

TOYO BUNKO RESEARCH LIBRARY 7

# Research Trends in Modern Central Eurasian Studies (18th-20th Centuries)

A Selective and Critical Bibliography of Works  
Published between 1985 and 2000

Part 2

Edited by

Stéphane A. DUDOIGNON and KOMATSU Hisao

In cooperation with Abstracta Iranica, Tehran-Paris

東洋文庫

Tokyo  
The Toyo Bunko  
2006

Published by  
the Toyo Bunko  
2-28-21 Honkomagome,  
Bunkyo-ku, Tokyo, 113-0021, Japan  
In cooperation with Abstracta Iranica, Tehran-Paris

The Toyo Bunko, 2006  
ISBN 4-8097-0202-2

Published through a special subvention from the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports,  
Science and Technology for the year 2005.

Printed by  
TOKYO PRESS Co., LTD.  
Itabashi, Tokyo, Japan

Published by  
the Toyo Bunko  
2-28-21 Honkomagome,  
Bunkyo-ku, Tokyo, 113-0021, Japan  
In cooperation with Abstracta Iranica, Tehran-Paris

The Toyo Bunko, 2006  
ISBN 4-8097-0202-2

Printed by  
TOKYO PRESS Co., LTD.  
Itabashi, Tokyo, Japan

# Table of Content

Foreword	ix
Tables of Signs and Abbreviations	xi
Transcription System	xv
1. Bibliographies, Epistemology, Miscellanies	
1.1 Bibliographies, Catalogues of Manuscripts and Documents	
1.1.A Bibliographies, Bio-Bibliographical Guides, Repertories	1
1.1.B Catalogues of Manuscripts and Lithographs	5
1.1.C Catalogues and Descriptions of Collections of Documents	16
1.2 Epistemology, State of the Art	
1.2.A History of Various Disciplines and Institutions	20
1.2.B Bio-Bibliographical Data, Obituaries	29
1.2.C Epistemological Questions	33
1.3 Miscellanies: Journals, Colloquia, Collective Works	
1.3.A New Periodical Publications	42
1.3.B Proceedings of Non-Thematic and Pluri-Disciplinary Conferences	47
1.3.C Encyclopedias, Dictionaries, Collected Papers	62
2. Geography	
2.1 General Works	64
2.2 The Crimea, the Volga-Urals Region, Siberia	66
2.3 The Caucasus	67
2.4 Western Central Asia	68
2.5 Eastern Central Asia (Xinjiang)	73
3. Modern and Contemporary History	
3.1 General Works	74
3.2 The Crimea, the Volga-Urals Region, Siberia	
3.2.A General Works	80
3.2.B The Czarist Period	82
3.2.C The Soviet and Current Periods	94
3.3 The Caucasus	
3.3.A General Works	100
3.3.B Before the Russian Conquest	100
3.3.C The Czarist Period	105
3.3.D The Soviet and Current Periods	108
3.4 Western Central Asia	
3.4.A General Works	110
3.4.B Before the Russian Conquest	
3.4.B.a General Works	123
3.4.B.b The Kazakh Hordes ( <i>Dasht-i Qipchāq</i> )	124
3.4.B.c The Khanates of Transoxiana and the Turkmens	126

3.4.C The Czarist Period	
3.4.C.a <i>General Works</i> ·····	146
3.4.C.b <i>The Steppe Territory</i> ·····	150
3.4.C.c <i>Russian Turkestan and the Protectorates of Bukhara and Khiva</i> ···	151
3.4.D The Soviet and Current Periods	
3.4.D.a <i>General Works</i> ·····	168
3.4.D.b <i>Kyrgyzstan</i> ·····	178
3.4.D.c <i>Tajikistan</i> ·····	179
3.4.D.d <i>Uzbekistan</i> ·····	181
3.5 Eastern Central Asia (Xinjiang)	
3.5.A <i>General Works</i> ·····	186
3.5.B <i>The Qing and Republican Periods</i> ·····	187
4. Sciences, Arts and Techniques	
4.1 <i>General Works</i> ·····	192
4.2 <i>Sciences and Techniques</i> ·····	193
4.3 <i>Architecture and City Planning</i> ·····	193
4.4 <i>Arts and Crafts</i> ·····	196
4.5 <i>Music</i> ·····	199
4.6 <i>Performing Arts and Cinema</i> ·····	206
5. Studies on Religion	
5.1 <i>General Works</i>	
5.1.A <i>All Religions</i> ·····	211
5.1.B <i>Islam</i> ·····	211
5.1.C <i>Other than Islam</i> ·····	227
5.2 <i>Shiite Islam</i>	
5.2.A <i>The Ismā'īliyya</i> ·····	227
5.2.B <i>The Ithnā'-'Ashariyya</i> ·····	229
5.3 <i>Sunni Islam</i>	
5.3.A <i>General Works</i> ·····	229
5.3.B <i>European Russia and Siberia</i> ·····	230
5.3.C <i>The Caucasus</i> ·····	245
5.3.D <i>Western Central Asia</i> ·····	248
5.3.E <i>Eastern Central Asia (Xinjiang)</i> ·····	264
6. Modern Languages and Literatures	
6.1 <i>General Works</i> ·····	266
6.2 <i>Iranian Languages</i>	
6.2.A <i>General Works</i> ·····	269
6.2.B <i>Persian/Tajik</i> ·····	269
6.2.C <i>North-Iranian Languages</i> ·····	281
6.3 <i>Turkic Languages</i>	
6.3.A <i>General Works</i> ·····	284
6.3.B <i>Qipchaq Group</i> ·····	284

6.3.B.a <i>Tatar Language and Literature</i> . . . . .	284
6.3.B.b <i>Bashkir Language and Literature</i> . . . . .	284
6.3.B.c <i>Kazakh and Karakalpak Languages and Literatures</i> . . . . .	285
6.3.B.d <i>Kyrgyz Language and Literature</i> . . . . .	286
6.3.C Chaghatay Group	
6.3.C.a <i>Chaghatay Language and Literature</i> . . . . .	286
6.3.C.b <i>Uzbek Language and Literature</i> . . . . .	287
6.3.C.c <i>Modern Uighur Language and Literature</i> . . . . .	300
6.3.D Oghuz Group	
6.3.D.a <i>Azeri Language and Literature</i> . . . . .	303
6.3.D.b <i>Turkmen Language and Literature</i> . . . . .	305
6.4 Hebrew, Yiddish, Judeo-Persian Languages and Literatures . . . . .	306
6.5 Other Languages and Literatures . . . . .	307
7. Anthropology and Sociology	
7.1 General Works . . . . .	309
7.2 European Russia and Siberia . . . . .	312
7.3 The Caucasus . . . . .	319
7.4 Western Central Asia . . . . .	321
7.5 Eastern Central Asia (Xinjiang) . . . . .	351
8. Economy and Political Science	
8.1 General Works . . . . .	355
8.2 The Russian Federation and Ukraine . . . . .	358
8.3 The Caucasus . . . . .	361
8.4 Western Central Asia	
8.4.A General Works . . . . .	363
8.4.B Kazakhstan . . . . .	378
8.4.C Tajikistan . . . . .	378
8.4.D Turkmenistan . . . . .	394
8.4.E Uzbekistan . . . . .	394

## Foreword

The present volume constitutes the second part of a project launched in 2000, and concretized in 2003 by the publication of a first tome on current Research trends in modern Central Eurasian studies. The first of our two volumes has offered a succession of epistemological articles, by an international panel of authors, on the state of the art in modern Central Eurasian studies, in various disciplines (in sociology and in history, in particular, with a specific attention for Xinjiang studies) and in various regions of the world (in the Russian Federation, in Central Asian countries, in Turkey, in Japan, and in the European Union). The authors of these articles have, in particular, tried to assess the tendencies of change in these varied categories since the upheavals of the mid-1980s in the USSR and in China.

The present volume is the continuation of that first publication. As it had been announced in the first tome, the second one contains a selective and critical bibliography of works published in and outside Central Eurasian countries between 1985 and 2000. The result of a cooperation with *Abstracta Iranica*, the yearly journal of critical bibliography on Iranian studies published since 1977 by the French Institute of Research in Iran (IFRI), this second volume is based mainly on material provided by this journal. Since the late 1980s, *Abstracta* has shown a significant effort at covering the international publication activity on modern and contemporary Central Asia and the Caucasus — with particular interest in publications coming from the CIS, especially from Tajikistan and from Uzbekistan, whether in Russian or in the national languages of these two countries.

From this point of view, *Abstracta* has constituted for researchers from the CIS a regular and systematic "Western" echo to their work. At the same time, attention has been given in *Abstracta*'s pages to the permanent renewal of research that can be observed outside Central Eurasia, especially in Western Europe, Northern America and Japan, since the boundaries of the former USSR have been opened to researchers from these parts of the world in the late 1980s. *Abstracta Iranica* has been and remains instrumental in the covering of the field since it allows its contributors to publish short critical accounts on books, as well as on separate papers that reveal almost in real time an advancement of research in a particular discipline or field. Moreover, *Abstracta*'s interest in Central Eurasia has been gradually enlarged to regions that can hardly be included into the limits of the Iranian world, as far as the modern and contemporary periods are concerned.

This second volume contains for its most part the English original version or translation from French of some 1,500 reviews published between 1985 and 2000 in *Abstracta Iranica*. (In the present book, references already reviewed in *Abstracta* are introduced by the sign ■; reviews published here in a version different from that of *Abstracta* are signaled by the sign □; to these reviews have been added a limited number of new abstracts of more or less recent publications, introduced by the sign ●.) In accordance with *Abstracta Iranica*'s rules, most reviews are short-

size abstracts (around 20 to 30 lines for a monograph, 5 to 10 for a separate paper): our main goal, and a postulate of *Abstracta*'s, has been to cast light on the contribution of each reviewed publication to the development of the field, and to analyze the orientations of research in different disciplines and countries since the beginning of the new period opened in the mid-1980s.

As already suggested in the foreword of our first volume, *Abstracta*'s activity and its echo in the present work bear testimony of limitations proper to Iranian studies as they have been developing in Western Europe and in Northern America during the last two decades. Among other characteristic features, Persian-speaking areas and disciplines such as history and literary studies are probably over-represented, if compared, for instance, with other linguistic areas and with other social sciences. Conversely, the most striking lacunae of our first volume (such as the lack of papers on research trends in Northern America, and on disciplines as important as economy, anthropology, or political science) are not due to the editors' will, and have been partly compensated by the amount of reviews devoted to these areas or fields in this second volume. More generally, disciplines or fields poorly represented in *Abstracta* have found more development in these two volumes published by the Toyo Bunko (such is the case, notably, of sociological studies).

The editors would like to take the opportunity offered by this short foreword for addressing their deepest thanks to the persons who have contributed to the realization of this overall project, in particular of its second volume, first to the numerous contributors of this volume, especially those who have accepted to write new abstracts on references absent from *Abstracta*; to Prof. Sato Tsugitaka, Director, the Research Department of the Toyo Bunko; to Prof. Rémy Boucharlat, Director, *Abstracta Iranica*; to Prof. Yann Richard and Prof. Jean During, successive Directors, IFRI, Tehran. We are also grateful to the Japan Foundation for supporting our international network in Central Eurasian studies. We would also like to express our gratitude to Ms. Hamamoto Mami, Mr. Noda Jin, Mr. Shimada Shizuo, and Mr. Shioya Akihumi for their assistance in proofreading and other works. Finally we wish to express our deep appreciation to the General Secretary of the Research Department of the Toyo Bunko Mr. Matsumoto Akira for his encouragement and patience, from the very beginning to the very end of this overall undertaking.

Tokyo, October 2005

*The Editors*



# Tables of Signs and Abbreviations

## 1. Special signs

- introduces a review already published in *Abstracta Iranica*
- introduces a review other than that published in *Abstracta Iranica*
- introduces an unpublished review

## 2. Signatures of Reviewers

A.A.	: Abdolhamid ABDOLHAMD (Professor, University of Tehran)
A.J.F.	: Allen J. FRANK (Takoma Park, MD)
A.K.-H.	: A. KARIMI-HAKKAK (University of Washington, Seattle)
A.P.	: Alexandre PAPAS (Lecturer, EHESS, Paris)
B.B.	: Bayram BALCI (Research Fellow, French Institute of Anatolian Studies, Istanbul)
B.H.	: Bernard HOURCADE (Senior Research Fellow, CNRS, Paris)
C.A.	: Chahryar ADLE (Senior Research Fellow, CNRS, Paris)
C.Br.	: Christian BROMBERGER (Senior Research Fellow, CNRS, Aix-en-Provence)
C.D.	: Cloé DRIEU (PhD candidate, INaLCO, Paris / IFEAC, Tashkent)
C.F.	: Charles-Henri de FOUCHECOUR (Emeritus Professor, Sorbonne Nouvelle University [Paris III])
C.J.	: Christian JAMBET (Professor, EPHE, Paris)
C.N.	: Christian NOACK (Associate Professor, University of Bielefeld)
C.P.	: Catherine POUJOL (Associate Professor, INaLCO, Paris)
Ch.B.	: Christophe BALAY (Professor, INaLCO, Paris)
D.B.	: Daniel BALLAND (Associate Professor, University of Paris-Sorbonne [Paris IV])
D.M.	: Denis MATRINGE (Professor, EHESS, Paris)
E.d.l.V.	: Etienne de la VAISSIÈRE (Associate Professor, EPHE, Paris)
E.F.	: Eve FEUILLEBOIS (Associate Professor, Sorbonne Nouvelle University [Paris III])
F.A.	: Françoise AUBIN (Emeritus Senior Research Fellow, CNRS/CERI, Paris)
F.G.	: Frantz GRENET (Senior Research Fellow, CNRS, Paris / Professor, EPHE, Paris)
F.Ga.	: Farough GAFFARY (Paris)
F.H.	: Florence HELLOT (Paris)
F.R.	: Francis RICHARD (Senior Curator, National Library of France, Paris)
G.J.J.	: Guissou JAHANGIRI JEANNOT (Paris)
G.L.	: Gilbert LAZARD (member of the Institut de France / EPHE, Paris)
H.L.	: Harald LIST (Paris)
H.M.	: HAMAMOTO Mami (JSPS Research Fellow, The University of Tokyo)

H.N.	: Homa NATEGH (Paris)
J.C.	: Jean CALMARD (Emeritus Senior Research Fellow, CNRS, Paris)
J.D.	: Jean DURING (Senior Research Fellow, CNRS, Strasbourg / Director, IFRI, Tehran)
J.P.	: Jürgen PAUL (Professor, University of Halle)
J.-P.D.	: Jean-Pierre DIGARD (Senior Research Fellow, CNRS, Paris)
K.H.	: KOMATSU Hisao (Professor, The University of Tokyo)
L.A.	: Laura ADAMS (Lecturer, Princeton University)
M.-A.A.-M.	: Mohammad-Ali AMIR-MOEZZI (Professor, EPHE, Paris)
M.B.	: Marcel BAZIN (Professor, University of Reims)
M.E.S.	: Maria Eva SUBTELNY (Professor, University of Toronto)
M.G.	: Monika GRONKE (Professor, University of Cologne)
M.R.	: Marguerite REUT (Senior Research Fellow, CNRS, Paris)
M.-R.A.	: Mohammad-Reza ASKARI (Paris)
M.S.	: Maria SZUPPE (Research Fellow, CNRS, Paris)
N.J.	: NODA Jin (PhD candidate, The University of Tokyo)
P.F.	: Patrick FONTAINE (Paris)
P.Lq.	: Pierre LECOQ (Professor, EPHE, Paris)
Ph.G.	: Philippe GIGNOUX (Emeritus Professor, EPHE, Paris)
Ph.R.	: Philippe ROCHARD (Aix-en-Provence)
R.	: The Redaction
R.B.	: Rémy BOUCHARLAT (Senior Research Fellow, CNRS, Lyon)
R.E.	: Reinhard EISENER (Berlin)
R.M.	: Rudolph MATTHEE (Associate Professor, University of Denver)
S.A.D.	: Stéphane A. DUDOIGNON (Research Fellow, CNRS, Paris)
S.C.	: Suchandana CHATTERJEE (Maulana Abul Kalam Azad Institute of Asian Studies, Calcutta)
S.J.	: SUGAWARA Jun (Lecturer, Aoyama Gakuin University, Tokyo)
S.S.	: Sanaoullah SANA (University of Bern)
T.Z.	: Thierry ZARCONI (Research Fellow, CNRS, Paris)
Tch.P.	: Tchangiz PAHLAVAN (Tehran)
U.T.	: UYAMA Tomohiko (Associate Professor, Slavic Research Center, Hokkaido University, Sapporo)
V.F.	: Vincent FOURNIAU (Associate Professor, EHESS, Paris)
V.H.	: Vincent HACHARD (Curator, Library of the INaLCO, Paris)
W.B.	: Wolfgang BEHN (Senior Curator, Staatsbibliothek Preussischer Kulturbesitz, Berlin)
X.L.T.	: Xavier LE TORRIVELLE (Lecturer, INaLCO, Paris)
Y.R.	: Yann RICHARD (Professor, Sorbonne Nouvelle University [Paris III])

### 3. Institutional Abbreviations

AFEMOTI	Association Française des Etudes sur la Méditerranée Orientale et le Monde Turco-Iranien, Paris
ARIAC	Association de recherche et d'Information sur l'Asie Centrale, Paris
BDIC	Bibliothèque de Documentation Internationale Contemporaine, University of Paris X (Nanterre)
CACIAC	Central Asia and the Caucasus Information and Analytical Centre, Luleå (Sweden)
CEACS	Centre for East Asian Cultural Studies for UNESCO, Tokyo
CGART	Tsentral'nyi gosudarstvennyi arkhiv Respubliki Tatarstan, Kazan
CNRS	Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (France)
EHESS	Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales, Paris
EPHE	Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes, Paris
IEI	Institut d'Etudes Iraniennes, University of Paris III (Sorbonne Nouvelle)
IFAO	Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale, Cairo
IFEA	Institut Français d'Etudes Anatoliennes, Istanbul
IFEAC	Institut Français d'Etudes sur l'Asie Centrale, Tashkent
IFEAD	Institut Français d'Etudes Arabes de Damas, Damascus
IFRI	Institut Français de Recherches en Iran, Tehran
INaLCO	Institut National des Langues et Civilisations Orientales (Langues' O), Paris
IOC	Institute of Oriental Culture, The University of Tokyo
SOAS	School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London

### 4. Titles of Journals, Collections, and Encyclopaedias

Abbreviation	Full title
AE	<i>Avrasya Etüdleri</i>
AI	<i>Abstracta Iranica</i>
ArOr	<i>Archív Orientální</i>
ART	<i>Asian Research Trends</i>
ASSR	<i>Archives de sciences sociales des religions</i>
BAI	<i>Bulletin of the Asia Institute</i>
BCAI	<i>Bulletin critique des Annales islamologiques</i>
BSOAS	<i>Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies</i>
CAaC	<i>Central Asia and the Caucasus</i>
CAC	<i>Cahiers d'Asie centrale</i>
CAJ	<i>Central Asiatic Journal</i>
CAM	<i>Central Asia Monitor</i>
CAS	<i>Central Asian Survey</i>
CEMOTI	<i>Cahiers d'études sur la Méditerranée orientale et le monde turco-iranien</i>
CESR	<i>Central Eurasian Studies Review</i>

CMR	<i>Cahiers du monde russe</i>
EAS	<i>Europe-Asia Studies</i>
EF <sup>2</sup>	<i>Encyclopaedia of Islam, second edition</i>
EIr	<i>Encyclopaedia Iranica</i>
EO	<i>Etnograficheskoe obozrenie</i>
FO	<i>Folia Orientalia</i>
HMEIR	<i>Harvard Middle Eastern and Islamic Review</i>
IA	<i>Inner Asia</i>
IANA ist.	<i>Izvestiia Akademii nauk Azerbaidzhanskoi S.S.R., Seriya istorii, filosofii i prava</i>
IAN T OON	<i>Izvestiia Akademii nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR, Otdelenie obshchestvennykh nauk</i>
IAN T VIF	<i>Izvestiia Akademii nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR, Otdelenie vostokovedeniia, istorii i filosofii</i>
IC	<i>Islamic Culture</i>
ISSSR	<i>Istoriia SSSR</i>
JCAS	<i>Journal of Central Asian Studies</i> (formerly ACAAR Bull)
JESHO	<i>Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient</i>
JHS	<i>Journal of History of Sufism</i>
LAC	<i>Lettre d'Asie Centrale</i>
MAMvQ	<i>Motale'e-ye Asiya-ye Markazi va Qafqaz</i>
MEJ	<i>Middle East Journal</i>
MES	<i>Middle Eastern Studies</i>
NAK	<i>Nairiku Ajiashi Kenkyu</i>
OI	<i>Otechestvennaia istoriia</i>
ONU	<i>Obshchestvennye nauki v Uzbekistane</i>
ReMMM	<i>Revue des mondes musulmans et de la Méditerranée</i>
RMM	<i>Rossii i musul'manskii mir</i>
RR	<i>Russian Review</i>
RSO	<i>Rivista degli studi orientali</i>
SAK	<i>Seinan Ajia Kenkyu</i>
SE	<i>Sovetskaia etnografiia</i>
ShIu	<i>Sharq Iulduzi</i>
SI	<i>Studia Islamica</i>
SK	<i>Suravu kenkyu / Slavic Studies</i>
SR	<i>Slavic Review</i>
SSh	<i>Sadoi Sharq</i>
TG	<i>Toyo Gakuho</i>
TsA	<i>Tsentral'naia Aziia</i>
TsAiK	<i>Tsentral'naia Aziia i Kavkaz</i>
UIF	<i>Uzbekistonda izhtimoi fanlar</i>
UTA	<i>Uzbek tili va adabiyoti</i>
VE	<i>Vestnik Evrazii / Acta Eurasica</i>
VI	<i>Voprosy istorii</i>
ZV	<i>Zvezda Vostoka</i>

# Transcription System

## I. Cyrillic Alphabet

Original character	<i>Abstracta</i> code	Our transcription
А а	A a	A a
Б б	B b	B b
В в	V v	V v
Г г	G g	G g
Ғ ғ	Ġ ġ	Gh gh
Д д	D d	D d
Е е	E e	E e
Ә ә	Ä ä	Ä ä
Ж ж	Ž ž	Zh zh
Җ җ	Ǧ ǧ	J j
З з	Z z	Z z
И и	I i	I i
Й й	I i	I i
Ї ї	Ī ī	I i
К к	K k	K k
Қ қ	Q q	Q q
К к	Q q	Q q
Л л	L l	L l
М м	M m	M m
Н н	N n	N n
ң	ñ	ng
О о	O o	O o
Ө ө	Ö ö	Ö ö
П п	P p	P p
Р р	R r	R r
С с	S s	S s
Т т	T t	T t
У у	U u	U u
Ў ў	Ŭ ŭ	U u
Ү ү	Ū ū	U u

Ү ү	Ü ü	Ü ü
У у		U u
Ф ф	F f	F f
Х х	X x	Kh kh
Х х	H h	H h
Һ һ	H h	H h
Ц ц	C c	Ts ts
Ч ч	Č č	Ch ch
Ї и	Ǧ ǧ	J j
Ч ч	Ǧ ǧ	J j
Ш ш	Š š	Sh sh
Щ щ	Ŝ ŝ	Shch shch
Ъ ъ	‘	‘
Ы ы	Y y	Y y
Ь ь	’	’
Э э	È è	E e
Ю ю	Û ù	Iu iu
Я я	Ã ã	Ia ia

II. Arabic Alphabet

Original character	<i>Abstracta</i> code	Our transcription
أ	A a / I i / U u	A a / I i / U u
ب	B b	B b
پ	P p	P p
ت	T t	T t
ث	<u>T</u> t / <u>S</u> s	Th th
ج	Ǧ ǧ	J j
چ	Č č	Ch ch
ح	Ḥ ḥ	H h
خ	Ḫ ḫ	Kh kh
د	D d	D d
ذ	<u>D</u> d / <u>Z</u> z	Dh dh
ر	R r	R r
ز	Z z	Z z

ژ	Ž ž	Zh zh
س	S s	S s
ش	Š š	Sh sh
ص	Ṣ ṣ	S s
ض	Ẓ ẓ	Z z
ط	Ṭ ṭ	T t
ظ	Ẓ ẓ	Z z
ع	‘	‘
غ	Ġ ġ	Gh gh
ف	F f	F f
ق	Q q	Q q
ك	K k	K k
گ	G g	G g
ل	L l	L l
م	M m	M m
ن	N n	N n
و	V v / W w / Ū ū	*V v / W w / U u
ه	H h	H h
ی	Y y / Ī ī	Y y / I i

\* We transcribe و by v for references from Iran [with the Iranian vocalisation, ex: *vā’ez*], and by w for references from Afghanistan and Central Asia (with Dari vocalisation, ex: *wā’ez*).

# 1. Bibliographies, Epistemology, Miscellanies

## 1.1 Bibliographies, Catalogues of Manuscripts and Documents

### 1.1.A. Bibliographies, Bio-Bibliographical Guides, Repertories

■ ALLWORTH, E[dward] A., "Central Asia in the 1990s: an Annotated Bibliography of Books and Pamphlets Published in English during the Present Decade by Journalists, Politicians, Scholars, Students, Travelers, and Others," *CAM* 1995/5: 15-30.

The present bibliographical survey has been regularly published in the *Central Asia Monitor* from 1995 onwards. It is limited to publications in English, and the author has deliberately made no distinction between academic publications of various quality, and works of journalistic character. However the list offers a convenient guide on the recent Anglo-Saxon bibliography for further studies on the evolution of the Western discourse on Central Asia since the late 1990s.

S.A.D.

● ASHŪROV, Dawrān, *Farhang-i rūznāmahā wa majallahā-yi Tājīkistān* [Repertory of the Newspapers and Journals of Tajikistan], Dushanbe: Pazhūhishgāh-i farhang-i fārsī-tājīkī, 1999, 136 p.

The present booklet has been published in Arabic alphabet for the audiences of Iran and Afghanistan. It offers short historical notices on pre-revolutionary, early Soviet, and Soviet regional, local, or institutional Tajik-, Uzbek- and Russian-language newspapers and journals of present-day Tajikistan. Not surprisingly in an official publication aimed at exportation, many absences can be deplored, among which some significant items of the late Czarist period; such is also the case for non-conformist newspapers and journals which flourished throughout Tajikistan during Perestroika and the very first year of independence — some of them still being published today in various exile places.

S.A.D.

■ BALLAND, Daniel, *Annuaire des études centrasiatiques en France, 1993*, Ivry-sur-Seine: CNRS, UPR 252 "Monde iranien" — Groupe Asie Intérieure, 1993, 54 p.

This unique yearbook of Central Asian studies in France briefly presents the research teams of the Inner Asia Group (Groupe Asie Intérieure) of the CNRS created in 1993. For each team is given a short list of the researchers and of the periodical publications to which the team has subscribed. A second part consists of a bio-bibliographical guide of the researchers in human sciences working in France on Inner Asia, with lists of their works in progress and main publications.

S.A.D.

■ BİNARK, İsmet, *Türkiye dışındaki Türkler bibliyografyası* [Bibliography of the Turks outside Turkey], II. *Doğu Avrupa Türkleri; Türkistan Türkleri* [The Turks of Eastern Europe; The Turks of Turkestan], Ankara: Devlet Arşivleri Genel Müdürlüğü, 1992, 1379 p., index.



A non-exhaustive bibliography on the Turkic peoples of Eastern Europe, the Caucasus, and Central Asia, classified by regions and by disciplines, the present work offers a large catalogue of Turkish publications prior to 1991. S.A.D.

□ BREGEL, Yuri, comp. and ed., *Bibliography of Islamic Central Asia*, Part I — *History, Religion, Culture*, Part II — *Descriptions and Travels, Written Sources for Central Asian History, Ethnography, Folklore, Folk Entertainments, Physical Anthropology*, Part III — *Archaeology, Numismatics, Architecture, Visual Arts, Auxiliary Historical Discipline, Historical Geography, Historiography, Bibliography, Addenda, Indexes*, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University, Research Institute of Inner Asian Studies, 1995 (Indiana University Uralic and Altaic Series, vol. 160, part. I–II–III), LX–XXXVI–XXX–2276 p.

As the compiler properly stresses in his introduction, a classified and comprehensive bibliography of the history and culture of Central Asia had not existed before the publication of this voluminous opus. The result of an international cooperation led from the Department of Uralic and Altaic Studies at Indiana University (Bloomington), with participation of the St. Petersburg branch of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Federation of Russia, this bibliography provides a invaluable instrument to students and specialists in the history of Central Asia. Classified into three parts (pre-Islamic Central Asia; Islamic Central Asia before the establishment of Communist regimes in Russia and China; and Islamic Central Asia under the Communist regimes), the bibliography includes monographs and articles in periodicals and collective volumes in all languages except Chinese and Japanese, published from the 17th century to 1988. Press articles have been excluded, except those from the Russian pre-Soviet newspapers and journals. The total number of records in the bibliography is about 30,500. Their sources are, for the most part, Soviet bibliographical annals, other general bibliographies, bibliographies of Central Asia, lists of publications of individual scholars, and entire sets of periodicals and encyclopaedias. The material in the bibliography is arranged according to the fields of study, or the types of literature: History, Religion, Culture, etc. The classification system is more detailed than in all other bibliographies related to Central Asian studies. Historical works, which make the bulk of the present work, are divided into: general and political history, social and economic history till the Russian conquest, and social and economic history after the Russian conquest. Other sections are devoted to religion, culture, European and Russian description and travel literature, written sources for Central Asian history, ethnography, folklore and folk entertainment, archaeology, architecture, visual arts, auxiliary historical disciplines, historical geography, historiography, bibliography. All works listed are classified into two main groups: monographs and articles. Bibliographical records are repeated in several sections, when required by their content.

Among inevitable lacunae of this kind of work, the bulk of which has lain on the compiler's shoulders during more than seven years of almost exclusive work, one may regret a relatively weak interest for the history of ideas in modern times, and the mediocre covering of linguistic domains other than the Russian and English ones (this

is particularly true as far as publications in Central Asian languages are concerned). From this viewpoint, this publication remains characteristic of a period when scientific literature on Central Asia was elaborated in places remote from this region itself, with poor contact with local academic circles. Moreover, in spite of its innumerable qualities and the heroic work provided by the compiler, this bibliographical survey appears as the last almost individual effort in this field, and from this point of view too, it probably marks the end of a period. The amount of publications of all kinds devoted, for a decade and a half, to modern and contemporary Central Asia should dissuade any specialist to embark on an undertaking of this dimension. Time seems to have come for computerised data bases accessible through the Internet, with close participations of scientists from all Central Asian countries (a thing not always easy to obtain, as the present volume can also demonstrate), and for more selective, but critical and epistemological bibliographies — if we take into account the extremely uneven quality of the publications which have been multiplying and continue to flourish since the late 1980s.

More detailed reviews notably by N. di Cosmo, *CAJ* 41/2 (1997): 271-275; B.A. Litvinskii, *Vostok* 1997/4: 176-181. S.A.D.

- ISRAEL, Raphael, *Islam in China: A Critical Bibliography*, Westport, CN: Praeger, 1994 (Bibliographies and Indexes in Religious Studies: 29), XVIII-172 p.

Although it suffers from numerous typographical shortcomings, and has been limited to publications in English — with many lacunae even in this restricted field —, this commented bibliography offers useful abstracts of numerous isolated papers. See in particular the sections: bibliography and inscriptions (23-29); general works (30-54); Imperial China (55-60); Republican China (61-64); People's Republic (65-72); culture, religion, and theology (73-82); social protest and political uprisings (83-90); Xinjiang studies (111-120).

Detailed critical review by Françoise Aubin, *BCAI* 13 (1997): 209-211. S.A.D.

- KOCAOĞLU, Timur, "Recent Studies on Modern Central Asia in Turkey: 1969-1997," *ART* 8 (1998): 21-39, bibliography.

The paper offers a quick survey, followed by a bibliography, of Central Asian studies in Turkey since the publication of the "Memoirs" of Zeki Velidi Togan in 1969. (The choice of this date probably aims at stressing the role which has been played by the Turkic émigré communities from the former Russian Empire and the USSR in the development of current Central Asian studies in Turkey.) Nothing is said of the particular political connotation of these studies in Istanbul and Ankara during the cold war period, nor on the relative ideological and methodological renewals of the 1990s. The uncommented bibliography includes works of most various nature and quality.

S.A.D.

- LEIVI, D. S., BUBNOVA, M. A., *Istoriia Tadzhikistana. Ukazatel' sovetsskoi literatury, 1917-1983 g.* [History of Tajikistan. Index of the Soviet Literature, 1917-1983], Dushanbe:

Izdatel'stvo Donish, 1986 (Akademiia nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR, Institut istorii im. A. Donisha), 348+376 p.

These are the two first volumes of a very useful repertory of Soviet works published between 1917 and 1983 about Tajikistan. The first volume is devoted to historiography and other auxiliary disciplines of history: numismatics (catalogues and collections), epigraphy, the study of sources (catalogues, manuscript funds), historical geography, anthropology, and ethnography. The second volume is entirely devoted to archaeology and neighboring fields (such as the history of irrigation, inscriptions, etc.). The whole set is organized in rubrics according to the research field, not chronologically, each rubric including several subdivisions. The numbering of titles is continuous over the two volumes. At the end of vol. 2, detailed indexes (authors, geographical denominations, ethnic terminology) facilitate the utilization of this work, the interest of which should not be under-estimated. Two other volumes were in preparation at the time the present notice was written. The first one should deal with history until 1917, the second one with the history of Soviet Tajikistan.

M.S.

● MILIBAND, S. D., "Dopolneniia i ispravleniia k 'Biobibliograficheskomu slovariui otechestvennykh vostokovedov' [Complements and Corrections to the 'Bio-bibliographical Dictionary of Domestic Scholars in Oriental Studies']," *Vostok* 1997/3: 201-212; 1997/5: 198-216; 1997/6: 200-212; 1998/1: 210-218; 1999/3: 210-214; 2000/2: 201-210.

This series of bio-bibliographical notices, classified by alphabetical order, offers useful actualizations of the author's reference work on the scholars of Soviet and early post-Soviet Oriental studies, and their personal bibliographies in Russian and Western European languages: *Biobibliograficheskii slovar' otechestvennykh vostokovedov s 1917 g.*, 2nd edition, revised and completed, Moscow, 1995, 2 vols.

S.A.D.

■ SALIKHOV, A. G., *Abdulkadir Inan. Bibliograficheskii ukazatel'* [Abdulkadir İnan. A Bibliographical Index], Ufa: Izdatel'stvo "Gilem," 1996 (Akademiia nauk Respubliki Bashkortostan, Otdelenie gumanitarnykh nauk — Institut istorii, iazyka i literatury UNC RAN), 59 p., index.

This bibliography is made of 428 notices of works by Abdulkadir İnan, a Turkish historian of the Turks of Central Eurasia, and of a dozen of publications devoted to him and to his work edited in Bashkortostan since the early 1990s.

S.A.D.

■ SCHOEBERLEIN-ENGEL, John S., *Guide to Scholars of the History and Culture of Central Asia*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard Central Asia Forum, Harvard University, 1995 (Research Publications of the Harvard Central Asia Forum: 1), 312 p., indexes.

An invaluable tool, this first world guide ever published of the scholars of Central Asia contains numerous biographical notices, with information on everyone's interests and recent publications. There are indexes of authors by research themes, as well as by countries and institutions. Central Asian scholars occupy an important place, as well as young scholars, without distinction of grade or rank. A still awaited second edition

should include neglected regions (the Caucasus, the Volga–Urals, Siberia, Xinjiang, etc.), and give more room to scientific milieus which have not been represented in the first one (Central Eurasian studies in Japan, for instance, and in numerous regional research centres of the Russian Federation).

More detailed review by K.H. Menges, *CAJ* 41/2 (1997): 290-292. S.A.D.

□ UMEMURA, Hiroshi, dir., *Nihon ni okeru Chūō Ajia kankei kenkyū bunken mokuroku, 1879-1987 = Bibliography of Central Asian Studies in Japan, 1879-March 1987*, Tokyo: Yunesuko Higashi Ajia Bunka Kenkyū Sentā = The UNESCO Centre for East Asian Cultural Studies, 1988-1989, 2 vols., 717+259 p.

The copy from which the present account has been written belongs to the third printing (1994) of this luxurious bibliography of more than a century of Central Asian (and Mongolian) studies in Japan, since the Meiji era, which suggests that this volume has met a considerable, and highly deserved success in the international scientific community during the years following its first publication. This bibliography provides an invaluable tool for a history of Central Asian studies in Japan, especially in the second half of the twentieth century, when Central Asia began to be considered from the Nippon archipelago as a cultural area of its own, and no more as a periphery to a superior Chinese civilization. As H. Umemura stresses in his introduction, while there have been a number of bibliographies published over the years, probably none has covered the field more comprehensively than the present volume. Moreover, the fact that titles contained in this volume have been provided with Western (mainly English) language translations is indeed a very significant step forward in internationalizing this important material. The bibliography bears testimony, in particular, of the spectacular development of modern and contemporary studies on Central Asia (and Mongolia) in Japan during the 1970s and 1980s, before the new qualitative boom of the mid-1990s.

The first volume is devoted to the bibliography itself, with its 15,067 notices classified by Japanese phonetic order of author names. The second volume offers, beside numerous errata (pp. 191-259), several main indexes: of bibliographies by Japanese phonetic order; of Chinese dynastic names by chronological order; of personal names by alphabetical order; of geographical names by Japanese phonetic order; and a general index by Japanese phonetic order too. They are followed themselves by several very convenient, especially for non-Japanese-speaking readers, cross reference indexes, notably a Romanized cross reference index of bibliographies, Chinese dynastic names, geographical names, and the general index. This bibliography is available also at the web site <<http://www.toyo.bunko.or.jp>>.

S.A.D.

### 1.1.B. Catalogues of Manuscripts and Lithographs

■ [BABADJANOV, Bakhtiyar] BABADZHANOV, Bakhtiyar, [KRÄMER, Annette] KREMER, Annet, [PAUL, Jürgen] PAUL', Iurgen, eds., *Kratkii katalog sufiiskikh proizvedenii XVIII-XX vv. Iz sobraniia Instituta Vostokovedeniia Akademii nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan im. Al-Biruni* /

*Handlist of Sufi Manuscripts (18th – 20th Centuries) in the Holdings of the Oriental Institute, Academy of Sciences, Republic of Uzbekistan (Biruni)*, Berlin: Das Arabische Buch, 2000, 237 p., index.

The result of an Uzbek-German cooperation, the present work is part of a new series of thematic catalogues of the manuscripts collections of the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies, Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan, which have been published during the last years thanks to a German logistic support (see notably *AI* 20-21, notice 32, p. 11). The authors of this volume offer a description of manuscripts of the 18th to 20th centuries concerning Sufism. They have included in their list manuscripts which were absent from the preceding 11 volume catalogue of the Biruni Institute. The alphabetical classification by author names (by title for anonymous works), and by works of a same author allows an immediate and very convenient vision of the various copies of a same work. Each notice mentions: the name of its author and the title in Arabic alphabet and Cyrillic transliteration, the language in which the text has been written and the literary genre to which it can be attached (poetry, hagiography, etc.); then, for each manuscript of one and the same work, there is a reference to its notice in the 11 volume catalogue of the Biruni Institute (when this notice exists), its registration number, the date of copy according to the Lunar Hegirian calendar and to the Gregorian calendar, its pagination, measures, the style of its calligraphy and, in Arabic characters, the name of the copyist when this name is known. At the end of the catalogue, several manuscripts indexes in Arabic characters (of authors, commentators, translators and compilers, then of titles, copyists, autographs, binders and place names) give the reader the possibility to find his/her way very rapidly in the whole volume. S.A.D.

● BAHRĀMIYĀN, ‘Alī, MOWJĀNĪ, Seyyed ‘Alī, dir., with [‘ALĪ] MARDĀN, Amr-i Yazdān, KARĀMATĪ, Yūnos, ĪLCHĪ-BĪK, Qodrat, YĀQMŪRLĪ, Bashīr, *Fehrest-e noskkehā-ye khattī-ye Ensūtū-ye sharq-shenāsī wa āthār-e khattī-ye Tājikestān (shahr-e Doshanbe)* [Catalogue of the Manuscripts of the Institute of Oriental Studies and Manuscript Heritage of Tajikistan (City of Dushanbe)], III — Tehran: Markaz-e asnād va tārikh-e dīplomāsī, in collaboration with Ketābkhāne-ye bozorg-e Hazrat-e Āyatollāh al-‘ozmā Mar‘ashī-Najafī (Qom), 1379[2001], viii-338 p., indexes.

This is the third volume of a collection, the two first items of which are commented *infra* (see Mowjānī). The same (curious) thematic order has been kept in this volume: Qur’ān and *tafsīr*; sciences and arts; theology, philosophy and logics; ethics; politics and political philosophy; Sufism; law; biography of the Prophet and hagiography; lexicography; verse; prose; enigma; correspondence; history and geography; variorum.

R.

● BAHRĀMIYĀN, ‘Alī, with [IUNUSOV, Abdullo] YŪNUSĀF, ‘Abd-Allāh, *Fehrest-e noskkehā-ye khattī-ye ketābkhāne-ye mellī-ye Tājikestān (Abī’l-Qāsem Ferdowsī)* [Catalogue of the Manuscripts of the National Library of Tajikistan (Abu’l-Qasim Firdawsi)], Tehran: Markaz-e asnād va tārikh-e dīplomāsī-ye vazārat-e omūr-e khāreje-ye Jomhūrī-ye eslāmī-ye Īrān —

Qom: Ketābkhāne-ye bozorg-e Hazrat-e Āyatollāh al-‘ozmā Mar‘ashī-Najafī, 1380 [1422/2002], xviii-125 p., indexes.

This is the first volume of the second ever published catalogue of the Oriental manuscripts of the Firdawsi National Library of Tajikistan — not the richest, but probably the best kept public manuscript collection of this country, thanks to the great efforts spent, throughout the civil war and its aftermath, by the Chief Curator of the Manuscripts Section, Dr. Abd-Allah-Jan Yunusov. The already existing catalogue in Tajik, in three little volumes, by N. Karomatullaeva, contained notices of 299 volumes from the 2,200 manuscripts kept in the Firdawsi Library (a stable amount, since for comprehensible reasons the library has made very few acquisitions in decades). The present volume offers notices on 651 individual manuscripts; the remaining part of the collection — both individual manuscripts and albums — should be described in the forthcoming volumes. The manuscripts are presented following the alphabetical order of titles (which makes the indexes extremely useful); each notice gives a very short description of the content and of the physical aspect of the manuscript, as well as the first sentences of the text. There is also an introductory paper by the same A.J. Yunusov, about precious Persian manuscripts kept in Tajikistan ("Ganjīnehā-ye khattī-ye garānbahā-ye mardom-e tājik [Precious Manuscripts Collections of the Tajik People]," xv-xvii). The absence of a thematic classification (which existed in the first catalogue) makes the reading lengthier, but allows the reader interesting and sometimes unsuspected discoveries. S.A.D.

● DODKHUOEVA, L., *Katalog khudozhestvenno oformlennykh vostochnykh rukopisei Akademii nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR* [Catalogue of the Illuminated and Illustrated Oriental Manuscripts of the Academy of Sciences of the Tajik SSR], Dushanbe: Izdatel'stvo Donish, 1986 (Akademiia nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR, Institut vostokovedeniia), 184 p., 15 pl., indexes, Eng. summ.

The manuscripts collection of the Institute of Oriental Studies (now the Institute of the Oriental Studies and Manuscript Heritage) of Dushanbe is well known for the interest of its fund in miniatures from various Central Asian and Northern Indian (especially Kashmiri) miniature schools. The Mongol and Timurid school of Shiraz is also represented by noticeable works of the 13th-15th centuries. The present catalogue offers technical data on the number and size of miniatures, titles, colophons, peculiarities of the ornamentation of bindings, as well as useful bibliographies on each manuscript. Manuscripts and miniatures are arranged according to the time of their illumination or illustration. R.

■ IUSUPOVA, D. Iu., DZHALILOVA, R. P., *Sobranie vostochnykh rukopisei Akademii nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan. Istoriia* [The Collection of Oriental Manuscripts of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Uzbekistan. History], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo "Fan" Akademii nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan, 1998 (Akademiia nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan, Institut vostokovedeniia im. Abu Raikhana Beruni), 534 p., index.

For long, historians of medieval, pre-modern and early modern Central Asia were waiting for the gathering in one volume of notices on manuscript works of history dispersed in the eleven volume catalogue of the Oriental manuscripts of the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan, published in Russian between 1952 and 1987. This task has been achieved, thanks to an international support orchestrated by Prof. Jürgen Paul, of the Martin Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg, with the concurrence of a German company of technical assistance. The reader is pleased about the correction of the approximations which were present in the 11 volume catalogue, and about the addition of manuscripts absent from that first catalogue, as well as about the appearance of numerous references to the numerous comments, editions and translations published during the last decades.

To be mentioned also: the simultaneous publication of: VIL'DANOVA, A. B., *Sobranie vostochnykh rukopisei Akademii nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan. Tochnye i estestvennye nauki* [The Collection of Oriental Manuscripts of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Uzbekistan. Exact and Natural Sciences], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo "Fan" Akademii nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan, 1998 (Akademii nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan, Institut vostokovedeniia im. Abu Raikhana Beruni), 248 p., index, bibliography. The result of the commitment and self-abnegation of Uzbekistani orientalists, who work most of the time in extremely difficult conditions, the simultaneous publication of these two catalogues can be considered a model of international cooperation in matter of preservation and exploitation of the sources of the history of Central Asia, and of the history of sciences in the world of Islam. S.A.D.

● JARRING, Gunnar, *Prints from Kashghar: The Printing Office of the Swedish Mission in Eastern Turkestan, History and Production, with an Attempt at a Bibliography*, Stockholm: Svenska Forskningsinstitutet i Istanbul, 1991 (Transactions: 3), 140 p., glossary, indexes, 19 ill.

Among its numerous activities, the Swedish Lutheran mission in Xinjiang ran a printing-office in Kashghar between 1901 and 1938. It is the story and the production of that little, though active office that G. Jarring relates in the present book. The author himself had visited the missionaries and their young Turkestanian staff in 1929 and 1930, and brought back with him a collection of their publications. The first five chapters recount the general history of the office, from the impetus given by J. Avetarian — a controversial translator of the Bible into Eastern Turki — up to the precarious situation of 1937-38. The leading role of G. Raquette is recalled and a very interesting part (pp. 19-26) explains the difficulties of the printing office during the Eastern Turkestan Revolution of the 1930s. We learn that the office has been destroyed after the departure of the missionaries in 1938. The huge chapter 7 (pp. 29-116) consists of a well-presented catalogue of all the printing material produced by the Swedish mission. Historians of modern Central Asia will retain in particular the periodicals published by the Turkic Islamic Republic of Eastern Turkestan: *Istiqlal*, p. 85; *Sharqi Turkestan Hayati*, *Erkin Turkestan*, p. 87, 91; *Yengi Hayat Hurriyeti*, p. 91-92; *Yengi Hayat*, p.



101, 107-108.

Detailed reviews by Reinhard F. Hahn, *CAJ* 36/1-2 (1992): 156-159; Shinmen Yasushi, *TG* 75/1-2 (1993): 160-167. A.P.

■ KAGRAMANOV, Zh. V., *Iz sokrovishchnykh rukopisei Azerbaidzhana* [On the Manuscripts Treasure of Azerbaijan], Baku: Akademiia nauk ASSR, Izdatel'stvo Elm, 1983, [42]-[108] p., in Russian and English.

The book offers a survey of the history and collections of the Manuscripts Department of the Academy of Sciences of the Azerbaijani SSR. A short introduction (translated into English) is followed by more than 50 pages of reproductions of miniatures and photographs of manuscripts (16th-19th cc.). The Manuscripts Department contains more than 40,000 titles, some of which are very rare, sometimes unique samples (e.g.: works by the astronomer and astrologist Nāsir al-Dīn Tūsī), in Arabic, Persian, Turkish, Uzbek, Azeri, Armenian languages, etc. Beside ancient manuscripts, the department also possesses a rich collection of the first lithographs of the 19th and early 20th centuries, from present-day Azerbaijan itself, but also from Iran, Afghanistan, Central Asia, Turkey and India. The study of these lithographs only begins, but that of the manuscripts continues since a long time. The results of these researches are translations and publications of original texts. M.S.

■ KOSTYGOVA, G. I., *Persidskie i tadzhikskie rukopisi Gosudarstvennoi Publichnoi Biblioteki imeni M.E. Saltykova-Shchedrina. Alfavitnyi katalog* [The Persian and Tajik Manuscripts of the Saltykov-Shchedrin State Public Library. Alphabetical Catalogue], Leningrad, 2 vols., 1988-1989, XIII-250+330 p.

In spite of its very modest presentation, this new catalogue of Persian and "Tajik" manuscripts of the former Imperial Public Library of St. Petersburg will fulfill a lot of good services. G.I.K., who is already the author of several works on the funds of the Saltykov-Shchedrin Library, has assembled here the description of the manuscripts of the former Dorn collection (already described by the latter in 1865), which includes notably the manuscripts "purchased" by Dubrovskii before 1790-91 in the Abbey of Saint Germain des Prés, as well as those of the new series, some of which have been acquired recently. The classification is alphabetical, following the names of the Persian texts, and the catalogue contains 1,369 numbers, one for each copy. The various parts of collected volumes are described separately. The author gives, briefly: the date of the copy, the place of the copy, the name of the copyist, the characteristics and the state of the copy, a bibliography and the registration number. The v. 2 contains invaluable indexes of the names of authors, copyists, painters, calligraphers or illuminators, of the places of copy, and of the matters dealt with. A table of concordance of numbers and a list of the 120 manuscripts with paintings, with for each the mention of the amount of paintings, make this catalogue a very convenient working tool for the study of a rich collection, notably in *muraqqa'āt*, where can be found copies from very different dates between the 14th and the 20th centuries. F.R.



■ MIRZOEV, A. M., *Katalog vostochnykh rukopisei Akademii nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR* [Catalogue of the Oriental Manuscripts of the Academy of Sciences of the Tajik SSR], 6 — Dushanbe: Donish, 1988, 372 p.

Here is the sixth volume (the first one was published in 1960) of the catalogue of Oriental manuscripts of the library of the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan in Dushanbe. The reader can find there notices No. 1929 to 2372. Each of them describes a copy of a Persian (sometimes Turkic or Arabic) text. The classification by title is organised according to the following rubrics: lexicography (1929-1998); encyclopaedias (1999-2003); grammars (2004-2085); poetic art (2086-2098); enigmas (2099-2152); epistolography and correspondences (2153-2187); official documents (2188-2196); medicine and pharmacopoeia (2197-2285); mathematics (2286-2293); astronomy (2294-2337); music (2338-2342); techniques, sports, etc. (2343-2372). There are often several copies of the same text, but the description of each of them is very detailed. The indexes of titles, of incipits, of authors, copyists, owners and readers' names are followed by indexes on the dates of composition and copy of the texts (the oldest is that of a *Ikhtiyārāt-i badī'ī*, 869 h.q., whilst 173 mss. are copies dated between 1093 h.q. and 1330 h.q.). The last part of the volume is made of 21 facsimiles of unfortunately mediocre quality. The absence of ancient copies is compensated by the presence of some twenty copies of rare or largely ignored texts. F.R.

■ MOWJĀNĪ, Seyyed 'Alī, *Fehrest-e nāmgū-ye nosakh-e khattī-ye Makhzan-e Hamīd Soleymān-e Enstītū-ye Sharqshenāsī-ye Abī Reyhān Bīrūnī (Ozbakestān)* [Index of the Manuscripts of the Hamid-Sulaimon Fund in the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies (Uzbekistan)], Qom: Ketābkhāne-ye bozorg-e Hazrat-e Āyatollāh al-'ozmā Mar'ashī Najafī (bā hamkārī-ye Daftar-e motāle'āt-e siyāsī va beyn ol-melalī va Enstītū-ye Sharqshenāsī-ye Abī Reyhān Bīrūnī), 1377 sh./1998, 1150 p., index of titles.

The result of a cooperation between Uzbekistan and Iran, the present work provides us with a second catalogue of the collection of Oriental manuscripts (7,554 units) of the Institute of Manuscripts of Tashkent — a collection which was moved some years ago to the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan, where it bears today the name of the founder of the Institute of Manuscripts, Hamid Sulaimon (1909-1978). (As to the first catalogue, which was of a more convenient utilization, see A.P. Kaiumov, ed., *Katalog fonda Instituta rukopisei* [Catalogue of the Collection of the Institute of Manuscripts], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo Fan Uzbekskoi SSR, 2 vols: 1., 1989, 412 p.; 2., 1988 [sic], 388 p., 10 pl.) The catalogue published in Persian in Tehran consists of a series of short notices with indication, for each manuscript, of the registration number, the title, the author name, the date of the copy, the number of pages, the dimensions, and the language of the text. An index permits one to find out the works through their title, but one should perhaps deplore the lack of an index of authors, given the dimension of this catalogue. One may also regret the weak interest shown for copyists, who are totally absent from the notices. Last, it is a pity that the origin of the manuscripts has not been mentioned: the fund of the Institute

of Manuscripts of Tashkent was set up a relatively late date (since the 1970s for the most part), so the history of its collection of manuscripts and lithographs offers per se interesting information on the state of private libraries in Central Asia during the Soviet period. Nevertheless the present catalogue is an invaluable tool for historians of pre-modern Central Asia, in particular for specialists of the history of Persian and Chaghatay literatures in Transoxiana — of which Hamid Sulaimon had made the speciality of the Institute of Manuscripts. S.A.D.

- MOWJĀNĪ, Seyyed 'Alī, with 'ALĪMARDĀN, Amr-i Yazdān, *Fehrest-e nosakh-e khattī-ye fārsī-ye Enstūtū-ye āthār-e khattī-ye Tājikestān* [Catalogue of the Persian Manuscripts of the Manuscripts Institute of Tajikistan], Tehran: Daftar-e motāle'āt-e siyāsī va beyn ol-melalī, 1 – 1376, xxii-370 p., indexes; 2 – 1377, 368 p., indexes.

The Institute of the Manuscript Heritage of Tajikistan, with 5,750 manuscripts and 6,340 lithographs, is the richest of that country. Here are the two first volumes (on vol. 3: see *supra* Bahrāmīyān) of its second catalogue. As usually in this kind of publication sponsored by the Islamic Republic of Iran, there is no word for the previous catalogue published in Tajik language in the 1960s, to which the present work adds very few fresh information. The descriptive notices are preceded by a general paper on the collections of the institute: [NAZRIEV, Jurabek] NAZRĪ, Jūrabēk, [ALIMARDONOV, Amriiazdon] 'ALĪ MARDĀN, Amr-i Yazdān, "Ganjīne-ye nosakh-e khattī-ye Farhangestān-e 'olūm-e Jomhūrī-ye Tājikestān va ahammiyat-e ān barā-ye āmūkhtan-e tārikh-e tamaddon-e fārsī va tājik [The Manuscripts Collection of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Tajikistan, and Its Significance for the Study of the Persian and Tajik Civilization]," IX-XXI.

Also reviewed by Kimura Satoru, *NAK* 16 (2001): 83-89.

S.A.D.

- MUMINOV, A. K., *Katalog arabograficheskikh rukopisei Muzeia-zapovednika "Azret-Sultan" v gorode Turkestan* [Catalogue of the Manuscripts in Arabic Script of the Hazret-Sultan Reserve-Museum of the City of Turkestan], Turkistan: Mura, 1997 (Gosudarstvennyi istoriko-kul'turnyi muzei-zapovednik "Azret-Sultan," Mezhdunarodnyi kazakhsko-turetskii universitet im. Kh.A. Iasavi, Institut etnologii i istorii narodov Kazakhstana), 139 p., ill., index.

This work provides a descriptive catalogue of the collection of Arabic, Persian and Turkic manuscripts of the Hazret-Sultan Museum in Turkestan (former Yasi), Kazakhstan. The catalogue contains 136 notices, classified by themes, and giving a systematic and rigorous description according to 27 codicological and palaeographical criteria. The thematic fields of this classification are: 1. Qur'an and Qur'anic sciences; 2. Hadith; 3. dogma; 4. *fiqh*; 5. logic; 6. philology; 7. poetry; 8. miscellany (*mutafarriqāt*). Around one third of the works represented are in Persian. M.S.

- [QURBONOV, Gholib] KURBANOV, Golib, [SCHWARZ] SHVARTS, Florian, *Katalog arabograficheskikh rukopisei Bukharskoi oblastnoi biblioteki im. Abu Ali ibn Siny / Abu Ali ibn*

*Sino nomidagi Bukhoro viloyati kutubkhonasini arab alifbosida iozilgan quliozmalar fihristi / Catalogue of the Arabic, Persian and Turkic Manuscripts in the Ibn Sina Library, Bukhara*, Bukhara: s.n., 1998, [vi]-102-[21] p., index.

The Oriental Section of the Regional Library of Bukhara owns a collection of 1,126 manuscripts, lithographed and typographic editions in Arabic characters. The present catalogue gives a brief description of the manuscripts, among which are some rare pieces — like documents coming from the private libraries of some grandees of pre-Soviet Bukhara, such as the jurist and polygraph Sadr-i Ziyā, or the courtier and chronicler Hishmat; like autographic works of the reformist thinker Dānish and of the historian Sāmī Bustānī. The catalogue is divided up into 14 chapters, according to the discipline to which each manuscript can be attached: 1 – Qurʾan and Qurʾanic sciences (6 units); 2 – *kalām*, *fiqh*, Hadith (17 units); 3 – philology (18 units); 4 – Sufism (39 units); 5 – poetry (55 units); 6 – prose (7 units); 7 – letters and various documents (3 units, among which a collection of documents coming from the chancellery of the Emirs Haydar and Nasr-Allah); 8 – philosophy, ethics and politics (14 units); 9 – poetics and rhetoric (3 units); 10 – music (1 unit); 11 – exact sciences (13 units); 12 – medicine and pharmacology (16 units); 13 – zoology (2 units); 14 – history (8 units). Among the little shortcomings which could be reproached to this work, let's mention its formal bilingualism, with headers in English and comments in Russian. The manuscripts, inside each section, are classified according to their registration number, but several indexes allow the reader to find his/her way through the volume (indexes of titles, authors, copyists, of different kinds of seals, production places and dates, registration numbers). Perhaps should the reader deplore, however, the absence of true descriptions of content, in particular for various collections of documents. We also regret the absence of reference to other existing copies of several works in other public (or private) collections of Central Asia, Russia, or the Middle East, neither to recent scientific publications on such and such of these works.

S.A.D.

■ RICHARD, Francis, "Manuscrits persans de la Bibliothèque Nationale de France se rapportant à l'Asie Centrale," *CAC* 7 (1999): 57-63.

This short study presents Persian manuscripts belonging to the Central Asian collections of the National Library of France. The author exposes the various specificities and origins (from the Decourdemanche, d'Ollone, or Edouard Blanc collections) of these books, of which a list is given. Ancient manuscripts are quite rare and the most significant production represented in the NLF is that of the 19th century.

R.

■ [SEMENOV] SEMIYĀNUF, A. A., ed., *Majmūʿe-ye noskhehā-ye khattī-ye fārsī-ye Farhangestān-e ʿolūm-e Jomhūrī-ye Ozbakestān*, 1-6 [Catalogue of the Persian Manuscripts of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Uzbekistan, 1-6], transl. from Russian to Persian by ʿĀref Ramazān, Tehran: Sāzmān-e madārek-e farhangī-ye enqelāb-e eslāmī (Farhangestān-e ʿolūm-e Jomhūrī-ye Ozbakestān, Moʼassese-ye khāvarshenāsī), 1375[1996-97], ix-354 p.

This is the Persian translation of the volumes 1 to 6 of the 11-volume catalogue of the Persian manuscripts of the Biruni Institute of Tashkent, published in Russian from 1952 to 1963. It is in fact a very abridged translation, which gives a brief description of the manuscripts described in each volume (title, author, date, dimensions and serial number). This work makes more accessible for the Iranian audience the rich content of the collection of Persian manuscripts of the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan. F.R.

■ SHCHEGLOVA, O. P., *Katalog litografirovannykh knig na persidskom iazyke v sobranii Vostochnogo Otdela Nauchnoi Biblioteki im. A.M. Gor'kogo Leningradskogo Gosudarstvennogo Universiteta* [Catalogue of the Lithographed Books in Persian in the Collection of the Oriental Department of the A.M. Gorky Scientific Library of the State University of Leningrad], Moscow: Nauka, 1989, 355 p.

820 Persian lithographed books, for the most part rare ones, are described with great precision in this catalogue of the collection of the University Library of St. Petersburg, by a specialist who has authored analogous catalogues of other collections. The indexes of the printing places and workshops show that Iranian editions are a majority in this fund, even if the most ancient (Bombay 1828) and recent ones (Bombay 1937) are Indian. A second index, very detailed, takes an inventory of author, publisher, printer and calligrapher names. The catalogue's classification is systematic (history, geography, biographies, anthologies, etc.). The introduction indicates the most important works of the collection: two Tabriz publications of 1841 are the oldest Iranian publications of the fund. Our knowledge of Persian lithographed edition makes considerable progress thanks to the publication of guidebooks of such a quality (see also the following review). F.R.

■ SHCHEGLOVA, O. P., "Kolleksiia litografirovannykh izdaniia na persidskom iazyke iz biblioteki Vostochnogo Fakul'teta MGU [The Collection of Lithographic Editions in Persian from the library of the Oriental Faculty of the Moscow State University]," in E.A. Doroshenko, A.I. Polishuk & N.A. Kuznetsova, eds., *Istoriografiia Irana novogo i noveishego vremeni: sbornik statei* [The Historiography of Modern and Contemporary Iran: Collected Papers], Moscow: Nauka, 1989: 236-248.

This article discusses the importance of a collection of 702 lithographed Persian language works published in Iran, Afghanistan, India, Central Asia and the Caucasus between 1828 and 1937, which were later acquired in Iran by Zhukovskii and his students. Some of the works included are not represented in the great bibliographical collections such as Storey's. This collection, the author argues, is extremely important material for the study of 19th century Persian literature, as it reveals a great deal about 19th century literary themes and popular taste. The collection consists of poetry, among which are works by poets from the constitutional period who are all but forgotten, a great deal of material on folklore, a series of *ta'ziye* texts, and materials on Iranian Sufism. In addition it includes some of the oldest translations from European literature into Persian. Perhaps the most important part are the 105 textbooks in the collection, a

systematic study of which would provide an invaluable insight into Iranian education, its themes and concern, before the introduction of modern schooling. R.M.

- SUBHAN, Abdus, *A Descriptive Catalogue of Central Asian Documents*, New Delhi: Northern Book Centre, 1997, XIII-196 p., index.

The present work is a selective catalogue of Persian manuscripts from Central Asia kept in various collections in the East of India (by order of their importance: the Asiatic Society of Calcutta, the Khuda Bakhsh Oriental Public Library of Patna, and the National Library of Calcutta). The manuscripts have been selected according to their contribution to the medieval and pre-modern history of Central Asia — which explains the place devoted to historiography, biography and genealogy, followed by literature, then by works of literary biography. For each title, the author gives a very detailed notice, followed by a physical description of the studied manuscript, by a list of other known copies of the same work, by a bibliography of modern studies devoted to the manuscript or based on it, and by a description of the content, often very precise, sometimes folio after folio. S.A.D.

- URUNBAEV, A., DZHALILOVA, R. P., *Sobranie vostochnykh rukopisei Akademii nauk Uzbekskoi SSR* [The Manuscripts Collection of the Academy of Sciences of the Uzbek SSR], vol. 11, Tashkent: Fan, 1987, 445 p.

Here is the eleventh volume of the series of catalogues of Persian manuscripts of the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan in Tashkent. The first volume had been published in 1952. This volume contains notices No. 6990 to 7574, and is classified methodically: 13 texts of history, among which recent autographic works; 16 works of *inshā*; 31 of philosophy; 67 of sciences, among which 44 of mathematics; 21 of medicine; 24 of prosody etc.; 91 of poetry; 26 of prose literature; 14 of folkloric literature; 5 of enigmas; 135 of religion; 7 of occult sciences; and 81 of Sufism. The notices have been written, and are signed by different specialists. As in the previous volumes, the composite manuscripts provide as many notices as they contain texts. All in all, this volume is accompanied by some illustrations, of a mainly palaeographic interest (see for instance No. 7347); it is equipped with good indexes (pp. 371-442), and rich of detailed notices conforming to the current needs of catalogue writing. It permits the reader to get acquainted with a varied collection, with some ancient copies (No. 7110 etc.), and several still unknown works (*e.g.*, *Maktūbāt-i Amīr Haydar*) — with a significant proportion of books copied in Central Asia.

F.R.

- [URUNBAEV, Asamidin] ŪRONBĀYEF, ‘Asām al-Dīn, MOWJĀNĪ, Seyyed ‘Alī, MŪSĀYEF, Shāh Niyāz, eds., *Fehrest-e nosakh-e khattī-ye fārsī-ye ganjīne-ye Ensūtū-ye sharqshenāsī-ye Abī Reyhān Bīrūnī, Tāshkand*, 1/1 – *Tārīkh* [Catalogue of the Persian Manuscripts from the Collection of the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies, Tashkent, 1/1 – History], Tehran: Markaz-e Motāle‘āt-e Āsiyā-ye markazī va Qafqāz-e vezārat-e omūr-e khāreje-ye Jomhūrī-

ye eslāmī-ye Īrān, Enstītū-ye sharqshenāsī-ye Abī Reyhān Bīrūnī-ye Ākādemī-ye ‘olūm-e Jomhūrī-ye Ozbakestān, 1376/1997, 118 p.

This little volume, the first of a larger series, is not a catalogue strictly speaking. (A catalogue does already exist: see the review *infra*.) The book rather provides a simple inventory of the Persian historical manuscripts of the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan, in Tashkent. The alphabetical classification makes the utilization easier. However, most of the notices are taken from the existing catalogue in Russian (*Sobranie vostochnykh rukopisei*, 11 vols., Tashkent, 1953-1987: see the preceding review), in an abridged version and almost without modification (although some of these notices are inaccurate, some openly erroneous). The only interest of this work is its publication in Persian, which makes easier for non-Russian speakers the access to the main manuscript collection of Tashkent. In 1998, a descriptive catalogue of manuscript works of history, of a much higher scientific importance, has been published in Tashkent (see *supra*: Iusupova & Dzhaliilova). M.S.

□ [VOHIDOV, Shodmonbek] VĀ‘EDŌF, Shādmān Bēk, [ERKINOV, Aftandil] ERKĪNŌF, Aftān Del, *Fehrest-e noskhehā-ye khattī-ye ketāb-khāne-ye Rownaqī, Shahr-i Sabz, Ozbakestān* [Catalogue of the Manuscripts of the Rawnaqī Library in Shahr-i Sabz, Uzbekistan], Qom: Ketābkhāne-ye bozorg-e Hazrat Āyatollāh al-‘ozmā Mar‘ashī Najafī, 1377 sh./1998, 72 p., pl.

This catalogue introduces a private collection of 79 manuscripts (and of about a hundred lithographed works), gathered by the calligrapher and copyist Fayz-Allah Khwāja b. ‘Ināyat-Allah Khwāja (1890-1978), better known under his penname Rawnaqī Shahr-i Sabzī, the son of a former mufti of Shahr-i Sabz, and himself a qadi of that city in the first years of the Soviet period. This collection, in which the leading place is occupied by works and anthologies of Persian and Turkic poetry, is per se an exceptional document on the practices of literature, and more generally of literacy, in the learned milieus of southern Central Asia during the Soviet period — in particular in the *khwāja* lineages which have continued to enjoy locally some intellectual and spiritual authority. The Rawnaqī fund also allows us to find or to follow the trace of numerous calligraphers of Transoxiana at the turn of the twentieth century — beginning with Rawnaqī himself, the author of treatises which represent, to this day, the latest known expression of the school of calligraphy of Shahr-i Sabz. S.A.D.

● WĀLI, Kurban, *Uyghur, Uzbek, Tatar qādimki üsārlār tizimlik* [A Catalogue of Old Uyghur, Uzbek and Tatar Books], [Kashghar]: Qāshqār Uyghur Nāshriyati, 1989.

This catalogue introduces a collection of 1,556 manuscripts and works written in Chaghatay, Persian, Arabic, Tatar and mixed languages, gathered by the Project group for the collection, arrangement, and publication of classical works of ethnic minorities in the Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region. This is the first catalogue that informs us about a number of old writings preserved in this region. They are classified into the following categories: literature and arts (544), history, geography, and biography (146),

religion and philosophy (555), culture and education (152), astronomy and calendar (33), law (35), medicine (44), pamphlets [*risala*] (47). The most regrettable is that they have not been available for any researchers.

More detailed review by ShinmenYasushi, *TG* 72/3-4 (1991): 114-121. R.

### *1.1.C. Catalogues and Descriptions of Collections of Documents*

■ ANDERSON, John, "Islam in the Soviet Archives. A Research Note," *CAS* 13/3 (1994): 383-394.

The author shortly evokes various collections of documents concerning the history of Islam in the USSR after 1937: in the Council for Religious Affairs of the Council of Ministers of the USSR (presently in the State Archive of the Russian Federation); in the Central Committee of the CPSU (presently in the Centre for the Preservation of Contemporary Documentation, in Moscow); and in the archive of the Agent of Yaroslavl' for Religious Affairs (presently at the Keaston Research Centre in Oxford, with a great amount of reports on Islam, in the late 1980s, by the Council of Religious Affairs of the RSFSR). S.A.D.

■ ATABAKI, Touraj, RUSTAMOVA-TOWHIDI, Solmaz, *Baku Documents. Union Catalogue of Persian, Azerbaijani, Ottoman Turkish and Arabic Serials and Newspapers in the Libraries of the Republic of Azerbaijan*, London – New York: I.B. Tauris Publishers, 1995 (Tauris Academic Studies), XIV-332 p., index.

The role of Baku as a centre of reformist and modernist thought, and as a crossroads between the Levant and the Russian Empire, the city's economic and administrative significance from the 1860s to the 1920s explain the presence of very rich collections of press in Arabic script in the public libraries of this city, and of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The authors offer us, in the present catalogue, a brief description of some 1,040 newspapers and journals published in Arabic alphabet, in 16 languages, among which an important proportion of publications in Persian. The catalogue is followed by several indexes of titles according to their languages, publication places, and fields of specialisation. It is made of a series of very brief notices, limited to the mention of: the title in Arabic script and Latin transcription; the language of publication; the issues of which copies can be found in Azerbaijani libraries; the publication place; the periodicity; and the various places of conservation of each journal or newspaper. The present catalogue permits the discovery and exact localisation of documents often unknown by historians of the modern Middle East and Central Eurasia. It offers an invaluable tool for the current exploration of the Turkic and Persian press of the Southern Caucasus, from the mid 19th century to the first years of the Soviet period. S.A.D.

● BİNARK, İsmet, *Osmanlı devleti ile Kafkasya, Türkistan ve Kırım hanlıkları arasındaki Münâsebetlere dâir arşiv belgeleri (1687-1908 yılları arası)* [Archive Documents Pertaining to Relations between the Ottoman Empire and the Khanates of the Caucasus, Turkistan and



the Crimea], Ankara: T.C. Başbakanlık, Devlet Arşivleri Genel Müdürlüğü, 1992 (Osmanlı Arşivi Daire Başkanlığı Yayın: 3), XLIII-240-99 p.

The Ottoman Archive in Istanbul has a lot of documents that reveal many aspects of historical relations between the Ottoman Empire and Central Eurasian Muslim states. This is the publication of 142 documents under the auspices of Turkish government with a great interest in Central Eurasia since the perestroika period. After the general introduction this volume is divided into three parts; 1st part: the summaries (1-57); 2nd part: transcription of the whole documents with a glossary and index (59-240); 3rd part: clear facsimiles of the 142 documents (241-339). Documents reserved in the counter parts should be researched in near future.

K.H.

● BİNARK, İsmet, *Osmanlı devleti ile Azerbaycan Türk hanlıkları arasındaki Münâsebetlere dâir arşiv belgeleri: Karabağ-Şuşa, Nahçıvan, Bakü, Gence, Şirvan, Şeki, Revan, Kuba, Hoy (1578-1914)* [Archive Documents Pertaining to Relations between the Ottoman Empire and the Azerbaijan Turkic Khanates: Karabag-Shusha, Nahchivan, Baku, Ganja, Shirvan, Sheki, Revan, Kuba, Hoy], Ankara: T.C. Başbakanlık, Devlet Arşivleri Genel Müdürlüğü, 1992 (Osmanlı Arşivi Daire Başkanlığı Yayın: 4), XXVIII-427 p. 1 map.

Being the second product of the Turkish project mentioned above, this is the publication of 88 Ottoman documents that reveal many aspects of historical relations between the Ottoman Empire and Azerbaijan Turkic khanates. Following the introduction (3-37), this volume is divided into two parts; 1st part: a summary and transcription of the whole documents with index (39-260); 2nd part: clear facsimiles of the 88 documents (261-427).

K.H.

● GOSMANOV [USMANOV], M. G., MÄRDANOV, R. F., *"Shura" zhurnalynyng bibliografik kürsätkeche* [A Bibliographical Index of the Journal *Shūrā*], Kazan: Milli Kitap năshriiate, 2000, 264 p., ill., index.

The present work offers an invaluable thematic index to the journal *Shūrā* (1908-1918), classified into main rubrics: social life (including religion, the national problem, feminine questions, etc.), history (of various foreign countries, of various Turkic peoples, and of the Tatars), philosophy (including a section on European philosophy), economy (trade, agriculture, etc.), education (among Tatars, Russians, and in various foreign countries, including Japan and India), literature (oral tradition, classic and modern Tatar literature, foreign literatures), language (including numerous references on the alphabet), art, press, natural sciences, the life of the journal itself, and an important index of the *Shūrā*'s collaborators (pp. 238-256). The whole work provides historians with an invaluable tool for self-location in one of the main titles of the "Muslim" press of Russia in the years between the first and the second revolution.

S.A.D.

● JARRING, Gunnar, "Eastern Turkestanica in the Swedish National Archives," *CAJ* 35/1-2 (1991): 55-61.

It is due to the Swedish mission established in Xinjiang between 1892 and 1938 that



the National Archives in Stockholm are in possession of a gigantic collection of photographs of the area. Yet it is thanks to the zealous missionary S. Fränne that these treasures could have been patiently put together. The collection covers numerous ethnographical subjects, as well as religious aspects (worship places, rituals), historical events (during the critical 1930s); it contains a large amount of pictures relating to foreign scientific expeditions through the Tarim Basin. The author points out the existence of a second very rich fund, namely, that of Rev. S. Moen. This preliminary article by G. Jarring could find an auspicious following in the publication of a clear-cut catalogue of the photographic material. A.P.

- [JURAEVA] ZHURAEVA, Gh., "Sharqshunoslik instituti vaqfnomalari [The *waqf-nāmas* of the Institute of Oriental Studies]," *Sharqshunoslik* 8 (1997): 170-177.

This brief description of the rich collection of *waqf-nāmas* (mainly in Persian, dated from 1463 to 1923) of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan, in Tashkent (the second in the country, after that of the State Central Archive of Uzbekistan) offers short presentations of several documents among the most interesting ones in this collection. S.A.D.

- KHISMATULLIN, A. A., VASIL'EVA, O., *Spisok-spravochnik fondov Tsentral'nogo gosudarstvennogo arkhiva Bashkirskoi SSR* [List-Guide of the Funds of the Central State Archive of the Bashkir SSR], Ufa: Bashkirskoe knizhnoe izdatel'stvo, 1991, 166 p.

The Central State Archive of the Bashkir SSR contains invaluable documents informing the history of the province of Ufa (then province of Orenburg, then the governorate of Ufa) during the Czarist period, from the 18th century onwards, and on the Bashkir ASSR (then SSR, nowadays the Republic of Bashkortostan) since 1917. The present volume constitutes the second, augmented edition of its catalogue, after that published in 1975 under the direction of L.A. Pakunina. It includes new notices on the acquisitions of the Archive during the past 16 years, as well as improvements of existing notices. Although this guide offers useful help for research in this extremely rich fund, one may deplore the total lack of attention of the authors for documents written in languages other than Russian. For this reason, the archive of the former Assembly of the Muhamedan Law (72,000 files...), which has been transmitted to the Central State Archive of the Bashkir ASSR in 1967, remains up till now deprived of a catalogue worth of this denomination. S.A.D.

- SIMS-WILLIAMS, U., *Union Catalogue of Persian Serials and Newspapers in British Libraries*, introduction by J. Gurney, London: Ithaca Press, 1985, xv-149 p.

The Middle East Libraries Committee (MELCom) needs no introduction. After the Union Catalogue of Arabic Serials and Newspapers, MELCom now presents a repertory of Persian language periodicals from sixteen selected libraries. As most of the holdings listed in the Union Catalogue of Persian Serials are available through inter-library loan or photocopying, the importance of the Union list transcends the confines of the

United Kingdom. It is to be hoped that a similar project of the University of Chicago, entitled "Persian and Tajik Language Serials in the United States," can be brought to an early completion.

The inventory aids researchers in the social, behavioral, and physical sciences and in the humanities, in locating primary source material from Iran, Afghanistan, Central Asia, and the Indian subcontinent and helps to identify vernacular holdings, produced by expatriate groups outside the region. The Union Catalogue is introduced by Dr. Gurney's critical survey of the state of Persian periodical holdings in the United Kingdom. The facts make sad reading, for one comes to realize that during the fifty years of the Pahlavi dynasty, in this field, Britain did not produce a scholar of the foresight, initiative and personal engagement to rival the motivation of E.G. Browne. Obviously, there has been no one with a remote interest in collecting the flood of journals by Iranian expatriates which have been readily available at bookshops such as Collet's or the Iranian Book Centre in London. Another conclusion is that Persian language serials have a low priority in British libraries.

The Union Catalogue of Persian Serials contains 639 items from all periods and of various frequencies. The initial listing was completed in 1983, but a few recent acquisitions have been added. Unfortunately, the compiler did not consider it necessary to record a good twenty serials referred to or listed in the footnotes to the introduction, all of which were acquired by British libraries before 1985. This omission is particularly serious if one takes a close look at the apparent number of items listed. Well over one hundred of them are of historical value only because they record the holdings of less than four issues. Then, too, serials which have been published under variant titles have been listed and counted separately. Thus the actual number of titles is considerably less than the total number of entries. The number of complete runs is insignificant, but could have been greater if libraries were acquiring those reprints which are becoming increasingly available, *e.g.* *Jangal*, *Mir'āt al-safar*, *Navīd*, *Sūr-i Isrāfīl*, *Urdū-yi Humāyūn*.

The material is arranged alphabetically by title; corporate entries have not been used at all, but the corporate authors are listed conveniently in the index of institutions at the end. The compiler has supplied the full bibliographical data whenever possible. The entries, arrangement and lay-out are excellent. Appended is a chronological index that lists everything under the Iranian chronology, *i.e.* also Afghan, Indian, and Tajik material. An index in Farsi would have been an invaluable help for any native speaker. The Union Catalogue is a good repertory of a poor collection. No library with Iranian holdings can afford not to acquire it.

W.B.

## 1.2 Epistemology, State of the Art

### 1.2.A. History of Various Disciplines and Institutions

- AKHMEDZHANOV, A. K., *Sovetskaia istoriografiia prisoedineniia Srednei Azii k Rossii* [The Soviet Historiography of the Reunion of Central Asia to Russia], Tashkent: Fan, 1989, 155 p.

This work has been published in Tashkent at the very eve of the revisions of the official history of the colonial period in Central Asia. However confusing (the critic of existing studies in economic, social and cultural history and that of the bibliography of the first revolutionary movements of the twentieth century have been gathered in one and the same chapter), the book provides interesting information on more or less recently published primary sources on the Russian colonisation of Central Asia, which is studied in the fifth chapter. S.A.D.

- ALEVRAS, Natal'ia, "Nachala evraziiskoi kontseptsii v rannem tvorchestve G.V. Vernadskogo i P.N. Savitskogo [The Basis of the Eurasian Conception of G.V. Vernadskii and P.N. Savitskii's First Works]," *VE* 1996/1 [2]: 5-17.

On the basis of the first, pre-revolutionary publications of two leading figures of the Eurasian movement of Russia, the historians G.V. Vernadskii and P.N. Savitskii, the author has tried to analyze the intellectual influences which have determined the initial orientation of the movement. The author underlines, in particular, the common insistence of both Vernadskii and Savitskii on the key role of physical geography in history — a legacy of the early twentieth century Russian historiography —, and at the same time their conceptual borrowings from Mackinder's geopolitical theories. As it is quite often the case in recent studies on Eurasianism, one may deplore the weak knowledge by the author of the primary sources of this intellectual movement, the most part of which is made of works published in Central and Western Europe in the 1920s-30s. (Only a little part of it has been re-published in Russia in the late 1980s and early 1990s.) To be signaled in passing: the Moscow-based journal *Vestnik Evrazii / Acta Eurasica* has become since its appearance in 1996 one of the main tribunes for critical discussion on present-day Neo-Eurasianism in the academic circles of the Federation of Russia (for a general survey of this tendency inside the journal, see: L. B. ALAEV, "Evraziia bez evraziistva (*Vestnik Evrazii. Nezavisimyi nauchnyi zhurnal*) [Eurasia without Eurasianism (*The Messenger of Eurasia, An Independent Scientific Journal*)]," *Vostok* 1999/2: 170-174). S.A.D.

- AL'MEEV, R. V., "K istorii sozdaniia i razvitiia bukharskogo muzeia-zapovednika [Contribution to the History of the Preserve-Museum of Bukhara]," *ONU* 2000/1: 41-48.

This paper introduces the history of the Preserve-Museum of Bukhara since its creation in November 1922 till the present, through documents from the Central State Archive

of Uzbekistan in Tashkent, and from the Museum's archive. These documents allow the author to reconstruct the ideological substratum of the Museum's activity in the fatal 1930s and 1940s. They also bear testimony of the overall professionalisation of history in Central Asia during the first decades of the Soviet period. Significantly, the period from the 1980s to the present is the association of the Museum with the growing tourist activity in Bukhara and its neighborhood. In short, this paper provides a captivating summary of the economic and political backgrounds of local lore, history and museography in Uzbekistan through the roaring twentieth century. S.A.D.

- ASHNIN, Fedor, ALPATOV, Vladimir, "Vostokovedy v dele 'Rossiiskaia natsional'naia partiia' [The Orientalists in the Case of the 'National Party of Russia']," *Vostok* 1994/5: 228-229.

This very short paper brings precisions to the martyrology of Russian Orientalists repressed in the 1930s, launched by the journal *Narody Azii i Afriki* (then *Vostok*) in 1990. The paper opens a series of contributions by the same authors (see reviews *infra* in this section) on the political and judicial "repression of Oriental studies" in Russia. It introduces the repression against specialists of the Soviet East in the Ethnographic Department of the Russian Museum (later Ethnographic Museum of the Peoples of the USSR), on the pretext of the conspiracy of a National Party of Russia, totally forged by the OGPU. The authors provide short biographies of the scientists arrested in this framework, and bring many corrections to their first martyrology. S.A.D.

- ASHNIN, Fedor, ALPATOV, Vladimir, "Evraziistvo v zerkale OGPU – NKVD – KGB [Eurasianism in the Mirror of the OGPU, NKVD, and KGB]," *VE* 1996/2 [3]: 5-18.

On the basis of the file of the "National Party of Russia" kept in the Central Archive of the FSB (former KGB) in Moscow, the authors propose a study of the way the OGPU, then NKVD have made use of the Eurasian movement, through a wave of prosecutions opened in 1933-34, for pressuring the Russian émigré intelligentsia. Consulted documents allow the authors to make some considerations of the (very relative) spreading of Eurasian ideas in the academic milieus of Moscow and Saint Petersburg up till the mid-1930s. S.A.D.

- ASHNIN, F. D., ALPATOV, V. M., "Arkhirnye dokumenty o gibel'i akademika A.N. Samoilovicha [Archive Documents on the Death of the Academician A.N. Samoilovich]," *Vostok* 1996/5: 153-162.

The numerous works devoted to the life and work of the Russian turcologist Aleksandr Nikolaevich Samoilovich (1880-1938), a specialist of Chaghatay language (see G. F. BLAGOVA, "Akademik A.N. Samoilovich i izuchenie literaturnogo nasledii Zahir ed-Dina Mukhammeda Babura [The Academician A.N. Samoilovich and the study of the literary legacy of Zahir al-Din Muhammad Babur]," *Vostok* 1997/6: 120-128) used till recent years to stumble against the causes of his mysterious disappearance, in September 1937, in the Kislovodsk spa. These circumstances have been uncovered thanks to the recent discovery of a file in the archive of the FSB (former KGB) in St.

Petersburg, which reveals Samoilovich's arrest, death condemnation and execution for "spying for Japan." Deprived of explanations on the reasons of this repression (quite a rare occurrence among Soviet Academicians non-affiliated to the Communist Party), the authors attach it to the arrests made in August-September 1937 among the specialists of Inner Asia and the Far-East in the Leningrad Institute of Oriental Studies, in the framework of a wider witch hunt justified by the alleged presence of a "fifth column" inside Russia's academic intelligentsia. These considerations stress the importance of the discovered documents for the understanding of the specific political background of "Oriental studies" in Russia and the USSR in the years before the beginning of the Second World War. At the same time, the valuation of Samoilovich's fate is also characteristic of the present period, when the academic circles of the capitals of the former USSR are confronted with the necessity to build up a new legitimacy — which may explain their quest for martyrs among leading figures of "Oriental studies," which in Russia used to have close links with political power.

Among other victims of the 1937-38 repressions among the scientists of Oriental studies in Russia, the authors have devoted other studies, such as "Iz sledstvennogo dela E.D. Polivanova [Out of E.D. Polivanov's Judicial File]," *Vostok* 1997/5: 124-142; and "Delo professora B.V. Choban-zade [The Case of Professor B.V. Choban-zade]," *ibid.* 1998/5: 125-133), devoted to the Crimean Tatar political activist (in the Milli Firqä) and philologist Bekir Choban-Zade (1893-1937), a specialist of Azerbaijani language and literature. Choban-Zade's arrest and execution in 1937 are resituated by the author within the struggle for political power between antagonistic factions of the Azerbaijani Communist party — namely those led respectively by Ruh-Allah Ali-ugli Akhundov (1897-1938), Choban-Zade's protector, and M.D. Bagirov, the leader of the Azerbaijani CP from 1933 onwards and a close associate of Lavrentii Beria's in the Southern Caucasian repressions of the mid-1930s (see also, by the same: "Delo Rukhully Akhundova [Ruh-Allah Akhundov's Case]," *ibid.* 2000/2: 91-108, and our review in p. 108). S.A.D.

- BATUNSKY, Mark, "Russian Clerical Islamic Studies in the Late 19th and Early 20th Centuries," *CAS* 13/2 (1994): 213-235.

The author surveys the social, political, and theological motivations which can explain the specific role played by the Orthodox missionaries in the political marginalization of the Muslim populations of the Russian Empire — and, by reaction, in the appearance of early 20th-century "Muslim" nationalist movements, which have further put into discussion the official equation Russification = Christianization. S.A.D.

- GERMANOV, V. A., "'Vostochnyi front' [The 'Oriental Front']," *Vostok* 1996/3: 115-137.

The discovery by the author — a renowned historian of early Soviet Central Asia — of documents on the life and work of the Russian Orientalist Mikhail Stepanovich Andreev (1873-1948) in the Archive of the SNB (former KGB) of Uzbekistan, has permitted him to reconstruct, with a rare abundance of details, the tough academic life of

the 1920s-1930s in Tashkent's institutions of Oriental studies. A rich biographical material allows the author to cast a crude light on the multiple conflicts of these fatal years — between the overall scientific and administrative or political logics, and more concretely between the Bartholdian and the Marxist-Leninist schools of the history of Central Asia, and even more precisely between the Marxist historian and administrator M.M. Tsvibak (d. 1938) and numerous representatives of the academic communities. Interestingly, the materials studied by the author seem to be focusing exclusively on the Russian-speaking academic milieus communities of early Soviet Uzbekistan: no word is said on the relations, or the lack of exchange between these communities and the autochthonous Uzbekistani intelligentsia, which as usually in the Russian-centred historiography of human and social sciences in Central Asia plays its role as a discreet wall-painting. S.A.D.

■ [GOSMANOV] USMANOV, M. A., et al., ed., *Kazanskoe vostokovedenie: traditsii, sovremennost', perspektivy. Tezisy i kratkoe sodержanie dokladov mezhdunarodnoi nauchnoi konferentsii 10-11 noiabria 1996 goda* [Oriental Studies in Kazan: Their Traditions, Present Situation, and Perspectives. Abstracts of the Papers to the International Conference Held on November 10-11, 1996], Kazan: Izdatel'stvo "FEST," 1996 (Kazanskii gosudarstvennyi universitet – Institut istorii Akademii nauk Respubliki Tatarstan – Ministerstvo kul'tury Respubliki Tatarstan), 304 p.

In spite of the extreme heterogeneity and the excessive shortness of contributions, this collection of papers, which is dominated by Turkic linguistics, provides a useful — and quite rare — survey of two centuries of research in one of the most ancient centres of Oriental studies in Russia, and gives interesting information on the current trends of disciplines which have benefited from a relative renewal since the last years of the Soviet period. S.A.D.

● ITINA, M. A., LEVINA, L. M., NERAZIK, E. E., RAPOPORT, I. U. A., "K 60-letii Khorezmskoi arkheologicheskoi ekspeditsii [For the 60th Anniversary of the Khwarezmian Archaeological and Ethnographic Expedition]," *EO* 1996/6: 19-33.

The paper gives an overview of the activity of the Khwarezmian Archaeological and Ethnographic Expedition since its creation in 1937. Although the bulk of the expedition's material concerns ancient and medieval periods, the author remembers its occasional works on monuments of a more recent past — such as 17th and 18th-century Kazakh and Karakalpak villages and *mazārs* in the delta of the Syr-Darya, or more global studies on the ethnography of the Eastern shore of the Aral Sea (e.g., L. M. LEVINA, *Etnikul'turnye protsessy v Vostochnom Priaral'e* [Ethnic and Cultural Processes in the Eastern Shore of the Aral], Moscow, 1996). This contribution on contemporary studies has been studied by T. A. ZHDANKO, "Etnograficheskie issledovaniia i etnografy Khorezmskoi ekspeditsii [Ethnographic Studies and the Ethnographs of the Khwarezm Expedition]," *EO* 1997/1: 70-85, Eng. sum.; 1997/2: 15-34, Eng. sum. S.A.D.

■ KIM, G. M., SHASTITKO, P. M., eds., *Istoriia otechestvennogo vostokovedeniia do serediny XIX veka* [History of Domestic Oriental Studies before the Mid-19th Century], Moscow: Nauka, 1990 (Akademiia nauk SSSR, Ordena Trudovogo Krasnogo Znameni Institut vostokovedeniia), 435 p.

This collection of papers reconstructs the history of Oriental studies in Russia, Ukraine, Lithuania and in Kazan, from the spreading of the first information on the Orient in early medieval Rus', up till the zenith of Czarist imperialism in the 1870s. The numerous contributions present intellectual biographies of prominent figures of Oriental studies in Russia, and for each period they characterize the main schools and orientations of research.

S.A.D.

■ LARUELLE, Marlène, *L'idéologie eurasiste russe ou comment penser l'empire*, Paris: L'Harmattan, 1999, 423 p., bibliography, appendixes.

To our knowledge, the present work is the first ever published monograph on Eurasianism — a historiographical movement and scientist ideology which developed in the Russian émigré intelligentsia during the 1920-1930s, and enjoys again, since the last years of the Soviet period, a considerable audience in Russia as well as in some former Soviet republics, in Kazakhstan in particular. The author has had a privileged access to the archives of the Eurasian movement, in Prague in particular, and her documentary basis is very close to exhaustiveness. M.L. also masters the complex philosophical substratum from which Eurasianism was detached as a distinct ideology. The result is a complete study of the ideological postulates of Eurasianism, in particular of its specific historiosophy, which is based on a forest-steppe dualism, of which the Golden Horde and Muscovy have provided, to the Eurasists' eyes, perfect expressions. We may perhaps deplore that the author has not extended the scope of her study to the present reinterpretations of Eurasianism (in the more general framework of the renewal of traditional thought in Russia since the early 1970s: see on this point the current researches by Mark Sedgwick), neither to its utilization in the academic, political and military milieus of the Federation of Russia (see on this points the works by Françoise Thom). However, these are recent developments in the history of this thought, to which the author has already begun to devote distinct works. (See also, by the same author: "Jeux de miroir. L'idéologie eurasiste et les allogènes de l'Empire russe," *CEMOTI* 28 (2000): 207-229).

S.A.D.

● LAUMULIN, M. T., "Razvitie vostokovedeniia vo Frantsii i izuchenie Tsentral'noi Azii [The Development of Oriental Studies in France and the Study of Central Asia]," *Vostok* 2000/3: 169-190, bibliography.

The recent developments of Central Asian studies in France are resituated in a detailed panorama of the long history of Oriental studies and sinology in this country. The pages on current research and publication activity on Central Asia (182-6) are divided into paragraphs on classical oriental studies, political science, and economy. Unfortunately not very familiar with French scientific institutions and circles, the author totally miss-

es the specific genealogy of Central Asian studies in France. This lacuna brings him to numerous confusions in the classification of various scientists, journals and organizations. (Bringing together into one and the same category R. Dor, a well-known ethno-linguist, C. Poujol, a long-established historian of Russian colonisation of Turkestan, and O. Roy, a political scientist specializing in contemporary Iran, Afghanistan and Transoxiana reveals the level of approximation of the present study.) The bibliography of 151 ill-assorted references attached to the paper brings together monographs and papers of varied status and uneven quality, from the 18th century to the present.

See also on the same subject a previous study by S. M. GORSHENINA ("Nauchnaia struktura issledovaniia Srednei Azii i arabskogo mira vo Frantsii [The Scientific Structure of the Study of Central Asia and of the Arab World in France]," *ONU* 1998/10-11: 55-65), in which the author enumerates the main French education and research institutions, as well as some public libraries, which specialize in Central Asian studies (the "Arab world" of the title is evoked just in passing). S.A.D.

- LAUMULIN, Murat Turarovich, BEISEMBIEV, Timur Kasymovich, *Zarubezhnye issledovateli Srednei Azii i Kazakhstana: bibliograficheskii ukazatel'* [Foreign Scholars of Middle Asia and Kazakhstan: A Bio-Bibliographical Survey], Almaty: Kenzhe-Press, 1994, 98 p.

This book offers a short study of a heterogeneous selection of "orientalists" and "sovi-etologists" from outside the Soviet world, including some representative of Central Asian émigrés active in Western Europe and Turkey. The personal notice of each author — which includes 18th and 19th-century European travelers as well as Western historians of the Communist party — comprises a brief evocation of his/her specialization, and a very short list of significant publications. These notices are followed by a thematic index, and by an essay by M.T. Laumulin ("The Kazakhs: the View from Outside," 90-98) who searches confirmation, in the works of Western social scientists, of the efforts made by Kazakh ethnographers, during the Soviet period, for the fixation and preservation of "national traditions." S.A.D.

- NAVRUZOV, Gul'duz, *Formirovanie nauchnogo tsentra v Tadjikistane (1924-1950 gg.)* [The Formation of a Scientific Centre in Tajikistan], Dushanbe: Donish, 1992 (Akademiia nauk Tadjikskoi SSR, Institut istorii i arkhologii i etnografii im. A. Donisha), 310 p.

This history of scientific research in Tajikistan, from the foundation of the Tajik Soviet Autonomous Republic in 1924, until the creation of the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan in 1951, underlines the role played by Russian scientists in the first development of Tajikistani research institutions. S.A.D.

- RZAEV, Agababa Kasum oglu, *Azerbaidzhanskii vostokovedy XIX veka: ocherki* [Nineteenth Century Azerbaijani Orientalists: Sketches], Baku: Elm, 1986, 139 p.

Based for the most part on archive documents from Moscow, Leningrad, Baku, Kazan, Astrakhan, and on the journals of the time, this monograph studies the scientific activity of prominent Azerbaijani orientalists, and their contribution to the development of



the field. Have been studied the works of Mirza Ja'far Topchibashev, Mirza Kazem-Bek, Abdulsattar Kazem-Bek, Mirza Kazim-Bek Abedinov and Mirza Abdulla Gafarov. C.P.

- SAGNAEVA, S. K., "Ural'skaia tema v nauchnom nasledii E.E. Blomkvist [The Uralic Theme in E.E. Blomkvist's Scientific Legacy]," *EO* 1992/4: 84-90.

Dealing with the history of Soviet ethnography, the present article shows the special place of the "Uralic" topic in Evgenia Blomkvist's works. Through her interest in Central Asia, the ethnographer enriched our knowledge of others groups. The modern Uralic population in Central Asia includes some groups of Ural Cossacks, deported to the regions of the Amu-Darya and Syr-Darya Rivers in the 1870s. Most Cossacks, old-believers, have then kept a lot of archaic features in everyday life and culture. The article is based on Blomkvist's letters from Tashkent and Karakalpakia to different correspondents during WWII (letters kept in her personal file in the St. Petersburg Archive of the Institute and Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography). The book "Bukhtarma's Old-Believers" was written by E.E. Blomkvist in collaboration with N.P. Grynko but never published; only one chapter was published in 1947, another posthumously in 1972; other materials (887 pages) still lie in the Archive. X.L.T.

- SAIDMURADOV, S. D., MAL'TSEV, Iu. S., *Iz istorii vostokovedeniia v Tadjikistane (1917-1958)* [Elements of the History of Oriental Studies in Tajikistan (1917-1958)], Dushanbe: Donish, 1990 (Akademiia nauk Tadjikskoi SSR, Institut vostokovedeniia), 208 p., bibliography.

The present monograph appears as the first result of a long term work on the history of Oriental studies in Tajikistan, of which the authors have reconstructed the main steps, from the 1917 revolution to the creation of the Department of Oriental Studies and Manuscripts of the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan in 1958. The authors have attached to their study a long bibliography, which includes works by the main researchers of the Institute of Oriental Studies from 1958 to 1985 (pp. 85-204).

S.A.D.

- TEMİR, A., *Türkoloji Tarihinde Wilhelm Radloff Devri* [Wilhelm Radloff's Time in the History of Turcology], Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu, 1991 (552), xv-191 p.

Wilhelm Radloff (1837-1918) has laid to posterity an exceptional legacy in linguistics, philology and ethnography of the Turkic world. This homage volume is not a collective one and gives, therefore, a readable and consistent portrait in three parts: biographical, scientific and bibliographical. The first part relates especially the activities of Radloff in St. Petersburg — an international capital of Oriental studies —; in Siberia and Turkestan where Radloff led huge expeditions; and in Kazan where he dealt with linguistic problems and *maktab* educational questions. Adding (in footnotes) numerous short biographies of contemporaneous orientalist and scholars, including Tatar Muslim intellectuals in touch with Radloff, the book shows how the latter kept a central posi-

tion (intellectual and academic) in the history of Turkic studies. In the second part, the author analyses the four topics covered by Radloff's scientific work: collections of popular literature, dictionaries, grammars and mission reports. Ending by the bibliography of publications and re-issues between 1858 and 1930, this portrait suggests that Radloff's time in the history of Turkic studies corresponds to a time when turcology played a central role in Central Eurasian studies.

Reviewed by Sultan Tulu, *CAJ* 38/2 (1994): 302-304.

A.P.

■ TÜRK DİL KURUMU, *1926 Bakû türkoloji kongresinin 70. yıl dönümü toplantısı (29-30 Kasım 1996)* [The Commemorative Meeting for the 70th Anniversary of the Baku Turcological Congress in 1926 (November 29-30, 1996)], Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu, 1999 (Atatürk Kültür, Dil ve Tarih Yüksek Kurumu, Türk Dil Kurumu Yayınları: 726), 119 p.

A majority of this collection of papers in Turkish and Azerbaijani concern the history of the First Turcological Congress, in Baku in 1926. That was a crucial date in the Soviet nationalities policy — with notably the adoption of the Latin alphabet for the Turkic languages of the USSR. The first paper is devoted to the influence of German academic circles upon the young Soviet turcology (KAZIMOĞLU, Samir, "Alman türkologları ve Birinci Bakû Türkoloji Kongresi (Prof. Dr. Georg Jakob, Prof. Dr. Theodor Menzel, Prof. Dr. Paul Witteck)," 1-5; see also DEMIREL, Ömer Faruk, "I. Türkoloji Kongresi ve Theodor Menzel," 27-65). The second study is a historical survey of the congress and its various resolutions (HÂSÂNLİ, Cämil, "Birinci Türkoloji Qurultaya Qısa Tarixi Baxış," 7-12). The following paper concerns the role played in the Congress by representatives from the Volga-Urals region (ÖNER, Mustafa, "I. Bakû Türkoloji Kongresinde İdil-Ural Türkleri," 13-25). Then comes a comparative perspective between the Congress of Baku and the current problems of turcology in the Southern Caucasus (NÂRİMANOĞLU, Kamil Vâli, "1926-çı il Baky Türkölözhi Gurultajy vâ Chaghdash Türkologiiyanyn Problemläri," 67-77). The two next studies are an analysis of the role of an Azerbaijani Philologist in the adoption of Latin alphabet in Soviet Turkestan (TÖKER, Mustafa, "Türkistan'ın Lâtin Alfabesine Geçmesinde Büyük Rol Oynayan Halid Seid Hocaev ve Yeni Elifba Yollarında Eski Hatıra ve Duygularım Adlı Eseri," 79-89), and of the role of a Crimean Tatar delegate in the Congress of Baku (ACAR, Kenan, "Bakû Türkoloji Kurultayının Faal Delegelerinden Bekir Sıtkı Çobanzade," 91-95 [on the latter, see *supra* our review of Ashnin & Alpatov in this section]). The volume goes on with a short note on the influence of the Congress of Baku on the Soviet policy towards national languages (NÂSİBZADÂ, Näsib, "Sovet Siyasätinde Bakû Türkoloji Kurultayının Yeri (Täbliğın Başlıca Tezläri)," 97-100). Then comes a paper on the Congress's discussions on the notions of "literary" language and "popular" language (İSMAİLOĞLU, Tavfık, "Birinci Türkoloji Qurultayda Ädäbi Dil Mäsäläsi," 101-110). After a short meditation on the common substratum of Oghuz Turkic speaking peoples (AHMEDOV, Hasan, "I. Bakû Türkoloji Kurultayının 70. Yıl Dönümü Dolayısıyla Türkmenşeli Halklarda Siyasî Fikir," 111-113), the volume is concluded by a last paper on the role played during the Congress by the Kazakh writer

Ahmad Baytursun (TAMIR, Ferhat, "Ahmet Baytursinoğlu ve 1926 Bakû Türkoloji Kongresi Kurultayı," 115-119). The whole set of papers provides a vivid and rich description of the Congress of Baku, as well of its implications for the Soviet national policy. S.A.D.

■ VALEEV, R. M., *Kazanskoe vostokovedenie: istoki i razvitie (XIX v. – 20e gody XX v.)* [Oriental Studies in Kazan: Their Origins and Development (in the 19th Century up till the 1920s)], Kazan: Izdatel'stvo Kazanskogo universiteta, 1998, 380 p., bibliography, appendix.

After a first commemorative volume published in 1996 (cf. *supra* in this section: Gosmanov), this monograph reconstructs the history of the second centre of Oriental studies in Russia after Saint Petersburg. The author shows particularly interested in the history of the teaching of Oriental languages and in the study of Islam, which are resituated in the context of the development of Orthodox Christian missionary activity (of which Kazan was also a leading centre), and of learned societies in the second half of the nineteenth and first decades of the twentieth century. S.A.D.

■ VIGASIN, A. A., KHOKHLOV, A. N., SHASTITKO, P. M., eds., *Istoriia otechestvennogo vostokovedeniia s serediny XIX veka do 1917 goda* [History of Domestic Oriental Studies from the mid-19th Century to 1917], Moscow: Izdatel'skaia firma "Vostochnaia literatura" RAN, 1997, 536 p., bibliography (pp. 478-520), index.

This voluminous synthesis is opened by a historical survey of the main institutions of Oriental studies and research in Imperial Russia, then of the "Asiatic" Departments of the Ministries of Foreign Affairs and War. Then comes an important chapter on "Near-Eastern" studies, focusing on Iranian studies, with biographies of A.K. Kazem-Bek, V.V. Grigor'ev, N.I. Veselovskii and V.V. Bartol'd. The most important part of the whole work is devoted, however, to (Buddhist) Central and Eastern Asia, notably through V.P. Vasil'ev's works in the University of St. Petersburg. S.A.D.

□ ZARCONI, Thierry, *Boukhara l'interdite, 1830-1888. L'Occident moderne à la conquête d'une légende*, Paris: Autrement, 1997, 187 p., 2 maps, ill., appendixes, glossary, bibliography.

Under a unique title, the present monograph is divided, in fact, into two distinct parts. The first one is devoted to the role which has been played by dressing up and disguise in the approach of Bukhara by nineteenth-century European travellers and scholars. The author has been particularly interested in two of the latter: the Savoyard J.J.P. Desmaisons and the Hungarian Arminius Vámbéry. The chapter on Desmaisons is based on a Russian translation of an unpublished mission report in French (cf. N. A. KHALFIN, ed., *Zapiski o Bukharskom khanstve (Otchety P.I. Demezona i I.V. Vitkevicha)* [Notes on the Khanate of Bukhara (The Reports by P.I. Desmaisons and I.V. Vitkevich)], Moscow: Glavnaia Redaktsiia Vostochnoi Literatury, 1983: 17-83). The second part of the work is an evocation of the city of Bukhara in the 19th century, through some Russian and Western sources, as well as through some Soviet publica-

tions.

One may be particularly pleased about the fact that this work makes accessible, for a large French-speaking audience, some of the main authors of the European travelling literature on Central Asia — Desmaisons in particular, whose work remains for the most part unpublished in its original language. The cultural, even political background of this literature is well analyzed, notably through the personal links of several traveller writers with Masonry. The best pages of the whole book remain those, very relevant, on the physical expressions of a Muslim identity, and on the difficulty for European travellers to use cunning with their Christian body. (See in particular a paragraph on the varied orientation of forearm's hair among Sunnis and Shiites, according to the form of their respective ablutions.) Thanks to his familiarity with "participating anthropology," the author writes in full knowledge of the facts. A renowned specialist of the history of Sufism, he offers us interesting pages on the role of solidarity networks in the world of mystical orders.

S.A.D.

■ ЗИОЕВ, Н. [ЗИАЕВ, Kh.], "XIX asrning ikkinchi iarmi – XX asrning boshlarida Uzbekiston tarikhining organilishi khususida [About the Study of the History of Uzbekistan in the Second Half of the 19th and the Early 20th Century]," *ONU* 1993/8: 65-70.

This short, but edifying paper casts light on the weight of political pressures which have determined history writing in Uzbekistan, between the red terror of the mid-1930s and the proclamation of independence in 1991. Some doubts may be expressed on the author's optimism, when he asserts that the new situation created by the dissolution of the USSR gives way to a climate favourable to the "return" to a healthy "objectivity." Still untouched by Post-Modern critique, Uzbekistani historiography seems to be tempted to continue, through a cult of objectivity, the Soviet tradition of selecting in the past elements that can appear as antecedents, or justifications of the current political situation.

S.A.D.

### 1.2.B. Bio-Bibliographical Data, Obituaries

■ BAYKARA, T., *Zeki Velidi Togan*, Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı (Türk Büyükleri Dizisi: 110), 1989, IX-229p.

As it is well known, the checkered career of Zeki Velidi Togan (1890-1970) is described in his *Hâtıralar: Türkistan ve Diğer Müslüman Doğu Türklerinin Milli Varlık ve Kültür Mücadeleleri* [Memoirs: National and Cultural Struggles of Turkestan and Other Muslim Eastern Turks], Istanbul: TAN Matbaası, 1969. The present work, prepared by one of his students in the Istanbul University, consists of his short biography, academic life, thought, the full bibliography listed by year from 1911 to 1970, and rich appendixes including his short articles, selections from his main works, and others. After the rehabilitation of Togan in Bashkortostan this work was translated into Bashkir language and published.

A Russian translation with appendixes has been published in Bashkortostan:

Tundzher BAIKARA, *Zaki Validi Togan*, sostavlenie, perevod na russkii iazyk, dopolneniia, ukazatel' R.M. Bulgakova, A.M. Iuldashbaeva, Ufa: Kitap, 1998, 328p. K.H.

- GAFUROVA, N. B., "90-letiiu Bobodzhana Gafurovicha Gafurova [Bobojan Ghafurovich Ghafurov's 90th Anniversary]," *Vostok* 1999/6: 142-146.

This account on an international conference organized in New Delhi on July 28-29, 1999 about the Tajik Communist leader and historiographer Bobojon Ghafurov (1909-1977) illustrates the way academic meetings of this kind, perfectly devoid of scientific interest, have been used by newly independent Tajikistan for enhancing this country's diplomatic relations with powerful neighbors. It also stresses the importance India has long enjoyed in the political imaginary of Soviet and post-Soviet Tajikistani political leaders. S.A.D.

- GORSHENINA [GORCHENINA], S. M., "Tsentral'naia Aziia v tvorchestve Zhozefa-Antuana Kastan'e [Central Asia in the Works of Joseph-Antoine Castagné]," *Vostok* 1999/1: 130-146.

Written with a special documentary care, this study establishes for the first time an almost complete biography of the traveler J.-A. Castagné (1875-1948), the author of works on the archeology and ethnography of Central Asia. However, due to her will to fully rehabilitate a figure who was for long sharply criticized in the academic circles of the USSR, the author tends to overestimate his scientific contribution, or at least the echo given to his works in pre-revolutionary Turkestan. (On this aspect, see the useful — albeit excessively condescending — clarification by the Russian Iranologist B. A. LITVINSKII, "Zh.-A. Kastan'e — issledovatel'-uchenyi ili liubitel'-kraeved? [J.-A. Castagné: A Researcher and Scholar, or a Mere Amateur of Local Lore?]," *ibid.*: 147-155.) It should be more difficult, in the future, to discover new documents on Castagné's life and work, but a critical estimation of his overall intellectual contribution remains perhaps to be done. S.A.D.

- KOMISSAROV, D. S., "Vydaiushchiisia uchenyi, organizator vostochnogo literaturovedeniia [A Prominent Scholar, the Organizer of the History of Oriental Literatures]," *Vostok* 1995/4: 157-163.

This very elliptical study on the work of the Soviet historian of Persian literature Iosif Samuilovich Braginskii enumerates the main contributions of this author, without really dealing with his ultra-orthodox positions in the polemics of the 1940s-50s about the application to "Oriental" literatures of the historical schemes of Marxism-Leninism. More telling is the publication of an "Autobiography" written by Braginskii in 1955, the manuscript of which is kept in the archive of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Russia. Its author describes himself as a unrepentant Stalinist for whom the ideological Thaw of the mid-1950s was a "betrayal" ([BRAGINSKII, Iosif Samuilovich], "Avtobiografiia," *ibid.*, 148-156). This little commemorative file is closed by an apologetic paper of personal souvenirs on Braginskii (A. M. MODEL', "Vo glave zhurnala" [At the Head of the Journal], *ibid.*, 163-165); the paper remembers with a

naïve clumsiness the extremely conservative positions defended by Braginskii at the direction of the journal *Vostok* (which was called first *Sovetskoe vostokovedenie*, then since 1959 *Problemy vostokovedeniia*) during all the Perestroika period. Such an open celebration of the figure of Braginskii reveals the permanence of a strong reactionary current in Russian Oriental studies, and the spreading of an overall nostalgia for pre-Gorbachev times in the academic milieu of Russia. S.A.D.

- LUKASHOVA, Natal'ia, "V.P. Nalivkin: eshche odna zamechatel'naia zhizn'" [V.P. Nalivkin: Still a Remarkable Life], *VE* 1-2 [6-7] (1999): 38-60, 1 ill.

This study evaluates the contribution of new documents, in particular of personal papers kept in the State Archive of the Federation of Russia, to the biography of the Russian orientalist Vladimir Petrovich Nalivkin (1852-1918), who was active in Turkestan from 1872 to his death. The author casts light on the lack of a clear demarcation line between Nalivkin's research work and his social and political preoccupations — in his writings on Central Asia as well as in his personal engagement in the Menshevik current of the Social-Democratic Party of Russia. S.A.D.

- MEFTĀH, Elhāme, WALĪ, Wahhāb, *Īrānshenāsī va īrānshenāsān-e keshvarhā-ye moshtarak ol-manāfe' va Qafqāz* [Iranian Studies and Iranologists in the CIS and the Caucasus] Tehran: Enteshārāt-e beyn ol-melalī al-Hodā, 1372/[1993], 195 p.

The present volume provides a good example of the interesting contribution of the descriptive academic literature in Persian to the bibliography of modern Central Eurasian studies. It opens with several chapters on the overall orientations of Iranian studies (largely speaking) in the former USSR and present CIS countries, with an expected special interest in linguistic studies (on Persian and Pamirian languages, in particular). This introductory part is followed by chapters on the organisation of Iranian (mainly Persian) studies in specific countries of the CIS: Azerbaijan, Armenia, Uzbekistan, Ukraine, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, and Georgia. After a short panoramic paragraph of the history of cultural exchanges between Iran and each of these countries, the author lists the research institutions, the Persian university departments, and the main public collections of Persian manuscripts and documents. All in all, despite the author's obvious ignorance of Russian language, and the paucity of his bibliography (in Persian, Turkish, and English), the book offers interesting and convenient, although elliptic and non-critical, information for the localisation of research and teaching activity in Iranian studies throughout the former USSR. S.A.D.

- OVSIANNIKOV, V. I., "Neopublikovannoe pis'mo A.K. Kazem-Beka v 'Russkoe Slovo' [A Non-Published Letter by A. Kazem-Bek to the *Russkoe Slovo*]," *Vostok* 1995/1: 159-166.

This paper offers a critical edition of a letter sent by Aleksandr Kazem-Bek to the journal *Russkoe Slovo* ["The Russian Word"] in January 1860. The famous Russian orientalist of South-Caucasian origin expresses his vision of Russia's civilizing mission in

the Near- and Middle-East, and advocates a greater attention of the Russian authorities for the development of Oriental studies. More than 140 years later, this appeal is endorsed by the editor of the text: from this point of view, this paper and the teleological use of a mid-nineteenth century document reveal the permanence of an imperial, Great Russian vision in the Oriental studies circles of the Federation of Russia, which have been generously echoed by the journal *Vostok* since the end of the Soviet period.

S.A.D.

- RADZHABOV, S. A., ed., *Iosif Samuilovich Braginskii*, Dushanbe: Donish, 1986 (Akademiia nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR, Tsentral'naia nauchnaia biblioteka, Materialy i bibliografii uchenykh Tadzhikistana: 30), 123 p.

This small bio-bibliographical volume belongs to a series of monographs devoted to prominent academe of Iranian studies. It brings useful information on the Soviet philologist and specialist of Iranian studies I.S. Braginskii, whose main publications deal with the history of classical and modern Tajik literature, and with the history of the peoples of Central Asia. The chronological index of Braginskii's works includes more than five hundred references. Among the latter, one should mention a famous *History of Tajik Literature* and a contribution to the *Encyclopedia of the Myths of the Peoples of the World*. Many references of the index concern fields other than Iranian studies. All Braginskii's works are deeply coined by the Marxist-Leninist ideology. Most books and papers are written in Russian or Tajik, but there are some in Uzbek and in various Western languages. Another index gives a list of references on Braginskii and his work. In 1968, Braginskii had participated in the International Congress of Orientalists organised by the UNESCO, in Paris, on the theme of "The Central Asian Civilization."

M.S.

- SHIKHSAIDOV, A. R., "K 70-letiiu Gadzhi Gamzatovicha Gamzatova. Zhizn' vo imia nauki [For the 70th Birthday of Gadzhi Gamzatovich Gamzatov. A Life in the Name of Science]," *Vostok* 1996/3: 228-230.

Beyond the pompous and tautological eulogies of this personal homage to the Dagestani journalist and academic administrator Gadzhi Gamzatov, the son of the national poet Gamzat Tsadasy, the reader will find interesting sociological material on the figure of a local patron of the humanities in the last decades of the Soviet period — who played an important role in the promotion of Oriental studies in Dagestan, in a spirit very close to that of the classical, pre-Marxist Russian school of Oriental studies.

S.A.D.

- TABAROV, S., "Ian Rypka — issledovatel' persidskoi i tadzhikskoi literatury [Jan Rypka, a Researcher on the Persian and Tajik Literature]," *ArOr* 54 (1986): 219-225, Eng. summary.

This paper pays homage to the work of Jan Rypka, the creator of the "Prague School" of Oriental studies. The author surveys the problematic of Rypka's work, the fields and methods of his work (his main work is the *History of the Persian and Tajik Literature*, which has been translated into several languages). Unfortunately, this homage is devoid



of a biographic notice as well as of bibliographic references. Although the author writes with precision of the specific contribution of this great figure of Iranian studies, one may regret that it did not give at least references to his most important works. M.S.

- UVATOV, Ubaidulla, *Donolardan saboqlar* [Lessons from the Learned Ones], Tashkent: Abdulla Qodirii nomidagi Khalq Merosi Nashrioti, 1994, 93 p.

The present set of short biographical essays, by a Samarqandi philologist, makes up a very interesting document on the current reassessment of the literary heritages in post-Soviet Central Asia. The author offers collections of legends and stories about great figures of Central Asia's Islamic past (*muhaddiths* like Bukhari and Tirmidhi, philologists like Zamakhshari, historians like Ibn 'Arabshah or al-'Utbi, and the former's writings on the ulama of Samarqand). In a mood typical of the first years after Uzbekistan's independence, the author gives interesting information on his own quest, up to Turkestani émigré lineages in the Hijaz, in search of traditions that could allow a re-islamization of the Uzbek historical discourse about the remote and recent past.

S.A.D.

### 1.2.C. Epistemological Questions

- [AYMERMACHER, Karl] AIMERMAKHER, K., BORDIUGOV, G., ed., *Natsional'nye istorii v sovetskom i postsovetskikh gosudarstvakh* [National Histories in the USSR and in the Post-Soviet States], Moscow: AIRO-XX, 1999 (Fond Fridrikha Naumanna – Assotsiatsiia issledovatelei rossiiskogo obshchestva XX veka – Institut russkoi i sovetskoi istorii im. Iu.M. Lotmana Rurskogo Universiteta v Bokhume), 445 p., appendices, ill., index.

The result of an ambitious cooperation between Germany and Russia, this important work offers a collection of studies on the impact of the political transition after 1991 on history writing in Russia and the countries (re-)born out of the dissolution of the USSR. The authors have given a particular attention to the way nationalisms have determined a course characterized by a quest for the enemy and the rejection of everything alien — beginning with the rejection of the West among present-day Russian historians (cf. AIMERMAKHER, Karl, BORDIUGOV, Gennadii, "'Svoe' i 'chuzhoe' proshloe. Vvedenie ["One's" and "Other People's" Past. Introduction]," 13-17).

Several authors deal with changing perceptions of the national history of Russia and of the non-Russian peoples of the former USSR, in the Soviet and post-Soviet contexts (BORDIUGOV, Gennadii, BUKHARAEV, Vladimir, "Natsional'naia istoricheskaiia mysl' v usloviiakh sovetskogo vremeni [The National Historical Thought in the Context of the Soviet Period]," 21-73, 158 bibliographical notes; KONSTANTINOV, Sergei, USHAKOV, Aleksandr, "Vospriiatiia istorii narodov SSSR v Rossii i istoricheskie obrazy Rossii na postsovetskom prostranstve [The Perception of the History of the Peoples of the USSR in Russia and the Historical Images of Russia in the Post-Soviet Area]," 74-103, 94 bibliographical notes; ZUBKOVA, Elena, KUPRIANOV, Aleksandr, "Vozvrashchenie k 'russkoi idei': krizis identichnosti i natsional'naia istoriia [The



Return to the "Russian Idea": Identity Crisis and National History], " 299-328).

Then come papers on the rewriting of national historiographies in the former federate republics, beginning with the regions of Slavic culture (GUZENKOVA, Tamara, "Etnonatsional'nye problemy v uchebnikakh po istorii (na primere Ukrainy, Belarusi i nekotorykh respublik Rossiiskoi Federatsii) [Ethno-National Problems in the History Textbooks (through the Cases of Ukraine, Belarus and Some Republics of the Federation of Russia)], " 115-143, 90 bibliographical notes). The next studies are devoted to the southern periphery of this geographic ensemble with several, uneven contributions about the Caucasus, Central Asia, and Turkic-speaking peopled regions of Russia (ISKANDERIAN, Aleksandr, ARUTIUNIAN, Babken, "Armenia: 'Karabakhizatsiia' natsional'noi istorii [Armenia: The "Karabaghization" of National History], " 147-160; SEMBINOV, Murat, "Stanovlenie natsional'noi istorii Kazakhstana [The Moulding of a National History of Kazakhstan], " 179-194; ISKHAKOV, Salavat, "Istoriia narodov Povolzh'ia i Urala: problemy i perspektivy 'natsionalizatsii' [The History of the Peoples of the Volga and the Urals: Problems and Perspectives of the "Nationalisation"], " 275-298).

A paper on Tajikistan has been written by a Moscow-based historian of Byzantium (SHUKUROV, Rustam, "Tadzhikistan: muki vospominaniia [Tajikistan: The Torments of Remembrance], " 231-254). The author criticises many ideological continuities and borrowings from the Soviet ideological constructions in present day Tajik history writing (such as the official atheism of Soviet time, still in use in the secular Aryanism which has been developed by the Tajik intelligentsia and authorities during Perestroika and in the first years of independence). The author also evokes the influence of the Afghanistan war on the appearance of a new communal consciousness, among former young Tajik interpreters of the Soviet Army who, around 1990, made a significant and active part of the young human scientists in Dushanbe. A long chapter on the historiography of Tajik nationalism explains the Soviet fundamentals of the conception of history which is being developed by the Tajik academic intelligentsia. The author compares the "ethnic" and linguistic line which is being developed by Tajik historians (since Litvinskii and Ghafurov's work in the 1940) with the "territorial" line which has acquired since the same date dominating positions in the neighbouring Turkic-speaking states (most particularly in Uzbekistan). In short: this paper gives a well-informed, astute and lucid presentation on the state of historical discourse among Tajikistani academe in the early 1990s — except perhaps when the author comes to confuse the discourse of the academic intelligentsia with the aspirations of the majority of the population of Tajikistan.

S.A.D.

■ BALLAND, Daniel, "Les études centrasiatiques en France: dynamismes et disparités," in C. Gyss-Vermande, ed., *Livre blanc de l'orientalisme français*, Paris: Société Asiatique, 1993: 235-246.

In an extremely concise presentation, the author, a leading figure of the Inner Asia Group created in the CNRS in February 1992, underlines the development and com-

plete renewal of modern and contemporary Central Asian studies in France, like everywhere else in the West since the mid-1980s — but deplores the little amount of position openings in higher education and research during the same period. The author also evokes significant discrepancies between various regions and disciplines: these "geo-disciplinary cleavages" reveal a telling lack of researchers with tenure and of means for the study of contemporary societies of the western (ex-Soviet) area of Central Asia — whilst ancient and medieval studies on societies east of the Tian-Shan show much more developed. S.A.D.

■ BREGEL, Yuri, *Notes on the Study of Central Asia*, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University, Research Institute for Inner Asian Studies, 1996 (Papers on Inner Asia: 28), 61 p.

These (very) critical notes offer us a first survey of the recent (since 1991) academic production on the history of post-Timurid Central Asia, in the CIS and in Northern America. In Central Asia, the author observes a general continuity of the practices of the Soviet period, especially from the point of view of the extreme politicization of historical studies. The main (and relative) innovation is the growing "Balkanisation" of the history of Central Asia, which is more and more divided into compartments, according to national boundaries inherited from a recent past. Although drawn from 1924 onwards, these boundaries tend to be projected in the most remote past: the author has well noted the territorial line which continues to have the lead in theories on ethno-genesis — a legacy of Nikolai Marr's linguistic theory (the postulate of which was a native, autochthonous development of languages, through parallel phases common to all, in correspondence with the great phases of the development of mankind according to Marxism-Leninism). Such a postulate allows nations to search for their respective origin among the human groups which have preceded them on their present territory — each nation searching for roots as ancient as its boundaries are contestable. (For a recent, more detailed analysis of this phenomenon, through the case of republics of the Middle-Volga or of the Caucasus, see several illuminating works by Victor A. SHNIRELMAN: *Who Gets the Past: Competition for Ancestors among Non-Russian Intellectuals in Russia*, Washington (DC): The Woodrow Wilson Center Press, 1996; "Bor'ba za alanskoe nasledie (Etnopoliticheskaia podopleka sovremennykh etnogeneticheskikh mifov) [The Struggle for the Heritage of the Alans (On the Ethno-Political Fundament of Contemporary Ethno-genetic Myths)]," *Vostok* 1996/5: 100-113); on Kazakhstan, see Uyama Tomohiko, "Kazahu minzokushi saikō: rekishi kiju-tsuno mondaini yosete [Rethinking the Ethnic History of the Kazakhs: Some Reflections on Historical Writing]," *Chiiki Kenkyū Ronshū* 2/1 (1999): 87-116.

We thus fully realize to which extent since the dissolution of the USSR the methodological experiments of historians are being made in old saucepans. However, when the author dwells at length on the "lack of interest" of Central Asian academic circles in modern and contemporary history, he shows unusually inaccurate. In fact one could observe in the whole region, between 1988 and 1992, a deep renewal of historical studies on the nineteenth and twentieth centuries (at least until the great terror of

the mid-1930s, whence the periods posterior to WWII remain one of the tougher 'grey zones' of current history writing). This renewal has exerted a considerable influence on a relatively large audience (see in Tashkent for instance, during the Perestroika period, the contribution of the monthly journal of scientific popularization *Fan va Turmush* [Science and Life] to the "rediscovery" by the great public of the history of the most various political trends and figures of the first half of the twentieth century, and that of the repression by the Czarist and Soviet regimes against various categories of local intellectuals and political activists). Philologists, more than historians, have played a key role in these revelations, for two main reasons: 1) the knowledge of Chaghatay or Persian language is necessary to the exploration of many crucial primary sources for the history of the colonial and early Soviet periods; 2) whence historians of modern times continued to be excluded from political matters, as in the Soviet period, the number and strong corporatist consciousness of the philologists, and the positions they used to enjoy in the popular written media allowed them to take the lead for the promotion of the rights of the national intelligentsias. Local historians seem to have almost completely missed this fatal moment. The specialists of contemporary history — which was long limited to the history of the Communist Party — show mediocre connoisseurs of vernacular sources, and they often show devoid of a real intellectual autonomy relatively to the slogans of the moment. However, the central role played by philologists and specialists of literature had also at least one pernicious effect: the lasting limitation of the rediscovery of the recent past of Central Asian societies to literary texts and sources. For instance, an abundant religious literature continued to be ignored by Soviet orientalists deprived of education in Islamic studies, to very rare exceptions. For this reason, the first phases of the history of reform and modernisation movements in Central Asian Islam, which in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries had been dominated by Islamic theology and law, remained and are still today largely ignored by Central Asian "new" historiographies.

Nevertheless Yuri Bregel is not less hard on Western research. The second part of his article offers a very critical overview of the spectacular quantitative boom Central Asian studies have enjoyed — or endured — in the West since the mid-1980s, after decades of an almost total indifference of the Northern American and Western European academic circles for this region of the world. The new attractiveness of the field has materialized through the massive arrival of newcomers, among whom can be found very few genuine historians, but many Sovietologists or specialists of literature and oral tradition. Most of these authors share the same lack of education in Central Asian history, so the majority of historical studies published since the late 1980s in Northern America and in Western Europe merely echo publications of an often polemical nature published in Central Asian countries since their independences — these publications have been credited for "authenticity" because of their anti-Russian discourse and ultra-nationalist stance. The "rediscovery" of Central Asian past appears fully here a "reinvention," the ideological postulates of which are demystified with brio by Yu. Bregel. Let's underline in passing the role of private publishers in the multiplication of

general historical works full of approximations, at a time when we still lack authors capable of facing the challenge of a global history of post-Timurid Central Asia. A renewal in this matter, suggests the author, will perhaps come from a better contact with the Persian and Chaghatay sources of the history of Central Asia in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, the knowledge of which could be considerably favoured by a policy of systematic edition of texts. We have still to deplore that local historiography such as it has sometimes been maintained during a great part of the Soviet period (see in Tajikistan the works by Ahror Mukhtorov on the history of Ura-Teppe), as well as the "grey memory" of contemporary history of Central Asian societies have not yet attracted Western historians or anthropologists.

This paper has been reprinted in a slightly abridged form as: "Notes on the Study of Central Asia. 1 – Rewriting Central Asian History," *Vostok* 1997/5: 109-123; "2 – American Scholarship and Central Asia," *id.*, 1997/6: 5-25. S.A.D.

- DONIEROV, A. Kh., "Nekotorye aspekty razvitiia etnograficheskikh issledovanii v nezavisimom Uzbekistane [Some Aspects of the Development of Ethnographic Studies in Independent Uzbekistan]," *ONU* 2001/1: 50-57.

This rather confused paper, not deprived of the traditional waffle, by an author totally devoid of anthropological culture, introduces the main works in a discipline commonly called throughout the CIS "ethnic history" (Rus. *etnicheskaia istoriia*), through dissertations presented in Uzbekistan during the 1990s. These works are classified into two categories: 1 – a limited number of significant dissertations on the Ferghana Valley, on the historical ethnography of this region (S. S. GUBAEVA, *Osnovnye napravleniia etnicheskikh protsessov v Ferganskoi doline v kontse XIX – nachale XX vv.* [Fundamental Orientations of Ethnic Processes in the Ferghana Valley in the Late 19th – Early 20th Centuries], Tashkent, 1992), on its demography and economic sociology (Sh. M. ABDULLAEV, *Etnosotsial'nye i etnopoliticheskie protsessy v Ferganskoi doline (Osnovnye problemy, tendentsii i protivorechiia, 70 – 80e gody XX v.* [Ethno-Social and Ethno-Political Processes in the Ferghana Valley (Fundamental Problems, Tendencies, and Contradictions, 1970s-1980s)]), Tashkent, 1994), or on inter-ethnic contacts in the Valley (U. S. ABDULLAEV, *Traditsionnye i sovremennye mezhetnicheskie sviazi v sel'skikh mestnostiakh Ferganskoi doliny* [Traditional and Contemporary Inter-Ethnic Links in Rural Districts of the Ferghana Valley], Tashkent, 1991); 2 – a second category brings together various more classical works on the customs and rituals of the Uzbekistani society, which have gained momentum since the last years of the Soviet period, and the current rehabilitation and official valuation of everything national in Uzbekistan (from S. L. SHARIPOV, *Traditsionnye i novye prazdniki i obriady v bytu uzbekov* [Traditional and New Festivals in the Everyday Life of the Uzbeks], Tashkent, 1991, to T. Kh. ESBERGENOVA, *Traditsionnoe trudovoe vospitanie detei u karakalpakov* [Traditional Labour Education of Children among Karakalpaks], Nukus, 1999). The author's overall estimation of these works by the young generation of Uzbekistani social scientists is based on notions such as those of "culture," "spiritual heritage," and

"national spirit" — very far from anthropology of Central Asian societies as it has developed everywhere else than in the CIS during the past two decades. S.A.D.

- FRAGNER, Bert G., "Iranian Studies in German-Speaking Countries: Federal Republic of Germany, German Democratic Republic, Austria and Switzerland," *IS* 20/2-4 (1987): 53-98.

This paper offers a useful overview of the history and organization of studies on Iran (Islamic periods), Afghanistan and Central Asia in German-speaking countries of Europe. The paper covers fields as varied as philology, history, religion, literature, archaeology, and arts. This panoramic insight is completed by a selective bibliography of recent works. M.G.

- GOLUNOV, S. V., "Islam v SNG (po materialam rabot politologov FRG) [Islam in the CIS (through Materials of Political Scientists from the Federal Republic of Germany)]," *Vostok* 1997/5: 173-180.

This discussion of the German vision of Islam in the CIS, from 1991 to 1996, does not make a clear distinction between political science and the printed mass-media — which, in fact, drives the author to stress unwillingly the lack of mutual contacts and influence between the two in Germany, and their totally different respective logic. The contributions of German studies in political science and on the German press on Islam in the CIS are evaluated through the quality of their information, with an almost complete indifference for the overall paradigms on which they are respectively based, which deprives the present paper of any kind of epistemological dimension (as it is the case in a majority of post-Soviet studies of European studies on contemporary Central Eurasia). As to the author's estimation of the leading role of former Sovietology in the first development of German studies on Islam in the CIS, it is probably exact as far as the first half of the 1990s is concerned, but should be completely revised for the second half of this decade, during which Oriental and Islamic studies in Germany have shown more implicated in the study of the most varied (*i.e.*, not only political) aspects of contemporary Islam in Central Eurasia. S.A.D.

- HAMMER, Michel, "La perestroïka vue par quelques historiens tadjiks," in Mohammad-Reza Djalili & Frédéric Grare, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Geneva: Institut Universitaire des Hautes Etudes Internationales, 1995: 55-61.

On the basis of a regular correspondence, since 1979, with several Tajik historians engaged in various ways in the public debates of Perestroika, the author analyzes his correspondents' reactions to the evolution of the political climate in the USSR until the proclamation of the independence of Tajikistan on September 9, 1991. He stresses the deception of his interlocutors in front of the indifference of the central power for the social problems and the first political violence in the periphery, as well as the great prudence of their discourse as to the eventual independence of Tajikistan. The author underlines in particular the reserves expressed by these historians of Dushanbe on the idea of a Tajik state (perceived as an emanation of the Soviet political culture, totally

deprived of historical memory), and even on the existence of the Tajik as an ethnic group or a nation: the author's correspondents prefer to speak of an addition of regional and local Sunni Persian-speaking communities instead of a "nation." All in all, this paper gives an interesting illustration of the national discourse in specific academic milieus of Tajikistan during the decisive second half of the 1980s. S.A.D.

■ JUNTUNEN, Mirja, SCHLYTER, Birgit N., ed., *Return to the Silk Routes. Current Scandinavian Research on Central Asia*, London – New York: Kegan Paul International, 1999, 189 p., ill., tab., appendices.

This work contains the proceedings of the international colloquium *Nordisk Centralasienforskning: språk – kultur – samhälle* [Research on Central Asia in Nordic Countries: Language, Culture, Society], held in Stockholm on September 26-29, 1996. The book is opened by two general papers on the state of Central Asiatic studies, respectively in Nordic countries and in Northern America. The first one offers a descriptive overview of the history of Central Asian studies in Nordic countries; the author insists on the disciplinary shift from the initial domination of philology to that of social sciences (JUNTUNEN, Mirja, SCHLYTER, Birgit N., "Nordic Research on Central Asia: Past, Present and Future," 3-21, 1 ill.). The following paper, in spite of a very general title, deals with current research in the USA, with little interest for publications in languages other than English (SCHOEBERLEIN, John, "Marginal Centrality: Central Asian Studies on the Eve of a New Millenium," 23-45). The author of this study tends to project on the whole field the specific characters of the organisation of research in Northern American Universities. This brings him to an overestimation of the consequences of a divorce between classical history and philology, on the one hand, which are put in the dock, and on the other hand contemporary studies of the most various disciplines, which are presented as the exclusive depository of the promises of the field. A third paper, by the author of a forthcoming monograph on the sociolinguistic history of Xinjiang, tries to cast light on the contribution of the history of languages and of their practices to a better understanding of the ethnic, religious, economic and even military situation in this region of the world (ENWALL, Joakim, "Towards a Sociolinguistic History of Sinkiang," 119-131, tab.). The volume goes on with a series of papers which illustrate the current trends of research in archaeology, studies on religions, linguistics and political science: JUHL, Susanne, "Chinese Excavations at Turfan," 47-58, 6 fig.; ROSÉN, Staffan, "The Sino-Swedish Expedition to Yar-tonguz in 1994," 59-72, 1 map; ELVERSKOG, Johan, "Superscribing the Hegemonic Image of Chinggis Khan in the *Erdeni Tunumal Sudur*," 75-86; BERGLIE, Per-Arne, "'They only Weep...': Stories about Tibetan Travellers to the Other Worlds," 87-96; PETERSSON, Bo, "Russia and Post-Soviet Central Asia: Reintegration Ahead?," 135-147; ØHLERS, Marianne, "Democracy versus Stability in Kazakstan," 149-166; HARPVIKEN, Kristian Berg, "War and Change in Afghanistan: Reflections on Research Priorities," 167-186. Three other studies are still devoted to contemporary Central Asia and Afghanistan, but they are quite disappointing and give a vision of remote observers, which remains that of a big majority of

studies on contemporary Central Asia — all disciplines taken into account.

Other review: by T.H. Barrett, *BSOAS* 63/2 (2000): 306-307.

S.A.D.

- PETERSEN, Kenneth, "History in the Remaking: Jadidist Thought in Post-Soviet Uzbekistan," *CAM* 1996/4: 23-29.

The systematic comparison between present time and the period of "Jadidism" in the first third of the twentieth century has become a compulsory exercise of the "new history" of ideas in modern Central Asia. The present author unwillingly suggests the specificity of present time, if compared with the pre-Soviet period, through the now dominating patrimonial relation with this particular past. If the works of the early twentieth century "Jadid" authors make a major "body of thought" in nowadays Uzbekistan, it is probably because their recent rediscovery — most often in the form of selected extracts — and their reinterpretation are parts of the Soviet culture of a class of local autochthonous literati more accustomed to comment a limited corpus of semi-sacred texts, then to think critically on the basis of a wider ensemble of historical documents of varied kinds. As to the formation of "cultural icons" able of replacing those of the past period, doesn't it show us even more clearly that the present incantation of Jadidism in Tashkent fully belongs to a culture directly inherited from the Soviet one?

S.A.D.

- SHINMEN, Yasushi, "Research in Japan on Islamic Central Asian History," *ART* 3 (1993): 43-66.

This paper offers a concise presentation of the main orientations of Japanese research on Central Asian medieval and modern societies, followed by a very useful bibliography in Latin transcription (to be completed by the reading of the more voluminous *Bibliography of Central Asian Studies in Japan, 1879-March 1987*, Tokyo: The Center for East Asian Cultural Studies, 1987, 2 vols., 717+259 p.).

S.A.D.

- SHNIREL'MAN, V. A., "Bor'ba za alanskoe nasledie (etnopoliticheskaia podopleka sovremnykh etnogeneticheskikh mifov [The Struggle for the Heritage of the Alans (On the Ethno-Political Fundament of Contemporary Ethno-Genetic Myths)]," *Vostok* 1996/5: 100-113.

The author has studied the way ethno-genetic theories of the 1930s have been seized by the mass-media and political circles of the Northern Caucasus, since the early 1990s, in the framework of an overall quest for ancient and prestigious ancestors by each nation of this region, in connection with the legitimization of the national territories inherited from Soviet history. This rich pseudo-scientific literature is analyzed notably through the "Alanian controversy" which has opposed mutually the Northern Caucasian republics in the 1990s. The author identifies several dominating schemes of interpretation of the past — through conceptions of autochthonous development (as among Adyghe and Vainakhs), or through notions of a *Kulturträger* mission and superiority of migrant peoples (as among Ossetians), or still through an admixture of the two (as



among the Balkar intellectuals). Another element of this rhetoric, the quest for figures of enemies, drives national historiographies to a systematic denigration of neighbouring national groups: whence ancient Scythians are seen in Kabardian academic milieus as a Turkic-speaking people, Iranian peoples as a whole are introduced by new Chechen school textbooks as warlike Barbarian nomads, traditionally hostile to Caucasian highlanders. This synthetic and very concise paper gives an astute, vivid and telling illustration of the extreme politicization of "ethnic history" in the Northern Caucasus since the dissolution of the Soviet Union, and of the way former academic quibbles of the Soviet period are now largely debated, and used by non-specialists of the mass media and the new ruling classes.

See also, by the same author: SHNIRELMAN, Viktor, *Who Gets the Past? Competition for Ancestors among Non-Russian Intellectuals in Russia*, Baltimore – London: The Woodrow Wilson Press Center – John Hopkins University Press, 1996, 98 p.; reviewed by M.I. Cheremisskaia in *Vostok* 1997/4: 181-189. S.A.D.

■ TEHRĀNĪ, Bahrām, "Fa'āliyyathā-ye 'elmī dar Ozbakestān pas az esteqlāl [Scientific Activities in Uzbekistan since Independence]," *MAMvQ*, 6/19 (*pā'īz* 1376/Autumn 1997): 208-212.

In this short overview of the change in human and social sciences in Uzbekistan since 1991, the author analyzes the reorganization of their financing, before tackling the delicate question of cooperation between Iran and Uzbekistan in the field of Persian language and culture (in particular in the publication of Persian texts from manuscripts in Uzbekistani public collections, a field in which bilateral cooperation has already given interesting and promising results). S.A.D.

■ UYAMA Tomohiko, "Kazahu minzokushi saikō. Rekishi kijutsuno mondaini yosete / Rethinking the Ethnic History of the Kazakhs: Some Reflections on Historical Writing," *Chiiki Kenkyū Ronshū / Journal of the Center for Area Studies* (Osaka), 2/1 (1999): 85-116, bibliography, Russian summary.

The author criticizes the Soviet theory of ethno-geneses as it has been constantly applied since the 1930s to the Kazakhs — the latter being credited with an appearance as an "ethnic group" in a remote past, whence their links with neighboring Turkic populations have been systematically underestimated. The author remembers that the Kazakhs appear as a distinct group in the 15th century only, and that we have no element on the way they then used to define themselves, whence external source name them "Noghay." A first specifically "Kazakh" communal consciousness seems to have been solidified later, after the lasting conflict between the "Kazakhs" and the Jungars, in particular after the 1723-1725 Exodus. The author still stresses, most astutely, that if the three great Hordes of the modern period seem well to correspond with a more ancient geographical distribution of these various populations, the Hordes appear as such only in the course of the 18th century.

It is under the influence of the Russian culture and thought that the first modern



Kazakh intellectuals of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries promoted a modern national Kazakh identity, notably through the collection of folklore and ethnographic material. After the great terror of the mid-1930s Leningrad and Moscow-based ethnographers, leaning on N. Marr's woolly racist theories, elaborated a theory of the ethno-genesis based on the postulate of the ancient and absolutely "autochthonous" character (in Russian *avtokhtonnost'*) of the Kazakhs. Last, it is from the 1960s on that one can observe in the USSR a renewed interest in modern national cultures. A new paradigm replacing another, older one, the theory of a Kazakh national "rebirth" (*vozhrozhdenie*) in modern time, under the favourable influence of Bolshevism, was gradually set up, through a selective integration of the theory of ethno-genesis. It is this theory of a national "rebirth" which is now in vigour in independent Kazakhstan, where it has kept its status as an official ideology.

The author casts light on the overall weakness of Soviet and post-Soviet works on ethnicity: essentialist perceptions of "ethnic groups" and simplistic readings of Hegel's work continue to dominate the ethnographic schools throughout the CIS, from Siberia to Tajikistan. Such remarks could be easily enlarged to the "ethnic history" of many other Central Eurasian peoples, to which numerous works have been devoted during the past decade.

S.A.D.

### 1.3 Miscellanies: Journals, Colloquia, Collective Works

#### 1.3.A. New Periodical Publications

■ *Central Asia and the Caucasus. Journal of Social and Political Studies*, dir. Murad Esenov, Luleå (Sweden): Central Asia and the Caucasus Information and Analytical Center, 1 (2000), 160 p.

Published in Russian since 1996, the journal *Tsentral'naia Aziia* (renamed in Fall 1999 *Tsentral'naia Aziia i Kavkaz*) is now enriched with an English edition, published separately, slightly later than each issue in Russian. This should allow this periodical publication to reach an audience larger than that of specialists of the contemporary Caucasus and Central Asia. Published in Sweden by the "Central Asia and the Caucasus Information and Analytical Center," *Central Asia and the Caucasus* plays an important role in the publication and communication of research for human and social scientists in a field which has been constantly changing for a decade and a half. It also provides, since its foundation, a free tribune and a unique place for scientific exchanges for the scientists of the CIS, who are now often deprived of possibilities of self-expression in their respective countries.

S.A.D.

■ *Inside Central Asia. A Weekly Roundup of Media Reports Covered by BBC Monitoring*, Reading: BBC Monitoring, 17 (May 2-8, 1994), 6 p.

The first issue of this weekly bulletin was published in January 1994. Central Asia, with

a population of over 60 million, is of great interest to policy makers and investors from different parts of the world, especially in the West. The countries covered by this publication represent "an enormous potential market and production base." Therefore, this bulletin aims at providing up-to-date information on economic and political trends or current affairs, which is difficult to obtain from one's own single resource. The publisher believes "it is a vital reading for anyone planning or doing business in Central Asia." To be able to publish such a bulletin, the BBC Monitoring Service is scanning the international media, television, radio, newspapers and news agencies in the languages spoken in this region from Azeri to Uzbek. The countries covered by the Monitoring Service of the BBC are: Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Kyrgyzstan, Azerbaijan and the province of Xinjiang in China. Scholars interested in the current affairs of this large region will find in the bulletin information on government policies, appointments, security issues, legislation, agriculture, finance, industry and political events in the countries concerned. Regular subscription is rather expensive and thus might be only for business centres and institutes which can afford it.

Tch.P.

■ *Izvestiia Akademii nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR: seriia vostokovedenie, istoriia, filologiiia = Akhboroti Akademiiai fanhoi RSS Tojikiston: seriiai sharqshinosi, ta'rikh, filologiiia*, Dushanbe: Donish, 1 (1986).

Published four times a year since 1986, this new series of the *Izvestiia* of the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan is devoted to fields beforehand studied in the "Department of Social Sciences" (*Otdelenie obshchestvennykh nauk*) of the same journal. Written in Russian and in Tajik, the papers are gathered under the following rubrics, with variations from an issue to another one: Oriental studies (*vostokovedenie*), history (*istoriia*), archaeology (*arkheologiiia*), ethnography (*etnografiia*), history of art (*iskusstvovedenie*), literary history and critic (*literaturovedenie*), reviews and bibliography (*kritika i bibliografiia*). Each issue includes a "chronicle" (*khronika*) on the Soviet and Tajikistani academic life in the above-mentioned disciplines. To be noticed: the issue 2/2 (1986) is devoted to the city of Khujand on the occasion of the 2,500th anniversary of its foundation; it also contains three notes on the activities of the Institute of Oriental Studies, on the Donish Institute of History, of the Rudaki Institute of Tajik Language and Literature, all three attached to the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan. V.H.

● *Khujand*, Khujand [Tajikistan]: Nashriiai Hukumati viloiati Sughd, director Atakhon Saifulloev, monthly, c. 60 p., since 1998.

Published under the patronage of the Governor of the province (viloiat) of Soghd in Northern Tajikistan, the journal *Khujand* is devoted to the literary tradition and historical past of the eponymous city, situated on the shores of the Syr-Darya River, at the entrance of the Ferghana Valley. Written by a team of philologists and amateurs of local lore, it provides numerous extracts of poetical works from various periods of the past and by contemporary authors, as well as papers on the local history and archaeol-

ogy of Khujand and its immediate neighbourhood. Although totally devoid of scientific pretension, this journal, a regional rival to *Sadoi Sharq*, the monthly journal of the Union of Writers of Tajikistan printed in Dushanbe, offers interesting documents on the rich literary tradition and local memory of a Central Asian city. S.A.D.

■ *Merosi niigon* [The Ancestors' Heritage], ed. Rakhim Masov, Dushanbe: Jam'iiati Hifzi Iodgorihoi Ta'rikh va Madaniati Tojikiston, 1 (1992), 128 p.

Oriented mainly towards the rehabilitation of the pre-Soviet architectural patrimony, "The Ancestor's Heritage" is a journal with colour illustrations meant for a Tajikistani cultivated audience. It gives presentations on important monuments and restoration sites (e.g., the *mazār* of Shaykh Muslih al-Dīn in Khujand, of Hazrat Bābā in Chorkuh, of Muhammad Bashārā on the Zarafshan River, etc.); on present excavation sites (Sarazm, Khulbuq); or on great archaeological discoveries of the twentieth century (Soghdian mural paintings, civilisation of Hissar, site of Kafir Qal'a), in the form of short papers mostly written by specialists from the Institute of History of the Academy of Sciences. The journal also gives a large room to the current rediscovery of the living patrimony of Tajikistan (e.g., "Ura-Teppa, a City of Craftsmen"). Each paper is followed by a short English summary. (Address of the journal: Dushanbe, Khiioboni dustii Khalqho 94).

Also reviewed by B.Ia. Staviskii, *Vostok* 1996/6: 185-186.

S.A.D.

□ *Mir islama* [The World of Islam], dir. Rafael' Khakimov, red. Rafik Mukhametshin [Räfyq Möhämätshin], Kazan: Tsentr islamovedcheskikh issledovaniĭ pri Institute istorii Akademii nauk Tatarstana, 1 (1999), 243 p.

The journal published in Kazan since Fall 1999 has taken the title of a prestigious journal published in St. Petersburg in the early twentieth century and devoted to the "awakening" of the world of Islam under the pressure of colonialism, with a special interest indeed in the Muslim populations of the Russian Empire. The editors of the new *Mir islama* are researchers of the Institute of History of the Academy of Sciences of Tatarstan in Kazan; they show preoccupied by the growth of Islamist radicalism in Tatarstan's new cities and industrial suburbs. As such, they intend to develop, as an alternative to the Saudi or Pakistani models, a common reference to early twentieth-century "Jadidism" and, more generally, to varied Islamic movements which developed in European Russia between the last decades of the eighteenth century and the successive waves of anti-religious repressions of the 1920s-30s. Tatarstani Young historians share with their illustrious early twentieth-century predecessors a common curiosity towards the contemporary movement of ideas, and for their eventual political impact. This undertaking of historians engaged in the political sphere should be followed with attention by all those captivated by the problematic of Islam and modernity from the eighteenth century to our days, in a large area included between the suburbs of European Russia and the edge of Central Asia.

Beside a number of text translations or re-editions, and speeches by protagonists

of public life (among whom Gusman-hazrat ISKHAKOV, the mufti of Tatarstan), we must notice, among the most significant publications of this first issue, a paper by Ramil' KHAIRUTDINOV on the first *Mirislama*; in this study enriched by numerous archive documents (which are unfortunately not described, as it is always the case in Russian publications), the author evokes the decisive role played by Orthodox missionary milieus of Kazan in the appearance of that journal; he relocates the latter's creation into the context of the lasting preoccupations of the Russian Ministry of the Interior regarding the Muslim communities of the Empire, their press and their public (*obshchestvennye*) institutions ("Mirislama: iz istorii sozdaniia zhurnala [*Mirislama*: History of the Creation of a Journal]," 3-20, 2 appendices). The rubric "The Place of Politics" is illustrated by two studies: a non-documented paper — despite numerous quoted statistics — by Rinat NABIEV on the concomitant renewal of the Islamic and Orthodox Christian cults in Tatarstan and, more largely, in the Federation of Russia ("Respublika Tatarstan: mezhkonfessional'naia situatsiia v sisteme obshchestvenno-politicheskikh otnoshenii [Republic of Tatarstan: The Inter-Confessional Situation in the System of Social and Political Relations]," 79-87); and a historical study by Iskander GILIAZOV ("Natsional-sotsialisty i islam v Germanii [The Nazis and Islam in Germany]," 87-108) on the Muslim press and communal movements in Nazi Germany, and on the attempts at an ideological and political takeover by Hitler's regime; the author shows a particular interest in the activity of the former great mufti of Jerusalem, Amīn al-Husaynī, and of the Tatar polygraph 'Ālimjān Idrīsī, in favour of the opening in 1944 of lessons for the education of mullahs in the Göttingen University (under the direction of the historian B. Spuler), and more generally for the organisation of varied "Muslim" military units made of émigrés from the USSR (from Turkestan most particularly); this paper gives a useful complement to the works by Gerhard Höpp on the respective Muslim policies of the Weimar Republic and the IIIrd Reich, and to those by Étienne Copeau on the Promethean movement.

The rubric on history strictly speaking is the most developed of this first issue of the new *Mirislama*. It is opened by a long paper by Galina EMEL'IAKOVA on communal self-denominations in the "Muslim" intellectual milieus of the Russian Empire at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Although this paper reveals an unusual interest of the author in recent, notably Western publications, this study is limited by the total lack of interest in primary sources, whether Russian or Muslim; moreover the author tends to project on the whole Muslim populations of the Russian Empire a discourse on identity which was that of numerically small intellectual circles — sometimes emigrated in Turkey... — a shortcoming which proves quite common in Russian studies on early twentieth century domestic Muslim-background modernisation movements ("K voprosu o natsional'noi samoidentifikatsii volzhskikh tatar v kontse XIX – nachale XX vekov: tatarizm, tiurkizm, islamizm [Contribution to the Question of National Self-Identification among the Volga Tatars at the turn of the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries: Tatarism, Turkism, Islamism]," 109-122). The following papers are adaptations of texts previously published in Russian or in Western languages, reviewed in

other places of the present volume (Danil' AZAMATOV, "Zasedateli Orenburgskogo magometanskogo dukhovnogo sobraniia v XIX veke [The Sitting Members of the Orenburg Muslim Spiritual Assembly in the Nineteenth Century]," 123-134; Zavdat MINULLIN [MINGNULLIN], "Zemliachestva i blagotvoritel'nye obshchestva tatarskikh uchashchikhsia v musul'manskikh stranakh (nachalo XX v.) [The Fellow Countrymen Societies and Charities of Tatar Students in the Muslim Countries (Early Twentieth Century)]," 135-144; Aislu IUNUSOVA, "K istorii dukhovnogo upravleniya musul'man Respubliki Bashkortostan [Contribution to the History of the Spiritual Board of the Muslims of the Republic of Bashkortostan]," 145-158). In a special section on "Great Figures of the Spiritual Board of the Muslims [of Russia]," we must still mention an original study by Aidar KHAIRUTDINOV on the treatise *Rahmat-i ilāhiyya burhānlarī* (1911) by the modernist theologian of Kazan, Mūsā Jār-Allāh Bīgī (1873-1949), in which the author casts light on two preoccupations of Bīgī's: the rehabilitation of *ijtihād*, and the demonstration of the excellence of Islam in order to escape the accusation of impiety formulated against Bīgī by the most conservative *ulama*, in an overall context of renewal of the Orthodox Christian missionary activity ("Musa Bigiev ob universal'nosti Bozhei milosti [Sayings by Mūsā Bīgiyeff on the universality of God's Mercy]," 171-186). S.A.D.

■ *Sharqshunoslik* [Oriental Studies], dir. A.U. Urinboev, Tashkent: Abu Raihon Berunii nomidagi Sharqshunoslik Instituti, Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiyasi, 1 (1990), 166 p.

An annual journal published by the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan, *Sharqshunoslik* is also the mouthpiece of the Society of Orientalists of Uzbekistan. It publishes studies on the manuscript sources of the history of Central Asia, that the Institute has authority to preserve and to study. At the same time, it offers the scientists of the country a tribune for the (relatively) "new history" (*iangi tarikh*) of the Orient, as it is (re-)written today in Tashkent, in a spirit penetrated by the soul of ethnic nationalism.

The main rubrics of the journal are devoted to the history of various movements of thought in Central Asia (through emblematic figures or currents like Ibn Sina, Biruni, Ulugh Beg, Nawayi or the Transoxianian school of *fiqh*), of literary and scientific exchanges between the region and its close or far neighbours (India, Turkey), as well as the current political and cultural events of the world of Islam (papers on Khomeyni and the Iranian revolution of 1979, on Palestine and the Palestinians: themes which have been totally eradicated from the journal after the political reaction of 1992). Last, the reader can also find in the journal regular information on the activities of the main Uzbekistani research institutions in Oriental studies. (Address: Toshkent, Akademik H. Abdullaev kuchasi 81, Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiyasi, Abu Raihon Berunii nomidagi Sharqshunoslik Instituti). S.A.D.

■ *Sharqshunoslik* = *Vostokovedenie* [Oriental Studies], dir. A. Mukhtarov, Tashkent: Davlat

Sharqshunoslik Instituti, bimonthly, since 1992, c. 60 p.

The Institute of Oriental Languages of Tashkent has become an autonomous, then an independent institution after being for decades a section of the State University, in charge of the education of teachers and translators of "Oriental" languages (as we would say "Occidental" for European languages). It delivers diplomas in international economy, specialised journalism and diplomacy — which has contributed to make it, since independence, one of the most highly estimated institutions of higher education in Uzbekistan. At the same time, the institute has enriched the initial range of its classical teachings (with new sections on the history of Islam, on Islamic philosophy, etc.) and has created philological laboratories which work now on some great editions and translations (such as a multi-volume *History of Arabic Literature*; an Uzbek four-volume translation of Ibn Battuta's *Travels* in four volumes, etc.).

The SOAS or "Langues' O" of Tashkent publishes two journals: *Sharq mash'ali* = *Maiak Vostoka* [The Flaming Torch of the Orient], an illustrated magazine devoted to the cultural heritage of Uzbekistan, is sold in kiosks; *Sharqshunoslik* is meant for a public of students and specialists, so it reflects the teaching and research work of the Institute (papers on comparative linguistics of Uzbek and Chinese languages, on Bābur and Persian and Turkic literary bilingualism in Northern India, on Nawayi's tongue, on Russo-Afghan relations in the early twentieth century, etc.) or informs its readers on current cultural events in Central Asia (papers on contemporary Egyptian literature and its reception in Uzbekistan...).

S.A.D.

### 1.3.B. *Proceedings of Non-Thematic and Pluri-Disciplinary Conferences*

■ AKINER, Shirin, ed., *Cultural Change and Continuity in Central Asia*, London: Kegan Paul International, in association with the Central Asian Research Forum, School of Oriental and African Studies, London, 1991, ix-377 p.

Central Asia is a vast area not yet sufficiently known to the people of the world. The international media sometimes produces such a confusing image that one does not exactly know to feel afraid of the nuclear weapons existing over there, Islamic fundamentalism gaining ground, or to have sympathies with the people who have dared to try to liberate themselves from an empire, which is not willing to change its own intentions. Or many other images are being presented depending on the level of knowledge and acquaintances of the producers concerned. After the collapse of the Soviet Union most of the information concerning Central Asia was related to the economic or political aspects of the countries of this area having gained independence. Information on ancient history, or on cultural aspects of the life of the people was either not available, or based on the first impressions of those who had the possibility to pay a visit to some of the places of this area, when the Soviet empire started to break into pieces. Now, gradually, there are books presented to the market, which are dealing with the social and cultural aspects of the life of the countries concerned. The present book is to be considered as one of these kinds of efforts in the recent time.

The editor of the book herself is one of the scholars interested in the problems of language and literature of the non-Russian people of the former Soviet empire. Therefore she has been successful in producing a very useful collection of articles by scholars from a wide variety of disciplines. Most of the articles of the present volume are related to Soviet Central Asia. There are articles dealing with Afghanistan and Xinjiang as well, which at the same time help to broaden the meaning and definition of the mainly politically formulated Central Asia, and give the reader a better chance to see at least cultural interrelations in certain parts of the regions concerned. The book tries to demonstrate the cultural diversity of the area, but at the same time, it is intending to assert that there is a perceptible framework of shared traditions, or, as Eden Naby says, a "shared culture." As a result, in the present volume we observe similarities, as well as contrasts. It was exactly with the same objective that the conference on tradition and change in Central Asia was held in April 1987 at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London.

There are, on the whole, 19 articles, which are a selection of contributions made to this conference: Tradition and change is being illustrated in a number of studies on literature by David C. Montgomery, Eden Naby and Ingeborg Baldauf. Irena Jeziorka examines the literary treatment of religious experience in three novels of Chingiz Aitmatov. Ildiko Beller-Hahn is focusing her attention on script changes in Xinjiang. Two studies are devoted to the evaluation of the language situation (by Simon Crisp) and Russian language teaching policy in Soviet Central Asia during 1958-66 (by J.M. Kirkwood). These two articles are quite important for further research in this field. Ewa A. Chylinski pays attention to ritualism of family life in Soviet Central Asia and provides an interesting account on the practice of circumcision within the social context of the family unit. Zbigniew Jasiewicz's study deals with the beliefs and rituals of craftsmen in Afghanistan, but he thinks that similar practices were common among the craftsmen of Central Asia in pre-Soviet time.

Three other studies are also devoted to the culture of Afghanistan: a perspective on marriage among Durrani Pashtuns of Afghan Turkestan (by Nancy Tapper), and musical change in Herat during the twentieth century (by John Baily). Beside the article by Beller-Hahn mentioned above, there are two more studies devoted to Xinjiang: an anthropological approach by C.M. Hann and an article on the role of the Hui Muslims in Republican Xinjiang by Andrew D.W. Forbes. There is also a separate study on Islam in China by Jacques Waardenburg. Jennifer M. Scarce is paying attention to continuity and modernity in the costume of the Muslims of Central Asia. The Central Asian architecture today from the point of view of tradition and change is being dealt with by F. Ashrafi. Another very interesting study is on the Baha'i community of Ashgabat by M. Momen. Kazakhstan is also subject to a separate study called "Change and Tradition in the Eighteenth Century" by Alan Bodger. In this book we face a collection of papers which intends to present a diverse picture of the region, although some of them could demonstrate the existence of that common element called "shared culture" or "civilization."

Tch.P.



- ATABAKI, Touraj, O'KANE, John, eds., *Post-Soviet Central Asia*, London: Tauris Academic Studies, 1998, xv-384 p.

The present volume consists of the proceedings of the Fifth Conference of the European Society for Central Asian Studies (ESCAS) held in Copenhagen in August 1995. The papers deal primarily with subjects relevant to present-day economic, social and political problems of the region, with a particular interest in the (re-)building of collective identities. It also includes a small number of papers on various aspects of the region's historical background. The volume brings together a balanced set of prestigious signatures and promising beginners. Except Kyrgyzstan, all the political entities of Central Asia — including Xinjiang and the Gansu — have been devoted one or several papers, with a special interest for Xinjiang, Uzbekistan, Afghanistan, the Uighurs and the Kazakhs. The contributions have been classified into three different categories. A first group of studies is devoted to the political actuality and geopolitics of Central Asia. It is opened by two introductory papers. The first one addresses some overall methodological considerations in the study of transition from 'traditional' to 'modernized' societies through the twentieth century. The author appeals to ex-Soviet social scientists to devote more attention to 'the dynamics of transition' and to the 'clan' networks of power which have become essential for understanding the present-day social and political situation in Central Asia (AKINER, Shirin, "Social and Political Reorganisation in Central Asia: Transition from Pre-Colonial to Post-Colonial Society," 1-34). Then comes a set of four papers on the evolution of international relations in the region during the first years of independence. A renowned specialist of the present geopolitics of Russia, the author of the first paper explains the changes in Russia's policy towards the Central Asian states in terms of that country's internal politics — in particular the struggle for reforms in the Gorbachev and early Yeltsin periods (BELOKRENTITSKY, Vyacheslav Ia., "Russia and Former Soviet Central Asia: The Attitude Towards Regional Integrity," 44-61). The next contribution, on the foreign policy of the newly independent Central Asian states, gives special attention to the newly evolved relationship between these states and the Federation of Russia, and to various forms of economic cooperation between the Central Asian states (SHAUMIAN, Tatiana, "Foreign Policy Perspectives of the Central Asian States," 62-72). In a paper which gives an Iranian point of view on the question, the author, although criticizing the Iranian authorities for strategic mistakes in the region, also pleads for an international recognition of Iran's growing cultural, geopolitical, and economic role for the region (PAHLEVAN, Tchanguiz, "Iran and Central Asia," 73-90). A specialist of Turkey's Central Asian policy, the author of the last paper of this sub-section describes the present extent of Turkish private and governmental investment in Central Asia, with special attention for the building of a pipeline from Central Asia to Turkey through the Southern Caucasus (WINROW, Gareth, "Turkish Policy in Central Asia," 91-108). The following two papers assess cultural and economic aspects of the opening up of the Central Asian states in the first years of independence. The first one suggests a wide range of possibilities at the disposal of Turkic nations for further cultural rapprochement, not ignoring at the same time the multiple



obstacles, notably political, which hamper such an evolution (TRYJARSKI, Edward, "Towards Better Mutual Comprehension among Turkic Speakers," 109-117). On the background of Azerbaijan's negotiations with international oil consortia, the author of the next contribution, a well-established specialist of the modern history of this country, analyzes the internal power struggles which have been taking place since its independence, with special attention for the impact of the Karabagh conflict on Azerbaijan's internal development since 1988 (SWIETOCHOWSKI, Tadeusz, "The Politics of Oil and the Quest for Stability: The Caspian Sea," 118-129).

The second section is devoted to collective identity building in ex-Soviet and Chinese Central Asia since the late 1980s. It is opened by three articles on different aspects of an Uzbekistani national identity in the making. On the basis of meetings with Uzbek literati in 1993, a first paper notes the exclusive emphasis of the early 1990s on nationally oriented literature, to the exclusion of national minorities living in Uzbekistan (MICALLEFF, Roberta M., "Literature and the Nation in Contemporary Uzbekistan," 130-136). The following contribution examines the *mahalla* (urban neighbourhood community) from the viewpoint of its utilization by the Uzbek state for collecting information, imposing social conformity, wielding economic influence, etc. (KOROTEEVA, Viktoria, MAKAROVA, Ekaterina, "The Assertion of Uzbek National Identity: Nativization or State-Building Process?," 137-143). In the context of de-russification, creation of an Uzbek national identity, and Westernization in present-day Uzbekistan, the author of the third article assesses the level of foreign language learning in this country, and insists on the growing demand for English (DOLLERUP, Cay, "Language and Culture in Transition in Uzbekistan," 144-156). Then come papers devoted to the political processes in different Central Asian countries. A rare study on the economic and political situation in Turkmenistan focuses on numerous, mainly geopolitical problems which were hampering in the early 1990s the exploitation of the country's large oil and natural gas resources (FREITAG-WIRMINGHAUS, Reiner, "Turkmenistan's Place in Central Asia and the World," 157-176). Two papers on ethnic minorities in Afghanistan analyze, respectively, the politicization of the Hazara since the Communist coup in 1978, through the emergence of the Hezb al-Wahdat (HARPVIKEN, Kristian Berg, "The Hazara of Afghanistan: The Thorny Path towards Political Unity, 1978-1992," 177-203), and the impact of Pashtun exclusive lasting domination of the country on the permanence of identity bases other than the nation-state — such as religion, ethnic distinctions, regional loyalties, etc. — through the example of the Chechka-Uzbeks of North-Eastern Afghanistan (RASULY-PALECZEK, Gabriele, "Ethnic Identity versus Nationalism: The Uzbeks of Northeastern Afghanistan and the Afghan State," 204-230). In the only study of the present volume devoted to Tajikistan, in spite of the ongoing civil war at the time when this volume was edited, the author presents an anthropological study of the Nawruz festival as it is practiced officially in this country since 1990, as a means of facing social and cultural jeopardy; special attention has been given to the traditional role of women in the celebration (ATTAR, Ali, "Nawruz in Tajikistan: Ritual of Politics?," 231-247). The next study deals with the debate around

'Kazakhness' among early twentieth century Kazakh intellectuals; based on literary magazines of the time such as *Āy Qāp* and *Qazāq*, the paper examines topics such as the notion of civilization, nomadism, Russian colonization, the role of Islam, etc. (KENDIRBAEVA, Gulnar, "The Early Twentieth Century Kazakh Intelligentsia: In Search of National Identity," 248-268). The five next papers treat subjects directly or indirectly relevant to Xinjiang, from a historical or contemporary point of view. The first of these contributions gives a historical sketch of the region since the establishment of Communist China; it reviews independence movements locally and in the diasporas, especially since the dissolution of the Soviet Union, as well as the activity of Islamist militants from Pakistan (WARIKOO, Kulbushan, "Ethnic Religious Resurgence in Xinjiang," 269-282). In a very original paper, the next author criticizes the early European and present-day Chinese identifications of contemporary ethnic groups with the ancient peoples of the region, and explores more sophisticated paradigms regarding the multiple identities which are characteristic of the Gansu region (STÅLBERG, Sabira, "A Central Asian – Chinese Melting Pot: The Case of the Gansu Corridor," 283-300). On the basis of three case studies on Dungan, Uighur and Kazakh families from China who have emigrated to Turkey, the author of the next contribution examines how different elements of identity are emphasized in different contexts, depending on the nature of the new setting and 'the other' which persons enter in contact with — which does not prevent the author from coming to the conclusion that beyond these situational variations, the three groups exercise three widely divergent forms of discourse about their identity (GLADNEY, Dru C., "Nations Transgressing Nation-States: Constructing Dungan, Uygur and Kazakh Identities across China, Central Asia and Turkey," 301-323). In a short study on the Sibe, a numerically small minority in Xinjiang belonging to the Tungus-Manchu peoples, the author reviews some theories on how the Sibe came to be in Xinjiang, with a particular attention for the Sibe language and its relation to literary Manchu; the latest catalogue (1989) of Sibe-Manchu publications is presented (GORELOVA, Liliya, "Past and Present of a Manchu Tribe: The Sibe," 324-330). Another small ethnic group of China, the Tuvans, who are denied the status of a distinct nationality, are studied from the point of view of the maintenance of their ethnic consciousness, and their cultural ties with the Tuvan Republic in the Federation of Russia (MONGUSH, Marina, "The Tuvans in China: Ethnic Identity and Language," 331-336).

The third section deals with varied aspects of pre-modern history of Central Asia. The late medieval period is illustrated by two papers: the first on the attachment of the Mughal Emperors to Central Asia (Richard FOLTZ, "Central Asia in the Minds of the Mughals," 337-344), the second on the political considerations which influenced the 17th-century Astarkhanid authorities' attitude towards their Russian slaves (Audrey BURTON, "Russian Slaves in 17th-Century Bukhara," 345-365). The volume is closed by two papers alien to the previous categories: a short contribution on philological problems linked with the ancient denomination of the royal clan of the Turks ([KLIASH-TORNYI, Sergei G.] KLJYASHTORNY, Sergey G., "The Royal Clan of the Turks and the Problem of Its Designation," 366-369), and a report on the latest archaeological exca-

ventions of ancient post-Han burial sites in Hexi [present-day Gansu province] (Susanne JUHL, "Burial Sites in Hexi," 370-379). All in all this volume edited with great care presents us with a captivating of a certain state of the art of modern Central Asian studies in the West in the early 1990s. To be deplored, perhaps: the absence, quite common in this kind of publication, of an index and of maps for some of the papers. S.A.D.

■ BEZAL'EL, Yizhaq, ed., *Jews of Bukhara. Studies in the Cultural Heritage of Oriental Jewry*, Jerusalem: Ben Zvi Institute for the Study of Jewish Communities in the East, Hebrew University of Jerusalem (*Pe'amim* 35), 1988, 208 p., 3 maps, in Hebrew.

This special issue of the journal *Pe'amim* is devoted to Central Asian Jews, commonly called "Bukharan Jews" or more simply "Bukharans." Eleven contributions reconstruct their history, from the origins, their installation in Central Asia, their links with the Holy Land — remote but never forgotten —, their attitude vis-à-vis the Russian conquest of Central Asia. Several chapters deal with Bukharans who have come back or emigrated to Palestine, and with the destiny of their community up till 1944. Two papers deal with the current situation of the Jews in Central Asia, in the last years of the Soviet period; another one presents a Jewish-Tajik poet who lives presently in Israel. H.L.

■ CHRISTIAN, David, BENJAMIN, Craig, eds., *Silk Road Studies, 2 – World of the Silk Roads: Ancient and Modern*, Proceedings from the Second Conference of the Australian Society for Inner Asian Studies (A.S.I.A.S.), Macquarie University, September 21-22, 1996, Turnhout: Brepols, 1998 (*Silk Road Studies*: 2), 306 p., maps, tab., appendices, corrigenda.

This rich collection of captivating papers is divided into two sections of uneven significance, and with few mutual links: a section on ancient history, and another one with modern and contemporary studies. Only the second, by far the richest part of the volume will be reviewed here, and the reader is invited to look at the book for studies on more ancient periods (LIEU, Sam, "From Iran to South China: The Eastward Passage of Manichaeism," 1-22; CANSDALE, Lena, "Jews on the Silk Road," 23-30; BENJAMIN, Craig, "In Introduction to Kushan Research," 31-50; CHRISTIAN, David, "State Formation in the Inner Eurasian Steppe," 51-76; HELMS, Svend, "Ancient Chorasnia: The Northern Edge of Central Asia from the 6th Century B.C. to the mid-4th Century A.D.," 77-96).

The second section is opened, without transition, with a short analysis of the Chinese official vision of ex-Soviet Central Asia, through the Chinese perception of Russia and the USA's respective roles in the region, and of Islam's potentialities for political mobilization. These potentialities seem to be seen from Beijing with scepticism, and perceived by the Chinese government as a paper tiger, of which Americans and Russians could be tempted to make use for maintaining or increasing their respective presence in the region (HENDRISCHKE, Hans, "Chinese Concerns with Central Asia," 97-104). The following paper is a kind of report of two short missions in Xinjiang in 1982 and 1994. The author admits his own dependence on the scanty avail-

able literature on this region: it seems that contemporary studies on Xinjiang continue to process from the viewpoint of remote observers, as used to do our fathers' Sovietology (MACKERRAS, Colin, "Some Observations on Xinjiang in the 1990s," 105-120). Then comes a paper limited to an overview of the recent literature in political science of Afghanistan up to the fall of the Talibans (MALEY, William, "The Dynamics of Regime Transition in Afghanistan," 121-146).

The following contribution (NOURZHANOV, Kirill, "Traditional Kinship Structures in Contemporary Tajik Politics," 147-164) is much more ambitious, although its author has satisfied himself with the systematization of the argument of previous personal publications. K.N. insists on the dynamism of traditional Tajik society, of its forms of sociability and local or regional solidarity networks, which have survived the Soviet period and constitute since the late 1980s the bases of a civil society of its own. The analysis deals with three levels of communal mobilization: the relatives (*awlād*), the religious community, and sub-ethnic regionalism. Thanks to his familiarity with the field, the author has given a special attention to the economic undercurrents in the functioning of the *awlād*, *mahalla* and traditional "male unions" (*gashtak* among the Tajiks, *gap* among the Uzbeks). K.N. offers an interesting analysis of their links with the political field since the last year of the Soviet period (see the formation of the direction of the Tajik Party of the Islamic Renewal out of a limited number of mutually linked *gashtaks*; the military mobilization of Sangak Safarov's Popular Front through *mahal-las*, etc.).

The author of the following study, a political scientist by education and profession, has treaded on the dangerous ground of the history of the reform movements in the Emirate of Bukhara at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries: his paper, devoid of any documental basis worth of this denomination, appears as a mere rehash of mostly outdated Western publications (AKBARZADEH, Shahram, "Reformism in the Bukharan Khanate," 165-180). Then come two papers out of the geographical scope of *Abstracta Iranica* and of the present volume (LAFITTE, Gabriel, "Re-orienting Mongolia," 181-192; PATRIKEEF, Felix, "Baron Ungern and the Eurasian Empire," 193-210). They are followed by a panoramic study on the theory of international relations as it is debated nowadays in the circles of Moscow's pundits, notably through the varied successes of a woolly neo-Eurasianist ideology, which has been gaining momentum in Russia and Kazakhstan's academic and ruling circles since the end of the Soviet period (PITTY, Roderic, "Russia and Eurasia in International Relations," 211-240). The penultimate paper of the volume gives a very quick overview of the history of Central Asian civilizations. Its pedantic transliteration and exclusive references to manuscript sources should prevent it from being used even as a teaching or popularization tool (TONGERLOO, Alois van, "Turkestan: A Treasury of Civilisations," 241-264). The volume is closed by a study on the way British hunters of the colonial period have transposed to Central Asia the customs and prejudices of their class and of their time: a source of useful and infinite meditation on Western modern and contemporary constructions of Central Asia as a whole (WATSON, Geoff, "Central Asia as Hunting

Ground: Sporting Images of Central Asia," 265-287).

Beside the paper by K. Nourzhanov, the most interesting contribution of this volume to modern and contemporary studies on Central Asia is perhaps to be found in the appendix devoted to the main websites on Central Asia (CIOLEK, T. Matthew, "Digital Caravanserais': Essential Online Resources for Inner Asian Studies," 288-302).

S.A.D.

● CHRISTIAN, David, BENJAMIN, Craig, eds., *Silk Road Studies, 4 – Realms of the Silk Roads: Ancient and Modern*, Proceedings from the Third Conference of the Australian Society for Inner Asian Studies (A.S.I.A.S.), Macquarie University, September 18-20, 1998, Turnhout: Brepols, 2000 (Silk Road Studies: 4), [2]-vi-343 p., maps.

All but three papers in this volume have been presented at the Third Conference of the ASIAs in 1998. Papers presented at the Second ASIAs conference have been published in the volume reviewed in the previous abstract. These two volumes are the first ones to bring together such a substantial body mainly by Australian or Australian-based scholars working on Inner Asia, and we can agree with the editors on the fact that Australian Inner Asian studies "are flourishing down under." Among papers devoted to modern times and the contemporary period, a first one makes the link with ancient times, in line with the ASIAs's overall orientation. It sketches relations between archaeology and ethnography, and brings out perspectives for further studies of the interface between nomadic and sedentary societies. The typology of the hunting traps of Ustiurt (which can be traced from the 1st millennium BCE to the early 20th century), previously established by V.N. Iagodin, is revisited by A.V.G. Betts in connection with analogous phenomena in other regions of the world, which allows the authors to draw interesting perspectives on the social role of large collective hunts in the open environment of this plateau East of the Aral Sea (A. V. G. BETTS & V. N. [IAGODIN] YAGODIN, "Hunting Traps on the Ustiurt Plateau, Uzbekistan," 29-45, 4 figs.). To be mentioned in passing, since it does not deal with modern times, a synthetic but substantial contribution by David CHRISTIAN on the Silk Roads in the long duration of history; the author deals with their trans-ecological role as a vector of goods and ideas between the pastoralist and agrarian worlds, at the scale of the Afro-Eurasian continent ("Silk Roads or Steppe Roads? The Silk Roads in World History," 67-94). Among the four contributors on the modern and contemporary periods, we meet again with a leading author of the ASIAs's previous volume: Kirill NOURZHANOV presents us with a convincing chronology of the political processes which have preceded the signature of the General Peace Agreement in Tajikistan in June 1997. The evolving logic of the various protagonists, inside and outside the country, is reconstructed on the basis of sociological and economic criteria. The author gives a special attention to the "third forces" which have tried to oppose, from 1995 to 1998, the monopoly on power of the enlarged 'Kulabi' and 'Gharmi' factions — such as A. Abdullojonov's Movement for National Revival in the north of the Country, or M. Khudoiberdiev's Defense Council for Central and Southern Tajikistan ("Politics of National Reconciliation in Tajikistan: From Peace

Talks to (Partial) Political Settlement," 161-179). The following paper discusses the perception of Islam as a political threat in Central Asian governing circles. On a documentary basis which is not precisely identified, the author examines two aspects of this perception: the fact that Islamic fundamentalists in Central Asia would be searching the establishment of an Islamic state, and Islam's overall potential to encourage and foster in the region alternative political units to the existing national entities (Shahram AKBARZADEH, "Islam and Regional Stability in Central Asia," 181-194). The author of the following studies continues his considerations of the previous volume (reviewed *supra*) on the lasting representations of British aristocratic travelers in Central Asia, and the way these representations were influenced by Orientalism and notions of 'Tatar' characteristics, but also by pragmatic considerations. A change in the focus of travel accounts on Central Asia is identified by the author in the closing decade of the nineteenth century, with the Great Game effectively concluded: then travel accounts became a celebration of the virtues of the British Empire, compared to the Russian and Chinese administrations in the region, whence the peoples of Central Asia, formerly condemned, became primitive curiosities for the viewing upper-class British travelers (Geoff WATSON, "Prestigious Peregrinations: British Travelers in Central Asia, c. 1830-1914," 209-238). The penultimate contribution of this volume on modern Central Asia is a thematic study of three short novels published by the nationalist and pro-Soviet Uighur writer Zunnun Qadir (1912-1989), after his rehabilitation in 1979. The author has been particularly interested in the influence that early twentieth-century Central Asian 'Jadid' literature has exerted on Qadir's work in the last years of his life (Dilber THWAITES, "The Road to Urumqi: Zunun Kadir's Lost World," 261-290). Our selection of papers is closed with a biographic reflection on three prominent figures of the Baltic Germans in Inner Asia, Paul Unterberger (1842-1920, a governor of Russian Far-Eastern provinces), Roman von Ungern-Sternberg (1885-1921, a renowned adventurer and warlord of the civil war period in Mongolia and the Russian Far-East) and Arnold von Skerst (1888-1948, a financial diplomat of the Czarist regime). The author systematically questions the stereotypes on the Baltic Germans' attraction for Germany and Pan-Germanism, and brightly analyzes the influence of the Imperial Orthodox cultural substratum on the respective deeds of these three characters (Felix PATRIKIEFF & John PERKINS, "National and Imperial Identity: A Triptych of Baltic Germans in Inner Asia," 291-306). The overall volume brings an important contribution to the current problematic of imperial representations through the colonial and Soviet periods of the history of Central Eurasia. Great care has been given to the edition of individual papers to which — it is worth mentioning — maps have often been attached: quite a rare feature of this kind of publication. S.A.D.

- [FOURNIAU, Vincent], ed., *La mémoire et ses supports en Asie centrale*, Tashkent – Aix-en-Provence: Edisud, 2000 (Cahiers d'Asie centrale: 8), 191 p., ill.

The contributions of the present volume continue the overall introduction to the main Central Asian public collections of ancient Persian and Turkic manuscripts, which had

been undertaken by the *Cahiers d'Asie centrale* in its previous issue (see Ashirbek Muminov, Francis Richard, Maria Szuppe, eds., *Patrimoine manuscrit et vie intellectuelle de l'Asie centrale islamique*, Tashkent – Aix-en-Provence: Edisud, 1999 (Cahiers d'Asie centrale: 7), 232 p., and my review in this volume). These two successive issues of the biannual journal of the French Institute of Central Asian Studies (IFEAC in French acronyms) have been conceived as a location tool for the use of Western as well as for local scientists. The present issue answers, moreover, to specific explicit ambitions, like that consisting of "measuring the persistence of written literary themes, through oral tradition and other modes of preservation of memory" (Catherine POIJOL, "Introduction," 13). Another particular objective of the present volume has been to cast light on numerous bridges between nomadic and sedentary societies, from the viewpoint of the written transmission of memory. Unfortunately, these questions have been treated in very general terms, and in a great conceptual poverty. For instance, relations between nomadic and sedentary worlds have been studied in the framework of "multiculturalism" — a vocabulary and a notion which belong to a specific political militancy, and should not have been taken as the fundament of comparative research in human and social sciences. Otherwise, the notions used for the approach of general problems are rooted in the Sovietologic literature of the Cold War period, which leads inevitably to the formulation of a series of stereotypes (like those on the cleavage between oral or popular and written or learned cultures, or that between "official culture" and "counter-culture" which remind us of the good old dialectical materialism). Generally speaking, the level adopted in this volume is that of semi-popularization for students of the first and second (pre-graduate) cycles of French universities.

Of the five papers which make the special thematic file of this volume, the first offers a very general overview of the main public collections of Oriental manuscripts in St. Petersburg, followed by bibliographical notes mentioning the main existing catalogues (Firuza ABDULLAEVA, "Les collections de manuscrits en persan de Saint-Petersbourg," 23-34). This evocation is followed by a short panoramic introduction to the main public collections of manuscripts in Chaghatay Turkic language in Xinjiang. The paper, by two non-specialists, is finished by an elliptic presentation — with no reference to existing catalogues nor to modern publications — of some dozens of these manuscripts, classified by approximate genres ("literature and art," "history and geography," "religion and philosophy," "linguistics and education [sic]," "law and documents," etc.). The attached bibliography contains no publication in Chinese, nor publication in Uighur prior to 1980 (Amina ABDURAHMAN & JIN Yu-Ping, "Une vue d'ensemble des manuscrits tchaghatay du Xinjiang:" 35-62). More useful, the following study evokes the content of the four main public collections of Oriental manuscripts in the cities of Almaty and Turkestan (Kazakhstan), with their postal addresses. The author devotes particular paragraphs to the 149 "most representative" (from which point of view?) of the Fund of Rare Books and Manuscripts of the National Library of Kazakhstan, and to a selection of some thirty manuscripts of the Archive of the



National Museum of Book in Almaty (Meruert ABUSEITOVA & Aytjan NURMANOVA, "Manuscript Funds in Arabic Characters in Kazakhstan," 63-82). This thematic file of the *Cahiers d'Asie centrale* is continued with a paper giving an overall typological classification of authors of historical works and memories in Islamic Central Asia (Tursun SULTANOV, "Quelques mots sur la paternité des œuvres historiques d'Asie Centrale (d'après les ouvrages en persan et en tchaghatay)," 83-91). This short file is closed with a general reflection on relations between oral tradition and modern history writing in the Kazakh world: although not deprived of interest, this reflection remains too panoramic and too short for bringing out any element of innovation (Aytjan NURMANOVA, "La tradition historique orale chez les Kazakhs," 93-100). To this set of papers can still be added a very short text on the Ashgabat manuscripts (Annagurban ASHIROV, "Une note sur l'Institut des Manuscrits du Turkménistan," 187-188).

More detailed comment by the same reviewer in *BCAI* 18 (2002):107-108.

S.A.D.

■ GERVERS, Michael, SCHLEPP, Wayne, eds., *Cultural Contact, History and Ethnicity in Inner Asia*. Papers presented at the Central and Inner Asian Seminar, University of Toronto, March 4, 1994 and March 3, 1995, Toronto: Joint Centre for Asia Pacific Studies, 1996 (Toronto Studies in Central and Inner Asia: 2), 183 p., figs.

The second of a much promising series of collective volumes on Central Eurasia, the present collection of papers is devoted to three themes with strong mutual connections: 1) the history of cultural contacts and exchanges, direct or indirect (LINDUFF, Kathryn M., "Art and Identity: The Chinese and Their 'Significant Others' in the Third and Second Millenium BC," 12-48, 26 fig.; MESERVE, Ruth I., "On Medieval and Early Modern Science and Technology in Central Eurasia," 49-70, appendices; SIDELKO, Paul L., "Western Embassies to the Mongols and the Prospects for Their Conversion, 1245-1253," 71-79); 2) the ancient, medieval and modern history of the Mongols (WU, Chaolu, "Tree Worship in Early Mongolia," 80-95, bibliography; KAHN, Paul, "Instruction and Entertainment in the Naiman Battle Text: An Analysis of § 189 through § 196 of *The Secret History of the Mongols*," 96-105; BAKICH, Olga, "Diary of Ivan Iakovlevich Korostovets, Russian Plenipotentiary in the Russo-Mongolian Negotiations in Urga in 1912-1913," 106-114); 3) China and Inner Asian Muslims.

The first contribution of this third section provides a tentative analysis of the current debate between some nationalist Uighur historians and their Chinese colleagues about the sharply discussed age of the Uighur population of Xinjiang (BENSON, Linda, "Contested History: Issues in the Historiography of Inner Asia's Uighurs," 115-131). The following paper proposes a panoramic overview of the history of Uighur language and of the debates on it throughout the twentieth century; the study begins with a short history of the ethnonym *uyghūr* since its reappearance in the 1920s; it goes on with a short history of the Uighur language and its varied denominations in Xinjiang and Soviet Central Asia; the text is closed on an overview of the current debates on a reform of the writing system, and on the destiny of the lexicographic borrowings of Uighur



from Chinese language (DUVAL, Jean R., "Modern Uyghur: A Historical Perspective," 132-167). A last paper is devoted to the current ideological utilization, by Uighur intellectuals, of recent paleo-anthropological discoveries in Xinjiang, which allow some authors to insist on the non-Chinese remote past of the region (RUDELSON, Justin John, "The Xinjiang Mummies and Foreign Angels: Art, Archaeology and Uighur Muslim Nationalism in Chinese Central Asia," 168-183). S.A.D.

■ GERVERS, Michael, SCHLEPP, Wayne, eds., *Historical Themes and Current Change in Central and Inner Asia*. Papers Presented at the Central and Inner Asian Seminar, University of Toronto, April 25-26, 1997, Toronto: Joint Centre for Asia Pacific Studies, 1998 (Toronto Studies in Central and Inner Asia: 3), 195 p., ill., fig.

Like the previous volumes of the same collection, the present one is divided into three mutually linked parts. The first section is devoted to the economic and political past of Central Asia. A first paper offers a useful clarification on the continuity of the intra-continental commercial activity during the three centuries which followed the European discovery of the maritime route of East Indies (FRANK, Andre Gunder, "Central Asia's Continuing Role in the World Economy to 1800," 14-38, bibliography; see by the same author, for more developments of this innovative thesis: *ReOrient: Global Economy in the Asian Age*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997). The following paper is a reflection on the influence of the Song's expansion policy on the appearance and further development of inter-ethnic violence between the Han and Khitan populations of the North-Western boundary of the Empire (FORAGE, Paul C., "Power and Ethnicity in the Northern Liao Secession, 1122-1123," 39-52). Then comes a paper on the vicissitudes of the worship of the Kōkōnuur Lake during the twentieth century — the lake becoming the stake of political struggles on the North-Western frontier between Chinese, Mongols, Tibetans and Muslim warlords (BULAG, Uradyn E., "The Cult of the Kōkōnuur Lake: Ritual and Political Control of Nomads in 18th-20th Century China," 53-80, bibliography). The last study of this first section proposes an overall reflection on the role played by physical geography in the Western fringe of the Eurasian steppe in the demarcation of the expansion zone of nomadism, and in the history of the Mongol Empire in the 13th-14th centuries (LINDNER, Rudi Paul, "At the Western Fringe of the Steppe," 81-90).

The second part is devoted to the remote cultural past of the region, with three contributions: VOLMER, John E., "Tiger Stripe Patterned Chinese Textiles," 91-100, 4 ill., bibliography; UTZ, David A., "A Sogdian Thaumaturgical Text from Dunhuang and the Origins of Inner Asian Weather Magic," 101-121, bibliography; WALTER, Michael, "Areal Religious Phenomena in Tibet and Central Eurasia," 122-133. The third section, reserved for contemporary studies, is opened with a general analysis of the institutional framework created in Kazakhstan by the Constitution of 1995, and of the progress of the notion of lawful state in this country since independence (DZHUNUSOVA, Zhanylzhana, "Transitional Political Institutions in Modern Kazakhstan [sic]," 134-149). In the following study the author has been tempted to measure the effect — a

quite limited one, for structural reasons — of the international agreements signed during the second half of the 1990s (Customs Union, Single Economic Space) on the economic integration of Kazakhstan inside the CIS, in particular from the viewpoint of this country's relations with Russia on the one hand, with Uzbekistan on the other (OKA, Natsuko, "Kazakhstan and Efforts at Regional Economic Integration with Other CIS States: The Customs Union and the Single Economic Space," 150-165, appendices). The next paper is said to be based exclusively on a fieldwork made in September 1996 — which may explain the poverty of its bibliography —; it is not a very original contribution on a question documented by a rich bibliography of recent scientific works (DADMEHR, Nasrin, "Tadjikistan. Une guerre inévitable?," 166-175, bibliography, map). The paper which closes this volume is a general study of the factors, notably demographic and social, which continue to worsen the ecological situation around the Caspian Sea (SMALL, Ian, "Environmental Scarcity: Considering the Aral Sea Basin," 176-195, bibliography). S.A.D.

- GYSELEN, Rika, SZUPPE, Maria, eds., *Matériaux pour l'histoire économique du monde iranien*, Paris: Association pour l'avancement des études iraniennes, 1999 (*Studia Iranica*: 21), 368 p., index.

This volume contains 19 papers dealing with the economic history of the Iranian world (from the Near-East to Central Asia) from Antiquity to the 19th century. Some contributions present unpublished sources, others new interpretations of varied economic aspects. The authors, specialists of different fields, have been using documents as varied as written documents, coins and archaeological vestiges. See notably: M. SZUPPE, "Les relations commerciales de Boukhara au début du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle." R.

- KOMATSU, Hisao, OBIYA, Chika, SCHOEERLEIN, John S., eds., *Migration in Central Asia: Its History and Current Problems*, Osaka: The Japan Center for Area Studies (National Museum of Ethnology), 2000 (JCAS Symposium Series: 9; Population Movement in the Modern World, III), vi-245 p., maps, appendixes, tabs.

The present work constitutes the proceedings of an international colloquium held at the Japan Center for Area Studies of Osaka on March 10-12, 1998, in the framework of the ten-year programme of the JCAS "Joint Research Project on Population Movement in the Modern World," and under the auspices of the Islamic Area Studies Project (a five-year structure created in 1997 and based in the University of Tokyo). The authors of the contributions gathered in the present volume have tried, through a multi-disciplinary approach, to replace in various durations migratory phenomena which can be observed nowadays in former Soviet Central Asia.

A first introductory paper gives a panoramic overview of the history of migrations in Central Asia, from ancient times to the present (RTVELADZE, Edvard V., "Migration of Peoples in Central Asia," 1-20). A second introductory paper is devoted to the way the migration question was treated, in relation with Russian colonization, in the writings of early twentieth-century Turkestan reformist and modernist authors (KOMATSU,

Hisao, "Migration in Central Asia as Reflected in Jadid Writings," 21-34). A first section is then devoted to various case studies of the colonial and Soviet periods, from the viewpoint of history or anthropology (BEISEMBIEV, Timur, "Migration in the Qöqand Khanate in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries," 35-40; SCHOEERLEIN, John S., "Shifting Ground: How the Soviet Regime Used Resettlement to Transform Central Asian Society and the Consequences of this Policy Today," 41-64; NISHIYAMA, Katsunori, "Russian Colonization in Central Asia: The Case of Semiretchye, 1867-1922," 65-84). The second section deals with the consequences of migratory phenomena for the evolution of group identities. A special attention has been given to the role of the Imperial Russian and Soviet policy on the formation of contemporary diasporas (like those of the Turkestanis in Turkey or, conversely, the Koreans in Central Asia: SHIGABDINOV, Rinat, NIKITENKO, Georgii, "Migration Processes in the West of Central Asia in the Late Nineteenth and the Twentieth Centuries," 87-112; KOCAOĞLU, Timur, "Turkistan Abroad: the Political Migration — From the Soviet & Chinese Central Asia (1918-1997)," 113-126; OKA, Natsuko, "Deportation of Koreans from the Russian Far East to Central Asia," 127-146). The third section is devoted to Tajikistan, with studies of the role of inner migratory phenomena of this former Soviet republic and their influence on the beginning or consequences of the civil war of the years 1992-1997 (BUSHKOV, Valentin I., "Population Migration in Tajikistan: Past and Present," 147-156; DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., "The Role of Migrant Communities in the Politics of Central Asia: Prolegomena for Further Comparative Studies. The Cases of Tajikistan and Tatarstan in the 1980s," 157-168; NIYAZI, Aziz, "Migration, Demography and Socio-Ecological Processes in Tajikistan," 169-178). The last section gathers varied studies of current aspects of the migratory problematic in Central Asia (ISLAMOV, Bakhtior, "Migration of Populations in the Independent States of Central Asia," 179-198; SHIMIZU, Manabu, "Transition to Market Economies in Central Asia: Economic Development Led by Natural Resource Export and Its Impact on Regional Reorganization and Mobility of Labor," 199-208; ABAZOV, Rafis, "Migration of Population, the Labor Market and Economic Changes in Kirghizstan," 209-236.)

As the editors have well stressed in their general introduction, the present volume has marked indeed in Japan the launching of a series of events on modern and contemporary Central Asia; it also suffers from shortcomings which reflect the present state of Central Asian studies in the West. Some of the studies published in the volume appear less in the form of achieved works than in that of general reflections and bases for further research. One may reproach to some the absence of very elliptical character of statistic elements or the methodology of their interpretation. However the Osaka colloquium has permitted — this is what it had authority to do — a mutual confrontation of specialists of the most various disciplines (historians and anthropologists, notably) and its debates, as well as its papers, have shown particularly fruitful. R.

- ROWLAND, R. R., et al., "Central Asia," *EIr* 5/2, 1990: 159-224; 5/3, 1991: 225-242.

This important paper, one of the longest ever published by the *Encyclopaedia Iranica*,

is divided into 13 parts dealing with the most various aspects of this region of the world: geography, demography (2 art., by R.R. Rowland), history (7 art., by R.N. Frye, C.E. Bosworth, B. Spuler, R.D. McChesney, Yu. Bregel, A. Amanat, E. Allworth), economy (3 art., by P.B. Golden, R.D. McChesney, I. Matley), languages (2 art., by I.M. Steblin-Kamenskii, G. Doerfer), modern literatures (K. Hitchins) and music (W. Feldman). The parts concerning history or languages are very well developed, with a study on the relations with Iran, but one may regret that the contemporary period is almost totally absent from this collection of papers, for history as well as for economy or anthropology. Some maps would also have been welcome. S.A.D.

■ SHUKUROV, Mirzo, ed., *Tojik, tojdor, tojvar* [Tajik, Crown Bearer, Crowned], Dushanbe: Adib, 1990, 128 p.

In this collection of editorials opened with Muhammad Iqbal's verses appealing to an "awakening" of the nations of Islam, the editor has gathered texts published in Tajikistan in the 1920s-40s and other, contemporary texts, on the etymology and history of the ethnic denomination *tājīk*. [Kamol AINĪ] presents (pp. 5-8) a text written in 1942 by his father Sadridin AINĪ on "The Meaning of the Term *Tājīk*," the basis and ultimate reference of almost all the other articles of this volume: a Russian translation, kept in A.M. Mirzoev's personal archive, had been published in the special issue of the *IANT OON* in 1978; the Tajik text, an autographic version of which has been "rediscovered" by Kamol Ainī in the reserves of the State Publishing House of Tajikistan, had been published in *Sadoi Sharq*, the monthly journal of the Union of Writers of Tajikistan, in August 1988. However, the most telling documents published in the present volume are two texts by the political activist, then founder of the Tajik SSR, Abdulqodir MUHIDDINOV (d. 1933): a short paper often reprinted on Bukhara's belonging to the Tajik cultural and linguistic area ("Mardumi shahr va atrofi Bukhoro tojikand io uzbek?," 41-51) and a text first published in 1929, with strong and explicit references to Ahmad Kasravi's work, on the necessity to create a simple literary Tajik language, freed from Arabic and Turkic "borrowings" and understandable in the whole Persian-speaking world ("Fikrhoi mo dar borai zaboni adabii tojikī," pp. 51-61). Numerous similarities between, on the one hand, Muhiddinov and Ainī's thought, and on the other hand arguments by contemporary authors of Tajikistan and Afghanistan reveal interesting continuities, or resurgences in the public debate on the idea of nation and of national language in Central Asia, since the 1920s.

These reference texts are followed by a paper by the philologist and critic Turaql ZEHNĪ on the term *tājīk* in classical Persian literature (pp. 63-74, reprinted from *Sadoi Sharq* 1989/5); this author adopts Ainī's whimsical Iranian etymology (based on the root *tāj*, "crown"), which is accepted by all the authors of the volume, and has become a matter of consensus in Tajikistan since the 1940s. Then come papers by Muhsin UMARZODA ("The Tajik Boundary and That of Tajik Language," 77-93; first published in *Haqiqati Uzbekiston* 1988/09/18); by the Afghan academician 'Abd al-Ahmad JĀWĪD ("A Couple of Words on Tajik Language," 95-105); by the Afghan historian 'Abd al-

Qiyāth NAWBAHĀR ("The Tajiks of Afghanistan," 107-112 — on some trans-historical moral virtues specific to the Tajiks, who are given credit for their exceptional capacity to cultivate the friendship of peoples...). The volume is concluded with two texts first published in the spring 1989, during the campaign for the promotion of the Tajik language as (unique) state language in Tajikistan (ARDAMEHR, "Let's Respect Our Mother Tongue," 113-119; Miskin BOZICHAEV, "Reflections on Our Mother Tongue," 120-126.). S.A.D.

### 1.3.C. Encyclopedias, Dictionaries, Collected Papers

- [CAFEROĞLU, Ahmet, ed.] *Azerbaycan Yurt Bilgisi*, Istanbul: Isis Press, 1984, 3 vols.

This is the reedition of the rare journal devoted to the history and literature of Azerbaijan published in Istanbul in 1932 (37 issues) by Ahmet Caferoğlu in association with F. Köprülüzade, A.Z. Velidi and other Turkish scholars. T.Z.

- [ÇOKAYOĞLU, Mustafa, ed.] *Yaş Türkistan: Türkistan Millî İstiklâl Fikriye Hizmet Etluvcı Aylıq Mecmu'a* [Young Turkestan: Monthly Journal Serving for the Turkestan National Independent Idea], 1. Cilt (1-13. sayılar) 1928-1930, Istanbul: Ayaz Tahir Türkistan İdil Ural Vakfı, 1997, 47 ills., 440 p.

This is the facsimile edition of the first volume of the rare journal published in Paris in the years of 1929-1939 (117 issues) by Mustafa Çokayoğlu (1890-1941), a leading Turkestani émigré worked for the independence of Turkestan against the Soviet rule. After a short preface by Tülây Duran, Timur Kocaoğlu contributes an introductory article "'Yaş Türkistan"ın Türkistan Basın Tarihindeki Yeri [The Place of the "Yaş Türkistan" in the history of press in Turkestan]" (13-30). K.H.

- [ENOKI, Kazuo], *Studia Asiatica: The Collected Papers in Western Languages of the Late Dr. Kazuo Enoki*, Tokyo: Kyuko-Shoin, 1998, 867 p., [2] folded leaves of plates.

This volume consists of 44 selected works of the late Orientalist ENOKI Kazuo. Most of the papers treat the ancient history of Central Asia and China, the history of Japan and the activities of the Toyo Bunko. Among others "A History of Central Asian Studies in Japan" (pp. 576-596, first published in 1981) presents us comprehensive information regarding Japanese knowledge of Central Asia. The author makes special mention of the Italian translation of NISHI Tokujirō (1847-1912), *Chū-Ajia kiji* [Description of Central Asia], 2 vols., Tokyo: Rikugun Bunko, 1889, 421-270 pp. After traveling in Russian Turkestan in 1880, this young Japanese diplomat prepared a detailed description of Central Asia, which can be seen as the first attempt of Central Asian area studies in Japan. K.H.

- KHASANOV, M. Kh., ed., *Tatarskii entsiklopedicheskii slovar'* [Tatar Encyclopaedic Dictionary], Kazan: Institut Tatarskoi entsiklopedii AN RT, 1999, 703 p., ill., maps.

Although it has been written in a spirit which remains that of Soviet encyclopaedias,

the present work was one of the very first publications of this kind devoted exclusively to the history and culture of the Volga and Urals Tatars, "from the most ancient times to the present." Among its 16,000 short notices, among which 7,000 biographic notices, the reader will find — beside the inevitable résumés of a bunch of local apparatchiks of the CPSU — numerous short articles written by specialists on the most documented figures and the main public institutions of European Russia's Muslim communities between the late eighteenth and early twentieth centuries. If a majority of the notices are too short to prove really useful to researchers, they offer an interesting state of research and of historical discourse in Tatarstan in the late 1990s. S.A.D.

■ *Strany i narody vostoka*, t. 26. *Sredniaia i Tsentral'naia Aziia (geografiia, etnografiia, istoriia)* [Lands and Peoples of the Orient 26: Middle and Central Asia], Moscow: Nauka, 1989, 270 p.

This volume is an important Central Asian issue of this regular publication, which contains a lot of Afghan studies, among which we will signal here: — historiographical studies devoted notably to the biography of the great historian of modern and contemporary Afghanistan V.A. Romodin (1912-1984), and to the presentation of the sources of the *Sirāj al-tawārīkh* by Fayz Muhammad Khān; — publications of unpublished texts such as an extract, translated into Russian, of a fifteenth century Chinese chronology on the city of Herat, or the travel diary of the Iranologist A.L. Griunberg during his crossing of southern Badakhshan in August 1967. D.B.

## 2. Geography

### 2.1 General Works

- A'LAM, Hushang, "Caviar," *EIr* 5/1, 1990: 99-101, bibliography.

The paper presents the various species of sturgeon, the method of preparation of caviar, and the amounts produced and exported since 1360-61/1981-82. The author remembers that a *fatwa* promulgated in 1983 by Ayatollah Khomeyni has made *halal* (licit) the consumption of caviar, which was until then reputed *haram* (illicit). As a consequence of this decision, its purchase has considerably increased in Iran proper since that date. We regret that this paper does not give any indication on the history of the sturgeon fishing and of the caviar trade, long in the hands of Russians, neither on the personnel of the fisheries and specialized stations, mostly made of seasonal Azeri migrants coming from their highlands. These lacunae would have been filled if several important publications on these activities would have been consulted (in particular those by M. Bazin, F. Carré, I. Rostami, P. Vieille and I. Nabavi). The reader can find necessary additional information in the article "Caspian Sea" by X. De Planhol, in the same fascicule of the *EIr* (reviewed *infra* in this section).

C.Br.

- BRUNET, Roger, REY, Violette, *Europes orientales, Russie, Asie Centrale*, Paris: Belin – Reclus (Géographie universelle), 2000, 480 p., maps, ill., tab., index, bibliography.

Arranged in two parts: one on "Oriental Europes" and the other on "Russia and the neighboring countries," this popularization work on the countries of the former USSR and its European zone of influence gives a limited room to the Caucasus and Central Asia (the latter includes here Mongolia, but not Xinjiang which is assessed in another volume of the same collection). The Caucasus and Central Asia have been gathered in a distinct part for reasons of edition commodity, and tackled in four short chapters a dozen of pages each: "The Fracture of Asia" (pp. 412-421); "Caucasia's Fires" (pp. 422-433); "Oases Asia" (pp. 434-448); "In the Central Asian Steppes" (pp. 449-461). The first of these four chapters provides a historical perspective, in various *durées*, on the ancient nomad and sedentary worlds, with two particular paragraphs on the natural resources (water and gas) and on the Aral — Caspian Sea ensemble. The second chapter deals with the human geography of the Southern Caucasus (the green setting of Colchidia, Erevan and the Armenian diaspora, Baku's oil wealth, etc.); the Northern Caucasus has been isolated inside a previous chapter on the south of the Federation of Russia (pp. 306-317, with one page only for the "Unappeased Terek Caucasus"). The third chapter draws perspectives on the main economic resources of sedentary Central Asia: hydrocarbons in Turkmenistan; cotton in Uzbekistan; ...landscapes (!) in Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan. The last chapter, which also ends the whole volume, draws a contrasted picture of Kazakhstan's regional diversity, and sketches perspectives on the difficult relationship between cities and steppes in Mongolia. Based mainly on other popularization work, this volume is rich in many very exact notations, but at the same

time it is also riddled with superficial assertions that reveal the authors' glaring lack of familiarity with the regions they deal with. These assertions do nothing for correcting the worst Western stereotypes on the Muslim-peopled regions of the Caucasus and Central Asia (*e.g.*, about the "unchanged and coveted Azerbaijan, a country of Islam and oil, misled by the discordant sounds of Turkish, Iranian, Russian and Western sirens," p. 422; or "in October 1995 a fire in the metro of Baku killed more than 300 persons. Azerbaijan is dangerous," p. 430; etc.). S.A.D.

- HAELLQUIST, Karl Reinhold, ed., *Asian Trade Routes: Continental and Maritime*, London: Curzon Press, 1991 (Studies on Asian Topics, Scandinavian Institute of Asian Studies: 13), 304 p., ill.

This collection of 24 papers, classified through a geographic key and going from the Bronze Age to the modern period, concerns the penetration of the Asian markets by the Westerners, the opening of trade routes and the establishment of communication between Occident and Orient. Six papers deal with Central and Inner Asia, Afghanistan and India (see the reviews in this volume). To be noticed, however: the absence of studies on Iran proper, although the country is mentioned in several papers. The other parts of the volume contain contributions on the Near East, South-East Asia and the Far East. The opening and evolution of trade routes are discussed, as well as the implications of these phenomena, through the creation of a game of mutual influences inside these societies, economies and cultures. The contributions of this volume have been presented to the "Asian Trade Routes" colloquium, which was held in Krogerup (Denmark) in August 1984. M.S.

- MIOSECC, Alain, "Quelques aspects et conséquences de l'élévation du niveau de la mer Caspienne," *Bulletin de l'Association des Géographes Français* 75/1 (1998): 31-37.

This short article indicates that the recent rise of the level of the Caspian Sea, from -29.04m in 1977 to -26.94m in 1994 (*e.g.*, + 2.10m in 16 years) is part of a long series of cyclic variations. If the author convincingly shows that "the conjunction of a rapid rise of the level of the sea and of the collapse of the Socialist system in the ex-USSR has only aggravated problems which come within a global geographic approach," he unfortunately does not evoke even once the southern shore of the Caspian Sea. M.B.

- MURZAEV, E. M., *Tiurkskie geograficheskie nazvaniia* [Turkic Geographical Denominations], Moscow: Izdatel'skaia firma "Vostochnaia literatura" RAN, 1996, 254 p., bibliography.

The author analyses the rules which guide the formation of place names in the Turkic world, with a special interest for those based on proper names of persons, or ethnic denominations. The author pays a particular attention to the denominations common to the Turkic, Mongol, and Tungus-Manchu languages; he devotes a distinct chapter on the spreading of place names of Turkic origin into the Russian world. S.A.D.



- PLANHOL, Xavier de, "Caspian Sea," *Elr* 5/1, 1990: 48-61, bibliography.

This paper offers a remarkable synthesis of the knowledge on the Caspian Sea. Morphology, hydrology, geological history, biogeography, history of maritime trade, of navigation techniques, of fishing: all these aspects are closely examined thanks to an impeccable erudition. The reader discovers with interest the pages on the history of geographic knowledge on the Caspian Sea, which was considered until the 7th/13th century as a gulf of the "External Ocean," and the chapters on two great periods in the history of maritime trade: from the 7th/13th to the 10th/16th century the Caspian is an "Islamic lake"; from the mid-16th century to the First World War the Russians have the control on it. About trade and fishing in the 19th century, British consular reports and travel accounts (like that by C. MacKenzie) should have brought some more precisions. It is regrettable that this reference article is not illustrated by any maps.

C.Br.

## 2.2 The Crimea, the Volga-Urals Region, Siberia

- ALEKSEEV, V. V., ed., *Ural'skaia istoricheskaja entsiklopediia* [Historical Encyclopedia of the Urals], Ekaterinburg: Ural'skoe Otdelenie Rossiiskoi Akademii nauk – Izdatel'stvo "Ekaterinburg," 1998, 624 p., ill., maps.

In this encyclopedia, which is in fact devoted to the Eastern Ural and the northern part of the Kazakh steppe, very few notices can be found on the past and present of the Muslim communities of this region. However, in spite of the very Russo-centric vision of regional history which predominates in this work, the readers will find some general data on the modern and contemporary history of the Eastern Ural.

S.A.D.

- SARTOR, Wolfgang, *Die Wolga als internationaler Handelsweg für persische Rohseide: ein Beitrag zur Handelsgeschichte Russlands im 17. und 18. Jahrhundert*, doctorate dissertation, Berlin: Freie Universität Berlin, 1992, 343 p.

This excellent dissertation on the Volga trade in silk focuses on Russia but is highly relevant to Iran. It is based on a plethora of archival sources, toll registers from Astrakhan, Moscow and St. Petersburg, as well as on many printed Russian works that are rarely used by historians of Iran. As little source material for the earlier 1600s has survived, the study concentrates on the later part of the century and especially the 18th century, when trade between Iran and Europe via the Russian route increased significantly. Really taking off after 1724, following the establishment of an indigenous Russian textile manufacturing industry, commercial exchange peaked in the 1740s, to trail off soon thereafter in the wake of the turmoil of Nader Shah's reign in Iran. The narrative is staccato — many paragraphs contain no more than one sentence — and the information at times presented in a disjointed manner. In providing a wealth of new material, including many statistics on the volume of trade, the participants, breakdown of prices and tolls, however, this study is an important contribution to our information

about Iran's overland trade link with Russia.

R.M.

## 2.3 The Caucasus

■ PLANHOL, X. de, KLEISS, W., SCHIPPMANN, K., BOSWORTH, C. E., KUNIHOLM, B., TAPPER, R., YARSHATER, E., DOERFER, G., JOHANSON, L., JAVADI, H., BURRILL, K., DURING, J., "Azerbaijan," *EIr* 3/2-3, 1988: 205-257.

This long paper offers a very detailed version — served by a bibliography which can be called exhaustive — of the geography, archaeology, history, literature and music of Azerbaijan. The rubric on geography (X. de PLANHOL) defines the geographical entity recovered by modern Azerbaijan, before treating the physical geography of this region (morphological aspects, climate, hydrology, vegetation), then its human and economic geography (nomadism and settling process, mountain life, agriculture, cities and industrialisation). The rubric on archaeology deals only with the Iranian part of Azerbaijan, from Palaeolithic and the Urartu period to the Islamic conquest. The history of pre-Islamic Azerbaijan (K. SCHIPPMANN) perfectly completes the previous rubric and casts light, in particular, on the Achaemenid, Seleucid and Parthian periods. One of the most significant rubrics, that covering the history of Azerbaijan from the Islamic conquest to 1941 (C. E. BOSWORTH) treats the history of the Christian communities of this region and sketches a panoramic overview from the arrival of the Arabs up till that of the Seljuk Turks. The author insists on the geopolitical and strategic role of this territory, the most Oriental Arab province under Umar's caliphate (7th century CE) and, under the Umayyads, a basis for the conquest of the Caucasus. Escaping the control of the caliphate, Azerbaijan then passed under the leadership of local potentates (Sayyid, for instance) before becoming Seljuk in 1062. The author then describes the Mongol Il-Khan period and the reign of the Qara-Qoyunlus and Aq-Qoyunlus, analyzes the Safavid period — the Golden Age of Azerbaijan with the shahs Ismā'il I, Tahmāsp I and 'Abbās I —, and at last the Qajar period, during which the Russian presence strengthens, whence the north of the region becomes Russian already in 1828. Azerbaijan still plays a major role before, during and after the Constitutional Revolution (1906-1911). However, after the Pahlavis' coming to power, Azerbaijan is forgotten and the public use of its language is forbidden, to the advantage of Persian. A last rubric of history is devoted to the period from 1941 to 1947 (B. KUNIHOLM).

As to the populations and cultures of Azerbaijan, they are devoted to an analysis (by R. TAPPER) focusing on the various ethnic groups represented on its territory (Turks, Kurds, Tats), on the commercial and cultural importance of Tabriz in the early twentieth century, on the dark years of the Pahlavi period, on the rebirth of the Azerbaijani language and literature under the Islamic Republic, on the folklore and religion of Azerbaijan. The question of the Azerbaijani language of the Iranian linguistic family which preceded locally the Turkic Azerbaijani language is studied with much precision (E. YARSHATER); the author has given special attention to the survivals of this

language, in the form of lexical borrowings in Turkic Azerbaijani as well as in Tatic dialects now in use. This point is completed with a linguistic study of Iranian Azerbaijani. Turkic Azerbaijani is dealt with (G. DOERFER) first in relation with other Turkic languages, then in relation with the Oghuz sub-group to which it belongs. The numerous Azerbaijani dialects are introduced, although the authors give more room to the literary Azerbaijani language established on the basis of the Oriental group of the former Soviet part of the Azerbaijani territory, and the official language of the Azerbaijani SSR, then of the Republic of Azerbaijan, since 1936. In Iran, modern literary texts have been written in a language close to Tabriz Azerbaijani. Are then treated the questions of script, grammatical structure and the state of the art of research in this field. The general backwardness of works published in Iran is stressed, in spite of a general renewal of Azerbaijani studies since the proclamation of the Islamic Republic. A separate rubric deals with the Turkic Azerbaijani's borrowings from Persian language (L. JOHANSON) through phonology, vocalism, consonant system, morphology, syntax and lexicon. The history of Azerbaijani literature is treated according to a classification into four periods (H. JAVADI, K. BURRILL): from the thirteenth century to the Russian annexation of Northern Azerbaijan in 1828; between 1828 and 1920, the date of the coming to power of Bolsheviks in Southern Caucasus, and of the Pahlavis in Iran; from 1925 to 1979, corresponding to the reign of the Pahlavis, who restricted the written use of Azerbaijani language; last from 1979, a period during which the Islamic Republic favoured the renewal of Azerbaijani literature in Iran. The last rubric (J. DURING) is devoted to Azerbaijani music.

T.Z.

## 2.4 Western Central Asia

● ATABAKI, Turaj, VERSTEEG, Joris, *Centraal-Azië: mensen, politiek, economie, cultuur*, Amsterdam: Koninklijk Instituut voor de Tropen – s-Gravenhage: Novib – Brussel: NCOS, 1994 (Landenreeks, 0922-4939), 83 p., ill., maps, bibliography.

This concise book offers a geographic and historical overview of Central Asia, for a non-specialised audience. The work is opened with a historical survey of the population, communication routes, and Islam; it continues with a survey of the Soviet period — notably through the formation of national republics, the destiny of nomads and the ecological disasters —; then comes a chapter divided into separate paragraphs on each Central Asian state, and its political climate in the early 1990s; the volume is closed with a dozen of pages on the current economic situation.

S.A.D.

■ BALLAND, Daniel, "Une ville moyenne du Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance: Pendjikent," *LAC 2* (1994): 11-12.

The centre of a powerful emigration movement towards southern Tajikistani cotton plains since the 1950s, and a significant purveyor of literati and intellectuals in the early 1980s, the city of Penjikent and its district have been generally forgotten in the numer-

ous studies on the Tajik conflict. The author rectifies this omission with the present study, based on personal fieldwork in May-June 1993. He has been interested, in particular, in the first local economic and social effects of the proclamation of independence of Tajikistan in September 1991, in a region which remains separated from Tajikistan's central regions by three mountain ranges, and from Uzbekistan (with which the city previously had close economic relations) by a now weakly open political boundary. Coupled with the following reference by the same author (see the next review *infra*), this paper brings an innovative and significant contribution to the delicate problematic of boundaries in post-Soviet Central Asia. S.A.D.

- BALLAND, Daniel, "Tachkent, métropole de l'Asie centrale," *CEMOTI* 24 (1997): 218-250, 1 map, tab.

Will the city of Tashkent manage to maintain a part of its functions as a regional centre, after the structural adjustments resulting from the end of the USSR? Such is the question which the author has tried to answer, through the history of the city since the Russian conquest, and through a complete description of its current infrastructures. Tashkent was already one of the biggest Central Asian cities before Russian colonisation; after its promotion as the capital of Turkestan in 1867, it entered a period of spectacular growth, without equivalent in the region. After 1924, the loss of political prestige which resulted from the administrative declassification of the city (Tashkent became the capital of Uzbekistan in 1937 only) was largely compensated during all the Soviet period by the reinforcement of its influence — through its universities and research centres as well as through its economic role — notably after the relocations from the European regions of the USSR during the Second World War. However this regional hegemony was discussed even before the dissolution of the USSR, when the city began to lose its central functions at the pan-Soviet scale. Tashkent nevertheless keeps, according to the author, numerous assets for preserving in the twenty-first century a prominent role in the regional organisation of Central Asia, beginning with its situation in the centre of the main market of the region, and its accessibility through earth or sky routes — at a moment when its main rival, Almaty, has been replaced as the capital of Kazakhstan by Aqmolla (Astana), a city of secondary significance, with a peripheral position on the map of Central Asia. S.A.D.

- CURTIS, Glenn E., ed., *Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan: Country Studies*, Washington, DC: Library of Congress, Federal Research Division, 1997 (Area Handbook Series; DA Pam, 550-114), LXI-590 p., ill., maps, appendixes.

This thick volume gives an overall introduction to each of the five Central Asian states, by one or several internationally recognized specialists (Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan by Martha Brill OLCOTT, pp. 1-98 and 99-193; Tajikistan by Murial ATKIN, pp. 195-290; Turkmenistan by Larry CLARK, Michael THURMAN and David TYSON, pp. 291-374; Uzbekistan by Nancy LUBIN, pp. 375-468). Each notice is divided into an equal number of sections: history, physical geography, demography, society, religion, education,

health, economy, transports, political institutions, foreign policy and national security. Appendixes offer 23 tables of comparative statistics between the countries. The whole work provides a rather complete and easy to use introduction to the current economics and politics of Central Asian countries. S.A.D.

■ GHOIBOV, Gholib, *Ta'rikhi Hisori Shodmon, Chaghoniion va Dushanbe (Ta'rikhi siiosī va jughrofiiōi ta'rikhii Vodii Hisor az asri VIII to soli 1921)* [A History of Merry Hissar, the Chaghaniyan and Dushanbe (A Political History and Historical Geography of the Hissar Valley from the Eighth Century to 1921)], Dushanbe: "Amri ilm," 1999, 225 p., several indexes, ill.

The author of a monograph on the history of the city of Kulab in the sixteenth century, and of studies on some Islamic sanctuaries of the Khatlan region in southern Tajikistan (see in this volume the chapters on history and on studies on religions), Gh.Gh. proposes, on the basis of some chronicles, a work in historical geography of the central region of this country and a part of the Uzbekistani Surkhan-Darya region, around the citadel of Hissar, the Tajikistani capital Dushanbe and the city of Dehnau in Uzbekistan. The most significant chapter has been devoted to the Manghit period (mid-eighteenth century - 1920), which is studied according to the author's usual method — a specific textual document serving to the documentation of a specific event: the *Tuhfa-yi khānī* by Muhammad-Wafā Karminagī, the *Zafar-nāma* by Mullā Rajab Parī Hisārī or poetical works by Fārigh, with a special attention for the inner rivalries between the *begs* of Hissar, Kulab and the Darwaz in the nineteenth century. A small final part brings some elements to the history and historical geography of Dushanbe (with two chapters, written on the basis of Russian statistics, on this city's promotion to the status of the centre of the Hissar Valley, and on Dushanbe's and its rural satellites' geographical situation in the early twentieth century, pp. 170-176). The rich documentary resources used by the author do not prevent him from developing a teleological interpretation of history (with numerous lexicographical anachronisms), the main theme of which is made of the recurrent theme of a struggle of the populations of present-day central Tajikistan for their "independence," notably against the incursions by Muhammad-Rahīm Khān of Kokand (pp. 97-123). S.A.D.

■ GOURGUECHON, Jacques, *Voyage au Pamir*, Paris: Flammarion, 1998 (Gulliver), 376 p., map.

In spite of the author's lack of familiarity with the Pamirian cultures that he is being evoking in his book, and of his tendency to consider himself the first explorer of the regions he discovers, the reader can retain from this account on a travel made after the Tajikistani civil war some notes scribbled during a short stay in Khorog, in Higher Badakhshan, and a still shorter piece of text on the Kyrgyz highlands around Murghab. S.A.D.

■ GUBAEVA, Stella Sitdikovna, *Naselenie Ferganskoi doliny v kontse XIX — nachale XX v.*

(*Etnokul'turnye protsessy*) [The Population of the Ferghana Valley in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries (Ethno-Cultural Processes)], Tashkent: Fan, 1991, 130 p.

Alas, no map has been attached with this excellent work on the complicated demographic and ethno-cultural phenomena that have taken place in the Ferghana Valley during the colonial period (1876-1917). The author first reconstructs the population movements between the Ferghana and neighbouring regions, from the early nineteenth century to the industrial growth of the 1890s to 1910s. She then surveys community-building phenomena observed among the best documented ethnic groups of the Valley: Uzbeks, Tajiks and Kyrgyz, throughout this period. Although S.G. concludes, like more than a Soviet ethnographer before her, that each of these virtual "nations" had reached a high level of crystallisation in the early twentieth century — *i.e.*, well before the creation of the Soviet national republics from 1924 onwards —, she analyses multiple processes of inter-penetration between these three important groups. S.G. insists for instance on the local Tajiks and settled Uzbeks' coming together, whence the former used to refuse alliance with migrant Tajiks who used to come from southern Qarategin mountains; these migrants were commonly despised by autochthonous communities, whether Persian- or Turkic-speaking, because of their different dialect and their weak professional capabilities. A final chapter is devoted to the main non-native minorities of the region: Jews, Russians, and Tatars, whose history is studied from the viewpoint of their respective relations — or lack of relations — with dominating ethnic groups.

S.A.D.

● JANTZEN, Hermann, *Im wilden Turkestan: ein Leben unter Moslems*, ed. and intro. Christian Schmidt, Giessen: Brunnen Verlag, 1992, 300 p.

This book is the re-edition, in pocket format, of an early twentieth-century travelogue by H. Jantzen (1866-1959), a Mennonite missionary to Turkestan.

R.

■ LEWIS, Robert A., ed., *Geographic Perspectives on Soviet Central Asia*, maps by Robert R. CHURCHILL & Amanda TATE, London: Routledge, 1992, xv-323 p., maps.

This collection of papers is devoted to the impact of geography on politics in still Soviet Central Asia. The work has been organised around two mutually linked themes: 1) the local integration and 2) the perspectives for emigration of Central Asian Turkic-speaking Muslim populations to other regions of the USSR. The effects of the modernisation of local societies and the resulting change for demography and environment are stressed through a regional introduction based on the historical experience of colonialism in Central Asia. To be noticed: a paper by Lee SCHWARTZ on the geopolitics of Soviet Central Asia; the author's approach to the imbalances between regions, to localism and tendencies of institutional integration — opposed by strong tendencies to disintegration, in the context of an overall growth of nationalisms — is very useful for an overall understanding of the current phenomena.

C.P.

■ MĪR BĀBĀ, 'Abd-Allāh, *Khūjand-nāma. Majalla-yi maqālāt-i mutanawwi'* [The Book of

Khujand. Collected Papers on Various Subjects], Dushanbe: Mirāth, 1994, 117 p.

Written in a spirit of traditional erudition, this series of short texts of local history on the city of Khujand (north of Tajikistan) offers data on topics as various as the etymology of the name *Khūjand*, the localization of some of the city's main *mazārs*, the history of Khujand's *kārīz* (canals of subterranean irrigation), etc.: an important manifestation of traditional local history as it has been reactivated in Central Asia since the end of the Soviet period. S.A.D.

■ RAUNIG, Walter, "Problems of Settlement of the Eastern Wakhan Valley and the Discoveries Made There in 1975," in Karl Reinhold Haellquist, ed., *Asian Trade Routes, Continental and Maritime*, London: Curzon Press, 1991 (Studies on Asian Topics, Scandinavian Institute of Asian Studies, 13): 69-77.

Several ruined sites have been discovered in 1975 by an Egyptian archaeological mission on the terraces of the Eastern Wakhan Valley (Afghan Badakhshan). The valley is peopled by Wakhis, who are hardly classifiable as Tajiks, since their language constitutes a linguistic group of its own, and is limited to the sole Wakhan Valley. The Wakhis are a sedentary people; their economy is based on irrigated agriculture and breeding. Of the two main ruins ensembles, one (on the northern terrace) contains four complexes and the other (southern terrace) fifteen complexes. Other ruins also discovered in the same region are probably ancient strongholds (of the period of the Tibetan occupation?), but have not been visited by the author. The complexes of the northern terrace are residence buildings surrounded by their former fields and irrigation ditches, among which one obviously goes from the Pamir Valley to the Wakhan. The best preserved mansion (dimensions: 20m x 12m) contains in its present state nine chambers and one tower; the main gate opens onto the East. The ruins of the southern terrace are of the same type, but visibly one of the houses was fortified. The results of the analyses of the materials discovered by the expedition (to be noticed, however: these results are less sure as far as the southern terrace is concerned) allow us to date the period of prosperity of these villages from the fourteenth to the seventeenth century (foundation and reparation of ditches), but they could belong to a more remote past. Houses have been abandoned during the nineteenth century, probably because of deteriorations in the irrigation system and of a decline of the agricultural production. The very long history of human presence in the Wakhan Valley is confirmed by discoveries of the Neolithic period.

Among the other papers of the present volume, let's notice that by Walter RAUNIG, "Some Aspects of Trade in Badakhshan (Afghanistan) between 1880-1920," 61-68. The first part of this short paper summarizes the history of trade in Badakhshan since ancient times. The second part is devoted to commercial activities and trade routes in the nineteenth-twentieth centuries, whether international (leading traditionally through the Hindu-Kush towards Central Asia, China and Russia) or local (see the role of traveling traders). The important evolution of recent years is linked with the adoption of modern transportation facilities, even if transportation by animals has not been totally aban-

doned.

M.S.

- SUZI, Avo, *Vartang*, Dushanbe: Irfon, 1991, 240 p.

This book contains the diary of numerous travels to the North-Western Pamir (between 1979 and 1989) by a Latvian engineer in hydrology interested in the mores of the populations he used to meet with. A.S. had already authored the account of an expedition in Mast-Chah (*Mascho v raznykh izmereniakh* [Mast-Chah in Its Varied Dimensions], Dushanbe: Adib, 1989).

S.A.D.

- TUQLIEV, Nurislom, ed., *Toshkent. Entsiklopediia* [Tashkent: An Encyclopedia], Tashkent: Qomuslar Bosh Tahririati, 1992, 495 p.

This encyclopedia of Tashkent is by far not simply the Uzbek translation of the Russian edition of 1983: it offers a great amount of new notices on figures of local history, streets, monuments, factories, cemeteries, etc. of the present-day capital of Uzbekistan.

S.A.D.

## 2.5 Eastern Central Asia (Xinjiang)

- WENG, Weiquan, *Bazaars of Chinese Turkestan: Trading Life along the Old Silk Road*, Hong Kong – Oxford – New York: Oxford University Press, 1997, 144 p., ill. mainly col., maps.

This photographic album offers a wide presentation of everyday life on the bazaars of Kashghar. The introduction offers general and consensual considerations over the history and human geography of the Xinjiang.

R.



### 3. Modern and Contemporary History

#### 3.1 General Works

■ AGADZHANOV, S. G., TREPAVLOV, V. V., *Natsional'nye okrainy Rossiiskoi imperii: stanovlenie i razvitie sistemy upravleniia* [The National Confines of the Russian Empire: Creation and Development of the Administration System], Moscow: Slavianskii dialog, 1998 (Institut Rossiiskoi Istorii RAN), 416 p., bibliography.

On the basis of a rich archive material, this important monograph deals with the administrative practice of the Czarist regime in varied peripheries of the Russian Empire, notably in Siberia (pp. 58-117), the Caucasus (pp. 245-322) and Central Asia (pp. 323-350), between the beginning of the Russian expansion towards the East and the South in the 16th century and the early 20th century. In spite of the great attention given to the successive reforms and regional adaptations of the administrative policy of the empire in these various areas, one may perhaps deplore the author's lack of interest in the interaction between the Russian authorities and the vernacular populations — a question which lies at the core of a majority of recent works on the history of colonization, which has enjoyed a deep renewal during the past decade. S.A.D.

■ AGHASSIAN, Michel, KÉVONIAN, Kéram, "The Armenian Merchant Network: Overall Autonomy and Local Integration," in Shushil Chaudhury & Michel Morineau, eds., *Merchants, Companies and Trade: Europe and Asia in the Early Modern Era*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press – Paris: Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, 1999: 74-94.

Another contribution to the growing literature on the role of the Armenians in early modern commerce, this article transcribes a commercial document in the Armenian archives of All Saviour's Monastery in New Julfa, dating from 1729, and uses its contents to discuss the characteristics and the reasons for the success of the Armenian business community throughout Asia. The authors also provide some information on the complex accounting system used by Armenian merchants. R.M.

■ BRICE, W. C., "Sikkat al-ḥadīd," *EF* 9, 1995: 600-603, 1 map, bibliography.

This notice on the history of railway in the world of Islam contains some paragraphs on the strategic lines developed by the Russian Empire, for logistic support to the conquest and colonization of Central Asia, towards Herat in Afghanistan. The article casts light on the colonial logics which have prevailed in the initial development of national networks during the twentieth century. S.A.D.

● EGAMI, Namio, ed., *Chūō Ajia shi* [A History of Central Asia], Tokyo: Yamakawa Shuppansha, 1987 (Sekai kakkokushi: 16), xvi-696-82 p., 1 p. of pl., ill., maps.

This is a long-awaited general history of Central Asia that includes Western and Eastern Turkestan as well as Tibet. Most of the chapters reflect Japanese state of arts in Central Asian studies in 1970s except for the first part, "Ethnic and Historical Settings of

Central Asia and Cultural Exchange" prepared by the editor (pp.1-316). This comprehensive history is distinguished by its voluminous first part and the detailed description of the history of Eastern Turkestan. After the emergence of new independent states in Central Asia this was followed by a totally new edition, Komatsu Hisao, ed., *Chūō Yūrashia Shi* [A History of Central Eurasia], Tokyo: Yamakawa Shuppansha, 2000 (Shinban Sekai Kakkokushi: 4), vi-456-94 p., 4 p. of pl., ill., maps, chronological and genealogical tables. This edition covers Central Asia, Tibet and Mongolia, and focuses on the modern history of this vast area. Attached genealogical tables of the Chingisids illustrate a great tradition of Central Eurasia. R.

- FRYE, Richard N., "Central Asian Concepts of Rule on the Steppe and Sown," in Gary Seaman, ed., *Ecology and Empire: Nomads in the Cultural Evolution of the Old World, Proceedings of the Soviet-American Academic Symposia in Conjunction with the Museum Exhibition "Nomads, Masters of the Eurasian Steppe,"* 1, Los Angeles: Ethnographic Press, 1989: 135-140.

The author of this brief essay, meant "to stimulate interest and research into the many problems of the history of Central Asia," muses on the differences between concepts of rule between the nomadic "states" of Central Asia and the sedentary bureaucratic empires of China and Iran. The most significant of these is seen in the presence of an organized "state" religion versus a choice of beliefs, as well as in the different ways in which leaders emerge in either system, embodied in the different concepts of charisma, centering around either the person or the institution of kinship. R.M.

- GROSS, Jo-Ann, ed., *Muslims in Central Asia: Expressions of Identity and Change*, Durham: Duke University Press, 1992, xii-224 p., ill., glossary, bibliography, index.

In her general introductory chapter, the editor surveys the contributions to this volume in the light of the ethnological methods of analysis of the modes of identity building. She first stresses the interest of Situationist conceptions (F. Barth) for the study of the interactions between nomadic and sedentary populations in frontier regions (about the paper by Isenbike TOGAN, "Islam in a Changing Society: the Khojas of Eastern Turkestan," 134-148 [see the review in this volume], and by Beatrice Forbes MANZ on the ethnogenesis of a Chaghatay identity: "The Development and Meaning of Chaghatay Identity," 27-45 [see the review in this volume]). The editor then refers herself to the works by Ch. Keyes, who favours the analysis of the historical context of ethnogeneses, and their manipulations by societies, for her appreciation of the studies by Walter FELDMANN on Turkmen oral tradition as a vector of community ideal ("Interpreting the Poetry of Mäkh tumquly," 167-189) and of Muriel ATKIN on the failure of the creation of a Tadjik identity by the Tajikistani national intelligentsia [see the review in this volume]. Pierre Bourdieu's "theory of practice," as developed by C. Bentley, shows productive in the case of Central Asia, a region characterized by an extreme cultural fragmentation, since this theory allows a reconstruction of the multiple micro-processes through which are shaped the communities of interest and of sen-

timent. In this line Beatrice Forbes MANZ (mentioned paper), Hamid ALGAR ("Shaykh Zaynullah Rasulev: the Last Great Naqshbandi Shaykh of the Volga-Urals Region," 112-133 [see the review in this volume]), Edward J. LAZZERINI ("Beyond Renewal: Jadid Response to Pressure for Change in the Modern Age," 151-166 [see the review in this volume]) and Christopher MURPHY ("Abdullah Qadiri and the Bolsheviks: from Reform to Revolution," 190-202 [see the review in this volume]) have, to various extents, shown the centrality of the notion of *habitus* in the permanent ethnogenesis of the Muslim communities in Inner Asia, in medieval as well as in modern times. Still remained to be studied the distinct impact of national ideologies and of modern states on identity buildings, as well as the influence of contemporary nationalist discourses on the modes of community organization (two studies sketched by Muriel Atkin for Tajikistan and by Olivier Roy for Afghanistan [see the review in this volume]).

S.A.D.

- ILGAR, İhsan, ed. and transl., *Rusya'da Birinci Müslüman Kongresi Tutanakları* [The Proceedings of the First Muslim Congress in Russia], Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı (Kültür Eserleri Dizisi: 119), 1990, xxxviii-518 p.

This is the Turkish translation of the proceedings of the first Muslim Congress held in Moscow in May 1917 with two introductions prepared by N. Devlet and the editor. Since the original publication, *Butun Rusya Muslumanlarining 1917nchi yilda 1-11 Mayda Maskavda bolghan 'umumi isiyezdining prutaqullari*, Butun Rusya Muslumanlari Shurasi "Bashqaruchi Kamiteti" ning nashri (Petrograd: Amanet Shirketi Matbaasi, 1917) is very rare, this Turkish edition is useful for any researcher who is interested in this historical congress. There are a few editorial errors, for example in p. 206 an original sentence is lacking in the beginning of the second paragraph.

K.H.

- IUKHT, A. I., *Torgovlia s vostochnymi stranami i vnutrennii rynok Rossii (20-60-e gody XVIII veka)* [Trade with Eastern Countries and the Inner Market of Russia (1720s-1760s)], Moscow, 1994.

After publishing a great many articles on various aspects of 18th century commercial relations and merchants involving Iran, the Caucasus and Central Asia, the author has collected much of his long-term research in a synthetic study on trade between Russia and the northern tier of the Islamic world in the first half of the 18th century. About one half of the book is devoted to the relations with the Ottoman state and the Central Asian khanates; Iran is the focus of the other half. The chapters on Iran, which contain a wealth of information about the type and volume of commodities carried to and from Iran via the Caucasus and Russia, as well as on the merchants engaged in the exchange, are especially important in suggesting that, periods of disruption following the fall of the Safavids notwithstanding, the northern trade continued and actually flourished several times in the 1730s and 1740s.

R.M.

● KAPPELER, Andreas, *The Russian Empire: A Multiethnic History*, translated from the German by A. Clayton, London – New York, et al.: Pearson Education, 2001 (first published in German: *Rußland als Vielvölkerreich: Entstehung, Geschichte, Zerfall*, Munich, 1992).

The present monograph was one of the first comprehensive historical analyses of the multi-ethnic Russian Empire. Although a number of books and articles about the Russian Empire have been published from the mid-1980s, most of them have been written from the viewpoint of Russian national history, or about particular periods or regions. This work's characteristic is that the author has been dealing with all the regions of the Russian Empire and the USSR during more than four centuries. The book explains the integral processes of each ethnic or national group, and makes clear the complex set of relations between Central Eurasian non-Russian societies and the Russian Empire and society as a whole. From this point of view, this work usefully undermines the concept of the 'prison of peoples,' and calls for reexaminations in the field of interrelations between the center and its peripheries.

Chapters 1 to 4 are assigned to the period until the beginning of the nineteenth century. After the analysis of the eastward expansion of the sixteenth — eighteenth centuries ("the gathering of the lands of the Golden Horde") and the westward expansion of the seventeenth — nineteenth centuries, the author concludes that varied ethnic groups cannot be assigned unequivocally to specific classes; contrary to what had long been assumed by a number of authors, he shows that "ethnic and religious criteria were not of decisive importance for the social structure of pre-modern Russia" (p.124). The tradition of tolerance and of pragmatic relationships with those who belonged to non-Orthodox religious affiliations had been established as soon as during the period of the Golden Horde (p.160), and the tolerant and pragmatic policies were then strengthened by resistances of non-Russians. As to the imperial elite, it consisted of people coming from many different ethnic groups, whence the lower strata of non-Russian communities remained for long non-Russified.

Chapters 5 to 8 discuss the period from the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The author asserts that from the early nineteenth century onwards the manner of the government toward non-Russian peoples changed from traditional pragmatism to colonial approaches, because Eurocentric conceptions became common in Russia. Two new factors appeared in the nineteenth century: national movements, and modernization. Almost all of the ethnic groups in the Russian Empire have been affected by national movements, and the phenomenon began to undermine the multi-ethnic empire. Added to this, the need for modernization was more and more deeply felt, and for that social and political standardization was necessary. The author's opinion — that "the contrary tendencies towards greater homogeneity and diversity reinforced political and social tensions in the late Czarist multi-ethnic empire" (p. 319) — is persuasive.

In the 9th and 10th chapters, the author explains how the nationality issues and the revolution affected each other, and gives an outline of the history of the Soviet Union from the viewpoint of successive change in the nationality policy. He considers that even after the collapse of the Soviet Union, the multi-ethnic empire continues to exist

in a smaller size. He forecasts the future appearance of nostalgia in the Russian multi-ethnic empire, in spite of the popular memory of the Russian Empire as a 'prison of the peoples,' which has been largely diffused by school education during the Soviet period. H.M.

- LANDAU, Jacob M., *Pan-Turkism. From Irredentism to Cooperation*, Bloomington – Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1995, 275 p., bibliography, index.

Contrary to its title, the present monograph is in fact centred on Republican Turkey, not on the whole Turkic world. An introductory chapter is devoted indeed to the Turkic peoples of the Russian Empire ("The Outside Turks: The Rise and Fall of Pan-Turkism Abroad," 7-28). However one may ask oneself — since the author has had no access to any original document, even in Russian language — what this publication brings to those which have already appeared, on the same question, during the past half-century. The specialist of Central Eurasia will perhaps be tempted to focus on the final chapter devoted to the recent developments since the end of the Soviet period ("From Irredentism to Solidarity," 194-234). However this part also is centred on Turkey and deals only with the official, governmental level of the relations between Ankara and the new independent states of the Caucasus and Central Asia, with a total lack of interest in the rich informal field. By its methodology and its general vision of Panturkism as a "natural" characteristic of Turkey and of the Turkic-speaking regions of the former Soviet Union, the present work remains based on the essentialist postulates of Soviet nationality studies as they developed during the whole period of the cold war. (See also, by the same author: "Pan-Islamism," *ET* 8, 1995: 248-250, bibliography; *idem.*, "Pan-Turkism," *ibid.* 8, 1995: 250-252, bibliography.) S.A.D.

- ZARCONI, Thierry, ed., *Inde — Asie Centrale. Routes du commerce et des idées*, Aix-en-Provence: Édisud, 1996 (*Cahiers d'Asie centrale*: 1-2), 366 p.

The present collective volume makes of the first volume of the journal of the French Institute of Central Asian Research (IFEAC) created in Tashkent in 1994. This institute has developed, during its two first years of existence, an important publication activity. The journal, of a high and regular scientific content, is intended for both researchers and a cultivated audience (CHUVIN, Pierre "Les *Cahiers d'Asie centrale*: naissance d'une revue," 5). Perhaps may we regret a lack of interest in contemporary questions and the big room given to ancient periods and peripheral disciplines, with a particular significance of archaeology, history of art, and codicology.

The first paper of this first volume of the *Cahiers d'Asie centrale* is a study of the varied known manuscripts of the *Masīr-i Bukhārā* by Mīr 'Izzat-Allāh of Delhi (of which exists an English translation of 1872), as a source for the history of Bukhara as a commercial place of continental significance at the turn of the twentieth century, but also for the history of the Bukharan society in the beginning of the Manghit period (SZUPPE, Maria, "En quête de chevaux turkmènes. Le journal de voyage de Mīr 'Izzatullāh de Delhi à Boukhara en 1812-1813," 91-111, 1 map). This part of the vol-

ume devoted to merchants and craftsmen is closed with a synthetic article on the role of Kashmir as a transit market in the commercial exchanges between India and Central Asia (including Xinjiang): WARIKOO, K., "Trade Relations between Central Asia and Kashmir during the Doghra Period (1846-1947)," 113-124.

The question of mutual cultural influences between Central Asia and India is at the core of several studies devoted to religions and their faithful. A first contribution deals with the notion of cultural influence applied to the hypothesis of non-Muslim Indian influences on the mystical practices of Central Asian Naqshbandis (PAUL, Jürgen, "Influences indiennes sur la *naqshbandiyya* d'Asie centrale?," 203-217). The author criticizes the excessive tendency of historians of religions to induce influences from simple phenomenological comparisons. This problem of the Indian influence is dealt with through three questions: 1) vegetarianism and the role of animals; 2) celibacy and the question of marriage (two fields in which the idea of an Indian influence is either rejected, either non-established); 3) last the breathing techniques during mystical exercises (the only field in which an Indian influence is testified by sources). The short article which follows this one must be situated among previous works by this author on the growing politicization of the *turuq* in Central Asia, in particular of the Naqshbandiyya, since the endemic disorders which have characterized the end of the Timurid period in Mawarannahr (BABADŽANOV [BABADZHANOV, BABAZHANOV], Bakhtyar [Bakhtiyar], "Zahîr al-Dîn Muhammad Mîrzâ Bâbur et les *Shaykh Naqshbandi* de Transoxiane," 219-226). In this study the author analyses the close personal ties between, on the first hand, 'Umar Shaykh (d. 1494) and his son Bâbur, with on the other hand Khwāja Ahrār (d. 1490) and several of the latter's disciples in the Ferghana Valley or in Samarqand. The author insists notably on the overall conditions of extreme instability of the cities of the Ferghana Valley at the turn of the sixteenth century, and of the role as intermediaries played for example by Khwāja Mawlānā Qāzî between "les begs et les amirs avides de pouvoir," as an explanation of the growing political power of the *turuq* at the turn of the Timurid and Shaybanid periods.

The following study is a detailed paper on the history, in the long duration, of the Himalayan roads to India and of their traditional role as pilgrimage roads for the Muslims of Central Asia and even of European Russia (ZARCONE, Thierry, "Une route de sainteté islamique entre l'Asie centrale et l'Inde: la voie Ush-Kashghar-Srinagar," 227-252, 1 map, 3 ill.). The most part of this paper is devoted to the study of place names (through the terms *mazār*, *gunbaz*, *ribāt* and *langar*) and the information that they contain for the localisation of Islamic sanctuaries on the Ferghana Valley — Altishahr — Kashmir itinerary of the *hajj*. The author has been interested, in particular, in the conversion of the Tibetans of Ladakh. In a study published out of the thematic file ("Soufis d'Asie centrale au Tibet, aux *xvi*<sup>e</sup> et *xvii*<sup>e</sup> siècles," 325-344), the same author deals with more details with the role of Naqshbandi missionaries from Kashghar in the contacts with Tibet. A short chapter of this study, based on the *Ta'rikh-i rashīdī* of Mîrzâ Muhammad Haydar, is devoted to the role played by a disciple of Khwāja Ahrār's in the holy war undertaken in the early 1530s against Tibet by Sa'īd

Khān, one of the last Shaybanid khans of Kashghar.

Another chapter, more detailed, studies the diplomatic relations established one century and a half later by the Naqshbandi *shaykh* Āfāq Khwāja, the leader of one of the two main political factions of Kashghar, with the Dalai Lama, in the goal of obtaining the military support of the Buddhist Oirats. However this account would not be complete without a mention of a gripping study of a letter sent in 1828 to the Emir of Bukhara by Sayyid Ahmad Barelwī (1786-1831), a reformist Sufi and the military leader of a holy war against the Sikhs (GABORIEAU, Marc, "L'Asie Centrale dans l'horizon de l'Inde au début du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle à propos d'une lettre de Sayyid Ahmad Barelwī à l'émir de Boukhara," 265-282, 1 map, bibliography). The author analyses the representation of Mawarannahr as a citadel of Islam, protected by a founding holy figure of the Naqshbandi path, and ruled by an emir concerned about the implementation of the Sharia. The author shows how Sayyid Ahmad hesitates between an acute consciousness of the deep transformations brought about by the British domination in India, and a fundamentalist utopia which brings him to see in Bukhara (or at least to present it in his official correspondence) as an ideal recourse in the jihad led by the Muslims of India.

The other papers of the volume are: BURTON, Audrey, "Itinéraires commerciaux et militaires entre Boukhara et l'Inde," 13-32, 2 maps; RAPIN, Claude, "Relations entre l'Asie Centrale et l'Inde à l'époque hellénistique," 35-45, 2 fig.; MEHENDALE, Sanjyot, "Begram: along Ancient Central Asian and Indian Trade Routes," 47-64, 4 ill., bibliography; GRENET, Frantz, "Les marchands sogdiens dans les mers du Sud à l'époque préislamique," 65-84, 9 ill., bibliography; MUKMINOVA, Razia G., "Les routes caravanières entre villes de l'Inde et de l'Asie Centrale: déplacements des artisans et circulation des articles artisanaux," 85-90; PUGAČENKOVA, Galina A., "La genèse centre-asiatique des minarets indiens," 127-132, [2] ill.; KERVRAN, Monique, "Entre l'Inde et l'Asie Centrale: les mausolées islamiques du Sind et du sud Pendjab," 133-172, 41 ill. and fig., bibliography; DZUMAEV, Aleksandr, "Migrations des musiciens des villes de Transoxiane et développement de la science musicale en Inde (XVI<sup>e</sup>-XVII<sup>e</sup> siècles)," 173-182; FILANOVIĆ, Margarita I., USMANOVA, Zamira I., "Les frontières occidentales de la diffusion du bouddhisme en Asie centrale," 185-202, 4 ill., bibliography; KOČNEV, Boris, "Les Moghols et l'Asie Centrale, à travers les monnaies de Shāh Jahān figurant dans les trésors centre-asiatiques," 257-263; BOQUERAT, Gilles, "Du bond en avant au retour en arrière: évolution de la perception indienne de l'Asie Centrale au cours du XX<sup>e</sup> siècle," 283-295.

S.A.D.

## 3.2 The Crimea, the Volga–Urals Region, Siberia

### 3.2.A General Works

- AKHMEROV, Gainetdin, *Izbrannye trudy* [Selected Works], ed. Rif Khairutdinov, Kazan:



Tatarskoe knizhnoe izdatel'stvo, 1998, 240 p., 3 photos., bibliography.

During his life (1864-1911), the Tatar scholar Gainetdin Akhmerov produced a number of important historical and ethnographic works on the Muslim communities of the Volga-Ural region. Akhmerov is of particular interest as a transitional figure among Tatar historians. On the one hand, he appeared widely in the Russian journals of his day, publishing numerous scholarly articles in Russian in the well-known *Izvestiia Obshchestva arkhologii, istorii, i etnografii* of Kazan University. On the other hand, the bulk of his writing was works in Tatar, intended for a Muslim readership, and based on essentially traditional and native historical and historiographical conceptions.

This work, ably edited and introduced by R. Khairutdinov, contains all of Akhmerov's historical and ethnographic works, including Russian translations of his Tatar works. These include his "History of Bulghar" (Bulghār Ta'rīkhī), originally published in Kazan in 1909, and his "History of Kazan" (Qāzān Ta'rīkhī), published in Kazan in 1910. In these works, especially in the history of Bulghar, Akhmerov demonstrates the deep meaning Bulghar identity had for Volga-Ural Muslims even at the beginning of the 20th century. Akhmerov firmly identifies Volga-Ural Muslims as the descendants of the Bulgars, and offers as evidence the fact that Bulghar shrines were important pilgrimage sites for the Volga-Ural Muslims of his day. His history of Bulghar also was the main source for 'Ārif-Allāh Chuqurī's manuscript history of Bulghar. Akhmerov's "History of Kazan" is essentially a political and ethnic history of the Kazan Khanate. Akhmerov uses local Turkic legends and manuscripts, but also Russian sources, especially the chronicles and other published materials.

The collection also includes three major articles published in the *Izvestiia Obshchestva arkhologii, istorii, i etnografii* between 1903 and 1908. These include "On the Language and Ethnicity [*narodnost'*] of the Mishars," "Teptiars and Their Origins," and "The Wedding Rites of the Kazan Tatars." The last part of the collection contains numerous minor notices and short articles that appeared in the same journal. These include notices on numerous archaeological expeditions Akhmerov participated in, but are rich in local lore relating to the archaeological sites. Among Akhmerov's works excluded from the collection are numerous Arabic and Turkic school primers published in Kazan between 1909 and 1912. A.J.F.

■ GOLDEN, P. B., "Tatar," *EI*<sup>2</sup> 10/169-170, 1999: 387-398, bibliography.

It is a restricted definition of the ethnic denomination "Tatar" (Tātār) which is given here, since it takes into account only the Mongol tribal group which first bore this name, up till Genghis-Khan's access to power, with no interest in the complex history of this term, applied since the thirteenth century to Turkic-speaking populations of Crimea, the Volga and Urals region and Siberia. See also by the same author: "Teptyar," *ibid.* 447, bibliography (a short but well documented presentation of the social group of Turkic and Finno-Ugric origin among the "service people" [< Persian *daftar*] in the Middle Volga, and of the evolution of this group into an ethnic group between the sixteenth and the early twentieth century; the French translation of this



paper suffers from mistakes in place names).

S.A.D.

■ ISKHAKOV, Damir [IS'HAQOV, Dämir], *Ot srednevekovykh tatar k tataram novogo vremeni (Etnologicheskii vzgliad na istoriiu volgo-uralskikh tatar XV-XVII vv.)* [From the Tatars of Middle Ages to the Tatars of Modern Times (An Anthropological View of the History of the Volga-Urals Tatars in the 15th–17th Centuries)], Kazan: Izdatel'stvo "Master Lain," 1998 (Institut istorii AN Tatarstana, Seriiia "Etnopoliticheskaia istoriia tatar"), 276 p., bibliography.

In his book, the Kazan ethnographer D. Is'haqov examines Tatar ethnic history in the 15th and 16th centuries, a time which he considers to be a key transitional period in Tatar ethnic history. The author argues that it was in this period, when the Tatar population as a whole came under the rule of unified Russian state, that a unified Tatar identity emerged. He employs a broad range of sources, including both Russian archival documents and Turkic genealogical materials. The work is divided into two sections. The first section examines the administrative structure of the Kazan khanate and the "ethno-estate" (*etno-soslovnaia*) structure in the Kazan khanate and under Russian rule through the 17th century. Here Is'haqov examines the feudal groupings in the Kazan khanate and their transformation under Russian rule into estates. In the second part of the work the author examines peripheral groups, outside of the central lands of the Kazan khanate. Specifically, these include the Mishars of the "Meshchera Iurt" and Turkic communities of the trans-Kama region and Perm' province. He argues that by the 17th century these disparate communities had begun to "crystallize" into the "Volga Tatar" ethnic group (*etnos*), resulting in the transformation from the older estate oriented identities.

A.J.F.

### 3.2.B The Czarist Period

■ ABDUSHII, Hasan Ato, *Turkii qavmlar tarikhi* [History of the Turkic Tribes], ed. Poion Ravshan, Tashkent: Chulpon nashrioti, 1995, 240 p., glossary.

Formerly suppressed pan-Turkic historiography produced in Russia in the first decade of the 20th century evidently maintains its relevance for historians in independent Uzbekistan. A case in point is a work by the Tatar historian Häsängata Gabäshi (1863-1936), which was first published in Kazan in 1907, and republished in Ufa two years later, under the title *Mukhtasar-i ta'rikh-i qawm-i turkî*. The present work is an edition of the complete work, translated from the Arabic script Turki into Cyrillic script Uzbek, and including a glossary of older terms. The published version was to be the first part of a two-part history. However, the second part was never published, although a manuscript outline survives in Kazan University Library.

Gabäshi's history is to a large degree a transitional work, combining both a traditional structure as an ethnic genealogy of the Turkic peoples, but as a result, retaining a primary emphasis on ethnicity and nationality, that distinguished his work at that time from those of other Muslim historians in imperial Russia. Similarly, his "secular" Pan-

Turkic, or rather Pan-Turanian focus is likely what endears him to Uzbek, and other historians in the former Soviet republics, and in the Turkic republics of the Russian Federation, where official condemnation of "Islamic Fundamentalism" has complicated, and stunted, scholarly evaluations and discussions of Islam. At the same time, this sort of secularized and nationalist historical thinking, albeit in a Soviet incarnation, formed the basis for the methodological training of Central Asian historians in the Soviet era, and as a result, the argumentation of early nationalists, such as Gabāshi, is readily accessible and understandable to "postSoviet" scholars in Uzbekistan and elsewhere in Central Asia.

Gabāshi's history, however, begins in classic Islamic fashion as a genealogy of the Turkic peoples that originates, logically enough, from the prophet Adam, tracing the origins of various ancient peoples, including the ancestors of the Turks, the Arians. He classes the Turks as "Turanians," together with Inner Asian peoples as a whole, as well as the Chinese and Japanese. As Turks, he classifies all of the ancient steppe peoples, Scythians, Sarmatians, Huns. He also discusses the various Turkic states that emerged in Inner Asia, such as the Avars, Bulgars, Oghuz and others. At the same time, the work is largely an overall survey of 20th-century Inner Asian Peoples, including Turkic groups, both in Central Asia, Siberia, and the Volga-Ural region, Mongol peoples, Manchu-Tungus peoples, and even the Chukchis.

We are fortunate that the editor, Poion Ravshan, has provided a translation of the complete work, although the book does lack a table of contents. A.J.F.

■ ALEKSEEV, V. V., dir., *Istoriia kazachestva aziatskoi Rossii* [History of the Cossacks in Asian Russia], vol. I – *xvi – pervaiia polovina XIX veka* [From the 16th to the First Half of the 19th Century], vol. II – *Vtoraia polovina XIX – nachalo XX veka* [From the Second Half of the 19th to the Early 20th Century], vol. III – *XX vek* [20th Century], Ekaterinburg: UrO RAN, 1995, 317+253+268 p., ill.

Gathering a rich group of historians of the Cossack phenomenon, the present monograph analyses in a very documented way the implication of Cossacks of the most varied affiliations in the Slavic colonization of several regions of "Asian Russia," including Central Asia and the Caucasus. The third volume, devoted to the evolution of the situation since the end of the Soviet period, brings interesting elements to our knowledge of the social and political role played by Cossack communities in present-day Kazakhstan and in the Northern Caucasus. S.A.D.

● BAUMANN, Robert F., "Subject Nationalities in the Military Service of Imperial Russia: The Case of the Bashkirs," *SR* 46/3-4 (1987): 489-502.

Scholars have focused little attention on the role of "national" units in the Russian army. A single case in the historiography of the Volga-Urals region, the present article is a historical inquiry into the imperial policy towards Bashkirs and their employment in the armed forces from the end of the 18th up to the beginning of the 20th century. A synthesis of published documents on the subject, this article draws a complete and use-

ful history of the relations between Russian officials and Bashkir soldiers. The establishment of universal military service on January 1874, and the prevailing nationality policy increased pressures for the disestablishment of irregular native units in regions securely under Russian control and for the full integration of *inorodtsy* into the regular army. This process is well-analysed through its social and economic background.

X.L.T.

■ DEVLET, Nadir, *1917 Ekim İhtilâli ve Türk-Tatar Millet Meclisi (İç Rusya ve Sibirya Müslüman Türk-Tatarlarının Millet Meclisi 1917-1919)* [The Revolution of October 1917 and the National Assembly of the Turk-Tatars (The National Assembly of the Muslim Turk-Tatars of European Russia and Siberia, 1917-1919)], Istanbul: Ötüken, 1998, 328 p.

The present monograph is devoted to the national movement led by the Turkic intelligentsias of the Volga-Urals region in the aftermath of the revolution of October 1917. The National Assembly (Millî Majlis) is introduced as the illustration of the will of the Tatars and Bashkirs of the Russian Empire to reach their goals through constitutional means. Although the work is richly documented, it shows a weakness, which is the author's will to make the wills and strategies of 1917 coincide with those which prevail today among the nationalist intellectual circles in Kazan and Ufa. This teleological vision of history remains unfortunately typical of the most part of the academic literature devoted, in Turkey and in varied Turkic diasporas, to early twentieth-century national movements in the Russian Empire [see in this volume the review by C.N. of Hakan Kırımlı's dissertation on the Crimean Tatars]. Such representations bring to a double phenomenon of projection of current realities towards the past, and analysis of current realities in the light of the events of the revolutionary period.

S.A.D.

■ ENIKEEV, Said murza kniaz', *Ocherk istorii tatarskogo dvorianstva* [Studies in the History of the Tatar Nobility], Ufa: Izdatel'stvo "Gilem," 1999 (Akademiiia nauk Respubliki Bashkortostan, Otdelenie gumanitarnykh nauk), 356 p., tab., photos., appendixes.

A synthesis work more than the result of research in primary sources, the present work offers an innovative survey of the history of the Muslim Turkic-speaking aristocracy in the Middle Volga region, from the Golden Horde to the current period. The study is focused on the Romanov period and, in particular, on the problem of the conversion to Orthodox Christianity of vernacular Muslim aristocracies.

S.A.D.

■ FAKHRUTDINOV, R. R., *Tatarskii liberalizm v kontse XIX — nachale XX veka (Ocherki politicheskoi istorii)* [Tatar Liberalism in the Late 19th — Early 20th Centuries (Studies in Political History)], Kazan: Izdatel'stvo "Magarif," 1998, 127 p., 4 tabs., appendixes.

This short synthesis deals rapidly with the economic and political background of the appearance of the political party Ittifāq al-muslimīn [Union of the Muslims], and focuses on the social composition of this party, on its ideology and on the tactics successively adopted by it between its creation in 1905 and its ban in 1918. In spite of the author's ambition, which consists in analyzing the political expression of a "liberal"

movement which appeared in the Muslim communities of the Russian Empire in the first years of the twentieth century, the work does not convince, because of the weakness of its documentary basis — which is made only of recent Russian translations of well known personal memories of a little amount of protagonists and observers, and of a limited number of programmes of the Muslim representation in the State Duma of Russia. The author has completely neglected over-abundant archive sources, to say nothing of the rich "Muslim" press of the years 1906 to 1918. The result is a work which pretends to define a "liberal" movement totally abstracted from its social and political context, through the study of a very limited proportion of the now available primary documentation. Moreover, one should discuss the postulate of a focalization of such historical studies on Muslim liberalism on the "Tatars," which is characteristic of history writing in the Middle Volga region, whence this subject should incite researchers to enlarge their study to the whole Muslim communities of the Russian Empire. Last but not least, one should have wished more caution in the use of the term and notion of "liberalism" (whether "Muslim" or "Tatar"), which is borrowed from the current historiography of early twentieth-century centre-right Russian political parties, and which has met a considerable fortune for some years in the study of reform and modernization movements in the Muslim communities of the Russian Empire.

S.A.D.

■ FRANK, Allen J., *Islamic Historiography and 'Bulghar' Identity among the Tatars and Bashkirs of Russia*, Leiden – Boston – Köln: Brill, 1998 (Social, Economic and Political Studies of the Middle East and Asia: 61), x-232 p., bibliography, index.

Allen Frank's superb inquiry into 19th century Islamic historiography of the Volga–Urals region presents not merely the meritorious rediscovery of an almost totally neglected corpus of sources, but delivers a profound and imaginative insight into the construction and dissemination of communal identities among the Muslim minorities of Inner Russia. Frank's approach to the 19th century sources is philological above all. Two introductory chapters briefly but convincingly survey the history of regional historiography prior to the 19th century and provide a socio-historical analysis of the changing role of the 'ulamā after the Russian conquest. Their at least partial acceptance of and accommodation to foreign rule is one of the keys to Frank's interpretation of the popular throughout the 19th century regional historiography. The author argues that a "Bulghar" identity, promulgated by the learned men, provided the local Muslim communities with a meaningful interpretation of their contemporary status under non-Islamic rule, and that this message lost its intelligibility when the 'ulamā became marginalized by a Western and secular Muslim *intelligentsiia*.

Frank's most important source is the early 19th-century *Tawārīkh-i bulghāriyya*, a compilation of miscellaneous information grouped around a legend about the conversion of Bulgars by companions of the Prophet and a genealogical lineage of saints and rulers that connected the author and the local Muslim communities to this sacred past. Moreover the *Tawārīkh* provides a fantastic narrative of Timur's campaigns against the

allegedly un-Islamic behaviours of rulers and populations of Persia, Ottoman Turkey, the Bulghar state and Russia. Frank traces the legacy of this work not only in numerous copies and repeated reprints, but in various commentaries by subsequent generations of learned men. Scrupulously analysing the structure and content of these works, Frank's impressive insight and language abilities allow him to reconstruct common sources as well as to elucidate the different approaches of the *Tawārīkh* and the later commentaries to the central message, that can be summed as follows: The Muslims of the Volga-Urals region, actually united under the confessional administration of the Orenburg Spiritual Assembly, form a community by their common spiritual and genealogical bonds to a "sacred Bulghar." These spiritual bonds materialize in Islamic *lieux de mémoire* like the tombs of saints, but also in villages bearing their names. Thus historical and religious bonds transcend the ethnic distinctions of the geographically dispersed local communities, and they distinguish them vis-à-vis other Muslim communities within the umma, as sure as they oppose the faithful to their non-Muslim neighbours.

Frank's analysis of early 19th-century Bashkir genealogies and their intended reconciliation of "Bulghar" historical legacy with ethnic and tribal Bashkir traditions are of peculiar interest, as they perfectly illustrate the complicated interplay of different layers of communal identity, typical for the "pre-modern" (broadly speaking) Inner Asian context. Small wonder that Frank's challenge of the established Soviet and post-Soviet Tatar and Bashkir national historiography, simplifying and projecting modern ethno-national identities into history, has already evoked blunt refutations. The displacement of confessional modes of identity by ethno-national conceptions of communal cohesion itself is subject to the final chapter of the study. Frank shows that during the 20th century "Tatarists" and "Bulgharists" both shared basically the same concept of nation — of being an immutable community that exists at least since the medieval period, if not from antiquity.

Outside the area, however, the conception of communal identity as an interplay of overlapping, changing and evolving layers has so far attracted little attention, too. As Frank correctly states, the bulk of Western studies on communal and national identity in the Volga-Urals depends on pre-revolutionary or Soviet nationalist writings. Frank's pioneering study (and Michael Kemper's recent inquiry into a broader regional Islamic discourse) will certainly inspire new approaches to the puzzling question of communal identity within the "Muslim" national movement(s) in the Russian Empire and in the first decades of the 20th century.

C.N.

■ GALIAUTDINOV, I [shmukhamet] G., *'Tarikh namai bulgar' Tadzhedina Ialsyugulova* [The 'Tārīkh-nāmayi Bulghār' of Tāj al-Dīn Yālcĥīgul], 2nd ed., Ufa: Kitap, 1998, 272 p., facsimile.

The first edition of this work appeared in Ufa in 1990, and at that time represented the first serious philological analysis of an influential Turkic literary work of the Volga-Urals region (the Tatar historian M.A. Usmanov first treated the *"Tārīkh-nāma-yi*

*Bulghār*" as a historical source in 1972). The first edition consisted of a general introduction to Turkic Islamic literature in the Southern Urals region, a discussion of the manuscript copies of the text, a detailed grammatical and philological analysis of the work, as well as a lexicon, glossary, and onomasticon taken from the various manuscripts. The final section of the work contained a Russian translation of the work, a Cyrillic script Bashkir transcription, and printed Arabic script text edition, and a rather illegible facsimile of one of the manuscripts. The second edition complements the first with more detailed study of the manuscripts, and more extensive notes on the various manuscripts and editions. The second edition also contains reprints of two articles, one a review of the first edition by Iskander Abdullin, and the other a philological study of one of the manuscripts by F.S. Faseev, published in Kazan in 1983. A.J.F.

- GLUKHOV, Maksim, *Tatarica — Entsiklopediia* [Tatarica — Encyclopaedia], Kazan: Izdatel'stvo "Vatan," 1997, 504 p., bibliography, English, French and German summaries.

This large Russian language work is devoted to the history of the Kriashens, that is, Eastern Orthodox Tatars who form a small, but historically and numerically constant community that, until their ascription by Soviet authorities to the "Tatar" nation, formed communities quite separate and distinct from the larger Muslim community. This book, by the Kriashen historian Maksim Glukhov, consists of two separate sections. The first section, entitled "Tatarica" (7-151), is essentially an elucidation of his 1993 work, *Sud'ba gvardeitsev Seiumbeki* [The Destiny of Suyumbike's Guards], and addresses the history of the Kriashens, whom Glukhov believes to have existed as a separate Turkic Christian community already during the time of the Golden Horde. Glukhov argues, on the basis of largely unconvincing linguistic evidence, that the Kriashens functioned as Cossacks, that is, as military servitors during the era of the Golden Horde and its successor states. He also offers the example of the Nagaibeks, Kriashen who did indeed serve as Cossacks of the Orenburg Cossack Host, under Russian rule. The work is especially interesting for providing examples of the ideas and assumptions underpinning much of post-Soviet historiography among the former ethnic minorities of the Soviet Union. Glukhov's approach is, to say the least, essentialist. He considers as his strongest evidence rather convoluted etymological connections between historical and existing peoples. He seeks to establish a place for the Kriashens, as Tatars, within the current Tatar historiography that establishes an equally nationalist and ethnically essentialist for the "Tatar nation" as a whole. To this end, as an adherent to the "Qipchaq/Tatar" theory of Tatar national origin, Glukhov devotes considerable space to attacking the positions of the Neo-Bulgharists. The second part of the work (152-490) is an encyclopaedia of Kriashen history. Here Glukhov deserves credit for being the first historian to attempt a synthesis of Kriashen history as a whole. Although much space is devoted to his historical theories set in the pre-Russian period, most of the entries are devoted to Kriashen history and ethnography during the Russian and Soviet eras. As such, it provides very important materials on Kriashen historical traditions, ethnography, settlements and personalities. In light of the traditionally poor documentation for

these communities, Glukhov's work is a significant contribution to a still embryonic topic. A.J.F.

- GOPAL, Surendra, *Indians in Russia in the 17th and 18th Centuries*, Calcutta: Naya Prokash, 1988, 322 p.

The 118 documents included in this book were taken from the two collections *Russko-indiiskie otnosheniia v XVII v.* and *Russko-indiiskie otnosheniia v XVIII v.*, eds. K.A. Antonova & N.M. Goldberg, published in Moscow in 1958 and 1965 respectively. Despite the title of both the original compilations and the current collection, these documents do not concern the activities of Indian merchants in Czarist Russia, but trace their movements along the routes between India and Russia traversing Central Asia and Iran. In fact, Indian merchants dealing with Russia for the most part either crossed the Caspian sea or travelled through the Caucasus to reach Astrakhan, which was their nodal point in Russian territory as well as the residence of an important Indian mercantile community. In Iran itself the Indians were represented in cities like Isfahan, Tabriz, Qazvin, and Rasht. In his selection from a total of 525 documents, translated into English with the assistance of K.A. Antonova, the editor let himself be guided by what he calls a desire to "give us an insight into the various facets of the life of Indians in Russia." For a comprehensive picture the scholars will therefore still have to turn to the original Russian compilation. Several appendices following the translated documents contain, among other things, lists of abbreviations, of rulers, and of the documents. R.M.

- IMAEVA, Larisa, "K voprosu ob istokakh musul'manskogo liberalizma v Rossii nachala XX veka v istochnikakh po ego izucheniiu (v sviazi s publikatsiei dokumentov musul'manskoi fraktsii Gosudarstvennoi dumy Rossii (1906-1917 gg.)) [The Question of the Origins of Muslim Liberalism in Early Twentieth-Century Russia, in the Sources for Its Study (in Relation with the Publication of Documents from the Muslim Fraction in the State Duma of Russia (1906-1917))]," in A.B. Iunusova & A.V. Malashenko, eds., *Etnichnost' i konfessional'naia traditsiia v Volgo-Ural'skom regione Rossii: Sbornik statei* [Ethnicity and the Confessional Tradition in Russia, in the Volga-Urals Region: Collected Papers], Moscow: Moskovskii tsentr Karnegi, 1998: 102-113.

While she introduces "Muslim reformism" as a pure analogy to Christian Reform (with reference to the works by the Soviet Islamologist Marietta Stepaniants), the author sketches a list of analogies between what she calls "Muslim liberalism" and the early twentieth-century Russian "liberalism." Her conclusion is a perfect similarity between the views and strategies of the party *Ittifāq al-muslimīn* and the KDs, between the revolution of 1905 and those of 1917. S.A.D.

- IMAEVA, L. A., ed., *Musul'manskie deputaty Gosudarstvennoi dumy Rossii, 1906-1917. Sbornik dokumentov i materialov* [The Muslim Representatives in the State Duma of Russia, 1906 to 1917. Collected Documents and Materials], Ufa: Kitap, 1998, 378 p., ill.

In spite of the compiler's simplistic historical views [see the previous notice], the present collection of documents is of a great interest, and bears testimony of the deep renewal of present studies on the participation of the "Muslim" representation in the elective political institutions of the Russian Empire from the mid-1860s to 1917. The documents published here — for the most part discourses or presentations to varied commissions by representatives of the "Muslim Fraction" of the State Duma, but also several press articles (sometimes translated from Turkic, in the early twentieth century, by functionaries of the Imperial Gendarmerie) as well as police reports — are presented in chronological order, in four chapters which correspond to the four successive dumas, each preceded by a short historical introduction. We must remark the important contribution of the regional archive collections of Kazan and Ufa, which have been rarely used by historians of the constitutional period, even if one must deplore the incomplete reproduction of many documents and the non-critical use by the compiler of recent encyclopedias and polemic works published during recent years. S.A.D.

■ KHABUTDINOV, A. Iu., *Tatarskoe obshchestvenno-politicheskoe dvizhenie v dosovetskii period: 1900-1918. Uchebnoe posobie po kursu istorii Tatarstana* [The Tatar Social and Political Movement in the Pre-Soviet Period: 1900-1918. A Textbook for the History of Tatarstan], Kazan: Kazanskii gosudarstvennyi universitet, 62+62 p.

The two booklets contain the main theses of the author's Kazan University candidate dissertation of 1996, unfortunately without footnotes and encompassing only a rudimentary bibliography. Drawing the readers' attention to a textbook might seem odd, but Khabutdinov's dissertation offers a somewhat different approach to the problems of Tatar nation building apart from established academic traditions and, probably therefore, is very likely to remain unpublished. This study on the structures and personal of the "Tatar" political movement covers the whole of the Volga-Urals, avoids the usual Kazanocentrism, and includes the sometimes peculiar developments of other centres like Ufa and Orenburg. Secondly, the author does not satisfy himself of presenting seemingly monolithic political movements, but detects the various substructures of the national movement and examines their interplay. Three chapters on the political movement, the educational reforms and the public organisations convincingly describe the functions and the interactions of the most important political or seemingly un-political institutions, be it the unions of the 'ulamā, the teachers and students, or voluntary and charitable organisations. Khabutdinov stresses the multiple roles of central figures and outlines the shades of a collective biography by portraying the national activists in their kinships bonds and loyalties. Certainly the publication of two booklets does not allow for more than a sometimes approximate overview. The author nevertheless provides the reader with basic information about central figures and forums of the national movement, and presents interesting findings on the establishment and evolution of elite networks and their national functions within the "sedimentary society" of late Imperial Russia. C.N.



■ KIRIMLI, Hakan, *National Movement and National Identity Among the Crimean Tatars, 1905-1916*, Leiden: Brill, 1996 (The Ottoman Empire and Its Heritage: Politics, Society and Economy, 7), xii-242 p., map, photos., bibliography, index.

Sketching only generalizing picture of the first hundred years of Russian rule over the Crimean peninsula and summing up Gasprinskii's activities before 1905 in two chapters, Kırımlı's study focuses on the history of the national movement and the development of a Crimean Tatar identity between 1905 and 1916. The inquiry basically relies on the contemporary writings of the national activists, as well as later reports and memoirs the author detected in Turkish publications and archives. Russian sources, though, are hardly ever consulted. This selection is to credit mainly for the merits as well as for the shortcomings of the study.

In general, the activities and discussions within the "Young Tatar" movement and the "Fatherland Society" are examined in great detail, while the analysis of their interaction with other actors on the political scene remains quite superficial. The assessment of the social and cultural framework and its impact on the formation of a Tatar national consciousness is fragmentary at best. For example, Kırımlı convincingly describes the generation conflict between Gasprinskii and the "Young Tatars" and shows how the latter developed on some of Gasprinskii's basic ideas and principles, combining them with more radical social and political demands. It does not become clear, however, that this radicalization was not to a small degree due to a closer interplay between Russian and Tatar intellectuals during the first Russian revolution. To a somewhat lesser degree the same critic can be applied to Kırımlı's presentation of the complex relationship between Crimean Tatar and Volga Tatar leaders within the all-Russian Muslim movement. The Russian context is completely neglected for the analysis of nationalist thinking and national organisations after 1910. Kırımlı comments extensively on the activities of Crimean Tatar students and their "Fatherland Society" in Istanbul, claiming that under the repressive rule of the Russian authorities nationalist thinking could no longer unfold on the peninsula. Given the allegedly impressive dimensions of the nationalist underground network during the First World War which Kırımlı later depicts as the foundation of Tatar state building in 1917, this argument does not sound convincingly.

Although presenting sometimes quite interesting material on the development of nationalist thinking among Crimean Tatar intellectuals, the book finally disappoints. The author hardly ever shows the necessary critical distance concerning his sources. This is especially true for his treatment of memoirs and historical reports: he fails to dismiss their anachronistic efforts to "turkicize" the Crimean and the all-Russian Muslim movements. Added to this, Kırımlı is largely inaccurate in his terminological proceeding, for example when he qualifies Gasprinskii's concept of *millät* as "clearly corresponding to the Western ethnic concept of nation" (p. 117). In its narrow and one-sided selection of the source material and its limited methodological approach, the study does not meet the contemporary state of art in research on nations and nationalism.

Also reviewed by İlber Ortaylı, *Turcica* 29 (1997): 504-507.

C.N.

■ MALINOVSKII, V. G., TOMILOV, N. A., *Tomskie tatarsy i Chulymskie tiurki v pervoi chetverti XVIII veka: khoziaistvo i kul'tura (po materialam Pervoi podushnoi perepisi naseleniia Rossii 1720 goda)* [The Tom Tatars and the Chulym Turks in the First Quarter of the Eighteenth Century: Economy and Culture (According to the First Census of the Population of Russia in 1720)], Novosibirsk: Nauka, Sibirskoe predpriiatie RAN, 1999 (Kul'tura narodov Rossii, 3), 536 p., tab., appendixes, Eng. sum.

The present work is divided into three clearly distinct parts: a general introduction by V.G. Malinovskii and N.A. Tomilov introduces the interest of the inspection (*reviziia*) of 1720 for the history of the populations of the basins of the Tom and of the Chulym Rivers in the early eighteenth century; then comes an edition of the data of this inspection, in facsimile and in the form of a modern Russian transcription; last three papers published in the appendixes: BOIARSHNOVA, A. Ia., "Tiurkoiazychnye gruppy lesostepnoi i lesnoi polos Zapadnoi Sibiri [The Turkic-Speaking Groups of the Steppe and Wooded Steppe Areas of Western Siberia]," 475-486; TOMILOV, N. A., "Chulymskie tiurki v kontse XVI — nachale XIX v. [The Turks of the Chulym River between the Late Sixteenth and the Early Nineteenth Century]," 487-516; *idem.*, "Chaty v kontse XVI — nachale XIX v. [The Chats between the Late Sixteenth and the Early Nineteenth Century]," 517-532. The whole set of contributions constitutes an exceptional ensemble of studies and documents on the Turkic-speaking communities of the Tom and Chulym Rivers between the beginning of the Russian colonization and the end of the Imperial period. S.A.D.

■ NIZAMETDINOV, Kamil, KHÄLIULLIN, Ilshat, eds., *Archa töbäge tarikhy / Istoriia Arskogo kraia* [History of the Territory of Arsk], Kazan: Tatarstan kitap nashriiaty, 1996, 256 p., 11 photos., bibliography.

This work is a bilingual Tatar-Russian collection of materials on the pre-Revolutionary history of the Arsk region, today located in the North-Western part of the Republic of Tatarstan. This region, also known in Russian as the Zakazan'e [Beyond Kazan], and in Tatar as the *Qazan arty*, is in many respects the ethnic and intellectual heartland of the Tatar nation as a whole. At the same time, the book is an especially important source for local lore, as well as the history of the region's Islamic institutions. Most of the articles appear in both Tatar and Russian versions. The largest article, devoted to the history of the region as a part of the Kazan khanate, and under Russian rule up to the end of the seventeenth century, was written by Kamil Nizametdinov. Marsel' Akhmetzianov contributed a number of articles, devoted to the region's Islamic epigraphy and to the history of the village of Novyi Kiner (Yanga Kenär), as well as a number of biographical sketches of important local Muslim scholars, including Shihāb al-Dīn Marjānī, Abū'n-Nasīr Qūrsāwī, Shams al-Dīn Kūltasī, and a local Sufi, Yahyā b. Safar 'Alī (1758-1838). Rashit Galliamov contributed a number of articles devoted to the histories of a number of villages during the first century of Russian rule, and separate articles on the later histories of specific villages. The book also contains two previously published articles. One of these is an extract from Radik Salikhov and Ramil

Khairutdinov's 1995 monograph listing the surviving Tatar structures and tombs bearing historical significance. The second is a re-edition of Mukhammat Magdeev's article, originally published in the journal *Qazan Utlary* in 1986, and devoted to the role of the Arsk region in the literary history of the Tatars. Magdeev's article is the only Tatar article that does not appear in a Russian version. The original sections of the work, especially those by Marsel' Akhmetzianov and Rashit Galliamov devoted to local history, will doubtlessly prove to be very useful to students of local history and Islamic institutions, especially since these articles appear to be largely based on local written and oral sources. A.J.F.

- TEMİR, A., *Yusuf Akçura*, Kültür ve Turizm Bakanlığı Yayınları 836, Ankara: Gaye Matbaası, 1987, VII-103 p.; 2nd edition: Türk Kültürünü Araştırma Enstitüsü Yayınları 156, Ankara, 1997, 108 p. 11 ills.

This is dedicated to the life and thought of Yusuf Akçura (1876-1935) who was forgotten for many years despite his important role in the rise of Turkish nationalism. The author uses extensively Akçura's memoirs (*Hâtıra Defteri*) with corrections of M.F. Togay's edition (Muharrem Feyzi TOGAY, *Yusuf Akçura, hayatı ve eserleri*, İstanbul: Zaman Kitabevi, 1944). As to this outstanding figure who linked Turkic Muslim intellectuals both in the Russian and the Ottoman Empires see also: François Georgeon, *Türk milliyetçiliğinin kökenleri: Yusuf Akçura (1876-1935)*, trans. by Alev Er, Ankara: Yurt Yayınevi, 1986, 167 p.

Reviewed by S. Tulu, *CAJ* 38/2 (1994): 299-301.

K.H

- TOYOKAWA, Kōichi, "Jūhasseiki Roshia no nantō shokumin seisaku to Orenburugu kense-tsu [Eighteenth-Century Russia's Colonization Policies in the South Eastern Region: The Project of I.K. Kirillov]," in *Roshia isuramu sekaihenō izanai* [An Invitation to the Islamic World of Russia], Sapporo: Slavic Research Center (Slavic Research Center Series: 74), 2000: 11-27

This article introduces and analyses the proposition or the *proekt* by I.K. Kirillov (1695-1737), which was to become the basis for Russia's policy in her southeastern region. Kirillov's project submitted to the Empress Anna in 1733 insisted on the effective use and economic exploitation of the abundant natural resources of the south-east region, on the construction of fortresses in territories inhabited by Kazakhs and Bashkirs, and the construction of a stronghold on the estuary of the Or river. The author analyses the fundamental purpose of Kirillov's proposal, with special attention for the future Russian expansion towards Central Asia, and for the Bashkir question. According to him, Kirillov's proposal was embodying Peter the Great's Eastern policies. After its approval by the Empress Anna in 1734, the proposal became an important step for Russia's expansion in the East. See also the author's other work: *Orenburg i Orenburgskoe kazachestvo vo vremia vosstaniia Pugacheva 1773-1774 gg.* [Orenburg and the Orenburg Cossacks in the time of the Pugachev revolts 1773-1774], Moscow: Arkheograficheskii Tsent, 1996, 246p. H.M.

■ TREPAVLOV, Vadim, "Tiurkskaia znat' v Rossii (nogai na tsarskoi sluzhbe) [The Turkic Aristocracy in Russia (The Noghays at the Service of the Czars)]," *VE* 1998/1-2 [4-5]: 101-114.

In this brief article the author addresses the issue of the Turkic origin of several major Russian noble families, with special emphasis on noble families of Noghay origin, and examines the conditions under which their ancestors entered Muscovite service. The author bases his study primarily on sixteenth century Russian sources chronicling Russia's political interaction with the Noghays and the Crimean Khanate, and demonstrates that both the Noghay servitors and their followers made a major contribution to Muscovy's military effort in the sixteenth century. A.J.F.

■ USMANOVA, Diliara, *Musul'manskaia fraktsiia i problemy "svobody sovesti" v Gosudarstvennoi Dume Rossii (1906-1917)* [The Muslim Fraction and the Questions of "Freedom of Conscience" in the State Duma of Russia (1906-1917)], Kazan: Izdatel'stvo "Master Lain," 1999, 163 p., 6 tabs., ill., bibliography.

Diliara Usmanova's monograph is taken on two tasks. The first is a general examination of the activities of Muslim deputies and their "Muslim Bloc" in the imperial Russia's four parliamentary assemblies (Dumas), which were convened from 1906 until the overthrow of czarism in 1917. The second task is to examine the more specific issue of "freedom of conscience," or religious liberty as it was addressed by the Muslim deputies, and discussed in the Duma at large. The author admirably succeeds in both tasks, and in so doing provides an informative and cleareyed appraisal of the role of Muslim deputies in Russia's first parliament. She bases her studies both on the published proceedings of the Dumas, as well as the Muslim press of that era, which paid close attention to its community's deputies.

In the main narrative regarding the Muslim deputies, the author portrays a very heterogeneous group, whose numbers and diversity shrank as the czar successively dissolved the Dumas, and restricted the franchise. In Usmanova's view, while the Muslim deputies obviously enjoyed a degree of unity on the basis of a common faith and a shared experience as a religious and ethnic minority within Russia, differences among Muslim deputies hindered their overall effectiveness as parliamentarians. The differences that influenced their effectiveness were not so much ethnic, regional, or even partisan divisions, but rather differences in education and training as parliamentarians. Specifically, some Muslim deputies came to the Duma as lawyers, conversant with Russian law, fluent in the Russian language, and familiar with the parliamentary experiences of other countries. These deputies were able to work very effectively on the various committees and in the Duma chamber. Other Muslim deputies came to the Duma from rural communities. Their ignorance of the Russian language and of parliamentary procedure as a whole vitiated their effectiveness, and weakened the Muslim Bloc as a whole. Furthermore, while other ethnic blocs, such as the Polish Kolo, maintained clear enough goals, the Muslim bloc, representing a much more diverse group, was unable to articulate, let alone implement, any specific "Muslim" program.

The author sees the Muslim Bloc's chief legacy to have been in the area of drafting legislation advancing freedom of religion in the Russian Empire. While internal disorganization, and the dissolution of the first three Dumas hindered the implementation of these laws, she identifies freedom of religion, and defending the rights of religious minorities within the empire as a major concern of the Muslim deputies. A.J.F.

- ZORIN, N. V. & KAPLUNOVSKAIA, E. B., "Etnodemograficheskie osobennosti meshchanskikh semei Kazani v kontse XIX v. [Ethno-Demographical Traits of the Petty Bourgeois Families in Late Nineteenth Century Kazan]," *EO* 2000/1: 70-81.

The authors analyze the structure of petty bourgeois families in Kazan on the basis of the polls made in 1898. This material offers information on 9,028 families, of which the present paper targets 5%: 453 families, which have been chosen at random. The authors show that the relationship between the number of family members and the number of families in the city is in inverse proportion. From the ethnic point of view, Tatar and Jewish families have more, and German families have fewer members if compared with the majority Russian families. When this material is analyzed from the viewpoint of the complexity of families (number of generations and married couples in a family), it is clear that 62.9% of all the members of the 453 families belongs to complex families. The latter result suggests that separation within a family in the second half of the nineteenth century was less typical than researchers have tended to assume until now. The authors' suggestions are very interesting, although further analysis of more samples will be needed before more definitive conclusions can be drawn. H.M.

### 3.2.C The Soviet and Current Periods

- ILISHEV, G. Sh., "Bashkirskaya partorganizatsiia v seredine 1930-kh godov [The Party Organization in Bashkiria in the Mid-1930s]," *VI* 1988/9: 126-131.

Characteristic of post-Soviet trends in regional historiography of the twentieth century, this article consists of a come-back on party life in Bashkiria in the 1930s. Taking advantage of the political opening of the Perestroika period, the author (who teaches history of the Communist party at the Bashkir University, Ufa) develops critics of this specific Soviet past through a description of the reality of Stalin purges in Bashkiria. The documentary basis of the study is made of the party archives of the BASSR *Obkom*. The author tries to demonstrate the large extent taken by repressions, and for that he introduces short biographies of four little-known repressed peoples, in order to show that repression was not limited to high-ranking members of local party organisations, but touched also bureaucrats in remote rural areas. Deprived of serious methodological background, the presentation remains poor and the article looks like a necessarily partial enumeration of victims. X.L.T.

- ISKHAKOV, S. M., "Oktiabr'skaya revoliutsiia i bor'ba musul'manskikh liderov za vlast' v Povolzh'e i na Urale (oktiabr' 1917 g – leto 1918 g.) [The October Revolution and the

Struggle for Power among Muslim Leaders in the Volga-Urals Region (October 1917 – Summer 1918)]," *OI* 1999/1: 47-63.

Debates about state-building in Muslim-peopled areas of revolutionary Russia have for long captured the attention of researchers. This is precisely the reason why the sudden outbreak of Tatar-Bashkir struggle after October 1917 represents a fine case of study (on this subject, see Daniel E. Schafer, *Building Nations and Building States: The Tatar-Bashkir Questions in Revolutionary Russia, 1917-1920*, Ph. D. dissertation, University of Michigan, 1995). In post-Perestroika regional history writing, the new interest in the national past has strongly contributed to the politicization of these topics. In each republic, intellectuals have started to construct (through rehabilitations and reassessments) a mythological-historical image of their glorious nation. In such an overall context, the great merit of the present article is to come back on the crucial problem of "objectivity." The author exposes the ways in which the studies are affected by political manoeuvres. He shows how several translations of the same text (for instance, of Ahmet Zeki Validov's "Memoirs") frequently emphasize different historical interpretations. The article continues with a narrative of the 1917-1918 events in connection with this historiographical background, in a constant balancing between the facts and their interpretation by contemporary historians from Ufa, Kazan or Moscow. Moreover, writing down the chronology of the struggle which occurred between Muslim leaders for the creation of a National state (from Bashkurdistan on 11 November 1917 to the Tatar-Bashkir Republic on 23 March 1918, via the Idel-Ural state on 29 November 1917), the author clarifies the narrative by exposing on main events the respective analyses made by actors of that time (especially the *Validovtsy* of the BNC, the *Harbi Shuro* of Tatars and the Bolsheviks). If the general interpretation proposed by the author is not really innovative (a common interest in preventing social chaos was motivating contemporaries), his well-documented paper provides some new and fascinating information. Such is for example the case on the central role played by the Kurbangaliev's brotherhood in the conflict with Validov. There are also interesting passages on the Bulgharist movement or on the "Islamic factor" considered through his institutional aspect. Last, the article is rich of long footnotes with biographical and bibliographical content, and should become a reference for historians working on the nationality question in the Volga-Urals region. X.L.T.

■ KARIMULLIN, Abrar, *Tatarskoe gosudarstvennoe izdatel'stvo i tatarskaia kniga Rossii (1917-1932)* [The Tatar State Editions and the Tatar Book in Russia (1917-1932)], Kazan: Tatarskoe knizhnoe izdatel'stvo, 1999, 319 p., tab., bibliography.

This detailed history of one of the most productive publishing houses in a non-Russian language of the beginning of the Soviet period offers rich information on the evolution of Tatar books from the Bolshevik takeover to the imposition of Socialist realism in the USSR, in all the region of the Union concerned by the publication and diffusion of books in Tatar language (Siberia included). A monument of scholarship, this monograph offers elements of reflection on the evolution of book printing in the Turkic-

speaking and -reading republics of the Soviet Union during a still very under-studied transitional period. S.A.D.

- KUZEEV, R. G., BABENKO, V. Ia., MOISEEVA, N. N., "Osobennosti etnonatsional'nogo razvitiia narodov Volgo-Ural'skoi istoriko-etnograficheskoi oblasti za gody Sovetskoi vlasti [The Specificities of the Ethno-National Development of the Peoples of the Volga-Urals Historical and Ethnographical Area during the Period of the Soviet Power]," *SE* 1988/1: 3-15.

The authors analyse the evolution of socialism in the national republics of the Volga-Urals region from the 1920s to the 1980s. Confident in the Marxist principle of primacy of the economic factors over the political and cultural ones, they draw a chronology of the successful establishment of socialism throughout industrialization and urbanization. In the social field, these decisive evolutions allowed the apparition of a large and powerful national proletariat and the diffusion of socialist values thanks to Russian-speaking local intelligentsias. Then the authors evoke Perestroika as the time of the final fusion, the "last step of transition from Socialist nations to the Soviet people." Written for the upcoming 27th Congress of the CPUS, the article ends up with a recommendation: party officials would better take into account local specificities, and read ethnographic reports before taking any decisions concerning "ethnic" affairs.... X.L.T.

- MENDEL, Miloš, "The Islamic Religious Community in Bohemia and Moravia (1934-1945)," *ArOr* 66 (1998): 127-141.

On the basis of a rich archive material, the author deals with the activity of the organisation *El-Ittihad el-Islami* created in Prague in 1934 by Muslims of Czech and foreign origins, for a better representation of the interests of the Muslim community of Czechoslovakia. Although the author only mentions in passing the relative significance of the Tatar or Cherkess immigration from the former Russian Empire, his pages on the influence struggle between the Cherkess Hamid Bekukh and the converted Czech Alois Borhan Brikcius offer interesting elements for a study of the role played by the Muslim emigration from Russia and the Caucasus in Mittel Europa's struggles between the two world wars and during the German occupation. S.A.D.

- SHNIREL'MAN [SHNIRELMAN], Viktor, "Ot konfessional'nogo k etnicheskomu: bulgarskaia ideia v natsional'nom samosoznanii kazanskikh tatar v XX veke [From Confessional to Ethnic: the Bulghar Idea in the National Consciousness of the Kazan Tatars in the Twentieth Century]," *VE* 1-2 [4-5] (1998): 137-159.

In this article the author examines the image and legacy of the early twentieth-century Vaysi movement among the "Neo-Bulgharists" in post-Soviet Tatar society. The author demonstrates a definite link between the radical Sufi movement led by Ginan Vaisov, until his death in Kazan in 1918, and the modern-day nationalist movement, which has engendered a sharp polemic among Tatar intellectuals over the last twelve or so years — specifically, in the person of Mirkhad Vaisov (1918-1986), Ginan Vaisov's son. The younger Vaisov, as an adult, compiled his own version of "Bulghar" history, based on



his father's vision, and it was his version that the Neo-Bulgharists current ideological leader, F. Nurutdinov, used to formulate the current nationalist interpretation of what had originated as a religious movement. The author traces the transformation of the Vaysi's Bulghar identity, which he characterizes as "confessional" (indeed, the Vaysi movement led by Ginan Vaisov was actually a later radicalized incarnation of a more widespread regional Islamic identity centered around the Islamic sacred history of Bulghar), to a "national" conception articulated by the Neo-Bulgharists, in which the former "confessional" features are completely lacking. Here the characterization of the Neo-Bulgharist interpretation as "national" rather than "confessional" may be too broad. A more precise characterization of the conceptions defining Neo-Bulgharist identity would be "Soviet," since the fundamental conceptions characterizing the conceptions and arguments of both the Neo-Bulgharists and their opponents the "Tatarists" emerged from Soviet ethnographic models. A.J.F.

■ SOLTANGALIEV, Mirsäet / SULTAN-GALIEV, Mirsaid, *Sailanma khezmtälär / İzbrannye trudy* [Selected Works], eds. I.G. Gizzatullin & D.R. Sharafutdinov, Kazan: "Gasyr" näshriaty ("Gasyrlar avazy / Ekho vekov" zhurnalyna qushymta), 1998, 719 p., [32] pl., appendices, index, bibliography, chronology.

Preceded by a biographical introduction, this rich volume has notably the advantage of presenting in a whole set early publications by Sultan-Galiev, in Tatar and in Russian languages, in the Muslim press of European Russia, and other texts which belong to the revolutionary and to the early Soviet periods. This neighbouring allows us to better measure the extent of the ideological mutation that occurred during the revolutionary years, from a rather classical form of Jadidism to what has been then called national Communism. The work is closed with the publication of a series of documents written by Sultan-Galiev after the successive investigations to which he had been exposed from 1922 onwards. The whole set is followed by a rich critical apparatus which permits the reader to resituate each document in its specific respective context. To this day and to our knowledge, this volume makes of the most significant contribution to our direct knowledge of the work of one of the most prominent protagonists and theoreticians of the Tatar and Bashkir national movement after 1917. (See in this volume the review by H.K. of a recent Japanese translation of a selection of writings by the same author, and of a monograph by Yamauchi Masayuki.) S.A.D.

● UBUSHAEV, V. B., "Izuchenie deiatel'nosti Sovetov natsional'nykh raionov Povolzh'ia v period postroeniia sotsializma [A Study on the Activity of the Soviets in the National Districts of the Volga Region, during the First Period of Construction of Socialism]," *VI* 1985/10: 116-125.

The author's intention is to launch a debate on the historiography of the Volga Region. Actually, the historical study of Soviet organisations was limited till a recent past to three main chronological frameworks: the October revolution, collectivisation and



industrialisation. Other aspects have been generally neglected by the historians of the early Soviet period. The author draws here a remarkable picture of self-representation systems among local intelligentsias. At the end of the article, through his analysis of different cases in the national republics of the Volga region, the author shows the validity of the comparatist method he recommends. His descriptions (with abundant references to primary sources) are rich of elements on the emergence of a national feeling among local elites during the 1970s. It finally makes possible to feel a synchrony in the evolution of national historiographies, which anticipates on the proclamations of sovereignty by these Republics from 1990 onwards. X.L.T.

- VOLOBUEV, O. V., "Krymskotatarskii vopros po dokumentam TsK KPSS (Vtoraia polovina 50-kh — seredina 80-kh gg. XX v.) [The Crimean Tatar Question According to Documents of the Central Committee of the CPUS (between the Second Half of the 1950s and the Mid-1980s)]," *OI* 1994/1: 158-169.

Based on documents ignored by most historians of the Crimean Tatars, this article offers an instructive presentation of the manner the Soviet regime dealt with the problem of this "nationality" from Stalin's death to Perestroika. The author begins with the history of the deportation of 190 thousands of them after WWII; transported mostly to Central Asia (especially Uzbekistan), these populations then have been permanently asking for permission to return to Crimea. The article draws up the chronology of the events around the Crimean Tatars' claims to return home, and the administration's reactions to them. Two points are particularly interesting: the Soviet power was then divided up by strong conflicts of interests which interfered in the decision-making process; it shared a strong degree of incomprehension towards a subject charged with memory and identity dimensions. For instance, a proposal by the Central Committee in the autumn 1966 to the Crimean Tatars to take advantage of the existence in the USSR of a national Tatar territory and to move to Tatarstan. Written by a specialist of Crimea's history, this article is based on new materials derived from the archives of the Central Committee of the CPUS — on one hand notes and reports sent to the Central Committee by Ukraine, Uzbekistan secretariats and by KGB agencies; on the other hand, documents emanating from the Central Committee itself. X.L.T.

- VOLOBUEV, O. V., "Rozhdenie i sud'by novoi krymskoi gosudarstvennosti v pervoi polovine XX veka [Origin and Destiny of the New Crimean Statehood in the First Half of the 20th Century]," *OI* 1999/2: 89-99.

Making use of archive documents recently published ("Dokumenty i materialy o peredache Krymskoi oblasti iz sostava RSFSR v sostav USSR (ianvar' — fevral' 1954) [Documents and Materials Relative to the Transfer of the Crimean *oblast'* from RSFSR to the Ukrainian SSR (January — February, 1954)]," *Istoricheskie arkhivy* 1992/1), this article deals with the history of Crimea from the October Revolution to the immediate aftermath of Stalin's death in 1953. Isolating this strategic region from his Ukrainian context, the analysis focuses on relationships between the local elites (especially the

Tatar nationalist leaders) and the Russian authorities. It traces the way by which claims for autonomy became a reality during the murky time of the Civil War, and then meticulously studies the national policy carried out in the newly created ASSR of Crimea (as a part of the RSFSR). Closed to Nation-building theory, the author distinguishes and examines several aspects of the Crimean State's territorial implantation: *korenizatsia*, the cultural modernisation and the effects of collectivisation on Tatar communities. That makes even more dramatic the recall of mass deportations ordered by Stalin after the "collaboration" of Crimean Tatars with German occupying forces (the main operation took place in the night between May 17 and 18, 1944). The article ends with an evocation of "Khrushchev's voluntarism." Considering the overall chronology of the event, the author agrees with common interpretations on the unexpected gift granted to Ukraine in 1954: the need for Khrushchev to be supported by regional elites in his fight against the Politburo's members Malen'kov and Molotov. However, despite such relevant reflections, the article remains limited by its one-side historical exploration: concentrated exclusively on the destiny of the Crimean Tatars, the author, a specialist of Crimean Tatar history and the author of a handbook on the subject, excessively neglects the factors linked with the Russian demographic majority of the Crimean population.

X.L.T.

■ YAMAUCHI, Masayuki, ed. and transl., *Surutangariehuno yumeto genjitsu. Shiryō* [Dreams and Realities of Sultangaliev. Documents], Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppan Kai, 1998, vii-321-16 p., ill., bibliography, index.

Since the period of Perestroika, the rehabilitation of Central Asian Muslim intellectuals and Communist leaders, who suffered repression during the 1920s and 1930s, has started and researches based on unpublished documents and restricted publications have contributed to the re-evaluation of their activities and thought. Among others the rehabilitation of Mir Sait Sultangaliev (1892-1939), one of the most outstanding Muslim Communists, makes it possible for us to understand many aspects of the revolutions of 1917 in Central Asia. This work consists of two parts: an introduction and a Japanese translation of selected writings of Sultangaliev. In the introduction the editor, who has already published three books relating to Sultangaliev, provides a historical perspective of nationality problems in Central Asia, especially in the Middle Volga region. The texts are selected not only from Mirsaid Sultan-Galiev's *Stat'i, vystupleniia, Dokumenty* (red. I.R. Tagirov, B.F. Sultanbekov, Kazan, 1992) but also from contemporary periodicals such as *Zhizn' natsional'nostei* [The Life of Nationalities]. The Japanese translation by the editor and his younger colleagues such as NONAKA Susumu, OBIYA Chika and UYAMA Tomohiko is reliable and, no doubt, will encourage Japanese studies in this field.

K.H.

● ZARIPOVA, R. K., "Bashkirkoe krest'ianstvo v period nepa [The Bashkir Peasantry during the NEP]," *OI* 1999/6: 135-138.

This very short paper focuses on the shocks provoked by the NEP on the farming sys-

tem and local communities in Bashkiria, especially on the eponymous population. Examining the Bashkirs' social situation in the beginning of the 20th century, the author concludes on their inability to preserve themselves in such a context of economic liberalisation: still nomadic, not well-equipped for profitable production, they finally had to rent their lands for "miserable prices." The description becomes really catastrophic when the text comes to the several famines which reached southern Bashkir lands during periods of good harvests. Despite the use of first-hand primary sources (mostly from the Central Historical Archives of the Republic of Bashkortostan), the subject is superficially broached by an author clearly biased by Bashkir nationalist feelings and resentments. X.L.T.

### 3.3 The Caucasus

#### 3.3.A General Works

- TAPPER, Richard, "History and Identity among the Shahsevan," *IS* 21/3-4 (1988): 84-108. Refuting the notions of "tribe" and of "ethnic group" as they have been defined — poorly, in a majority of cases — and used by historians and ethnologists, the author shows, through a comparative study, that the existing versions of the origins and identity of the Shāhsavān have been extensively varying according to the periods of time and social and political contexts... In short, Tapper's conclusion is that "the answer to the original question — 'who are the Shahsevan?' — depends on who is asked, when, for what purposes, and in what circumstances" (p. 108). This excellent, suggestive and well documented article gives however, sometimes, the deplorable impression that the baby should be thrown out with the bathwater. J.-P.D.

#### 3.3.B Before the Russian Conquest

- BARTHOLD, W. - [BOSWORTH, C. E.], "Shīrwān," *ET*<sup>1</sup> 9, 1995: 487-488, bibliography. Update of the *ET*<sup>1</sup>'s paper on the history of this South-Eastern region of the Caucasus, from the medieval period to our days. To be read also, by the same authors: "Shīrwānshāh," *ibid.*: 488-489, bibliography. R.
- BOURNOUTIAN, George A., transl., *A History of Qarabagh. An Annotated Translation of Mirza Jamal Javanshir Qarabaghi's Tarikh-e Qarabagh*, Costa Meza, CA: Mazda Publishers, 1994, 157+62 p., bibliography, glossary, index, facsimile of the Persian text. This work offers the first critical translation of the text by Mīrzā Jamāl Jawānshīr Qarābāghī (1773/74-1853), one of the most important South-Caucasian sources in Persian for the history of Qarabagh in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. The translation and the facsimile of one of the existing manuscripts are preceded by an introduction in which the editor introduces the main edited sources, while admitting

that he did not have access to the important collection of manuscripts kept in the Academy of Sciences of Azerbaijan. The most important part of the introduction is devoted to a survey of the history of Armenians of Qarabagh, that the author treats without giving way to the temptation — common among the historians of this region — to project towards a more or less remote past the current geopolitical situation. While underlying some permanent features in the strategies of the Armenian *meliks* — like that consisting of appealing to foreign powers: Iran under Nāder Shāh and the Qajar rulers, then Russia, against the leaders of the Turkmen confederations —, the present work resituates the conflicts of the eighteenth and of the first half of the nineteenth century in their most specific political framework. The author proposes interesting reflections on the role played by Russia's colonial policy in the formation of modern national identities, Armenian and Azerbaijani, and in the appearance of lasting inter-community conflicts in Qarabagh. S.A.D.

- BOURNOUTIAN, George A., HEWSON, Robert H., "Erevan — II. The Persian Khanate of Erevan," *EIr* 8/5, 1998: 545-548, ill., bibliography.

The author provides a historical panorama of the city of Erevan, between the moment when it became the administrative centre of the Ararat region under the Aq-Qoyunlu, and the Russian conquest sanctioned by the Treaty of Torkmanchay in 1828. Preceded by: KETTENHOFEN, Erich, "Erevan — I. Ancient and Medieval," *ibid.*: 542-545, bibliography. R.

- CHENCINER, Robert, MAGOMEDKHANOV, Magomedkhan, "Persian Exports to Russia from the Sixteenth to the Nineteenth Century," *Iran* 30 (1992): 123-130.

The authors of this article — the first part of which is a general overview of trade relations between Iran and Russia — draw attention to the existence of various untapped sources for the history of these relations from the 17th to the early 20th century. Among the collections of documents the authors have located, are a great number of custom ledgers in Makhachkala in Dagestan, as well as numerous documents in the War History Archive in Moscow, the Kiev State Archive, and the State Archive of Astrakhan. Random samples of the content of some of the material as well as some files and catalogues numbers are provided. R.M.

- COWE, S. Peter, "Ejmiatsin," *EIr* 8/3, 1998: 278-281, bibliography.

This is a historical survey of the holy places, the city and the current district of Ejmiatsin (or Echmiadzin), from the fourth century BCE to the end of the Soviet period. R.

- DRUART, Jacques, "Le mystère des monnaies iraniennes contremarquées de l'aigle russe," *La vie numismatique* 47/4 (1997): 127-132.

The author analyses the phenomenon of Persian coins which have been counter-marked by Russian engravings — the two-headed eagle — during the Russian occupation of

Northern Iran between 1719 and 1732. Markov and other Russian numismatists have attributed this practice to a measure of re-organization of the local system undertaken by Russian authorities in order to compensate the delays in the arrival of Russian currencies for the payment of the troops. Several enigmas are still attached to the rare known items of this type, for instance the extreme wear of the original engraving if compared with the counter-mark, whence the strike is always contemporary to the counter-marks. On several coins the problem is made still more complex by the existence of a second counter-mark in Persian language, "*rā'ij*." R.M.

- FERRARI, Aldo, "Gli Armeni e la spedizione persiana di Pietro il Grande (1722-23)," *Annali di Ca' Foscari* 35/3, 1996: 187-198.

Armenian hopes that a Christian crusade might liberate them from Muslim domination go back to the middle of the 16th century. This article discusses an important episode in the so-called Armenian liberation struggle, the campaign of Peter the Great against northern Iran in 1722-23. The author assesses the role of the well-known itinerant diplomat Isreal Ory in the Armenian overtures toward various European courts, noting how the Armenians were ready to make common cause with the Russians, possibly against the Turks. He also makes clear that, at this point, Armenian (and Georgian) aspirations were religious rather than "national" in nature. Their hopes of collusion with Russia never materialized, though, since in 1724 the Russians gave priority to an accommodation with the Ottomans with the aim of dividing Iran's North-Western territory between them. R.M.

- GAMZATOV, Gadzhi Gamzatovich, "Dāgestān — I. Cultural Relations with Persia," *Elr* 6/5, 1994: 568-575, ill., bibliography.

In a general historical introduction, the author recalls the antiquity of the links between ancient Albania and the Sassanian Empire, although he also insists on the episodic and discontinuous character of the Iranian influence in the coastal regions of the Northern Caucasus — considered from Iran as a remote march in the fringes of the nomadic steppes and of powerful northern empires. Three fields are successively dealt with: literature, art and architecture, and music. In a spirit alas characteristic of the *Encyclopaedia Iranica*, the authors totally ignores the place and role of Arabic language in the literary production and in the epigraphy of Dagestan, which may bring the reader to a fallacious impression on the level of diffusion and use of Persian language in this region, from the tenth century CE to the Qajar period. S.A.D.

- GOLDEN, P. B., "Rūs," *EF* 8, 1995: 618-629, bibliography.

Cutting off with the traditional approach focused on Byzantium, through a large use of Islamic sources, this long and detailed notice renew our vision of the ninth and tenth-centuries *Rus'*, which is seen here as a commercial and political entity with a rather colourful ethnic composition. After a short explanation on the notion of a "kaghanate of Rūs" common in the Christian sources, the author studies the original territory of the

Rūs, the latter's relations with their neighbours, their mode of government, economic system, religious customs and practices. We then deal with the founding events of their history: their expeditions on the South-Western coast of the Caspian Sea, the fall of Khazaria, and their conversion to Christianity. The notice is concluded by a rapid study of the writing systems used by the Rūs during the considered period of time.

S.A.D.

■ KHATCHIKIAN, Chouchanik L., "Les livres de comptes des négociants arméniens des XVII<sup>e</sup> et XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècles," in Raymond Kevorkian, ed., *Arménie entre Orient et Occident. Trois mille ans de civilisation*, Paris: Bibliothèque Nationale, 1996.

On the basis of commercial registers kept in the archive of the Matenadaran of Erevan, the author studies the role of the Armenian merchants of Nor Jula in the Caspian — Volga road linking Western Persia to Russia. The first of this register concerns the commercial activity of Sarhad Ahvelian, a trader between Isfahan and Moscow, for the years 1711 to 1718. The second one contains precious information on the commerce practiced by the Company of Nazaret, the ancestor of the Nazarian family, between Isfahan and Amsterdam via Moscow and St. Petersburg for the period 1751 to 1759. These two account registers allow us not only to follow the commercial and financial activities of these families, but also to know their mutual relations.

See also in the same volume: TADJIRIAN, Elisabeth, KARAPETIAN, Meroujan, "Les voies de transit du commerce arménien en Moscovie aux XVII<sup>e</sup> et XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècles," 157-161, a short study based on the rich documentation of the fund No. 100 in the Central Archive of Ancient Documents of Russia, published for the most part in 1953 under the title *Armiano-russkie otnosheniia v XVII veke. Sbornik dokumentov*, ed. V. Parsamiian. The authors study the road that the merchants of Nor Jula were using between Iran and Russia before and after the fall of the Safavids. The available documents show that, although the interests of Russian traders were threatened by the development of the Armenian commercial activity in Russia (which in the early eighteenth century was absorbing between 70 and 76% of the commerce between Iran and Russia), this inconvenient was largely compensated by the transit rights perceived by Russian authorities.

R.M.

■ MAMEDOVA, Goukhar, *Russkie konsuly ob Azerbaidzhane (20-60-e gody XVIII veka)* [Russian Consuls of Azerbaijan in the Period from the 1720s to the 1760s], Baku: Elm, 1989, 127 p.

This monograph, which is meant to be a reinterpretation of the history of Azerbaijan that was earlier examined by 19th-century Russian scholars such as Butkov and Bronevskii and a number of Azerbaijani scholars, considers the period in the 18th century from the establishment of Russian consular representation in Iran in 1721, to the transfer of Russian consular service to the cities of Azerbaijan in the 1760s. The source material is drawn primarily from the consular reports generated by the incumbents of these posts, beginning with S. Avramov, administrators whose missives contain much

valuable material on political as well as commercial matters. The book contains much important information on an episode in Iran's history that is little known for lack of Western studies. This includes a discussion on the commercial incident in Shirvan, the so-called uprising of Shirvan in 1721, which gave Peter the Great an excuse to invade Iran's Northern provinces a year later. One of the book's main conclusions is the shift in importance of "Azerbaijan" (in reality consisting of a number of independent khanates after the demise of Iranian influence in the Caucasus) as reflected in the rise of Baku as a trade emporium, and the Russian decision in 1762 to establish a full-fledged consulate in that city. The author's combined nationalist Azerbaijani and Soviet bias is reflected in the persistent references to Azerbaijan and its people, who "gravitated" towards Russia in the second half of the 18th century. R.M.

■ MUSTAFAEV, Dzh. M., "Po povodu otnoshenii mezhdru Azerbaidzhanskimi khanstvami i Rossiei konets XVIII — nachalo XIX v. [On the Question of the Relations between the Azerbaijani Khanates and Russia, Late 18th–Early 19th Centuries]," *IANA ist.* 1985/1: 61–67.

In this short article, the key position of Azerbaijan is analyzed in connection with the rivalry between Russia and Iran for its control. When the czar Paul I was trying to establish the Azerbaijani khanates under Russian control against Iran, Fath 'Alī Shāh was sending his diplomats to Petersburg for trying to withdraw any Russian influence from the Southern Caucasus. The policy of the Czarist administration seems to have been more fruitful: in 1797 an embassy from Talesh was received in Petersburg, where it was claiming for Russian protection, as well as another embassy from the khanate of Qarabagh. In 1798, it was the turn of the khanate of Kuba. The relations between Russia and the khanate of Baku, although they are more difficult to analyze, finally stabilized in August 1800. This situation was concretized in December 1802 by the collective peace agreement of Georgiev against the Iranian threat. C.P.

■ ROTA, Giorgio, "Le *Favayedo's-safaviyeh* a le storia della Georgia," *Annali di Ca' Foscari* 33/3 (1994): 427–444.

Interesting historiographical examination of the *Fawā'id al-safawiyya* and the information it offers on Georgia. The author compares the published uncritical edition, by Maryam Ahmadi (1367/1988), to four mss. held in London (British Library: Add 16,698 and Or 139; Royal Asiatic Society: P Cat 145; India Office Library: Ethé 567), as well as to MS BL Or 4,132 of the *Khuld-i barīn* and the MS Royal Asiatic Society P Cat 43 of Kamāl b. Jalāl Munajjim's *Zubdat al-tawārikh*. He argues that recourse to a large number of mss. and a more careful use of the primary sources and the scholarly literature on the part of the editor would have avoided most, if not all mistakes in the edited work. The article begins with a brief summary of the circumstances leading to the composition of the work and its contents. (Composed in 1211/1796–7, the *Fawā'id* is dedicated to Abūl-Fath Sultān Muhammad, a descendant of Shāh Tahmāsp II, and recounts Iranian history up to this time.) The bulk of the study is devoted to a clarification of eleven passages of the printed text, all of them dealing with Iranian-

Georgian relations, where misreading and a lack of adequate footnotes often make it difficult to comprehend the text, especially proper names. R.M.

- SALMĀSI-ZĀDE, Mohammad, "Shīrvān dar dowre-ye safaviyye [Shirvan in Safavid Times]," *Īrān-shenākht* 3 (1375/1997): 111-142.

Almost two-thirds of this article is devoted to Shirvan in the period prior to the Safavids. The part that does discuss Shirvan in Safavid times is based on a limited number of sources, mostly Iskandar Beg's *Ta'rikh-i 'ālam-ārā-ye 'abbāsī* and Hasan Rūmlū's *Ahsan al-tawārīkh*. In its emphasis that Shirvan was important and attractive for its many natural resources and strategic location, the article adds little to our knowledge and understanding of the region. R.M.

- SIDORKO, Clemens P., "'Kampf den kezerischen Qizilbash!' Die Revolte des Haggi Da'ud (1718-1728)," in Raoul Motika & Michael Ursinus, eds., *Caucasia between the Ottoman Empire and Iran, 1555-1914*, Wiesbaden: Reichert Verlag, 2000: 133-145.

This interesting study analyses the little-known revolt of Hajji Davud, the rebel Lezghi leader who in 1721 took Shamakhi, the capital of Shirvan, from the Safavids, in a prelude to his conquest of the entire province. Hajji Davud's rebellion has been variously interpreted. Some have seen it as a religious uprising, presaging later Muslim jihad movements against the expansionist Czarist state. Iranian and pre-revolutionary Russian historians have tended to dismiss it as ordinary plunder raids, whereas for Soviet scholars Hajji Davud became an anti-colonial guerilla leader. The author convincingly demonstrates that, in reality, the revolt was caused by socio-economic and religious grievances. The Dagestanis represented a minority Sunni population in Shirvan within the larger and increasingly emphatic Shi'i framework of the Safavid state, and suffered growing pressure from the central government. The corrupt local Safavid authorities overtaxed the local population. These conditions generated a joint operation of oppressed Sunni Shirvanis and the Lezghi warriors of Hajji Davud. Hajji Davud's rebellion had far-reaching consequences: it provided an excuse for Czar Peter to invade Iran and, in the long run, and it inaugurated the autonomy of this part of the Caucasus.

R.M.

### 3.3.C The Czarist Period

- ĀKHÜNDZĀDA, Mīrzā Fath 'Alī, *Maktūbāt* [Letters], intro. and comment M. Sobhdam, Düsseldorf: Mard-e Emrūz, 1364[1985], 40-5-228 p.

M. Sobhdam takes to his name a book already published in Tehran by Bāqer Mo'menī in the years 1968-70, and the introduction has been "borrowed" from Fereydūn Ādamiyat (*Andīshehā-ye M.F. Ākhūndzāde*, Tehran: Khwārazmī, 1970). Let's also remark that M. Sobhdam is a penname. H.N.

- [ĀKHÜNDZĀDA] ĀKHÜNDUFF, Mīrzā Fath 'Alī, *Maktūbāt-e Kamāl al-Dowle* =



*Kāmalīuddövlə məktubaları* [Kamāl al-Dowle's Letters], intro. Hāmed Mahmūdžāde, Baku: Elm, 1986 (Azerbaijanyn klassik irsy), 12-187 p.

M.F. Ākhūndžāde (1812-1878), of Azeri origin, was one of the greatest figures of the nineteenth century on the level of literature and literary critic. He was also the first Persian play-writer by the amount of his satirical dramas, some of which like *Khasīs* ("The Miser") were directly influenced by Molière, whose works were very fashionable in the nineteenth century Caucasus, in Persia and in Egypt. Moreover M.F.A. was the first who proposed a new Latin alphabet to the Ottoman and Persian governments, in order to struggle against the Islamic religious culture, that he attacks openly and violently in his *Maktūbāt*, imaginary letters exchanged between an Indian prince and a Persian one on the miserable condition of the Muslims, in particular of the Shiites in Persia, in comparison with the progress of the Western world. Ākhūndžāde's theater was written in Azeri language and he himself was living in Tiflis, of which H. Mahmūdžāde takes argument for defining him as a Russophile philosopher. Beside fragments copied from the book by Fereydūn Ādamiyat (*Andīshehā-ye M.F. Ākhūndžāde*, Tehran: Khwārazmī, 1970), the editor's introduction does not bring anything new on the subject; one can find there only a series of stereotypes such as: "All M.F.A.'s writings are characterized by humanism, compassion for mankind and international solidarity" (p. 7).

H.N.

■ ALTSTADT-MIRHADI, Audrey, "The Forgotten Factor: The Shi'i Mullahs of Pre-Revolutionary Baku," in Ch. Lemercier-Quelquejay, G. Veinstein & S.E. Wimbush, eds., *Passé turco-tatar, présent soviétique. Etudes offertes à Alexandre Bennigsen*, Paris: EHESS – Louvain: Peeters, 1986: 345-365.

The author studies the place and the role of the Shiite mullahs in Baku from 1897 onwards, as well as their traditional schools, their teaching programmes, their mode of administration, their economic and religious positions. The author defines with detail the characteristics of Shiite mullahs, whose "influence is not universal as the pope's," but individual and regional. For this reason the fatwa taken by one of them can be contested by another one (p. 353). The author also remarks the deep impact of the mullahs of Persia on the Shiite clergy of the Southern Caucasus. A second part of the paper is devoted to the relations between the mullahs and the Muslims, on the first hand and on the other hand the Russians and the other Christian communities at the eve of the Russian revolution of 1905. On this topic, the paper loses a part of its scientific quality and impartiality, when the author writes on a "Christian repression" against the Muslims, with indirect reference to the role played in it by Armenians. However we know that after 1901 the Armenian schools and churches had been submitted to more repression from the Russian authorities than the community institutions of the Muslims, the economic and political strength of which was less feared by the Czarist government. In the same logic, the author keeps silent on the role played by the mullahs of Baku, in connection with the Russian administration, in the incitation of the Muslims to the massacre of the Armenians of this city (from 1904 to 1906) with weapons provided by the

authorities.

H.N.

- BOURNOUTIAN, George A., transl., *Russia and the Armenians of Transcaucasia, 1797-1889. A Documentary Record*, Costa Meza, CA: Mazda Publishers, 1998, 578 p., 8 maps, appendices, bibliographical notes, bibliography, index.

The present work offers the first publication in English translation of a large range of documents written in Russian, in Armenian, in Persian and in Georgian about the Armenians of the Southern Caucasus in the nineteenth century. Most of these documents come from the collection of the *Akty, sobrannye Kavkazskoi arkheograficheskoi komissiei* published between 1866 and 1904, in part under the responsibility of the Russian paleographer of French origin Adolphe Berger (Adol'f Berzhe). The twelve published volumes of these *Akty* contain mainly the correspondence of numerous Russian officials of the Northern and Southern Caucasus with their respective central administrations, with Russian diplomats in post in Iran or in the Ottoman Empire, as well as with religious and secular representatives of the Armenian, Georgian and Muslim communities of Russia, of the Caucasus, of Iran and of the Ottoman Empire. Some of these documents also come from varied funds of Russian, Georgian and Armenian archives, as well as from some archive collections in Turkey and Iran.

S.A.D.

- SAMSONADZE, M. M., *Torgovlia v Gruzii (pervaia tret' XIX veka)* [Trade in Georgia (First Third of the Nineteenth Century)], Tbilisi: Mechniereba, 1990, 135 p.

This study considers the trade in Georgia during the first third of the 19th century, that is the period following the Russian annexation of the independent kingdom of Eastern Georgia (*Kartli-Kakheti*), during which Georgia became more and more oriented toward Russia and Europe. Most of the study is devoted to this orientation as well as to internal trade and the growth of a capitalistic merchant class in Georgia, but relations with Iran and Turkey receive considerable attention as well. Discussing commercial links between Georgia and the Middle East, the author acknowledges the growing preponderance of trade with Russia, yet he maintains that despite the two wars that were fought between Russia and Iran, commercial interaction between Georgia and Iran increased rather than declined in the early nineteenth century. Indeed, as Georgia began to industrialize in this period, its demand for raw material for its textile industry was in part met by supplies of cotton from Iran. After Russia eased transit tariffs for commercial traffic in 1821, Georgia also became a crossroads for transit trade between Europe and the Middle East. As a result, Iranian towns such as Tabriz and Khoy began to be frequented by Georgian traders, some of whom bought supplies from as far away as the annual fair of Leipzig in Germany.

R.M.

- SWIETOCHOWSKI, Tadeusz, *Russian Azerbaijan 1905-1920*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985, XIII-256p. maps, bibliography, index.

On the basis of a rich documentation and in close connection with the historical and

social context of the time, the author studies the successive steps of the formation of a modern national identity among the Muslims of Azerbaijan. A first part is devoted to the colonization of the country (as soon as 1828), its Russification (as soon as 1881), its urbanization (notably with the growth of the petroleum production from 1859, and more particularly from 1871 onwards), followed by the penetration of foreign capitals (after 1889) and a strong demographic growth in Baku. A very welcome second part studies the economic and social relations between the region's varied communities: the Christians, mainly Armenians, better "organized" in dynamic movements (p. 40) and the Muslims, poorly protected and taking refuge in their own "isolation," so more exposed to be exploited by the government, which goes as far as inciting them to a religious war against the Armenians after February 1905. As far as the relations with the Iranians and the Iranian revolution of 1906 are concerned, T.S. remarks the awakening of the Muslim intelligentsia, the creation of the first political parties (*Himmat* and later on the *Musavat*) and gives the date of 1906 as that of the foundation of social-democracy in Tabriz (which in fact must be dated of 1905). In this field, the works by G. Haupt (non-quoted by the author) and those by A. Bennigsen have not been outdated. The last chapters are devoted to the "arrival" of the Soviets and to the First World War, during which the Azerbaijanis under the influence of Ottoman pan-Islamism think in terms of *ummat* instead of *millat*, whence the Persians, who were present at the peace conference in 1919, were then dreaming to a "recovery" of Azerbaijan and of the whole Southern Caucasus (p. 155). In short, an interesting and necessary work for a better interpretation of the contemporary history of the Iranian and former Soviet Azerbaijan.

H.N.

### 3.3.D The Soviet and Current Periods

- ASHNIN, F. D., ALPATOV, V. M., "Delo Rukhully Akhundova [Ruh-Allah Akhundov's Case]," *Vostok* 2000/2: 91-108.

Based mainly on the archive of the former NKVD of Transcaucasia, this paper reconstructs the political circumstances of the arrest and execution of the Azerbaijani SR, then Bolshevik political leader R. Akhundov (1897-1938), in the framework of the great terror of 1937-38, and of faction struggles inside the Communist Party of Azerbaijan. The authors have tried to go beyond the accusations of the 1930s, and to cast light — thanks to testimonies given during the rehabilitations process in the mid-1950s — on the inner antagonisms of the Azerbaijani CP in the 1920s and early 1930s, notably between the "internationalists" led locally by Akhundov and the "national Communists" gathered behind Nariman Narimanov, then between Akhundov and Bagirov, the leader of the Azerbaijani CP from 1933 to 1953. Although the documentation of the present paper is principally made of retrospective documents, the testimonies added to Akhundov's file for his rehabilitation after 1953 allow the authors to provide captivating information on the logic of political struggle and repression in the Southern Caucasus during the first two decades of the Soviet period.

S.A.D.

- BOURNOUTIAN, George A., *A History of Armenian People*, Costa Mesa (CA): Mazda Publishers, 2 vols., 1993, 174 p., 1994, 237 p.

The two volumes offered by the author, who teaches in the USA as a specialist of the Middle Eastern and of Armenian history, aim at bringing to the knowledge of the Armenians and non-Armenians a clear and complete history of the Armenian people. The eleven chapters of the first volume trace an evolution punctuated by the reign of different Armenian dynasties, from the eleventh century BCE to the end of the fifteenth century CE. Those dynasties have ruled over the destinies of Armenians who were the majority over a territory which was expanding or shrinking according to circumstances. He finishes this first volume at a moment when, under the pressure of Turkic peoples, the Armenians lost the majority for becoming a minority. The twelve chapters of the second volume are articulated around each component of the Armenian diaspora, around the significance of what has been called by historians "the Armenian question," around the controversies about the genocide, and around the hopes arisen by the Armenian Republic and its difficulties under the Soviet domination from 1921 to 1991.

The author focuses mainly on the political and cultural evolution of the Armenians. We then follow their vicissitudes under the expansion of the Parthians, of the Romans, of the Sassanians, of the Arabs — a little bit rapidly for the latter — and of the Turks. These vicissitudes give testimony of the crossroads position of the Armenian territory between Europe and Asia, a position which has been maintained under the Ottoman, Russian and Persian empires, and which made this territory a key issue of the East - West relations in the twentieth century. We deal here with the difficulty to define exactly the territory occupied by the Armenians, and to make coincide sovereignty, space and time — a question made more difficult by the divergent opinions of nineteenth and twentieth centuries Armenian political parties on this matter. The author underlines the key features of the cultural evolution and of the identity phenomenon: Armenian Christianity, with its part of legends and realities, the Armenian language and the fixation of its alphabet in the fifth century CE, the different protagonists of this culture. The economic evolution, although it is not totally absent from the work, is dealt with more discretely.

The reader will appreciate to benefit from the original documents to which the author has had access thanks to his great knowledge of the Armenian, Persian and Russian language. Moreover the author indicates whether the historical sources familiar to the readers of his previous works on the history of Erevan or of Qarabagh are poor or discussed. The referenced works are in voluntarily limited number and among them there is a strong majority of publications in English. Sixteen tables of comparative chronology enrich the whole volume and localise with much precision the history of the Armenians inside universal history — to the risk that a certain periods of time the little Armenian kingdom occupies a much room as major empires, whence neighbouring states of a comparable significance are ignored. Although the author remains an unfailing advocate of the Armenian exception, the numerous arguments which back up his defence, the two indexes of proper names, the 29 reproductions, the selective

bibliographies as well as the 43 maps which illustrate the changes which have appeared with time, and which bring out of the shade communities now solidly established throughout the world can only encourage to read this interesting and clear synthesis of the history of the Armenians. F.H.

### 3.4 Western Central Asia

#### 3.4.A General Works

■ AKHMEDOV, B. A., ed., *Materialy po istorii Srednei i Tsentral'noi Azii, X-XIX vv.* [Materials on the History of Middle and Central Asia, 10th-19th Centuries], Tashkent: Akademiia nauk Uzbekskoi SSR, 1988, 414 p.

This work signed by a well-known historian is not a monograph, but a selection of fragments of Arabic, Persian and Turkic chronicles, in Russian translation, concerning the "social-political history and the cultural life of the Central Asian peoples" (p. 3) and their contacts with Eastern Turkestan and China. The translated and quoted fragments are of varied length, sometimes very short; only some thirty works are represented for the period from the tenth to the nineteenth century. Although non exhaustive, the work constitutes a sort of rapid and convenient guide among the Oriental chronicles (from Tabarī, through Ibn Battūta, Bābur, up till Sang Muhammad Badakhshī). The book offers a useful complement to another collection of historical documents (also in Russian translation) entitled *Istoriia Uzbekistana v istochnikakh...* : see *infra* the comment under Lunin. M.S.

■ ALEKSEEV, V. P., ed., *Materialy k etnicheskoi istorii naseleniia Srednei Azii* [Materials for the Ethnic History of the Population of Middle Asia], Tashkent: Fan, 1986.

This collective volume gathers articles entirely devoted to the ethnogenesis of the Uzbeks (E. E. NERAZIK on medieval Khwarezm, K. S. SHANIAZOV on the 14th-17th cc.). The contribution by B. A. AKHMEDOV concerns the use of written sources in the study of the Uzbek ethnic history. B. D. KOCHNEV deals with the Turkization of Ferghana through numismatic materials. G. K. KHODZHAIEVA uses a genetic study implemented in Uzbekistan including their results of expeditions realized since the early twentieth century, and she is also with E. L. USMANOVA the author of a research on the region of Samarqand about serology, while dermatology and odontology are highly praised fields among Soviet geneticists, who are willing to take profit of their rich population funds for a better understanding of the genesis of migratory phenomena. C.P.

■ BABAKHODZHAIEV, Marat, dir., *Istoriia narodov Uzbekistana* [History of the Peoples of Uzbekistan], Tashkent: Fan, 1992, 2 vols., 184+219 p., ill., chronology.

No index, obviously, or bibliographical references must be searched for in this work

intended for university teaching, and which must be taken as it is, in conformity with the Soviet tradition of great historical syntheses. Just after its publication, however, the book has been submitted to harsh discussions in the Uzbekistani specialized press, which has notably criticized it for a too conformist observance of the rules of Soviet history writing, in particular its "internationalism": since the proclamation of the independence in 1991, one speaks more in Tashkent of the history of the Uzbeks than of the history of Uzbekistan. In fact, the main innovation of the book, in comparison with the Soviet period, is a new periodisation of modern history, with a bigger room given to the armed upheavals of the colonial period, to the Jadid movement between the revolutions of 1905 and 1917, and to the territorial autonomies of the revolutionary years of 1917-18.

S.A.D.

■ BREGEL, Yuri, assisted by Ryan Gliha and John McKane, *Historical Maps of Central Asia, 9th-19th Centuries A.D.*, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University (Research Institute for Inner Asian Studies), 2000, [III] p., [11] maps.

This short book, that will prove very useful to students and teachers in Central Asian history, contains eleven historical maps of Central Asia (historical provinces and oases; main regions and trade routes from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century; then general situations: in the second half of the ninth century CE; in the early thirteenth century CE; in the mid-fourteenth century; in the second half of the fifteenth century; in the early sixteenth century; in the mid-sixteenth century; in the mid-seventeenth century; in the second half of the eighteenth century; in the first half of the nineteenth century). The colonial period has been let aside, as well as the Soviet and current periods. In spite of its experimental character and simple presentation, the booklet constitutes an interesting pedagogical tool and fills an obvious gap of publications on Central Asia.

S.A.D.

■ CHEKHOVICH, O. D., "Reliktovye klauzy sredneaziatskikh aktov [Relic Clauses of Middle Asian Acts]," in F. Girs, E.A. Davidovich, M. Osmanov, eds., *Pamiatniki istorii i literatury Vostoka: period feodalizma. Stat'i i soobshcheniia*, Moscow: Nauka, 1986: 57-65.

The author questions the apparent immobility of the composition of the documents relative to the transactions between private persons in Islamic Central Asia. This specialist of source study focuses her attention on the place of varied clauses contained in the selling contracts, the evolution of terminology employed for rendering the notions made necessary by tradition and those, in particular, of judicial capacity of contracting peoples and guarantee for the latter. These considerations bring the author to cast light on the existence of relic clauses since the fifteenth century, a period in which the redaction of acts was not made anymore in Arabic but in Persian language. The analysis is based on an unpublished selling act of 1334/1915, on a quarter of a *tanāb* in the neighborhood of Bukhara, translated and commented, to which are confronted extracts of older documents, from the fifteenth century and from the pre-Mongol Middle Ages.

V.F.

- CROWE, Yolande, "Samarqand," *EI* 8, 1995: 1031-1038, fig., bibliography.

The second edition of the *EI* has long distinguished itself, like the first one, for its lack of interest in Central Asian matters. The long paper devoted to Samarqand is part of the consolation prizes dispersed in the last volumes of the collection. The present historical survey insists on the modalities of the Islamicization; it is followed by a short description of the monuments of the city and of its neighborhoods. S.A.D.

- ERTÜRK, Korkut A., ed., *Rethinking Central Asia: Non-Eurocentric Studies in History, Social Structure and Identity*, Reading: Ithaca Press, 1999, vi-202 p.

The common theme of the present volume is made of a systematic comparison between Central Eurasian societies with data from the history of the Ottoman Empire and modern Turkey. Most articles are revised and updated versions of papers given at the Central Asian Republics and Turkey Conference held at the Middle East Centre, University of Utah, July 14-16, 1994. In his general foreword, the editor points out some lacunae of "Western" research on Central Asia, a region still often studied with no great care for its specific and richly documented history (1-9). Several papers in the volume consist of summaries of books published before 1999 by the same authors. Such is for instance the case of Andre Gunder FRANK's contribution, "Re-Orient: From the Centrality of Central Asia to China's Middle Kingdom," which develops an earlier thesis that until the Industrial Revolution, Europeans showed merely able to take part in an Asian-centred economy, thanks to the African and American resources accumulated through the slave trade. The same synthesis of a previously published work is given in the short contribution by Isenbike TOGAN, "Patterns of Legitimization of Rule in the History of the Turks:" the author analyses how major changes in the legitimization of rule among Central Eurasian nomads have coincided with periods of rupture in internal redistributive patterns, when reappeared the questions of local redistribution versus accumulation. In a paper on "Central Asian Societies and the Oral Literature of Epic Heroes," Lois A. GIFFEN identifies three stages in the evolution of the Central Asian Turkic oral epic literature: 1) the heroic folktale; 2) the classical heroic poem or epos; and 3) the epic romance of later "feudalism." Sharon BAŞTUĞ in "Tribe, Confederation and State among Altaic Nomads of the Asian Steppe," concerns herself with understanding the specific structure of the patrilineal descent system among the Altaic people. She argues that the traditional form of descent of the Altaic pastoral nomadic peoples was the segment-type lineage system. Serif MARDIN's "Abdurreshid Ibrahim and Zeki Velidi Togan in the History of the Muslims of Russia" shows how the intellectual tone within the Jadid movement in the Volga-Urals region of Russia shifted from an Islamic cultural renewal to Turkic nationalism in the span of a few decades. Inspired by Hamid Algar's famous paper on Shaykh Zayn-Allah Rasuliyyev (1992), the paper shows a relatively new attention to the heritage of the Naqshbandiyya-Mujaddidiyya in the modern Muslim Central Eurasian intellectual circles. The next paper, by A. Aydın ÇEÇEN on "Uzbekistan between Central Asia and the Middle East: Another Perspective," provides a good illustration of the risk of writing at too high a

level of generality. The author's focus on specific ways of modernization in Central Asia and Uzbekistan's historical links with the Middle East has been more sharply developed during the past decade in many other publications (*e.g.*, Menashri 1998). Fortunately, Isenbike TOGAN's second contribution to this volume, "In Search of an Approach to the History of Women in Central Asia," would dispense any doubt that the reader may have felt on the validity of the academic postulates of the present volume. In this paper the author tries to identify those historical dynamics, rather than Islam *per se*, that have been responsible for fluctuations in the intensity of patriarchal domination on women among various Turkic peoples. In Togan's account, patriarchal domination and the rule of private property intensify in Central Asia at times when political power weakens in the centre and tribes re-emerge as powerful autonomous forces. Togan's paper with its appeal for comparative gender history as a key to global history, and to a general dissociation of ideas on Islam and Islamized societies, is a major contribution to a necessary rupture with the ethnic and religious essentialism which still dominates in the discourse of Western media (more than in Western academia) on the worlds of Islam in general. In this sense and to this extent, the present volume perfectly fulfils the goal that its editor was assigning to it.

More detailed review by Stéphane A. Dudoignon in *CESR* 3/1 (2004): 24-27.

S.A.D.

■ FOURNIAU, Vincent, *Histoire de l'Asie centrale*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1994 (Que Sais-je?), 128 p.

It is difficult to describe in a few words a work the ambition of which — this is a law of the collection of which it is a part — is inversely proportional to its size. Gathering three millennia of proto-history and history of Central Asia in such a little amount of pages was a challenge indeed, of which the author has quite successfully managed to get out, offering students and the larger audience an easily accessible and particularly clear book. Among the necessarily numerous motives of dissatisfaction after such a reading, we will deplore a restrictive conception of "Central Asia," which has been limited here to the Russians' "Middle Asia" (*Sredniaia Aziia*), to which Kazakhstan has been added. Accepting without discussing them the categories of Russian and Soviet geography and history, the author tends to project in the very long duration a space and political boundaries which are in fact inherited from a recent history (since the definitions adopted here are not earlier than the late nineteenth century colonisation). The volume forgets the Volga-Urals region, Southern Siberia, Eastern Turkestan (Xinjiang) and Greater Khurasan, which however belong to one and the same entity, from the viewpoint of ethnic history which is the author's, inspired by Russian and Soviet classical literature, as well as from the viewpoint of political or intellectual history. As to the postulate of an explanation of the genesis of contemporary macro-ethnic groups (the Uzbeks and Kazakhs in particular, who are given a particular attention by the author) through the conquest-migrations of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries and through the political entities which appeared in the aftermath of these phenomena ("Uzbek"



khanates, "Kazakh" hordes), they are based on a form of nominalism and a century of ethno-centered history writing, which does not take into account the fluctuating character, permanently reinvented, of collective identities among the very different groups which constitute the Muslim populations of Central Asia. The long and the middle duration, largely privileged by Soviet historians, can give the impression that the events of the twentieth century have been determined by multi-secular determinations, and so they encourage an essentialist vision of the history of the Central Asian peoples. An analysis a little more ambitious of primary sources — which are not mentioned here — and more attention for the modern and contemporary period would have suggested to the author, for instance, the role played in the definition of the contemporary political space by varied ideological and political movements among the Muslim communities of the Russian Empire or by the national Communist parties in the early 1920s. The bibliography is very short. S.A.D.

- FRAGNER, Bert G., "Historische Wurzeln neuzeitlicher iranischer Identität: zur Geschichte des politischen Begriffs 'Iran' im späten Mittelalter und in der Neuzeit," in Maria Macuch, Christa Muller-Kessler & Bert G. Fragner, eds., *Studia semitica necnon iranica, Rudolpho Macuch septuagenario ab amicis et discipulis dedicata*, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1989: 79-100.

In this paper on the historical roots of the modern Iranian identity, through a history of the notion of "Īrān" in late Middle Age and the early modern period, the author argues that military power and the establishment of dynastic regimes have into the 20th century been overwhelmingly the work of militant tribal power of mostly Turkish origin. The author notes that in the entire Islamic world similar historical conditions are to be found only in Central Asia. The administrative and fiscal system that arose in Iran under the Mongol influence further drew the country into the Central Asian orbit, distinguishing its governmental practices from those of the Ottoman and Mamluk states. On the basis of this pattern, the author suggests considering an Iranian — Central Asian block, distinct from an Islamic — Mediterranean block, as an analytical category.

R.M.

- GAFUROV, B. G., *Tadzhiki. Drevneishaia, drevniaia i srednevekovaia istoriia* [The Tajiks. Prehistory, Ancient and Medieval History], 2nd ed., postface B.A. Litvinskii, Dushanbe: Irfon, 1989, 2 vols., 382+479 p., 3 maps, ill.

This book published under the signature of B. Gafurov (1908-1977), a Tajik politician and academician, is in reality by B.A. Litvinskii (mentioned in this new edition as a "redactor"), helped by some other specialists, among others I.S. Braginskii for the Islamic period. Continued up till the mid-18th century, it is not limited to the territory of the current Republic of Tajikistan (which from a historical viewpoint would have been meaningless), but encompasses all sedentary Central Asia, with a particular insistence on the basins of the Amu-Darya and the Zarafshan (the Bactriana and Sogdiana of ancient times). The present edition reproduces the text of 1972, with minor correc-

tions. As Litvinski himself recognizes (t. 2, p. 334), the ideological packaging is outdated, with his periodisation in "primitive community," "slave relations" and "feudal regime," and its sometimes excessive efforts for giving substance to popular revolts on which we know in fact very few things. Remain qualities of information and clarity, which have made this book the basic textbook of the young generation of Soviet archaeologists and historians of Central Asia. Litvinskii's postface, under the modest title "Bobodzhan Gafurovich Gafurov and his work," gives in 50 pages an excellent description of the results of the archaeological and historical researches which have been implemented since the book's first edition.

F.G.

- GANKOVSKII, Iu. V., ed., *Rossia i Afganistan* [Russia and Afghanistan], Moscow: Nauka, 1989, 208 p., appendix.

In this useful and solid collection of articles on the political and economic relations between the Russian Empire and Afghanistan, from 1764 to 1917, the papers are classified in chronological order, which gives the whole set of the aspect of a continuous treatment of the subject. The authors have been largely using the archive collections of Moscow and Tashkent; for this reason, they bring a lot of unpublished data, notably in the form of statistics, on the bilateral commercial exchanges. In the appendices, a short overview of Afghan studies in Russia between 1840 and 1910 brings the reader's attention on studies which, although not very well known, and poorly accessible in the West, nevertheless make of the necessary counterbalance to the British publications of the same period, on which the specialists' information remains too often exclusively based.

D.B.

- HIDOIATOV, Goga Abramovich, *Mening zhonazhon tarikhim* [My Beloved History], Tashkent: Uqituvchi, 1992, 304 p.

Published in Russian at the same publishing house in 1990, this textbook with a meaningful title and important printing (fifty thousands copies) offers a historical survey of Uzbekistan, from the "origins" to the early twentieth century. The Soviet period still remains a taboo for historians; however the author could include in his work some innovations, brought about by the proclamation of Uzbekistan sovereignty in 1990, one year before the independence. The most significant of these innovations is a new interpretation of the anti-colonial upheavals of the last third of the nineteenth century and of the Jadid modernist trend of the 1900s-1910s, both introduced from now on as parts of a same movement of national liberation — an interesting example of the continuation of the Soviet over-politicization of history writing in post-Soviet Central Asia.

S.A.D.

- JAN, Michel, ed., *Le voyage en Asie Centrale et au Tibet: anthologie des voyageurs occidentaux, du Moyen Âge à la première moitié du XX<sup>e</sup> siècle*, Paris: Robert Laffont, 1992, 1482 p.

A first part of this impressive collection of texts of Western travelers in Central Asia

and Tibet is devoted to medieval forerunners: Plano Carpini, Rubrouck, Marco Polo, Clavijo, etc., before dealing with Russian and Chinese, Soviet and Chinese Communist Central Asia. One may regret the absence of translations from Russian travelers, often better informed than their modern Western counterparts, but the compiler, a sinologist, must be congratulated for having cleverly associated the Western and Eastern Turkestan for the modern and contemporary period. S.A.D.

■ KALTER, Johannes, PAVALOI, Margareta, eds., *Uzbekistan. Heirs to the Silk Road*, London: Thames and Hudson, 1997, 360 p., 712 ill., maps, bibliography.

This rich album has been published simultaneously in three languages (a German original and two translations, English and Russian), for accompanying the exhibition "Erben der Seidenstraße — Usbekistan" held in 1996 in the Linden-Museum of Stuttgart, then in the Museum für Völkerkunde of Berlin, and last in the Museum voor Volkenkunde of Rotterdam. Organised with great means, but also with a remarkable know-how in the exploitation of a great number of German, European or Central Asian public collections, this travelling exhibition gave an occasion for bringing to the knowledge of larger audiences pieces of art or old photographic documents rarely shown and which make the great interest of this splendid book.

Remembering astutely that Uzbekistan is a recent creation — after a foreword in which the Uzbekistani president Karimov has praised the "antiquity" of his country... —, the authors of the different articles resituate the history of Transoxiana in different durations, in four different chapters: the ancient silk roads; Central Asia in Islamic times; Turkestan under the "Uzbek" khanates; last independent Uzbekistan. The papers on general history are short and mark the main chronological articulations; a majority of the texts concern history of art and their main purpose is to serve — what they do very well — a particularly bright iconography. S.A.D.

■ KHUJANDI, Orifjon Iahiozod, *Khujandnoma io qissaho az ta'rikhi Khujand va Khujandiion* [The Book of Khujand, or Narratives from the History of Khujand and the Khujandis], Khujand: Nashrioti davlatii ba nomi Rahim Jalil, 1994.

This very interesting short work has been written by a local erudite from the city of Khujand in Northern Tajikistan; it offers us a short historical survey of the city, several collections of legends on its foundation and anecdotes on its history from the hagiography of prominent local and regional Muslim saints. These elements are followed by statistics on the town's madrasas at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, of historical data on the figure of Bībī 'Umr al-Nisā Ātūn b. Hājji Sa'dī (1896-1979), the founder of the female "Mother's Madrasa" (Madrasa-yi Ācha) that is said to have remained active during throughout the Soviet period, and on this madrasa's former students. The work also includes lists of the city's madrasas and mosques. It is typical of the current expansion of neo-traditional local history writing in Tajikistan since the independence in 1991. S.A.D.

■ LUNIN, B. V., ed., *Istoriia Uzbekistana v istochnikakh. Izvestiia puteshestvennikov, geografov i uchenykh XVI — pervoi poloviny XIX v.* [The History of Uzbekistan in the Sources. Data from the Travellers, Geographers and Scholars from the 16th to the First Half of the 19th Century]. Tashkent: Akademiia nauk Uzbekskoi SSR, 1988, 256 p.

This very useful bibliographical work surveys the historical and geographical sources, mainly Russian, Persian and Uzbek, about present-day Uzbekistan. More than thirty authors are quoted according to the chronological order. Each notice is composed by a short introduction about the author and the source, followed by extracts of the work (in Russian translation if it has been written in another language). The comment is reduced to the minimum, but it indicates the most important bibliographical references, Russian and Soviet, about each source. Among the most interesting are extracts from the *Mihmān-nāma-yi Bukhārā* by Fazl-Allāh al-Amīn b. Rūzbihān al-Khunjī (early sixteenth century, a chronicle with an anti-Safavid orientation), accounts by Russian travellers and envoys to Bukhara, Khiva and Tashkent, and by Uzbek envoys to Russia (e.g. that by I.D. Khokhlov in 1620-1622 or that of T. Burnashev's travels in 1794-1795 and 1800, etc.), as well as extracts of the first scientific works of the Russians on these regions of Central Asia (e.g. the lexicographical works by V.N. Tatishchev in the 1730s-40s, E. Eversmann's publications on traditional medicine in 1820 or A.O. Kornilovich's works on Russia's commerce with Central Asia in the same 1820s). In an appendix, since it goes beyond the chronological limits of the work, has been published an extract, in a Russian translation, of the account of Clavijo's travel in Samarqand in 1403-1406. First edition: *Istoriia Uzbekistana v istochnikakh*, Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo "Fan" Uzbekskoi SSR, 1984 (Akademiia nauk UzSSR, Institut istorii), 222 p.; third edition: *Istoriia Uzbekistana v istochnikakh: Uzbekistan v soobshcheniakh puteshestvennikov i uchenykh: 20-80-e gody XIX v.*, Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo "Fan" Uzbekskoi SSR, 1990 (Akademiia nauk UzSSR, Institut istorii), 192 p. M.S.

□ MUMINOV, Ashirbek, RICHARD, Francis, SZUPPE, Maria, eds., *Patrimoine manuscrit et vie intellectuelle de l'Asie centrale islamique*, Aix-en-Provence: Édisud, 1999, 232 p., VIII pl., 13 fig. (*Cahiers d'Asie centrale*: 7).

This volume gathers a part of the communications given at a colloquium held in Tashkent in October 1997 by the French Institute of Central Asian Studies — except one paper given in April 1998 in the Fourth Section of the Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes (MUMINOV, Ashirbek, "Fonds nationaux et collections privées de manuscrits en écriture arabe de l'Ouzbékistan," 17-38). In this contribution, the author, no doubt one of the best specialists of Central Asia's resources in manuscript sources, offers an extremely interesting panoramic survey of the main manuscript collections of Uzbekistan, not omitting several private collections discovered since the countries' independence. The following study is devoted to a very rich and still under-studied public collection: that of the A.A. Semenov Library of the Institute of History of the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan, in Dushanbe, which owns numerous richly illustrated manuscripts and of several manuscripts of a particular significance for the histo-

ry of modern Central Asia (DODKHUOEVA, Larisa & Lola, "Manuscripts orientaux du Tadjikistan: la collection Semenov," 39-55, 5 ills. in II pl.). This text is followed by two short studies by two reknown French specialists of codicology: RICHARD, Francis, "Manuscripts persans de la Bibliothèque Nationale de France se rapportant à l'Asie centrale musulmane," 57-63; DÉROCHE, François, "Note sur les fragments coraniques anciens de Katta Langar (Ouzbékistan)," 65-73, 3 ills. in I pl.. As most of the authors of the present volume, F. Richard and F. Déroche insist on the still very embryonic character of our knowledge of the history of manuscript books, ancient and modern, in Central Asia, and on the resources offered by the history of the book for a global understanding of the societies of this region.

The second part of the volume is devoted to the literati and the books from the fifteenth to the seventeenth centuries. Through the identification of the seals particular to the library of Muhammad Pārsā (1345-1420), two Uzbek scholars propose a new reconstruction, sensitively more complete than the existing ones, of this book collection. On this basis, the authors give an analysis of the role played by the works by Hanafī authors in the overall process of "Hanafisation" of the Naqshbandiyya, of which Pārsā was one of the main protagonists. This evolution is resituated by the authors, both recognized specialists of the history of *fiqh* in Transoxiana, in the general context of a theoretical legitimization of the practices of the "rural clergy" in this region from the early Timurid period onwards (MUMINOV, Ashirbek, ZIYADOV, Shavasil, "L'horizon intellectuel d'un érudit du XV<sup>e</sup> siècle: nouvelles découvertes sur la bibliothèque de Muḥammad Pārsā," 77-98, 2 tabs.). The following study, based on an analysis of the Persian manuscripts of sixteenth and seventeenth century literary *tadhkiras*, tries to define a profile of the literati (*adībs*) in Transoxiana under the Shaybanids and the Janids; although the word "*intellectuel*" seems quite anachronistic for denominating literati in the Muslim Iranian cultural space of the considered period, the present study casts light on the blurred outlines and the non-professional status of this category, which includes individuals coming from the most varied socio-professional categories of pre-modern Khurasan and Transoxiana's urban milieus (SZUPPE, Maria, "Lettrés, patrons, libraires. L'apport des recueils biographiques sur le rôle du livre en Asie centrale aux XVI<sup>e</sup> et XVII<sup>e</sup> siècles," 99-116, 68 bibliographical notes). Through an *in situ* inquiry very similar to a detective work, the author of the following study identifies the signature of several painters of the workshops of the Astarkhanid prince 'Abd al-'Azīz Khān in the painted decoration of some monuments of Samarqand and Bukhara (PORTER, Yves, "Le *kitāb-khāna* de 'Abd al-'Azīz Khān (1645-1680) et le mécénat de la peinture à Boukhara," 117-136, 12 ills. on v pl., 72 bibliographical notes). Y. Porter raises interesting questions on the role of outer influences — Indian through Mughal miniature painting, Chinese via imported blue-and-white porcelain — on the evolution of miniature and wall-painting in Transoxiana in the second half of the seventeenth century. Let's remark also interesting reflections on inverted parallelisms between political history and the history of artistic practices: the author expresses the hypothesis that the importance of architectural patronage under 'Abd al-'Azīz Khān may have served to

hide the effects of an overall economic and political recession.

The third part, analogous to the first, comes back to the description of several sets of documents or inscriptions, and to the possibilities of interpretation that they offer to historians. Two of these studies are signed by well-known duettists of the exploration of manuscript resources of Uzbekistan. The first one is devoted to the catalogue that the famous jurist, literati and bibliographer Mīrẓā Muḥammad Sharīf Sadr-i Ziyā (1867-1932) wrote of his own library in the mid-1920s, the manuscript of which is kept in the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies in Tashkent, Uzbekistan. The analysis and the transcription in a table of this list of works allow us to have an excellent idea of the content of this library, when it shows the diffusion through the learned circles of Bukhara of techniques of cataloguing borrowed from the Russian public libraries (for an observation of the same phenomenon in Khiva, see the following study). It is perhaps regrettable that the authors did not think to include in their study other sources, more telling, for their intellectual portrait of Ziyā, in particular the now published manuscript of his "Diary" (Rūz-nāma) located in the same Biruni Institute and very much neglected by modern historians to this day (VAHIDOV, Shadman, ERKINOV, Aftandil, "Le *fihrist* (catalogue) de la bibliothèque de Ṣadr-i Ẓiyā : une image de la vie intellectuelle dans le Mawarannahr (fin XIX<sup>e</sup> – déb. XX<sup>e</sup> s.)," 141-173, 1 ill., 1 tab.) The same type of document has been used by the authors of the following contribution for their panoramic reconstruction of the history of manuscript books in Khiva under the Russian protectorate. Among the conclusions of this study, let's note the authors' insistence on the importance of translations from Arabic and Persian languages into Chaghatay in a court milieu characterized, in compared with the other regions of Transoxiana, by the prominent place of Chaghatay Turkic language in the official practice (ERKINOV, Aftandil, VAHIDOV, Shadman, "Une source méconnue pour l'étude de la production de livres à la cour de Muḥammad Raḥīm Xān II (Khiva, fin XIX<sup>e</sup> s.)," 175-193, 3 tabs.). The author of innumerable layouts of monuments of Central Asian epigraphy, of which he is to this date the best specialist, B. Babadjanov studies the inscriptions in Arabic and Persian languages of the tombs of the Kubrawī *shaykh* Sayf al-Dīn Bākharzī and of the neo-Genghiskhanid prince Būyān-Qulī Khān, in the suburb of Fathābād in Bukhara. The author resituates the construction of the second monument, in the 1360s-70s, in the context of the period of calm which followed in Transoxiana the election of his successor Kābul Shāh (1363-1370), up till Timur's access to power and the eviction of the neo-Genghiskhanids from the government of Bukhara ([BABADZHANOV] BABAJANOV, Bakhtiyar, "Monuments épigraphiques de l'ensemble de Fathābād à Boukhara," 195-210, 1 ill., 7 fig.) The last paper, on the basis of the introduction of a little group of *waqf* documents, proposes a formal analysis of this type of documents, from the pre-Mongol era to the first years of the Soviet period. The author also suggests, although in an elliptic way, the establishment of formal models of these documents in the perspective of the future constitution of data basis accessible through the Internet (KAZAKOV, Bahadır A., "Analyse structurelle des actes de *waqf* provenant d'Asie centrale, XIII<sup>e</sup> – déb. XX<sup>e</sup> s. (dans la perspective de l'établissement de modèles pour banques de

données)," 211-232, 6 fig.).

S.A.D.

■ PETRUCCIOLI, Attilio, ed., *Bukhara: The Myth and the Architecture. Theory and Method in Islamic Architectural Design*. Proceedings of the International Symposium held at the MIT, Cambridge (MA), November 1996, Cambridge, MA: Aga Khan Program for Islamic Architecture, 1999, 186 p., ill.

Among the numerous works devoted since the early 1990s to the study and the restoration of Bukhara's monuments, the present work appears as one of the most seductive. Inside it, articles on urban history happily neighbor with works on the building techniques or on city-planning practices. A short introductory study introduces current research on the origins of the city; its author insists on the fact that in spite of its ancient population, Bukhara gained a real significance only after the beginning of the Islamic time (FRYE, Richard N., "How Ancient is Bukhara?," 15-18). The following study confronts the data given by three tenth-century authors, al-Istakhrī, Ibn Hawqal and al-Narshakhī, on the topography of Bukhara in the Samanid period (GAUBE, Heinz, "What Arabic and Persian Sources Tell Us about the Structures of Tenth-Century Bukhara?," 19-28, 2 maps). Then comes a paper on the contributions of numismatics to our knowledge of the history of the Arab conquest of Transoxiana, and of the political role played by the Arab tribes of Bukhara in the first half of the eighth century CE (RTVELADZE, Edvard, "Coins of Ancient Bukhara," 29-37). The following study puts in perspective the information given by textual sources and the data of archaeology; its author first introduces a complete survey of the modern bibliography on Bukhara in the Samanid period; then, given the impossibility of carrying out systematic excavations, he proposes an experimental comparative typology of the cities of Transoxiana. Insisting first on the defensive preoccupations of the Soghdian society and the latter's static city-planning, the author then deals with the eighth century quick upheavals, characterized notably by the migration of the social elites towards the suburban zones, and by an exchange of their respective roles between Bukhara's centre and its suburbs (NAYMARK, Aleksandr, "The Size of Samanid Bukhara: A Note on Settlement Patterns in Early Islamic Mawarannahr," 39-60, 5 fig., 94 bibliographical notes). Then comes a study on the formation of the original city of Bukhara, focused on the distinction between the *ark* and the *shahristān*, in parallel with the creation of a large irrigation system (NEKRASOVA, E. G., "Lower Layers of Bukhara: Characteristics of Earlier Settlements," 61-69, 1 fig.). The following paper, unfortunately deprived of the lesser note, offers us a kind of guided visit of Samanid Bukhara: *ark*, *shahristān* and *rabā* (suburbs) (ASHRAFI, Firouz, "Between Conservation and Innovation: the Central Plan of Bukhara," 71-78).

Then come the two central contributions of the volume, the most significant of it with the paper by Aleksandr Naymark. Both are based on an analysis of the famous collection of documents relative to the economic activity of the *khwājas* of Jūybār (on it, see our review of the paper by Jürgen Paul in the present volume). The first of these two papers uses this collection as a source for the historical study of the spatial organization of the oasis of Bukhara, and of the relations between the city and its land in



the sixteenth century. The author casts light on the close link between the coming to power of the Janibekids in the second half of this century, and the extension of the properties of their allied the Jūybārī *khwājas*. Other transformations are studied in the longer duration, such as the extension by certain families of their properties over the whole oasis of Bukhara and even beyond. The author remarks, about the *khwājas* of Jūybār, the location of their properties along the main roads, in particular the road to Samarqand, which allowed them to transport the agricultural products from the tūmān towards the markets of the capital. Some lines are devoted to the continuity of village communities on the most part of cultivated lands — if not as a juridical entity, at least as a production structure (SCHWARZ, Florian, "Bukhara and Its Hinterland: The Oasis of Bukhara in the Sixteenth Century in the Light of the Juybari Codex," 79-92, 3 fig., 61 bibliographical notes). The second of these two papers offers us a masterly study of the evolution of land property in the village of Juzmandun during the second half of the sixteenth century. After some paragraphs of introduction to the history of the *khwāja* of Jūybār, the author sets out the content of the selling documents used for this study, before evoking the typology of the exchanged pieces of lands and the sellers' identity. A paragraph is devoted to the "reserved" (*harīm*) lands, excluding any form of private property of private use of the soil, another to the significance of Juzmandun's orchards and vineyards, which explains the Jūybārī's interest in this village. The paragraphs on the sellers' identity cast light on the social diversity of land property: if military dignitaries and the higher ranks of the class of the *khwājas* seem over-represented among the big land-owners, the acquisitions made by the Jūybārī when they were at the heights of their fame do not seem to have excessively harmed the middle and small land property in the area. The overall depiction which comes out of this study is that of a possessing class non-reduced to such or such social or professional group, even less to such or such particular family —the economic and political fortune of the *khwājas* of Jūybār in the second half of the sixteenth century appearing rather as an exceptional case in the history of the oasis of Bukhara (MCCHESNEY, Robert, "Bukhara's Suburban Villages: Juzmandūn in the Sixteenth Century," 93-119, 91 bibliographical notes).

The papers gathered in the last part concern the history of architecture and city-planning, from the Mongol period to our days. The first gives a comparative typology (the periodisation of which is borrowed from Trimingham) of the architectural complexes linked with the main *turuq* of Transoxiana (YUSUPOVA, Mavlyuda [JUSUPOVA, Mavluda], "Evolution of Architecture in the Sufi Complexes in Bukhara," 121-132, figs., photos.). Then comes a non-documented evocation of Bukhara's suburban architectural ensembles (SHARIPOV, Nasim, "Suburban Ensembles of Bukhara," 133-138, 1 fig., 2 photos.), then a synthesis of the role of two *mazārs* of Bukhara, the mausoleums of Ismā'īl Sāmānī and of 'Arab-Atā, at the chronological turn between pre-Islamic and Islamic architecture (PUGACHENKOVA, G. A., "The Role of Bukhara in the Creation of the Architectural Topology of the Former Mausoleums of Mavarannahr," 139-144, 2 figs., 1 photo.). Then come two studies on the modern and contemporary periods: one



on the upheavals of the colonial and Soviet periods (GANGLER, Annette, "Bukhara from the Russian Conquest to the Present," 145-160, 12 ill. and figs.), another on the leading conceptions of the Soviet period in the management of the architectural and city-planning heritage (AZZOUT, Mounira, "The Soviet Interpretation and Preservation of the Ancient Heritage of Uzbekistan: The Example of Bukhara," 161-173, ill.). The editor of the volume closes this impressive series of contribution with a personal paper, richly illustrated, on construction techniques (utilization of wood and bricks) in Bukhara's monuments of traditional and colonial architecture (PETRUCCIOLI, Attilio, "An Atlas of Building Elements in the City of Bukhara," 175-181, ill. and fig.). A rather abstract but significant text has been placed at the very end of the volume; it expresses the official Uzbekistani vision of the pre-modern architectural heritage and of its political utilization (USMANOV, Botir, "Revitalization of the Heritage of Uzbekistan," 183-186).

S.A.D.

- SOUCEK, Svat, *A History of Inner Asia*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000, XIII-369 p., bibliography, index.

Contrary to its title, and to the introductory map, the present book focuses not on the very large Inner Asia, but on a more limited region generally called Central Asia. Through a projection towards the remote past of political boundaries inherited from the Soviet period, the author draws correspondences between this historical region and the territory of the five newly independent states of the former Soviet Middle Asia, with two distinct chapters on Xinjiang and to the Republic of Mongolia. As to the chronological framework of this survey, it has been extended through the thirteen centuries which follow the first adoption of Islam in Transoxiana in the seventh century CE — a chronological turn which, according to the author, marks the transition "from archaeology to history." The introduction of the book has been devoted to the main landmarks of physical geography, and to some historical invariants, notably to the main religions present in the region. Then comes a succession of chapters of history, organised according to a rather classical classification: Samanids; Uighurs of Qocho; Qarakhanids; Saljuqids and Ghaznavids; the Mongol conquest; Chaghatayids; Timur and the Timurids; Shaybanids; the first Russian expansion and the fall of the Golden Horde; Buddhist Mongols; the Central Asian khanates; the Russian conquest of Central Asia; the civil war of 1917 onwards and the creation of the national republics in Soviet Central Asia; the proclamations of independences in 1991; Xinjiang in China; independent Central Asia; the Republic of Mongolia. This chronological framework reveals the author's intention to find in a more or less remote past explanations to the situation created by the proclamations of independences in 1991. One of the strengths of this work lies in its bibliography of modern works and (mainly English) translations of primary sources in Persian and in Chaghatay Turkic language. The author has showed a great care at showing, in a synthetic shape, a state of the art of our knowledge on Central Asia, in spite of his omission of numerous research works published during the last two decades in Russian and in other languages, and in spite of his total ignorance

of non-translated sources in Oriental languages, which deprives him of the possibility of innovating.

More detailed review by S.A. Dudoignon in *BCAI* 18 (2002): 101 S.A.D.

### 3.4.B Before the Russian Conquest

#### 3.4.B.a General Works

- BREGEL, Yuri, "'Arabshāhī," *EIr* 2/3, 1986: 243-245.

Very few sources exist concerning this clan which pretended to descend from Genghis Khan. Most of the works which mention it are by Soviet scholars (except that, remarkable but unpublished, by M.B. Dickson: see the bibliography). This explains the importance of the present paper, which offers a synthesis of the known data of the history of this branch of the Genghiskhanids. The 'Arabshāhī clan has dominated the region of Khwarezm between the early 10th/16th and the early 12th/18th century (Khiva was their centre). The 'Arabshāhīs came from "the steppes" together with Uzbek nomadic tribes which used to make of their military strength. They were themselves a clan parallel to that of the Shaybanids of Transoxiana, with a common ancestor (sometimes the two branches are commonly called Shaybanid). However, contrary to the Shaybanids who constantly struggled against the Safavid shahs of Iran for the possession of Khurasan, the 'Arabshāhīs were not very interested in this province, although they temporarily controlled its Northern oases. In fact, the military activity of the *sultāns* was for the most part directed against their own clan (internecine wars between cousins) or that of the Shaybanids with whom they traditionally had hostile relations. The organization of their state was based on the tribal structure of a nomadic society. As to their political system, the choice of the great khan was made according to the age principal, whence Khwarezm was distributed in apanages to the members of the reigning family (which also included the exercise of authority on an Uzbek tribe). The state of the 'Arabshāhīs of Khwarezm constituted in reality a sort of confederation of tribes, which subsisted up till the early 12th/18th century. M.S.

- BREGEL, Yuri, "Central Asia VII: In the 13th/19th Century," *EIr* 5/2, 1990: 193-205.

This very useful paper retraces the less known period of the history of Central Asia, which goes from the fall of the Tuqay Timurids to the Russian conquest, in other words from the weakening of the central power in each khanate of Transoxiana to its reinforcing. The reader finds here many details on the political episodes of the states of Bukhara, Khiva and Kokand, before the establishment of the Russian domination. The author also deals with the economic evolution of the region, favored by the emergence of three centralizing dynasties, respectively the Manghit, the Kunghrat and the Ming, as well as the region's lack of political and ethnic unity, which showed decisive for the Russian advance. The second part traces the steps of the development of the relations between Russia and Central Asia, before giving the details on the military operations

during the two decades during which was operated the administrative, economic and cultural attachment of Turkestan to Russia. C.P.

- LEVI, Scott, "India, Russia and the Eighteenth-Century Transformation of the Central Asian Caravan Trade," *JESHO* 42/4 (1999): 519-548, bibliography.

This wide-ranging article mounts a forceful attack against the traditional notion of 18th century Central Asia as a culturally stagnant and economically insignificant and peripheral region. Focusing on the north-south axis, the author first shows how even in the "chaotic" 18th century Central Asia continued to provide huge numbers of horses to the subcontinent while, in exchange, India flooded Central Asia with its renowned textiles. Russia, in turn, under Czar Peter I, made efforts to divert the trade through Astrakhan to the overland routes through Central Asia through the frontier town of Orenburg. This shift led to a re-alignment in the economic fortunes of Central Asian cities. Some of these underwent a process of de-urbanization, but this must not be equated with decline, for the loss of population of one centre implied the gain of another. While Bukhara lost people, parts of the Ferghana Valley thrived. R.M.

### 3.4.B.b *The Kazakh Hordes (Dasht-i Qipchāq)*

- EROFEEVA, I. V., "Kazakhskie khany XVIII – serediny XIX v. [Kazakh khans in the 18th and the First Half of the 19th Century]," *Vostok* 1997/3: 5-32, tab.

This important paper offers a notable contribution to the question touching the social organization of pre-modern Kazakh tribal confederations, on which we still lack factual data. Refuting both antagonistic theories which postulate the existence, or the non-existence of a unified Kazakh "state" before the Russian colonization — with the political implications that everybody can imagine —, the author calls for less abstraction and more documentary basis in the studies on these problems. According to her, any debate in this highly polemical matter should be preceded by a long term collective work on the prosopography of the Steppe wealthy of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries — a period richly documented, but much less explored by researchers which goes from the early fifteenth to the late seventeenth centuries (notably thanks to the works by V.V. Vel'iaminov-Zernov and by T.I. Sultanov). The genealogical and biographical data that the author has been extracting from a great number of the most varied sources — among which, alas, we find no vernacular text in original version... — are put in a still very basic table presenting the available data on 53 *khāns* and one important *sultān* (Abū'l-Fayz). The bibliographical references (to numerous archive documents or more or less recent Russian studies, or still to a limited amount of Oriental sources translated into Russian) are unfortunately rejected at the end of the paper, whence a good utilization of each notice would have necessitated the presence of these references at the end of each. No doubt preference should be given in the future to a constant enlargement of our documentary basis, and to the elaboration of cumulative data bases by national or international teams of researchers.

About the prosopography of notables and great figures of the Steppe, we must also remark in passing, although it is less interesting than the previous work, a study by Talgat ISHMAGAMBETOV ("Razvitie kazakhskogo isteblishmenta v kontse XIX — sere-dine XX vekov [The development of the Kazakh *establishment* from the Late Nineteenth to the Mid-Twentieth century]," *TsA* 1997/5 (11): 7-22), in which the author, on a rather meager documental basis made of for the most part of Russian works and of a collection of recently reprinted texts on the Alash Orda party, has been sketching a typology of the Kazakh social "elites" in the decades preceding the purges of the mid-1930s, according to criteria of acculturation to Russia (education in the Russian universities or in the institutes of St. Petersburg, Moscow or Omsk; election to the State Duma of Russia, etc.). S.A.D.

■ KYDYRBEKULY, Dulatbek, ANNAKULYEVA, Gul'nara, "Istoricheskii obzor kazakhsko-turk-menskikh otnoshenii [A Historical Survey of the Relations between the Kazakhs and the Turkmens]," *TsA* 1997/4 (10): 114-119.

Giving a large echo to a territory-centred vision of history, now very much in favour in the Central Asian newly independent states, the authors try to project present time towards a more remote past, through an evocation of the nomadic peoples which have succeeded each other on the territories of Kazakhstan and Turkmenistan since the most ancient times. They then deal with the Turkic populations for insisting on the place of the Oghuz in the ethnogenesis of modern nations as varied as the Tatars, the Uzbeks and the Kyrgyz. Based on a very recent Kazakh and Turkmen bibliography (which is not necessarily deprived of political ulterior motives), the historical survey of the relations between the "Kazakh" confederations and their more Southern "Turkmen" counterparts remains very vague on the nature of these links and shows a discussable taste for anachronisms (notably through the projection of the ethnic denomination "kazakh" towards a past in which this term is not documented).

An experienced historian and a better connoisseur of primary sources, Timur BEISEMBIEV ("Kazakhsko-uzbekskie svyazi v proshlom" [The Relations between the Kazakhs and the Uzbeks in the Past], *ibid.*: 120-122) does not make such mistakes: his short synthesis offers him the occasion of a useful statement on the evolution of the relations between the Kazakhs and the Uzbeks after the conquest of Transoxiana by the Shaybanid confederation, the progressive settlement of the latter, and the more or less marked acculturation of its varied components to the region's populations of Persian-speaking farmers and city-dwellers, whence the Kazakhs were being submitted, during the eighteenth century, to a series of disasters which spared the Southern populations. The author shows particularly interested in the consequences of half a century of colonization of the south of the Kazakh steppe by the khanate of Kokand, in the first half of the nineteenth century, on the evolution of the modern Kazakh society in and around the merchant cities situated north to the Syr-Darya River. S.A.D.

● MOISEEV, V. A., "K voprosu o gosudarstvennosti u kazakhov nakanune i v nachal'nyi peri-

od prisoedineniia Kazakhstana k Rossii [Contribution to the Question of Statehood among the Kazakhs at the Eve and in the Early Period of the Reunion of Kazakhstan to Russia]," *Vostok* 1995/4: 22-27.

In this study on statehood in Kazakh territory from the late 17th to the second half of the 18th century, the author first deals with the political and social structure of Kazakh society, with a special interest in zhuzes, the clan system, and the election of the khans. Second, he questions the weakness of the khans' power, in spite of their attempts at building a centralized authority. The lack of tax revenues, geographical conditions that needed vast pasture lands, and the council system of the military prevented the establishment a centralized statehood. Finally, the author proposes the concept of military democracy, khans in Kazakh territory appearing rather as leaders of the military than rulers. He argues that the notion of "Kazakh khanates" can be only an invented one. This short paper, based on imaginary arguments, has contributed to pave the way to present-days highly politicized discussions on nation- and state building in modern and contemporary Kazakhstan.

See also: *idem.*, "Ot khanov k prezidentam [From Khans to Presidents]," *Vostok* 1997/5: 190-193. N.J.

### 3.4.B.c *The Khanates of Transoxiana and the Turkmens*

■ BABABEKOV, Haidarbek, *Narodnye dvizheniia v Kokandskom khanstve i ikh sotsial'no-ekonomicheskie i politicheskie predposylki (XVIII-XIX vv.)* [The Popular Movements in the Kokand Khanate and Their Social, Economic and Political Premises (18th-19th Centuries)], Tashkent: Fan, 1990, 118 p.

The Kokand-born historian H. Bababekov — the founder in 1992 of the private Mahpirat Institute of the Peoples of Central Asia and the editor of the magazine *Turan Tarikhi* — has made himself a speciality with the study of modern and contemporary "revolts" in the Fergana Valley. The summary of a doctorate dissertation presented in 1991, the year of the independence of Uzbekistan, the work that he devotes to the "jacqueries" and city "uprisings" of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries continues the exploration work undertaken by R.N. Nabiev (*Iz istorii Kokandskogo khanstva (Feodal'noe khoziaistvo Khudoiar-Khana)*, Tashkent, 1973) and tries to cut off with some of the taboos of Soviet history writing on Central Asian "popular movements." The author of the present work proposes an analysis of the role played in the organization of these armed movements by some mystical orders hostile to the khan and to the Russian occupation — from the revolt of the *khwājas* of Chadak in 1709 to the uprising of the "fake Pulāt Khān" in 1876. S.A.D.

■ BOSWORTH, C. E., "Tādjīk — 1. Étymologie et développement linguistique primitif du terme," *EL*<sup>2</sup> 10/163-164, 1998: 64-65, bibliography.

In this short but complete history of the term *tājīk*, the author recalls the initial explanations by Quatremère and by Barthold, before explaining the more recent works by

V.A. Livshits, by W. Sundermann and by W. Henning — quoting notably the latter's hypothesis of a particular usage of the Persian term *tāzīk* in Fars, where this term would have designated since the Sassanian period the Iranian-speaking autochthonous population of this region. "Persian peoples emigrating from Fars to Transoxiana would have brought with them their own name [...], a name totally different from that of *Tāzīk* [...]" by which the Persians and the Parthians used to designate the Arabs."

See also: FRAGNER, B., "Tādjīk — 2. Développement historique du terme à partir de l'époque timouride," *ibid.*: 65-66, bibliography. The author first deals with the usage of the term *tājīk* by the Muslim Turks of Central Asia between the tenth and the early twentieth century, in particular after the Timurid time, from which the opposition *Turk* / *Tājīk* expressed principally a functional social segregation. Another turn is made of Russian colonization, after which the statisticians of the empire tended to apply the term *tājīk* to all the populations of Transoxiana, from the Ferghana and the Pamir speaking Iranian languages and dialects, whence the term *sārt* was applied to Turkic-speaking populations of urban and rural areas — with no account for the largely diffused practice of bilingualism. From the beginning of the Soviet period onwards, in the official culture, we observe the superposition of the notion of *Tājīk* to the linguistic term *tājīkī*, in the goal of separating into two different entities the Persian-speaking Tajiks from the Turkic-speaking Uzbeks (the tribal denomination *uzbek* covering then the colonial term *sārt*).

S.A.D.

■ BREGEL, Yuri, transl. and ed., *Firdaws al-Iqbāl: History of Khorezm by Shir Muhammad Mirab Munis*, Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1999 (Islamic History and Civilization, Studies and texts: 28), 718-3 p., maps and genealogical tabs.

Yuri Bregel's magnificent translation of the *Firdaws al-iqbāl* follows the text edition published in 1988 of this major monument of Central Asian Chaghatay historiography in general and of Khiva's court historiography in particular. In addition to the translation of the work itself, the publication includes an extensive introduction offering discussions of the work's sources, manuscripts, previous editions, the biographies and bibliographies of the authors, the work's historiographical antecedents, and subsequent works taking up the narrative where the *Firdaws al-iqbāl* leaves off. The *Firdaws al-iqbāl* was begun in 1819, although the khan of Khiva, Eltuzer Khan, ordered Shir Muhammad Munis to begin a history of the dynasty of the khans of Khiva probably in 1807. At the time of Munis' death in 1829 the work remained unfinished. However, it was continued by Munis' nephew, Muhammad Riza Agahi, and finished perhaps as early as 1842. The translation occupies the bulk of the work beginning with the legendary origins of the khans of Khiva and traces the history of the Chingisid and Qongrat rulers of Khwarezm. The bulk of the work is devoted to the reigns of the Qonghrat rulers Eltuzer Khan and Muhammad Rahim Khan. In Bregel's estimation, the sheer volume of first-hand information on the court of Khiva transmitted by Munis and Agahi make the work an incomparably informative source. The quality of the translation is flawless. The English is idiomatic, while at the same time, the flavour of the

original Chaghatay is clearly evident and we are fortunate that Bregel left in many charming stylistic flourishes, especially the numerous delightful metaphoric constructions, so characteristic of Munis and Agahi's style. Indeed, translation should convince readers to question the widely encountered claim that literary life in nineteenth century Central Asia was stagnant or retarded. The translation alone places the publication in the first rank of scholarship on Central Asia. However Bregel's extensive and impressively thorough annotations provide details of the region's historical geography, ethnography, and personalities based on an exhaustive study of published sources. The publication also includes indices of personal, geographic, and ethnic names, as well as genealogical tables and maps. Indeed, the annotation, index of geographic names, and maps are major contributions to the historical geography of Khwarezm. The scope, detail, and preciseness of the work as a whole, complemented by Bregel's profound knowledge of the history of Islamic Central Asia in general and of Khwarezm in particular, make this edition an outstanding achievement both in its own right, and as a means of exposing the tremendous indigenous literary heritage of Islamic Central Asia to a broader readership.

A.J.F.

■ BURTON, Audrey, *The Bukharans: A Dynastic, Diplomatic and Commercial History, 1550-1702*, Richmond: Curzon, 1997, xx-664 p., 2 maps, 16 pl., ill., glossary, genealogical and chronological tab., bibliography, index.

The result of two decades of personal research paved by the publication of numerous papers, this monumental work appears as the chef d'oeuvre of an explorer of the history of sixteenth and seventeenth century Transoxiana. The explicit goal of such a work was to question the historical stereotype of a social and cultural decay of Transoxiana during the post-Timurid time, which is largely diffused in Iranian as well as in Mongol sources, which are notoriously hostile to the Shaybanids and to the varied dynasties which succeeded to them in the same region. For correcting these unfavorable representations, the author has used a great number of local sources contemporary to the events that they describe, and some foreign observers non-suspect of excessive partiality. Unfortunately the work appears as dense as the object it tries to describe. Of course it would have been regrettable to deprive the book of its critical apparatus, as some people advised the author to do, since it would have made it totally impossible to use. However it would have been more astute to publish separately the two clearly distinct work, deprived of mutual articulation, which constitute this single volume: the first one on the chronicle of the Janibekid and Astarkhanid khans of Transoxiana during the period of relative concentration of power in Bukhara, the second one on the continental commerce of which the Venerable City was the centre during the same period.

The first part is presented in the rather traditional shape of a succession of reigns — a compilation of events deprived of real perspective, where the author shows often very close to the often official sources that she uses, with very few attention for numerous modern studies published during the last decades. (Why does A.B. always prefer to make reference to manuscript sources, whence the latter have often been the object

of recent studies, in particular by Uzbekistani scholars, and often give a precious help to historians in spite of highly discussable methodological postulates?) Among other shortcomings of a literal interpretation of reign chronicles, such significant evolutions as the settlement of the *ulus* of Uzbek are explained to us by purely subjective personal orientations of such or such ruler. To be deplored also is a vision excessively simplistic of the mutual acculturation of the Turks, on the first hand, and on the other hand indigenous populations superficially introduced as exclusively Persian-speaking. In spite of the intensive utilization of primary sources — official texts based on the eulogy of such or such figure of the dynastic history and the blame of others —, the author does not avoid the expressions of ethnocentrism in her repeated judgments on the respective modes of government of the Abul'khayrids and of the Astarkhanids. Other consequence of this literal fidelity to the texts: the author generally adopts the opinion of the chronicle writers, but what do signify for us notions like that of the "grandeur" or the "insignificance" of a ruler? Sovereigns appear as the sole real protagonists of a history which seems to turn around them: if the whole political system is "bad" (for whom?), fortunately 'Abd-Allàh II appears for reforming it! As to the political institutions, we must note the very weak contribution of the present work to our knowledge of the varied systems of charges and ranks in the military, civil and judicial administration of Transoxiana in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries: the author mentions these question just in passing and refers to works about later periods, in particular on the Manghit dynasty — without noting that the content of the different charges considerably changed in Bukhara from the beginning to the end of this dynasty... From a more general point of view, we must deplore that the chronological period chosen for the present work has not been related with the preceding and following times. However the publication of such a monumental work should have been the occasion of some methodological openings, which are absent of it: the author satisfies herself *in fine* to suggest us that civilization did not suffer from an eclipse in Transoxiana between the early sixteenth and the early eighteenth century.

The author seems to be better at her ease in the chapters on the history of trade, which partly consist of elements already published or in print at the time when the present book was published. This second part constitutes an important contribution to our knowledge of the routes of continental trade between Bukhara and the neighboring regions, although it remains superficial on varied aspects of this question (for instance on the routes of commerce and migration between Bukhara and Western Siberia, for which the author relies on some recent Russian studies). These considerations on the Siberian trade seem characteristic of the whole work, where no question is dealt with in a systematic way, offering rather the reader a walk in an over-abundant documentation only partially explored and used. A very sophisticated index makes easier the access to a definitely compact work, of which chronology seems to have been the unique undercurrent.

Also reviewed by Keith Hitchins, *CAJ* 43/1 (1999): 150-151.

S.A.D.



■ ERKINOV, Aftandil, "The Perception of Works by Classical Authors in Eighteenth and Nineteenth Century Central Asia: The Example of the Xamsa of 'Ali Shir Nawa'i," in Anke von Kügelgen, Michael Kemper, Allen J. Frank, eds., *Muslim Culture in Russia and Central Asia from the 18th to the Early 20th Centuries, 2. Inter-Regional and Inter-Ethnic Relations*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1998: 513-526.

The paper deals with the interesting question of the circulation of literary works, of the popularity of an author and of his themes. The Chaghatay *Khamsa* by 'Alī Shīr Nawā'ī is among the classical works the most popular in eighteenth and nineteenth centuries Transoxiana, which is shown by the important number of its manuscripts and lithographs (from 1874 onwards). Whence the literary milieus of the Uzbek courts, in particular in the Turkic-speaking courts of Khiva and Kokand, do not produce great works anymore, their interest in classical literature remains. It is expressed by the important production of Nawā'ī's *Khamsa*, among which luxurious orders by the khans. The textual analysis of existing manuscripts allows the author to note that a great part of these copies are adaptations of the original text to the taste of the time. The modifications of the text concern the number and the order of the poems (or of the sections inside a poem) as well as on the production of abridged versions, reduced of philosophical or mystical passages. On the other hand we observe frequent additions of explicative comments (on Qur'anic or legendary characters, geographical places, etc.) and dictionaries for the parts which contain an accumulation of Persian and/or Arabic terms (in the margins, between lines or at the end of the text). If he does not develop them furthermore, the author at least suggests some orientations for future research: which were the realities of the intellectual life in eighteenth and nineteenth centuries Transoxiana? Which was the relation of the copyist with the text that he was copying? Which relations did exist between the literary modes and tastes, the readers' level and the "career" of a classical work? Which work and which adaptation for which reader, and according to which criteria?

M.S.

■ FOURNIAU, Vincent, "Agriculture nomade et irrigation en Asie Centrale: apports possibles de l'ethno-histoire," in *L'Asie Centrale et ses rapports avec les civilisations orientales des origines à l'Âge du Fer. Actes du colloque franco-soviétique, Paris, 19-26 novembre 1985*, Paris: De Boccard, 1988 (Mémoires de la Mission Archéologique Française en Asie Centrale: 1): 243-245.

An example of semi-nomadism in the nineteenth century: the Turkmen tribes attracted to the khanate of Khiva by the distribution of cultivated lands and other rewards, in exchange of military service.

R.B.

■ GHAFÜR, Mohammad 'Alī Khān, *Rūznāme-ye safar-e Khwārezm* [Diary of a Journey to Khwarezm], ed. Mohammad Hasan Kāvosi 'Erāqī & Mohammad Nāder Nasīrī Moqaddam, Tehran: Daftar-e motāle'āt-e siyāsī va beyn ol-melalī, 1373/1994, 35-106 p., map, photo., index, facsimile of the mss.

Publications of nineteenth century Persian *safar-nāmas* concerning Central Asia tend

to multiply in Tehran for some years and should be more regularly followed by the academic critique. Here we have the narrative of a journey undertaken in 1841 by a functionary of the Iranian Ministry of Foreign Affairs for obtaining from the khan of Khiva the liberation of a Qajar dignitary and his followers, made prisoners by the Khivans during an expedition of theirs against Mashhad. Although very short, the work contains rich geographical information of the route between Tehran and Khiva, and it provides interesting notations on the khanate itself. S.A.D.

■ GHOIBOV, Gholib, *Shahri Kūlob dar asri xvi (Tibqī ma'lumoti Hofīzi Tanish dar "Sharafnōmai shohī")* [The City of Kulab in the 16th Century (According to the Data of Hāfiz-i Tanish in the *Sharaf-nāma-yi shāhī*)], Dushanbe: Amri ilm, 1998, 264 p., appendixes, bibliography, index.

The present work consists in fact of a collection of studies by the same author of the city of Kulab through varied primary sources, mainly the *Sharaf-nāma-yi shāhī* of Hāfiz-i Tanish. The book is opened by a chapter which introduces, in Cyrillic alphabet, passages of this sixteenth century chronicle on the city of Kulab and the region of Khatlan (or Khuttalan). Then comes a series of distinct studies: on the biography of Hāfiz-i Tanish (54-82); on this author's works (83-104); on Kulab in the sixteenth century (105-113); on the city's conquest by 'Abd-Allāh Khān (114-121); on the narrative of this event by Hāfiz-i Tanish (122-136); last on the location of the mausoleum of Amīr Sayyid 'Alī Hamadānī (137-145). The second half of the work is fully devoted to a critical apparatus for the preceding studies and, more generally, for the reading of the *Sharaf-nāma-yi shāhī* from the viewpoint of the history of Khatlan: biographical and toponymic notices, glossary of the sixteenth century technical terms. S.A.D.

■ GOLDEN, P. B., "Sayrām," *EF* 9, 1995: 114-115, bibliography.

This history of the city of Sayram, the site of which is neighbour to present-day Shymkent in Southern Kazakhstan, is followed by a bibliography of sources and modern studies. R.

■ GULAMOV, Khandamir Gafurovich, *Is istorii diplomaticheskikh otnoshenii Rossii s Bukharskim khanstvom (xviii v.)* [Elements of History of the Diplomatic Relations of Russia with the Khanate of Bukhara (Eighteenth Century)], Tashkent: Fan, 1992 (Tashkentskii gosudarstvennyi universitet im. V.I. Lenina), 108 p.

The author, a specialist of diplomatic relations between Bukhara and Russia in the eighteenth and nineteenth century, analyses the changes which occurred in these links during the last third of the eighteenth century, in the aftermath of the annexation of the Kazakh Hordes by Catherine II and the reinforcement of the power of Bukhara in Transoxiana. These evolutions are studied through a description of the embassies led to Bukhara by Irnazar Makshutov (in 1774-1776 and in 1779-1780) and to Russia by Pahlawān-Qulī Qūrchī (in 1797). S.A.D.

■ KHODZHIEV, E. S., *Ekonomicheskie i politicheskie sviazi Tashkenta s Rossiei (konets XVIII – nachalo XIX vv.)* [The Economic and Political Links of Tashkent with Russia (Late 18th – Early 19th century)], Tashkent: Fan, 1992 (Samarkandskii Ordena Trudovogo Krasnogo Znameni Gosudarstvennyi universitet imeni Alishera Navoi), 108 p., bibliography.

This study casts light on the role of Tashkent as a geographical intermediary of the exchanges between the southernmost regions of Central Asia, the Steppe and Siberia — a role which tended to increase after the progresses of the Russian military advance towards the south, especially after the city's conquest by the khan of Kokand 'Ālim Khān in the first years of the nineteenth century. At the same time, the author notes a meaningful change in the exportations of Tashkent and its land towards Russia, the cotton fabrics which used to predominate up till the late eighteenth century being durably replaced by raw materials for the Russian textile industry. S.A.D.

■ LEE, Jonathan L., *The 'Ancient Supremacy'. Bukhara, Afghanistan and the Battle for Balkh, 1731-1901*, Leiden – New York – London: E.J. Brill, 1996, 695 p., maps, plates, plans.

A monumental work both by its size and by the period studied (which in fact begins before 1731, the date of the conquest of Balkh and the Badghis up to Andkhoy by Nāder Shāh Afshār). On the basis of the archive of the India Office Library, of which he is probably one of the best connoisseurs as far as Afghanistan is concerned, the author traces in detail the historical evolution of Afghan Turkestan until the end of 'Abd al-Rahman Khān's reign. The narrative follows a strictly chronological line and belongs to a genre, history of events, which is "politically correct" to run down. Two remarks must be made on this matter. First, an eventless history can be conceived only in a spatiotemporal context the events framework of which is sufficiently well known, which is far from being the case in pre-contemporary Central Asia; from this viewpoint, the work by J.L. is a cornerstone which may be followed by other ones, for instance for the khanates of Transoxiana. Second, such a text is rich in innumerable details on the most varied subjects and constitutes as such a mine of unpublished information, the resources of which however cannot be explored because of the lack of a detailed index. We also notice in some places inaccurate transcriptions (Aiyub Khan, *mann*, notion of the vowels — the use of the a/â is remarkably inaccurate). Last, the bibliography reveals weaknesses the less surprising of which is not the absence of the thick manuscript compilation by H.G. Raverty entitled *A History of the Mīngs or Hazarāhs [sic] of the Chingiz or Great Khān, Including Those Located within the Present Afghān State ; the Contingent of Chaghatāe Khān and His Successors, Known as Chaghatae's Tribes, and Their Invasion of Hindustān ; and also of the Nikūdarīs, Karāūnas and Others ; Together with an Account of the Four Great Nomad Tribes Known as the Chahār Īmāk* (IOL, Mss. Eur. D 201).

Also reviewed by Komaki Shohei, *TG* 78/3 (1996): 061-068.

D.B.

■ MANNONOV, B. S., "Lolaboshining Khorazm safari [Lālebāshī's Journey to Khwarezm]," *Sharqshunoslik* 8 (1997): 73-80.

In the introduction to this study, a comment by the author on recent Iranian publications on the history of diplomatic and commercial relations between Qajar Iran and the khanates of Transoxiana is the pretext of a pointless polemic on the "scientifically proved" presence of Turkic populations in Central Asia since the most ancient times, opposed to the insistence by Iranian scientists on the domination of "Aryan" populations... These premises are followed by an analysis of the narrative of the journey of Rezā-Qoli Khān Hedāyat to Khiva in 1851 (quoted in the Tehran edition of 1978). The author replaces this narrative in its general diplomatic context (Iranian attempts of expansion towards Turkestan under Amīr Kabīr's government) before putting the Iranian ambassador's narrative in perspective with varied Khwarezmian sources, in particular the works by the Khivan historian Āghāhī ("Jāmi' al-wāqī'āt-i sultānī," Tashkent, Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies, No. 9786).

In the same issue of the journal *Sharqshunoslik*, we can also read by the same author: "Khorazm tarikhnavisligida Khiva khonligi tashqi siyosati [The Foreign Policy of the Khanate of Khiva in the Historiography of Khwarezm]," 143-157. On the basis of manuscript or (more often) published works by Khwarezmian chronicle writers and historians Bayānī, Mu'nis and Āghāhī — of which the author could not read the manuscripts located out of Uzbekistan —, the author traces a century and a half of diplomatic history of Khiva, in the context of the British and Russian colonial expansion. Also in the same issue of *Sharqshunoslik*, D. VALIEVA offers us a rapid panorama of the diplomatic relations between the emirate of Bukhara and Iran in the nineteenth century ("Bukhoro va Eron aloqalari tarikhiga oid [About the History of the Relations between Bukhara and Iran]," 133-143): a study too poorly documented for bringing some innovation in this field. S.A.D.

- MCCESNEY, R. D., "Central Asia VI: In the 10th-12th/16th-18th Centuries," *EIr* 5/2, 1990: 176-193.

This long and well-documented paper gives a long awaited explanation of the complex problem of apanages in Central Asia. The author casts light on the nature of the sovereignty and of succession in the "neo-Genghiskhanid" state formed by Muhammad Shaybānī, of which he proposes a historical study. We see how the principle of succession through seniority / birthright is transformed into a struggle between cousin clans inside the royal clan, and how the apanages were distributed (decentralized nature and functioning). Moreover the author offers a very useful terminological analysis of the terms *amīr*, *sultān*, *khān*, *shaykh*, followed by the list of apanaged khans in Balkh, Bukhara, Samarqand, Tashkent, and by a rich bibliography. C.P.

- MCCESNEY, R. D., *Waqf in Central Asia. Four Hundred Years in the History of a Muslim Shrine, 1480-1889*, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991, xv-356 p., 3 maps, glossary, bibliography, index.

A meticulously researched monograph on the evolution and growth of the Muslim shrine complex centred on the alleged tomb of 'Alī b. Abī Tālib, cousin and son-in-law

of the Prophet Muhammad and first Shiite imām, in present-day Mazar-i Sharif in northern Afghanistan, from the time of its founding in the village of Khwāja Khayrān near Balkh in 1480 by the Timurid ruler, Sultān Husayn Bāyqarā, until the incorporation of its administration into the Afghan state in 1889. The work is based on a wide range of Persian historical, historico-geographical, legal, and biographical sources, many of which are available only in manuscript copies in Uzbek and Tajik libraries; and on the important contributions to the study of *waqf* in Central Asia by Soviet scholars, most notably Chekhovich, Davydov, and Mukminova. The author's goals are to demonstrate the dependence of the shrine's pious endowment on geographical and socio-religious factors, and also to reveal the intermeshing of political, social and economic forces in their development and administration over a four-hundred year-span.

Besides describing the hydrology of the Balkh region and illuminating many problems connected with irrigation, land tenure and taxation, the author reconstructs the historical chronology of the Balkh region starting from the time of the Timurids at the end of the 15th century, through the period of Jani-Begid and Tuqay-Timurid Uzbek rule in the 16th and 17th centuries, the Nadirid occupation from 1737 to 1747, the period of independent control in the 18th century, and ending with the period of Afghan rule from the annexation of Balkh in 1848 until the end of the 19th century. The author's masterful treatment of the pivotal role played by the shrine's managers, particularly the Ansārī family, which controlled its administration from at least the 17th century, demonstrates just how varied and complex the shrine's relationship was with the political authorities in Balkh and later in Bukhara. This is a multi-faceted book that represents the most sophisticated treatment to date of the problem of *waqf* in Central Asia, as well as the political history of post-Timurid Central Asia in general, and the Balkh region in particular. Although some of its conclusions remain speculative, it points to way of new avenues of research, making it a must for those working on *waqf* in the eastern Islamic world and on the history of medieval Iran and Central Asia.

Also reviewed by C. Schöning, *CAJ* 38/1 (1994): 131-132.

M.E.S.

■ MIKHALEVA, G. A., *Uzbekistan v XVIII — pervoi polovine XIX veka: remeslo, torgovlia, poshliny* [Uzbekistan in the 18th and the First Half of the 19th Century: Craftsmanship, Trade, Taxes], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo Fan Akademii nauk Uzbekskoi SSR, 1991, 113 p.

This work exceptionally well-documented, essentially from the main public archive collections of Moscow and St. Petersburg, has been written by an excellent specialist of the history of the commercial relations between Central Asia and Russia. The author devotes an important chapter of her work to the exchanges between the khanates of Transoxiana, on the first hand, and on the other hand Russia, the Steppe Territory, Iran, Afghanistan and India. On this matter, the author updates the already rich data of a preceding work, often quoted by historians of the pre-modern time: *Torgovye i posol'skie svyazi Rossii so sredneaziatskimi khanstvami cherez Orenburg (vtoraia polovina XVIII — pervaiia polovina XIX v.,* Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo Fan Uzbekskoi SSR, 1982).

Also reviewed by Y. Kawahara, *NAK* 13 (1998): 85-92

S.A.D.

■ MİR PANJE, Esmā'il, *Khāterāt-e esārat: rūznāme-ye safar-e Khwārazm va Khīve-ye sarhang Esmā'il Mīr Panje* [Memoirs of Captivity: Diary of a Travel to Khwarezm and Khiva by the Colonel Esma'il Mir Panje], ed. Safā al-Dīn Tabra'iyān, Tehran: Mo'assese-ye pāzhūhesh va motāle'āt-e farhangī, 1370/1991, 174 p., ill.

The man who used to call himself Colonel Esma'il Mir Panje was charged in 1269 *h.q.*/1853 of leading a military operation against the Turkmens, for putting an end to their incursions. During this operation, he was taken prisoner, and spent ten years in captivity before managing to flee. The author then wrote his memoirs on the demand of Nāser ed-Dīn Shāh: it is these memoirs that have recently been discovered, and published in the present volume. They contain interesting information on the economic, political and social situation, the state apparatus of Khiva, on the relations that the Russians and the British had with local khans and their interventions beside the latter. The book is a useful source for the understanding of the political history of this period.

A.A.

■ MUKHTOROV, Ahror [MUKHTAROV, Akhrar], *Hokimoni Ūroteppa (asrhai xv — xix)* [Rulers of Ura-Teppa (15th to 19th Century)], Dushanbe: Meros, 1996, 186 p., ill.

In this monograph which would have deserved more care from the publisher, the author has gathered, through a great number of primary sources, elements on the biography of sovereigns and privileged rulers of Ura-Teppa (north of present-day Tajikistan), from the late fifteenth century to the annexation of that city to the Russian Empire in the late nineteenth century. For each of these rulers, the author describes the main features of their government as they appear in the contemporary or later sources, as well as the relations between Ura-Teppa and its powerful neighbor Khujand and with the more remote Bukhara. The whole set of these biographical notices constitutes a reference work on the social elites of the city of Ura-Teppa and its land, between the end of the Timurid period and the Russian colonization. The work ends up with a chapter on the author's father Mīr Mukhtār (d. 1928), a civil administrator of the end of the colonial period. This last part constitutes an extremely interesting logical prolongation of the preceding chapters, and it gives a link with the early Soviet period. Based on archive documents and on oral testimonies gathered by the author himself from contemporaries, these souvenirs allow us to penetrate into the early twentieth century social and political upheavals, as they were experienced in a family of civil notables of a Transoxianian city.

S.A.D.

■ MUKMINOVA, R. G., "Craftsmen and Guild Life in Samarqand," in Lisa Golombek & Maria Subtelny, eds., *Timurid Art and Culture. Iran and Central Asia in the 15th Century*, Leiden: Brill, 1992 (Muqarnas Supplement: 6): 29-35.

A short history of the development of craftsmanship in Samarqand and a list of the most important local crafts are followed by an insight of the social organization and of the economic situation of craftsmen in the fifteenth century. The author has been exploiting notably twenty-five contracts established between masters and apprentices

(or the latter's legal representative) dated from the late sixteenth century (and then post-Timurid, but estimated by the author usable for the Timurid period, given their traditional character). These documents reveal invaluable information on the economic and social life of craftsmen and guilds (*e.g.*, from the twenty-five contracts, two only stipulate the apprentice's rights). The significance of this collection also comes from the fact that in Central Asia as well as in Iran, traditionally — up till the nineteenth century — contracts of apprenticeship were concluded almost exclusively in an oral way.

M.S.

■ NEGMATOV, Numon, *Tadzhikskii fenomen: teoriia i istoriia* [The Tajik Phenomenon: Theory and History], Dushanbe: n.n., 1997, 406 p., bibliography, maps.

The national historiography of Tajikistan is since its first formulation in the 1920s-30s in an impasse from which it does not seem ready to get out. A prominent academician of Tajikistan and a renowned specialist of the history of the Samanids — who are often introduced in Dushanbe as a "national" dynasty, the fall of which would have marked the loss by the "Tajiks" or their proper state —, the author tends to project towards the most remote past, until the Palaeolithic, the roots of a trans-historical Tajik nation. This essentialist, Aryanophile reading of the history of the Tajiks is aggravated by a victimization of the latter, since a series of "betrayal" by Turkic slaves put an end to the Samanids' reign at the turn of the eleventh century CE. Dominated by this founding drama inscribed in the *longue durée*, Negmatov's work is fully based on the notion of a form of political space particular to the Tajiks: the *jamā'a*, characterized by the primacy of consultation, and opposed to the allegedly arbitrary rule of the chiefs of the Turkic tribal confederations.

S.A.D.

■ SHAMS BUKHĀRĀ'Ī, Mīrzā, *Ta'rīkh-i Bukhārā, Khuqand wa Kāshghar (dar sharh-i hukmrānī-yi Amīr Mīr Haydar dar Bukhārā, Muhammad 'Alī Khān dar Khūqand wa Jahāngīr Khwāja dar Kāshghar)* [History of Bukhara, Kokand and Kashghar (as a Comment on the Reign of Amir Mir Haydar in Bukhara, Muhammad 'Ali Khan in Kokand, and Jahangir Khwaja in Kashghar)], ed. Muhammad Akbar 'Ashiq, Tehran: Daftar-i Nashr-i Mīrāth-i Maktūb, Āyīna-yi Mīrāth, 1377/1998 (Mīrāth-i Māwarā al-Nahr: 2), 346-2 p., bibliography, indexes.

Constituting the second volume of the series "Heritage of Transoxiana," this is the edition of a short historical and autobiographical narrative written in Persian in 1859 by Mīrzā Shams b. Mīrzā Ya'qūb Bukhārā'ī (b. 1804) on the order of V.V. Grigor'ev, governor of Orenburg, to whom the author gave the autographic version of his work. Mīrzā Shams was originating from a lineage of high functionaries of the administration of Bukhara, allied through marriage with the Manghits. After the Amīr Haydar's death in 1824, he was attracted into the succession struggle between the latter's sons and, after having briefly served Amīr 'Umar (r. 1824-1826), rapidly supplanted by his brother Nasr-Allāh (r. 1826-1860), he was obliged to go to exile, first to Kokand then to Orenburg where he settled quasi-permanently (author's biography pp. 56-59). The edi-



tion of this text by Grigor'ev (Kazan, 1861) with its Russian translation is not complete since it begins only with the accession to power in Bukhara of the Emir Haydar in 1800, whence the original narrative begins with the events of the 1740s (*cf.* Ch.A. Stori, Iu. Bregel, *Persidskaia literatura. Bio-bibliograficheskii obzor*, Moscow, 1972, 2: 1166-7). In 1321/1903, a re-translation into Persian language of the Russian text (!) was dedicated to the Qajar prince Sultān Mas'ūd Mīrẓā Zill al-Sultān, son of Nāsir al-Dīn Shāh, by Haydar Khān and Hājji Hasan Khān Yāvur. It is this version which has been the object of the present edition, made from the microfilm of the unique manuscript of this work (63 folios) kept in the library of the University of Tehran. The edition is preceded by an introduction which gives the historical framework of the author's biography and an analysis of the text. The main value of the work is due to its quality of its author as an eyewitness. The narrative is devoted for its most part to the political events in Bukhara, Kokand and Kashghar, but it contains also interesting information on the economic and social life, etc. (ff. 1a-29b). It includes a short supplement (ff. 30a-30b, 57b-59a) with some information on the years preceding the access to power of the Emir Haydar, as well as a geographical part (ff. 39b-57b, 59a-63b), that the editor supposes to be an addition by Grigor'ev himself (pp. 61-63). It is more probable that it is a summary of the original historical part that Grigor'ev decided to omit since it offered less interest for the Russian readership, interested above all by the evocation of contemporary events.

M.S.

- SAPAROV, Mukhammetzaman, *'Dzheng-e Merv' kak persidskii istochnik po izucheniiu iuzhnogo Turkmenistana serediny XIX v.* [The *Jang-i Marw*, a Persian Source for the Study of Southern Turkmenistan in the Mid-19th Century], Ashkhabad: Ylym, 1990 (Akademiia nauk Turkmenskoi SSR, Institut istorii im. Sh. Batyrova), 64 p.

The author presents a Russian abridged translation of a text which had already been published in its original Persian version, from a manuscript of 118 folios belonging to Ahmad Tāher (Tehran), and bearing the date of 1298/1861 (*Barresihā-ye tārikhī*, April-May 1971). The *Jang-i Marw* is a chronicle written in 1277/1861 by Seyyed Mohammad 'Alī al-Hoseynī on the unsuccessful military campaign launched in 1276-7/1860-1 by the governor of Khorasan, Hamze Mīrẓā Heshmat, against the Tekke khans, on the pretext of the latter's raids along the Iranian boundary. The text describes the different moments of the expedition, and stresses the intestine dissensions and erroneous behaviour of the Iranian commanders, to whom the author attributes the responsibility of their defeat.

S.A.D.

- SARAY, Mehmet, *Rus işgali devrinde Osmanlı devleti ile Türkistan hanlıkları arasındaki münasebetler (1775-1875)* [The Relations between the Ottoman State and the Khanates of Turkestan during the Russian Occupation (1775-1875)], Istanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi Basımevi ve Film Merkezi, 1990, 160 p., maps. First published in Istanbul (İstanbul Matbaası) in 1984.

So far, the diplomatic relations between the Ottoman Empire and the Central Asian



khanates have been studied mostly through Ottoman archives and documents. While the relations in the 16th to 17th centuries were treated for example by İ.H. Uzunçarşılı and J.A. Burton ("Relations between the Khanate of Bukhara and Ottoman Turkey, 1558-1902," *International Journal of Turkish Studies* 5/1-2 (1990-91): 83-104), those relations in the 18th to 19th centuries have remained almost untouched except for a few studies such as J.-L. Baqué-Grammont, "Tûrân: une description du khanat de Khokand vers 1832 d'après un document ottoman," *Cahiers du monde russe et soviétique*, 13/2 (1972): 192-231. This work is the first attempt to survey the dynamic relations during the period of Russian expansion into Turkestan based on a number of Ottoman archives and British documents. Although it is informative, the author permits himself to present subjective consideration and restrains from consulting Central Asian and Russian sources. Further researches should be complemented by these sources that will provide us with new aspects. K.H.

■ SEYYED SAJJĀDĪ, Seyyed Mansūr, "Rāhhā-ye ertebātī-ye Marv bā sāyer manāteq dar dōw-rān-e eslāmī [The Ways of Communication of Marv with Other Regions in the Islamic Time]," *MAMvQ* 6/18 (1376/1997): 13-41, fig., bibliography.

On the basis of the works of a certain amount of medieval travellers and geographers, the author reconstructs a part of the history of caravan routes which radiated from Marv. See also by the same author: "Dar bāre-ye manābe' va ma'ākheze joghrāfiyā-ye tārikhī-ye Marv" [About the Sources of the Historical Geography of Marv], *ibid.* 6/19 (pāyīz 1376 / Fall 1997): 5-38, 162 bibliographical notes. This second paper is a study on the state of primary sources on the historical geography of Marv. S.A.D.

■ SHKUNOV, V. N., "Russko-indiiskaia torgovlia na Sredneaziatskikh rynkakh v kontse XVIII — nachale XIX v. (Po materialam rossiiskikh arkhivov) [Trade between Russia and India on the Middle-Asian Markets, in the Late 18th — Early 19th Centuries (through Documents from the Archives of Russia)]," *Vostok* 1997/3: 94-101, 1 tab.

After a short historical survey of the development of the commercial relations between Russia and India in the late eighteenth century (in connection with the development of Russia's cotton industry), the author introduces the state of these exchanges at the turn of the nineteenth century. He notably insists on the role as hubs played by Orenburg in the north and Bukhara in the south of Central Asia. If the quotations from Vámbéry or from Desmaisons (in the Russian edition of 1983) bring nothing very new to the field, the consultation by the author of the State Archive of the region of Orenburg bring several new elements, notably on the vicissitudes of a famous "Tatar" merchant from Sterlitamak, 'Abd-Allāh Amīrov, between the caravanserais of Orenburg and the dervish convents of Northern India, from the 1770s to his return in the Southern Urals in 1806. (On this travel and its narrative by Amīrov, one can read, among others: N. A. KHALFIN, "Stranstvovaniia Gabaidully Amirova po Indii ['Ubayd-Allāh [sic] Amīrov's Peregrinations in India]," *ZV* 1956/7: 107-110). The author most rightly insists on the significance of the travel account written after his return by Amīrov with a merchant

from Kazan, Shaikhmuratov, thanks to the invaluable notations it contains on the penetration of Russian trade in the Indian subcontinent, and to the perspectives it sketches on the possible development of this trade without the intermediary of the British commerce. S.A.D.

- SOTUDE, Manūchehr, ed., *Zafar-nāma-yi khusrawī. Sharh-i hukmrawā'ī-yi Sayyid Amīr Nasr-Allāh Bahādur Sultān b. Haydar (1242-1277 h.q.) dar Bukhārā wa Samarqand* [The Book of Khosrovian Victories. A Comment on the Reign of Sayyid Amir Nasr-Allah Bahadur Sultan b. Haydar (1242-1277 H.) in Bukhara and Samarqand], intro. Ismā'īl Rahmatuff, Tehran: Daftār-i Nashr-i Mīrāth-i Maktūb, Āyīna-yi Mīrāth, 1377/1999 (Mīrāth-i Māwarā al-Nahr: 3), 268-4 p., index.

This anonymous chronicle of the reign of the Emir of Bukhara Nasr-Allāh Khān Manghit (1242-1277/1827-1860) describes the events since the death of the Emir Haydar and the succession struggle between the latter's sons up till the death of Nasr-Allāh. The good general introduction by the editor and an introduction by I. Rahmatov with, notably, interesting paragraphs on the particularities of the author's language (pp. 14-20 and 35-39) offer a good representation of the work; the notes contain a bibliography of the studies on this text. Whence one used to think that there is only one copy of this text (fund Mirzoev, No. 95), a second one, dated 1279/1862 and which seems to be the draft of the text, has been discovered in the fund of the Firdawsi National Library of Dushanbe, Tajikistan (No. 541). The editors think that, in both cases, the manuscript is an autograph (description of both pp. 26-29). Of the author we ignore the name, although we can verisimilarly identify his milieu as that of the functionaries of the Manghit court (p. 29). The text is of a great interest for the history of the first half of the nineteenth century in Central Asia, notably by its details on Bukhara's military campaigns against its neighbors. These military actions concern not only the khanate of Kokand, a significant rival, but also little territorial powers, independent or half-independent thanks to their control on local resources: Ura-Teppa, Khujand, Jizzakh, Shahr-i Sabz, etc. On the other hand the events in little states under Afghan control (Khulm, Mazar-i Sharif, Andkhoy, Qunduz, the Badakhshan, etc.) as well as some information on the first Anglo-Afghan war, the relations with Qajar Iran (notably through the boundary problems in Sarakhs and Marv), etc., show the attention Bukhara used to give to political developments in the whole region, and the role played in them by the Emirate. M.S.

- SZUPPE, Maria, ed., *L'héritage timouride. Iran – Asie Centrale – Inde, xv<sup>e</sup> – xviii<sup>e</sup> siècles*, Aix-en-Provence : Édisud, 1997 (*Cahiers d'Asie centrale*: 3-4), 366 p., iv pl., index.

The present work constitutes the second volume of the *Cahiers d'Asie centrale*, the journal of the French Institute of Central Asian Studies (IFEAC, Tashkent), which has been published during its first three years of existence in the form of double issues, containing the proceedings of international colloquia organized by the institute. In this case, we have the results of the scientific meeting held on September 24-26, 1996 in

Tashkent about the post-Timurid dynasties, as an echo to the Tamerlane jubilee which was set up that year in Uzbekistan. The volume is opened with two general papers. The first sketches some orientations for reflection on the Timurid and post-Timurid roots of the Central Asian modern and contemporary societies and cultures. So doing the author of this first paper invites us to resituate in the *longue durée* the processes which are observable nowadays, including those in the sphere of community identities (SUBTELNY, Maria E., "The Timurid Legacy: A Reaffirmation and a Reassessment," 9-19). The second of these two introductory contributions draws a general chronology of the relations between the Shaybanids and their main southern neighbors: Safavid Iran and Mughal India (BURTON, Audrey, "Descendants et successeurs de Timour: la rivalité territoriale entre les régimes ouzbek, safavide et moghol," 23-39).

The first part of the volume is devoted to the Timurid political modes, and their transmission to later periods. A first study deals with the composition of the military class in Iran in the Mongol and Timurid periods. In spite of the weak representation of local emirs in the primary sources, the author proposes to see in them a composite element of the Iranian society, divided up by many movements and antagonisms. The latter are explained by the very diverse ethnic origins (Iranian, Turkic and Mongols) of this military class (MANZ, Beatrice F., "Military Manpower in Late Mongol and Timurid Armies," 43-55). Then come two short studies on the double political legitimization, Genghiskhanid and Islamic, of the last Abul'Khayrids in the steppe and the first Shaybanids in Transoxiana. The authors have been interested, in particular, in the logic of the apanage system as it was elaborated at the turn of these two periods; unfortunately, the question of Shaybānī Khān's relations with the Sufi orders is dealt with very shortly, whence the analyses of this ruler's rhetoric of power do not bring new elements to current knowledge (KILIÇ, Nurten, "Change in Political Culture: The Rise of Sheybani Khan," 57-68; ISOGAI, Ken'ichi, "Yasa and Shari'a in Early 16th-Century Central Asia," 91-103, 2 figs.). On these last point, preference will be given to the following study, the author of which explains the politicization of the early Shaybanid brotherhoods' secular activity, that on the Naqshbandiyya in particular, by the evolutions of the end of the previous period, in particular by the initiatives taken by Khwāja Ahrār (d. 1490). Recalling Shaybānī Khān's deep knowledge of the place and role of spiritual leaders in the local population of Transoxiana, the author studies the role played by several leading figures of the Naqshbandiyya in the years before the Shaybanid conquest of the region. Through the eventful biography of Muhammad Qāzī, a disciple of Khwāja Ahrār's active in Tashkent and in the Ferghana Valley at the turn of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, and the biography of his disciple Makhdūm-i A'zam, the author offers us a fine analysis of the alliance strategy of the lineages of Central Asian shaykhs during the periods of inter-dynastic transition (BABAJANOV [BABADJANOV, BABADZHANOV], Bakhtiyar [Bakhtyar], "La naqshbandiyya à l'époque des premiers Sheybanides," 69-90). In the following contribution, the author proposes an analysis of the varied substrata, among which Islamic borrowings, which have influenced the formation of the theory of the state in India during the Mughal period (ALAM,

Muzaffar, "State Building under the Mughals: Religion, Culture and Politics," 105-128). In the last paper of this part, the author studies the causes of the emigration of Iranian elites towards the Mughal court in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries through the *Ma'āsir al-umarā'* by Nawāb Samām al-Dawla Shāh Nawāz Khān, a late eighteenth century collection of Mughal biographies. The distribution of 198 of these biographies allows the author a first quantitative analysis. The migrant population under study appears to have come mainly from oriental or central regions of the Safavid territory; the Tajiks (among whom numerous *sayyids*) clearly predominate over the Turks; last the author establishes a distinction between a forced and definitive migration and a voluntary migration which allowed the preservation of more or less close relations with Iran. The author's conclusions on the tendency shown by Persian-speaking notables of the pre-modern Iranian society to serve indifferently the Safavids or any Indian dynasty, or on the continuity over centuries of a migratory flow from Iran to the outside offer bases for further researches for historians and sociologists of the Iranian ruling classes from the sixteenth century onwards (HANEDA, Masashi, "Emigration of Iranian Elites to India during the 16th-18th Centuries," 129-143, 1 tab.).

The second part bears an ambitious title: economies, societies, cultures. A short, but detailed paper by Ludmila SHPENIOVA on "La politique monétaire du Timouride 'Omar Sheykh au Ferghana à la fin du XVI<sup>e</sup> siècle" (147-155, 3 figs.) gives a statement on the circulation of copper coins in North-Eastern Transoxiana at the turn of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. This paper allows us to resituate the Ferghana Valley in the development of monetarized commercial exchanges. Also based on recent numismatic discoveries, the following contribution establishes that the Kazakh khans of the southern Dasht-i Qipchāq and the 'Arabshahids are among the neo-Genghiskhanid dynasties which were issuing coins (KOCHNEV [Kočnev], Boris, "Les relations entre Astarshahides, khans kazaks et 'Arabshahides (dernières données numismatiques)," 157-167). In a paper which intentionally bears in French the same title as that of the famous monograph by P.P. Ivanov (*Khoziaistvo dzhuibarskikh sheikhov. K istorii feodal'nogo zemlevladieniia v Srednei Azii v XVI-XVII vv.*, Moscow — Leningrad, 1954), as if for taking distance from the unreliable translations proposed in this work, J. Paul revisits the original Persian text of the archive of the Jūybārī shaykhs of Bukhara, edited in Moscow in 1938. This article marks a new departure in the study of this exceptional collection of documents, still understudied; it allows us to nuance our knowledge of the legal practices in matter of agricultural land property in Transoxiana during the Shaybanid period (PAUL, Jürgen, "La propriété foncière des cheikhs Juybari," 183-202, 3 tabs). The two last contributions of this second part are a little bit disappointing. The first of the two, contrary to the author's announce in her introduction, remains at a very general level and does not bring us new elements on the penetration of nomadic populations in the sedentary oases of Transoxiana at the turn of the Timurid and Shaybanid periods (FILANOVITCH [FILANOVICH], Margarita, "Traits principaux de l'urbanisme dans le Mavarannahr et le Turkestan à la fin du XV<sup>e</sup> et au XVI<sup>e</sup> siècle," 169-182). The second of these texts, essentially apologetic, cleverly includes itself in the trend of gender stud-

ies for suggesting us, as often in Uzbekistan, that "in spite of the social limitations imposed by Islam" (211), the Timurid society constituted a model of equality between sexes. In this work, the author tends to project towards a remote past qualities attributed to present time. So doing, the author dissociates a social conservatism which is superficially attributed to Islam from Uzbek "national" traditions introduced, in a subliminal way, as a substratum of modernity (MUKMINOVA, Raziya [Razia], "Le statut de la femme dans la société de l'Asie centrale sous les Timourides et les Sheybanides," 203-212).

The third part of the work is devoted to the artistic influence of the Timurid dynasty, on the basis of typological comparisons (HAASE, Claud-Peter, "Shrines of Saints and Dynastic Mausolea. Towards a Typology of Funerary Architecture in the Timurid Period," 215-227, [4 ill. in black-and-white] ; YUSUPOVA, Mavluda, "L'évolution architecturale des couvents soufis à l'époque timouride et post-timouride," 229-250, 8 fig. And ill.; BERNUS-TAYLOR, Marthe, "Le décor du « Complexe vert » à Bursa, reflet de l'art timouride," 251-266, 14 ill. [pl. I to III]). The only author of this part who has some familiarity with primary sources and is in state of bringing something to our still fragmentary knowledge of pre-modern Central Asian societies is Yves Porter, whose research in history and prosopography of the artistic milieus of sixteenth and seventeenth century Bukhara have been regularly published in the four published volumes of the *Cahiers d'Asie centrale*; the author offers us here, according to his own words, some bricks for reconstructing the building of a history of painting in Bukhara, through a study of the style of the miniatures signed "Farhād" or which can be attributed to this painter. This study is concluded by an essay on the provisional repertory of painters active in seventeenth century Bukhara (PORTER, Yves, "Farhad le peintre. À propos des ateliers de peinture de Boukhara à l'époque de 'Abd al-'Aziz Khan (1645-1680)," 267-278, 3 ill. [pl. IV]., appendix: "Les peintres de Boukhara au XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle").

The fourth part is devoted to the memory of the historical past in Transoxiana. The editors have most cautiously avoided to deal with the contemporary period (for instance through a possible study on the reinterpretations of the figure of Amīr Tīmūr in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries), and limit their investigation to a wisely remote past. A first contribution deals with the visit to the tomb of Ahmad Yasawī in the *Mihmān-nāma-yi Bukhārā* (1509) by Fazl-Allāh b. Rūzbehān, an adviser of Muhammad Khān Shaybānī. These elements allow the author to develop on the cult of Yasawī in the Shaybanid period, and on the relations between this cult and that instituted by Tīmūr, the first spiritual and material renovator of the sanctuary. The choice of Yasi as the spiritual capital of the Shaybanid world is attributed by the author to several types of considerations: first it reveals the ever growing influence of Turkic shaykhs in the whole region of Turkestan; then Yasavism had already had a great success in the Sufi milieus of Western Turkestan and was rapidly propagated in Mogholistan; last in the early Shaybanid period, in the overall context of hostility against Safavid Iran, Yasavism was covered in Transoxiana with a Turkic and anti-Iranian connotation (BERNARDINI, Michele, "À propos de Fazlollah b. Ruzbehan Khonji Esfahani et du mausolée

d'Ahmad Yasavi," 281-296, 2 ill. [pl. iv]). The following paper surveys several Mongol sources for questioning the successive reinterpretations of the epics of Tīmūr under the first Mughals (HABIB, Irfan, "Timur in the Political Tradition and Historiography of Mughal India," 297-312). The last paper of the whole file is devoted to the way the Safavids appropriated a Central Asian spiritual heritage through their expression of an attachment for the imperial personified by the Timurids — who are clearly opposed, in Iranian sources, to the Safavids' Eastern enemies, the Shaybanids and then the Janids. The author shows particularly interested in the evolution of the figure of Tīmūr in Safavid sources, from his omission in the beginning of this period to the cult of Tīmūr as a vector of legitimacy after the Safavid domain entered its imperial period under Shāh 'Abbās and his direct successors (SZUPPE, Maria, "L'évolution de l'image de Timur et des Timourides dans l'historiographie safavide, XVI<sup>e</sup>-XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècles," 313-331). S.A.D.

□ SZUPPE, Maria, ed., *Boukhara la Noble*, Aix-en-Provence : Édisud, 1998 (*Cahiers d'Asie centrale*, 5-6), 197 p.

"Venerable" would probably have been preferable to "noble" for the translation of the term *sharīf*, traditionally associated with the name of Bukhara. The present volume is opened by two panoramic papers which summarize the argument of previous publications by the same authors (FRYE, Richard N., "Early Bukhara," 13-18, 8 notes; BURTON, Audrey, "Marchands et négociants boukhars, 1558-1920," 37-62). The following article underlines the significance of numismatics for the history of the Qarakhanids, with several new data on coin issuing of the Qarakhanides of Transoxiana in the first third of the eleventh century (KOCHNEV, Boris D., "Histoire de 'Ali Tegin, souverain qarakhanide de Boukhara (XI<sup>e</sup> siècle), vue à travers les monnaies," 19-36, 2 tabs.). The study devoted to the mausoleum of Chashma-yi Ayyūb in Bukhara casts light on an important feature of Islamicization in Transoxiana: the study of this holy place and, more generally, of the *mazārs* built near water springs reveals the takeover of the Biblical figure of Job (Ayyūb), the patron saint of springs, through legends propagated throughout eighth century Transoxiana by the conquering Arab tribes coming from Yemen (BABAJANOV [BABADJANOV, BABADZHANOV], Bakhtiyar [Bakhtyar], MUMINOV, Ashirbek, NEKRASOVA, Elizaveta, "Le mausolée de Chashma-yi 'Ayyūb [sic] et son prophète," 63-94, ill., fig.). The following study offers us an analysis of an important mid-sixteenth century architectural complex of Bukhara, the Tāq-i Sarrafān, from the viewpoint of its builder and successive owners; on the basis of the Naqshbandī shaykhs of the Jūybārī dynasty, the authors have reconstructed the transition, in one generation, of the lands and buildings from the lineage of Jān Wafā Bay, a Shaybanid military dignitary owner of an *iqṭā'*, to the family of Khwāja Sa'd Jūybārī, the main beneficiary of the redistributions of land property in this whole part of Bukhara in the second half of the sixteenth century (FILIMONOV, Vladimir, NEKRASOVA, Elizaveta, "L'ensemble architectural du Tāq-i Sarrafān à Boukhara," 95-124, 12 ill.). Then comes a description of the library of Muhammad Pārsā, one of the most important in fifteenth and sixteenth

century Bukhara (DODKHUDOEVA, Lola, "La bibliothèque de Khwāja Muhammad Pārsā à Boukhara," 125-146, 1 tab., appendix). The author of the following study continues his exploration of Bukhara's artistic milieus in the post-Timurid periods, through the tailing of two painters, Mahmūd Mudhahhib and Shaykh-Zāda, through their signed miniatures and those which can be attributed to them. The author then deals with the "commercial" production of little cities of Khurasan like Bākhaz and Sabzevār, intended to be exported to Bukhara where these miniatures were assembled with stencil drawn margins. Patiently reconstructed by the author, the circulation of manuscripts and of the artists working in Bukhara allows him to measure the influence of the Shaybanid school of painting; moreover it puts the bases for a better further understanding of the functioning of the court milieus in sixteenth and seventeenth century Transoxiana (PORTER, Yves, "Remarques sur la peinture de Boukhara au XVI<sup>e</sup> siècle," 147-167, 8 pl.). From the two most important public manuscript collections of Tashkent, the author of the following paper studies the diffusion of the manuscripts of 'Alī Shēr Nawāy's *Khamse* copied in Bukhara between 1801 and 1890; his conclusion is the high level of their appreciation in the learned milieus of the emirate along the 19th century (ERKINOV, Aftandil, "Les manuscrits du Khamse de 'Ali Shir Navā'i dans la vie culturelle du khanat de Boukhara sous les Mangits," 168-180, 2 tabs.). The last paper is devoted to the right of asylum developed during the nineteenth century by the rulers of Shahr-i Sabz and of Kitab, for the people of Bukhara and of Kokand in opposition with their respective sovereigns. The study is illustrated by the cases of Muhammad Hakīm Khān, the author of the *Muntakhab al-tawārikh*, and of the poet Junayd-Allāh Hādhiq. This analysis permits a better understanding of the political role of an interaction space which included, between the emirate of Bukhara and the khanate of Kokand, principalities stemmed from the apanage system: Shahr-i Sabz, Hisar, Ura-Teppa, Khulum and Balkh (SCHIEWEK, Eckart, "À propos des exilés de Boukhara et de Kokand à Shahr-i Sabz," 181-197, 1 tab.). S.A.D.

■ [TILAVOV] TILOVOV, Sh., "Amir Haidar maktublari tarikhii manba sifatida [The Correspondence of Amīr Haydar as a Historical Source]," *Sharqshunoslik* 8 (1998): 11-18.

The author introduces several important collections of letters by the Emir of Bukhara Haydar b. Ma'sūm (r. 1800-1825), kept in the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan (correspondences with the governor of Qarshi Muhammad Hakīm Bay, with the Emir's son-in-law Sayyid Ahmad Khwāja, etc.), and explains the interest of these varied correspondences for the history of the Emirate of Bukhara during a still very understudied period.

The current renewal of the study of the sources of modern history of Transoxiana is also illustrated by a panoramic paper by ESHONOVA ("Bukhoro amirligi tarikhnavislari (XIX asr ikkinchi iarmi – XX asr boshlari) [The Chronicles of the Emirate of Bukhara (From the Second Half of the 19th to the Beginning of the 20th Centuries)]," *ibid.*: 177-189), which sets out the content of historiographical works, unpublished for the most part, of Bukharan authors of the colonial period and of the first years of the



Soviet period: Dānesh and Sāmī, already known by several biographical studies and publications of their texts, but also more confidential authors like the chronicle writer of the late Manghit period Mīrzā Salīm Bēk b. Muhammad Rahīm, the memorialists Mīrzā Muhammad Sharīf Sadr-i Ziyā and Hāmid b. Baqā Khwāja, the historian and geographer Mullā 'Abd al-Rahman Tamkīn, the biographer Khwāja 'Abd al-'Azīm Shar'ī Bukhārāyī, the historian Nāsir al-Dīn Tūra, and two sons of the Emir Muzaffar: the historians and chronicle writers Mīr Siddīq Khān Hishmat and Sayyid Muhammad Nāsir. The author still devotes some paragraphs to two accounts of travels to St. Petersburg by the Emir 'Abd al-Ahad, a pilgrimage account by the Bukharan 'Ālim Qārī Rahmat-Allāh Wāzih, a late and non-official chronicle of the Manghits by Mīrzā Salmān Khwāja Samarqandī, as well as an invaluable narrative by Mullā Mahmūd Khwāja Baljuwānī of the inter-communal violences of January 1910 in Bukhara.

S.A.D.

- ZAMĀNĪ, Hoseyn, ed., *Safarnāme-ye Bokhārā, 'asr-e Mohammad Shāh-e Qājār 1259-1260 h.q.* [Diary of a Travel to Bukhara during the reign of Muhammad Shah Qajar, 1259-60 h.q.], Tehran: Pazhūheshgāh-e 'olūm-e ensānī va motāle'āt-e farhangī, 1373/1994 (Pazhūheshgāh-e 'olūm-e ensānī va motāle'āt-e farhangī: 179), 92 p., phot., index.

The travel account published here constitutes an invaluable document on the Iranian political vision of Transoxiana in the mid-nineteenth century and on the diplomatic relations between Iran under the first Qajars and the Central Asian khanates. Accompanying the Iranian embassy led by Seyyed Khalīl to the Emir of Bukhara Nasr-Allāh, the unknown author left us an important document which includes, beside the description of the vicissitudes of the journey, notations on questions as varied as the state of the popular opinion in the Eastern provinces of Iran, the destiny of some figures of the Shiite community of Bukhara, the diplomatic role of Iran in Central Asia, or the question of Marv and the Turkmen territories. The work is closed with an interesting critique of the political institutions of the Emirates of Bukhara, praised by the author for its military modernism, but mocked for the archaic strategic and tactical conceptions of the generals of the Bukharan army.

S.A.D.

- ZHIAEV, A., "Tsennyi istochnik po istorii vzaimootnoshenii Bukharskogo khanstva i Indii v XVII – nachale XVIII veka [An Important Document for the History of the Relations between the Khanate of Bukhara and India in the 17th – Early 18th Centuries]," *ONU* 1992/3-4: 44-49.

After a short recall of the main manuscript sources for the history of political relations between Transoxiana and India in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, the author introduces the main characteristics of the *Silsilat al-salātīn* written in 1143/1730-1 in the Indian subcontinent by an Astarkhanid prince, Hājji Mīr Muhammad Salīm, and already studied by the Uzbekistani historian Buriboi Ahmedov (cf. *Istoriko-geograficheskaya literatura Srednei Azii XVI-XVIII vv.: Pis'mennye pamiatniki*, Tashkent: Fan, 1985: 101-110). The author of the present paper insists on the contribution of this specific



source to the history of the relations between the Astarkhanids and the Mughals, in particular during the crisis of 1645, marked by the failure of the intervention of Mughal troops in Badakhshan and by a relative reinforcement of the Iranian influence in the south of the Hindu-Kush.

S.A.D.

### 3.4.C The Czarist Period

#### 3.4.C.a General Works

■ AKHMEDZHANOV, G. A., *Sovetskaia istoriografiia prisoedineniia Srednei Azii k Rossii* [The Soviet Historiography of the Reunion of Middle Asia to Russia], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo Fan, 1989, 155 p.

Published before the post-Soviet revisions of the history of the colonial period in Central Asia, this work offers interesting information on the sources more or less recently published on the history of the Russian colonization of Central Asia (chap. 5).

S.A.D.

■ BECKER, Seymour, "The Muslim East in Nineteenth-Century Russian Popular Historiography," *CAS* 5/3-4 (1986): 25-49.

This article analyses a number of popular 19th-century works on Russian history on their portrayal of the Muslim lands which were at that time being annexed and russified. A study of works by authors like Nikolai Karamzin, Mikhail Pogodin, Sergei Solov'ev and Dmitrii Ilovaiskii reveals a consensus on the legitimacy of the Russian expansion eastward as a quest for secure frontiers and trade opportunities, and as a civilizing mission. Russian 19th-century historiography *mutatis mutandis* depicted the lands that were pacified and assimilated as peopled by savage tribes and religious fanatics.

R.M.

■ DANI, Ahmad Hasan, *New Light on Central Asia*, Delhi: Renaissance Publishing House, 1993, 208 pp., 16 photographs, index pp. 193-208.

This book is a collection of articles written during the author's stay in Central Asia between 1985 and 1992. It is a description of traditional cultures and glorified histories of Central Asia and its neighbourhood. The author is critical about stereotyped images of Central Asia. According to him, it is inaccurate to describe Central Asia as a colony of Russian imperialism. Prof. Dani's argument is that Central Asia encompasses a wider region. It also has a history and culture that predate the era of imperial expansion. The author draws attention to the fact that little is known about shared cultural links and economic exchanges between Pakistan, Afghanistan and Central Asia. Such linkages proliferated through land routes (caravan routes) till mid 19th century that engulfed a wide array of people, cultures, territories and networks in South, Central and West Asia. Dani asserts that cultural links among the people of Central and South Asia were promoted by well-to-do merchant families (Hindus and Muslims alike) of Shikarpur,

Multan, Peshawar, Sind, Karachi, Kashmir, Gujarat and Bukhara till the middle of the 19th century. (There are two recent works on Shikarpuris as a diasporic community: Stephen Frederick Dale, *Indian Merchants and Eurasian Trade, 1600-1750*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994; Claude Markovits, *The Global World of Indian Merchants: Traders of Sind from Bukhara to Panama*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.) Dani's conviction is that such contacts came to an end with the spread of imperial rule in the region. The affluence of a Sethi in Peshawar and a Shikarpuri in Bukhara, the commonness of professions (shawl and rug making) among the Tajiks and Kashmiris are forgotten. The fact that the embroiderer (*zardozi* worker) of Lahore was one and equal to his Tajik counterpart in Bukhara who specialized in silks is something that is generally not borne in mind. However, the commonness of social behaviour reminds us of the fact that this was a vastly spread out landmass where social and religious contacts prevailed. The *adab*, the *dastarkhan* are social gestures that are common to the Pakistanis and the Central Asians.

Dani's book is significant in terms of its focus on the Central Asian neighbourhood — Sind, Afghanistan and Pakistan. Tajiks and Uzbeks cohabited in the urban centres Thatta and Balkh. Their successors' titles (*Mirzas* and *Begs*) remind us of the dominant Turko-Persian nobility in the region. Therefore, it is inappropriate to talk about Central Asia that is de-linked from Pakistan, Afghanistan, India and Iran. The book's concluding articles on Tajikistan are poignant descriptions of the land and its people. The author's narration about the mausoleum in Bukhara, the *Ark* (the Emir's citadel), the urban layout that included a water reservoir (*Lab-i hawz*), the bazaars, Kalan minaret, Mir-i Arab Madrasa reflects upon the dominant authority of the ruler of Bukhara up to the mid 19th century. Today, there is no strong authority that could stem the tide of dissension in the republic of Tajikistan. Commenting on the regional forces in Tajikistan, Dani indicates that several political groups and parties express sentiments that are rarely ideological.

S.C.

■ DERINGIL, Selim, "L'Empire ottoman et le pan-islamisme dans la Russie turcophone," *CEMOTI* 16 (1993) : 207-216.

A paper given by the bright Turkish historian to a colloquium held by the Centre d'Études et de Recherches Internationales of Paris in Ankara in October 1992, this text gives a statement on the variations of the Ottoman policy towards the Muslim populations of the Russian Empire — from the state pan-Islamism of the 1880s, which had been elaborated as a defense system against pan-Slavism, to the attempts at a better control of the movements of ideas and persons from Russia's and Central Asia's Muslim communities towards the Ottoman Empire: the Turkic subjects of the Czar tended then to be seen by the Sublime Porte as "foreigners" bearing a potentially dangerous cultural influence. The author casts light on the parallelism between the respective political itinerary of the Ottoman and Russian Empires, less and less preoccupied in ethnic and religious solidarity, for the profit of criteria of "proto-citizenship."

S.A.D.

■ DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., *Lectures de la modernité en islam centrasiatique. La réforme des institutions d'enseignement éthique, théologique et juridique dans le monde tatar et en Transoxiane, du premier renouveau à la soviétisation (1767-1937)*, doctorate dissertation, Paris: Université de la Sorbonne Nouvelle (Paris III), 1996, 781 p. en deux volumes.

For the writing of this monumental dissertation, the author has largely taken profit of his long stays in Central Asia. There he could complete his linguistic education and benefit from the recent accessibility to documentary funds and to numerous but dispersed studies in Russian, in Tajik, in Turkic languages (Chaghatay, Tatar, Kazakh). In spite of his great efforts for transcribing these languages, problems remain, due notably to the lack of a "h" in Russian language (which can give, for instance, *xila* for *hila/hile*, cf. p. 104).

This dissertation deals for the most part with the history of ideas. The chronology is introduced already in the introduction ("Reconstitution chronologique et identification des clivages sociaux"). The nine chapters are divided up into three parts on: the appearance and development of Islamic reform in Central Eurasia, between Bukhara and the Middle Volga (ch. I-III); the destinies of Islamic reform in Transoxiana and the problem of the "Tatar tutelage" (IV-VI); the relation between living memory and historiography of Islamic reform in Central Eurasia since 1920 (VII-IX). The recent history (appearance of a neo-Jadidism since 1991) is introduced in the conclusion. A French translation of the twelfth chapter of Chulpān's *Keche va Kunduz* (Night and Day) is given in an appendix. The work includes a 156 page long bibliography!

In a collective work edited by him and François Georgeon (*Le réformisme musulman en Asie Centrale, du premier renouveau à la soviétisation (1788-1937)*, Paris: EHESS, 1996 (*Cahiers du monde russe* 37/1-2), the author had already given substantial contributions on the problematic dealt with in his dissertation (foreword and two papers: "Djadidisme, mirasisme, islamisme"; "La question scolaire à Boukhara et au Turkestan russe, du premier renouveau à la soviétisation (fin du 18<sup>e</sup> siècle-1937)"). Since 1991, he has published many contributions on the political and cultural history of Central Asia (see the reviews in this volume). A very promising student in the Institute of Oriental Languages, he has now become one of the best specialists in his field of research.

J.C.

■ HAUNER, Milan, "Russia's Geopolitical and Ideological Dilemmas in Central Asia," in Robert L. Canfield, ed., *Turko-Persia in Historical Perspective*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991 (School of American Research Advanced Seminar Series): 189-216.

This paper gives an excellent sketch of the historical and cultural circumstances of the expansion of the Russian "Eurasian" empire in Central Asia since the non-official definition of a doctrine of geopolitical domination given in Peter the Great's alleged testament. Supposed to be extended towards the "warm seas" in the south and up to the Pacific Ocean in the east, this domination necessitated a considerable development of the means of communication, in particular through railways (a theory reassumed by the Admiral Mahan in the early twentieth century: cf. p. 191 ff.). In the project of reach-

ing India through Central Asia, the author distinguishes two tactics practiced elsewhere by Russia: diversion strategies and subversive action (such as the incitation of the people of India to revolt against the British). The geopolitical situation of Central Asia is analysed, as well as varied ideologies — pan-Islamism, pan-Turanism, pan-Slavism, with proponents as different as the prominent historian Barthold (who used to see in the formation of great empires a path for the further mutual rapprochement of various peoples) and the servicemen and geographer Veniukov (who, although advocating racist ideas, was proposing a policy of controlled racial mixing, going with a "return to Christianity" in Islamized areas). The most striking ideological antagonism ("*homo sovieticus* versus *homo islamicus*") is analyzed with relevance, notably through the failures of the Soviet policy of nationalities from Stalin to Gorbachev. J.C.

- IVLEV, N. P., IVLEV, M. N., "River Crossings and the Bridges of Nomads," CAS 13/3 (1994): 417-424, ill.

This paper illustrated by sketches and based on mid-nineteenth century Russian military sources displays an innovative vision of the techniques of river crossing by nomadic hordes and caravans. These techniques, floating bridges made of cartages or of bunches of reed linked together, permeated numerous populations to cross rapidly the great Central Asian rivers. Understudied or badly understood sources confirm their existence as soon as the twelfth century CE. E.d.l.V.

- LESURE, Michel, "L'expédition d'Asterabad (1781-1782) est-elle encore un 'secret d'Etat'?", in Ch. Lemerrier-Quellejay, G. Veinstein & S.E. Wimbush, eds., *Passé turco-tatar, présent soviétique. Études offertes à Alexandre Bennigsen*, Paris: EHESS – Louvain: Peeters, 1986: 215-229.

Based for the most part on French and Russian diplomatic archive documents, this important paper introduces, from the Russian side, the expedition undertaken towards the Caspian South under Catherine II by the Czar's former favourite, Prince Potemkin. Led by Earl Voinovich, the sea expedition in the bay of Astarabad (Astrabad/Astrabat in the French documents) — principally with commercial and scientific goals — was in fact an attempt of military establishment in this strategic zone, as was shown later by the recurring occupations of the islets of Āshūrāda by the Russians in the nineteenth century (cf. Qā'em Maqāmi, "Āshūrāda," *Elr*). Skilfully thwarted by Āghā Mohammad Khān, who took prisoners the Russian officers during a banquet, and forced them to dismantle their installations and to leave, this failed expedition still asks historical enigmas partly solved by the diary written by Rading, the vice-captain of the fleet. In spite of negative judgments expressed by some about Voinovich, this officer of Yugoslavian origin had then a rapid promotion (p. 22, note 27). On this affair, a note by La Colinière, the secretary of the Earl of Ségur, ambassador of France in St. Petersburg, is given in an appendix. J.C.

- LETVEEVA, L. G., *Prisoedinenie Srednei Azii k Rossii v memuarykh istochnikakh* [The

Reunion of Middle Asia with Russia in Memoir Sources], Tashkent: Fan, 141 p.

This useful historiographical study allows us to complete and renew the fund of accessible documentary resources on the Russian colonization of Central Asia. The first part explains the viewpoint of the Czarist authorities on the policy to be implemented towards the Uzbek khanates, notably through the diary of the Minister of War D.M. Miliutin and through the testimonies of servicemen and politicians of the time. The second part, less original than the first, introduces notes and narratives by travelers, scholars and diplomats about Khiva, Bukhara and Kokand in the second half of the nineteenth century. The third part applies the treatment of these memoirs to the study of the Czarist administrative policy and of the social movements which touched Turkestan as well as the whole Russian Empire at the end of the nineteenth century. C.P.

■ WARIKOO, K., "Central Asia and Kashmir: A Study in Political, Commercial and Cultural Contacts during the 19th and Early 20th Century," *CAS* 7/1 (1988): 63-84.

The goal of this study, based on the documents of the national archive of India and those of the government of Kashmir, is to cast light on the particular place of this area in the shaping and application of the Russian and British strategies. The author insists in particular on the fact that Kashmir has maintained political and cultural links with Central Asia in spite of the geographical obstacles, of the constitution of the General Governorate of Turkestan, of the establishment of the Russian protectorate over Bukhara and Khiva, and above all in spite of the Anglo-Russian rivalry, before and after the establishment of the Soviet power. C.P.

### 3.4.C.b *The Steppe Territory*

■ UYAMA Tomohiko, "Nijusseiki shotōniokeru Kazahu chishikijinno sekaikan: M. Dulatohu *Mezameyo, Kazahu!* o chūshinni [The Worldview of the Kazakh Intellectuals in the Early 20th Century: Mīr Ya'qūb Dawlatov's Work 'Wake up, Kazakh!']," *SK* 44 (1997): 1-36, Russian summary.

The author investigates Dawlatov's famous anthology *Oyan, Qazaq!* (Ufa, 1910) which played a significant role in the development of the Kazakh nationalist movement. Dawlatov's understanding of the existing state of the Kazakhs, nomadic way of life, Islam, Russia and its civilization, and the future of the Kazakhs are analyzed comprehensively. According to his analysis, Dawlatov considered himself first of all as a Kazakh, second a Muslim, and third a Russian subject. Although he described the present state of the Kazakhs in a dark tone, he believed in the future rebirth of his nation. In the expected course of "national rebirth" he preferred the elements of Russian and Western civilization to the Islamic ones, rejecting a return to the nostalgic nomadic way of life. Facing with ignorance, stagnation and Russian migration into the Kazakh steppes, Dawlatov aspired to create an integrated Kazakh national identity and to acquire the positive elements of modern civilization, and his ideal can be compared with those of many other intellectuals in modern Central Asia. K.H.

### 3.4.C.c Russian Turkestan and the Protectorates of Bukhara and Khiva

■ 'ĀLIM KHĀN, Amīr Sayyid, *Ta'rīkh-i huzn al-mīlāl-i Bukhārā: khātirāt* [A Sorrowful History of the Peoples of Bukhara: Memoirs], ed. Muhammad Akbar 'Ashiq Kābulī, [s.l.]: Union des Ecrivains d'Afghanistan libre, 1370/1991, LXXXV-90 p.

'Ālim Khān was the last Emir of Bukhara (1910-1920), and took refuge in Afghanistan, where he died, after the Soviet occupation of the Emirate. The former ruler's memoirs on the events of this period are published here, with an important introduction by the publisher (according to *Nashr-e dānesh* 13/6 (1372/1993): 72). C.F.

■ AVCI, Yusuf, *Fıtrat ve eserleri* [Fitrat and His Works], Ankara: T. C. Kültür Bakanlığı yayınları, 1997 (Türk Dünyası Edebiyatı Dizisi: 47), 207 p., appendixes.

This work is devoted to the famous reformist thinker 'Abd al-Ra'uf Fitrat (1886-1938) and more particularly to his literary works, which had a deep influence on the appearance and evolution of a new generation of reformist and modernist thinkers in Central Asia in the early 1910s. The author has devoted an important bibliography to this figure, to his education, including several years in Istanbul where he wrote his major works, and to his place in the Jadid reformist current and in the government of the Soviet Popular Republic of Bukhara (pp.1-60). Fitrat's literary and poetical work is analyzed in detail (his books, dramas, press and journal articles), as well as his exchanges and contacts with other writers (pp. 61-82). The author shows also interest in the thinker's ideas on Turkic languages and in his work as a historian, a philosopher and a musicologist (pp. 83-108). We may however deplore that the author, as often in Turkish publications, did not take into account the deep current renewal in Central Asia of studies on Fitrat and his time, neither of the considerable interest shown in this figure by Uzbek and Tajik researchers, intellectuals and politicians. Moreover the author, who seems not to know Russian language, has not been interested in the Marxist critique of Fitrat's work, neither in the specific modes of his recent rehabilitation in Uzbekistan (see the non-quoted work in Uzbek language by Ilhom GHANIEV: *Fitratshunoslik* [Fitratian Studies], Bukhara, 1995). In the appendixes, the author gives a long list of Fitrat's works, gathered by their main themes (pp. 109-117). He also publishes a selection of several Uzbek texts transcribed from the Cyrillic alphabet: poetries, dramas, narratives, passages of varied literary works, political meditations (pp. 118-202). T.Z.

■ AVLONII, Abdulla, "Burunghi uzbek vaqtlı matbuotining tarikhi [The Ancient Uzbek Periodical Press]," in Shuhrat Rizaev, ed., *Millii uighonish va uzbek filologiyasi masalalari. Uzbek filologiyasi fakul'teti ilmiy kengashi (11.10.90) da tasdiqlandi*, Tashkent: Universitet, 1993: 115-123.

This is the reprint in Cyrillic script of a text published in June 1924 — i.e., at the beginning of a long period of ideological tension — by a Jadid poet and publicist from Tashkent, 'Abd-Allāh Awlānī (1878-1934), about the pre-Soviet Muslim press of Russian Turkestan. Published several years before the systematic and polemic study by

Ziyā Sa'īd (*Ūzbēk wāqtī matbū'ātī [sic] ta'rīkhīga mātēriyāllār* [Materials for the History of the Uzbek Periodical Press], Tashkent — Samarqand: Ūzbēkistān Dawlat nashriyātī, 1927), this text consists of a series of very short notices in which the author taunts "traditionalist" newspapers and journals (such as *al-Islāh* and *al-Īzāh* of Tashkent, introduced by him as the organs of conservative ulama and big landowners). Conversely Awlānī advocates the numerous titles of the Jadid press, with a particular attention for the journal *Tūrān* of which he had been the chief-redactor. The recalling of a violent polemic created in the spring 1917 by the radical young Socialist publicist Mīr Muhsin Shīr Muhammad ūghlī (1895-1929), a collaborator of the journal, against the liberal autonomist party Shīrā-yi islāmiyya, gave Awlānī an occasion to clear oneself of possible accusations of sympathies for rightist political forces. S.A.D.

- 'AYNĪ, Sadr al-Dīn, *Yaddāshthā* [Memoirs], ed. and pref. Sa'īd Sīrjānī, Tehran: Āgāh, 1362/1984, 5 vols., 957 p.

It is Kamāl al-Dīn, the son of the famous Tajik writer Sadr al-Dīn 'Aynī, who during a journey to Tehran in 1969 gave the editor the four recently published volumes of his father's *Memoirs*, and the manuscript of the fifth, which deals with the Russian revolution of 1905 and its impact in Bukhara. 'Aynī along his *Memoirs* condemns the ulama, "germs disguised as human beings," propagating fanaticism, this "mental illness" (p. 506) which lets its victims in obscurantism, could only welcome the revolution of 1905 "which put progress in march" (p. 801) in Bukhara, and allowed him and other progressive literati to create the first modernized schools and the first liberal newspapers in Central Asia. 'Aynī also contributed to the reform of the teaching of the Latin alphabet. Having to struggle against the most conservative ulama, hostile to the reforms (p. 802), the author and his companions had to continue their work in secrecy until at least 1914. Religious tyranny is described in all its aspects, notably at the time of the epidemic of cholera in 1893, during which sick persons were held hidden in private houses and mosques, rather than brought to hospitals or cured by Russian doctors (p. 383). These *Memoirs* are dotted with numerous poems by the author and his companions, but also by such classical authors as Bidel, Hafiz, Saadi and others. Let's note in passing the attribution to Hafiz of a verse which is absent of the latter's *Dīwān*: Shenīdam ke gham mīresānad qazand / khorūsīdan-e daf bovad sūdmand. Last, the editor has added a little Tajik-Persian glossary, in order to permit the Iranian readers to find the meaning of "Bayhaqī style" words and expressions forgotten for long in Tehran, and to open themselves the Tajik and Afghan worlds, given that "Persian language is the language of culture of the Muslim world" (p. 16, preface). H.N.

- ['AYNĪ, Sadr al-Dīn], *The Sands of the Oxus. Boyhood Reminiscences of Sadriddin Aini*, transl. and introd. John R. Perry & Rachel Lehr, Costa Mesa, CA: Mazda Publishers, 1998 (Bibliotheca Iranica, Literature Series: 6), 275 p., ill., glossary, bibliography.

The opening of Central Asia's boundaries, since Perestroika, should have permitted the rapid rediscovery of innumerable primary sources for the modern history of this region

of the world. We must however deplore that too often it has given place to a kind of repetition: two American philologists who spent some time in Dushanbe in the late 1980s have had the very relative privilege of receiving from Kamāl 'Aynī, the son and legatee of the "founder of modern Tajik literature" the permission of publishing an English translation of a part of the Persian-language *Memoirs* of Sadr al-Dīn 'Aynī, several times edited and translated since the early 1950s, and to enrich this translation with some photographs already published in many commemorative albums. The work will not remain without utility for the largest audience, even if the translation nor the short introduction — which satisfies oneself with the paraphrase of 'Aynī himself or of Soviet historians — do not contribute to modify the existing representations of pre-revolutionary Bukhara. The translated chapters correspond to the first part of the original edition of the *Memoirs* published in Persian script in Dushanbe (Stalinabad) in 1954.

Also reviewed by Jiří Bečka, *ArOr* 67/3 (1999): 429-430.

S.A.D.

- BAILEY, Frederick M., *Mission to Tashkent*, 2nd ed., with a new intro. and an epilogue by Peter Hopkirk, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992, 314 p., maps, index.

This is a fascinating adventure story by a British intelligence officer. Lieutenant Colonel Frederick Bailey was already an experienced political intelligence officer before being sent to Kashghar in Chinese Turkestan and then to Tashkent. As a naturalist, he brought back from his pre-war journeys specimens of birds, butterflies and plants. His linguistic skills, among others, made him an outstanding intelligence officer in the great game which produced many British players during those years of Anglo-Russian rivalry. In 1918, he took command of a small secret *mission* to Central Asia which enabled him to write this book. He was supposed to prepare a report on the events following the Russian revolution and to try to spoil any plans of the Germans and the Bolsheviks to form a fighting force by making use of the POWs, mainly Austrians transported by the Czarist authorities to camps around Tashkent. Although the book was written around 1924, it did not get clearance until 1946. P. Hopkirk says in his introduction that even then "a good deal had to be omitted." Beside that Bailey did not include the "17-page top secret report" he wrote for his chief. This report is to be found in the India Office Library in London and in the National Archives in Delhi. Hopkirk believes "despite the absence of this material *Mission to Tashkent* remains one of the best books about secret intelligence work ever written, as well as a great adventure story." It is divided into 15 chapters, beginning with "Persia to Kashgar" and ending with the chapter called "Safe in Meshed." The author starts his story with the events in Shushtar of Iran; he then travels to many other places. The book has now been translated into Persian by Parviz Mohebbat in Tehran by Entesharat-e Ettela'at, 1369/1990, the translation being based on the original edition (London: J. Cape, 1946).

Tch.P.

- BALJUWĀNĪ, Muhammad 'Alī b. Muhammad Sayyid, *Ta'rīkh-i nāfi'ī*, ed. [Ahror Mukhtorov] Ahrār Mukhtāruḥ, Dushanbe: Nashriyāt-i 'Irḥān, 1994, 108 p.

Written between February 1923 and June 1927 by a mullah from Khawaling (a south-



ern, mountainous province of present-day Tajikistan), who had studied in the madrasas of Bukhara during the 1910s, the *Ta'rikh-i nāfi'ī* is edited on the basis of the unique, autographic manuscript kept in the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan in Dushanbe. The text constitutes a source of major significance for the history and the sociology of the learned milieus of the Emirate of Bukhara and its Oriental province at the turn of the colonial and Soviet periods. Baljuwānī comments in particular the military reforms of the Emirs 'Abd al-Ahad (r. 1885-1910) and 'Ālim Khān (r. 1910-1920), as well as the functioning of the Bukharan madrasas and the prerogatives of the *mudarrises*. Not very talkative about the Jadid movement, the *Ta'rikh-i nāfi'ī* gives more detail on the episodes of the access to power of the Young Bukharans (who are called here by the hybrid Turko-Persian term *yāshān*, characteristic of the Bukharan dialect), after the capture of the city by the Red Army in August 1920. An analysis of the political role played between February 1917 and September 1920 by different dignitaries of Bukhara is followed by an evocation of the launching of the *bāsmachī* resistance in the Eastern regions of the Emirate and describes some of the fundamental political changes introduced by the Young-Bukharan government under Bolshevik tutelage — notably in the functioning of the government, the administration of justice, the creation of non-religious schools or the taking of the *mudarrises* into the public service. Baljuwānī ends his narrative with a political credo which is that of an 'ālim favorable to the idea of a reform of the state, following the model of early twentieth century Afghanistan under the Emir 'Abd al-Rahman and the king Habīb-Allāh. S.A.D.

■ [DĀNISH] Donish, Ahmad Makhdum, *Risola io mukhtasare az ta'rikhi saltanati Manghitiia* [The "Treatise," or Abridged History of the Reign of the Manghit House], ed. Daler, Dushanbe: Sarvat, 1992, 98 p.

Reprint in Cyrillic script, without critical apparatus, of the famous "Treatise" by Dānish (1826/7-1897), a non-official chronicle of the reign of the Manghit dynasty in Bukhara. See the edition in Arabic script by A. Mirzoev: *Risāla yā mukhtasarī az ta'rikh-i khānadān-i Manghitiyya*, Stalinabad [Dushanbe]: Nashrdawtājīk, 1960, 185 p.; and an introduction by L.M. Epifanova, *Rukopisnye istochniki po istorii Srednei Azii perioda prisoedineniia ee k Rossii*, Tashkent: Nauka, 1965: 13-22. S.A.D.

■ EGAMNAZAROV, Alinazar, *Siz bilgan Dukchi eshon: huzhzhatli qissa* [Dukchī Īshān You Have Known: a Documentary Narrative], Tashkent: Sharq nashrioti matbaa kontsernining bosh tahririati, 1994, 144 p.

Intended for a large audience, the work offers an alternation of passages of narrative with archive documents and testimonies by witnesses on the anti-Russian uprising led by Dukchī Īshān in 1898 in the Eastern part of the Ferghana Valley. S.A.D.

■ ERGASHEV, Bahodur Hodzhikurbanovich, "Iz istorii obshchestvenno-politicheskoi zhizni Bukhary nachala XX veka [Elements of the History of Public Life in Early 20th Century Bukhara]," *ONU* 1992/2: 49-52.

This important study based on the rich documentary funds of the Central State Archive of Military History (Moscow) and on the early twentieth century Russian press of Turkestan, deals with the role played by the last Emir of Bukhara, Sayyid 'Ālim Khān (1910-1920), in the events that marked the last decade of the pre-Soviet period of the history of Transoxiana. The documents of Russian origin used by the author reveal that in the first years of his reign the young sovereign was perceived as close to the Bukharan reformist circles. (Did he not intervene several times, on the demand of representatives of the merchants and in a reformist spirit, against the overall practice of extravagant spending on the occasion of marriages and other rituals?) The reports written by the Governor Samsonov also show the Emir's despondency in front of the negligence of power that he had inherited from his father 'Abd al-Ahad. Very quickly, however, the Russian observers changed their appreciations and began to denounce the ruler's hesitating character and the growing influence of the "conservative" milieu of the Emirate, as well as the limitation of reforms to the fields of education and of the army. The inclusion of new members into 'Ālim Khān's harem is the pretext of the latter's denunciation as a hypocritical Oriental despot, who tries to hide the existence of a sybarite behind the screen of his gifts to the Red Cross of Russia. At the eve of the First World War, the Russian newspapers and the chancery reports portray the ruler as a defender of the most backward conservatism, and they see his payments to Imperial banks as signs of the tyranny and of the corruption of the state apparatus in Bukhara. Retrospectively, the Russian documentation shows the two first years of the reign as a period of reforms more or less imposed by the colonial authorities — notably in the order to withdraw the political effects of the pogrom of the Shiite community in January 1910 —, before a "conservative" reaction from 1912 to 1917. This point of view is characteristic of the Russian vision during this period of time; we may regret that the author did not continue his research up till the revolutionary period and that, more generally speaking, he tends to adopt the perspective traced by the very specific sources that he manipulates.

S.A.D.

- FITRAT, *Davrai hukmronii amir Olimkhon* [The Reign of Amir 'Ālim Khān], ed. and post-face A. Nasriddinov, introduction A. Mukhtorov, Dushanbe: Palatai davlatii kitob, 1991, 61 p.

This short book provides an edition in Cyrillic script of a work published in Persian in Tashkent in 1930 by the Bukharan publicist Fitrat (1886-1938). This text is an attempt at a rehabilitation of the party of the Young Bukharans, against critiques then expressed by the chief of the government of the Uzbek SSR, Fayz-Allāh Khwāja, in his historical works and personal *Memoirs*. This source, of a particular importance for a global understanding of the public debates of the late 1920s and early 1930s in Soviet Transoxiana, would have deserved more care by the publisher.

S.A.D.

- FOURNIAU, Vincent, "Dāneš, Ahmad Makdūm," *EIr* 6/6, 1993: 647-649, fig.

The biographical information given in this notice on Dānish, the prominent reformist

‘*ālim* of Bukhara, is taken for the most part from works by Soviet historians and philologist (Radzhabov, Mirzoev, Islamova, Epifanova, Hodizoda). They bring the author to introduce Dānish's itinerary as a transition between a status of court functionary to that of a political opponent — a transition which would have been characteristic of the "progressive" learned milieus of the Emirate in the late nineteenth century. We have written elsewhere what we think of these categories, so we will satisfy ourselves here to deplore that the author of this notice does not show more sensitive to the ethic, theological and political aspects of the collection of treatises the *Nawādir al-waqāyi*’. The author should also have noticed that the (very relatively) "simple" language of some of Dānish's poetical works does not reveal a progress towards "realism" (a theory conveyed by most Soviet historians of literature), but should be explained by a didactical and satirical literary tradition characterized by orality and cultivated in the Bukharan learned circles in parallel with classical poetical genres deeply influenced by Bīdil and the *sabk-i hindī*. The paper is followed by a long bibliography which could have been summarized with the mention of that, more complete, recently published in Tajikistan: A. Iunusov & I. Norkallaev, *Ahmadi Donish (Fehristi adabiiot)*, 2nd ed., Dushanbe: s.n., 1988, 124 p. (Vazorati Madaniiati RSS Tojikiston, Kitobkhonai davlatii RSS Tojikiston ba nomi Abulqosim Firdavsī, Shu‘bai dastnavishoi sharqī va bibliografiiai millī). S.A.D.

■ HA’ERĪ, ‘Abd al-Hādī, "Mafhūm-e novīn-e āzādīhā-ye siyāsī va ejtemā’ī dar neveshtehā-ye fārsī-ye Āsiyā-ye miyāne [The New Definition of Political and Social Liberties in Persian Writings from Middle Asia]," *Simorgh* 1/7-9 (1369/1990): 3-25.

The author sketches a history of intellectuals in Russian Turkestan, from the Czarist period to the Bolshevik revolution and Stalin's time. The activity of these Persian- and Turkic-speaking men of letters is put in perspective with the political, economic and social upheavals of their time, as well as with their position vis-à-vis the power in place. Ahmad Makhdūm Dānish (1826/7-1897), the founder of the enlightenment movement, Sadr al-Dīn Sayyid Murādzāda ‘Aynī (1878-1954), the founding father of Soviet Tajik literature, Abī'l-Qāsim Lāhūtī Kirmānshāhī (1887-1957), the founding father of Tajik contemporary poetry, appear as figures close to Russian (and Iranian as far as Lāhūtī is concerned) revolutionary movements. All have shown sensitive to the discourse on the freedom of speech and the valuation of the languages and literatures of the peoples of Central Asia. These themes developed by the revolution of October 1917 seduced these intellectuals who had a conflictual relationship with the local power and with the religious authorities. The article is introduced as an introduction to the history of contemporary intellectual movements in the Central Asian region. References are limited to English sources and to works translated into Persian language — which does not allow the author to know the Tajik point of view on these questions. G.J.J.

■ ISHANOVA, Sh. A., "Normy nakazaniia po musul'manskomu ugovnomu pravu v dorevoliutsionnom Turkestane [The Rules of Punishment According to the Muslim Law in

Pre-Revolutionary Turkestan]," *ONU* 1993/5: 18-23.

This paper explains the penalties corresponding to varied categories of punishment in different works of judicial comment, beginning with the arch-classical *Hidāya* (very much in use in the Central Asian madrasas before and since the end of the Soviet period). The author however cautiously puts into perspective these normative texts with the practice of Islamic courts of the region during the colonial period, during which the activity of the *qāzīs* of Turkestan was very restricted — to the contrary of that of the courts of Bukhara and of Khiva, which is abundantly documented by manuscript sources. S.A.D.

■ ISKANDAROV, B. I., ed., *Tadzhikistan v trudakh dorevoliutsionnykh russkikh issledovatelei (vtoraia polovina XIX – nachalo XX v.)* [Tajikistan in the Works of Pre-Revolutionary Russian Researchers (Second Half of the 19th – Beginning of the 20th Century)], Dushanbe: Donish, 1990 (AN Tadjhikskoi SSR, Institut istorii im. A. Donisha), 304 p.

This interesting collective work on the Russian Imperial historiography of Central Asia gives a state of Russian textual sources, whether published or disseminated in various archives of the CIS, which inform the history of present-day Tajikistan between the 1870's and the early 1920's. The papers are listed as follows: G. NAVRUZOV, "Predposylki k issledovaniuu dorevoliutsionnogo Tadjhikistana [The Premises to the Study of Pre-Revolutionary Tajikistan]," 19-40; O. B. BOKIEV, "Sotsial'no-ekonomicheskaiia i obshchestvenno-politicheskaiia zhizn' severnogo Tadjhikistana [The Social, Economic and Political Life of Northern Tajikistan]," 41-110; Sh. T. IUSUPOV, "Sotsial'no-ekonomicheskaiia, obshchestvenno-politicheskaiia i kul'turnaia zhizn' Vostochnoi Bukhary — Administrativno-politicheskoe ustroistvo [The Social, Economic, Political and Cultural Life of Eastern Bukhara: The Administrative and Political Organization]," 111-126; H. P. PIRUMSHOEV, "Sotsial'no-ekonomicheskaiia, obshchestvenno-politicheskaiia i kul'turnaia zhizn' Vostochnoi Bukhary — Naselenie/chislennost', etnicheskii sostav, zemel'nye otnosheniia, nalogovaia sistema, remeslennoe proizvodstvo, torgovlia [The Social, Economic, Political and Cultural Life of Eastern Bukhara: Demography and Ethnic Composition, Land Tenure, Tax System, Craftsmanship, Trade]," 126-171; V. V. DUBOVITSKII, "Istoriia i kul'tura Vostochnoi Bukhary [History and Culture of Eastern Bukhara]," 171-183; B. I. ISKANDAROV, "Russkie issledovateli o Pamire i Pripamir'e [The Russian Explorers about the Pamir and Pre-Pamir]," 184-205; N. AKRAMOV, "Sotsial'no-politicheskii stroi Pamira [The Social and Political Structure of the Pamir]," 205-232. This work is a useful complement to the recent monograph by D. Iu. ARAPOV, *Bukharskoe khantstvo v russkoi vostoковедческой литературе* [The Khanate of Bukhara in the Russian Orientalist Literature], Moscow: MGU, 1981). S.A.D.

■ ISMOILOVA, D., "Farghona viloiatida 1916 iil khalq quzgholoni [The Popular Uprising of 1916 in the Ferghana Province]," *UIF* 1991/8: 26-33.

Beginning with a recalling of the dramatic economic consequences of the starting of

WWI for Russian Turkestan, the author analyses the revolt movements which appeared in Khujand and then in different points of the Ferghana Valley after the extension by Nicholas II, on June 25, 1916 of conscription to the Muslim subjects of the empire, for the tasks of the rear. Abundantly documented by a long-term research in the archive collections of Uzbekistan, this study allows us to refine the geography, and even the sociology of the so-called "uprising of the seasonal workers" in the spring of 1916 in the Ferghana Valley — an uprising which was at the basis of the *bāsmachī* resistance in the following years, and which constitutes in the Uzbekistani collective memory a central founding drama.

S.A.D.

- IUSUPOV, Sharki, *Ocherki istorii Kabadianskogo bekstva v kontse XIX – nachale XX veka* [Studies in History of the Principality of Qabadiyan, Late 19th—Early 20th Century], Dushanbe: Donish, 1986, 134 p.

The author proposes a monograph of the territory of Qabadiyan (around present-day Shartuz, in Tajikistan), which was a part of the Eastern region of the Emirate of Bukhara after 1876. After a short recall of the regional history in the pre- and post-Mongol periods and in the late nineteenth century (first part), the author devotes a second part to the study of rural economy, the production system and the social relations, the concessions obtained by the Russians on the irrigated lands through the protectorate, and the evolution of craftsmanship and trade in traditional Qabadiyan under the pressure of Russian industry and capital. Historical works of the Eastern regions of the Emirate of Bukhara during the colonial period are all the more useful since they are rare and they enrich our knowledge of a region, the population structure and the economy of which sensitively differ from more central regions of the Emirate along and around the Zerafshan basin.

V.F.

- IUSUPOV, Sh. K., *K istorii dorevoliutsionnogo Dushanbe* [Contribution to the Pre-Revolutionary History of Dushanbe], Dushanbe: Donish, 1988 (AN Tadzhikskoi SSR, Institut istorii im. A. Donisha), 115 p.

This monograph by Sharqi Iusupov offers us a succinct description of the administrative apparatus and of the economic life of the Hisar Valley during the colonial period (through Russian sources and, to a lesser extent, through inquiries among the oldest inhabitants of the city). The Central State Archives of Uzbekistan have also been used, for the redaction of brief chapters on the activity of Russian doctors in the Hisar Valley after the plague epidemic in Anzab in 1898, and on the construction of the first hospital in Dushanbe in 1915, by order of the General-Governor of Turkestan, by a contractor from Tashkent, ‘Arif-Khwāja ‘Azīz-Khwājaev.

S.A.D.

- [JALILOV, O. Kh.], ZHALILOV, O. Kh. "Vasiqalar namunalari haqidagi quliozma (XIX asr) [A 19th Century Collection of Judicial Acts]," *UIF* 1991/1: 48-54.

The author introduces a collection of documents coming from a *qāzī* of Khwarezm, written between 1882 and 1890 and kept in the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies of

the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan, in Tashkent (inv. 7799). A precise typology is given for each of these documents, with the indication of its language (Persian or Turkī), which allows the reader to have a good idea of the activity of the chancery of a *qāzī* in the khanate of Khiva under the Russian protectorate. S.A.D.

■ JASIEWICZ, Zbigniew, "Leon Barszczewski's Collection of Photographs from Russian Turkestan and the Bukharan Emirate as a Historical and Ethnographical Source," in Ingeborg Baldauf & Michael Friederich, eds., *Bamberger Zentralasienstudien. Konferenzakten ESCAS IV: Bamberg 8.-12. Oktober 1991*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1994 (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 185): 361-368, 4 photos., bibliography.

Short introduction to the still unpublished photographic work of Leon Barszczewski (d. 1910), an officer of the Imperial Russian army in Turkestan during the last twenty years of the nineteenth century, and to the documentary interest of this work (which is only comparable, according to the author, with that of the famous "Turkestanian Album" of St. Petersburg). S.A.D.

■ KASIMOV [QOSIMOV, KASYMOV], Begali, "XX. Yüzyıl başlarında Türkistan'daki ceditçilik akımının başlıca özellikleri [The specificities of the Jadīd Movement in the Early-Twentieth Century Turkestan]," *AE*, 3 (1995): 88-97.

Turkish translation of a paper in Uzbek already published in French translation (*CMR* 37/1-2: 107-132), and which was itself the result of a monograph in Russian by the same author (*Revoliutsiia i literatura (Zarozhdenie i razvitie uzbekskoi revoliutsionnoi poezii, 1905-1917 gg.)* [Revolution and literature (Birth and Development of the Uzbek Revolutionary Poetry, 1905-1917)], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo Fan Akademii nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan, 1991). S.A.D.

■ KHALID, Adeeb, "Muslim Printers in Muslim Central Asia," *CAS* 11/3 (1992): 113-118.

A very important paper, very well-documented, on the development of the first "Muslim" printing houses in Russian Turkestan, and on the control and limitation measures taken by the colonial authorities against this evolution. S.A.D.

■ KHOTAMOV, N. B., *Rol' bankovskogo kapitala v sotsial'no-ekonomicheskom razvitii Srednei Azii (nachalo 90kh gg. XIX v. – 1917)* [The Role of Bank Capital in the Social and Economic Development of Middle Asia (from the Early 1890s to 1917)], Dushanbe: Donish, 1990 (Akademiia nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR, Institut istorii, arkhologii i etnografii im. A. Donisha), 320 p.

To our knowledge, this is the first historical study on the role of the Russian commercial and industrial banks in the penetration of capitalistic mechanisms in Central Asia, at the turn of the 20th century. Through numerous archival documents, the author analyzes the impact of the first Russian banking initiatives (loans to the *dehqāns*) on the development of cotton production, and on the introduction in the Ferghana Valley of industries of first transformation (oil mills and cotton mills, which had an exponential

development up to 1917). On the social plan, Khotamov insists on the commercial dependency in which the local bourgeoisies were maintained towards Moscow, and on the consequences of the increasing running into debt of the petty peasantry. S.A.D.

■ KOMATSU, Hisao, *20. Yüzyıl Başlarında Orta Asya'da Türkçülük ve Devrim Hareketleri* [Turkism and the Revolutionary Movements in Early 20th-Century Middle Asia], Ankara: Turhan Kitabevi, 1993, 79 p. ills., map.

This pioneer monograph on Fitrat (1886-1937), who was in the first third of the twentieth century a protagonist of cultural and political change in Bukhara and then in the Uzbek SSR, insists on the founding role of the *Munāzara*, a treatise written and published in Istanbul in 1911, and on this work's impact on the emergence and structuring of the Jadid movement in the Emirate of Bukhara after Fitrat's return from Turkey in 1913. The author devotes several important chapters to the continuity of a cultural and political Turkism in the Soviet Popular Republic of Bukhara and in the Uzbek SSR, up till the launching of the red terror in the mid-1930s. S.A.D.

■ KOMATSU, Hisao, *Kakumeino Chūō Ajia: aru jadīdono shōzō* [Revolutionary Central Asia: A Portrait of Äbduräuf Fitrat], Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppankai, 1996, iv-290 p., bibliography, index.

This monograph analyzes the history of national movements and the revolution in Bukhara and Russian Turkestan. Among others, it vividly depicts the life of 'Abd al-Ra'uf Fitrat (1886-1938). By describing the activities of this famous Bukharan Jadid, who studied in Istanbul, as well as of many other Bukharan, Turkestanian and Tatar intellectuals, the author shed light on the width of the Muslim intellectuals' world, which extends beyond the state and regional borders. The author also shows the complexity of the problem of ethnic/national identities, effectively using the example of Fitrat, who changed from a Bukharan nationalist to a Turkestanian nationalist, and finally to an Uzbek nationalist. In this context, the national delimitation in 1924 is analyzed not only as the result of Moscow's "divide and rule," but also as an opportunity for the native elite to build a new powerful nation with great and distinctive literature and history. Fitrat's *Uzbek adabiyātī namūnalarī* [Specimens of Uzbek Literature] (1928) symbolizes both the ambition of Uzbek intellectuals to invent their tradition, and their tragedy under Stalinism. In general, the monograph, based on rich materials written in a variety of languages, significantly contributes to the study of cultural and political history of modern Central Asia.

Reviewed by Uyama Tomohiko, *Roshiashi Kenkyū* 59 (1996): 132-135; Kasuya Gen, *Isuramu Sekai* 51 (1998): 107-111. U.T.

■ MAKHKAMOV, A. A., "Rol' Kokanda v chainoi trgovle Rossii so Srednei Aziei v kontse XIX – nachale XX veka [Kokand's Role in the Tea Trade of Russia with Middle Asia in the Late 19th and Early 20th Centuries]," *ONU* 1990/7: 43-46.

This very short study, based on an important documentary work, gives a statement on



the growing role of Kokand as a hub of the international trade of green tea in the Ferghana Valley, then in the whole Central Asia, from the Russian conquest onwards. The former capital of the Ferghana could play this role after the reduction by the Russian government of the amount of importations from British India, and as a consequence of the increasing importation of Chinese tea through the ports of the Black Sea and the Transcaspian railway, up till Kokand's main customs house (opened in 1896). If this rapid reorientation of the commercial exchanges of the Ferghana, more and more cut off from British India, showed profitable to some prominent families of autochthonous traders, it also contributed to the gradual integration of this region in the economic orbit of Russia. S.A.D.

- MANZ, Beatrice F., "Central Asian Uprisings in the Nineteenth Century: Ferghana under the Russians," *RR* 46/3 (1987): 267-282.

The author analyzes a series of popular uprising, especially the Andijan uprising, in the Ferghana Valley under the Russian rule. She interprets these uprisings in the continuity of power struggles by various political groups since the last period of the Kokand Khanate as V.V. Bartol'd pointed out in his *Istoriia kul'turnoi zhizni Turkestana* (Leningrad, 1927). However she relies mainly on Russian sources and underestimates the socio-economic conditions under colonial rule as well as the religious aspects of the Andijan uprising. For the new research trend of this uprising based on local sources, for example, see: Bakhtiyar BABADJANOV, "Dūkčī Īshān und der Aufstand von Andīzan 1898" (see *infra* p. 219); later its revised and enlarged Russian version was published: B. M. BABADZHANOV, "Dukchi Ishan i Andizhanskoe vosstanie 1898 g.," in S.N. Abashin and V.O. Bobrovnikov eds., *Podvizhniki islama: Kul't sviatykh i sufizm v Srednei Azii i Kavkaze*, Moscow: Vostochnaia literatura RAN, 2003: 251-277.

K.H.

- MIRBABAIEV, A. K., "K istorii gorodskogo khoziaistva dorevoliutsionnogo Khodzenta [For a History of the Urban Economy of Pre-Revolutionary Khujand]," *IANT vost.* 1986/2: 49-54.

In this paper entirely based on Russian Czarist archive relative to Khujand (Leninabad during the Soviet period), the action of the Russian administration is described through examples of facilities such as the new bridge on the Syr-Darya between 1874 and 1912, the moving of cemeteries to the periphery of the city and the projects of installation of public lightening. Unfortunately the author did not try to confront the personal names and the budget figures that he is quoting with an analysis of the region's political and social history in the same period of time. This shortcoming reduces the interest of this paper, which however touches a subject too rarely dealt with by Soviet historians: the colonial period of Central Asia. V.F.

- MIRZA AKHMEDOVA, P. M., RASHIDOVA, D. A., "K izucheniiu dzhadidskogo dvizheniia [Contribution to the Study of the Jadid Movement]," *ONU* 1990/7: 30-40.

One of the most notable contributions to the first rehabilitation of the Jadid movement



in Uzbekistan, this study is still based on a very limited amount of recently rediscovered primary sources, made of the only texts accessible in printed form at the end of the Soviet period (the "Selected Works" of Fayz-Allāh Khwāja in a posthumous Russian translation and the "Materials for the History of the Revolution of Bukhara" by 'Aynī, in a truncated version — both texts written and published well after the Bolshevik takeover). The authors have tried to cut off with one of the dogmas of the Soviet historiography of Jadidism, which tended to oppose dialectically the good "liberals" (an emerging autochthonous intelligentsia and the petty bourgeoisie) and the bad "traditionalists" and "pan-Turkists" (identified by the bazaar people) inside the party of the Young Bukharans during the revolutionary period. Self-conscious of the limits of their inquiry, the authors invite their readers to rediscover an unsuspected amount of sources for the history of Jadidism, totally ignored by Soviet historians. S.A.D.

- MĪRZĀ SIRĀJ AL-DĪN BUKHĀRĀ'Ī, Hājjī 'Abd al-Ra'uf, *Tuhaf-i ahl-i Bukhārā* [Souvenirs for the People of Bukhara], ed. Mohammad Asadiyān, 2nd ed., Tehran: Enteshārāt-e Bū 'Alī, 1370/1991, 384 p.

This is the re-edition in a limited amount of copies (500 only, intended partly for Tajikistan) of the accounts by Mīrzā Sirāj al-Dīn Bukhārā'ī, *takhallus* Hakīm (1877-1914), of his travels in Western Europe, but also in Iran where he was from 1907 to 1910, in Tehran and in the Mazandaran, a privileged witness of the Constitutional revolution, and in Afghanistan from where he came back full of admiration for the reforms of the former Emir 'Abd al-Rahman. The text, achieved in 1910 and of which a first edition, lithographic, had been published in 1912, has also been re-edited in Cyrillic script by Saloheddin Solehov and Masrur Mirzoev (Dushanbe: Adib, 1992, 272 p.), followed by a French translation (by the author of this notice: *Souvenirs de voyage pour les gens de Boukhara*, Arles: Actes Sud / Sindbad, 1998). S.A.D.

- MUHAMMAD AZIZ MARGILONIY, *Tarikhi Aziziy (Farghona chor mustamlaka davrida)* [Aziz's History: The Ferghana Valley during the Period of the Czarist Colonial Rule], ed., intro. and notes by Shodmon Vohidov va Dilorom Sangirova, Tashkent: Ma'naviyat, 1999, 112 p.

This is the modernized Uzbek edition of the fifth chapter of the *Tārīkh-i 'Azīzī*, the unique autographic manuscript of which is located in the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies in Tashkent. It presents us detailed description of political and socio-economic affairs in the Ferghana Valley from the 1860s to 1910. Among others the author's accounts of Dukchi Ishan and the Andijan uprising in 1898 represents an interesting interpretation by a local Muslim intellectual as to this extraordinary incident under Russian rule. Publication of local histories is highly expected. K.H.

- [Mullā 'Ālim Makhdūm Hājjī] MULLA OLIM MAKHDUM HOJI, *Tarikhi Turkiston* [History of Turkestan]; ed. Tulqin Alimardonov & Nurboi Hakim, Qarshi: Nasaf nashrioti, 1992, 149

p.

This book provides an edition in Cyrillic script (and without critical apparatus) of a history of the khanate of Kokand written in Turkī in 1915, by the chronicle writer from Ferghana Mullā ‘Ālim Makhdūm Hājjī. Relying for a large part on previous works, the *Ta’rīkh-i Turkistān* constitutes however an interesting source for the history of the Russian colonization of the Ferghana and, in its second part, for that of the Emirate of Bukhara and of the Khanate of Kokand under the Russian protectorate. The author gives interesting reflections on contemporary events, notably on the efforts of military reinforcement and political modernization under the Emir ‘Abd al-Ahad (r. 1885-1910).

S.A.D.

● MUKHTAROV, Akhror Mukhtarovich, dir., *Iz istorii narodnykh dvizhenii v Srednei Azii (Sbornik statei, posviashchennykh 100-letiiu vosstaniia Vose)* [Elements of History of the Popular Movements in Middle Asia (Collected Papers, in Honor of the 100th Anniversary of Wāsī’s Uprising)], Dushanbe: Donish, 1988 (Akademiia nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR, Institut istorii im. A. Donisha), 135 p.

Through Persian textual sources and inquiries made in the 1960’s among former participants in the late 19th-century revolts in Baljuan (today the region of Danghara, in southern Tajikistan), two Tajik historians bring new light on the highly fashionable (in late Soviet time) subject of the "popular revolts" in pre-modern Central Asia, from the 15th to the early 20th century. Bahodur Iskandarovich ISKANDAROV devotes the first paper of this volume to a study of the social roots of the so-called "revolt of Wāsī" (from 1885 to 1887/88): "Vosstanie krest’ianskikh mass Tadzhikistana pod rukovodstvom Vose [The Uprising of the Peasant Masses of Tajikistan under the Leadership of Wāsī]," 7-25. Davlat Sabirov, a cultivator, who was a witness of the revolts of Baljuan under ‘Abd al-Wāsī’ and (in 1916) under Mīr Nādir, brings personal memories on some quantitative aspects of these movements (A. MUKHTAROV, "Rasskaz uchastnika vosstaniia Vose Sabirova Davlata (zapis’ 1961 g.)," 26-35; and "Vosstanie krest’ian Bal’dzhuanskogo bekstva v 1916 g. [The Uprising of the Peasants of the Baljuan Principality in 1916]," 35-42). Various Persian sources have also been visited. Such is the case with a letter from 1305/1887-88 by the *bek* of Hisar, Āstāna-Qul Bāy Qūshbēgī, announcing to the emir ‘Abd al-Ahad that he has sent him the prisoner ‘Abd al-Wāsī’ under escort to Shahr-i Sabz. (A. A. SEMENOV, "Vosstaniia protiv pravitel’sstva v XIX – nachale XX v. [The Anti-Governmental Uprisings of the 19th and early 20th Centuries]," 32-34 = reprint of: "Ocherk ustroistva administrativnogo upravleniia Bukharskogo khanstva pozdneishego vremeni [Study on the Organization of the Administrative Rule in the Late Khanate of Bukhara]," in *Materialy po istorii tadzhikov i uzbekov Srednei Azii*, 2, Stalinabad, 1954 (*Trudy AN Tadzh. SSR* 25): 14-16 and 55-56). Then comes a paper on the popular movement which marked the Timurid prince Sultān Ahmad’s accession to power in 1469. The study is based on a manuscript of 1035/1635-6, now in the National Archives of Afghanistan, of the *Akhbār-i jahāngīrī* by an anonymous chronicler familiar to Khwāja Ahrār (A. MUKHTAROV, "Vosstanie v

Samarkande pod rukovodstvom tkacha [A Samarqand Uprising Led by a Weaver]," 43-49). The last historical contribution to this volume is a study of the revolts in Bukhara and the Miyanqal in the last quarter of the 19th century, of the social roots of these revolts, and of the political game of Great Britain in Central Asia during the same period. The paper is based on archive material from Orenburg and from the Archives of Foreign Policy of Russia (A. MUKHTAROV, "K istorii narodnykh dvizhenii v Bukharskom emirate v pervoi chetverti XIX v. [Contribution to the History of Popular Movements in the Bukharan Emirate in the First Quarter of the 19th Century]," 50-64). In the last section of the volume, several papers are devoted to the reinterpretations of the figure of 'Abd al-Wāṣī' in modern Tajik literature, folk song, theatre and opera (see our review of M. Rajabov's paper in the section on literature and oral tradition).

S.A.D.

- [NADVETSKII, Andrei] NADVETSKIY, Andrei, *Boukhara*, transl. from English to French by Marie Suchaud, Paris: Edifra, 1993 (Juste à temps: les grandes archives photographiques), 159 p., ill.

Well served by a good technical presentation, this collection of photographs coming from Russian and Uzbekistani public archive collections on Bukhara at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries illustrates some aspects of the social life of the Emirate under the Russian protectorate: the ruler and his entourage; the army; the ethnic groups of a mixed population; the crafts; the monuments of the city and of the main towns of the Emirate.

S.A.D.

- NAVRUZOV, S., "Puteshestvenniki i uchenye ob administrativnom ustroistve Khivinskogo khanstva XIX – nachala XX veka [Travellers and Scholars on the Administrative Structure of the Khanate of Khiva in the 19th and Early 20th Century]," *ONU* 1991/10: 44-48.

This paper offers us a critical examination of the contribution of narratives by Russian travelers and scholars to our knowledge of the administrative structures of the khanate of Khiva before and after the Russian protectorate. Particularly interested in questions of community organization, the author (of whom we may deplore the ignorance of vernacular sources) puts into perspective the most diverse information on entities such as the *qawm* (basic community) or the *kent* (gathering of several communities on a clan basis), as well as on varied regional and local representatives of the power (*hākīm*, *nāyib*, *qāzī*, *āqsaqāl*, *mīrshab* and *ra'īs*).

S.A.D.

- POZAILOV, Giora, "'Aliyat yehudei Bukhara le-Erez Yisra'el ve-hityashvutam ba'ad le-mil-hemet ha-'olam ha-rishona [The Alya of Bukharan Jews and Their Settlement in Eretz Israel up till the First World War]," *Pe'amim* 25 (1988): 121-138.

Begun well before 1882, the date of the first *alya* (massive immigration), the movement of the Central Asian Jews towards Jerusalem expanded between that date and the eve of WWI, accelerated but not created by the Zionist ideology, the motivation being mainly religious. Between the Jewish communities of Central Asia and the

"Bukharians" were established in Jerusalem reciprocal dependencies: the Central Asian communities needed the spiritual support of their brothers in the Holy Land; the latter relied largely on financial contributions from the Central Asian communities. Pushed by the smallness of the city of Jerusalem, the Bukharians built up their own neighborhood outside of the wall, Rehōbōt. The community institutions included schools, printing houses and even a mutual aid fund. The Bukharians integrated themselves into the Sephardic community of Jerusalem, without establishing their own authorities before WWI. This war, the October revolution and the Ottoman administrative measures interrupted these financial transfers from Central Asia to Palestine and threw the Bukharian community of Palestine into a crisis of which it never really recovered. H.L.

- QAIUMOV, Aziz, et al., eds., *Hamza Hakimzoda Niiōzi arkhivining katalogi* [Catalogue of the Archive of Hamza Hakīmzāda Niyāzī], 1, Tashkent: Uzbekiston SSR Fan nashrioti, 1990, 456 p.; 2, Tashkent: Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiisining Fan nashrioti, 1991, 432 p.

These two first volume of a planned set of three (the third one was not published) give a publication in Cyrillic script of the personal archive of the Turkestanian political activist and publicist Hamza Hakīmzāda Niyāzī (1889-1929), now in the Institute of Manuscripts of Tashkent. The documents edited here are distributed according to their type (literary works, press articles, correspondences, etc.) and followed by several indexes which make easier its utilization. The first volume is devoted to documents written by Hamza himself, the second one to correspondences received by the writer (from May 1906 onwards). The whole set constitutes an important source for the study of the history of the Jadid movement in Turkestan (in the Ferghana and in Tashkent in particular). It casts a new light on the problem of the transition to Communism of a part of the first modernist intelligentsia of this region. S.A.D.

- QOSIMOV, Begali, "Zhadidchilik [Jadidism]," in Shuhrat Rizaev, ed., *Millii uighonish va uzbek filologiyasi masalalari. Uzbek filologiyasi fakul'teti ilmiy kengashi (11.10.90) da tasdiqlandi*, Tashkent: Universitet, 1993: 12-39.

Behind its general title, the present study is in fact an tentative statement on the political role of Moscow and of the Russian Bolsheviks of Tashkent against the autochthonous revolutionary movement, at the moment of the creation of the ASSR of Turkestan in 1917-18. S.A.D.

- QUSHMATOV, Abduvalī, *Vaqf (Namunahoi zamindorii vaqf dar shimoli Tojikiston dar solhoi 1870-1917)* [Waqf (Examples of Waqf Land Tenure in Northern Tajikistan, 1870-1917)], Dushanbe: Irfon, 1990, 192 p.

On the basis of a patient research in varied public archive collections of Tajikistan, the author proposes a typology and traces the evolution of numerous *waqfs* in the region of Khujand, West of the Ferghana Valley, and Ura-Teppa, at the feet of the Kuhistan, from the Russian conquest to the collectivization of *waqfs* and the definitive closure of

the madrasas by the Soviet power in Central Asia from December 1922 onwards. This study, very rich in factual information, reconstructs notably the modes of financing and organization of the mystical orders in the Ferghana and the Kuhistan; it offers an abundant material for the study of mystical and political sociability in these regions covered by brotherhood networks, and exposed to a permanent social agitation during the whole colonial period. S.A.D.

- SĀRLĪ, Orāz Mohammad, *Tārīkh-e Torkamanestān* [A History of Turkmenistan], 1, Tehran: Daftar-e motāle‘āt-e siyāsī va beyn ol-melālī, Mo‘assese-ye chāp va enteshārāt-e vezārat-e omūr-e khārejī, 1373/1994, xii-403 p., ill., photos., bibliography.

Beginning with the progresses of the military advance in Central Asia, this original work, richly documented (notably by numerous late nineteenth century Persian manuscript sources) deals mainly with the history of the khanate of Khiva and of the Turkmen steppe during the period of the Russian conquest, with a particular interest in the social and political organization of the Tekke during their resistance, up till the battle of Gök-Teppe. S.A.D.

- TABAROV, Sohib, *Munzim*, Dushanbe: Irfon, 1991 (Doqhoi siiohi ta‘rikhi Tojikiston), 152 p.

Based mainly on the historical and memoirs works by the writer Sadr al-Dīn ‘Aynī (1878-1954), the monograph devoted by the author to the reformer of Islamic teaching Mīrzā ‘Abd al-Wāhid Burhānzāda, alias Munzim (1877-1934), who was ‘Aynī’s companion, gathers dispersed information on one of the first introducers of the reformed education in Bukhara. Munzim theorized the "new method" inspired by Gasprinskii (Ghāsprālī) in Crimea and played a central role in the organization of the secret societies which became the nucleus of the future Young Bukharan party, before being active in the education system set up by the Soviet regime in Central Asia. One may deplore that the author, who had had access to unpublished information on Bukhara’s secret societies at the end of the protectorate, does bring about more precisions, in his work, on Munzim’s links with these organizations.

Also reviewed by Shimada Shizuo, *TG* 78/2 (1996): 055-062.

S.A.D.

- TAKHIROV, F. T., *Pravovaia sistema Tadzhikistana v dorevoliutsionnyi period* [The Legal system of Tajikistan in the Pre-Revolutionary Period], Dushanbe: TGNU, 1998, 71 p.

Under this anachronistic title (since the appearance of Tajikistan is not prior to the Soviet period), the author of the present work proposes a survey of the different judicial systems implemented on the first hand in the regions annexed from 1867 onwards to the Russian territory of Turkestan (Khujand, Ura-Teppe), on the other hand in the Easternmost regions of the Emirate of Bukhara under Russian protectorate. The author first deals with the Russian right as it was administered towards the empire’s "non-native" [*i.e.*, non-Russian] communities (*inorodtsy*). The chapters devoted respectively to the Islamic and to the customary law (curiously isolated from each other) rely for

the most part on ethnographic studies made during the Soviet period, which deprives them of most of their interest. The author has been interested in the contradictory effects of the Russian policy on the functioning of the judicial system in the Emirate of Bukhara: favorable to the traditionalist ulama, the colonial power encouraged the most conservative trends of the Hanafi *madhhab*; at the same time, the extension of Russian legislation in all fields concerned by exchanges with Russia was undermining from the inside the system set up with the establishment of the protectorate. These considerations are very interesting, and would have given place to more subtle conclusions if the author would have access to a more substantial documentation — beginning with an abundant corpus of vernacular judicial texts in Persian language, that he seems to have totally ignored. S.A.D.

■ TURAEV, Kh., *Regesty aktov po istorii feodal'nogo instituta tankha v Zapadnoi Bukhare (vtoraiia polovina XIX – nachalo XX vv.): iz sobraniia Tsentral'nogo gosudarstvennogo arkhiva Uzbekskoi SSR, Instituta vostokovedeniia Akademii nauk Uzbekskoi SSR, Bukharskogo muzeia* [Registers of Acts for the History of the Institution of Tankhwāh in Western Bukhara (Second Half of the 19th – Beginning of the 20th Century): In the Collections of the State Central Archives of the Uzbek SSR, of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of the Uzbek SSR, and of the Museum of Bukhara], Tashkent: Uzbekistan, 1991, 222 p.

This important work appears as a series of descriptive notices on endowment charters for lands, mills, baths and caravanserais made by the Emirs of Bukhara, for the most part under the Russian protectorate (the documents are dated between 1865 and 1919) to the profit of civil and military dignitaries. This catalogue permits the author to conclude on the reinforcement of the practice of *tankhwāh* during the period under consideration and on the growing devolution of the management of these endowments to the *amlākdārs*. The Eastern provinces of the Emirate seems to have distinguished themselves from this overall practice: taken from the khanate of Kokand in 1876, the *tankhwāhs* were particularized there by a lower level of immunity and a more rigorous control by the central administration of the Emirate. S.A.D.

■ [ZIIŌEV, Hamid] ZIIAEV, Kh., "Zavoevanie bukharskogo i khivinskogo khanstv tsarizmom [The Conquest of the Khanates of Bukhara and Khiva by the Czarist Regime]," *ONU* 1990/8: 30-39.

This paper brings some elements of relative innovation on the violent acts of the Russian troops and on the "popular uprisings" which have gone with the submission to Russia of the last independent khanates of Central Asia. The author follows a deplorable tendency to adopt the viewpoint of the little amount of testimonies by autochthonous witnesses and Russian archive documents to which he refers himself, in order to make them tell exactly the contrary of what they used to tell before the disappearance of the USSR. See also by the same author: "K istorii zavoevaniia uzbekskikh

khanstv tsarizmom [Contribution to the History of the Conquest of the Uzbek Khanates by the Czarist Regime]," *ONU* 1990/1: 22-30. S.A.D.

- [ZHOEV, Hamid] ZHAEV, Kh., "Natsional'no-osvoboditel'noe vosstanie 1916 goda v Turkestane [The 1916 Revolt of National Liberation in Turkestan]," *ONU* 1991/7: 27-36.

Seeing still a class conflict in the armed uprising of the summer 1916 in Turkestan, the author suggests some elements of chronology on the basis of the archive of the colonial administration kept in Uzbekistan. His study insists notably on the fury of the revolted populations against the autochthonous representatives of the administrative power (*mingbāshī* [district administrators], *āqsaqāl* [elders of villages and neighborhoods], less armed for their own defense than the officers of the Russian administration). We may deplore — although it is a rule of the genre — that the author tends to adopt without a real critical distance the discourse of the Russian authorities on the existence of plots by local and regional elites (in Jizzakh, in particular), aiming at taking advantage of the social disorders for recapturing a lost political independence. Among the merits of this paper, which quotes some witnesses' narratives transcribed by the Russian police, let's mention the significance given to the demonstrations of Muslim women protesting as soon as the first months of 1916 against the spectacular increase in the prices in Turkestan as a consequence of requisitioning measures. We may deplore that this study does not give much room to the determining role played in the organization of the uprisings by the learned milieus of Turkestan, in particular by mystical orders, in the Ferghana as well as in the "old Tashkent" (in the Shaykhāntāhūr Madrasa, notably). S.A.D.

### 3.4.D The Soviet and Current Periods

#### 3.4.D.a General Works

- ABDULLAEV, R. M., "Iz istorii natsional'nogo dvizheniia v Turkestane posle fevralia 1917 goda [Elements of History of the National Movement in Turkestan after February, 1917]," *ONU* 1993/4: 48-53.

Synthesis study, based notably on the reading of the Russian press of Turkestan during the colonial period, on the strategy of the "Muslim" political parties and organizations after February 1917 and in the months preceding the proclamation of the Autonomy of Turkestan. S.A.D.

- [A'ZAMKHUJAEV] A'ZAMKHUZHAEV, Saidakbar, "V preddverii dramy. Turkestanskii komitet Vremennogo pravitel'stva [On the Threshold of the Drama. The Turkestanian Committee of the Provisional Government]," *ZV* 1993/2: 135-148.

This study casts light on the failure of the Turkestanian Committee of the Provisional Government to conquer the support of the Central Asian "Muslim" political organizations. The author attributes to this failure a significant part of the Committee's weak-

ness in front of the structures set up by the Bolsheviks.

S.A.D.

■ [A'ZAMKHUJAEV] A'ZAMKHUZHAEV, Saidakbar, *Turkiston birligi uchun (Mustaqilligimiz tarixidan sahifalar)* [For the Unity of Turkestan (Pages of the History of Our Independence)], Tashkent: Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiyasi Fan Nashriyoti, 1995, 15 p.

A good connoisseur of the "Muslim" press of the revolutionary period in Turkestan, the author has presented in September 1996 in the Institute of History of the Academy of Sciences of Uzbekistan an important doctorate dissertation on the Autonomy of Turkestan (winter 1917-18), after the publication of a dozen of papers and booklets on the same subject. In the latter, among which is the present study, the author recalls the main preparatory steps of the proclamation of the autonomous government in Kokand. He insists in particular — perhaps more than necessary — on the unity of action of the Muslim organizations of the region during the whole year 1917.

S.A.D.

■ BAQOEV, Muhammadzhon, *Faizulla Khuzhaev, zhurnalist va publitsist* [Fayzullah Khojaev, Journalist and Publicist], Tashkent: Uzbekiston, 1992, 78 p.

Perestroika in history has first been expressed in Tashkent through the publication of papers and booklets rehabilitating postmortem the Uzbek Communist leaders of the 1920s-30s, liquidated during the red terror for their alleged "nationalist" tendencies and whose names remained excluded from the official history of the Uzbek SSR. The present monograph is devoted to the journalistic and publicistic works of Fayz-Allah Khwājaev (1894-1937), chief of the government of the soviet Popular Republic of Bukhara (1920-24) then of the Uzbek SSR (1924-37). The work is dated by the author's considerations on Khwājaev's loyalty towards the Leninist ideal.

S.A.D.

■ BUTTINO, Marco, "Study on the Economic Crisis and Depopulation in Turkestan, 1917-1920," *CAS* 9/4 (1990): 59-74, tabs.

Very useful for an understanding of the period of the establishment of the Soviet power in Central Asia, this paper is illustrated by numerous tables and an important apparatus of notes based on Russian statistics and on sometimes mutually contradictory economic and demographic data of the studied period. The author draws the outlines of the tragic economic and social crisis which touched Turkestan after the revolutions of 1917, the roots of which must be searched in the Russian colonial domination of the preceding half a century. These considerations bring the author to an overall conclusion on the devastating effects of the Russian domination for the peoples of Central Asia. The first part suggests, on the basis of economic data, an interpretation of the dynamics of the civil war in Turkestan, the second part the effects of famine on the populations.

S.A.D.

■ EISENER, Reinhard, "Some Problems of Research Concerning the National Delimitation of Soviet Central Asia in 1924," in B.G. Fragner & B. Hoffmann, eds., *Bamberger Mittelasiensstudien. Konferenzakten, Bamberg 15.-16. Juni 1990*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz



Verlag, 1994 (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 149): 109-116.

On the basis of some documents of the ethno-territorial division of Soviet Central Asia from 1924 onwards, now preserved in the Central Archive of the Communist Party of the USSR (Institute of Marxism-Leninism, Moscow), the author reveals the weight of "decisions taken from above" in the creation of the Uzbek and Tajik SSRs (notably through an evocation of Lenin's hesitations on the opportunity of creating in this region national republics), and the passivity of Tajik Communist leaders in front of a new boundaries very unfavorable to the Tajik ASSR. S.A.D.

■ GERMANOV, V. A., "Novyi dokument po istorii sovetskogo Tadzhikistana nachala 20-kh godov [A New Document for the History of Soviet Tajikistan in the Early 1920s]," *ONU* 1991/4: 41-47.

The two documents introduced by the author are the text, preserved in the Central Archive of the CPSU (Institute of Marxism-Leninism, Moscow) of the memoranda written in June 1920 by Grigorii I. Broido (1883-1956), responsible for the External Relations in the Turkestan Commission of the Central Committee of the Bolshevik Party, and sent by their author to Lenin, who put on the first one his personal annotations. Named as his post after the defeat of General Kolesov against the Emir of Bukhara (early 1918), Broido urges his peers, in various texts of this period, not to hasten the attack against the khanates of Bukhara and Khiva. To his eyes, a precipitated military attack would have launched a long and difficult armed resistance, and compromised the situation of the local oppositional organizations (the Young Bukharan and Young Khivian "parties"). Although these parties' strength was not overestimated by the Bolsheviks (Broido calls the latter "a puny lad"), they were supposed to be used in the framework of the establishment of new political institutions. Broido notably criticizes G.B. Skalov, the delegate of the Revolutionary Military Council of the ASSR of Turkestan for Khiva and the Amu-Darya district, for not showing enough confidence in the indigenous revolutionary forces. The text of the second memorandum is a series of practical recommendations for the accelerated education of political collaborators specializing in Central Asia. S.A.D.

■ GERMANOV, Valerii, "Kontrabanda," *ZV* 1994/7-8: 183-198.

The author delivers a series of historical considerations focused on the role of Russian revolutionary organizations in Central Asia on the ways of "exporting" the revolutions of February and October to Khiva, from the warning signs of the coup d'Etat of the Young Khivians in April 1917 to the strategic polemics of the years 1919-20 between the Bolshevik leaders of Turkestan Skalov and Broido. S.A.D.

■ GILSENSEN, V. M., "Turkestanskoe biuro Kominterna (osen' 1920 – osen' 1921) [The Turkestan Bureau of the Komintern (Autumn 1920 – Autumn 1921)]," *Vostok* 1999/1: 59-77.

Far from providing a systematic description of the short-lived Turkestan Bureau of the

Komintern in Tashkent, its organization, functions and activities, this article basically is a presentation of some findings about this institution in the *fond* 544 of the former Central Party Archive in Moscow. Gilensen's interpretations partly are rather speculative, for evident lack of sufficient knowledge about the general historical situation, relative circumstances (the Anglo-Soviet negotiations), or the role of and the interrelations with other Moscow institutions in Turkestan, e.g. *Turkkomissii*, *Turkbiuro TsK*; that the Turkestan bureau of the Komintern followed in the footsteps of *Sovinterprop* (the Council of International Propaganda) is not even mentioned. Nevertheless, these document findings as such deserve some interest. They show rather clear that this undertaking of the Komintern, besides causing some internal trouble, was almost totally inefficient, and that lots of money were wasted on more or less most doubtful revolutionary efforts and figures.

R.E.

- IVANOV, Iu. M., *October and the East. The Transition of the Contemporary Republics of Central Asia to Socialism*, Moscow: Nauka, 1987, 160 p.

English translation of a paper published in Russian, based for the most part on Lenin's writings and inner documents of the CPSU, on the evolution and the economic and social consequences of the October revolution in Central Asia. The chapter 5 deals with the religious policy of the CPSU during the "transition period." The author insists on the colonial situation which prevailed in the Czarist period and tries to demonstrate the economic success of the republics of the former Russian Turkestan.

C.P.

- JAHANGIRI, Guissou, "Les prémisses de la construction de l'identité nationale tadjike," in Mohammad-Reza Djalili & Frédéric Grare, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Genève: Institut Universitaire des Hautes Etudes Internationales, 1995: 29-54.

"How can one be Tajik?" The author studies the way the Ministry of Instruction of the young Tajik SSR, autonomous then federated (after 1929) tried to answer to this question since its creation in 1924. Hostile to the positions of the Turkestanian nationalists, who were favorable to a policy of linguistic Turkicization, the Tajik ASSR implemented a national ideology. This ideology was based, according to Stalin's criteria, on the definition of a specifically "Tajik" ethnic group and historical territory, and on the modernization of the vernacular Persian dialects of Miyanqal (the region situated between Samarqand and Bukhara). These dialects were promoted to the status of a press and administration language, whence a national literature was encouraged, on the basis of the literary tradition proper to Central Asia. Perhaps may we deplore that this part of the paper devoted to the description of the process of identity building introduces the first generation of Soviet Tajik intellectuals as the almost exclusive protagonist of this phenomenon. Their action is resituated in a very elliptic way in the three participant game which united during the 1920s Moscow, Dushanbe and Samarqand (then the capital of the Uzbek SSR) on the question of the ethno-territorial division of the former Russian Turkestan. The author also shows few interest in the decisive problem of the continuity and change between the early 1910s Jadidism — which had a strong

Turkist component — and the conversion of the intellectual elites of Tajikistan — a majority of whom were coming from the Jadid movement — to a Tajik national ideal.

S.A.D.

- KARIM, Ibrohim, *Madaminbek (Izhtimoi-falsafii ocherk)* [Madamin Bek: A Social and Philosophical Study], Tashkent: Iozuvchi nashrii, 1993, 72 p.

Reflection on the struggle years of Muhammad Amīn Bēk b. Ahmad Bēk (1889-1920), one of the mythical leaders of the bāsmachī resistance against the Red Army in the Ferghana Valley. The figure of Madamīn is often introduced in Tashkent, since the independence of Uzbekistan, as the protagonist of a specifically Uzbek national liberation struggle — a position assumed by the author, who tries to oppose the interpretations developed in the Islamist circles of the Ferghana Valley, which have since the end of the Soviet period developed an alternative vision of the bāsmachī resistance.

S.A.D.

- KASAEV, Sergei Savvich, *Nekotorye aspekty resheniia natsional'nogo voprosa v Uzbekistane* [Some Aspects of the Solution of the National Question in Uzbekistan], Tashkent: Uzbekiston, 1994, 80 p.

Contrary to what its title and its presentation let us imagine, this booklet does not deal with the current aspects — probably too problematic — of the national question in Uzbekistan, but focuses on the period from 1925 to 1937. The author shows interests in the less sensitive question of the distribution of land and water resources to varied ethnic minorities of the Uzbek SSR in the aftermath of collectivization. In fact the results of this study, which remain rather superficial as to the social impacts of the distribution of land to the republic's registered minorities (Jews, Kazakhs, Gypsies...), underlines the big regional disparities which appeared in the successive reforms of land property between 1925 and 1929.

S.A.D.

- KHASANOV, M. K., "'Kokandskaia avtonomiia' i nekotorye ee uroki [The "Kokand Autonomy" and Some of Its Lessons]," *ONU* 1990/2: 41-52.

On the basis of the archive of the "Muslim Bureau" (*Musbiuro*) of the Communist party of Turkestan, the author has been analyzing the cleavages which appeared in Kokand between the Russian settlers gathered in the local soviet, the autochthonous reformers of the Jadid movement and the more conservative ulama after the proclamation of the "Autonomy of Turkestan" (Turkistān mukhtāriyatī) on November 28, 1917 by a regional Muslim congress. The paper introduces the mechanisms of the degradation of the political conflict between these three identified forces, and its transformation into inter-community violence which opposed in the Ferghana Valley the European power, represented by the soviets and the Red Army, with different categories of the autochthonous population. The author strives hard to take the opposite view of Soviet historiography. He insists notably on the massive adherence to the anti-Soviet resistance among the Ferghana's peasants impoverished by the "red terror," and among their

notables hostile to the Bolshevik policy of confiscation of pious endowments (*waqfs*) and of suppression of the Islamic courts. The "Basmachis" struggle appears here as the prototype of a national resistance against the Soviet power, according to a conceptual scheme which has been more and more applied, since the late 1980s, by Central Asian historians of the colonial, revolutionary and early Soviet periods. The author, moreover, tries to denunciate the Red Army's role in the worsening of the conflict through the distribution of weapons to "Islamist" bands. Beyond this largely anachronistic scheme of interpretation, openly inspired by the situation in the Ferghana Valley in the late 1980s, one may deplore the confusion which is kept by the author on the social profile and on the political role of protagonists rapidly called "Islamic fundamentalists" and their "Islamist bands." Even in its vocabulary, the historical interpretation which is proposed here is largely inspired by the social and political reality of the Ferghana Valley since the last years of the Soviet period, and by the techniques implemented locally by the KGB for fueling internecine conflicts among the leaders of vernacular political movements. Behind the reformists of Kokand, allied with the "fundamentalists" one can detect the profile of the powerful Uzbekistani oppositional party Birlik. The author's reference, totally deprived of documentary basis, to the armament of Basmachi bands by the Red Army strongly recalls the critics launched by the press of Tashkent against the Soviet state, accused of backing the Islamist political parties created in Central Asia at the turn of the 1990s against the reformist and nationalist movements of the local intelligentsias. Besides, the paper is concluded by a warning to the current Uzbekistani power against the activity of the Ferghana's Islamists and against Russia's shady role in Central Asia. In this chapter of political recommendations, the author recalls the strategic changes of the Bolshevik party during the turn of the years 1921-2 (more conciliating attitude towards the religious leaders, return of numerous *waqfs*, legalization of the Sharia and of the local customary law, partial amnesty of the Basmachis, etc.): these liberalization measures are compared by the author with Gorbachev's "New Thought" (*novaia mysl'*): an excellent example of a teleological reading and politicization of the modern and early contemporary history of Central Asia. S.A.D.

- KHASANOV, Marat, "Smertel'nyi gambit: iz istorii osipovskogo miatezha [Deadly Gambit: Elements of History of Osipov's Uprising]," ZV 1991/10: 122-142.

Unfortunately deprived of any critical apparatus, this well-informed paper deals with the inner cleavages which appeared in the Autumn 1918 in the Bolshevik power in Tashkent, and which pushed the generation of the Turkestanian "old Communists," eliminated at that date from the party's direction, to join the so-called Osipov's uprising. S.A.D.

- KOCAOĞLU, Timur, "A National Identity Abroad: the Turkistani Emigree Press (1927-1997)," CAM 1998/1: 21-23.

Although the gathering into one historical category of the whole "Turkestanian" press published outside Central Asia since the end of the NEP appears rather discussable, this

paper must be praised for the very useful markers that give us on the main periodicals published by successive waves of émigrés from varied Central Asian regions during this period, including several newspapers and journals of current (mainly Uzbekistani) nationalist or oppositional movements and parties, not omitting several sites on the Internet.

S.A.D.

■ MAHMUDOV, M. M., ed., *Inqilob zhangchilari* [The Warriors of Revolution], Tashkent: Uzbekiston, 1990, 183 p.

The first step of the rehabilitation of figures of the recent past in Central Asia concerned, in the late 1980s, vernacular Communist leaders eliminated during the red terror of the years 1937-38. The present collective work offers a gallery of portraits of these "warriors of revolution" in which one can find several prominent theoreticians and protagonists of the Uzbek and Kazakh national Communist movements in the 1920s, excluded for long from the pages of official history (such as F. Khojaev, S. Khojanov, T. Ryskulov, etc.).

S.A.D.

■ MASOV, Raxim, *Istoriia topornogo razdeleniia* [A History of a Rude Division], Dushanbe: Irfon, 1991, 190 p.

Tajikistan's academic intelligentsia, in quest of ideological references after half a century of obedience to the Soviet ideal of the friendship of peoples, has been searching for new markers and references among the vernacular Communist leaders of the 1920s. The latter (among whom Abbas Aliev, Abdulqodir Muhiddinov, etc.) had tried to obtain Stalin's favor through a denunciation of the alleged "pan-Turkism" of their Uzbek counterparts, in order to limit the effects of a territorial division of Central Asia which, after 1924, had made Bukhara and Samarqand, but also Khujand until 1929, "Uzbek" cities. Rahim Masov, a historian of the establishment of the Soviet power in Tajikistan, reopens this highly sensitive theme of the boundary and the Tajiks' lost historical capitals, through a reconstruction of the opposition of the first Tajik Communist leaders to the "loss" of these cities. Productive of political legitimacy in 1991 as in 1924, the theme of the Great Tajikistan has not had, however, the awaited echo in the Tajikistani public opinion. We may deplore moreover, from a more strictly methodological point of view, the author's extremely one-sided and ideological use of a limited documentation: the author carefully omits to question oneself on the passivity shown until 1924 by the Tajik Communist leaders, gathered behind Muhiddinov, whose main preoccupation seems to have consisted of cutting off with their arch-rivals of the faction led by Fayzullah Khojaev, chief of the government of the Soviet Popular Republic of Bukhara and then of the Uzbek SSR.

Also reviewed by Komatsu Hisao, *TG* 78/4 (1997): 67-74.

S.A.D.

■ PERSITS M. A., *Zastenchivaia interventsiia: o sovetskom vtorzhenii v Iran i Bukharu v 1920-1921 gg.* [An Embarrassed Intervention: About the Soviet Invasion of Iran and Bukhara in 1920-1921], 2nd revised and enlarged edition, Moscow: Izdatel'skii dom "Muravei-Gaid,"

1999, 197 p., biography of the author.

Based on evidences from Russian archival documents Persits, a longstanding Soviet specialist in 'Communist movements of the East,' touches crucial points of the Eastern policy of early Soviet Russia: the change in world revolutionary expectations from West to East (1919-20) and practical consequences of this, the successful liquidation of the Emirate of Bukhara by military means (September 1920), and the two, in the end, unsuccessful interventions in Persia (Khurasan and Gilan, 1920-21). Though boosting his archival research, Persits's presentation of its results turns out rather superficial and Soviet-like incoherent. Untenable speculations too often have to substitute for lack of source criticism and analysis as well as obvious gaps in knowledge (e. g., mistaking propaganda statements for *realpolitik* (p. 16 ff.), or asserting that the diplomatic activities to appease Bukhara in summer 1920 (p. 73 ff.) were "for the sake of themselves" (p. 76), although he is mentioning the actual problem (p. 82 ff.) that the Politburo hesitated to approve of the already organized 'Bukharan operation' until mid of August 1920). Unfortunately, Persits is ignorant of Western research and, moreover, does not know about the developments in the 'Anglo-Soviet relations' of that period, which certainly had an impact on the decision making of the Soviet political leadership with respect to their Eastern policy. The latter, by the way, hardly can be called 'embarrassed' (*zastenchivyi*), rather than ruthless, but confined by a broader set of various political interests. Beyond these kinds of shortcomings, some interest deserve the findings concerning the short-lived Soviet Republic of Gilan (p. 90 ff.), in particular, Raskol'nikov's operation against Anzali and the Soviet relations with Kuchik Khān — a field, the author virtually is more familiar with. Nevertheless, also here the reader may wonder if it would not have been more useful simply to publish and annotate the core documents, than paraphrasing and explaining them in a way that raises suspicions.

R.E.

■ RIDDELL, John, transl., *To See the Dawn. Baku, 1920 – First Congress of the Peoples of the East*, New York – London – Montréal – Sydney: Pathfinder, 2nd ed., 1998 (The Communist International in Lenin's Time), 344 p., 2 maps, pl., glossary, index.

Edited in an apologetic spirit, this English translation of the stenographic account of the Congress of the Peoples of the East in Baku in September 1920 takes up for the most part a first annotated translation by Brian Pierce (*Congress of the Peoples of the East: Baku, September 1920*, London: New Park Publications, 1977). The editor of the present volume (first published in 1993) has added some appendixes and archive photographs taken from the City Library of La-Chaux-de-Fonds (Switzerland). In parallel to this publication, the edition of a collection of documents in two volumes has been prepared by Solmaz Rustamova-Towhidi and Bakhtiiar Rabiev; the taped manuscript can be consulted in Baku at the State Central Archive of the Political Parties and Social Movements of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

S.A.D.

■ TILAVOV, Akbar Tilavovich, *Stanovlenie i razvitie politicheskoi sistemy v Sovetskom*

*Turkestan: opyt i uroki* [The Establishment and Development of the Political System in Soviet Turkestan: An Experience and Its Lessons], Tashkent: Fan, 1992, 148 p.

Published at the author's expenses, this dissertation presented in the Nawayi University of Samarqand traces the formation of the political organizations (parties, trade union, Communist youths, cooperatives, etc.) of the ASSR of Turkestan and the SPR of Bukhara from September 1920 to September 1924. After Marco Buttino's works in Europe, of which the author does not seem to have been informed, the latter tries to demonstrate the weak audiences, until October 1917, of the Bolshevik party among the autochthonous populations of Central Asia. Vis-à-vis the latter, the revolutionary organization had a policy of deliberated segregation (creation of a "Bureau of the Muslim Communists," suppressed as soon as it begun to acquire some influence). He analyses with detail the continuity of the colonial mode of administration after the seizure of the power by the soviets: revolution in Central Asia was led by immigrants from European Russia, for the most part workers and soldiers of Slavic origin, and the new regime in the hands of Russian-speaking people was supposed to serve the interests of colonists of a new type. The most substantial part of the power was held by the central organs of the Bolshevik party, whence the soviets of "Muslim" deputies, restricted to the old neighbourhoods of the main cities (Andijan, Kokand, Bukhara...) remained under the control of assemblies and executive organs dominated by Russian-speaking figures. Simple cogwheels, local soviets continued to be controlled by the central organs of the party after the creation of the Central Asian first national republics in 1924. The same phenomenon can be observed at the level of production cooperatives, which were rapidly taken in hands by the representatives of the Russian immigration, and which were deprived of the remnants of their autonomy by a decision of the Central Committee of the Turkestan ASSR in February-March 1922. The author compares these neo-colonial and centralist tendencies to the autonomy and diversity of the social institutions of the Soviet Popular Republic of Bukhara, where the first trade unions were led by SRs and Mensheviks opposed to the new power's systematic nationalizations. However the latter's audience in the local population made them dangerous rivals for the Bolsheviks, which submitted them to regular purges and regulated their activity so as to transform them in mere registration offices. The work offers an interesting, although romantic, vision of the decisive period which preceded in Central Asia the creation of the national republics from 1924 onwards, although shows some weaknesses in the one-sided use by the author of the available archive documentation and the often formal character of his analysis of the functioning of the first elected political institutions and cooperatives of the Soviet period.

S.A.D.

■ [TOGAN, Ahmed Zeki Velidi] VĀLIDI TUGHAN, Ähmätzäki, *Khätirälär. Törköstandıng häm bashka könsyghysh töröktärzeng milli bulmysh häm kul'tura ösön köräshe* [Memoirs. The Fight of Turkestan and the Other Eastern Turks for their Existence and National Culture], transl. from Turkish to Bashkir by Ämir Iuldashbaev, Ufa: Kitap, 1996, 656 p., ill.

Recently, at least three different translations of Walīdī's memoirs have been published

in Russia, besides one Bashkir edition by Ä. Iuldashbaev, a shortened Russian translation by the same historian and his colleague Shafikovin (Zaki-Validi TOGAN, *Vospominaniia. Bor'ba musul'man Turkestana i drugikh vostochnykh musul'man-tiurok za natsional'noe bytie i sokhranenie kul'tury*, vol. 1, Ufa: "Kitap," 1994, 400 p.) and a complete Russian translation originally prepared by the Institute of Russian History of the Academy of Sciences of Russia already in 1990, but published in Moscow only in 1997 (Zaki Validi TOGAN, *Vospominaniia. Bor'ba musul'man Turkestana i drugikh vostochnykh Tiurok za natsional'noe sushchestvovanie i kul'turu*, transl. from Turkish to Russian by V.B. Feonova, notes, postface and index by S.M. Iskhakov, Moscow: s.n., 1997, 650 p.). As the original is widely accessible, there is no need to comment on the content of Walidī's rather subjective, but extremely readable memoirs. They are simply a must for students and scholars on the history of the Muslim peoples in the late Russian Empire and early Soviet Union. Rather, we constrain ourselves to a brief description of the editions and some commentaries on present historiographical debate on Walidī, as far as they touch editorial questions.

The Russian translation by Feonova is generally acceptable, and it should be the first choice for students to whom Turkic texts are inaccessible. The printing and binding of the paperback are poor, though. The typing is narrow and the quality of the reproductions disappointing. The historian S.M. Iskhakov from the Academic Institute of Russian History provided the edition with extensive footnotes on the mentioned personal, for about 500 pages of text they are no less than 90 pages of explanations. The same Iskhakov provided the epilogue, reflecting his interpretation of the development of the Muslim and Bashkir movements in a Moscow-centred perspective. This epilogue is to a large degree identical to his contribution on Walidī in the renowned Russian historical journal *Obshchestvennaia istoriia* (1997/6). Certainly subjective and selective sometimes, Iskhakov not without reason criticizes the contemporary historiography on Walidī in Ufa. From 1990 onwards, numerous conferences and symposiums on Walidī have been held at Ufa, including regular "Validovskie chteniia" (Walidī lectures).

In these lectures and publications the leader of the Bashkir and then Turkestanian independence movement underwent a metamorphosis from an unperson to the unchallenged national icon of post-soviet Bashkortostan. Given the multi-faceted personality and versatility of this fascinating intellectual and politician, certainly not a harmless choice for Bashkir nationalists, making a compatible national hero of him requests a rather selective approach to his biography and writings. This is exactly what Iskhakov blames historians in Ufa in general and their Russian translation of the *Memoirs* in particular for. Indeed, this shortened edition, which circulates in more than 13,000 copies compared to the 650 copies of the Moscow edition, omits not only certain passages without indication, but is less reliable in translation too. As Iskhakov correctly shows, it abounds in inaccuracy and sometimes provides even distorting and manipulating interpretations. Although the manufacturing of the book is more appealing, it cannot be recommended.

C.N.



■ TURDIEV, Sherali, *Ular Germaniada uqigan edilar* [They Had Studied in Germany], Tashkent: Fan, 1991, 71 p.

The author, a historian of the Turkestanian intelligentsia of the 1910s-20s, reconstructs the tragic itinerary of six of the students sent by the first government of the Soviet Popular Republic of Bukhara to Berlin and Hamburg, thanks to the cooperation agreement signed by the Soviet and German governments in the aftermath of WWI. Those who came back to Central Asia after completion of their higher education were then all accused, during the red terror in 1937, of espionage for Nazi Germany and executed. The author reconstructs the (real) links between these former students with national Communist leaders and "fellow travelers" hostile to the Russification policy implemented in the 1930s. S.A.D.

● YAMAUCHI, Masayuki, *The Green Crescent under the Red Star. Enver Pasha in Soviet Russia, 1919-1922*, Tokyo: Institute for the Study of the Languages and Cultures of Asia and Africa, 1991 (Studiae Culturae Islamicae: 42), 396 p. Republished Turkish edition: Masayuki YAMAUCHI, *Hoşnut olamamış adam — Enver Paşa: Türkiye'den Türkistan'a*, Istanbul: Bağlam Yayıncılık, 1995, 352 p.

This is the publication of the Enver Paşa archives located in the Türk Tarih Kurumu (Turkish Historical Society). Following the lengthy introduction to the historical background of his activities, the editor presents 191 documents in Turkish transcription, which consists of correspondence, appeals, decisions, speeches, military diary, memoranda, protocols and regulations dated between November 1918 and August 1922. Among them, for example, a secret report on the situation of Turkestan, probably submitted to Enver Paşa by an anonymous Turkish officer in ca. 1921, gives interesting comments on leading Jadid intellectuals such as Fitrat, Munavvar Qori and others (No.179). K.H.

### 3.4.D.b Kyrgyzstan

■ ASANKANOV, A., *Kyrgyz: rost natsional'nogo samosoznaniia* [The Kyrgyz: The Development of a National Consciousness], Bishkek: Muras, 1997, 228 p.

The author deals with the — relatively late — appearance and reinforcement of a Kyrgyz national consciousness during the last decade of the Soviet period and in the first years of independence. His study is based on numerous official documents and discourses by political leaders of varied tendencies, as well as on the national press, notably through the readers' post. This work permits an analysis of the process of construction of a collective identity in various strata of the contemporary Kyrgyzstani society. S.A.D.

■ KENČIEV, Japar, DOR, Rémy, SALK, Gundula, "Dire l'histoire en l'écrivant: un fragment de *sanjira* kirghize," *Turcica* 31 (1999): 489-508, index of the Kazakh and Kyrgyz figures of the *sanjira*.

The authors propose a statement on the current perceptions of the genealogy of the Kyrgyz people, on the basis of a manuscript of the scholar Japar Kench typed in 1991 (the last year of the Soviet period). The French translators have deliberately chosen to publish this text with a limited critical apparatus, with a clear consciousness of the multiple potential implications of this text — beginning with that which comes out of the expression, by a contemporary Kyrgyz scholar, of the will to gain the oldest possible historical roots, synonymous with political respectability. S.A.D.

### 3.4.D.c *Tajikistan*

■ ASTANOVA, G. Iu., "Dokumenty iz arkhiva Uzbekistana po istorii Tadjikistana XIX – nachala XX veka [Documents from the Archives of Uzbekistan for the History of Tajikistan in the 19th and Early 20th Centuries]," *ONU* 8 (1991): 55-60.

A specialist of the agrarian questions in the Emirate of Bukhara in the nineteenth century, the author evokes in a few dense pages the significance of the collections, of still very under-studied manuscript collections of the State Central Archive of Uzbekistan and of the Biruni Institute of Oriental Studies in Tashkent for the study of the most varied aspects of the economic, social and political study of present-day Tajikistan — the territory of which was divided, at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, between the protectorate of Bukhara and Russian Turkestan. S.A.D.

■ ATKIN, Muriel, "Religious, National and Other Identities in Central Asia," in Jo-Ann Gross, ed., *Muslims in Central Asia. Expressions of Identity and Change*, Durham: Duke University Press, 1992: 46-72, bibliography.

On the basis of Soviet Tajik literature (mainly history writing) and the official press of Dushanbe in the early 1980s, the author summarily reconstructs the discourse on identity of the Tajikistani intelligentsia, from the ethno-territorial division of 1924 to the launching of Perestroika. She underlines the extent to which the collective identities created by a numerically small "Russified elite" are still alien to the bulk of the population, which remains divided up according to multiple and diverse cleavage lines. Among the latter, the criteria of national or confessional membership play a secondary role. One of the big merits of the present paper, beside the author's identification of survivals of "localist" segmentations proper to a rural and mountainous country with a relatively low level of school education, is to recognize the difficulty for a remote observer to catch the modes of transformation of group solidarities in a country of oral tradition, in full social and political reconstruction. S.A.D.

■ FRAGNER, Bert, "Die 'Wiederentdeckung' des Persischen in Mittelasien: Sprachpolitik und Sprachentwicklung in der Sowjetrepublik Tadschikistan in den achtziger Jahren," in Udo Tworuschka, ed., *Gottes ist der Orient — Gottes ist der Okzident. Festschrift für A. Falaturi zum 65. Geburtstag*, Wien: Böhlau, 1991: 249-261.

The author first recalls that after the establishment of the Safavid power in Iran, the

Persian-speaking populations of Sunni Central Asia elaborated specific religious and cultural traditions, one of the external sources of which was not Persia, but India's Islam. The weakening of communications with Iran and the domination of Uzbek dynasties drove to a proper evolution of Central Asian Persian language, strongly influenced by the Eastern Turkic languages. The lack of contacts became an isolation during the Soviet period: Central Asian Persian language, called Tajik language, was successively transcribed into the Latin, then into the Cyrillic script, with a strong contagion of Russian vocabulary; moreover a specifically Tajik national ideology was set up *ex nihilo*, based notably on reference to ancient Sogdiana and to the historical turn of the Arab conquest and Islamicization (all things subtly analyzed by Térésa Rakowska-Harmstone in her reference work *Russia and Nationalism in Central Asia: The Case of Tajikistan*, Baltimore – London: The John Hopkins Press, 1970). However the author insists more on some recent expressions of the overall return to the great Persian tradition as it is practiced in the learned circles of Dushanbe since the mid-1980s (return to the Arabic alphabet, officially planned by the law on the state language voted in July 1989; linguistic purism excluding the multiple grammatical borrowings from the Uzbek language and lexicographic borrowings from Russia, adoption of terms and of grammatical and syntactic elements from Tehran Persian language). This evolution is astutely illustrated by a text published in 1988 in the weekly journal of the Union of Writers of Tajikistan under the pen of Abdurofe' Rabiev — who then became, in the following years, a prominent publicist of the nationalist political organizations, and led the public debate on the economic reform and on the reduction of the cotton monoculture.

S.A.D.

■ [KENJAEV, Safaralī] KENDZHAEV, Safarali, MIRZOEVA, Kutfiniso, *Ocherk istorii prokuratury Tadjikistana* [Studies in History of the Public Prosecutor's Room in Tajikistan], Dushanbe: Fond Kendzhaeva, 1995, 215 p., ill.

This historical study has been written by two Tajikistani jurists who have been personally implied in the Central Asian purges of the Andropov period, and then in the political struggles on the 1990s. For this reason, it is far from confining oneself to the starchy style of the Soviet period. Although this work should be confronted with numerous other partially autobiographical sources of the same period, it constitutes an extremely interesting document for a global understanding of the political cleavages which appeared inside Tajikistan's ruling class in the years which preceded the launching of the civil war in 1992. A special attention will be given by the reader to modes of utilization of the police and justice apparatus of a Central Asian Soviet republic in the framework of the successive purge campaigns to which the national Communist parties have been submitted by Moscow since the early 1980s.

S.A.D.

■ MASOV, Rahim, *Tadzhiki: istoriia s grifom "sovershenno sekretno"* [The Tajiks: A 'Top Secret' History] Dushanbe: Tsentr izdaniia kul'turnogo naslediia, 1995.

A new polemic and sensationalist work by the irremovable director of the Institute of

History of the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan, this book tries to demonstrate, on the basis of Soviet archive documents, how the "national rights" of the Tajik nation have been ignored as a consequence of the "intrigues" of the Uzbek government led by Fayzullah Khojaev during the ethno-territorial division of Central Asia in 1924 and in 1929. On this subject, which has caused a lot of ink to flow in Dushanbe since the last years of Perestroika, the reader can refer oneself to the less politicized and more rigorous works by Donald Carlisle on the national and territorial strategy of the Uzbek government, or to those by Reinhard Eisener on the absurd behaviour of the leaders of the Tajik Communist party, behind Abdulqodir Muhiddinov's clique, whose main preoccupation seems to have been, in 1924 as well as in 1929, to cut off through secession with the authority of the government led by their arch-rival Fayzullah Khojaev.

S.A.D.

- SECHKINA, L. P., *Tadzhikistan v gody Velikoi otechestvennoi voiny, 1941-1945* [Tajikistan in the Years of the Great Patriotic War], Dushanbe: Donish, 1989 (Institut istorii, arkhologii i etnografii im. A. Donisha AN Tadjikskoi SSR), 248 p.

A classical genre of Soviet history writing in Tajikistan, the study of that republic to the war effort between 1941 and 1945 is illustrated by the author with much detail. In the lack of overall critical and statistical perspective, it remains however difficult to appreciate with precision the impact of the war on Tajikistan's economy, as well as on the republic's demography, to say nothing of the representations of the conflict as they were transmitted by the Tajikistani participants of WWII.

S.A.D.

#### 3.4.D.d Uzbekistan

- AHMAD, Sirozhiddin, "Munavvar Qori: esse," *Shlu* 1992/5: 105-119.

Unfortunately deprived of any critical apparatus, these elements of a biography of the Turkestanian nationalist and modernist polygraph Munawwar Qārī b. 'Abd al-Rashīd Khān (1881-1934) sketch a rather complete picture of the latter's social and cultural origins, in particular of the family of learned people from which he was coming. They go on with a survey of his main activities during the colonial and Soviet periods, and end with testimonies of his parents and friends on his last years of freedom before his arrest in 1929, and on his captivity and death in deportation. Let's deplore that, in the lack of a sufficient accessible documentation, Munawwar Qārī's activities as an organizer of alternative intellectual and political sociability in Tashkent during the 1920s remain still unstudied.

S.A.D.

- BALDAUF, Ingeborg, *'Kraevedenie' and Uzbek National Consciousness*, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University, Research Institute for Inner Asian Studies, 1992 (Papers on Inner Asia: 20), 31 p.

Compared with other Central Asian nations, the making of the Uzbek nation underwent a considerably complicated process. The author, investigating the *kraevedenie* campaign

in Uzbekistan in 1920s, throws light on the emergence of an Uzbek national consciousness. In her analysis the Uzbek journal *Maorif va Oqitguchi* (1925-30) is used extensively. This work reminds us the importance of Central Asian periodicals in early Soviet period for studies in nation building in this area. See also her previous consideration: "Some Thoughts on the Making of the Uzbek Nation," *Cahiers du monde russe et soviétique*, 32/1 (1991): 79-96. K.H.

■ CRITCHLOW, James, "Did Faizullah Khojaev Really Oppose Uzbekistan's Land Reform?," *CAS* 9/3: 29-42.

The author has rediscovered in the Library of Congress a version of the full text of the intervention made by Fayzullah Khojaev, the first chief of government of the Uzbek SSR (1924-1937) at the Second Congress of the CP of that republic in November 1925 — a text still unknown by historians. Whence Soviet historiography used to introduce Khojaev as a "bourgeois nationalist" leader hostile to social reforms, this intervention on the "future problems of the economic construction of Uzbekistan" appears as an eloquent speech for the defence of the agrarian reform implemented from November 1925 onwards, and it clears up the image diffused by Stalinist propaganda. Khojaev's late political rehabilitation — undertaken in the 1960s but incomplete until the last years of Perestroika — can be explained by the resistance to change among Uzbekistani apparatchiks of the "generation of 38." The latter and their heirs nowadays have replaced the first generation of national Communists, victims of the red terror, and did not want to see the rehabilitation of the Bukharan political leader, who in the 1980s became an idol of the Uzbekistani reformist intelligentsia — cf. Donald Carlisle, "The Uzbek Power Elite: Politburo and Secretariat (1939-1983)," *CAS* 5/3-4 (1986): 91-132.

S.A.D.

■ FRASER, G., "Alim Khan and the Fall of the Bokharan Emirate in 1920," *CAS* 7/4 (1988): 47-62.

This useful paper describes in a detailed way the fall of Bukhara at the end of August 1920, through the British sources preserved in the India Office Library, and through the better known viewpoint of the Emir 'Ālim Khān, as it has been expressed in his manifesto published in Paris in 1929. In this text, one can find some elements on the ruler's biography as well as an evocation of his negotiations with the Bolsheviks and of his difficulties with the Young Bukharan movement. A particular significance is given by this narrative to the Emir's resistance during his retreat towards Afghanistan where he arrived in March 1921, accompanied by the ambassador and by several officers of this country, as well as by twenty five dignitaries from Bukhara. The author of the paper describes the former ruler's double attempt at warning the international opinion: in October 1920 towards the king of England and the British government, and in September 1927 towards the League of Nations — a period during which the former Emir tried to help the movements of armed struggle against the Bolsheviks. C.P.

■ GOLOVANOV, A. A., *Krestianstvo Uzbekistana: evoliutsiia sotsial'nogo polozheniia, 1917-1937 gg.* [The Peasantry of Uzbekistan: The Evolution of Its Social Situation, 1917-1937], Tashkent: Fan, 1992 (Akademiia nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan, Institut Politologii), 161 p.

Apparently, the contemporary history of Central Asia is still a matter too serious for being entrusted to historians: it is the Institute of Political Studies of Tashkent, the former Party School, which has ordered the present study on the catastrophic consequences, for the Uzbek peasantry, of the giving up of the NEP and of the collectivization of agriculture. The work shows how the kolkhozes and the sovkhozes, in spite of a certain original dynamism, could not develop these initial capacities because of the establishment of a system of bureaucratic management as soon as the second half of the 1920s. The author concludes his study, in a spirit of politicization of history which is particular to the 1990s, with a plea for a gradual privatization of agricultural land; at the same time he recommends the maintaining of a form of collective organization of agricultural work. His argument on this question is the over-occupation of Uzbekistan's useful territory and the necessity to look after a complicated irrigation system. To be noticed also, in these times of formal democratization in Central Asia, the author's proposal for the creation of a Peasant Party of Uzbekistan which, on a model borrowed from Eastern European popular democracies, would have been supposed to complete among the rural masses the task of President Karimov's People's Democratic Party.

S.A.D.

■ HAR'EL, Yaron, "Hanhaga u-mishtar ba-'eda ha-bukharit be-Erez Yisra'el bi-shnat 1914-1944 [Leadership and Regime in the Bukharan Community in Eretz Israel, 1914-1944]," *Pe'amim* 25 (1988): 156-169.

In a special issue of *Pe'amim* on the Jews of Bukhara, this paper discusses the institutions of the Bukharan communities between 1914 and 1944, in relation to the Yishuv at large and in terms of internal communal politics.

H.L.

■ MAKHKAMOVA-KARIMOVA, N., "Tsennyi istochnik po istorii Uzbekistana 1925-1937 godov [A Precious Source for the History of Uzbekistan in the years 1925-1937]," *ONU* 1994/6: 54-58.

Summary of a "candidate" dissertation presented at the State University of Tashkent in 1994 on the archive of Fayzullah Khojaev's government as a source for the history of Soviet Uzbekistan.

R.

■ MURPHY, Christopher, "Abdullah Qadiri and the Bolsheviks: From Reform to Revolution," in Jo-Ann Gross, ed., *Muslims in Central Asia. Expressions of Identity and Change*, Durham: Duke University Press, 1992: 190-202, bibliography.

The conclusions of the present study would be of the greatest interest, if they would not suffer from some of the major shortcomings of present historiography of modern and contemporary Central Asia. For reconstructing the biography of the Uzbek writer 'Abd-Allàh Qādirī (1894-1940), the author has based himself exclusively on the mem-

oirs of one of the latter's sons, published in 1973; moreover, he satisfies himself with the analysis of Qādirī's extremely varied literary work through the Uzbek critics of the Soviet period. Last, nothing is said of the most important: *i.e.*, the reasons why Qādirī passed from Jadidism of his early years to the cause of Bolshevism — whence we now have written testimonies on the writer's activity in the Islamic reformist circles of Tashkent up till the end of the 1930s. It is true however that we deal here with one of the most striking grey zones of the history of contemporary Central Asian intelligentsias.

S.A.D.

- PENSON, Max, *Uzbekistan: Dokumentarfotografie 1925-1945 von Max Penson*, aus der. Sammlung Oliver und Susanne Stahel, ed. Erika Billeter, Bern: Benteli, 1996, 169 p., ill. [BLO: Gen II 8175]

We unfortunately could not read this album. On the work of Max Penson, a photographer active in Central Asia at the beginning of the Soviet period, one can also refer oneself to the following album: KHODZHAEV, Faizulla, *Uzbekistan otkrytym serdtsem. Povest' o zhizni i tvorchestve Marka Penson* [Uzbekistan with Open Heart. A Narrative of the Life and Work of Mark Penson], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo literatury i iskusstva imeni Gafura Guliyama, 1989, 135 p., ill..

S.A.D.

- PIRUMSHOEV, Haidarsho, *Ta'rikhi omuzishi shurishi Vose'* [History of the Study of Wāst's Revolt], Dushanbe: Irfon, 1992, 80 p.

A symbol of the "national liberation struggle" (*muborizai ozodikhohi*) of the Tajiks against the ["Uzbek"] Emir of Bukhara and his local representative the *beg* of Baldjuan, the leader of the big jacquerie of Mu'minabad in 1888, 'Abd al-Wāstī, is a key figure of the Soviet historiography of Tajikistan. However it is in an oral way that the narratives of the revolt have continued to be transmitted until the Soviet period (cf. A. Mukhtarov, *Iz istorii narodnykh dvizhenii v Srednei Azii*, Dushanbe: Donish, 1988, 26-31). The author of the present work, a professor of history in the Pedagogical Institute of Dushanbe, analyses the standard figure of Wāstī as it has been constructed through songs and tales in the people's "grey memory" — a preoccupation of which is to show the religiously licit character of the sedition — and as this figure has been then taken over by the official literature of Stalin's era, which found with Wāstī the ideal image of a revolutionary defending the social and national rights of "Tajik" peasantry against a foreign aristocracy.

S.A.D.

- QOSIMOV, [Julchi] Zhulchi, *Qora kuzoinak bilan iozilgan tarikh: Turkiston (Quqon) Mukhtoriati, millii-ozodlik (basmachilik) harakati va mustaqillik uchun kurash tarikhiga doir* [History Written with Black Glasses: On the History of the Turkestan (Kokand) Autonomy, of the (Basmachi) Movement of National Liberation, and of the Fight for Independance], Namangan: [Uzbekiston Respublikasi Kitobkhon Jamiiati Namongon viloiati bulimi boshqaruvi], 1993, 10 p.

This booklet is totally devoted to the critic of works published in the USSR during the

1920s on the Autonomy of Turkestan and on the Basmachi struggle against the Red Army in the Ferghana Valley, in which the author wants to see one movement of national liberation. An interesting example of the current rewriting in Uzbekistan of the history of the Turkestanian autonomist movement of 1917-18, and of a specifically Ferghanese historical memory of the early Soviet period. S.A.D.

■ [RAJABOV, Qahramon Kenjaevich] RADZHABOV, Kahramon Kenzhaevich, *Istiqlolchilik harakati v Ferganskoi doline: sushchnost' i osnovnye etapy razvitiia (1918-1924 gg.)* [The Independence Movement in the Ferghana Valley: Its Essence and the Main Steps of Its Development (1918-1924)], Tashkent: Akademiia nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan, Institut istorii, 1995, 32 p., Eng. summary.

The history of the Jadid reformist movement and of its correlations with the Basmachi resistance against the Red Army, during the revolutionary years and the early Soviet period, has been one of the most fashionable research themes for Uzbekistani young historians after the independence of their country in 1991. Through Russian and Soviet archive of Turkestan, as well as memoirs of some figures of the Turkestanian emigration (Mustafâ Chuqây, in particular), the author has tempted in this "candidate" dissertation to sketch the social and ideological portrait of some of the main *qurbāshīs* (the leaders of the armed resistance in the 1920s) in the Ferghana Valley, in particular of Madamīn Bēk and of Shīr Muhammad Bēk. He has also been interested in the role played by several *qurultāys* (congresses) of the resistance, which are introduced here as vectors of unification of the movement and as the first signs of the unachieved construction of a Republic of Turkestan. S.A.D.

■ [RAHMANQULOVA] RAKHMANKULOVA, Adolat Khushbakhtovna, *Obshchestvenno-politicheskaia zhizn' Uzbekistana (20e gody)* [Public Life in Uzbekistan in the 1920s], Tashkent: Akademiia nauk Respubliki Uzbekistana, Institut istorii, 1995, 32 p.

In this summary of a "candidate" dissertation, the author analyses, from the viewpoint of Gorachev's "new thought," the political role of the Turkestanian, then Uzbek Communist party in the implementation of reforms conducted from Moscow, from the NEP to the eve of collectivization. S.A.D.

■ SABOL, Steven, "The Creation of Soviet Central Asia: The 1924 National Delimitation," *CAS* 14/2 (1995): 225-241.

One of the numerous studies devoted in the early 1990s to the ethno-territorial division of Central Asia from 1924 onwards, this paper is based, as most of the publications on this subject, on a now published official documentation coming from the Moscow circles of the Soviet power. S.A.D.

■ THURMAN, Mike, "Leaders of the Communist Party of Uzbekistan in Historical Retrospect: the 'Class of 38'," *CAM* 1995/6, 19-27, 1996/1, 19-25.

Through official biographies written during Khrushchev's Thaw on three historical lead-



ers of the Uzbek SSR — Iuldosh Okhunboboev (1885-1943), Usmon Iusupov (1900-1966) and Sharof Rashidov (1917-1983) — who accessed to power in the aftermath of the big purges of 1937-8, the author tries to reconstruct the main steps of the (notably regional) faction struggles which have marked the history of the Uzbek party-state during the whole Soviet period. He has been particularly interested in the posthumous disgraces or successive rehabilitations of these three key figures, notably through the destalinization process which characterized the Brezhnev's time. The most significant part of this study however deals with the way the Karimov administration has been using the recalling of these great ancestors, since the end of the anti-mafia campaign of the 1980s, for legitimizing the permanence of an Uzbekistani political class which largely comes from the last decades of the Soviet period. S.A.D.

- VYDRIN, A. A., "Iz istorii iazykovoi politiki v Uzbekistane [Elements of the History of the Language Policy in Uzbekistan]," *ONU* 1990/11: 29-35.

Dealing in passing the linguistic and cultural policies implemented in the ASSR of Turkestan (1918-1924) and in the SPR of Bukhara (1920-1924), the author offers a short synthesis on the debates on the national language in the Uzbek SSR after the creation of ethnic republics in Central Asia, from 1924 onwards. S.A.D.

- YAROSHEVSKI, Dov B., "Bukharan Students in Germany: 1922-1925," in Ingeborg Baldauf & Michael Friederich, eds., *Bamberger Zentralasienstudien: Konferenzakten ESCAS IV: Bamberg 8.-12. Oktober 1991*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1994 (Islamkundliche untersuchungen: 185): 271-278.

Through a study of the political archive of the Auswärtige Amt in Bonn, this paper summarily reconstructs the history of the educational mission sent from Bukhara to Germany in June 1922, and the quarrels of its leaders with the Soviet authorities, before the forced repatriation of the Bukharan pupils and students towards the school created for them in Moscow, in January 1923, and the interruption of a policy of education of the executives of the new power outside of the USSR. S.A.D.

### 3.5 Eastern Central Asia (Xinjiang)

#### 3.5.A General Works

- ALMAS, Tyrgun, *Uigury* [The Uighurs], Almaty, 1995, 2 vols., 146+342 p.

The author of the present work has become famous since the end of the Soviet period as one of the main spokesmen of the nationalist line of contemporary Uighur history writing. One of the postulates of his book is to date back the roots of the present Uighur population of Xinjiang more than six thousand years ago, *i.e.* before the Chinese presence in this region. For resituating this highly polemic work in the context of the debates between Uighur and Chinese historians on the antiquity of the Uighur popula-

tion of Xinjiang, see Linda Benson: "Contested History: Issues in the Historiography of Inner Asia's Uighurs," in Michael Gervers & Wayne Schlepp, eds., *Cultural Contact, History and Ethnicity in Inner Asia*. Papers presented at the Central and Inner Asian Seminar, University of Toronto, March 4, 1994 and March 3, 1995, Toronto: Joint Centre for Asia Pacific Studies, 1996: 115-131. S.A.D.

### 3.5.B The Qing and Republican Periods

■ FORBES, A. D. W., *Warlords and Muslims in Chinese Central Asia: A Political History of Republican Sinkiang 1911-1949*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986, 376p.

This study is critical to the former studies' tendency to explain the political history of Republican Sinkiang (Xinjiang) in terms of power politics that is represented by Rudyard Kipling's famous words "Great Game," and instead suggests to examine those chaotic years from the "indigenous" point of view. The author, by using primary sources mostly preserved in the UK, succeeds in revealing the details of political history; chronological process of power-transition from Yan Tseng-hsin (1911-28), Chin Shu-jen (1928-34), Sheng Shih-ts'ai (1934-44) through Kuomintang authority (1944-9); and several political factors of this region, such as policies of Britain and the Soviet Union, the Kumul rebellion, Tungan invasions, and two Republics established by the local Turkic speaking peoples. His solid description is definitely helpful to learn about this complicated and brutal political fluctuations. For the next step of survey, first of all, it is required to utilize several "indigenous" historical sources written in Chinese and Eastern Turki (or Modern Uighur) which have newly discovered or published in recent years, and to reconsider the validity of Chinese periodization in the context of Sinkiang regional history.

Also reviewed by Shinmen Yasushi, *TG* 69/1-2 (1987): 92-99.

S.J.

■ MEYER, Karl E., BRYSAK, Shareen Blair, *Tournament of Shadows. The Great Game and the Race for Empire in Central Asia*, Washington: Counterpoint, 1999, xxvi-644 p., maps, index, 37 photos..

The ambition of this thick work is to be a guide for the history of modern Central Asia in its relations with the colonial powers. The authors have however limited their study to the history of the European and American attempts at penetrating Tibet at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The text is moreover reduced to a following of biographical notices, dealt with in a romantic mood, incomplete and poorly coordinated, hence a considerable amount of repetitions in the course of the book. The lack of any critical apparatus arouses doubts on the authors' use of primary sources, contrary to what is suggest along the text. However and in spite of numerous undocumented assertions on the intelligence activity by such figure of literary and artistic Orientalism of the time (on the links of N. Roerich with the NKVD or those of S. Hedin with the Gestapo, among others), the reader gains some elements of reflection on the general cultural background of the exploration of Inner Asia in the second half of the nineteenth

and the first half of the twentieth century. (To be consulted also, another work written in a spirit close to that of the present one: SHISHKIN, O., *Bitva za Gimalai (NKVD: magiia i shpionazh)* [The Battle for the Himalaya (NKVD: Magic and Espionage)], Moscow: Olma-Press, 2000, 400 p.) S.A.D.

- MILLWARD, James A., *Beyond the Pass: Economy, Ethnicity, and Empire in Qing Central Asia, 1759-1864*, Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998, xxii+353p.

This study examines the fiscal and ethnic policies which the Qing Empire carried out over Xinjiang in its initial stage (1759-1864). The author gives dynamic and extensive pictures of Qing Imperialism as an Inner Asian Empire based on enormous and various Qing historical sources. In the introduction he discusses on ambiguity and liminality of *Jiayuguan*, a traditional pass between China proper and the Western region. The following chapters examine Qing's Imperial policies and statecrafts on the matter of "beyond the pass." The author describes the geographical and historical background (chapter 1), and examines fiscal policies implemented after Qianlong's conquest over Eastern Turkestan (chapter 2), commercial policy (chapter 3), penetration of Han Chinese (chapter 4), trade between Xinjiang and China proper (chapter 5) and ethnic policies (chapter 6). To this "new dominion," the Qianlong court took the policy of ethnic segregation and established military government which heavily relying on annual subsidies from China proper. Afterwards, due to the financial crisis in the early 19th century, this ruling system and political ideology shifted to the fiscal dependence on the commercial tax, and to be allowed penetration of Han merchants. By showing detailed accounts of Xinjiang economy and several discourses by statecraft thinkers, the author successfully describes the expansion of liminality (or conception of the realm), and the process of transition toward the present situation of Xinjiang. As well known, present Xinjiang (Xinjiang Uighur Autonomous Region) is said to be an "element" of People's Republic of China, and this grand-design originated from the territory of the Qing Empire. This study primarily reveals that the ideological, economical, and political foundation of this region are correctively traceable to the transformation in the 1830s. S.J.

- ŌISHI, Shin'ichirō, "'Wakuto' shijōno Buruhan Shahidono kijini tsuite [About Burhan Shahid's Articles in the *Waqt*]," *SAK* 49 (1998): 68-84.

Burhān Shāhid (1894-1989) is one of the most famous Uighur statesmen in contemporary China. Just after taking office as the president of the Xinjiang province in January 1949, he cooperated with the Communist Party of China and played a great role in the so-called "peaceful liberation" of the Xinjiang province. In later years he worked in the Chinese Muslim Society and on his death he was praised as "a devoted Communist and eminent representative of the Uighur people" by Chinese authorities. However his earlier career has been distorted for many years. For example he was not a Uighur but a Tatar by origin, and was born not in Xinjiang but in a village near Kazan. As a result his earlier career is left unknown in many points. In this paper the author introduced

11 articles written by Burhān, who worked as a correspondent of the Tatar newspaper *Waqt* and sent his articles from Urumchi to Orenburg during the years 1913-1915. This fact has been concealed in China up to the present days. The author supposes that the concealment comes from the young Burhān's pan-Turkic ideas and pro-Russian attitude, which were considered unsuitable for a prominent Uighur Communist. While in the ex-Soviet Central Asia since the Perestroika period new source materials have begun to be discovered and the modern history to be written from a local point of view, in Xinjiang there is no parallel development in historical studies. However this paper shows the importance of Tatar periodicals for unveiling the historical events in modern Xinjiang. K.H.

- ŌISHI, Shin'ichirō, "Nūshirwān Yaushehuno Torukisutan shūyūni tsuite [About Nūshirwān Yā'ushef's Journeys to Turkestan]," *Kōbe Daigaku Shigaku Nenpō* 13 (1998): 20-36, bibliography pp. 32-36.

Nūshirwān Yā'ushef (mid. 1880's-1917) has been one of the forgotten reformist-Jadid Tatar intellectuals. However in the pre-revolutionary period his name was very popular among Turkestan Muslims by his number of articles and travel accounts on contemporary affairs in Turkestan, especially in Eastern Turkestan. Under the influence of Abdūrreṣid Ibrahim, who had accomplished a great travel through Eurasia, Yā'ushef decided to travel extensively in the still unknown Eastern Turkestan, and contributed many articles to famous Muslim periodicals such as the *Waqt*, *Shūrā*, *Āyīna* and others. Although in his writings he criticized severely the decadence and ignorance prevailing among the Muslim populations of Turkestan, as a Jadid journalist he intended to enlighten the people for cultural and social reform. He himself engaged in teachings in 'New Method' schools opened in Eastern Turkestanian cities. The author succeeds in reconstructing Yā'ushef's life, activities and legacy in Eastern Turkestan. In the attached bibliography we find the comprehensive lists of Yā'ushef's writings and related articles. Unfortunately the titles are shown only in Japanese translation. K.H.

- [USMANOV, Mirkasym] GOSMANOV, Mirkasym, *Iabylmagan kitap* [The Uncompleted Book], Kazan: Tatarstan kitap nāshriaty, 1996, 208 p., 41 photos.

M. Usmanov's history of the Tatar community of China's Xinjiang province is part history, part memoir. Usmanov, a professor at Kazan University, and one of Tatarstan's most accomplished historians, is uniquely qualified to write this book. He was born and raised among the Tatars of Xinjiang province, and emigrated to the Soviet Union from China in the 1950's. Usmanov's history, which is an expanded version of an article published in 1992 in the Tatar literary journal *Qazan Utlary*, is based on a wide range of sources. These sources include an Uighur history of the Tatars of Xinjiang, published in Urumchi in 1988, unpublished manuscripts by the Tatar historian Qurbān 'Alī Khālīdī (1846-1913), himself an imam in the Chinese border town of Chuguchak (Tachen), conversations with fellow Tatar émigrés to the Soviet Union, who today reside primarily in eastern Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan, and, of course, Usmanov's own

papers and reminiscences. Usmanov chronicles the origins of the Tatar community, from early in the second half of the 19th century, when Tatar merchants began settling among the Kazakhs living east of the Sino-Russian border. By the end of the 19th century Tatar merchants, craftsmen, and professionals were well established in the towns of Chuguchak, Qulja, and Urumqi. Usmanov also discusses the waves of emigration from Russia during the Russian civil war, and later in the 1920s, until Stalin's closure of the Sino-Soviet border in the 1930s.

Usmanov's treatment of Tatar cultural life before 1949, especially in the towns of Qulja and Chuguchak, where Tatars made up a substantial portion of the population, offers a glimpse of Tatar cultural life that functioned essentially independently. Despite the violent vicissitudes of political life in Xinjiang from 1920 until 1949, Usmanov shows a rather large, prosperous, and welleducated milieu that escaped, at least temporarily, the influence of Soviet norms and dictates on local cultural and educational institutions. As Usmanov points out, at its peak in the 1940s the Tatar population in Xinjiang numbered approximately ten thousand, and following the death of Stalin in 1953, the Soviet Union and Communist China reached an agreement whereby the Soviet Union would agree to repatriate former Russian citizens residing in Xinjiang. This included not only Tatars, but Kazakhs, and some Uighurs as well. The causes for this emigration were numerous, but Usmanov stresses the fear among Tatars of the implementation of Communist policies in Xinjiang, as well as Soviet propaganda. As a result, nearly 85 percent of the Tatar community of Qulja, and over half of the community in Chuguchak left their homes for the Soviet Union. As Usmanov points out, recent census data from China record 4,000 Tatars still in Xinjiang province, but these are primarily concentrated in the large city of Urumqi, and the Tatars' fundamental institutions, specifically their religious schools and mosques, have apparently ceased to exist.

Usmanov's book will certainly be useful to historians of Central Asia in general, and Xinjiang in particular. He comments in detail on the cultural interactions between the Tatar migrants on the one hand, and the local Muslims peoples, including Kazakhs, Uighurs, Kyrgyz, and Hui (Dungans).  
A.J.F.

■ WANG, Ke, *Chūgokuno isuramu to minzoku mondai. Higashi Torukisutan kyōwakoku kenkyū* [The Muslims of China and the National Question. A Study on the Republic of Eastern Turkestan], Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppan Kai, 1995, xii-289-10 p., [iv] pl., maps, tabs, index, English summary.

The author surveys the development and character of the national movement among Turkic Muslims in Eastern Turkestan from the 1920s to the end of the 1940s, focusing on the Eastern Turkestan Republic that was proclaimed in November 1944 and survived until June 1945 in Northern Xinjiang. Basing his study on unpublished documents left by the leaders of the republic, memories written in Chinese, Uighur and Kazakh languages as well as interview records, he succeeds in reconstructing the development of the movement for independence. Among other things the dual structure of the leading

body consisting in traditional Muslim intellectuals and pro-Soviet younger intellectuals educated in modern schools, the positive commitment and assistance of the Soviet Union both in political direction and military activities, and the real conditions of the Republic government are analyzed in detail. These aspects may be compared with the case of the Bukharan People's Republic (1920-1924). In order to complement the study of this republic it is required to utilize the Soviet sources which can underline the importance of the Soviet factors indicated by the author and provide a lot of information about Turkic Muslim nationalists who worked beyond the Sino-Soviet border.

Also reviewed by Tohutī (Ta he ti), *Isuramu Sekai* 49 (1997): 95-102. K.H.

## 4. Sciences, Arts and Techniques

### 4.1 General Works

● IVANOV, V. P., TROFIMOV, A. A., "Narodnoe iskusstvo chuvashei: sovremennoe sostoiianie i problemy [The Popular Art of the Chuvashs: Its Current Situation and Problems]," *SE* 1989/3: 81-89.

A dated text about handicrafts and their current state among the Chuvashs, this article has lost with time a part of the interest it initially had. In fact, according to the most rigid Soviet tradition, such folklorist studies usually try to demonstrate the successful preservation of folklore. The authors begin with a long chapter on the cultural syncretism of Chuvash popular arts (admixing Turkic and Slavic influences). The next step is a eulogistic evocation of the crucial role played by the "Affirmative Action Empire": Soviet modernization is proposed here as the main factor for the protection of traditions. Putting the accent on the role of the state, the authors end their article by remembering the first Conference on Popular Arts held in Chuvashia in 1982. Of course, the event is described as very positive for the enforcement of traditional arts of the "small" nations of the USSR.

X.L.T.

■ KALTER, Johannes, *The Arts and Crafts of Turkestan*, transl. from German Michael Heron, London: Thames and Hudson, 1984, 167 p., numerous ills., map.

The present work has been published first in German in 1983, under the title *Aus Steppe und Oase: Bilder turkestanischer Kulturen* for accompanying an exhibition at the Linden Museum of Stuttgart, which owns one of the most beautiful public collections of ethnographical objects from Central Asia outside of the former USSR. A number of these objects have been collected by the author himself. The work is more than an exhibition catalogue and a beautiful book on art. The first part is devoted to the history, until the 16th century, of the Uzbek, Turkmen and Tajik nomad or sedentary populations living in Central Asia and Afghanistan, to their respective way of life, housing and craftsmanship, with a preference for Turkmen crafts. This chapter is followed by numerous illustrations, mainly in colour, of costumes, jewellery, embroidery, implements, harness, etc. with texts explaining the motives, the fabrication and the utilization of these objects in everyday life, which gives the reader a living idea of the Central Asian civilizations in the 19th and early 20th centuries. It is comforting that the author does not always show certain as to the ethnic origin of craftsmen and objects, but prefers to indicate the regional or local origin. In cities like Bukhara or Samarqand, which were big trade centres and crossroads, the various ethnic groups and their respective cultures have influenced and enriched each other, which makes more difficult the identification of the objects according to an ethnic origin.

M.R.

■ SUGIMURA, Toh, *et al.*, eds., *Shiruku rōdo no kazari - Chūō Ajia to Kōkasasu no bijutsu: Kokuritsu Mosukuwa Tōyō Bijutsukan shozō* [Central Asian and Caucasian Applied Art from

the Collection of the State Museum of Oriental Art, Moscow], Chiba: Chiba City Museum of Art, 1998, 179 p., 280 notices, ill., fig., bibliography, map.

The exceptional Central Asian collection of the Museum of the Arts of the Peoples of the Orient in Moscow had never benefited from such a complete illustration — to the exception of its rich jewelry collection. This has been done thanks to this rich catalogue, almost entirely illustrated in colour, of an itinerant exhibition on modern "Silk routes," which has been organised by three Japanese museums between September 1998 and August 1999.

S.A.D.

## 4.2 Sciences and Techniques

■ CENTLIVRES-DEMONT, M., "Les fondeurs de socs à araire et de marmites," *Techniques et cultures* 8 (1986): 184-198, 2 figs., 9 phots.

This elliptic title hides a precise and well-illustrated description of the work of the foundry workers of Northern Afghanistan, the cast-iron ploughshares (*fāl*) and cooking-pots (*dēg*) from local iron ore or, more often, from salvaged old iron. As C. Gillmé had already demonstrated in a pioneering inquiry which is not quoted by the author (*Afghanistan* 27/2 (1974): 34-35), this is a Central Asian handicraft tradition different from the Iranian tradition of iron or wrought steel ploughshares.

See also, by the same author: "La toison d'or du Badakhshan (Afghanistan)," *ibid.*: 213-216, 1 photo. This paper provides a brief description of summertime gold washing in the Rāgh River, in the North-West of Afghan Badakhshan. It is a complementary activity practiced only by a little minority of peasants. The title of the paper makes reference to the utilization of a piece in weaved goat hair (*rinjek*) for trapping gold specks.

D.B.

## 4.3 Architecture and City Planning

■ EFENDIZADE, R. M., *Arkhitektura Sovetskogo Azerbaidzhana = Architecture of Soviet Azerbaijan*, Moscow: Sovetskii arkhitekt, 1986, 318 p., numerous ills.

Almost totally devoted to the Russian and International architecture of Soviet Azerbaijan, this book also presents illustrations of ancient monuments. The colour photographs allow the reader to discover and study these constructions which have been long forgotten in the West because of the lack of documentation.

See also: FATULLAEV, Sh. S., *Gradostroitel'stvo i arkhitektura Azerbaidzhana XIX — nachala XX veka* [City Planning and Architecture of the Late 19th — Early 20th Century Azerbaijan], Leningrad: Akademiia nauk Azerbaidzhanskoi SSR, Institut arkhitektury i iskusstva, 1986, 455 p., c. 700 ills. This is a well-documented book which allows the reader to follow the evolution of architecture in Azerbaijan from the first years of the 19th century to the last decade of the Soviet period. All genres and styles



have been studied: from palaces to simple houses, not forgetting mosques and public baths. C.A.

- GHOIBOV, Gholib, *Mazorhoi Mavloni Tojiddin Dashti Kūlakī va Shaikh Saqīqī Balkhī dar nohiiai Danghara* [The Mazars of Mawlānā Taj al-Dīn Dasht-i Kūlakī and Shaykh Saqīqī Balkhī in the District of Danghara], Dushanbe: Amri ilm, 1998 (Mazorhoi Tojikiston), 53 p., 1 ill.

By a specialist of the history of post-Timurid Khuttalan (south of present-day Tajikistan), this short work situates in their historical context two Islamic sanctuaries (*mazār*) of the Dasht-i Kūlak (the Danghara steppe): the grave of Saqīqī Balkhī, a holy man killed on the battlefield during the Arab conquest of Mawara al-Nahr at the turn of the 8th and 9th centuries CE, and that of Tāj al-Dīn Dasht-i Kūlakī, a local Sufi who had been a disciple of Amīr Kulāl, a Central Asian leader of the *Naqshbandiyya* in the 14th century. Based on numerous historical and hagiographical sources, the present work provides a good illustration of the current renewal, in Tajikistan, of local and regional history, in particular through the study of sanctuaries linked with the history of Sufism. In the same collection on the "Sanctuaries of Tajikistan," which is published by a new Tajikistani publishing company, one can also read, by the same author: *Imomi Ja'fari Sodiq va mazori ū dar dehai Hazrati-Imom* [The Imam Ja'far-i Sādiq and His Grave in the Village of Hazrat-i Imām], Dushanbe: Amri ilm, 1998, 35 p. S.A.D.

- MAMADZHANOVA, S., MUKIMOV, R., *Zodchestvo Kukhistana (Gradostroitel'noe iskusstvo i zhilishche v verkhov'iakh Zarafshana v XIX — nachale XX vv.* [Traditional Architecture of the Kuhistan (Town-Planning and Housing in the Higher Zarafshan in the 19th — Early 20th Centuries)], Dushanbe: Meros, 1993 (Soiuz arkhitektorov Tadjikistana – Khisoriskii istoriko-kul'turnyi zapovednik – Tadjhik GUOP – Tadjhikskii tekhnicheskii universitet), 101 p., 111 ill.

The result of a pioneering experiment of private academic publication in Tajikistan, this work, the first of a series launched in 1993 by two young Tajik architects, provides an analysis of the principles of settling and organization of traditional housing, in high-land and piedmont zones of the higher Zarafshan River. The work is based on materials collected by the authors during numerous expeditions. S.A.D.

- MUKIMOV, R. S., MAMADZHANOVA, S. M., *Zodchestvo Tadjikistana (Istoriia arkhitektury i stroitel'nogo dela Tadjikistana* [Traditional Architecture of Tajikistan (A History of Architecture and Construction in Tajikistan)], Dushanbe: Maorif, 1990, 176 p., ill.

Written for the Tajikistani students in architecture and architectural restoration, this textbook provides a rapid survey of building techniques on the current territory of Tajikistan, from ancient times to the 1950s. To historians the book offers a special interest thanks to the authors' study of the functional changes induced in several kinds of traditional community buildings (*mehmān-khāna*, *chāy-khāna*) in the aftermath of the city growth of the first half of the 19th century onwards, and of the Russian coloniza-

tion of southern Central Asia in the second half of this century.

S.A.D.

■ MUKIMOV, R., MAMADZHANOVA, S., *Entsiklopediia pamiatnikov srednevekovogo zodchestva Tadjikistana* [Encyclopaedia of the Monuments of Medieval Architecture of Tajikistan], Dushanbe: Meros, 1993 (Soiuz arkhitektorov Tadjikistana – Khisorskii istoriko-kul'turnyi zapovednik – Tadjik GUOP – Tadjikskii tekhnicheskii universitet), 244 p., 202 ill., index.

This important monograph, by two renowned specialists of the history of architecture of the Islamic period on the territory of present-day Tajikistan, offers, after a short historical introduction, a long series of notices on pre-Soviet buildings gathered in several typological categories: private houses, community buildings (mosques, madrasas, libraries, *qāzī-khānas*, tea houses, *mehmān-khānas* and *gap-khāna*), with an important chapter on *mazārs*. Each notice is followed by bibliographical references, and accompanied by illustrations which have been gathered at the end of the book. S.A.D.

■ MUKIMOV, Rustam, MAMADZHANOVA, Saliia, *Kiropol' — Istravshan — Ura-Tiube (Pamiatniki srednevekovogo zodchestva Ura-Tiube i ego okruga)* [Kiropol — Istravshan — Ura-Teppa (Monuments of Medieval Architecture of Ura-Teppa and Its District)], Dushanbe: Meros, 1993, 144 p., 104 ill., bibliography.

Despite its little format and its bad presentation, this work offers an invaluable contribution not only for the historians of architectural techniques, but also for that of sociability in Central Asian Islam — until the 1940s — thanks to numerous illustrated and well-documented notices (on monuments of private architecture, *qāzī-khānas*, tea houses, *mehmān-khāna* and *gap-khāna*, madrasas, mosques, *mazārs* and baths of Ura-Teppa), not forgetting constructions of a traditional type in the first decades of the Soviet period.

S.A.D.

■ NEKRASOVA, Yelizaveta G., "The Burial Structures at the Čor-Bakr Necropolis near Bukhara from the Late 18th to the early 20th Centuries," in Michael Kemper, Anke von Kügelgen & Dmitriy Yermakov, eds., *Muslim Culture in Russia and Central Asia from the 18th to the Early 20th Centuries*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1996, pp. 369-384, ill., fig.

This article addresses a specific cemetery complex in the city of Bukhara. This cemetery, known as Chor Bakr, or Chahār Bakr, dates as an Islamic cemetery to the 10th century CE, however, beginning in the middle of the 16th century, it came to be closely identified with the family of the Jūybārī *shaykhs*. Nekrasova's article comprises primarily an archeological description of the cemetery together with its development from the 16th through the 19th centuries, but also contains broader discussion of the specific terminology used by Muslims with respect to the specific structural elements of the complex. The article also contains seven figures, including black and white photographs of the complex, as well as architectural diagrams of specific structures. A.J.F.

■ NEKRASOVA, Yelizaveta, *Die Basare von Buchara. Das Antlitz einer Handelsstadt im*

*Wandel*, transl. from Russian to German by Anke v. Kügelgen & Michael Kemper, Halle – Berlin: Das Arabische Buch, 1999 (ANOR: 2), 58 p., 9 ill.

This little book continues the ANOR series of mini-monographs. It is devoted to the markets of Bukhara, their topography and architecture, with a special interest in the 16th century. The author notably shows how Bukhara's bazaars were not exposed to any radical change during the 19th century, when all Central Asian region was attracted into the sphere of influence of the Russian (colonial) market. The illustrations give a particular value to this work: carefully reproduced, they offer the reader an indispensable assistance; they also make this study useful as a supplement to their guide for the visitors of Bukhara the Venerable.

J.P.

● NIL'SEN, Vladimir Anatol'evich, *U istokov sovremennogo gradostroitel'stva Uzbekistana (XIX — nachalo XX vekov)* [At the Sources of the Contemporary City Planning of Uzbekistan (Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries)], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo literatury i iskusstva imeni Gafura Guliyama, 1998, 208 p. ills., maps.

This is a fundamental work that analyses the historical architecture and city planning of those cities located in contemporary Uzbekistan such as Tashkent, Samarqand, Kokand, New Margelan, Namangan, Andijan, Kagan (New Bukhara), and Khiva. The author, presenting extraordinarily rich illustrations and maps, describes the characteristics of architecture and city planning during the Russian colonial period and evaluate them in a historical context. This work enriches the imagination of, among others, historians who are interested in the modern history of Central Asia.

K.H.

#### 4.4 Arts and Crafts

■ BULATOV, S., *Uzbek khalq amalii bezak san'ati* [Uzbek Popular Applied Decorative Art], Tashkent: Mehnat nashriyoti, 1991, 384 p., ill. glossary.

This encyclopaedic volume of decorative arts as practiced nowadays in Uzbekistan has at least an advantage: it includes a great amount of technical data, beginning with plates with basic motives and elements of specialised vocabulary of each discipline (these lexicographic elements have been gathered in a glossary at the end of the book).

S.A.D.

■ ISMAILOVA, E. M., "Iz istorii oformlenii sredneaziatskoi rukopisnoi knigi XIX veka [Elements of the History of the Ornamentation of the 19th-Century Middle Asian Manuscript Book]," *ONU* 4 (1991): 48-55, 3 ill.

This important paper gives a brief evocation of the artistic milieus of Kokand and Khiva in the 19th century, through a little amount of primary sources among which is the *Majmū'at al-shu'arā* by Fazlī Namangānī (a *tadkhira* lithographed in Tashkent in 1900), followed by a description of several ornamented manuscripts produced in the workshops of Kokand and of Khiva during this period. Those manuscripts suggest to

the author the permanence of a tradition of court ornamentists in spite of the 19th-century social and political upheavals in Central Asia. S.A.D.

■ PINNER, R., DENNY, W. B., eds., *Oriental Carpet and Textile Studies*, I., London: Hali O.C.T.S. Ltd., 1985, 304 p.

The first volume of a new international and pluri-disciplinary publication devoted to the study of Oriental fabrics gathers 33 contributions, among which 14 papers given to the International Conference on Oriental Carpets, in London in June 1983. Among the papers concerning the Iranian world, let us signal: Ittig, A., "The Kirmani Boom: A Study in Carpet Entrepreneurship" (reviewed in *AI* 9 (1986), No. 406); Andrews, P.A., "Farmash-Weaving among the Shahsevan" (reviewed in *ibid.*, No. 1064); Azadi, S., "The Turkoman Kaplyk (Tent Entrance Decoration)" (reviewed in *ibid.*, No. 1091, see *supra* in the review of the paper by J.W. Allan); Pinner, R., "An Unusual Saryk Carpet in the Islamisches Museum, East Berlin"; Fischer, W., "Carpet Production and Trade in a Ersari Village" (reviewed in *ibid.*, No. 1054); Mukanov, M.S., "The Carpets of Qazaqstan"; Janata, A., "The So-Called Herat Baluch Carpets and Their Weavers" (reviewed in *ibid.*, No. 1095); Ramsey, P., "Flat-Weaves of Central Asia"; Abbasov, A.J., "Azerbaijani [sic] Carpets on the Home and Export Markets in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Century"; Salmanoff, E.A., "Dragons and Dragon Carpets in the Caucasus"; Kerimov, L., "Khatayi"; Jalabadze, G.V., "Khorjins in the ethnographic Department of the Georgia State Museum in Tbilisi." P.F.

● [RAU, Pip], *Ikats: Woven Silks from Central Asia. The Rau Collection*, foreword by Ralph Turner, Oxford – New York: B. Blackwell, in Cooperation with the Crafts Council, [1988], 92 p., col. ill., glossary, bibliography.

This richly and originally illustrated work (76 pages of full-size color plates) gives a partial but magnificent presentation of a private collection of old Central Asian *shāhī* (in Malay *ikat*) textiles gathered in Afghanistan at the end of the 1970s. This technique of reserving dyeing, the role of the Bukharan Jews in the history of this technique, various technical aspects of the fabrics, patterns and motifs, and the traditional use of *shāhī* clothes, then the decay of the *shāhī* tradition in the 20th century are analyzed in close connection with the social history of the Emirate of Bukhara and of Uzbekistan. See also, on the same subject: GIBBON, Kate Fitz, HALE, Andrew, *Ikats: Silks of Central Asia. The Guido Goldman Collection*, London: Laurence King, 1997, 368 p., ill.

S.A.D.

■ SVERCHKOV, L., PAKAKHRISTU, O. A., "Traditsii masterov nozhevshchikov Srednei Azii [Traditions of the Masters Knife-Makers of Middle Asia]," *ONU* 1990/7: 46-52.

This paper offers a short, but well-documented historical study on some technical aspects of the tradition of the knife-makers in the Ferghana Valley, and in the cities of Tashkent and Hazarasp (Uzbekistan) and Ura-Teppa (Tajikistan). The authors date from the mid-19th century the interruption of the importation by Central Asian metallurgists

of raw material from India and Iran (the famous "steel of Isfahan," of which Tajik craftsmen have long kept the souvenir), because of the concurrence of metals imported from Russia. However, through a subtle analysis of the metallurgical procedures that are still used nowadays in Central Asia (notably in Ura-Teppa), the authors observe that many traditions of fabrication have there survived to that change of raw material. Their study interestingly illustrates the permanence of a specific technology beyond the economic conditions that had prevailed at the time of its appearance. S.A.D.

- SYCHEVA, Natal'ia = SYCHOVA, Natalya, *Iuvelirnye ukrasheniia narodov Srednei Azii i Kazakhstana, XIX-XX vekov. Iz sobraniia Gosudarstvennogo muzeia iskusstva narodov Vostoka = Traditional Jewellery from Soviet Central Asia and Kazakhstan, 19th and 20th Centuries. From the Collection of the Museum of Oriental Art, Moscow* [Jewelry of the 19th-20th Centuries from the Peoples of Middle Asia and Kazakhstan. From the Collection of the State Museum of the Art of the Peoples of the Orient], Moscow: Sovetskii khudozhnik, 1984, 179 p., including 123 col. pl., bibliography.

Traditional jewelry has long been the sole section of the colorful Museum of Oriental Art, in Moscow, illustrated in albums and books on history of art. The present album is for sure among the most successful ones, with an introduction on the social uses and meanings of jewelry for the peoples of Central Asia, followed by a succession of 123 color plates of 19th- and early 20th-century pieces from various regions of Central Asia, each with a detailed notice (headbands, diadems, bracelets, earring, belt and breast ornaments, amulet-holders), with a strong representation of Bukhara's and Turkmen crafts. S.A.D.

- TEAGUE, Ken, *Metalcrafts of Central Asia*, Princes Risborough, UK: Shire Publications, 1990 (Shire Ethnography: 19), 64 p., black and white ill., bibliography, index.

The overall historical introduction of the present booklet casts light on the intimate links between the history of metal crafts and that of nomadism in Central Asia — the decay of the latter, and the establishment of Russian or Chinese domination and colonization, being seen as the main cause for the decline of the former. A second chapter evokes the main styles and decoration of Central Asian metalwork: animal style, Buddhist style (with a strong reference to Tibet and Mongolia), Islamic style (Altishahr, Transoxiana, Afghanistan and Iran), with a description of the main decorative techniques, from appliqué to welding. The next part is devoted to the forms and functions of tools and implements, jewelry, weapons and armors. The last chapter is on the manufacture of metals, from extraction to metal ware production and metal trade, with sections on non-ferrous metalworking, and on iron working. The whole text is followed by a short bibliography and composes an attractive synthesis on metalwork and society in Central Asia, with special reference to Mongolia and Tibet. S.A.D.

## 4.5 Music

● BUSYGIN, E. P., IAKOVLEV, V. I., "Gusli u povolzhskikh narodov [*Gusli* of the Volga Region's Peoples]," *SE* 1985/2: 109-116.

This paper offers a well-documented historical study of the tradition of the *gusli* (a musical instrument very close to cithara) in the Volga-Urals Region. Typical of Soviet ethnographical studies, the present paper is full of interesting details about the origins and the social use of the *gusli*, the etymology of the word in vernacular languages, the making of the instrument's technical aspects, and the manners of playing (which are different in each region). The result of a long-term expedition carried out by the author in various zones of the considered area (especially in Tatarstan, Mari-El, Bashkiria, and Chuvashia), the text insists on local evolutions of a common musical practice. Mutual influences and assimilation process are well described despite an overall primordialistic view of ethnicity. One can also regret the weak presence of vivid elements in this quite cold description of a folk tradition (on the two black-and-white photographs which accompany the text, the two *gusli* players from Mari-El look as if they are staying in a museum).

X.L.T.

■ DURING, Jean, *La musique traditionnelle de l'Azerbaïdjan et la science des muqams*, Baden-Baden: Koerner Valentin Verlag, 1988 (Collection d'études musicologiques = Sammlung musikwissenschaftlicher Abhandlungen: 80), 220 p.

The author introduces the art music of Azerbaijan under its musicological aspects and, mainly, from the viewpoint of the theory of modes. He exposes the historical context in which were elaborated the 19th century *muqams*, as well as musical life, musical instruments, and the modal forms and concepts of *muqam*, *dastgah*, *sho'be*. The intervals are evaluated with precision and situated in their melodic dynamics. The modes or *muqams*, the study of which makes of the bulk of the book, are analysed successfully with their scale, structure, motives, modulations and specific melodic types (*güşhe*).

See also, by the same author: *Azerbayjân, musique traditionnelle*, Paris: s.n., 1989 (Musée de l'Homme), 30 p., CD 68 minutes. This disc recorded in Baku introduces a panorama of classical Azerbaijani *muqams* in their vocal and instrumental forms. The booklet provides numerous indications on the system of Azerbaijani *muqams*, which is very close to that of Persian *dastgāhs*. See also DURING, Jean, ed., *Azerbaïdjan, le "tar" de Malik Mansurov*, Paris: Buda, 1997, presentation text in French and English, and recordings. The texts include a detailed description of the instrument, of its tunings and of its specific technique, as well as a succinct analysis of the modes.

See also, by the same: *Azerbaïdjan. Musique et chants des ashîq*, Genève: Musée ethnographique, 1990, 31 p., CD. This disc introduces for the first time in Europe recordings of the instrumental and vocal repertory of Azerbaijani bards, as well as urban popular songs. The recorded *‘āshiqs* are from Tabriz, whence the trio who plays the popular songs comes from Baku. The booklet relocates the art of the bards in the

global cultural and musical context of Azerbaijan.

R.

- DURING, Jean, *Tadjikistan. Chants des bardes*, Geneva: AIMP, 1999, presentation text and sound recordings.

This CD illustrates a classical or semi-classical poetry, according to a strong musical tradition, which is now disappearing or submitted to a process of deep transformation; most of the bards present in the collection are dead since the recording.

See also, by the same author: *Ouzbékistan, grandes voix du passé (1940-1965)*, Paris: Ocora, 1999, presentation text and sound recordings (the text contains unpublished elements on the musical life during the Soviet period, as well as biographical sketches and interesting anecdotes on these great male and female singers: to be noticed: the presence of three pieces of the Sufi repertory of the local Turkestan (Yasi) tradition, recorded officially during the Soviet period: a unique document in this genre); *Turkestan, komuz kirghiz et dombra kazak*, Paris: Ocora, 1997, presentation text in French and English, and sound recordings (the Kyrgyz *kuu* and the Kazakh *kui* are instrumental pieces elaborately composed by learned masters, who are often at the origin of transmission chains, following a mode particular to nomadic cultures, in which the spirit of the ancestors and elders is commonly venerated. The text evokes this very significant aspect of the Kazakh and Kyrgyz culture, and it includes glances on the structure of pieces and their meaning, as well as details on their technique and esthetics).

R.

- DURING, Jean, "Rythmes ovoïdes et quadrature du cercle," *Cahiers de musiques traditionnelles* 10 (1997): 17-36.

This paper analyses the rhythmical subtleties that make of the specificity of certain Inner Asian musics and which, although of an extreme importance for the musicians themselves, are never taken into account by theoreticians. Examples are borrowed from Baluch and Tajik-Uzbek professional traditions, although similar cases can be found in many different cultures. The analyses have been realised with very subtle technical means, and deeply question the notions of pulsation and of strong beat, on which have been based the majority of the theories of rhythm, in the Orient as well as in the Occident.

R.

- DURING, Jean, *Musiques d'Asie Centrale. L'esprit d'une tradition*, Arles: Cité de la Musique – Actes Sud, 1998 (Musiques du monde), 172 p., map, tab., ill., glossary.

Based on the hypothesis of an ontological difference between "nomadic" and "sedentary" spaces, the present book explores the multiple ways this difference expresses itself in musical practices in the south of Central Asia (with special interest in Uzbekistan). Other oppositions are suggested, for instance that between the culture of agricultural plains, whether Tajik- or Uzbek-peopled, and that of the surrounding highlands, peopled whether by Persian-speaking or Turkic-speaking populations: see for instance the classification of Khujand as a *maqām* and "Sart" city, by opposition to the surrounding

highlands.

The author's high sensitivity to the inner cleavages of Central Asian societies is fully revealed in his relevant analysis of the close association between the fest (*toy*) and relation to music among city dwellers of Transoxiana: "the Central Asian musical tradition has its eyes turned towards the sky and its foot linked by the sociability network of the *toy*" (p. 71). Here the history of musical practices gives a large room, beside musical execution, to the listening, and the listeners become one of its full right protagonists. This vision allows the author his considerations on the absence of a hierarchy between the varied genres, and the numerous bridges between them — on the contrary of the Occidental tradition — in the particular and significant framework of the fest. This picture is enriched by some portraits of contemporary musicians, astutely sketched according to their respective manner to conform themselves to the norms of *adab*, and their relation to the restricting institution of the *toy*.

Very descriptive and lively (see the chapter on "A Wedding in Samarqand"), the present monograph has the characteristics of a reference work, which goes far beyond the scope of its peculiar topic and discipline. A quality which shows quite rare in works published in the West on Central Asia: the author has made it one's duty to pay homage to local researchers, Uzbek and Tajik in particular (with long quotations of works by Razia Sultanova, the inspired author of the CD which goes with the monograph, and those by Aleksandr Dzhumaev: see the latter's considerations on the "split in two" of *shash-maqām* in the 20th century, for a better service of the respective national discourse of the Uzbeks and the Tajiks). It was also an excellent idea to publish the beautiful photographs of the 1870-80s from the Yunus Rajabi Museum in Tashkent. A longer review of this book has been published by the present author in *AI* 20-21 (1997-1998): 355-357. S.A.D.

■ DZHUMAEV, Aleksandr, "Abdurauf Fitrat i ego sovremenniki na 'muzykal'nom fronte' Uzbekistana (20-30-e gody) ['Abd al-Ra'uf Fitrat and His Contemporaries on the "Musical Front" in Uzbekistan (in the 1920s and 1930s)]," *TsA* 1 [7], 1997: 104-109; 2 [8] (1997): 111-115; 3 [9] (1997): 118-122.

Each of the three studies which make of this suite has been written in a particular mood and inspiration: the first one is by a historian of ideas, the second by a musicologist, the third by a historian. All resituate the polemics of the 1920-30s on the "Uzbek national music" (a notion then defined negatively, through its opposition to Occidental music) in the framework of the political upheavals of these two fatal decades. After his exclusion from the government of the Soviet Popular Republic of Bukhara in 1923, Fitrat appears to us as a figure of the liberal intelligentsia opposed to the leaders of the Uzbek CP. His portrait however lacks consistency, notably on Fitrat's relations, during these decades, with prominent political figures of the time, such as Fayz-Allah Khwajaev and Akmal Ikramov (see in particular No. 2, p. 112-113). We then learn very few things on the musical assemblies organised by Fitrat in his Tashkent house in 1935-37 (on this point see for instance, in this volume, my review of the memories by Yunus



Maqsudii). The present study nevertheless casts light on the extreme ideologization of official culture in Uzbekistan, from the early 1920s on, as well as on Fitrat's intellectual debt to Russian musicologists of the time. The author offers us a major contribution on the problematic of modernism and of the relation with European culture in Central Asia, in the years of the NEP and of collectivisation. S.A.D.

■ JUNG, Angelika, *Quellen der traditionellen Kunstmusik der Usbeken und Tadschiken Mittelasiens: Untersuchungen zur Entstehung und Entwicklung des Šāmaqām*, Hamburg: K.D. Wagner, 1989 (Beiträge zur Ethnomusikologie: 23), 348 p.

Here is at last a publication in a European language on this venerable moment of Central Asian music: *shashmaqām*. Moreover, the book goes further than is suggested by its title. The sources of Tajik and Uzbek *shashmaqām* indeed are also those of the whole *maqām* tradition, from Turkey to Kashmir and Turkestan. Beside Central Asian authors like Jami, Kawkabi, Na'ini, Darwish 'Ali, one can find more ancient classics, as well as references to manuscripts not exploited so far. As to modern sources, the author has consulted and quotes all the works available in Russian, a necessary condition to the achievement of such a study. Primary sources in Persian and Uzbek have also been exploited, directly or not. Coming after numerous monographs on the music of Central Asia, this work offers a useful synthesis, a genre which should be developed and systematised by musicologists. The main chapters of musical theory are studied in a diachronic and comparative manner, through reference to ancient literary sources. In the chapter on *maqāmāt*, *shu'bāt*, etc., the positions of the great theoreticians have been classified chronologically, in a summarised form. The reader can easily perceive historical changes, which are astutely underlined by the author. The same can be said on the chapter about musical forms and rhythmical cycles, which are envisaged one by one in a comparative spirit. This interest in comparison is also expressed through a synchronic approach: the structure of the classical Tajik and Uzbek suite is not only analysed and described through telling schemes, but also put into relation with other Oriental suites (*wasla*, *nubā*, etc.), as well as with the sequences of which these suites are made of. This synthetic work can spare the reader the compilation of a great amount of difficult specialized works, often uneasy to find. Above all, it constitutes an invaluable introduction to Oriental musicology, and a model of comparative study which still demands to be refined and extended to new sources (in particular to Indian and Persian sources not yet taken into account in current researches on the music of the Turkic and Iranian worlds). J.D.

■ KARAMATOV, F., NURDZHANOV, N., *Muzykal'noe iskusstvo Pamira* [The Musical Art of Pamir], Moscow: Nauka, 1986, 292 p., photos.

This remarkable work (the second volume of which has just been published) is an invaluable contribution to the study of the Tajik folklore as it has been preserved in the Pamir mountains. The book gathers not only songs and instrumental melodies (for *daf*, *dutār*, *rubāb*), but also dances the figures of which have been carefully drawn or pho-

tographed, pantomimes, and popular sketches. A dozen of pages only introduce music in its technical principles and cultural context. The remaining part of the work consists of a description of the genres and pieces, with transcription of texts, photos and musical notations. J.D.

- KASMAĬ, S., LECOMTE, H., intro., *Tadjikistan. Musique populaire du sud*, Paris: Fonti Musicali, 1990, CD.

Several singers and instrumentalists play in turn and together: solos of *dombra* (*dutār-i mayda*), measured and non-measured songs in Persian with instrumental and orchestral accompaniment, on classical and popular texts. Recordings have been made in the Kulab region and they give a good idea of the musical tradition of this region — a tradition in which the bard is the central character. Sung poems have been translated into French in the introduction.

See also: KASMAĬ, S., ed., *Davlatmand: musiques savantes et populaires du Tadjikistan*, Paris: Maison des Cultures du Monde, 1992, CD. One singer only, and one percussionist figure on this CD: measured songs, on Persian classical poetry with accompaniment by an instrument (*setār*, *ghijak* or *dombra*) and percussion; solo of *setār*. Dawlatmand is a singer (*hāfīz*) who represents the southern tradition of Tajikistan, which is made of a popular background and of a "professional" art, more elaborated than the former. The introduction contains the translation of the poems. J.D.

- KASSIMOV, Alem, *Mugam d'Azerbaïdjan*, songs and *daf* by Alem Kassimov, *tār* by Elkhan Mansurov, *kamānche* by Malik Mansurov, introduction and analysis of the modes by P. Bois, Paris: Maison des Cultures du Monde, 1989, 2 CD 72' and 62'.

These two discs have been recorded during four concerts given for the first time in Paris. They give testimony of Kassimov's exceptional mastery: the young nightingale of Baku, considered now the greatest master, combines the science of the *maqāms*, a perfect voice, a "polychromatic" *hāl* and an extraordinary sense of public performance (two elements Iranian masters always lack). During his concerts, the whole range of basic emotions is used, and carries the public in states varying from soft affliction to the irresistible desire to dance. It helps to understand what the Ancients had in mind when they evoke in their treatises the impact of music upon the human soul. J.D.

- KONDRAT'EV, M. G., "O chuvashsko-tatarskikh etnomuzykal'nykh paralleliakh (Vvedenie v problematiku) [About Chuvash-Tatar Ethno-Musical Parallels (Introduction to the Problem)]," *SE* 1991/6: 105-114.

This article contains some reflections of the author upon the merits of musicology for a better understanding of the origins of the Tatars and the Chuvashs. Presenting a compilation of ethnographic publications on their respective folk music, he gives some historical examples of clear influences (particularly in the second part of the 19th century during the "Tatarization" of Chuvashs). Concluding on the received idea of a "mix-

ture of cultures," the only innovation of this text could be methodological if there were some originality in the demonstration. Unfortunately, the author keeps a primordialistic approach to ethnogenesis questions, which deprives his arguments of a great interest.

X.L.T.

■ LEVIN, Ted, MATYAKUBOV, O., prod., *Bukhara: Musical Crossroads of Asia*, New York: Smithsonian – Folkways Recordings, 1991, CD.

Several singers and instrumentalists succeed each other: urban songs for celebrations, classical songs (in Persian or in Uzbek), Hebraic psalmody and Islamic song. The authors have tried to offer an image of ancient tradition which would be deprived of any trace of acculturation. The introduction text by T. Levin is detailed and well-informed.

See also: LEVIN, Ted, ed., *Shashmaqam: Music of the Bukharan Jews in Brooklyn*, New York: Smithsonian — Folkways Recordings, 1991, CD. Professional musicians of Central Asia are often Bukharan Jews. Art music owes a lot to them, but they emigrate in ever-growing numbers to Israel and the USA. The introduction text is very complete.

J.D.

■ LEVIN, Theodore, *The Hundred Thousand Fools of God: Musical Travels in Central Asia*, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press – New York: Queens, 1996, 320 p., photos., maps, notations, CD, index, glossary, bibliographical and discographical guide.

The term "Central Asia" corresponds here to Uzbekistan and the north of Tajikistan with Uzbek populations as well as Tajik (in the Surkhandarya, Yaghnab, and Bukhara) and Jewish ones (in Bukhara). The author has been exploring these countries since 1977; he brings us first to Tashkent, and introduces us to traditional musicians (Ma'ruf Khwaja, Turgun Alimatov), as well as to symphony composers (Kozlovskii) or to a star of Uzbek light song (Yulduz). The musical travel continues to Bukhara, a centre of the high tradition of *shash-maqām* (still sung in Persian language), and of urban popular genres diffused there by Shiite Iranian migrants from Marv and Khurasan. The reader then discovers in Khwarezm a classical repertoire and entertainment genres very close to it, as well as songs of professional bards closer to Azerbaijan. Of another genre, however, is the musical and poetic tradition of the Qongrat and Barlas of Surkhandarya and Qashqadarya, and of Qaraqalpaks. The privilege of professional bards (*bakhshī*), this tradition reflects an ancient oral culture of still tribalized Turkic nomads, but it also includes some Tajik elements. Our travel then moves away from the main routes, and disappears into the mysterious Yaghnāb Valley (Tajikistan), where remain musical forms which perhaps date back to the Soghdians, and belong to the Iranian style *lato sensu*. The mystical dimension of Central Asian music, which is often evoked in the preceding chapters, is clearly revealed through the description of a *dhikr* in Zarafshan, and through the meeting with a female shaman (*bakhshī*) in Shahrīstan (Tajikistan). Last the travel ends in the Queens, New York, where Jewish migrants from Bukhara perpetuate the social rites and the music of their native culture.

Each of these musical descriptions is described through its main aspects, with notations and sound illustrations in the CD which goes with the book, with photographs, transcriptions and translations of texts. According to the style of a travel account which has been chosen by the author, the framework is set up with ethnological, geographical and historical references, and the context is described with the precision which is expected from an ethnologist. Thanks to his literary talent, the author manages to transmit impressive amounts of information, which would discourage non-specialists. This narrative choice allows him to escape from the academic requirement of "global explanation," and to express a certain ingenuousness of the eye, which is the condition of a good observation. The other advantage of such a position is that anecdotes and descriptions, dialogues and monologues, historical perspectives, psychological sketches and portraits will captivate not only the specialists, but also cultivated readers and amateurs of cultural tourism. By all these qualities, the present work shows a major contribution to our general knowledge of Uzbekistan and Tajikistan.

Other review: by David Burns, *CAM* 1999/3: 29-30.

J.D.

■ RAJABOV, Askaralī, "Makomy i ragi i ikh otrazhenie v tadjhikskikh muzykal'nykh traktatakh XVI-XVIII vv. [*Maqāms* and *Rāgs* in Tajik Musical Treatises of the 16th-18th Centuries]," *IANT vost.* 1986/4: 58-61.

This paper offers notes on some 16th-18th century Persian works on musical theory, now preserved in the public libraries of Delhi and Dushanbe. These texts belong to the Indo-Iranian world and describe the 12 Iranian, Arab and Turkic *maqāms* as well as Indian *rāgs* at a time when these two traditions were coming close and influencing each other in Northern India.

J.D.

■ SHUSHINSKII, F., *Azerbaijan khalq musiqichilari* [Azerbaijani Popular Musicians], Baku: Elm, 1985, 480 p., phot.

As far as the study of the history of Persian music is inseparable from that of Azerbaijan, this work on learned (not popular) Azerbaijani music is of a great interest. Without tackling theory, the author draws a panorama of Azerbaijani music from 1830 to the late twentieth century (through contemporary chronicles and biographies of musicians), in which Iranian elements emerge: two examples of the latter are 1) the stay of Sattār Khān (the greatest Azerbaijani singer, from Ardebil) in Tabriz and then in the court at Tehran around 1840, 2) the teaching of the *ta'ziye* repertoire in Qarabagh, by troupes from Isfahan.

J.D.

● SULTANOVA, Razia, "The Study of Uzbek Music: Past and Present," *ART* 10 (2000): 1-15, bibliography.

This is a short but informative sketch of the development of Uzbek musicology during the twentieth century. Pointing out fiscal difficulties that the academic community in Uzbekistan is facing with, the author shows the prospect of Uzbek musicology. A select bibliography is attached to this article.

K.H.

- TAPPER, R., "Peasant's Pilgrimage: A Ballad from Afghan Turkestan," *Asian Music* 17/1 (1986): 20-34.

This paper gives a description of the structure, content, and meaning of a narrative song expressing the personal experience of a pilgrim at the mausoleum of Mazar-i Sharif. The author and composer is a Hazara *qesse-khwān* (ballad singer) from the region of Sar-i Pul, recorded in 1968. His song, accompanied with *dutār* lute or *dombra*, strongly differs from all the other ones in his repertoire, as well as from conventional religious songs. The author places the bard's geographical and cultural framework; he gives a transcription and a translation of the 23 *bayts* and of the *qasīda*, as well as a short and relevant musical analysis. J.D.

- TODA, Noriko, "Fōkuroa kara Sovieto minzoku bunka e: 'Kazahu minzoku ongaku' no seiritsu (1920-1942) [From Folklore to Soviet National Culture: The Process of Formation of 'Kazakh National Music' (1920-1942)]," *SK* 46 (1999): 1-32.

This article analyzes the history of Kazakh music in the early Soviet period on the basis of a meticulous research of historical materials and theoretical methods of anthropology and musicology. The author points out that the method of forming Kazakh "national" music was modeled on that of Russian music in the nineteenth century, when Russian musicians and ethnologists recorded folk music and used it for composition of classic music. Russians recorded Kazakh folk music, too. The Soviet state launched transformation of folk music into "artistic" and "national" one, in the sense that folk music should be developed by "professionals" and be made close to "common" (*i.e.* European classic) music, rather than be preserved by "amateurs" in the original form. For this purpose, musical instruments were "improved" and used by orchestras, which were alien to Kazakh musical tradition. These phenomena were connected with the concept of culture "national in the form and socialistic in the content." The article also helps students of present Central Asia to understand the impact of Soviet national culture on the nationalism of nowadays. U.T.

- ZERENKA-KOMINEK, S., ed., *Turkménistan : la musique des bakhshy*, Genève: [s.n.], 1991, CD.

Several singers and instrumentalists successively perform, in duos and trios, lyrical, moral and epic songs, with accompaniment by *ghijak* and/or *dutār ghijak*, solos of *dutār*, of *ghijak*, of *ney*. Various schools are represented. Field recordings have been made in Turkmenistan in 1988-1990. The presentation text is the best Western-language introduction to the music of Turkmen bards. J.D.

#### 4.6 Performing Arts and Cinema

- ABIKEEVA, Gulnara, *Novoe kazakhskoe kino — katalog* [The New Kazakh Cinema — A Catalogue], Almaty: [Eurasia Festival], 1999, 152 p.

This catalogue has been published on the occasion of the first "Eurasia" film festival of Almaty (1998). It introduces all the films made in Kazakhstan from 1988 to 1998. Every year is presented through a concise introduction, which sometimes takes up excerpts of interviews or film critiques published in varied cinema journals (*Aziia Kino*, *Novyi Fil'm*) or excerpts of academic works by the author herself. Then comes an introduction to each film: technical presentation, synopsis, prizes received in various festivals, and some quotations from papers on it (with references). The author graduated from the VGIK (critique section), and worked first at the redaction committee of the Kazakhfilm studios, then from 1992 to 1994 she was chief redactor of the journal *Aziia Kino*; she now teaches at the Institute of Theatre and Film of Kazakhstan. C.D.

- ABIKEEVA, Gulnara, *Kino Tsentral'noi Azii, 1990-2001* [The Cinema of Central Asia, 1990-2001], Almaty: IREX, 2001, 341 p.

This very complete work provides a panorama of Central Asian cinemas in the decade 1990-2001. Each of the five chapters of the book (one for each Central Asian state) begins with a summary of the history of cinema in the concerned country, which allows the reader to place the post-Soviet period in a historical perspective; a chronology summarises the most striking events. In a second part, the author focuses on the 1990s, the general characteristics of which are illustrated by a table on the film production. Last, the author analyses a dozen of the most representative films of this period, country by country (technical presentation, synopsis, biography and list of works of the filmmaker). The whole work casts light on the overall quest for new values in the Central Asian societies during this period. Some of the texts which introduce the films have already been published (mainly in *Aziia Kino*). C.D.

- ABUL-KASYMOVA, X. N., *Kino i khudozhestvennaia kul'tura Uzbekistana* [Cinema and the Artistic Culture of Uzbekistan], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo Fan Akademii nauk Uzbekskoi SSR, 1991, 148 p.

A conventional study on the links between cinema and the other forms of artistic expression (literature, theater, music, plastic arts) in Uzbekistan from the 1930s to the 1960s, the present work has at least one advantage: it provides historians with interesting elements on the cultural and political context of film production in Central Asia, and gives elements for reflection on the specific position of cinema in the modern national cultures elaborated during this period. S.A.D.

- AINAGULOVA, K., ALIMBAEVA, K., *Tendentsii razvitiia Kinoiskusstva Kazakhstana* [Tendencies of the Development of Kazakh Cinema], Almaty: Gylym, 1990, 159 p.

This work is primarily focused on the cinema of the 1970s-1980s, which makes of the subject of the first chapter. Then the authors follow the personal itinerary of Chaken Aimanov, a theatre director who became the founding father of Kazakh cinema. The theme of heroes in Kazakh cinema is also studied, and offers interesting perspectives for reflection, notably through comparison with other national cinemas of the USSR

(mainly with Russian and Ukrainian cinemas). In a last part, the authors introduce the history of Kazakh documentary film. C.D.

- [AHROROV] AKHROROV, Ato, "Le cinéma tadjik, cinéma du Toit du monde," in Jean Radvanyi, ed., *Le cinéma d'Asie centrale soviétique*, Paris: Éditions du Centre Pompidou, 1991: 85-91.

A renowned specialist of the cinema of Soviet Tajikistan — see his monograph *Tadzhikskoe kino (1929-1969 gg.)* [Tajik Cinema (from 1929 to 1969)], Dushanbe: Donish, 1971, 228 p., ill.; see also A. Akhrorov & S. Dzhurabaev, "Na ekrane: 70 let zhizni (kratkii istoricheskii ocherk) [On the Screen: 70 Years of Life (A Short Historical Study)]," in A. Akhrorov, ed., *Tadzhikskii ekran. Stat'i, vospominaniia, interv'iu*, Dushanbe: Irfon, 1980: 3-27 —, the author summarises in some paragraphs half a century of history, since the creation of the Tajikfilm studios in 1932 to Perestroika. Without dissimulating the obvious mediocrity of a significant part of the official production of the 1930s to the 1970s, Akhrorov concentrates on the generation of film-makers which emerged in the early 1980s (Baqo Sodiqov, Davlat Khudonazarov, Valerii Ahadov...). These creators are credited with an overall quest of new values for substitution to the Socialist morals. The author also apologizes for the manner in which some of these film-makers, the representatives of a young urban intelligentsia attached to the regulating role of the state, have denounced in their films the development of a new class of "businessmen" coming from the traditional society — a class characterised by an ethics of non-licit profit and the ostentatious redistribution of riches inside personal protection systems. These considerations provide an interesting illustration of the normative discourse which developed locally on "corruption" during the last decade of the Soviet period, and was then adopted by many external observers. S.A.D.

- MAKKĪ, Mahtāb, "Sinemā-ye Tājikestān: goftogū bā Sa'dollāh Rahīmof [Cinema in Tajikistan: A Conversation with Sadullo Rahimov]," *Kelk* (Tehran) 29 (1371/1992): 220-228.

The artistic manager of the Tajikfilm studios, the philosopher S. Rahimov gives an interview to M. Makkī on the specific production of these studios and of television in Dushanbe. He quotes Kimiyagarov, the specialist of peplums on themes from the *Shah-nama* ("Rustam and Suhrab," "Siyavush," "Kave," etc.). Among current film makers, he mentions Baqo Sodiqov ("Tornado," "Bukhara the Venerable"), Bakhtiyar Khudonazar ("Brethrens"), Maryam Yusupova ("When Grass Turns Yellow"), Murvorid Qosimova ("Today and Ever," "Clowns and Acrobats"), Valerii Ahadov ("Umar Khayyam"), etc. S.R. asserts that political and ideological pressures do not exist anymore, and most of film-makers produce their creations by themselves, with only 25% of state subsidies. Tajikfilm's artistic manager however deplores the lack of interest of local public in "intellectual" films, and he urges the Tajik creators to show ability, "like Americans," to deal with serious subjects with an aesthetic language capable to drive crowds to movie theatres. F.Ga.

- NOGERBEK, Bauyrzhan, *Kino Kazakhstana* [The Cinema of Kazakhstan], Almaty: Natsional'nyi prodiuserskii tsentr, 1998, 272 p.

The book gathers papers published by the author in daily and weekly newspapers of Kazakhstan (*Qazaq Ądebieti, Mädeniet, Kazakhstanskaia Pravda...*) and in varied journals specializing in Central Asian cinema (*Aziia Kino, Novyi Fil'm*). The references — sometimes commented — of all the papers have been gathered at the end of the volume. Whence works by Gulnara Abikeeva (see two accounts *supra*) are conceived like catalogues of the recent history of cinema in Central Asia, Bauyrzhan Nogerbek tries to write a history of Kazakh cinema since its origins, and brings about an interesting reflection on the relations between the state and the studios. To be noticed also: twenty pages devoted to animation movies. C.D.

- RADVANYI, Jean, ed., *Le cinéma d'Asie centrale soviétique*, Paris: Éditions du Centre Pompidou, 1991 (Cinéma/Pluriel), 191 p., ill., chronology, transcription tab., catalogue of the films, dictionary of film-makers, index.

This work has been conceived as a catalogue to the Soviet Central Asian season at the Pompidou Centre in Paris, from January to March 1991. As such, the book makes of an excellent tool for the discovery of the still unknown history of national cinemas in this region, from the 1920s to Perestroika. After a historical panorama by Jean RADVANYI ("Naissance et affirmation des cinémas d'Asie centrale soviétique, singularités et parentés," 45-56), the same author analyses the way Soviet cinema has been opened to Central Asian cultures, on the basis of interviews of several film-makers: Ali Khamraev from Uzbekistan, Tolomush Okeev from Turkmenistan, Davlat Khudonazarov from Tajikistan, Bolot Shamshiev from Kyrgyzstan and Seryk Aprimov from Kazakhstan. The following papers are devoted to short surveys of present-day cinema in varied republics: see *supra* our account of the paper by Ato AHROROV [Akhrorov]. To be noticed also, a paper by S. A. DUDOIGNON on the problematic of the taking root of cinema in Central Asia ("Les cultures d'Asie centrale dans le miroir du cinéma," 99-103) and another one by Marilyn FELLOUS on the representation of woman in Central Asian cinemas ("Identification d'une femme moderne," 105-106). R.

- SMITH, M. G., "Cinema for the Soviet East: National Fact and Revolutionary Fiction in Early Azerbaijani Film," *SR* 56/4 (1997): 645-678.

This paper deals with the birth of cinema as a propaganda tool in Azerbaijan, which according to the author was the starting point of the diffusion of cinema in the "Soviet East." A cosmopolitan city, economically dynamic thanks to the oil extraction and industry, Baku was considered by the Soviet ideologists an interesting experimentation field for the integration of non-Russian territories. Although the first fiction films were made there before the arrival of the 1917 take-over (the first one, *V tsarstve nefti i millionov* [In the Kingdom of Oil and Millions] dates back to 1916), the Bolsheviks are those who gave a real significance to cinema as "the perfect medium for criticizing the ancient and prising the new." The first Soviet films made in Azerbaijan as well as in



Central Asia have a strong "Oriental" coloration: the film set is that of "backward, ignorant, superstitious and brutal" Muslim societies. They bring large audiences in the big cities of Soviet Russia, and are characterised much more by a "chauvinist Marxism" than by a real aspiration to integration of native populations. Numerous films quoted in this paper are analysed in close relation with the evolution of the Stalinist policy of nationalities.

C.D.

■ THORAVAL, Yves, "Tachkent, rendez-vous international d'Asie Centrale," *CEMOTI* 24 (1997): 313-315.

This account of the Twelfth International Film Festival of Tashkent, in May 1997, provides the author an opportunity for a reflection on the status of cinema in post-Soviet Central Asia. He insists notably on the growing cleavage between a subsidised official production, numerically limited and cramped in a pompous historicism (see the panorama devoted by the Tajik film-maker Baqo Sodiqov to the "Great Prince Timur" in 1997), and an independent cinema which relies on international co-productions — or on local producers "with a sometimes opaque corporate name"... (For analogous considerations, see Pierre DAUM, "Nouveaux habits pour un cinéma national," *Le Monde diplomatique*, May 1999: 16-17.) One may deplore the absence, to this date, of an overall work on the specific economy and sociology of cinema in Central Asia, in particular on its mode of financing and distribution — or more exactly of non-distribution.

S.A.D.

## 5. Studies on Religions

### 5.1 General Works

#### 5.1.A All Religions

- CORLEY, Felix, *Religion in the Soviet Union. An Archival Reader*, Houndsmill: MacMillan, 1996, 402 p., 8 pl., index.

Although the present work focuses on the Christian communities of the USSR, and does not bring substantial revelations on the Soviet religions policy, its selection of translated documents, disposed in chronological order, provides useful markers for further documentary research. S.A.D.

#### 5.1.B Islam

- ANDERSON, John, "Islam in the Soviet Archives. A Research Note," *CAS* 13/3 (1994): 383-394.

The author proposes a short evocation of varied documentary funds concerning the history of Islam in the Soviet Union, since the aftermath of the red terror: the collections of the Council for Religious Affairs of the Council of Ministers of the USSR now in the State Archive of the Federation of Russia (documents there accessible cover the period from the mid-1940s to the mid-1960s); the archive of the Central Committee of the CPSU (now accessible for the period from 1953 to 1990 in the Centre for the Preservation of Contemporary Documents in Moscow; a significant part of these two collections remain inaccessible to researchers); last the archive of the Yaroslavl, Agent for Religious Affairs (now preserved in the Keaston Research Centre in Oxford, it contains notably a great amount of reports written on Islam in the late 1980s for the Council of Religious Affairs of the RSFSR). S.A.D.

- BENNIGSEN, Alexandre, WIMBUSH, S. Enders, *Mystics and Commissars. Sufism in the Soviet Union*, London: C. Hurst & Company, 1985, x-195 p., bibliography, glossary, index.

In this study on the survival of Sufi groups and on their importance in the "Muslim" republics of the USSR, the authors begin with a short description of the main *tariqas* — Naqshbandiyya, Qādiriyya, Yāsawiyya, Kubrawiyya and others —, and of their history on the territory of the former Soviet Union. From 1917 onwards, political authorities have tried to oppose them by any means to "official" Islam recognized by the state. In reality, the two are most often represented by the same *shaykh / mufīī*, which may explain the inefficiency of the attacks against unofficial Islam. After gathering estimations on the number of the faithful (up to 10% of the population in some regions), and describing rapidly the inner organisation of these orders, the authors evoke the practices in use (*dhikr*, prayers, pilgrimages, etc.) and their political implications. The object of a particular persecution, Sufism long offered a kind of refuge of national and anti-

communist values. Progressive Muslims like Sultangaliev are less famous than martyred *shaykh*. Among others, the book offers interesting notations on the influence of foreign radio stations, notably Iranian (Radio Gorgan), and on the concern of the Soviet authorities on a possible Islamist movement (pp. 107-8). For a reduction of the influence of Sufism, it must give its support to institutional Islam, and so doing contradict sixty years of militant atheism. The main interest of the book comes from its documentation, almost entirely of Soviet origin: the press and specialised journals focusing on Islam for better fighting against it; arguments are rather poor (invectives against "obscurantist fanaticism"). In the appendixes, the reader can find two maps and a detailed geographical description of the high places of Sufism in the Northern Caucasus, in Azerbaijan, in Central Asia and in Tatarstan. The bibliography is almost exclusively in Russian. Y.R.

■ BENNIGSEN, Alexandre, LEMERCIER-QUELQUEJAY, Chantal, *Le soufi et le commissaire. Les confréries musulmanes en URSS*, Paris: Seuil, 1986, 212 p.

For the first time in the West, a rigorous and global study was devoted, with this book, to the sociological aspects of Sufism in the USSR. Beforehand, research in this field has been exclusively achieved by Soviet scholars, and coined by a more or less open hostility towards mystical orders, by ideological prejudices and by the government's anti-religious propaganda. Moreover, most of these Soviet works remained for long inaccessible to Western researchers and the information they used to provide had to be interpreted with great care. A significant contribution, of the authors — both specialists of Soviet Islam — consists of their use of this information through a solid critical reading, confirmed by field work in various regions of the Soviet Muslim world.

The role of varied *tariqas* on the social, cultural and political levels is analysed in six chapters of a remarkable rigour and clarity: — 1. what is Islam in the USSR; — 2. the Soviet state and Islam; — 3. the historical background: Sufi brotherhoods (the Naqshbandiyya and the reasons of its predominance; the Qādiriyya, Yāsawiyya, Kubrawiyya, and "non regular" Sufis, the *tariqas* of the Northern Caucasus, of Central Asia, of the Tatar country in the Middle Volga); — 4. the organisation of the brotherhoods (centralised and decentralised *tariqas*); — 5. the followers (the problem of recruitment: family and professional backgrounds, recruitment in jails and camps, in military quarters, among women); — 6. the brotherhoods' inner life (rituals, literature, holy places, political and social activity, relations with the official Islamic hierarchy). The 80-pages long appendixes bring original information, in two parts: — 1. geography of holy places (pp. 181-221, Northern Caucasus, Azerbaijan and Central Asia with two maps and a map of the influence of *tariqas*); — 2. texts (pp. 222-259, four Naqshbandī doctrinal or political texts and two reports by governmental plenipotentiaries (*upolnomochennye*) on the organisation of the brotherhoods).

Several points, however, demand some remarks. Jihad is presented as the sole temporal aspect of Sufism (p. 9), and sacred disciplines and rules are interpreted in this spirit (e.g., in the case of the Naqshbandīs' *khalwat dar anjuman* [retirement inside the

assembly] and *safar dar watan* [travel inside the fatherland], p. 66) — a very limited interpretation indeed. No reference is made to the doctrinal history of mystical orders, neither to the works by specialists (of the 302 notes of the book, one only refers to a paper by H. Algar, *SI* 14 [1977]). This lack of interest in classical studies on Sufism is of course justified by the framework given by the authors to their work, *viz.* the sociology of contemporary Sufism in the USSR. However, this specific form of Sufism cannot be cut from its own past without making harder the overall understanding of its present.

For example, the reader may ask him/herself to which extent the Sufis' attitude, especially the Naqshbandīs', towards the Soviet regime is inspired by traditional reactions of Sufism in front of a foreign threat — reactions which can be summarized in three kinds of simultaneous defense: — 1. the emigration of followers outside of the zone of danger; — 2. the deliberate assimilation of others by the new regime in order to distill the order's teaching in the circles of power; — 3. a third group remains in place, but tries to keep intact the order's tradition through a clandestine structure and esoteric teaching (see for instance the Sufis' attitude in front of the Mongol threat in the thirteenth century, in particular that of the Naqshbandīs' predecessors, the *khwājagān*: *cf.* *Hayāt-nāma* of Bahā' al-Dīn Naqshband, the *Rashahāt 'ayn al-hayāt* by Wā'iz Harawī and a recent work by the Turkish scholar Hasan-Lütfi Şuşud, *İslām Tasavvufunda Hâcegan Hanedanı*, İstanbul, 1958/1992). Such methodological remarks aim at opening new research fields, and do not search to diminish the scientific value of the present work, which remains very topical (the most recent information offered by the authors concerns the 1980s). After the book's reading, one can be only waiting for a study on the probable evolutions of Sufism after the invasion of Afghanistan and the launching of Perestroika (*cf.* the review and relevant remarks by A. Popovic in *BCAI* 4 (1987): 97-99).  
M.-A.A.-M.

- BENNIGSEN, Alexandre, WIMBUSH, S. Enders, *Muslims of the Soviet Empire: A Guide*, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1986, xvi-294 p.

In the first part of their book, the authors deal globally with the question of Islam and the Muslim society in the USSR, through a historical survey of the presence of Islam, a study of the political dynamism of present-day Soviet Muslim society, of the religious practice and statistics concerning mosques, religious publications, etc., as well as of Moscow's policy towards its Muslim populations. The second part studies historical, cultural, demographical and political data on varied Muslim ethnic groups in Central Asia, the Caucasus, European Russia and Siberia. As far as statistic information (in 86 tabs.) is extracted from the 1970 census (more recent figures remain inaccessible), the reader is invited to take into account the rapid demographic growth of these populations.

The authors insist on the significance of the Islamic factor in the former USSR: Muslims are more attached to their community (*umma*) than to their Soviet citizenship, and most of them are still in search of a proper identity. If Soviet policy-makers have

welcomed the Iranian revolution in 1979, they quickly understood the potential subversive influence that this event could have upon the Soviet Muslim populations. With the Iranian revolution and the Soviet invasion of Afghanistan a new era has begun, according to the authors, in the history of Islam in the USSR: a relative liberalism has been succeeded by a more open hostility of the Andropov and Gorbachev regimes towards Islam.

First edition: London: C. Hurst, 1985, xvi-294 p., maps; second edition reviewed by Beatrice Forbes Manz, *RR* 48/4 (1989): 462-463. M.-R.A.

- DE JONG, Frederick, RADTKE, Bernd, eds., *Islamic Mysticism Contested. Thirteen Centuries of Controversies and Polemics*, Leiden – Boston – Köln: Brill, 1999 (Islamic History and Civilization, Studies and Texts: 29), xii-829 p., index.

Fruitful international collaborations on Sufi orders have succeeded each other since 1982, first in France under the initiative of Alexandre Popovic and Marc Gaborieau. The present step has been taken in hands by historians of Islam from Utrecht, who have managed to gather thirty-three authors, and oriented collective attention towards a new set of problematic, *viz.* oppositions to Sufi mysticism throughout centuries and continents. This question, which has become topical in the last decades, can be dealt with from two opposite viewpoints: that of Sufis or that of their opponents.

The first viewpoint tends to limit Sufism in those of its aspects which are seen as the most heretic or more often disturbing by non-followers. This is the viewpoint taken by Gerhard BÖWERING (pp. 45-67) for his analysis of the very beginning of classical mysticism in the first centuries of Islam, when mysticism was ready to overcome injustice through a spiritual renewal through the process of *tawba* (repentance and inner conversion, allowing a direct access to God; however, inner rivalries and outer conflicts with doctors of religious Law will focus on the exclusivity of this visionary experience of divine presence). In al-Andalus under the Umayyads (from 755 to 1031), the persecution of the "saints" and of the prophets comes from the threat which was felt in front of them by temporal power in specific political situations, rather than from a durable opposition to Sufism as such (Maribel FIERRO, pp. 174-206). In Egypt under the Mamluks (thirteenth-fifteenth centuries), defamation campaigns against Sufi thought and practices cannot overcome the support given by the sultan, the emirs and public opinion to brotherhoods and their institutions (Th. Emil HOMERIN, pp. 225-247). In Maghrib under the Marinids (869-1465), one can find numerous cases of harmony between the representatives of the Law and those of the Path (Vincent J. CORNELL, pp. 207-224). About the Indian subcontinent under the Raj, Arthur F. BUEHLER (pp. 468-491) asks a question which is recurrent in Sunni Islam, especially in non-Arab lands: this Islam is divided into two paradigms: on the first hand Sufi practice focused on the teaching of a charismatic master called *shaykh* or *pīr* (literally "old") or *walī* (literally "close to God"), the mediator between God and the followers, and in the other hand the movement of those who recognize no authority outside the scriptures (the Qur'ān and the Hadīth), and who plead for the equality of the faithful in front of God, with no need

of a mediator, with an obsession for the return of the primitive purity of a largely idealised Arabia. In Eastern Turkestan, which is more or less solidly included into the Chinese Empire since the mid-eighteenth century, the best specialist of the Turki sources of this region, HAMADA Masami (pp. 541-552), admits a general lack of information on a possible opposition to brotherhoods, up till the appearance of significant and active "Wahhābī" communities, possibly of foreign origin, in the 1990s.

In late nineteenth-century Northern Sudan, the majority of the population was Mahdist indeed, but after the movement was crushed down by Kitchener, everybody came back to previous Sufi allegiances, despite the strong influence of recent events (R. Seán O'FAHEY, pp. 267-282). In Western Africa, where massive adoption of Islam dates back to the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries only, two mutually rival brotherhoods, the Tijāniyya and the Qādiriyya have been the agents of popular conversion, but at the same time they are closely associated with local aristocracy, which is itself integrated into the French or British political order; they do not participate in the struggle for independence, and are subjected to attacks by reformists only after decolonisation; however they are so deeply rooted locally that this presence helps them to be tolerated even by their adversaries (Ousmane KANE, pp. 324-340; Roman LOIMEIER, pp. 341-356; see also on Nigeria, pp. 357-385). In Arabic Iraq, the birthplace of both Sunni and Shiite Islam, Sunni Sufi brotherhoods have shown political instruments in the hands of the Ottomans and then of Great Britain as the mandatory power; now deprived of political power, they suffer from their minority situation in front of a majority Shiite community which do not forgive them their past activism (Pierre-Jean LUIZARD, pp. 283-309). The "neo-Sufism" developed by Ahmad b. Idrīs (1749-1837) and others is characterised by the direct access of the mystic to the Prophet, which gives him a quasi-infallible authority in the interpretation of the Law — something Wahhabism cannot admit (Bernd RADTKE, pp. 162-173). In twentieth-century Egypt, since the mid-1950s, Sufi orders are incited by governmental authorities to develop, which brought their bureaucratisation (Frederick DE JONG, pp. 310-323). In Southern Africa, popular Sufism is for two decades on the way to "reform" towards a "neo-Sufism" compatible with fundamentalism; although equipped with the terminology and structures of traditional Sufism, this new trend is deprived of the latter's content (Jacobus A. NAUDÉ, pp. 386-415).

The second viewpoint adopted by the collaborators to the volume is that of movements, institutions or figures hostile to Sufism, and of persecution campaigns. If here too we begin our survey from the first periods of Islam, the distinction between Sufism and its opponents is not clear: the origins of the Mu'tazila, founded in Basra in the second century of the Hijra, are linked with a character considered a founding father of Sufism, al-Hasan al-Basrī (d. 728); however respective positions of Sufism and its opponents rapidly became incompatible (Florian SOBIEROJ, pp. 68-92). In its beginning the Shiite movement of the Zaydiyya too did not oppose fundamental Sufism, and did so only after the appearance of a conflict on religious authority, notably in thirteenth-century Yemen (Wilfred MADELUNG, pp. 124-144). The same remark could be formulated on Ottoman Algeria, where the marabouts used to benefit from an inherited *baraka*

(Kamel FILALI, pp. 248-266). Nasrollah POURJAVADY (pp. 614-623) notes that the mystical and esoteric traditions of Sufism have numerous common points with (Ithna-‘Ashari) Shiism, although as a Sunni movement it could only bring the hostility of the Shiites. In Qajar Iran (from 1785 to 1925), the Sufis were first opposed by specialists of religious law and by philosophers, before being submitted to the attacks of modernizers (Mangol BAYAT, pp. 624-638). In the Malay-Indonesian world, the mutual opposition between Sufism and its opponents, in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, focuses on education, not on the institutions or the rituals as elsewhere in the world of Islam (Azyumardi AZRA, pp. 665-686).

The modern anti-Sufi movement *par excellence* is Wahhābī fundamentalism: the teaching delivered by the eponymous founder Muhammad b. ‘Abd al-Wahhāb (1703-92) is especially introduced by Esther PESKES (pp. 145-161), in a paper which must be recommended to anybody who wants to be initiated to this subject. One of the conclusions of this contribution is that Wahhabism totally excludes any Sufi engagement, contrary to Hanbalism (the most purist and conservative of the four Sunni schools of law); however one may also notice that the most illustrious thinker of this movement, Ibn Taymiyya (1263-1328), was a member of the Qādiriyya, which does not prevent Wāhhābīs from recognizing him as one of their authorities (in the same direction, Josef VAN ESS, pp. 22-44). The link between medieval anti-Sufism and contemporary Wahhabism, the always vicious propaganda against Ibn ‘Arabī (1165-1240) shows that the posthumous accusations made against the great thinker by Ibn Taymiyya are not yet finished, although they constantly use the same arguments (Michel CHODKIEWICZ, pp. 93-123). In the Indian subcontinent during the first half of the nineteenth century, whence ubiquitous Sufism still remains medieval, reformers like Sayyid Ahmad (1786-1831) criticize it for its excesses; the rupture between Sufi traditionalism and modernism or fundamentalism will be total only in the second half of the nineteenth century, and will be a characteristic of the twentieth century (Marc GABORIEAU, pp. 452-467). We then see the Salafiyya, a strongly anti-Sufi orthodox reformist trend, born in the Arab world at the end of the nineteenth century, notably under Muhammad ‘Abduh (1849-1905)’s influence, reaching Malaysia in the twentieth century (Werner KRAUS, pp. 729-756). In modern Chinese Islam, the modern reformist scriptural movement of Wāhhābī inspiration, called Yihewani (Chinese transcription of the Arabic word *ikhwān*, "brothers") struggled in the late nineteenth century against Chinese customs infiltrated into the rituals and brotherhoods; paradoxically enough it became in the twentieth century a propagator of teaching in Chinese language and a support to varied regimes, notably the Popular Republic (Leila CHERIF-CHEBBI, pp. 576-602).

Several fundamental questions are raised by the contributions. Such is that of the survival of a given brotherhood after the persecution for heresy, and sometimes even the execution of its most notorious leaders. Carl W. ERNST (pp. 416-435) takes the example of Muhammad Ghawth (1502-1563), master of the Shattāriyya in India, and remembers the illustrious precedent of al-Hallāj executed in Baghdad in 922 CE: this author observes a self-censorship of his disciples, who renounced to the most contest-

ed aspects of their master's teachings — in this case the ecstatic state which was supposed to allow a direct contact with God. The case of Muhammad Ghawth also shows the possibility of multiple allegiances: the holy man used to praise himself to have been initiated into fourteen orders. Bruce B. LAWRENCE (pp. 436-451) asks a question which would have deserved a general comparative study, departing from the Mughal sovereign of India, Akbar (r. 1556-1605): when a conflict arouse between a saint and a king, *i.e.* between a temporal and a spiritual sovereigns, and when this conflict was resolved through the persecution of a mystical path and the support to other, concurrent orders, the decision could depend on political necessities much more than on spiritual considerations. Through his reflection on Sufism in the Ottoman Empire on the sixteenth century, Ahmet Yaşar OCAK (pp. 603-613) very astutely remarks that "Sufism and opposition to it are two twin phenomena in the history of Islam, since they were born simultaneously and developed in parallel." The same could be said about the Balkans in post-Ottoman time, from 1918 to 1990: as is underlined by Nathalie CLAYER and Alexandre POPOVIC (pp. 639-664), Islam in Bosnia-Herzegovina is mainly anti-Sufi, although not exclusively, whence in Kosovo, Albania and Macedonia it is predominantly Sufi, although not exclusively either. Karel STEENBRINK (pp. 687-704) takes the example of Indonesia in the nineteenth century for stressing to which extent it would be simplistic to imagine an ideological dichotomy between Sufism and its opponents. Martin VAN BRUINESSEN (pp. 705-728) chooses the case of twentieth-century Indonesia for proving that the fiercest struggle sometimes occurs between varied brotherhoods, and sometimes even inside a brotherhood. The case of nineteenth-century China confirms this view: the trials in official judiciary instances which have been studied by Jonathan LIPMAN (pp. 553-575) give testimony of material rivalries between Sufi brotherhoods of the north-west of this country. Last, through an example borrowed from the history of Central Asia in the fourteenth century CE, Devin DEWEESE (pp. 492-519) offers a telling illustration of the use of an anti-Sufi rhetoric by Sufi movements in order to eliminate their rivals.

This overview of an exceptionally rich and varied collective volume will seem abusively short to quoted authors and to informed readers. Fortunately, the two editors give their own evaluation in a short post-face (pp. 757-760) in which they try to assess not only the inevitable lacunae that should be filled by further studies, but also the progress of knowledge on several important points: Islamic mysticism was contested as soon as during the formative period during the three first centuries after the revelation, and continuously till our days, following arguments which did not change very much, and were even sometimes used by the mystical orders themselves against their rivals. Such an observation shows the impossibility of a clearly delimited dichotomy between the Sufis and the ulama; however we cannot ignore the existence of radically different if not antagonistic conceptions of Islam, and the fact that rivalries between religious leaders correspond very frequently with a struggle for political as well as spiritual power. As an example of the discoveries that comparatists and historians of religions can make along these 750 pages of complex texts, we advise the reader to dis-



cover the deconstruction by Jo-Ann GROSS (pp. 520-540) of our notion of Islam in the Soviet Union: since the works by the late lamented Alexandre Bennigsen, everybody was long convinced of a conceptual dualism between "official" Islam, patronised by the Soviet state, and "parallel" Islam, essentially Sufi, secret, conservative and anti-Communist. Such a view, in fact, was conditioned by Soviet theories themselves, inherited from both Marxism and the Czarist period, on the necessarily backward character of popular religion — these theories have hidden all resources of the popular beliefs and practices as they could be discovered since the end of the Soviet period. F.A.

○ GABORIEAU, Marc, "Wahhabisme: une seule étiquette pour des mouvements divers," *LAC* 1 (1994): 1-2.

The introduction to a special issue of the *Lettre d'Asie Centrale* on Wahhabism, this paper sums up the history of varied movements attached to this category (up to 'Abduh and Rashīd Ridā's reformism). The special programme continues with an alarmist paper by Habiba FATHI on Wahhabism in Central Asia (2-3). After a more substantial and less oriented fieldwork, Leila CHERIF-CHEBBI offers us an overview on Wahhabism in China (3-4), in which the author insists on the diversity of the inspiration sources of the intellectual renewal of Chinese Islam. We then broach with Gilles DORRONSORO the Wāḥḥābīs of Afghanistan, with interesting elements of sociology of Afghan Islam. Thierry ZARCONÉ concludes ("Indéfinissable wahhabisme," 6-7) through an appeal to decrypting the official discourse on Islam in the Central Asian states, and to dissociation between the categories of Wahhabism and fundamentalism in this region — given the importance of Sufism, even in revivalist movements of a fundamentalist type.

A series of papers on Wahhabism in the former Soviet Union has been published by the *RMM*; see: ALEKSEEV, Stanislav, "Vakhkhability: kto oni? [The Wahhabites. Who Are They?]," *RMM* 1998/9 (75): 41-45; ROTAR', Igor', "Vakhkhability v respublikakh byvshego SSSR [Wahhabism in the Republics of the Former USSR]," *RMM* 1998/10 (76): 48-52; CHELNOKOV, Aleksei, "Vakhkhability uzhe podbiraiutsia k nefte dobyvaiushchim raionam Sibiri [Wahhabis Already Gather in the Gas Producing Districts of Siberia]," *RMM* 1999/12 (90): 73-78; BIBIKOVA, Ol'ga, "'Vakhkhability' ili to, chto pod nim podrazumevaetsia ['Wahhabism' or what it implies]," *RMM* 2000/3 (93): 101-110; BARKOV, Leonid, BOROVSKII, Dmitrii, VOLKOV, Oleg, "Vakhkhability na Volge [Wahhabis in the Volga Region]," *RMM* 2000/4 (94): 54-59; AKAEV, Vakhit, "'Severokavkazskii vakhkhability' — raznovidnost' islamskogo radikalizma ['North-Caucasian Wahhabism': Diversity of Islamic Radicalism]," *RMM* 2001/1 (103): 31-41; KHABUTDINOV, Aidar, "Vakhkhability v sovremennom Tatarstane [Wahhabism in Tatarstan Today]," *RMM* 2000/10 (100): 51-56. S.A.D.

● KÜGELGEN, Anke von, KEMPER, Michael, FRANK, Allen J., eds., *Muslim Culture in Russia and Central Asia, from the 18th to the Early 20th Centuries*, 2: *Inter-Regional and Inter-Ethnic Relations*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1998 (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 216): vii-[1]-660 p., biographies of contributors, bibliography, index.

The result of an INTAS conference held in St. Petersburg on October, 1996 in the framework of a five-year international research project, the present volume appears as one of the most substantial collective publications devoted, during the past twenty years, to the modern and contemporary societies of Muslim Central Eurasia. After a first volume of articles (Berlin, 1996) had presented varied aspects of Muslim culture in several regions of the Russian Empire and Central Asia, the focus has been shifted here towards the interrelations between individual regions and ethnic groups, as well as contacts with other countries.

A first group of articles addresses Islamic learning and Sufism, and the resulting networks. In his opening paper, Stefan REICHMUTH ("The Interplay of Local Developments and Transnational Relations in the Islamic World: Perceptions and Perspectives," 5-38) draws attention to the significant extent to which developments in various parts of the world of Islam have been linked together since the eighteenth century. He notably casts light on the development of the Naqshbandiyya Mujaddidiyya as well as on the activities of learned individuals from the Muslim "periphery" (especially Dagestan and West Africa) in the holy city of Medina. The contacts between Dagestanis and the Arab world are also handled by Amri R. SHIKHSAIDOV in his study ("The Biographical Genre in Dagestani Arabic-Language Literature: Nadir al-Durgilī's *Nuzhat al-adhān fī tarāḡim 'ulamā' Dāḡistān*," 39-62) of an important work of the Arabic biographical literature in Dagestan. Two additional articles examine the expansion of the Naqshbandiyya Mujaddidiyya in the North Caucasus (Michael KEMPER, "Einige Notizen zur arabischsprachigen Literatur der *ḡihād*-Bewegung in Dagestan und Tschetschenien in der ersten Hälfte des 19. Jahrhunderts," 63-100) and in Transoxiana (Anke von KÜGELGEN, "Die Entfaltung der Naqšbandiyya muḡaddidiyya im mittleren Transoxianien vom 18. bis zum Beginn des 19. Jahrhunderts: Ein Stück Detektivarbeit," 101-152; for a Russian translation of this paper, see: "Rastsvet Nakshbandiia Mudzhaddidiia v Srednei Transoksianii s XVIII – do nachala XIX vv.: opyt detektivno-go rassledovaniia," in A.A. Khismatullin, ed., *Sufizm v Tsentral'noi Azii (zarubezhnye issledovaniia)*. *Sbornik statei pamiati Fritsa Maiera (1912-1998)*, St. Petersburg: Filologicheskii fakul'tet Sankt-Peterburgskogo gosudarstvennogo universiteta, 2001: 275-330). Then two authors analyse the political aspects of Sufism in Eastern Turkestan under the Qing (Thierry ZARCON, "Political Sufism and the Emirate of Kashgaria (End of the 19th Century): The Role of the Ambassador Ya'qūb Xān Tūra," 153-166) and in the Ferghana Valley during the colonial period (Bakhtiyar BABADJANOV, "Dūkčī Īshān und der Aufstand von Andižan 1898," 167-192). Lastly, Ashirbek MUMINOV depicts a peculiar type of network in his examination of the *khawājas* in southern Kazakhstan, namely families with Arab (Qurayshī) genealogies which for centuries have played the role of religious dignitaries among the local tribes.

The second set of texts explores the appearance and evolution of diaspora groups, and the resulting cultural contacts. As to the migrations of the Volga Tatars, Allen J. FRANK on Kazakhstan ("Islam and Ethnic Relations in the Kazakh Inner Horde: Muslim Cossacks, Tatar Merchants and Kazakh Nomads in a Turkic Manuscript, 1870-1910,"

211-242), Mirkasim A. USMANOV on Eastern Turkestan ("Tatar Settlers in Western China (Second Half of the 19th Century to the First Half of the Twentieth Century)," 243-270) and Christian NOACK on St. Petersburg ("Die Petersburger Typen des Anatolij Aleksandrovič Baxtiarov, oder: "Tataren und anderen Schreihälsen ist der Zutritt verboten"," 299-312) examine Tatar communities founded primarily by settlers and merchants. By contrast, the Tatar diaspora in Lithuania and Germany originated with soldiers and prisoners of war, as demonstrate Tamara BARASHAUSKAITE ("Politische Integration und religiöse Eigenständigkeit der litauischen Tataren im 19. Jahrhundert," 313-334) and Iskandar GILYAZOV ("Die Wolgatataren und Deutschland im ersten Drittel des 20. Jahrhunderts," 35-353). The far-reaching contacts of Tatar students into the Arab world and Central Asia are examined by Zavdat MINNULLIN ("Fraternal and Benevolent Associations of Tatar Students in Muslim Countries at the Beginning of the 20th Century," 271-280). Quite different are the important diaspora groups of the Dagestanis in Turkey and Syria, which can be traced back to the partially-forced, partially-voluntary emigration of the Muslims of the North Caucasus following the defeat of their military resistance (Amirkhan MAGOMEDDAEV, "Die dagestanische Diaspora in der Türkei und Syrien," 281-298).

In the third group of contributions the Muslim's striving for political participation against the policies of the Russian Empire and the early Soviet Union are further addressed. Both tensions and accommodations between the Islamic periphery of the empire and the Christian, then atheist centre are illustrated through several examples: the activities of the Muftiyyat in Ufa (Danil' AZAMATOV, "The Muftis of the Orenburg Spiritual Assembly in the 18th and 19th Centuries: The Struggle for Power in Russia's Muslim Institutions," 355-384) and those of the "Muslim" Fraction in the Russian State Duma (Diliara M. USMANOVA, "The Activity of the Muslim Fraction of the State Duma and Its Significance in the Formation of a Political Culture among the Muslim Peoples of Russia (1906-1917)," 417-454). The counter-effects of Russia's policy toward Islam are demonstrated by Paul WERTH, through the telling example of the elite of an Udmurt village which the state-sponsored Orthodox missions compelled into officially accepting Islam ("Tsarist Categories, Orthodox Intervention, and Islamic Conversion in a Pagan Udmurt Village, 1870s-1890s," 385-416). The aftermath of the October Revolution is examined by Dzhul'etta MESKHIDZE through the fight of the Chechens and the Ingush for their independence from Moscow ("Die Rolle des Islams beim Kampf um die Staatliche Eigenständigkeit Tschetscheniens und Inguschetiens (1917-1925)," 457-482) and Gero FEDTKE through the varied positions of Bukharan reformers and revolutionaries toward Soviet ideology in the 1920s ("Jadids, Young Bukharans, Communists and the Bukharan Revolution: From an Ideological Debate in the Early Soviet Union," 483-511).

The fourth block of texts contains literary studies from inter-regional perspectives. An example of the impulses given through the centuries to the North from the South is given through the reception of the works by the famous late 15th-century poet from Herāt, 'Alī Shīr Nawāyī, in the khanates of Central Asia (Aftandil ERKINOV, "The

Perception of Works by Classical Authors in Eighteenth and Nineteenth Century Central Asia: The Example of the *Xamsa* of 'Alī Šīr Nawā'ī," 513-526). However, in the course of the 19th century, the Tatars for the first time received impulses from Russian and West-European literatures, and thereafter it was their turn to bring these new currents into Central Asia (Michael FRIEDERICH, "Rabe fliegt nach Osten, oder ein tatarischer Weltheimatdichter im Zeitalter der Umbrüche," 527-559). At the end of the volume is a contribution by Boris Kochnev on the "festival-mosques" (*namāz-gāh*) in the Central Asian khanates of Khiva, Bukhara and Kokand, from both architectural and social perspectives.

Far from reviving the Soviet myth of the "peoples' friendship," this exceptional set of contributions also avoids the typical, unequivocal Western insistence on tensions between everything Islamic and everything Russian or Christian in the territory of the former Russian Empire and Soviet Union. The familiarity of most contributors with newly discovered and accessible primary sources of the most varied kinds (Arabic, Persian or Turkic manuscripts; Russian archive collections; and of course fieldwork) has allowed them to propose new visions, detached from long lasting stereotypes, both Soviet and Western, on Central Eurasian societies of Islamic tradition. By the way, the achievement of the INTAS research project in the framework of which the present volume was taking place has further given way to the publication of a third volume of primary interest for the development of the field: Anke von Kügelgen, Ashirbek Muminov, Michael Kemper, eds., *Muslim Culture in Russia and Central Asia. Arabic, Persian and Turkic Manuscripts (15th–19th Centuries)*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz, 2000 (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 233). This whole set of publications constitutes one of the leading collective international contributions to the development of the field, and a model for the undertakings to come in this area. At the same time, among the rare motives of frustration which are necessarily generated by this kind of large enterprise, let us regret that, up till now, the twentieth century has to remain a "grey zone" of the cultural as well as social and political history of ex-Soviet and present-day Chinese Central Eurasia — a result of the lasting division of Central Eurasian studies between, on the first hand, "orientalists" with an Islamic background, of which the present volume expresses the traditional interest, and on the second hand researchers coming from Russian and Soviet studies, who rarely show any kind of interest for the primary sources which have been largely solicited in this volume, and in the two other opuses of the same collection.

The volume has also been reviewed, notably, by Florian Schwarz, *JHS* 1-2 (2000): 617-618. S.A.D.

- LANDA, R. G., "Rossiia i islam: vzaimodeistvie kul'tur [Russia and Islam: The Interaction of Cultures]," *Vostok* 2000/5: 18-31.

This article briefly deals with neo-Eurasianism, a movement which has been very much in fashion in the intellectual and ruling milieus of Russia since the 1980s. First, the author discusses both confrontational and friendly relationships between the Russians

and the nomadic peoples of Inner Asia, with a particular interest in the Khazars, and the Bulgars / Tatars. Although he does not deny the negative aspects of the Mongol invasion of Russia, he however insists that Russia's subjugation has played an important role for its integration and its transformation into a centralized state and colonial empire. After the collapse of the Golden Horde, many Tatars flowed into Moscow, had a strong influence on the Russian elite society, and played further on the role of mediators between Russia and Central Asia. Finally, the author introduces Ismail Gasprinskii's opinion that Russians and Muslims have deep geographical and historical relationships, since for Russia's Muslims Russian culture is more intimate than the Western European culture, and since Europeans seek to cause conflict between local Muslims and Russians in order to assess their own economic interests in this region of the world. H.M.

- LAZZERINI, Edward, "Through the Contact Lens Darkly: Soviet Muslims and Their Foreign Co-Religionists," in Shirin Akiner, ed., *Political and Economic Trends in Central Asia*, London: British Academic Press & Tauris, 1994: 153-174.

This short evocation of the life of official institutions of Islam in the USSR is followed by a long chronology of the relations between the Soviet Islamic "clergy" and the outside world of Islam (pp. 159-173), by a list of the official representative institutions of the various regions of Soviet Islam (before their uncontrolled multiplication from 1990 onwards), and by an annual census of pilgrims who went out of the USSR between 1971 and 1984. S.A.D.

- MALASHENKO, Alexei V., "Islam versus Communism," in Dale F. Eickelman, ed., *Russia's Muslim Frontiers: New Directions in Cross-Cultural Analysis*, Bloomington – Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1993: 63-78.

Do relations between Islam and Communism have to be defined only in terms of mutual opposition and antagonism? The author proposes a tentative typology of relations between Islamists and Communists in the late Soviet period: exploitation of the nationalistic or Islamist sympathies of the populations by the ruling Communist parties (in Tatarstan); confrontation between Islamists and Communists, eventually resolved through an entente against common enemies, viz. the "liberals" and "democrats" of the secular intelligentsia (in Dagestan, Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan); alliance between the oppositional intelligentsia and Islamist leaders united by their "common hatred of Communism" (in Tajikistan). S.A.D.

- MALASHENKO, Alexei V., "Religious and Political Change in Soviet Moslem Regions," in Vitaly Naumkin, ed., *State, Religion and Society in Central Asia. A Post-Soviet Critique*, Reading: Ithaca Press, 1993: 162-175.

The author analyses the conflict between the official clergy and clandestine imams in the main Muslim-peopled regions of the former USSR, since Perestroika. He evaluates the attempts by fundamentalist organisations for maintaining a unity of movement on

the scale of the CIS, against tendencies towards "nationalisation" of several Islamist parties (suggested by the evolution of the Hizb-i nahzat-i islāmī in Tajikistan since 1991). S.A.D.

■ MALASHENKO, Aleksei, "Russkii natsionalizm i islam [Russian Nationalism and Islam]," *VE* 1996/2 [3]: 98-112.

In this study, which is based on the regular reading of the Russian nationalist press and literature of the early 1990s, the author surveys the varied opinions on Islam among several components of the Russian nationalist right, from the neo-Slavophiles to the National-Bolsheviks, *via* the neo-Eurasians. The paper casts light on surprising ideological convergences between great figures of the Russian populist right and some radical orators of political Islam in Russia (like Heydar Jemal), in an overall context characterized by a general destabilization in the southern Marches of the former USSR, and by the growing contestation of President Yeltsin's administration. On this general problem, see also the papers gathered by the same author in a more recent volume: Galina Vitkovskaia & Aleksei Malashenko, eds., *Neterpimost' v Rossii: starye i novye fobii* [Intolerance in Russia: old and new phobias], Moscow: Moskovskii tsentr Karnegi, 1999, 194 p. S.A.D.

□ MALASHENKO, A. V., ed., *Islam v SNG* [Islam in the CIS], Moscow: Institut vostokovedeniia Rossiiskoi Akademii nauk, 1998, 179 p.

In this volume by researchers of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Russia, the following papers offer a special interest: an epistemological contribution by A. V. MALASHENKO himself ("Islam i islamovedenie v SNG v 90-e gody [Islam and Islamic Studies in the CIS in the 1990s]," 5-23), unfortunately focused on the academic production of the Institute of Oriental Studies in Moscow; two astute studies by Z. I. LEVIN ("Islam i natsionalizm v SNG [Islam and Nationalism in the CIS]," 43-60) and by A. V. KUDRIAVTSEV ("Islamofobiia v postsovetsoi Rossii [Islamophobia in Post-Soviet Russia]," 160-171) on the concomitant development of Russian nationalism and of political Islamism in the CIS. These papers are followed by three uneven contributions on the problematic of tradition – modernity in varied regions of Central Asia. In a well-documented panoramic study, A. Sh. NIYAZI [NIYAZI] ("Islamskaia traditsiia i protsessy modernizatsii v Tadzhikistane [The Islamic Tradition and Modernisation Processes in Tajikistan]," 123-138), after a short historical survey, deals with the reactions of agrarian communities of a central and southern mountain region of Tajikistan in front of the violence made to it by the industrial gigantism of the 1960s-80s; the author casts light on the influence that frustrations created by this industrialization on the politicization of Tajik Islam by Naqshbandī *murīds* of the Gharm Valley (Qarategin region) in the last years of the Soviet period.

Also reviewed by D.V. Mikul'skii, *Vostok* 1999/3: 193-196.

S.A.D.

■ PROZOROV, S. M., ed., *Islam na territorii byvshei Rossiiskoi imperii. Entsiklopedicheskii*

*slovar'* [Islam on the Territory of the Former Russian Empire. An Encyclopedic Dictionary], Moscow: Izdatel'skaia firma "Vostochnaia Literatura" RAN, 1., 1998 (Rossiiskaia Akademiia nauk, Sankt-Peterburgskii filial Instituta vostokovedeniia), 159 p., index, bibliography.

A long-term undertaking, with the contribution of numerous researchers throughout the former Soviet Union, and some from outside the CIS, the first part of this encyclopedic dictionary piloted from the Saint Petersburg subsidiary centre of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Russia shows a useful complement to a recent dictionary on the whole world of Islam (*Islam. Entsiklopedicheskii slovar'* [Islam. An Encyclopaedic Dictionary], Moscow, 1991). Whence this previous overall dictionary deals with the classical periods, and with regions outside the former Russian Empire and Soviet Union, this new one is devoted specifically to Islam in Russia, the Caucasus and Central Asia, from the beginnings to our days. As such, this volume bears testimony of the strategic withdrawal of Russia's Islamic studies inside the boundaries of the CIS. At the same time, this great work shows deeply innovative, inasmuch as it reveals a renewal of the collective interest in a territory which was not very much frequented, to this date, by specialists of Islamic studies: during the Soviet period, "orientalists" used to be deployed throughout the Near- and the Middle-East, whence the study of non-Christian religious practices inside the Soviet Union was the almost exclusive domain of ethnographers — and police observers. The explicit ambition of the editor of the volume is, first, to cast light on the specificities of "Russia's Islam" (*rossiiskoe musul'manstvo*), as it was conditioned by a millennium of exchanges with Inner Eurasian non-Muslim peoples, second to underline the great diversity of the practices of Islam in Russia, the Caucasus and Central Asia. For so doing, the first part proposes a series of varied notices on notions (that of '*ajam*', for instance), on leading mystical orders (Kubrāwiyya, Naqshbandiyya, the Kunta-Hajji branch of the Qādiriyya...), on leading figures of the history of Islam (propagators of the Islamic faith like al-Kaffāl in tenth-century CE Transoxiana, or Dudalany in the seventeenth century among the Karachays and Balkars of the Northern Caucasus; nineteenth-century muftis of Russia; theoreticians of modernisation like Gasprinskii in Crimea, Fakhretudinov in Kazan or Behbūdī and Fitrat in Russian Turkestan...), on important communal institutions (like the mausoleums, which are mostly studied in relation with their frequentation in modern times: see good studies on the grave of Borga Kash in Ingushia or on the *kashanas* in the Southern Urals).

In the necessarily long chapters of regrets, we must mention the existence of numerous imbalances which reveal the lack of a pre-established programme, and a strong tendency towards improvisation: many notices are too short (half a column) and superficial to show really useful, like those on the *madrasas* of Kazan (in spite of the latter's significance for the history of Islam in Russia, and of the existence of a rich unpublished documentation on them); on the contrary, long papers show too general: 13 columns for the notice on "Oriental Europe," seven and a half for a highly problematic paper on the history of Bashkortostan — although the long paper on Moscow is interesting and perfectly fits with the purpose of the dictionary. This overall lack of



a cast off is very much against the harmony of the set. Moreover, most general papers will probably have to be rewritten in the course of the publication of the next volumes, at least for including references to more limited notices that will make of the bulk of the final work. Let's still deplore the fact that the history of mystical orders is seen essentially through theoretic literature, although their history and sociology has been in full renewal for at least a decade. Last, the work is characterised by regrettable limitations: the paper by Efim Rezvan on the translations of the Qur'ān in Russia focuses on the work by Russian orientalists, and has chosen to completely overlook continuous disputes on its translation into several Turkic languages, especially at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

Also reviewed by Aleksei A. Khismatullin & Daniel C. Waugh, *CESR* 1/1 (2002): 24. S.A.D.

- RO'I, Yaacov, *Islam in the Soviet Union. From World War II to Perestroika*. London: Hurst, 2000, 764 p., glossary, maps, bibliography, index.

As the author rightly stresses in his introduction, the history of Islam in the USSR after the red terror of the 1930s remains a major lacuna of research in both Soviet and Islamic studies. The present monograph, a monumental work, had authority to fill a significant part of this gap, and to propose a certain amount of methodological innovations. We must admit, however, that our expectations are far from being satisfied. The Sovietological approach which is so lamented by the author as an obsolete method had long been based exclusively on the study, at a distance, of official documents and on the atheist propaganda accessible in Western libraries and archives, added with highly praised testimonies of rare émigrés from beyond the Iron Curtain. However the "new approach" proposed by the author, allowed by the opening of Soviet archive collections, gives an astonishingly conservative vision of the history of Islam in the USSR. In fact, despite the opening of boundaries in the late 1980s and of the possibility of an access to fieldwork for researchers from abroad, Islam remains to the author's eyes what it was for security agencies, whether Western or Soviet, during half a century of the Cold War: a remote, disturbing object that is easier to be assessed through (even doubtful) statistics and through the reports of the CPUS and KGB's observers. The book is based exclusively and *ad nauseam* (in more than 2,000 footnotes) on Soviet police reports of the years 1945-1989. The question has not even been asked of the existence of other kinds of sources, notably those emanating from the Muslim protagonists of the history traced in this book. Even when the author has been lucky enough for doing research work in the richest State Archive of Uzbekistan in Tashkent, he has chosen to ignore an abundant and varied written or auditory documentation in vernacular language. He forgot to question himself on the existence of innumerable living witnesses of the phenomena he was studying. So doing, the author has perpetuated some of the most regrettable thinking habits of the Cold War period. This impression is reinforced by the fact that the bibliography gathered at the end of the book mentions almost none of the numerous important works which were published in the 1990s, mainly in Russian and



English, on modern and contemporary Islam in various regions of Central Eurasia — which may be a reason for the lack of conceptual innovation that we observe in the present work.

The latter's main interest lies in its reconstruction of a peculiar vision of Soviet Islam, through the study of an impressive collection of reports by "plenipotentiary" representatives (*upolnomochennye*) of the central instances of the CPUS and its national branches, during their missions in varied republics and regions of the Union. From this viewpoint, this monograph offers for sure an interesting and even sometimes captivating document on the representations on which the Soviet religious policy was based, on the implementation of this policy towards Islam at different moments of the history of the USSR since the Second World War, and above all on the various information channels which could occasionally exert an influence on decisions taken in Moscow or locally concerning the repression of religious practices. What is tackled here is less Islam than the colonial and Soviet representations on it, which should have given the book a less commercial, but more honest title. Besides, the author's precision in his utilization of his specific sources, and the multiple precautions he takes in the interpretation of the innumerable assessments and figures at his disposal do nothing else than proclaiming the vanity of the method he implements concerning the study of Islam itself. The rare credible figures quoted in the text (like the oscillation of the number of mosques registered during the last decade of Stalin's era) do not learn us very much. The less vain chapters concern official Islam ("*establishment islam*"): the four regional Spiritual Boards, and registered mosques. Chapters dealing with non-official Islam are handicapped by the ignorance and mental projections of the *upolnomochennye*, the exclusive informants of this work.

We must admit, however, that the choice of the chronological framework of this study could hardly drive to an easy success: beginning in 1945 and stopping with Perestroika, without a big interest for what happened beforehand, or for the influence of historical events or facts outside the USSR, the author took the risk of reducing the history of Islam in this region of the world to the succession of impacts of Soviet administrative measures on local populations. At the same time, he was depriving himself of the possibility to relocate in various *durées* varied phenomena of which the documents he had in hand bear some trace. Through his perpetuation of thinking habits of Soviet studies, the author invites us to assess the history of Islam in Central Eurasian lands during the second half of the twentieth century, when it is not too late. This work should begin with the recollection of documents of the most various kinds and origins, not necessarily preserved in public archives or libraries, as well as with systematic interviews of protagonists and witnesses. It also presupposes an overall reflection on the varied types of collective memory which have neighbored in the region during the twentieth century, and the representations on Islam of Soviet observers and policy makers. In this perspective, it must be said in fairness to the author that his book offers us a first systematic deciphering of a specific kind of source, and his numerous and detailed quotations of his documentation give to his work an unquestionable documentary value.

S.A.D.

■ THROWER, James, "Notes on Muslim Theological Education in the USSR in the 1980s," in Shirin Akiner, ed., *Political and Economic Trends in Central Asia*, London: British Academic Press & Tauris, 1994: 175-180.

This paper provides a short description of the main official institutions of Islamic teaching in the USSR in the late 1980s, with some paragraphs on the programme and on the frequentation of the al-Bukhari Institute of Tashkent and the Mir-i 'Arab Madrasa in Bukhara. S.A.D.

■ VASILYEV, Aleksei, "Islam and Democracy. Islam Renaissance Party: An Echo of Jadidism," in Shirin Akiner et al., ed., *Tatarstan, Past and Present: Conference Held in London at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London, on June 29, 1992*, London: [School of Oriental and African Studies], 1992: 27-36.

The author has been studying possible recollections of Jadidism in the programmes and discourses of the Party of the Islamic Renewal created in Astrakhan in 1990. He observes that almost all the leaders of this organisation have only a very limited and biased knowledge of this movement, based on the polemics on Jadidism in Soviet history textbooks. This study offers a good example of the reinterpretation of the Islamic past of the Volga-Urals region and of Central Asia among Sunni Muslim intellectuals in the political underground of the last decade of the Soviet period. S.A.D.

### 5.1.C Other than Islam

■ FRISON, Ph., "Le prosélytisme des Églises chrétiennes au Turkestan: les événements de la charnière du XX<sup>e</sup> siècle vus par un Mennonite allemand," *LAC* 2 (1994): 8.

This short paper is devoted to the role of non-Orthodox Christian missionaries in Russian Central Asia, through the memories of a Russian German missionary, H. Jantzen (1866-1959), *Im Wilden Turkestan. Ein Leben unter den Moslems* (Giessen – Basel: Brunnen Verlag, 1988). S.A.D.

## 5.2 Shiite Islam

### 5.2.A The Ismā'īliyya

■ BOIVIN, Michel, *Les Ismaéliens*, Turnhout: Brepols, 1998 (Fils d'Abraham), 223 p.

This work is the first synthesis in French on Ismailism, which is introduced as a prosperous and modernist community established for 90% in South Asia. The historical part insists on the most recent time, still largely unknown. The introduction of Tayyibī, Nizārī and Imām-Shāhī theories shows the diversity of Ismailism and of its expressions. An anthology shortly but clearly introduces texts of various tendencies classified by

chronological order. The book is complemented by chapters on sacred art (Fatimid art and *pīr* graves in India and Pakistan), on spiritual life and on the sociological profile, as well as by a commented bibliography. In accordance with the spirit of the collection, the current period and practical aspects of religion are privileged. Readers interested in spirituality will be left unsatisfied.

E.F.

■ DAFTARY, Farhad, *The Ismailis. Their History and Doctrines*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990, 804 p., 20 ill.

This history of Ismailism has the advantage of being as complete as possible. It is even opened on a long introduction of the origins of Shiism, and ends in present time with a survey of existing communities. The author has integrated in his work all the scriptural sources, historical accounts, major doctrinal treatises which are often summarized, and works by leading Western and Eastern scholars. His contribution proves invaluable, since it casts light on the most obscure moments in the history of Ismā'īlīs, in particular on the Yemeni communities, on the life and thought of Nizārī imams under the Mongol domination, on the Safavid period. The book proves a precious guide in the labyrinth of schisms and affiliations. It insists on the recurrent character of Messianic temptations, for instance on the various interpretations of Muhammad b. Ismā'il's disappearance. It brilliantly exposes the drama of al-Hakīm's caliphate and the crisis of the Fatimid power. The author has been adopting the traditional periodization: proto-Ismā'īlī, Ismā'īlī, Fatimid, Nizārī "new convocation," post-Nizārī Ismailism. Careful on the status of the Ikhwān al-safā, the author stresses the contribution of the Iranian *dā'īs* who imported neo-Platonism. Perhaps doesn't he give enough significance to the event of the Great Resurrection proclaimed in Alamut, that he has been interpreting through its limited historical effects. He insists on the eventual fusion of the Imam's doctrine with that of the Sufi Pole, which is located in the vast movement of adoption of spiritual Shiism by the main *tarīqas*. This book is the indispensable historical synthesis that we were lacking so far.

C.J.

■ EMADI, H., "The End of Taqiyya: Reaffirming the Religious Identity of Ismailis in Shugnan, Badakhshan — Political Implications for Afghanistan," *MES* 34/3 (1998): 103-120.

Half of this contribution consists of a historical mix-up beginning with the rise of Ismailism in the eighth century CE, thereby maintaining, for example (p. 105) that the term 'assassins' (applied to the 11th-12th century Nizaris of Alamut) derives from *asāsiyyīn*, "since Ismailis adhered to strict observance of the foundation or principle," not even mentioning the well-established origin *hashshāshiyyīn* (etc., cannabis eaters); (p. 106) Rūdakī and Ibn Sīnā are called Ismaili philosophers, and (p. 108) well known Sufi poets, Sanā'ī, 'Attār, Rūmī etc. are presented as Ismailis in disguise. The rest of this contribution is devoted to more recent developments in the Ismaili community of Afghan Badakhshan. Basically, the author argues that poverty, social marginality and suppression by the Sunni majority were reasons for the susceptibility to socialist ideas amongst the Ismailis in the 1960s-1970s. In the 1980s, Ismailis readily entered the state

and party apparatus, because of its promotion prospects, and impressed by the standard of living of their fellow Ismailis in Soviet Tajikistan. The author concludes with some remarks concerning the difficulties of the Ismaili community after the fall of the Rabbani Government in 1996, proposing as a future model for the "Pamir region" a kind of cross-border autonomy for the Ismailis. R.E.

### 5.2.B *The Ithnā' - 'Ashariyya*

■ GADZHI-ZADE, Khikmet, "Svoboda sovesti v Azerbaidzhane [Freedom of Consciousness in Azerbaijan]," *TsA* 1997/4 [16]: 54-65.

Through the local press, the author analyzes the proselytism of new Christian — or derived from Christianity — churches in Azerbaijan, and the activity of the (Shiite) Islamic Party of Azerbaijan created in 1992 (in particular its negotiations with the Musavvat in the perspective of the foundation of an electoral coalition). The paper, not devoid of polemic intentions, remains unfortunately superficial; it is concluded by an apology of the freedom of consciousness. S.A.D.

## 5.3 Sunni Islam

### 5.3.A *General Works*

■ GABORIEAU, Marc, POPOVIC, Alexandre, ZARCONI, Thierry, eds., *Naqshbandis. Cheminements et situation actuelle d'un ordre mystique musulman*. Actes de la table ronde de Sèvres, 2-4 mai 1985, Istanbul: Institut Français d'Études Anatoliennes – Isis, 1990 (Varia Turcica: 18), II-749 p., index.

The expectation was long, but the result comes up to the hopes that the announcement of this publication had aroused for years. Very astutely conceived, the work is a mine of first-hand information on multiple aspects of the Naqshbandiyya in the varied countries where it was installed. The first part of the book is devoted to the history and doctrine of the order, to the state of research, the sources, the practices and the political role of Naqshbandī Sufis. The following parts deal with the various areas of influence of the Naqshbandiyya: the Indian subcontinent (7 papers), the Ottoman Empire and modern Turkey (10 papers), Central and Eastern Asia (former Russian Empire and USSR, Afghanistan and China, 5 papers), the Near-East and Sudan (3 papers), the Balkans (4 papers), Indonesia (2 papers). The whole set is framed by a foreword by Louis Bazin and a post-face by Olivier Carré. For each area, approaches are varied and several periods have been studied, so that every reader can choose his/her own main theme and get informed on questions as varied as, for instance, the role of *shaykhs* (papers by Gross pp. 109-121, Digby pp. 152-207, Hakim pp. 361-370, Blau pp. 371-377, Olson pp. 379-406, Zarcone pp. 407-420, Galip pp. 437-440, Grandin pp. 621-655, Lombard pp. 707-715), or the place of the Naqshbandīs in various national move-

ments (papers by Adams pp. 221-230, Malik pp. 231-235, Blau pp. 371-377, Olso pp. 379-406, Hamada pp. 455-489). D.M.

■ IBURAHIMU, Abudyurureshito [IBRĀHĪM, 'Abd al-Rashīd], *Japonya. Isuramu kei Roshiajin no mita Meiji Nihon* ["Japonya": Meiji Japan as Seen by a Muslim from Russia], transl. from Ottoman Turkish to Japanese by Komatsu Kaori and Komatsu Hisao, Tokyo: Daisan Shokan, 1991, ix-410 p., ill.

This is the first Japanese translation of the travel diary written by the famous Tatar pan-Islamist theoretician 'Abd al-Rashīd Ibrāhīm (Ibragimov, 1857-1944). The title of the Ottoman Turkish original is *Âlem-i İslâm ve Japonya'da İntişâr-ı İslâmiyet*, vol. 1, Istanbul, 1328 (1910). This translation covers the whole of the chapter about Japan, which constitutes the main body of the original volume. Japanese names and terms in the original text are corrected according to the contemporary Japanese sources. The author is supposed to have stayed in Japan for the first time from February to June, 1909. During this stay in Japan he paid much attention to the reasons of the rapid growth and strength of Japan and observed the characteristics of Japanese society and culture.

R.

### 5.3.B European Russia and Siberia

■ ALGAR, Hamid, "Shaykh Zaynullah Rasulev: The Last Great Naqshbandi Shaykh of the Volga-Urals Region," in Jo-Ann Gross, ed., *Muslims in Central Asia. Expressions of Identity and Change*, Durham: Duke University Press, 1992: 112-133.

We could never stress enough the significance, for the study of intellectual trends in nineteenth-century Russian Islam, of a source like the *Āthār* [Monumentae], a collection of biographies of literati and learned men of the Volga-Urals region by Rizā al-Dīn b. Fakhr al-Dīn (d. 1936), published in Tatar in Orenburg from 1901 onwards. It is in part on this documentary basis that the author evokes the spiritual paternities (through some paragraphs on Abū'l-Nasr al-Qūrsāwī), the personal itinerary and posterity of Zayn-Allāh b. Habīb-Allāh b. Rasūl, *alias* Rasūliyev (1835-1917), a Naqshbandī-Khālīdī *shaykh* of Bashkir origin who was active in the Eastern Urals at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Far from the great figures of secularization movements to whom late Soviet and local post-Soviet historiography use(d) to give more attention, Shaykh Zayn-Allāh is at the crossroads of two Naqshbandī *sil-silas* which both go back to Shaykh Ahmad Sirhindī. One of them has its source in Kabul and Bukhara, through the Tatar *mudarris* Qūrsāwī; the other one is represented by the Istanbul Khālīdī trend to which belonged Şeyh Ahmet Ziyaaddin Gümüshanevi (d. 1893), Zayn-Allāh's second initiator in the Naqshbandiyya. The deep spiritual trail let by the *shaykh* in Russia and Central Asia is due mainly to his work as the reformer of the Rasūliyya *madrasa* in Troitsk. In this institution the "new method" (*usūl-i jadīd*) of phonetic teaching of Turki was practiced as soon as 1893, whence the teaching pro-

gramme was, at the same time, focused on the Qur'ān and the Sunna in a reformist mind, and enlarged to non-religious disciplines. To the author's eyes, the Rasūliyya then takes place in the history of Islamic reform movements in Russia at an intermediary position between "Jadidism", a movement here considered as secularist, and Qadimism of the most conservative ulama. S.A.D.

■ AL-KURDĪ AL-ARDABILĪ AL-SHĀFI'Ī, al-Shaykh Muhammad Amīn / AL-KURDĪ AL-ERDEBİLĪ, Shaikh Mukhammad Amin, *al-Wāhib as-sarmadiyya fī manāqib an-Naqshbandiyya / Kniga vechnykh darov. O dostoinstvakh i pokhval'nykh kachestvakh sufiiskogo bratstva Nakshbandiia*, transl. from Arabic to Russian by I.R. Nasyrov, Ufa: RIO RUMNC Goskomnauki RB, 2000, 380 p.

This Russian translation of a treatise on the Naqshbandiyya-Khālidiyya, published in Cairo in 1911, would not have taken indeed its place in this volume if the same book would not have contained also the translation of an important text by the Naqshbandiyya-Khālidi *shaykh* from Troitsk, Zayn-Allāh Rasūliyev (1835-1917, see the previous review): *al-Fawā'id al-muhimma li'l-murīdīn il-Naqshbandiyya*, published in Kazan in 1899. This text constitutes an important document on the manners of thinking and practicing brotherhood life by a reformist thinker of the Eastern Urals at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, whose influence was considerable throughout Muslim Central Eurasia. The set of translations published in the present work makes of *per se* a rare and interesting document on the current reconsiderations of brotherhood tradition by the academic milieus of the Urals. S.A.D.

■ [ÄMIRKHANOV] ÄMIRKHAN, Ravil, "Möhämmädiia mädräsäse [The Muhammadiyya Madrasa]," in Röstam Mähdiev, ed., *Mädräsälärdä kitap kishtäse: Mäshhür mäg'rifät üzäkläre tarikhynnan* [The Madrasa Bookshelves: Elements for a History of the Great Figures of Education], Kazan: Tatarstan kitap nāshriiaty, 1992: 12-33, 3 ill.

Published in a collection of papers in Tatar on *madrasa* libraries in the Middle Volga region at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, this paper offers a well-documented history of the first big reformed *madrasa* of this region, the Muhammadiyya of Kazan created in 1882 by the Muslim divine 'Ālimjān Bārūdī, a former student of the *madrasas* of Bukhara. The Muhammadiyya was notably attended, up till the beginning of the Soviet period, by numerous students from Russian Central Asia. S.A.D.

■ ÄMIRKHANOV, R. M., et al., eds., *Märjani: tarikh häm khäzerge zaman. Khalyqara fänni konferentsiäse materiallary / Mardzhani: nasledie i sovremennost'.* Materialy mezhdunarodnoi nauchnoi konferentsii [Marjānī: History and Current Problems. Proceedings of the International Conference], Kazan: Master Lain, 1998, 196 p.

In spite of its potential significance, the conference held in Kazan in January 1998 on the reformist 'ālim Shihāb al-Dīn al-Marjānī (1818-1889) was quite disappointing and organised without real international participation. The proceedings, a true hodgepodge of ideas, have been divided into three parts: History, culture and education, philosophy

and religion. Among the contributions worthy of interest, we must begin with those by the rarest Arabists of the panel, the sole contributors able to approach the great Kazani 'ālim's multiform work. M. A. GOSMANOV ("Shihabetdin Märjani häm tarikhi chыganaklarnы öiränü [Shihāb al-Dīn al-Marjānī and the study of historical sources]," 16-22) makes a kind of catalogue of the sources of the history of Inner Asia used by Marjānī for his historiographical works, notably in the richest libraries of Bukhara and Samarqand during his studies in the *madrāsas* of Transoxiana. The editor of Marjānī's *Wafiyat al-aslāf*, N. G. GARAeva underlines the significance of this monumental and heterogeneous work for our knowledge of the Muslim learned milieus of Inner Eurasia in early modern times; the author also deals with varied theological questions raised in this work, notably the highly polemical problem of the night prayer in sub-boreal regions ("Materialy 'Vafiiat al-aslaf...' Mardzhani po istorii Povolzh'ia [The Data of Marjānī's *Wafiyat al-aslāf*... on the history of the Middle Volga]," 51-60). F. I. URMANCHE tackles the question of the celebration of *Nawrūz* in the ancient kingdom of the Volga Bulgars (9th-11th centuries), as it is dealt with by Marjānī in his historiographical works — with little interest of this author in the sometimes violent theological disputes raised in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries on these pre-Islamic celebrations ("Törki häm Iran khalyqlarynda Näürüz traditsiialäre (Sh. Märjani küzätüläre buencha) [*Nawrūz* Traditions among Turkic and Iranian Peoples (from Sh. Marjānī's Viewpoint)]," 85-90). The historical part is concluded with a paper on recent discoveries concerning Marjānī's personal library (R. F. MÄRDANOV, "Märjani kitap-khanäsenä bäile ianga mäg'lumatlar [New Data on Marjānī's Personal Library]," 116-120).

We may also mention several short, although interesting studies on the first interpretations of Marjānī's thought among Muslim intelligentsias of Russia in the early twentieth century. See in particular: J. S. MINGNULLIN, "Sh. Märjanineng 100 ellygyn bäiräm itü [Sh. Marjānī's Centenary]," 39-43 (on the celebrations of the hundredth lunar anniversary of Marjānī's birthday in 1914, in Russia and in Central Asia: a pivotal year in the history of Islamic reform movements in Russia, since it is also that of Gasprinskii's death); Ravil ÄMIRKHAN, "'Märjani' mäjmugasy häm anyng tarikhi ähämmiäte [The "Marjānī" Collection and Its Historical Significance]," 51-60 (an analysis of the interpretations of Marjānī's works in the rich commemorative volume published in 1914 on the occasion of the hundredth anniversary of his birth); Ä. M. SHÄRIPOV, "Shihabetdin Märjani bagyshlangan märsiialär [Funerary Elegies on Marjānī]," 95-99 (an astute selection of texts which show at the same time Marjānī's posthumous prestige and his first "takeover" by early twentieth-century Tatar nationalist and modernist authors); R. R. SALIKHOV, "Imamy Safiulla Abdullin i Gabdulla Apanaev — ucheniki i posledovateli Sh. Mardzhani [The Imams Safī-Allāh 'Abd-Allīn and 'Abd-Allāh Āpānāy, Disciples and Successors of Sh. Marjānī]," 179-185 (a biographical study on two figures of early twentieth-century Islam in the Middle Volga region, which would have been more interesting if not documented exclusively by Russian archive documents).

S.A.D.

■ BRASLAVSKII, L. Iu., *Islam v Chuvashii*, [Islam in Chuvashia], Cheboksary: Chuvashiia, 1997, 160 p., 25 photos., bibliography.

Leonid Braslavskii's study is an examination of the Islamic institutions of Tatar communities inhabiting the territory of Chuvashia. In fact, the territory of the study slightly surpasses the territory of Chuvashia, as it comprises the former jurisdictions of Cheboksary and Tsivil'sk districts of Kazan province, and Buinsk district of Simbirsk province, thereby including a number of villages today located in southwestern Tatarstan. The book is based entirely on Russian sources from the provincial archives in the cities of Kazan, Simbirsk, and Cheboksary, and is a welcome addition to the growing number of studies devoted to local Islamic institutions in the Imperial and Soviet eras. This book is an especially fine addition to this literature.

The work, richly illustrated with photographs and drawings of mosques and other Islamic architecture in Chuvashia, is divided into two main sections, as well as with facsimiles of Arabic-script Turkic documents. The first is a narrative of the history of Islamic institutions from the medieval era, through the imperial Russian and Soviet eras, down to the present post-Soviet era. The sections on the Soviet and post-Soviet eras represent original and instructive material for a topic whose historiography is still embryonic, and as such supply important empirical information. The second part of the book is a history of all of the mosques and *mahallas* that existed in the imperial and Soviet eras, as well as of the mosques that have been founded since the collapse of the Soviet Union. This latter section will undoubtedly serve as useful material for scholars studying Russia's Islamic institutions within a broader geographic framework.

A.J.F.

● DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., IS'HAQOV, Dämür, MÖHÄMMÄTSHIN, Răfiq, eds., *L'islam de Russie. Conscience communautaire et autonomie politique chez les Tatars de la Volga et de l'Oural, depuis le XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècle*, Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose, 1997, 352 p., map, tabs., index.

A specialist of intellectual life among the Muslims of Central Eurasia, S.A. Dudoignon shows a rare talent for, on the occasion of colloquia organised or co-organised by him, arousing valuable contributions by researchers of the regions under study, and for making them accessible to Western readers through translations and completing their annotations with a great erudition. He has already contributed to cast light on varied aspects of Islamic reform in Central Asia, on the occasion of a colloquium held in Tashkent in 1995 (*cf.* ASSR 106 [1999]: N.21). This time, the meeting was held in Kazan and focused on the intellectual history of the Tatars of the Middle Volga and the Urals, with the contribution of researchers from Tatarstan (ten papers in the present volume) — although S.A.D. deplors that, for reasons of particular mutual tensions, colleagues from Ufa could not be invited, although (or because...) Bashkortostan shares with its neighbour a largely common intellectual history. The introduction by S.A.D. and the first chapter by I. GILIAZOV (pp. 15-25; completed by A. NOGMANOV on the legal aspect of the Russian domination, pp. 115-130) retrace the main aspects of Tatar history relevant for the purpose of the volume. These authors remember that the khanate of Kazan was



conquered by Ivan the Terrible as soon as 1552-56 — *i.e.*, three centuries before Central Asian Muslim peoples —, and that it was then submitted to a policy of selective conversion to Orthodox Christianity which finally concerned no more than 10% of the population, but destroyed the authority of the autochthonous aristocracy through its integration into the Russian "service nobility" (R. KHÄIRUTDINOV, pp. 131-153). The Orthodox missionaries, who showed active agents of colonization, did not have a very high cultural level, so their ministry was often limited to the delivery of a christening certificate and the obligation to practice some fundamental rituals and duties, without a catechetical education (I. ZAHIDULLIN, pp. 27-64). After the reforms patronised by Catherine II, who in the 1770s gave up the policy of forced conversions launched by Peter I, and recognized the freedom of conscience, the returns to Islam was made through collective apostasies which succeeded one another until the early twentieth century, with peaks in the years 1802-3, 1827-30, 1858-70, and in the aftermath of the 1905 revolution (A. KEFELI, pp. 65-71), so that the Tatar identity which then developed focused on a strong Islamic component (D. IS'HAQOV, pp. 73-88). Durable consequences of the policy of russification were, on the first hand, the concentration of the Tatar population in rural areas, since Muslims had only a limited right to settle in cities, so that the nineteenth century Muslim trading bourgeoisie long kept strong ties with villages (C. NOACK, pp. 89-114), and on the other hand the promotion of the ulama as guides and reference authorities for the community of the faithful.

After a first liberalisation in the 1770s-80s, a new wave of reforms directly or indirectly favourable to the Muslim populations of European Russia was set up in the 1860s-80s, in the aftermath of the Crimean War. These measures led to a certain integration of the Muslim subjects of the Czar into the public life of the Russian Empire (R. SALIHOV, pp. 155-174, D. USMANOVA, pp. 175-191). The Islamic renewal of the Tatars, from the last decades of the nineteenth century onwards, arouses several interesting reflections: that of G. DELANOUE deals with religious reform in Arabic-speaking countries from 1800 to 1940, to which the Tatars were sensitive (pp. 193-205); those by S. A. DUDOIGNON himself insist on the difficulty to define a clear cleavage between "Jadidism" or reformism, on the first hand, and on the other hand "Qadimism" or traditionalism in Russia's Islam; they appeal to a sociological approach which would transcend the terms of the early twentieth-century ideological disputes (pp. 207-225, with a rich bibliography); those by T. ZARCONE raise the question of the relations between Jadid thinkers and the form of Sufi sociability made of by the *khānaqā'*, the brotherhoods' convents (pp. 227-246); those by F. GEORGEON on the influence of a Tatar modernist "model" in the late Ottoman Empire and in Republican Turkey drive to the conclusion that, if their meeting was apparently missed — since Republican Turkey based its nationalism on its territory, instead of ethnic affiliations, and since its nationalism is laic —, however the intellectual contribution of Muslim travellers or émigrés from Russia played a significant role in the Young-Turk period (pp. 249-257). The reader then proceeds to the re-Islamisation of the post-Soviet period, during which Islam showed a pillar of Tatar national ideology (R. MUSINA, pp. 259-269; L. SÄGITOVA, pp.

271-287), although it is now in quest of its institutions (R. MÖHÄMMÄTSHIN, pp. 289-305 — one of the editors of the present volume, named R. Mouhammetchine in a previous work edited by S.A.D., *Le réformisme musulman en Asie Centrale*). The first national republic of new Russia by its population, Tatarstan has managed to establish privileged equalitarian, although ambiguous, relations with Moscow (J.-R. RAVIOT, pp. 307-342).

See also the following review.

F.A.

■ [DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A.] DUDUAN'ON, Stefan A., ISKHAKOV, Damir [IS'HAQOV, Dämır], MUKHAMETSHIN, Rafik [MÖHÄMMÄTSHIN, Rāfyq], eds., *Islam v tatarskom mire: istoriia i sovremennost'* (*Materialy mezhdunarodnogo simpoziuma, Kazan', 29 apreliia-1 maia 1996 g.*) [Islam in the Tatar World: History and Present Situation (Proceedings of the Colloquium Held in Kazan on April 29-May 1, 1996)], Kazan: s.n., 1997 (*Panorama Forum*: 12), 378 p., tab.

This volume contains the Russian materials published from the international symposium convened in Kazan, in April and May 1996. The volume contains Russian versions of most of the articles that appeared in the French edition of the proceedings published in Paris in the same year. However, the Russian edition also contains a number of articles and documentary publications not included in the French edition (see the previous review).

The articles appearing in both editions are the following: Iskander GILIAZOV, "Evoliutsiia sotsial'noi struktury tatarskogo obshchestva i islam (vtoraia pol. XVI-XVIII vv.) [The Evolution of the Social Structure of Tatar Society and Islam (Second Half of the 16th – 18th centuries)"; Damir ISKHAKOV, "Ob identichnosti Volgo-Ural'skikh tatar v XVIII v. [On the Identity of the Volga-Ural Tatars in the 18th Century]"; Ildus ZAGIDULLIN, "Prichiny otpadeniia starokreshchenykh tatar Srednego Povolzh'ia v musul'manstvo v XIX v. [The Causes of the Apostasy to Islam among the Old-Convert Tatars of the Middle Volga Region in the 19th Century]"; Stéphane A. DUDOIGNON, "Kadimizm: elementy sotsiologii musul'manskogo traditsionalizma v tatarskom mire i Maverannakhre (konets XVIII – nach. XX v.) [Qadimism: Elements of a Sociology of Muslim Traditionalism in the Tatar World and Transoxiana (End of the 18th to the Beginning of the 20th Centuries)]"; Ramil' KHAIRUTDINOV, "Tatarskaia feodal'naia znat' i rossiiskoe dvorianstvo: problemy integratsii na rubezhe XVIII-XIX vv. [The Tatar Feudal Nobility and the Russian Gentry: Problems of Integration at the Turn of the 18th and 19th Centuries]"; Radik SALIKHOV, "Predstavitel'stvo tatar-musul'man v vybornykh organakh mestnogo samoupravleniia v Kazani na rubezhe XIX-XX vv. [The Presence of Muslim Tatars in the Elective Bodies of Local Self-Government in Kazan at the Turn of the 19th and 20th Centuries]"; Thierry ZARCONI, "Sufizm v tatarskom mire v nachale XX veka (Musa Iarulla Bigiev i odin iz polemicheskikh aspektov etoi problemy) [Sufism in the Tatar World at the Beginning of the 20th Century (Musa Yarullah Bigiev and one of the Polemical Aspects of this Problem)]"; Aidar NOGMANOV, "Evoliutsiia zakonodatel'stva o musul'manakh Rossii (vtoraia polovina XVI – pervaiia polovina XIX

vv.) [The Evolution of the Legislation Regarding the Muslims of Russia (Second Half of the 16th to the First Half of the 19th Centuries)"]; Gilbert DELANOUE, "Nekotorye aspekty vozrozhdeniia islama v Rossii. Musul'manskii reformizm v araboiazychnykh stranakh (1880-1940 gg.) [Some Points of Reference for the Islamic Renaissance in Russia: Muslim Reformism in Arab Lands (1880-1940)"]"; François GEORGEON, "Tiurkskie intelligenty Rossii v Ottomanskoi imperii i ikh vliianie v epokhu mlado-turkov [Turkic Intellectuals in the Ottoman Empire and Their Influence during the Young Turk Era]"; Rozalinda MUSINA, "Islam i musul'mane v sovremennom Tatarstane [Islam and Muslims in Contemporary Tatarstan]"; Liliia SAGITOVA, "O nekotorykh aspektakh etnokul'turnoi spetsifiki sovremenного tatarskogo obshchestva [On Some Aspects of Ethno-Cultural Uniqueness in Contemporary Tatar Society]"; Rafik MUXAMETSHIN, "Ofitsial'nye instituty musul'man i obshchestvenno-politicheskie organizatsii i dvizheniia v Tatarstane v 1990-e gody [Official Muslim Institutions and Socio-Political Organizations and Movements in Tatarstan in the 1990s]"; Jean-Robert RAVIOT, "Tatarstan v tsentre sozdaniia federal'skoi struktury Rossii: inventsiia suvereniteta-soiuza [Tatarstan in the Heart of the Federal Construct in Russia: the Invention of Sovereignty-Association]."

The Russian volume however contains a number of articles not found in the French edition. These include Mansur KHASANOV's "Fenomen rossiiskogo musul'manstva [The Phenomenon of Russia's Muslims]," (8-12) a very broad and extremely general introductory treatment of the historical role of Muslims in Russia. Two articles devoted to the history of Islam in the Volga-Ural region include Aidar IUZEEV's "Problema vozniknoveniia mira v proizvedeniiakh A. Kursavi i Sh. Mardzhani [The Issue of the Creation of the World in the Works of A. Qūrsāwī and Sh. Marjānī]" (148-158) and Suleiman RAKHIMOV's "Sotsial'no-pravovoi status tatarskikh uchebnykh zavedenii poslednei chetverti XVIII - nach. XX vv. [The Social and Legal Status of Tatar Educational Institutions from the Last Quarter of the 18th to the Beginning of the 20th Century]" (71-82). Rakhimov's article stands out as one of the collection's most substantial contributions. In this article Rakhimov makes the case that before the era of Jadidist Muslim educational reform Muslim educational institutions were dynamic and responded effectively to the needs of their communities. This important and entirely convincing argument challenges the widely encountered claim that before Jadidism traditional Islamic education was generally of little practical use to Muslim communities and was hide-bound and incapable of flexibility. Other historical articles include a contribution by Sherali TURDIEV, "Sredneaziatskie tatary: rol' i znachenie v kul'turnoi i politicheskoi zhizni Turkestana pervoi chetverti XX v. [Central Asian Tatars: Their Role and Significance in the Cultural and Political Life of Turkestan in the First Quarter of the 20th Century]" (169-190) and Al'fiia GALIAMOVA's "Sotsial'nyi oblik Tatarstan v 40 - 80-e gody XX v. [A Social Overview of Tatarstan from the 1940s to the 1980s]" (198-210).

The largest number of articles unique to the Russian edition deals with current political, cultural and religious issues in Tatarstan. Of particular interest is the article

by Niiáz KHALIT, "Polemika vokrug rekonstruktsii mecheti Kul-Sharifa v Kazanskom kremle: politicheskie aspekty zashchity tatarskogo arkhitekturnogo naslediiia [The Polemic Surrounding the Reconstruction of the Qul-Sharif Mosque in the Kazan Kremlin: Political Aspects of the Defense of the Architectural Heritage]" (233-250). This issue, which Christian Noack subsequently discussed somewhat more critically in the German journal *Osteuropa* (May 1998), involves the eventually successful attempt by Tatar nationalists to construct a massive mosque in the heart of the ancient Kazan Kremlin, on the site of what they believe to have been an earlier mosque destroyed during the Russian conquest of the city in 1552. Khalit, who has published several studies on the architecture of Kazan's mosques, is a vocal proponent of the project and discusses the various positions and arguments mainly for the reconstruction of the Qul-Sharif Mosque. Iagfar GARIPOV's "Molodye goroda: formirovanie naseleniia, mezhnatsional'nye i mezkhkonnatsional'nye otnosheniia [Young Cities: the Formation of their Population, Inter-Ethnic and Inter-Confessional Relations]" (266-277) deals primarily with the sociology of the industrial city of Naberezhnye Chelny, which was founded in the Soviet era and experienced rapid growth in the 1970s and 1980s, as the Soviet invested heavily in that city's main industry, the KamAZ truck plant. The city's Tatar population, made up in large part of young migrants from rural areas, was and remains among the most active center of the Tatar national movement and especially as a center for political Islam. Contributions on current political events include Rustam GABIDULLIN's "Etnopoliticheskaia kontseptsiiia gosudarstvennogo vozrozhdeniia Tatarstana v programmnykh polozeniakh tatarskogo natsional'nogo dvizheniia [The Ethno-Political Conception of the Rebirth of Tatarstan as a State in the Platform Declarations of the Tatar National Movement]" (278-290) and Rafael' KHAKIMOV's "Perspektivy federalizatsii Rossii: vzgliad iz Tatarstana [The Future of the Federalization of Russia: a View from Tatarstan]" (325-336).

Finally, the collection also includes publications of a series of notorious documents from the Tatar District Committee of the CPSU issued between 1944 and 1952, placing historical studies and pedagogy in line with Stalin's "Friendship of Peoples" dictates regarding official publications on Tatar history. These documents essentially condemned those scholars who viewed positively the historical role of the Golden Horde in Tatar history. As such, they are offered by Tatar nationalists both as proof positive of Soviet attempts to distort "genuine" Tatar history, and as a means of affirming the Tatar nationalists' vision of Tatar history, in which the Golden Horde holds a central role.

Also reviewed by Paul W. Werth, *RR* 58/2 (1998): 323-324.

A.J.F.

- DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., ed., *En islam sibérien*, Paris: Editions de l'EHESS, 2000 (*CMR*, 41/2-3), pp. 205-444, map, fig., English and French summaries.

After having encouraged cross-cultural studies on Islamic reform in Central Asia, then on Tatar identity (see *supra*), S.A. Dudoignon contributes to orienting research towards the Muslim peoples of Western Siberia. Because of the particularly mixed population

of this region, the results are more fragmentary and apparently disjointed than in a previous book on *L'islam de Russie*. However the editor has managed, thanks to a synthetic introduction, to give them a homogeneity which makes the reading of the whole set easier. His base of operations is now Omsk, instead of Kazan; besides, the editor remarks the contrast between the approach in the school of Kazan, oriented towards history and inter-regional exchanges, and that by the school of Omsk, focused on ethnography and differentiations: whence Kazan Muslim intellectuals are constantly stressing the cultural unity of Volga Tatars disseminated from Poland to Manchuria, those of Omsk take as the main object of their study "popular" culture, under the influence of Russian ethnography. As a consequence, the object of their research is made of remnants of pre-Islamic cults or the influence of laicized cults of the Soviet era (Aleksandr G. SELEZNEV on the Turkic-speaking populations of Western Siberia, pp. 341-356; Shulpan K. AKHMETOVA on the Qazaqs of Western Siberia, pp. 357-368, both papers translated from Russian by S.A.D.); or this object is made of by an exogenous learned culture imported mainly from the south of Central Asia. Educated in the methods and spirit of the Russian ethnographic school, these researchers are preoccupied in questions of ethnic identity (see the survey of Turkic-speaking ethnic groups of the Western Siberian plain by Nikolai A. TOMILOV, pp. 221-232, translated from Russian by one of the collaborators of the volume, A.J. Frank; a reconstruction of symbolic identity cleavages between autochthonous and migrant Tatars according to their respective genealogies, by Svetlana N. KORUSENKO, pp. 233-244, translated from Russian by S.A.D.; see also, to the West, in the Urals, the study on the identity discourse among the Bashkirs by Xavier Le TORRIVELLE, pp. 369-400).

Foreign specialists tend to give more significance to the Islamic factor. The great variety of the narratives on the conversion to Islamization of the Baraba Tatars, according to the source from which they come, reflects the complexity and the fluidity of the factors of this conversion; it should encourage researchers to a careful approach to the usual distinctions between "real" and "superficial" Islamisation, between genuinely Muslim and pre-Islamic customs (Allen J. FRANK, pp. 245-262). Among the vector of the Islamisation of the Western Siberian plain we find a numerically small group of traders from Bukhara long favoured by the Russian imperial administration, and who transformed into the higher class of the local Muslim society (Christian NOACK, pp. 263-278, in German). The relations with the oasis-cities of Transoxiana and with the Volga-Urals region can easily be traced through the study of spiritual genealogies of the Sufi brotherhoods (Thierry ZARCON, pp. 279-296). To which kind of identity, however, does drive this Islam that we are now used to call "peripheral" — an Islam which appears as the result of varying fiscal, migratory, religious, national policies successively implemented by Muscovy, the Russian Empire, the USSR, and now the Federation of Russia? The complexity of the possible answers to this question is illustrated by a perusal of the press published in Tomsk at the eve of the First World War by a tiny local Muslim intelligentsia, both Europeanized and attached to its own Muslim identity on which it was then trying to build up a citizenship consciousness (S. A.

DUDOIGNON, pp. 297-339). The last contribution of the volume brings us to the Russian Far East, outside Muslim-peopled regions, among Yukagirs, a numerically small ethnic group which, after being decimated in the Czarist period, and losing its cultural identity during the Soviet one, is now in a movement of neo-traditionalist reconstruction led by a tiny elite, whence the bulk of the population, overwhelmed by the economic difficulties, does not show very receptive to these innovations. F.A.

■ GALLÄMOV, I. K., MÄRDANOV, R. F., *XX iöz bashy tatar tög'lim-tärbiia zhurnallarynyng bibliografik kürsätkeche* [Bibliographical Index of Early 20th-Century Tatar Journals on Teaching and Education], Kazan: "Milli kitap" nashriiati, 1997, 67 p.

The authors offer us an invaluable working tool with this thematic index of four Muslim periodicals (*Tarbiya-yi atfāl*, *Tarbiya*, *Maktab* and *Mu'allim*) published in Tatar language in the Middle Volga region in the first decades of the twentieth century, and dealing essentially with the reform of Islamic educational institutions in European Russia. The main themes of the index are, for each periodical: information concerning the journal itself, the social and political life, education, language and literature, biographies, religious questions. S.A.D.

■ KANLIDERE, Ahmet, *Reform within Islam: The Tajdid and Jadid Movement among the Kazan Tatars, 1809-1917: Conciliation or Conflict?*, Istanbul: Eren Yayıncılık, 1997 (Middle Eastern and Balkan Studies Series), 199 p., bibliography, index.

This monograph comprises a revised edition of the author's doctoral dissertation, submitted to Columbia University in New York. The author addresses the history of Tatar Jadidism, or Islamic modernism, and its place in the intellectual and national development of the Tatars prior to the establishment of Soviet power. In addition to narrating the history of Jadidist thought among Volga-Ural Muslims, the author focuses his argument on the role of "progressive" Muslim scholars in conciliating Islamic reformism and modernism. The main part of the book is rather concise, amounting to 140 pages, and divided into five chapters. Chapter One consists of historical background of Tatars, as well as the general introduction to the author's approach. Chapter Two examines the growth of reformism among the Tatars, and examines the positions of a number of prominent scholars in conciliating reformism with modernism. Chapter Three examines the role of Jadidism in reforming religious practice among Tatar Muslims. Chapter Four examines the issue of Jadidism and education, and the last chapter examines the role of Jadidism in the political and national identity of Tatars. The book also contains appendices (pages 141-156) with short biographies of numerous intellectuals and other figures who were active in the political and intellectual life of Russia's Muslims. The book will certainly prove to be a useful addition to the relatively populous field of Jadidist studies, although it is unfortunate that the work makes little use of either Russian sources (including those from post-Soviet Tatarstan), or of several recent German and French studies of Jadidism, which may have served to sharpen or better focus some of the author's arguments. A.J.F.

● KARPAT, Kemal H., "The *Hijra* from Russia and the Balkans: the Process of Self-Definition in the Late Ottoman State," in Dale F. Eickelman & James Piscatori eds., *Muslim Travellers: Pilgrimage, Migration, and the Religious Imagination*, Berkeley: University of California Press – London: Routledge, 1990, pp. 131-152.

The author examines the historical significance of the great migrations of Muslim population from the Balkans, Crimea and Caucasus into the Ottoman domain from 1850 to 1914. He estimates the total amount of migration around five to seven million, which contributed to the rapid increase of the Ottoman population between 1860 and 1878. The mass migration caused by oppressions in the Balkans and the Russian Empire gave rise to the Pan-Islamic trend among the Ottoman Muslims, which was exploited by Sultan Abdülhamid II (1876-1909) to integrate various tribal and ethnic groups into the Ottoman Muslim nation. In this way the author presents an important aspect of historical relevance between modern Central Eurasia and Turkey. K.H.

■ KEMPER, Michael, *Sufis und Gelehrte in Tatarien und Baschkirien, 1789-1889. Der Islamische Diskurs unter russischer Herrschaft*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1998 (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 218), vi-516 p., bibliography, index.

In his impressive study, the German scholar Michael Kemper has explored and described the "Islamic Discourse" among Muslims in the Volga-Ural region of Russia from the end of the 18th century, with the establishment of the Orenburg Muslim Spiritual Assembly in 1788, down to the 1880s, when Islamic modernism and nationalist ideas began to take root among the region's Muslim intellectuals. In Kemper's monograph the term "Islamic Discourse" has a restricted meaning. Kemper bases the definition of the term on the works of the Islamologist Reinhard Schulze, and in this context it implies the debates and discussions of social, political and religious issues expressed through traditional Islamic literary genres and institutions, such as Sufism and Sufi treatises, theology, law, and historiography. Kemper uses the term "Islamic" in a narrower and more useful sense, signifying the cultural idiom of Islamic culture as a whole, to which the Volga-Ural *'ulamā* were trained in and consciously made reference to. In this context, "Islamic" is not simply a synonym for Muslim, rather it is a reference to a shared body of traditions, canons and genres common to the Islamic world as a whole.

The work is divided into five main chapters, which are further divided into numerous sub-chapters. The first chapter provides the institutional framework underpinning Islamic Discourse in the Volga-Ural region. Specifically, Kemper discusses the establishment of the Orenburg Muslim Spiritual Assembly by Catherine II in 1788, and the first two Muftis, Muhammad-Jān b. al-Husayn (r. 1788-1824) and 'Abd al-Salām b. 'Abd ar-Rahīm (r. 1825-1840). Chapter Two is devoted to the development of Sufi literature, in which Kemper provides the most thorough overview yet available of Sufi lineages and affiliations in the Volga-Ural region. Kemper then addresses the Sufi works of such figures as Tāj al-Dīn b. Yālchīgūl, 'Umar al-Utārī, Hisbat-Allāh al-Qarghālī, Abū'l-Manīh al-Qarghālī, and 'Abd al-Rahman al-Ūtiz-Īmānī, all figures who were primarily active



in the late 18th century and in the first half of the 19th century. Chapter Three is devoted to the Islamic Discourse within the fields of theology and law. This chapter is primarily devoted to the works and legacy of the influential theologian ‘Abd al-Nasīr al-Qūrsāwī, including both his own works, and those of his critics, most notably ‘Abd al-Rahman al-Ūtiz-Īmānī. Chapter Four deals with the role of historiography in Islamic Discourse, specifically addressing the works of Tāj al-Dīn b. Yālchīgūl and the "*Tawārīkh-i Bulghāriyya*" of Husām al-Dīn al-Bulghārī. Chapter Five examines the development of Islamic Discourse in the second half of the 19th century into three major currents, the pro-czarist "Volga-Bulghar" patriotism and pietism characterized by the Bashkir Sufi Muhammad ‘Alī al-Chūqūrī, the anti-Mufti radicalism of Bahā’ al-Dīn Waysī (Vaisov in Russian texts), and the critical Islamic reformism of Shihāb al-Dīn Marjānī.

Kemper's study is so important because it forces its readers to reevaluate virtually all of the existing literature on Muslim intellectual life among the Volga-Ural regions of Russia. In previous studies, figures such as Qūrsāwī, Ūtiz-Īmānī, and Marjānī, as well as many other lesser known names, are removed from the Islamic context in which everything they wrote was firmly based, and are praised for their supposed "secularist" or "enlightened" positions. While such assessments certainly were, and continue to be, expedient to Soviet and nationalist authors, such views are based on very selective (if any) interpretations of the original sources. Kemper also highlights how the application of national affiliations, such as "Tatar" and "Bashkir" in Soviet and post-Soviet studies is fundamentally anachronistic. As Kemper convincingly demonstrates, Volga-Ural Muslim thinkers for the most part identified themselves as "Bulghars," an identity based on essentially Islamic legends and conceptions of the community. Finally, Kemper deserves praise for his thorough exploration of the rich collections of Arabic, Turkic, and Persian manuscript collections in Kazan and St. Petersburg. The bibliography of manuscripts at the end of the book is an important resource for those seeking to use largely non catalogued collections in Kazan and Ufa. A.J.F.

■ KHAIRULLIN, A[nvar], ed., *Shihabetdin Märjani*, Kazan: Tatarstan kitap nāshriiaty, 1998, 176 p., 29 photos.

This volume contains a Cyrillic-script re-edition of Shahrar Sharaf's biography of Shihāb al-Dīn Marjānī that appeared in 1915 in Kazan within a large collection of articles entitled simply *Marjānī*. As Suleiman Rakhimov notes in a Russian afterword to the work, despite the appearance of numerous studies on Marjānī and his works, since its appearance in 1915 to commemorate the hundredth anniversary of his birth, Sharaf's study remains unsurpassed as the main biographical treatment of Marjānī. Sharaf's treatment of Marjānī's life is essentially chronological, tracing his early education, his residence in the *madrasas* of Central Asia, his return to the Middle Volga region and his career as an imam and educator, and his positions in various debates and controversies that occupied Muslim scholars in Kazan in the middle of the nineteenth century. The work also contains a table of contents listing all of the articles that appeared in the original



collection in 1915.

A.J.F.

■ LAZZERINI, Edward J., "Beyond Renewal: The *Jadīd* Response to Pressure for Change in the Modern Age," in Jo-Ann Gross, ed., *Muslims in Central Asia. Expressions of Identity and Change*, Durham: Duke University Press, 1992: 151-166.

On the basis of some major textual sources (among which the key collection of biographies of learned men *Āthār* by Rizā al-Dīn b. Fakhr al-Dīn, printed in Orenburg from 1901 onwards), the author draws a sketch of an intellectual biography of two major figures of Islamic reform in Russia: Abū'l-Nasr al-Qūrsāwī (1776-1812) and Ismail Bey Gasprinskii (1851-1914) — for a better understanding of the essential differences between them. The former is attached to the rich Islamic tradition of *mujaddids*: if he pleads for a return to the teaching of philosophy (*falsafa*) and natural sciences, his conceptions remain essentially "retrospective." Qūrsāwī insists above all, as do after him his Naqshbandī disciples and readers in Bukhara and in the Middle Volga region, on the grandeur of the Islamic past and the necessity to restore the unity of the *umma*. The latter, Gasprinskii, appeared in a radically different period of time, characterised by the impacts of the cultural policy of the Czarist power towards the Muslim subjects of the Empire, by the stimulation of economic change among the Muslim elites of European Russia, and by the challenge of the overwhelming technological superiority of the colonial powers. Assessing the "failure" of "Asian" societies, Gasprinskii brings in a rupture in the Islamic tradition of reference to a golden age, through the admission of the Hegelian postulate of a continuous progress and that of a necessary economic and technological competition of Islam with the West.

S.A.D.

■ MÄHDIEV, Röstäm, "Tatar mädräsäläre [Tatar Madrasas]," in Röstäm Mähdiev, ed., *Mädräsälärdä kitap kishtäse: Mäshhür mäg'rifät üzäkläre tarikhynnan*, Kazan: Tatarstan kitap nāshriaty, 1992: 3-12.

The editor of the present collective work in Tatar language on the *madrasas* of the Middle Volga region at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, the author offers an synthetic introductory paper on their libraries, now dispersed (through a study of the fund of the Oriental Library of the Institute of History of the Academy of Sciences of Tatarstan). Some paragraphs are devoted to the publication activity of the big reformed *madrasas* of this region and to the history of their libraries in the aftermath of the Bolshevik takeover.

S.A.D.

■ MALASHENKO, Aleksei, *Islamskoe vozrozhdenie v Rossiiskoi Federatsii* [The Islamic Renewal in the Russian Federation], Moscow: Moskovskii Tsentr Karnegi, 1998, 220 p., photos., bibliography, English summary.

The study of primary sources and fieldwork remains still very limited in this overview of the Islamic "renewal" in Russia, which focuses on the most visible political aspects of this phenomenon during the past decade. The historical introduction popularizes some recent Soviet or Russian publications, but skips over substantial contributions of

American or European schools of research, to say nothing of abundant primary sources. The author feels more at ease in the description of political organizations that claim to represent Islam or those of the religious milieus of Russia, of which he has become a key specialist. Let's note on this subject a very interesting chapter (105-125) on the phenomenon of regionalization and increasing mutual concurrence of regional *muftiyyats* and spiritual boards — Siberia has not been forgotten, with several captivating portrait sketches of great figures of Russia's Muslim religious milieus. S.A.D.

- MUKHAMETSHIN, R. M. [MÖHÄMMÄTSHIN, Rāfyq], "Dzhadidizm: vremia poiska novykh podkhodov [Jadidism: the Time to Search New Approaches]," *Tatarstan* 1995/9-10: 87-89.

A disciple of the historian of Jadidism Iah'ia Abdullin, who used to consider early twentieth-century Islamic reform as a movement of acculturation to Russia, the author, a former adviser of the *muftiyyat* of Tatarstan, relocates Jadidism in the continuity of the history of the nineteenth century Islamic revivals. He perceives Jadidism as it developed in Kazan in the 1900s and 1910s a movement of ethical and theological revival deeply associated with those which had appeared in Transoxiana at the turn of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. S.A.D.

- RÄHIMOV, Söläiman, "Gäliia mädräsäse [The Madrasa-yi 'Āliyya]," in Röstam Mähdiev, ed., *Mädräsälärdä kitap kishtäse: Mäshhür mäg'rifät üzäkläre tarikhynnan*, Kazan: Tatarstan kitap nāshriiaty, 1992: 114-129.

The former vice-curator of the Central State Archive of Tatarstan in Kazan, the author is also a specialist of the history of Islamic education in the Volga-Urals region at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. He devotes here a short monographic paper to the Madrasa-yi 'Āliyya, which was created in 1906 in the city of Ufa by the reform-minded theologian Ziyā Kamālī (a former pupil of Muhammad 'Abduh in al-Azhar), and which endured in 1908-09 serious troubles with the Russian authorities, under the pressure of the students' Islāhī protest movement. The author devotes several paragraphs to the *madrasa's* main figures in the 1910s, and insists on their close links with the main centres of renewal of Sunni Islam (with Cairo, in particular).

S.A.D.

- RÄHIMQULOVA, Mädinä, HÄMIDULLIN, Liron, "Hösäiniia mädräsäse [The Husayniyya Madrasa]," in Röstam Mähdiev, ed., *Mädräsälärdä kitap kishtäse: Mäshhür mäg'rifät üzäkläre tarikhynnan*, Kazan: Tatarstan kitap nāshriiaty, 1992: 74-114.

Unfortunately devoid of any critical apparatus (to the contrary of other papers published in the same volume), this long contribution reconstructs the history of the big reformed Husayniyya *madrasa* in Orenburg, one of the most important of the Volga-Urals region from its foundation in 1889 by the trader and manufacturer Ahmad Bāy Husaynoff till the early Soviet period. The paper gives a large room to the study of the economic activity of the Husaynoff family and its role in the public and cultural life of the Muslim population of Orenburg, in particular in the development of reformed Islamic

education at the *maktab* and *madrasa* levels. It then tackles in detail the teaching programmes successively adopted by the Husayniyya (these programmes are well-documented thanks to their lithographed publication in the first years of the twentieth century), then the composition of the *madrasa*'s teaching staff, with short biographies of its most notable members. This study is concluded by a last chapter on the literary works published during the 1910s by the Islāhī students of the Husayniyya, partly under the influence of the Young-Turks modernist and nationalist ideas. S.A.D.

- [RĀHIMQULOVA, Mādinā] RAKHIMKULOVA, Madina, *Medrese "Khusainiia" v Orenburge* [The Husayniyya Madrasa in Orenburg], Orenburg: Iana Vakyt, 1997, 250 p., ill.

In spite of its openly apologetic dimension and of the weakness of its critical apparatus, which make harder the use of the whole work, we may be pleased of its very existence, since it is to our knowledge the first distinct monograph on one of the most influential early twentieth-century reformed Islamic educational institutions in the Volga-Urals region. (For a shorter introduction, with more reference however to recent international researches, see M. FARKHSHATOV, "Husainiia," in S.M. Prozorov, ed., *Islam na territorii byvshei Rossiiskoi imperii. Entsiklopedicheskii slovar'* [Islam on the Territory of the Former Russian Empire. An Encyclopedic Dictionary], 1., Moscow: Izdatel'skaia firma "Vostochnaia literatura" RAN, 1998, 101 p., bibliography [and our review in the first part of this volume; see also the previous review].) M. Rāhimqulova's book is of particular interest thanks to its numerous biographical notices on the *madrasa*'s teachers or students, or still on prominent figures of the literary and musical life of Orenburg during the last decades of the Czarist regime. This monograph is the work of a local teacher (b. 1916), coming from a family of former rural mullahs in the governorate of Ufa — and for this reason excluded from Soviet higher educational institutions. As such, it provides an excellent example of local non-academic erudition and of reinterpretation of the regional past in the Muslim-background populations of the Southern Urals.

Of the same author, one can also read: *Prepodavanie estestvennykh nauk v tatarskikh shkolakh dorevoliutsionnoi Rossii* [The teaching of Natural Sciences in the Tatar Schools of Pre-Revolutionary Russia], Orenburg: Agentstvo Pressa, 1998, 217 p., pl. ill.; as well as a curious collection of archive documents of various nature on prominent figures of the Muslim population of the Volga-Urals region in the early twentieth century: *Rāmievlār* [The Ramiyeffs], Orenburg: Iana Vakyt, 1995, 141 p., ill.; *Galimjan Ibrahimov*, Orenburg: Iana Vakyt, 1997, 96 p., ill. S.A.D.

- TÜRKÖĞLÜ, İsmail, *Sibiryalı Meşhur Seyyah Abdürreşid İbrahim*, Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 1997, 172 p., ill. h.-t., index.

In the last decades a number of studies on Abdurreshid Ibrahim (1857-1944)'s life and activities have been published. This work presents the colorful life of stubborn Pan-Islamist Ibrahim as well as a comprehensive list of his writings. It would be awaited to evaluate his activities and thought in the historical context of Central Eurasia and Japan

in the first half of the twentieth century. See also the special issue of Ibrahim of *Toplumsal Tarih* 4/19 and 4/20 (1995); Selçuk Esenbel & Inaba Chiharu, eds., *The Rising Sun and the Turkish Crescent: New Perspective on the History of Japanese Turkish Relations* (Istanbul: Boğaziçi University Press, 2003, ix-307 p., 12 plates). As for relating studies in Japan, see the first part of this volume, p.131. K.H.

■ USMANOVA, Dilara, "L'Assemblée Spirituelle musulmane au début du xx<sup>e</sup> siècle: les projets de réforme face au pouvoir politique russe," in Stéphane A. Dudoignon, Dämîr Is'haqov, Rāfyq Möhämätshin, eds., *L'Islam de Russie. Conscience communautaire et autonomie politique chez les Tatars de la Volga et de l'Oural, depuis le xviii<sup>e</sup> siècle*. Actes du colloque international de Qazan, 29 avril-1<sup>er</sup> juin 1996, Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose, 1997: 175-192.

This paper marks a step in the author's general reflection on the promotion by Muslim communities of the Russian Empire of their claims for more equality with the Orthodox subjects of the Czar, in particular in the framework of the State Duma. The present study focuses on the evolution of the so-called Orenburg Spiritual Assembly created by Catherine II in 1788, from reform attempts proposed by Muslim representatives in the first Dumas, to the transformation of the Assembly into a Spiritual Direction more autonomous *vis-à-vis* the Russian power, under the Provisional Government and in the aftermath of the Bolshevik takeover. For a more detailed assessment of the disputes at the Duma, the reader can read a more recent monograph by the same author: Diliara USMANOVA, *Musul'manskaia fraktsiia i problemy "svobody sovesti" v Gosudarstvennoi Dume Rossii (1906-1917)* [The Muslim Fraction and the Questions of "Freedom of Conscience" in the State Duma of Russia (1906-1917)], Kazan, Izdatel'stvo "Master Lain," 1999, 163 p., tab., ill., and our review of this book in the third part of the present volume]. On the Orenburg Spiritual Assembly and its history, the main reference remains to this date a dissertation thesis by the historian Danil' AZAMATOV, *Orenburgskoe Magometanskoe Dukhovnoe sobranie v obshchestvennoi i dukhovnoi zhizni musul'manskogo naseleniia Iuzhnogo Urala v kontse XVIII-XIX vv.* [The Muslim Spiritual Assembly of Orenburg in the public and Spiritual Life of the Muslim Population of the Southern Urals, in the Late Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries], candidate thesis, Ufa: Rossiiskaia Akademiia nauk / Ufimskii nauchnyi tsentr / Institut istorii, iazyka i literatury, 1994. R.

### 5.3.C The Caucasus

■ BENNIGSEN, Alexandre, "The Qādiriyyah (Kunta Hājjī Tarīqah in North-East Caucasus: 1850-1987)," *IC* 62/2 (1988): 63-78.

The Qādiriyya was introduced into the Caucasus in 1850 by Kunta Kishiev, a Dagestanese pilgrim back from Mekka and Baghdad, and then had a great success among the populations of this region of the Russian Empire. Like Shāmil's Naqshbandiyya, it struggled against Russians, then against the Bolsheviks. Despite repression and deportations, this brotherhood, divided into several branches after Kunta

Kishiev's death in 1867, persisted till our days and tried in the 1980s to gather under a unique leadership its various branches. This paper was the first to tackle with so much detail more than a century of history of this brotherhood in the Caucasus.

T.Z.

- ZELKINA, Anna, *In Quest for God and Freedom. Sufi Responses to the Russian Advances in the North Caucasus*, London: Hurst & Company, 2000, 265 p.

The present work is a product of a philosophy radically different from that of the other book published in the same year by the same publisher on Islam in Central Eurasian land (see Yaacov Ro'i, *Islam in the Soviet Union. From World War II to Perestroika*, cf. our review *supra* in this section). The result of a long maturing marked out by numerous publications by the same author, *In Quest for God and Freedom* offers us a complex case study of what Russian and Soviet sources used for long to call "Muridism." This question has been tackled through the impact of an Islamic mystical order, the Naqshbandiyya, on the social, religious and political life of Dagestanese and Vainakh (Chechen) peoples in the North-Eastern Caucasus, during the first half of the nineteenth century. To the contrary of a big part of the existing literature, which sets great store by the military aspects of the wars against Russia, the book focuses on the social and religious dimensions of the North-Eastern Caucasian Naqshbandī movement. Another significant innovation of its is the relocation of the regional Naqshbandiyya into a historical context which is that of the whole world of Islam, and no more that of the history of the Russian conquest as it was the case in most studies on Caucasian "Muridism". At the same time, the author is far from ignoring the properly colonial dimension of the expansion of the *tariqa* in the North-Eastern Caucasus, which is largely perceived as a reaction to the threat of the Russian military progression: she has tried to measure the impact of the Russian conquest and colonization on the regional evolution of the Naqshbandiyya — in particular in the exceptional rapidity and deepness of its Caucasian expansion as soon as the first years of the nineteenth century.

Thanks to her intimate knowledge of regional archive collections, of a rich ethnographical literature, and of a great number of (often still manuscript) primary sources in Arabic language preserved locally and still unexplored, thanks also to her solid Islamological culture, the author could break off with still dominating essentialist approaches. She could identify the respective part of the local, North Caucasian substratum and that of intellectual trends from the whole *umma* in the regional history of the Naqshbandiyya. For that, the author has distinguished two different levels in the North-Caucasian Naqshbandiyya's activity, in the very first decades of its introduction in the region: a "spiritual" level and a "political" one. Although the latter is given a special attention, several chapters of intellectual history deeply renew our whole representations. One of the recurring questions of the work consists of analyzing the way the main Islamic mystical orders, the Naqshbandiyya and to a lesser extent the Qādiriyya, have provided the structures of anti-colonial struggle in the North-Eastern Caucasus between 1829 and 1859 (under the imamates of Ghāzī Muhammad, Hamza Bek, and

Shāmil). If the author comes here to a classical approach and postulates, she invites us to make an original detour, rich of various teachings, through the regional history of Islam. Insisting on the originality of the conversion process in the North-Eastern Caucasus — a region where the Ottoman missionaries played almost no role, although they were present in neighbouring Westernmost parts of the Caucasus —, she casts light on the respective specificities and the particular nature of Chechen and Dagestanese Islam, and on their mutual relations since the last decades of the eighteenth century. Dagestan in particular emerges in the early nineteenth century as a centre of learned Islamic culture, with close links with the whole world of Islam, most particularly in the Arab Near-East. On the contrary, in the high Vainakh valleys Islam remains a popular religion, because of a lasting lack of qualified religious personnel. The author, however, does not satisfy herself with this easy dichotomy, and she evokes the decisive intellectual mediation of *qāzīs* and *‘ulamā* from Dagestan, traditionally held in high respect in Chechnia. We find here an age-old scenario: the progresses of Islam in Chechen land seem most often linked with the presence of Dagestanese preachers; conversely, Dagestanese imams of the North-Eastern Caucasus, from Ghāzī Muhammad to Shāmil, have always given a special strategic significance to Chechnia: the country's lower agricultural valleys were for long the corn lofts for the resistance to the Russian expansion, and its highlands permitted the latter to oppose Russia even after defeats in open country.

At the same time, another structural specificity of North-East Caucasian societies is the fact that Chechnia, more than Dagestan, played the role of the main centre of the *Jihād* in the nineteenth as well as in the twentieth century. Because Chechnia lacks the stable leading elites and princely families that one could then find in Dagestan — as well as in the North-Western Caucasus, where Russian colonization went on more rapidly. Thanks to the manipulation of these regional elites Russia could gain supports in local political entities. Moreover the people of Dagestan usually show more difficulty to mobilise for *Jihād*, since they are much more implied than their Vainakh neighbours in agriculture and especially in inter-regional trade. At the same time, they also can become loyal partners when allied, as during Shāmil's imamate. Conversely, if the Chechens are more militant and quicker than their neighbours to take arms against invaders, they also show more unruly (see the Chechen resistances against the implementation of the fiscal system by Shāmil in the 1840s-50s). This unruliness obliged Shāmil to send to Chechnia his *muhājirūn*, his partisans of migrant origin, who had abandoned the rural communities of Dagestan submitted to Russian authority for rallying Chechen resistance. Alien to the Chechen clan (*tayp*) system, these *muhājirūn* could serve as local vectors of the imam's authority.

Key elements of intellectual history also cast a new light on the religious structuring of the anti-colonial struggle in the North-Eastern Caucasus. The author notably assesses the regional spreading of the Khālīdī branch of the Naqshbandiyya-Mujaddidiyya. The propagation of certain ideas of Ahmad Sirhindī's, among others his theory of the *shaykh* as unique curator and interpreter of the Sharia, was to have a great

success in the North-Caucasian Khālidiyya. The author also underlines the latter's — and more generally the Mujaddidiyya's — predilection for the legalist aspect of Islam, at the expense of mystical activity. For the first time, the notion was introduced in the Northern Caucasus that every faithful, of mystical trend or not, must belong to a *tarīqa*. It is through this way that the reformed Naqshbandiyya could be dispatched throughout the North-Eastern Caucasus. At the same time, it is in the form of new ideas, rather than as an institution, that the *tarīqa* reached Chechnia in the early 1820s, and its first local branches appear one decade later. The author astutely casts light on this unknown intellectual aspect of the first spreading of the *tarīqa*, which does not appear anymore as a mechanical projection of a tribal order in an Islamic garb. The very gradual institutionalization of the Naqshbandiyya in the North-Eastern Caucasus is illustrated, for instance, by the domination of temporal leaders on imams in the first steps on the struggle against Russia, and by the fact that imams had for long to be confirmed, in Vainakh land, by the traditional institution of the council of elders. It is only during Ghāzī Muhammad's imamate, in the early 1830s, that a real reversal of values could occur. Through the unification of rural communes (*jamā'ats*) and clans under Naqshbandī authority that Ghāzī Muhammad facilitated the *tarīqa*'s routine in various community structures of the North-East Caucasian societies, and paved the way for Shāmīl's imamate. In her conclusion, the author comes back to Russia's weight in these processes, especially in the way from the 1860s onwards the colonial administration perpetuated some of the structures of Shāmīl's state — like the utilization of his *muhājir* representatives (*nāyib*) in Chechnia. In short, the work constitutes a captivating and successful attempt at the identification of the respective role of the colonial power, of the structures of the indigenous societies — Dagestanese or Chechen — and of the intellectual trends from the whole *umma* in the introduction and particular development of the reformed Naqshbandiyya in the North-Eastern Caucasus.

Also reviewed by Alexandre Papas, *JHS* 3 (2002): 363-364.

S.A.D.

### 5.3.D Western Central Asia

■ ABDULLAEV, Evgenii, "Islam i 'islamskii faktor' v sovremennom Uzbekistane [Islam and the "Islamic Factor" in Uzbekistan Today]," *TsA* 1997/6 [12]: 87-100.

In the framework of an overall perception of Islam in Soviet Uzbekistan which is borrowed from works by A. Bennigsen and Ch. Lemerrier-Quelquejay, the author introduces the Islamic "renaissance" of the years 1985-95 through the most visible signs and the most easy to quantify expressions of this renewal (like the amount of mosques constructed since the late 1980s). The main aspects of Uzbekistani Islam which have been tackled in this study are: its ethnic diversity, which correspond to that of the country; the relations between Islam and the other religions now present in Uzbekistan; and the influence of the country's geopolitical context on the religious situation. Distinguished by a rather poor documentation and unwarranted assertions that reveal a strong political conservatism, this study is characteristic of Islamic studies for apparatchiks that



developed in Central Asia since the end of the Soviet period.

Curiously enough, the redaction of the journal has chosen to publish after this paper a thundering intervention by the former mufti of Uzbekistan, Muhammad-Sodiq MUHAMMAD-YUSUF (introduced in the previous study as a client of the Islamist and as a corrupted clergyman): "Vse religii v svoei osnove soderzhat ogromnyi politicheskii potentsial [All Religions Contain in their Foundation a Great Political Potential]," interview with Oleg Panfilov, *ibid.*: 101-106. These declarations are full of lasting bitterness towards the attitude of the political parties of the alternative secular intelligentsia which appeared in Central Asia in the 1990s; these organizations are accused by the former mufti of Uzbekistan of having used cynically for their own goals the support given to them by the religious institutions and by the Party of the Islamic Renewal, especially in Tajikistan. S.A.D.

- ABDULLOEV, Sherzod, *Maorifparvarī va ozodfikrī. Afkori diniu falsafi va islohoti Ahmadi Donish* [Enlightenment and Free Thought. The Religious and Philosophical Thought, and the Reforms of Ahmad Dānish], Dushanbe: s.n., 1994, 151 p.

A philosopher in the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan, the author had published two years before a first work, of polemical content, on "Contemporary Islam in the Political and Ideological Arena" [*Islomi muosir dar arsaī siiosat va ideologiia*, Dushanbe: Irfon, 1990, 152 p.]. That work was intended for the local intelligentsia and directed against the ideologists of political Islam, led in Tajikistan since the early 1970s by the clandestine leader Mullā 'Abd-Allāh Nūrī. The author was denouncing the activity in Central Asia of the Middle-Eastern Muslim powers and defending the heritage of Central Asian Islamic reform as a current more conformable to Transoxiana's modern history, and an explicit equivalent for Central Asia to what Protestantism had been three centuries before for North-Western Europe. A disciple of the Tajik historian of ideas Rasul Hodizoda, the author repeats in the present monograph on the Bukharan reform-minded 'ālim Dānish (1826/7-1897) the latter's Euro-centred interpretation of Islamic reform in Central Asia, focused on the *Aufklärung* and influenced by both Marxism and Weberianism. S.A.D.

- AKRAMOV, I., "XIX asr oxiri va XX asr boshlarida Samarqand viloiati madrasalari [The Madrasas of the District of Samarqand in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries]," *UIF* 1994/3-4: 54-58.

On the basis of archive documents of the Czarist period and other Russian primary sources, the author analyses the policy of the Russian authorities towards Islamic communal institutions of the Samarqand region (annexed from the Emirate of Bukhara in 1873), in particular towards the *madrasas* deprived of their *waqfs* located in Bukharan land. (The case of the Khwāja Ahrār *Madrasa* in Samarqand, which was deprived as soon as in 1869 of the right to perceive the resources of its *waqfs* located in Qarshi, set a precedent for the colonial administration of the Turkestan Territory.) As was noticed later by early twentieth-century Russian observers, these prohibitions did not prevent



the foundation of multiple new *madrasas* in Russian Turkestan, especially in the city and region of Samarqand in the years 1905-15. The author concludes his overview with a description of the teaching programme of the *madrasas* of Turkestan during this period – without great attention, however, to the main characteristics of these programmes' renewal in Central Asia (with a growing room given to *tafsīr*, the full rehabilitation of *kalām* and related disciplines). The paper is concluded with an important paragraph on the important and particular place of ethic teaching in Central Asian madrasas, through classical works of didactical poetry in Turkic and Persian languages. S.A.D.

- ALGAR, Hamid, "Sayf al-Dīn Bākhārī," *El*<sup>2</sup> 9, 1995: 110-111, bibliography.

The biographical notice on this Bukharan disciple of Najm al-Dīn Kubrā insists on his role in the progression of Islam among the Mongols, and in the spreading of his own branch of the *Kubrāwīyya* towards the South and South-East of Iran. These considerations are followed by a description of the vicissitudes of the *khānaqāh* in Fathābād, between the turmoil which followed the founding saint's death in 659/1261 and the gradual transformation of the site into a simple pilgrimage place along with the escheat of the *Kubrāwīyya* in Transoxiana, and the slow degradation of the sanctuary up till its abandonment in the nineteenth century. The paper ends with an evocation of the brotherhood's more favourable destiny in India, and of Bākhārī's spiritual legacy.

S.A.D.

- ATABAKI, Touraj, "The Voyage of Ahmad Danesh to St. Petersburg," in Marc Vandamme, ed., *De Turcicis Aliisque Rebus commentarii Henry Hofman dedicati*, Utrecht: M.T. Houtsma Stichting, 1992 (Utrecht Turcological Series: 3): 189-194.

After a first reading of the *Nawādir al-waqāyī* by the reform-minded Bukharan 'ālim Dānīsh (1826/7-1897) [published in Cyrillic script in Dushanbe, 2 vols., Irfon, 1988-1989], the author proposes some reflections on Dānīsh's "privileged relations" with Russia and on the emergence of "realism" in his work, in a "rupture" with Bukhara's literary tradition. Such considerations have already been produced by numerous Soviet scholars, since E.E. Bertel's ("Rukopisi proizvedenii Akhmada Kalla [The Manuscripts of Ahmad Kalla's Works]," *Trudy tadzhikskoi bazy Akademii nauk SSSR* 3 (1936): 9-28) to Rasul Hodizoda (*Ahmadi Donish. Tarjimai hol va merosi adabiiu ilmi* [Ahmad Dānīsh. His Biography and His Literary and Scientific Legacy], Dushanbe: Irfon, 1976). They have also been repeated by the rare Western researchers who have shown interested in this prominent figure of Islamic reform in Central Asia (e.g., Gianroberto Scarcia, "Note su alcuni motivi della cultura tagica e su Ahmad Danish," *Annali dell'Istituto Universitario Orientale di Napoli* 11 (1961): 63-103). Dānīsh's work has indeed been written for the most part after the establishing of Russian domination on Central Asia, and after its author's first diplomatic mission to St. Petersburg. Yet this work partakes of a rich Bukharan substratum and of multiple influences from the outer world of Islam, both very underestimated by modern historians. Now that Dānīsh's texts and those of the Bukharan intellectual renewal of the second half of the nineteenth cen-

tury are more accessible than during the Soviet period, one should not satisfy oneself anymore, about a figure as significant as Dānish, of an outdated apologetic discourse on Russia's civilizing mission in Central Asia.

See also, by the same author: "A Study in the History of Bukharan Modernism: The Journey of Aḥmad Dānish to St. Petersburg," in Ingeborg Baldauf & Michael Friederich, eds., *Bamberger Zentralasienstudien: Konferenzakten ESCAS IV, Bamberg 8.-12. Oktober 1991*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1994 (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 181), 263-269. In this paper, based on the same information and viewpoint as in the previous one, the author gives a curiously Iran-centred vision of early modern Transoxiana, which is introduced as a "Persian-speaking island" condemned to isolation since its ideological break-off with Shiite Iran in the sixteenth century. This general view does not take into account the links between Transoxiana with the Sunni world, in particular with the Persian-writing Indian subcontinent — to whom nineteenth-century Bukharan thinkers owe a great deal of their intellectual innovations —, to the Ottoman world — where the Tanzimat were another source of inspiration for Central Asian reformers —, and with the Arabic Near-East — where the reformed teachings of al-Azhar had a powerful impact on Muslim students from the Russian Empire. In short, the author gives us a teleological vision of Bukhara's early modern cultural history, based on twentieth-century Hegelian ideologies of nation-building.

S.A.D.

■ [BABADJANOV, Bakhtiyar] BABADŽANOV, Baxtiyor, "On the History of the Naqšbandiyya Muğaddidiya in Central Mawara'n-nahr in the Late 18th and Early 19th Centuries," in Michael Kemper, Anke von Kügelgen & Dmitriy Yermakov, eds., *Muslim Culture in Russia and Central Asia from the 18th to the Early 20th Centuries*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1996 (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 200): 385-414.

A major paper and a landmark in the modern historiography of the Naqshbandiyya in Central Asia, this study is based on a very careful reading of manuscripts preserved in the Biruni Institute of Tashkent which had almost never been even consulted, and which are introduced in detail by the author. The paper then focuses on the main figures of this mystical order and devotes a biography to each of them (in particular to the following *shaykhs*, on whom researchers were expecting for long some information: Khalifa Niyāz-Qulī, Miyān Fazl Ahmad, Khalifa Muhammad Husayn, etc.). The two last parts of the paper tackle two special historical points, *viz.* the question of the Naqshbandīs' political engagement and that of the rituals implemented by them.

T.Z.

■ [BABADJANOV] BABAJANOV, Bakhtiyar, "Le renouveau des communautés soufies en Ouzbékistan," *CAC* 5-6 (1998): 285-312.

The title of this paper must not mislead us: Sufism as it is analyzed here by the author is limited to some isolated individuals described as Yasawīs, and to one branch — however important — of the Naqshbandiyya-Khāfiyya in Uzbekistan. One should not con-

clude that there are no others. As a matter of fact the paper says nothing of another notable branch of the Uzbek Naqshbandiyya-Jahriyya established in Andijan. A historian of seventeenth and eighteenth-century Naqshbandiyya, the author is interested above all in this contemporary brotherhood's genealogy and in its mystical practices (*dhikr*). On this topic, he provides interesting information and sketches useful comparisons with the history of Naqshbandiyya in previous centuries. However the contemporary Naqshbandiyya is not studied in its present context and, when it is, the author's analyses become imprecise and his assertions discussable. This disappointing paper has been written too rapidly and without a deep knowledge of the subject. Original Russian version: "Vozrozhdenie deiatel'nosti sufiiskikh grupp v Uzbekistane [The Renewal of the Activity of Sufi Groups in Uzbekistan]," *TsAiK* 1999/1 [2]: 181-192. T.Z.

- BALCI, Bayram, "Hoca Ahmet Yesevi: le mausolée et l'université," *CEMOTI* 27 (1999): 313-328.

On the basis of some fifty interviews in Kazakhstan and Turkey, the author analyses the role of the Turkish-Kazakh Ahmet-Yesevi University of the city of Turkestan in the recent evolution of relations between Turkey and the Central Asian Turkic-speaking states. The author has well assessed the misunderstanding which long prevailed in these exchanges: whence the Ankara government considers this university as an institution common to the whole Turkic world, the Astana authorities, which are the real initiators of the project, perceive it as a purely Kazakh institution. This clear and pedagogical paper, enriched with a good bibliographical covering, properly relocates the contradictory logics of the current takeover of Yasawī's figure in the specific political context of the aftermath of the Cold War. S.A.D.

- BERDYEYEV, Mukhamedgel'dy, "Ocherki po islamskoi kul'ture Turkmenistana [Studies on the Islamic Culture of Turkmenistan]," *TsA* 1997/6 [12]: 80-86.

The author of an important monograph on the traditional diet among Turkmens (*Traditsionnaia sistema pitaniia u turkmen*, Ashgabat: Ylym, 1992), M.B. studies here the ritual of funerary banquets as a vector of influence of the "Iranian" sedentary, even urban culture of Transoxiana on the Turkmen culture. He notes, several times during the twentieth century, attempts by mullahs at a "re-Islamization" of these rituals, through a suppression of sacrifices of animals which used to go with them. The author insists however on the fact that the mullahs' very arguments (such as the ritual impurity of blood in the deceased's house) are themselves borrowed from an ancient Zoroastrian fund, which used to be spread throughout Central Asia, till the 1920s, by the students of the big *madrasas* of Transoxiana. (On the presence of these elements of Zoroastrianism in Turkic milieus up till the remote Volga Tatars, see B. Kh. KARMY-SHEVA, "Arkhaicheskaiia simbolika v pogrebal'no-pominal'noi obriadnosti uzbekov Fergany [The Archaic Symbolic in the Funerary and Mourning Rituals of the Ferghana Uzbeks]," in *Drevnie obriady, verovaniia i kul'ty narodov Srednei Azii* [Ancient Rituals, Beliefs and Cults of Middle Asian Peoples], Moscow: Nauka, 1986, p. 172).

This study is followed by more general considerations of Iranian food borrowings, such as sugar and bread, with their respective symbolic functions, in various ensembles of rituals and customs — the sanctification of bread in particular, in a context of steppe Islam. The paper is concluded by the comment of an inquiry carried out in 1989 throughout Central Asia on the level of practice of the dowry's (*kalym*) payment, as a revelation of the vitality of "everyday" (*bytovoi*) Islam in this region of the world; as a result of this inquiry, the dowry's payment appears highly in praise in the north and eastern parts of Turkmenistan, which comes at the third position, for this practice, behind Tajikistan and Uzbekistan. Alas, despite the Turkmenistan's independence in 1991 and the opening of the boundary between this country and Iran, no comparative work has yet been performed in the south of the Atrek River. Besides, the author does not show any interest in works published on the Turkmens of Iran — a telling example of the political limitations which continue to hamper ethnographic studies in the former USSR.

S.A.D.

■ DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., "Qu'est-ce que la *qadîmiya*? Éléments de sociologie du traditionalisme musulman, en Islam de Russie et en Transoxiane (au tournant des XIX<sup>e</sup> et XX<sup>e</sup> siècles)," in Stéphane A. Dudoignon, Dämîr Is'haqov & Rāfyq Möhämätshin, eds., *L'Islam de Russie. Conscience communautaire et autonomie politique chez les Tatars de la Volga et de l'Oural, depuis le XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècle*. Actes du colloque international de Qazan, 29 avril – 1<sup>er</sup> juin 1996, Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose, 1997: 207-225.

This paper concludes one of the first attempts made at a sociological approach of the traditionalist trend of Islam in Russia, called *Qadîmiyya*, as opposed to the better studied *jadîd* reformist current. The author shows that the cleavage between the two, initially "devoid of a precise ideological character," was accentuated around 1910. The eventual conflict between them divided up the Muslim communities of the Russian Empire on the interpretation to be given to the functions and finalities of their religious and public institutions. The author has followed this conflict through the regional press in Tatar language (with a special attention for the journal *Dîn wa Ma'îshat* of Orenburg); on this press, he notes that it had a "not inconsiderable effect of simplification and amplification" of this conflict. The author concludes that historians of early modern Islam in Russia should "go beyond the terms of the ideological debates between *jadîdî* and the *qadîmî* trends" and not satisfy themselves with the sole description of the ideas they were advocating.

T.Z.

□ FATHI, Habiba, "Le pouvoir des 'otin', institutrices coraniques, dans l'Ouzbékistan indépendant," *CAC* 5-6 (1998): 313-333.

The author's goal is to show that women play a role as decisive as men in the religious life of Central Asia. The paper offers interesting notations on "female" Islam in contemporary Uzbekistan — for instance when the author evokes the *social* as well as religious education of young girls and women by the *otins* (p. 319), when she underlines the close links between the *otin* and the *mahalla* to which she belongs, or the key role

of the *otins* and of the education they provide in matrimonial strategies (p. 324), last when the author tackles the recent appearance of "young Islamist women" under the influence of neo-fundamentalism as rivals of traditional *otins* at the scale of the local neighborhoods (p. 326).

See also, by the same author: "Les *otines*, sermonnaires inconnues de l'islam centrasiatique," *ReMMM* 85-86 (1999):185-202 — in which H.F. repeats the postulates of her previous study on the current replacement on traditional Uzbekistani *otins* by young women of a new social profile, who claim themselves of a Salafi background.

S.A.D.

- [GHOIBOV, Muhammad] GHĀYIBUḤF, Muhammad, *Az ta'rikh-i rawshangarī-yi Tājikistān wa Afghānistān* [Elements of the History of Enlightenment in Tajikistan and Afghanistan], Dushanbe: 'Irfān, 1991, 208 p.

Printed for export towards Afghanistan, this work written during Perestroika is a kind of textbook in the history of reform movements in Persian-speaking Sunni Islam at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, through the works of thinkers like Dānish, Afghānī, Mahmūd Tarzī, etc. Unfortunately based not on primary sources, but on late comments influenced by dialectical materialism (in particular by the works of the Tajikistani historian Z.I. Radzhabov — see his *O politicheskome traktate Akhmada Donisha (Kratkii ocherk)*, Dushanbe: Donish, 1977, and his *Aktual'nye voprosy gumanitarnykh nauk na sovremennom etape: filosofii, istorii, pravo*, Dushanbe: Donish, 1987), this book does not bring new elements on the set of questions linked with these movements. It is interesting thanks to its attempt at putting in perspective the Transoxianian and Afghan reformist trends.

S.A.D.

- HETMANEK, Allen, "Islamic Revolution and Jihad Come to the Former Soviet Central Asia: The Case of Tajikistan," *CAS* 12/3 (1993): 365-378.

This important paper casts light on some specificities of political Islam as it developed in Tajikistan from the summer 1990 onwards. The author notably insists on the weakness of its links with neighboring Muslim countries, on the relative ancient character of this movement — that the author dates back to the mid-1970s —, on the existence of a local form of Wahhabism, opposed to the neo-Zoroastrianism developed by the academy intelligentsia of Dushanbe during the last years of the Soviet period, and on a political strategy which was based for long on a common acceptance of the political institutions inherited from Perestroika. It is this very last specificity which has brought Tajikistani Islamists to break off with the pan-Soviet Party of the Islamic Renewal (created in Astrakhan in August 1990) and to ally themselves with the political organizations of the Tajikistani urban intelligentsia — before a political and ideological radicalization after the beginning of the civil war in the summer 1992.

S.A.D.

- IBRAHIM, Diloram, *The Islamization of Central Asia: A Case Study of Uzbekistan*, Leicester: Islamic Foundation, 1993, 32 p., bibliography.

This curious work, of a mainly apologetic character, summarizes the "Islamization" of Central Asia as the Arab conquest of a territory corresponding to present-day Uzbekistan, with no great consideration for the history of Islam in Central Asia after this initial event and outside this area. After a 1,400 year chronological gap, the book-let ends with ethic considerations on the role played by atheism in the alleged "moral decay" of the late Soviet Central Asian societies. S.A.D.

■ IUSUPOV, Erkin, ed., *Shaikh Nazhmiddin Kubro: maqolalar* [Shaykh Najm al-Dīn Kubrā: Papers], Tashkent: Iozuvchi, 1995, 80 p.

This small collection of papers devoted to the Khorezmian Sufi Najm al-Dīn Kubrā (d. 1221 CE) will be useful to scholars both as a document on the "rehabilitation" of medieval Central Asian religious figures in independent Uzbekistan, and a source for materials on the life and legacy of Najm al-Dīn Kubrā. The work is intended for a broad audience, and has neither footnotes nor references to scholarship on Kubrā and the Kubrawiyya outside of Uzbekistan. Among the most notable articles are Erkin IUSUPOV's "Najm al-Dīn Kubrā's Legacy and Some Thoughts of the Sufi *Tarīqa*," Orif USMONOV's "On Shaykh Najm al-Dīn Kubrā and the Kubrawiyya *Tarīqa*," Aziz QAIUMOV's "On another Manuscript of a Tale about Najm al-Dīn Kubrā." A.J.F.

■ [JALILOV] ZHALILOV, Omonbek Husainbek Ughli, "Khiva madrasalari va ularning iqtisodiy ta'minoti haqidagi huzhzhalar [The Madrasas of Khiva and the Documents on Their Economic Resources]," *Sharqshunoslik* 8 (1997): 122-133, 1 tab.

This paper introduces the first results of a systematic study of two document collections in the Central State Archive of the Republic of Uzbekistan: the historical fund No. 125 (the collections on the "Administration of the khans of Khiva" and the "Archive of the khans of Khiva") and the fund No. 323 which includes a collection of *waqf-nāmas* of the *madrasas* of Khiva. The author offers us a certain amount of data on the number of the city's active *madrasas* in the second half of the nineteenth century, as well as on the economic resources and nominal identity of the holders of varied charges and students of varied levels in each of the *madrasas* documented by these two document collections. A table recapitulates, for each identified *madrasa*, the founder's name, the date of the foundation, the number of cells, the amount of *tanābs* of agricultural land owned by the *madrasa's waqfs*, and the present state of the (whether preserved or destroyed) building. S.A.D.

■ KERIMOV, Gasyim M., "Islamskie evoliutsionnye protsessy v Sovetskoi Tsentral'noi Azii [Islamic Evolution Processes in Soviet Central Asia]," in Ingeborg Baldauf & Michael Friederich, eds., *Bamberger Zentralasienstudien: Konferenzakten ESCAS IV: Bamberg 8.-12. Oktober 1991*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 185), 1994: 279-290.

The perfectly incomprehensible title of this paper does not hide a series of considerations too general to be well-informed on the "re-Islamization" process in Soviet Central

Asia. The author enumerates administrative measures taken in Moscow towards the "Muslim" populations of the USSR. S.A.D.

□ KHALID, Adeeb, *The Politics of Muslim Cultural Reform: Jadidism in Central Asia*, Berkeley – Los Angeles – London: University of California Press, 1998, xxiv-335 p., 2 maps, 8 tabs., bibliography, index.

The dissertation presented by the author in 1994 has been published without significant modifications. To this date, it makes of the most significant contribution in a series of studies which developed in the USSR and in the West since the mid-1970s about the definition and history of early twentieth-century "Jadidism" (Islamic reform) in Central Asia. Beside a special attention to the rapid evolution of collective identities, and to the appearance of boundaries inside Central Asian Muslim communities, the author's most interesting innovation is his discussion of the concept of "cultural capital" formulated by Pierre Bourdieu. Particularly interested in the evolution of cultural practices during the colonial period, the author underlines the role played by printed text in Central Asia (which is limited here to Russian Turkestan) from the late nineteenth century onwards, and its influence on the appearance of a new conception of "genuine" Islam. The latter is defined by reformist authors not any more as the retrospective submission of learned men to a chain of intellectual authorities, but as their personal mastership of a limited corpus of Islamic sacred texts, now available in a printed form (on this aspect of the cleavage between classical literati and modern intellectuals, see also the pioneering works by Edward J. Lazzerini). According to the author, the cultural capital transmitted in traditional *madrasas* encouraged the 'ulamā to limit the field of public debates to questions concerning culture, wrapped up in the 'ulamā's prestige as defenders of religious authority.

The question remains to be asked of the audience of these new ideas, and of the Jadids' influence among their contemporaries. If the discussion which used to oppose *jadidī* and *qadīmī* authors in the early twentieth-century Central Asia remained wrapped up in a theological apparatus inherited from Transoxiana's prestigious Islamic past, these polemics were most often coined by the primacy of rather traditional social and economic preoccupations (such as the quest for genealogy and protection, or the control of communal properties: the polemics on the administration of *waqfs* is totally underestimated in the history of Jadidism as it has been written during the past thirty years). These preoccupations are expressed back and forth, for example, in readers' letters sent by rural mullahs to the journals like the *Dīn wa ma'āshat* in Orenburg and *al-Islāh* in Tashkent, which used to serve as open tribunes for Muslim religious people in Russia as well as in Central Asia. They also appear clearly in the abundant manuscript literature of memoirs which developed in the former religious circles of Turkestan and the protectorates during the very first years of the Soviet period. Both sources have been neglected by the author, who has chosen to deal exclusively with printed texts emanating from a young modern Muslim intelligentsia, the sort of people one can associate with, with no interest in the discourse of more conservative peoples, who appear in



this thesis, as in the Soviet historiography of Jadidism, in the negative.

More detailed reviews by: Nicholas B. Breyfogle, *RR* 59/1 (2000): 138-140; H.T. Norris, *BSOAS* 63/3 (2000): 441-442; Michael Rouland, *CAM* 2000/1: 24-26.

S.A.D.

- KUDRIAVTSEV, A. V., NIYAZI [NIYAZI], A. Sh., "Politicheskii islam, nachalo 90-kh [Political Islam, the Early 1990s]," in V.V. Naumkin, ed., *Sovremennyi islam: kul'tura i politika* [Contemporary Islam: Culture and Politics], Moscow: Institut vostokovedeniia RAN, 1994 (Rossiiskii tsentr strategicheskikh i mezhdunarodnykh issledovani): 95-128.

After a synthetic preamble on post-Soviet Islam, this paper tackles with more detail and precision the history of "parallel" Islam in Tajikistan, from the late 1980s to the first steps of the civil war. A. Niyazi shows particularly interested in the rapid politicization of non-official Tajikistani Islam, after the first congress of the Party of the Islamic Renewal in Astrakhan in June 1990. He analyses the regional establishment of the PIR's Tajik branch (in the higher Gharm Valley), then its rapprochement with the *qāziyyat* of Tajikistan in Dushanbe (a unique example, in the former USSR, of an alliance between "official" and informal Islam), then the party's growing radicalization up till the creation, in 1993, of the "Movement of the Islamic Resistance" based in Afghanistan and led by Sayyid 'Abd-Allāh Nūrī, a historical figure of unofficial Islam in Tajikistan.

S.A.D.

- MALLITSKII, N. G., *Toshkent mahalla va mavzelari* [The Mahalla and Mausoleums of Tashkent], Tashkent: Ghafur Ghulom nomidagi Adabiyot va San'at nashriyoti, 1996, 22 p.

This booklet is the translation into Uzbek of a study by Nikolai Gur'evich Mallitskii (1873-1947) published in 1927 on the historical geography of the city of Tashkent at the beginning of the 20th century. From a wider historical perspective, this study, which contains helpful lists of the names of *mahallas* and their mausoleums, is an essential step in the knowledge (see Iu. Sokolov, F. Tursunov) of the general and holy history of the largest city of Central Asia.

A.P.

- MIRBABAIEV, Abdullodzhon [MIRBOBOEV / MIRBOBO, Abdullojon], *Istoriia madrasa Tadjikistana* [History of the Madrasas of Tajikistan], 2 vols., Dushanbe: Meros, 1994, 125+72 p., bibliographies, figs. and ill.

After a general introduction on the place and role of *madrasas* in the medieval and pre-modern Central Asian cities, the author introduces series of richly documented historical notices on the still in place or disappeared *madrasas* of present-day northern Tajikistan (in Khujand, Ura-Teppe and Penjikent, Kanibadam and Isfara, plus a captivating chapter on rural institutions). These descriptions are followed by a systematic study of the architectural specificities of their buildings, notations on the social composition of their personnel and on their economic functioning until the beginning of the Soviet period. The second volume deals with Tajikistan's central and southern regions: Hissar Valley, Qarategin Valley, the city of Kulab and its neighborhoods.



Despite lamentable technical conditions of its printing, which were those of Tajikistan during the civil war, the present work distinguishes itself by the author's extensive use of primary sources and of the modern scientific bibliography. Moreover, the author has devoted captivating chapters not only to the architecture of these often disappeared buildings, but also the history of the personnel of these institutions, to the latter's frequentation until the beginning of the Soviet period, and to their economic functioning, not forgetting original considerations on the role of the *madrasas* of the emirate of Bukhara in the tormented social and political history of this region in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. S.A.D.

- MUKHAMEDKHODZHAEV, A., *Ideologiia nakshbandizma* [The Ideology of "Naqshbandism"], Dushanbe: Donish, 1991, 232 p.

Since Naqshbandiyya has stopped appearing as the hideout of fanatic reactionaries that was denounced by the Soviet propaganda, studies on this mystical order have rapidly developed in Central Asia. One of the first examples of this current boom has been offered to us by this study by an academic specialist of Islam, whose father was a local Naqshbandī *murīd*. The author introduces to his now numerous students some landmarks on Bahā al-Dīn Naqshband, on his teaching, on the spreading of the Naqshbandiyya, on the conceptions of its main figures until the fifteenth century CE, with a special interest in Khwāja 'Ubayd-Allāh Ahrār. S.A.D.

- NIYAZI, A. [NIYOZI, Aziz], "Islam in Tajikistan: Tradition and Modernity," *Religion, State & Society*, 26/1 (1998): 39-50.

This brief survey, remarkably enough, does not follow current trends to track down 'the Islamic threat,' instead of that drawing almost an opposite picture of a continuous local Islamic tradition, which hardly would allow radical Islamic movements to get a firm footing in Tajikistan. This look at continuities reveals noteworthy phenomena. Not least because of the influence of 'Naqshbandiyya Islam' mediating between dogmatic prescriptions and pre-Islamic beliefs and customs, the author detects that "in Soviet Tajikistan the 'struggle against the survival of religion' did not inflict serious damage on the Islamic tradition" (p. 42). Religious practice and instruction continued on an unofficial level, "the activity of Central Asian atheists in many ways recalled that of puritanical foreign Muslims," and "'learned' Islam was preserved by the local intelligentsia, particularly those in the humanities." The revival and official readmission of Islam in the late 1980s resulted basically in two tendencies: "moderate traditionalist (chiefly apolitical) and radical neo-traditionalist (chiefly politicized)." The latter variant "was first and foremost the response of a traditional society to the rapid process of industrialization which was devastating" (p. 44 ff.). The next step, "the radicalization of the Islamic opposition on the eve of civil war took place mainly as a result of the clumsy actions of the authorities in Dushanbe." Despite this development and subsequent armed struggle (also supported by foreign radical Islamist organizations), Niyazi can point to numerous, more or less convincing evidences which illustrate that the polit-

ical views hold within Tajik Islamic opposition circles were and are in their vast majority far from representing anything that could be called 'fundamentalist' in a usual sense (particularly for the question of 'political Islam' see also a further developed version of this article by the same author: "Vozrozhdenie islama v Tadjikistane: traditsiia i politika" [The Renewal of Islam in Tajikistan: Tradition and Politics], *TsAiK* 1999/5 [6]: 153-164.). R.E.

■ POLONSKAIA, Ludmila, MALASHENKO, Alexei, *Islam in Central Asia*, Reading: Ithaca Press, 1994, 171 p.

This book contains re-using of Soviet and Western publications, mainly in English, on medieval Islam, Islamic reform and the destiny of Islam during the Soviet period, until the renewal of the 1980s. S.A.D.

■ PRIVRATSKY, Bruce, "Turkistan: Muslim Landscapes and Kazak Identity," *JCAS* 2/1 (1997): 46-61.

In the best lineage of works by Devin DeWeese and by Robert D. McChesney, this innovative and appealing paper has been written by one of the best specialists of contemporary Islam among the Kazakhs. On the basis of a study of the religious practices and discourses around Ahmad Yasawī's mausoleum in the city of Turkestan, the author questions the stereotype of the Kazakhs as a superficially Islamized people, in whose culture a limited and peripheral place would be devoted to religion. The analysis of the level of local knowledge of Yasawī's tradition, on the first hand, and on the other hand a reflection on the relevance of various signs of "Muslimness" (*musulmanshiliq*) as cultural markers of Kazakh identity drive the author to an overall conclusion on the decisive role of landscapes marked out by Islamic sanctuaries in the shaping of the current notions of national community in Kazakhstan. S.A.D.

■ REISSNER, Johannes, "Islam und Entwicklung in russisch Turkestan. Der Sicht deutscher Reisender und Forscher des 19. Jahrhunderts," *SI* 23/2 (1994): 259-275.

Considering the Hungarian Arminius Vámbéry and the Swiss Henri Moser as German travelers considerably contributed to enriching the material of this paper. The latter's works on Central Asia, like those by German scholars and travelers at Russia's service in the nineteenth century focus on Islam's role in Central Asian societies. Matching up their information, with works by Russian specialists who used to show very curious of ethnographic specificity, these accounts give a large room to differences observed in the implementation of religious rituals, from the north to the south of this vast region. They commonly insist on the existence of a largely imagined cleavage between a "natural" religion peculiar to the steppe peoples (considered by the Russian authorities as a target for Orthodox Christian missionary activity) and Islamic "fanaticism" in the oasis-cities of Transoxiana. English version: "Islam and Development in Central Asia," *The Iranian Journal of International Affairs* (1994). S.A.D.

□ ROY, Olivier, "L'Asie Centrale," in Alexandre Popovic & Gilles Veinstein, eds., *Les Voies d'Allah. Les ordres mystiques dans l'islam des origines à aujourd'hui*, Paris: Fayard, 1996: 296-299.

This paper focuses on the phenomenon of Ishanism as it is expressed in contemporary Transoxiana (mainly Uzbekistan and Tajikistan). The author's main hypothesis consists of the present state of dispersion of brotherhoods, which would not depend on a centre (p. 297), and the strength of family tradition in an individual's adhesion to a brotherhood (p. 297). R.

● RUSHDI, Muhammad Siddiq, *Avliolar Sultoni. Turonlik Valiilar* [The Master of Saints. The Turanian Saints], Tashkent: Kamalak, 1995, 170 p.

Under this title, Ikromiddin Ostonaqul Ughli Oqqurghonii publishes and adapts in modern Uzbek two hagiographies: the *Risāla-yi Qādiriyya* and partly the *Tadhkirat al-awliyā-yi turkī*, written by a Sufi scholar native of Yarkand and called Rushdī (d. 1815). The first one is focused on Sayyid Muhī al-Dīn 'Abd al-Qādir Gīlānī and the second evokes no less than 88 saints. Actually those two hagiographies compile the classic biographical collections (*Nafahāt al-uns*, *Nesā'im al-mahabbat*, *Rashahāt*, etc.). However odd it may seem, the most interesting text is a short *Risāla*, non-announced, which relates the life of Ziyā' al-Dīn Hazinī (1867-1923), an 'ālim from the Ferghana Valley initiated to Sufism who has participated in the uprising of Dūkchī Īshān in 1898.

A.P.

■ RYSMAGANBETOVA, G. D., "Sufiiskie motivy v kazakhskoi literature: Shakarim Kudaiberdiev (1858-1931) [Sufi Themes in Kazakh Literature: Shakarim Khudayberdiyev (1858-1931)]," *Vostok* 1999/1: 47-58.

This late rehabilitation of a Kazakh literati from Semirech'e suffers from all the shortcomings of this kind of studies, which was developed by the philologists of the former USSR since Perestroika: a total lack of Islamic culture, in particular of knowledge on Sufism, a limited familiarity with the corpus of analyzed texts, and more generally with Kazakh modern oral creation and literature. In a very general comment, the author contents herself with introducing the ethics praised by Khudayberdiyev as a kind of universal wisdom — a new age interpretation of its kind, with which suggests that everything remains to be done in the field of the modern and contemporary history of Islam in the Kazakh society. S.A.D.

■ SHAHRANI, Nazif, "Local Knowledge of Islam and Social Discourse in Afghanistan and Turkistan in the Modern Period," in Robert L. Canfield, ed., *Turko-Persia in Historical Perspective*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991 (School of American Research Advanced Seminar Series): 161-188.

Often neglected, religious literature for edification is astutely rehabilitated by the author, who proposes a revision of the studies on popular Islam, too centered on behavioral aspects instead of on the practices of poorly educated or illiterate masses. The analysis

assesses the "local" knowledge of Islam as it is transmitted by mullahs of story tellers on the basis of texts in vernacular languages (Turkic languages, Persian, Pashto, etc.). Beside compilations of a catechism genre (*Islamic guide books*), the literature is dominated by edifying texts: biographies, hagiographies, *divans* of Sufi poets, heroic tales, or novels imbued with an Islamic ethics which is also transmitted orally through proverbs, tales, and stories. Basic texts (*Panj ganj*: "Five Treasures," *Kulliyāt*) used by mullahs as textbooks in the *maktab* are largely diffused, even by radio cassettes, which make them accessible to illiterate people. Like popular singers, the panegyrist of the Prophet (*na't khwāns*) enjoy a large success. The impact of this Islamic teaching on the masses is significant, with echoes on the socio-political level. Its influence used to determine in part the behavior of Muslims under Soviet or Chinese domination (the author was writing in the mid-1980s). J.C.

- SHORISH, M. Mobin, "Traditional Islamic Education in Central Asia Prior to 1917," in Ch. Lemerrier-Quelquejay, G. Veinstein, S.E. Wimbush, eds., *Passé turco-tatar, présent soviétique. Etudes offertes à Alexandre Bennigsen*, Paris: EHESS – Louvain: Peeters, 1986: 317-343.

Basing his study notably on the writings by the Tajik memorialist from Bukhara, Sadr al-Dīn 'Aynī, the author proposes a detailed description of the traditional education system in Russian Turkestan. He casts light on this system's Qur'anic aspirations, and on the reformist currents which shook off its foundations at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The author describes the schools "for calling" that *qārī-khānas* and *dalā'il-khānas* used to be — the first ones were devoted to blind youngsters who could learn the Qur'an by heart, the second ones were educating the *qassā* specializing in prayers in Arabic language, in the Hadith, and in the prophets' and the local saints' life. The most part of the paper focuses on the functioning of *maktabs* and *madrasas*, the organization of studies, the curriculum, the students' and teachers' life. This study provides a useful complement to a general picture which is too often only sketched.

C.P.

- [SŪFĪ ALLĀH-YĀR] SŪFĪ OLLOIOR, *Sabot ul-Ozhizin* [The Vigour of the Weak], eds. Hozhi Polatqori Muhammad Ali, Mahmud Hasanii Mirsolih Qosim, Tashkent: Mehnat Nashrioti, 1991, 94+114 p.

Despite the lack of a bibliography, this work provides a very useful facsimile edition of a major didactic treatise by Sūfī Allāh-Yār (d. 1733), the great eighteenth-century Samarqandi Sufi master. The editors recall his large influence, and substantiate that claim by printing two added texts: a commentary of the *Thabāt al-'ājizīn* entitled *Hidāyat al-tālibīn* which was printed in Pakistan, composed by a *murīd* of Sūfī Allāh-Yār's called Shaykh Habīb-Allāh; and a *muqaddima* of this commentary by Mūsā Afandī, preserved in Saudi Arabia. Other study should be done to estimate Sūfī Allāh-Yār's influence, from the use of his treatises in Central Asian *madrasas* during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries up to the regular readings by contemporary *otins*. A.P.

■ TABYSHALIEVA, Anara, "Vzgliad na religioznuu situatsiiu v Kyrgyzstane [A Look at the Religious Situation in Kyrgyzstan]," *TsA* 1997/6 [12]: 67-72.

This paper offers us a short analysis of the way religious change in Kyrgyzstan since independence is expressed in three distinct and mutually different regions of the country: 1) Bishkek and the Chu Valley, with a Christian Orthodox population in a situation of majority or equivalent to the Muslim population; 2) North-Eastern regions, with an overwhelming Kyrgyz majority and its Islam deeply influenced by Shamanism, which makes it the main target of protestant missions established in neighboring Kazakhstan; 3) last the regions of Osh and Jalalabad in the south, with very few non-Muslims, a very strong religious activism and the presence of Kyrgyzstan's main Islamic sanctuaries and holy places — for which reasons these regions have become the favourite field for Muslim preachers coming from the Near- and Middle-East. Despite a rather superficial fieldwork and a quite light historical and Islamic culture, the author has well noted significant current phenomena like the preoccupation of political leaders in front of the multiplication of inter-communal conflicts between Kyrgyz people converted to Christianity and those who remain faithful to Islam, notably on the occasion of funerals of new Christians; or like the alliance of the Muslim and Orthodox Christian clergies in front of Protestant churches proselytism; or still the conversions of women of urban background to Protestantism or to Baha'ism, in front of what they perceive as the danger of a return to pre-Soviet norms of inter-sexual relations.

In the same issue of the journal of Luleå, one can also read: SITNIANSKII, Georgii, "Krest ili polumesiats: Kirgiziia pered vyborom very [The Cross or the Crescent? Kyrgyzia Facing the Choice of Its Religion]," *ibid.* : 73-79, although this paper is based on an essentially polemic intention. Defending the cause of protestant missionaries, the author gives a deliberately approximate estimation of the progression of protestant churches and new religions in the population of various regions of the country, making no difference between the Orthodox Christian and Muslim populations in order to strengthen the overall impression of a spectacular advance of conversions. However one can notice, among given figures, a very weak proportion of Kyrgyz people (never more than one tenth) among the catechumens of these varied churches. To be used with precautions.

S.A.D.

■ TROFIMOV, Iakov, "Sovremennaia religioznaia situatsiia v Respublike Kazakhstan [The Present Religious Situation in the Republic of Kazakhstan]," *TsA* 1997/6 [12]: 60-66.

A specialist of Christian proselytism in Kazakhstan, the author gives us a brief panoramic survey of the activity of the main representative institutions of Kazakh Islam since 1990, as well as of various holy places and Sufi orders (which appear as the vectors of Uzbek brotherhoods in southern Kyrgyzstan). This overview is followed by a short description of the main communal institutions of various Christian communities (Armenian, Russian Orthodox, Catholic, Protestant) in relation with recent migration movements inside each of these communities. The paper is concluded with information on the recent advance of Hinduism (Krishnaism) and new religions in Kazakhstan.

S.A.D.

- TYSON, David, "Shrine Pilgrimage in Turkmenistan as a Means to Understand Islam among the Turkmens," *CAM* 1997/1: 15-32, bibliography.

A testimony of the deep current renewal of studies on Central Asian Islam since the end of the Soviet period, this paper illustrates the way pilgrimages to the graves continue to structure community identities among Turkmens, at the national as well as at the local scale. Through the study of the sites of Paraw Bibi, Khoja Yusup Baba Hamedani, Baba Gambar, Khoja Alem Baba, the author notes that the role of lineages (*öwlat*, from the Arabic and Persian word *awlād*) as an intermediary group in the tribal system is expressed by their central place in the cemeteries, and by the fact that all holy places (*öwliyä*) are devoted to them.

S.A.D.

- [WASLĪ SAMARQANDĪ] VASLII SAMARQANDII, *Imomi A'zam ta'rikhi. Al-kalomu-l-afham fi manoqibi Imomi A'zam*, Tashkent: Iozuvchi, 1995, 64 p.

A re-edition of a nineteenth-century text by a prominent 'ālim of Bukhara, on the Naqshbandī *shaykh* Makhdūm-i A'zam.

S.A.D.

- YAKOVLEV, Alexander I., PANARIN, Sergei A., "The Contradictions of Reforms in Arabia and Turkestan," in Vitaly Naumkin, ed., *State, Religion and Society in Central Asia: A Post-Soviet Critique*, Reading: Ithaca Press, 1993: 57-87.

Based exclusively (including for the Arabian peninsula) on works published in Russian during the first third of the twentieth century, this paper tries a still timid rehabilitation of "Muslim reformism" which was for long criticized in the former USSR for its liberal tendencies in economics. The authors mix up in one and the same category administrative measures by General Kaufman in Turkestan and sensitively more recent economic reforms by King Faisal of Saudi Arabia, which are both examined from the teleological viewpoint of current change in the Federation of Russia...

S.A.D.

- ZARCONI, Thierry, "Histoire et croyances des derviches turkestanais et indiens à Istanbul," *Anatolia Moderna = Yeni Anadolu* 2 (1991): 137-200.

This long and important paper would have deserved to be published in the form of a distinct book. Richly documented and illustrated, it brings an essential contribution to our still very fragmentary knowledge of the intellectual sociability of pilgrims from Central Asia and the Indian subcontinent in late nineteenth and early twentieth-century Istanbul. The author underlines, in particular, the meeting of two Sufi currents, the Naqshbandiyya and the Qalandariyya, in the Turkestanese and Indian *tekkes* of the Ottoman capital. These *tekkes* used to function as both weakly Ottomanized conservatories of the cultural and religious traditions of Central Asian Muslims, and hostleries for travelers with extremely various motivations.

S.A.D.

- ZARCONI, Thierry, "Témoignage sur l'islam confrérique dans le Kokand," *LAC* 1 (1994): 2.

This very short paper introduces a research in progress on the mystical orders, and more particularly on the re-Islamization process in the rural zones around the cities of Kokand and Namangan, in the Uzbekistani part of the Ferghana Valley. S.A.D.

- ZARCONI, Thierry, "Ṭarīqa – 5. De l'Asie centrale et du *Khurāsān* vers les limites du monde turc," *EI*<sup>2</sup> 10/167-168, 1998: 268-272, bibliography.

This important notice gives a historical overview of each of the great *turuq* which are documented in the Turkic world, with a particular attention for Central Asia (see the paragraphs on the Yasawiyya, Naqshbandiyya, Qalandariyya, Kubrawiyya and Qādiriyya). Rich bibliography. S.A.D.

### 5.3.E Eastern Central Asia (Xinjiang)

- AUBIN, Françoise, "Taṣawwuf. 8 – En Chine musulmane," *EI*<sup>2</sup> 10/169-170, 1999: 362-364, bibliography.

This important notice on Chinese-speaking Islam (which was totally absent from the *EI*'s first edition) is divided into two distinct parts. The first one is devoted to literary Sufism: the author casts light on the process of re-reading and reinterpretation, on the pretext of translation, of Arabic and Persian classical texts (received by China from the great Central Asian religious centres). The translators have adapted into an acceptable Chinese thought the philosophical concepts and notions of Sufism, without ever breaking off with Islamic orthodoxy. The second part, on the brotherhoods' world, insists on the key role played by the Naqshbandiyya of Transoxiana, then of Altishahr, in the appearance and development of the *turuq* in Chinese Islam, until the eighteenth-century split caused by the emerging dichotomy between the Old Religion and the New Religion. The paper is concluded by an evocation of the splitting up of the three main *turuq* present in China (the Naqshbandiyya, Qādiriyya and Kubrāwiyya) into little units called *men huan* — the very survival of which is under threat, because of their multiple dissensions as well as because of the progression of the *ikhwānī* trends. S.A.D.

- HAJI, Haji Nur, GOGUANG, Chin, *Shinjang Islam Tarikhi* [History of Islam in Xinjiang], Beijing: Millātlār Nāshriyati, 1995, 496 p.

Written by two of the most proficient specialists in the history of Xinjiang, this book is the unique monograph assessing the general history of Islam in Xinjiang from the first Arab embassy to the Tang Court in 713 to the conquest of Kashgharia by Qing armies during the second half of the eighteenth century. The volume contains three added sections about the main characteristics of "Uyghur Islam", the Islamization of the other Xinjiang *millets* (Kazakh, Kyrgyz, Uzbek, Hui), and about Sufism in Xinjiang. In spite of enduring traces of materialist skepticism towards religious topics and an event-oriented classical historiography, this study provides a well-documented introduction, notably focused on the khanate of Yarkand and on the rise of the Khwajas. As a matter of fact, this period (17th and 18th centuries) is in many respects, specially

intellectual and religious, the first critical phase of the modern history of Xinjiang before the short Islamic state organized by Ya'qūb Beg between 1865 and 1877, up to the Revolution of 1949. A.P.

■ OMĪDVĀR NIYĀ, Mohammad Javād, "Qāderiye dar Chīn [The Qādiriyya in China]," *MAMvQ* 6/18 (1376/1997): 87-106.

The author proposes an overview of the history of *Qādiriyya* in China, from its introduction there from Iran and Central Asia during the Mongol period, then its gradual sinicization from the late seventeenth century onwards, to the hardships imposed by the Communist regime. The paper focuses on the figure of Qi Jingyi and that figure's role in the propagation of Islam in China. The author, who knows the — unquoted — pioneering works by Dru Gladney, refers directly to recent publications by Chinese historians, sociologists and specialists of Islam like Gao Zhanfu (a specialist of Muslim communities of North-West China), Wang Xuehai (a historian of the significant community of Lin Xia and its region), and Ma Tong (a historian of mystical orders), etc. — all present in Gladney's bibliographies. S.A.D.

■ ZARCONI, Thierry, "Le Turkestan chinois," in Alexandre Popovic & Gilles Veinstein, eds., *Les Voies d'Allah. Les ordres mystiques dans l'islam des origines à aujourd'hui*, Paris: Fayard, 1996: 268-273.

As the author stresses from the beginning to the end of his paper, the history of Islamic mystical orders in Eastern Turkestan or Xinjiang must be understood in close connection with the whole Central Asia, since an overwhelming majority of the Sufi *shaykhs* who came there, including the reigning family of the Makhdūmzādas in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, were originating from Transoxiana. The author begins with the demythologization of one of the main conversion legends (that of Sātuq Bughrā Khān), before studying the decisive role played by marginal dervishes in the Islamization of Xinjiang — with a particular interest in the Qalandars' religious syncretism, between Buddhism, Shamanism and Islam. He also evokes the proximity between the Yasawiyya and the Qalandariyya, and the exchanges between the latter and the Uwaysī current, a specificity of Islamic mysticism in Eastern Turkestan. The author then underlines the major chronological turn of the sixteenth century, and the more and more evident implication of the Naqshbandiyya in politics. A new cultural context appears in the sixteenth century with the full Islamicization of Eastern Turkestan and the replacement of the ancient Turkic rulers' steppe code by the commandments of Islam. To the point that an attempt at political pan-Islamism could be launched in Kashghar under Ya'qūb Beg between 1869 and 1877, the Naqshbandiyya's transcontinental networks lie at the core of this tentative rapprochement with the Ottoman Empire. The history of Islam in the twentieth century remains indeed to be written for Xinjiang (see in particular, on this point, recent works by researchers as varied as Shinmen Yasushi and Wang Ke in Japan, or David Wang in Australia, on the Muslim uprisings and republics of the 1930s-40s). S.A.D.



## 6. Modern Languages and Literatures

### 6.1 General Works

■ BALDAUF, Ingeborg, *Schriftreform und Schriftwechsel bei den muslimischen Russland und Sowjettürken, 1850-1937: Ein Symptom ideengeschichtlicher und kulturpolitischer Entwicklungen*, Budapest: Akademiai Kiado – Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1993 (Bibliotheca Orientalis Hungarica: 40), 782 p., bibliography, index.

This monumental reference work on the successive reforms of writing systems among the Turkic-speaking peoples of the USSR, between the Crimean War and the great terror of 1936-37, is focused on an analysis of the role of national languages and their transcription in the building up of modern national affiliations. Very astutely the author first stresses the role of Russian Orthodox missionary organizations, before and after N. Il'minskii, in the elaboration of an education system in vernacular languages written in Cyrillic script, which was to have a determining influence on the emergence of a new sentiment of communal identity in the Volga – Urals region and in the Southern Caucasus, whence Turkestan and the protectorates were first spared by this phenomenon. The author then studies, region by region (not without a special interest in the Tatar world, in both Crimea and the Middle Volga), the main steps of the reform of the alphabet by Muslim learned milieus — through Mīrẓā Fath 'Alī Ākhūndzāda's proposals, then the debates about the writing system throughout the Tatar world in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, then the implementation of the reformed Arabic alphabet in the Volga – Urals region and in Crimea, and last the successive reforms of alphabet among the Kazakhs, in the Southern Caucasus, and in Bashkir land. Following the same principle of regional classification, the author then treats the progress of the transition to the Latin alphabet, from Ākhūndzāda's projects and the debates in Transcaucasia at the end of the nineteenth century to the Congress of Baku in 1920, before dealing with the political grounds (notably the Soviet power's successive strategies) which underpinned the debates on the transition to Latin alphabet in the first half of the 1920s. The work is concluded with rich chronological appendixes, in which the author has given, for each national language, the list of initiatives and administrative measures which led to the adoption of the Latin alphabet. S.A.D.

■ CARLSON, Charles F., "Language Reform Movements in Central Asia," in Ingeborg Baldauf & Michael Friederich, eds., *Bamberger Zentralasienstudien: Konferenzakten ESCAS IV: Bamberg, 8.-12. Oktober 1991*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1994 (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 185): 133-152.

On the basis of an analysis of the laws on national languages which have been voted in 1989-90 in the five Soviet Central Asian republics, and of the public debates which gave way to these legislations, the author studies several of the side effects of these texts, beginning with the paradoxical reinforcement of the role of Russian language as a vector of inter-communal and international communication. S.A.D.

- DOERFER, G., "Central Asia XIV: Turkish-Iranian Language Contacts," *Elr* 5/3, 1991: 226-235.

A renowned turcologist, the author cautiously recalls in his introduction several basic notions on the history and classification of the Turkic languages of Central Asia. He then gives indications on Iranian – Turkic linguistic (more precisely lexical) contacts in the Middle Ages, about Chorasmian then Persian languages on the Iranian side, about Chaghatay on the Turkic side. However the main part of the paper is devoted to conjunction phenomena testified in modern languages — the Irano-Aryan family being represented for this period almost exclusively by Tajik language. The latter has had a notable influence, in the fields of phonetics and vocabulary, on Uzbek language mainly but also — albeit in a lesser extent or in an indirect way — on modern Uighur, Turkmen, Kyrgyz, Kazakh, and Karakalpak. Conversely, a still stronger influence is being exercised almost exclusively by Uzbek language towards northern Tajik dialects (the basis of the literary Tajik language) and, in a lesser extent, towards southern Tajik dialects; this influence concerns phonetics as well as the lexicon and syntax and even morphology (*e.g.*, *yakum klasdan*, "of the first class," with an Uzbek ablative morpheme). A short paragraph is devoted to Yaghnobi, Pamirian dialects, Kurdish — and also, curiously enough, to Bukharan Arabic. A rich bibliography (pp. 233b-235a), with numerous Soviet references, is attached to the paper.

V.H.

- DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., "Destins de la littérature turco-persane d'Asie centrale, d'une renaissance à l'autre (1870-1970)," in Rémy Dor, ed., *Les littératures d'Asie Centrale*, Paris: Anka, 1994: 69-98 (*Anka* 22-23).

Literature and nationalism: a difficult debate for the definition of cultural identities in Central Asia. This paper paves the way for a history of the Turkic and Persian literature of Central Asia in the nineteenth and twentieth century, which still "remains to be written" as the author himself suggests. In fact, modern Central Asian states are born from the ancient Transoxiana, the region "beyond the river," with its particularly rich cultural past, and its intermediary position between the Turkic and Iranian cultures. The thaw of the Soviet ice fields reveals the permanence of a lasting antagonism, which is also a lasting synthesis. The author gives the main historical elements of this synthesis. On such a new subject, one will perhaps regret the lack of an elementary bibliography on this double Turkic and Persian corpus. The concept of literature itself should perhaps also have been defined (as well as other ones, political or social, such as that of "Jadīd"). The history of Central Asian literature(s) will still need to be put in perspective with the main literary ensembles of the neighbouring cultural areas, Turkic and Iranian indeed, but also Slavic to say nothing of those, faraway but no less influent, in Arabic and European languages.

Ch.B.

- MAZZAOUI, Michel M., "Islamic Culture and Literature in Iran and Central Asia in the Early Modern Period," in Robert L. Canfield, ed., *Turko-Persia in Historical Perspective*, Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1991 (School of American Research Advanced

Seminar Series): 78-103.

The author introduces a tentative specific periodization of the political and cultural history of the world of Islam. As far as division generally adopted for European history shows inadequate, he suggests new, more meaningful landmarks: 1258, the fall of the Abbasid caliphate; 1405, Tamerlane's death; 1453, fall of Constantinople; 1517, control of the Mamluks by the Ottomans. The period from 1250 to 1500 corresponds to the expansion of Islamic state systems, followed by the emergence of large entities (Ottomans, Safavids, Uzbeks, Mughals). The 1500s signify the beginning of modern times, and the period from 1500 to 1800 is that of pre-colonial Islamic continuities. Generally seen as a period of decline, the eighteenth century is rehabilitated by the author, who announces a personal monograph on the subject. The nineteenth century, that of colonization, is analysed ("secular reforms and Islamic survival") with prolongations in the early twentieth century ("constitutionalism and Russification") until contemporary movements: political, nationalist, Islamist, etc. Whilst this paper focuses on the pre-eminence of Turko-Persian culture, it remains centered on Iran proper, of which the author is a specialist, and does not bring innovations on such a large subject.

J.C.

■ RA'IS NIYĀ, Rahīm, *Kurughlū dar afsāne va tārikh* [Gurugli in Legend and History], Tabriz: Nīmā, 1366/1987, 486 p.

The adventures of the poet-hero and bard Kōroghlu belong to the history of Azerbaijan and to legend. An integrative part of the Turkic mythology, Kōroghlu entered a great number of literatures West and East of the Caspian Sea (Azerbaijani Turkic, Turkish, Uzbek, Turkmen, Georgian, Armenian, Tajik [cf. *infra* 6.2.B. under Braginskii] and Iranian Persian) in the most varied forms: tales and narratives, poems, theatre, opera. A long introduction (one hundred pages) develops the notion of folklore and all forms of oral and written creation which make of the world of the bards and *trouvères*. The first part of this richly documented work reconstructs the origins of the hero Kōroghlu in various national traditions from Central Asia to Anatolia, from the Sasanids to the Safavids. After having sketched the historical and geographical framework of Kōroghlu's life, the author concentrates in his second part on the study of the literary construction of this phenomenon: the tradition building, the first oral testimonies, the variations according to the cultural contacts, until the nineteenth century. It is in this century that the first written texts of Kōroghlu story appear: the author meticulously describes all the steps of the edition, from the first fragments to the most complete texts (in particular the edition by Chodzko, London, 1842). Incredible is Kōroghlu's destiny, passing from the Turkish language to the English, to the Russian, to the French (G. Sand), to the Tajik... The author offers us several detailed analyses of varied expressions of these processes: the opera in five acts by Aziz Hadjibeygov (1885-1948) from the book by M.S. Ordubadi, represented in 1937; the drama in six pictures (1941) by Ahmad Qodsī Tāj (1901-1967), of which Hasan Seyyed Beyglī wrote the scenario of a film made by H. Seyyedzāde in 1960; the poems by Mehdī Seyyedzāde and Hoseyn

Monzavī; last the Turkish narrative published in 1967 by Yaşar Kemal under the title "Köroğlu's Appearance" in *Three Turkish Narratives* (translated into Kurdish by Shukūr Mustafā, Baghdad, 1972, and into Persian by the author, 347-440). The lack of an index and of a bibliography must be deplored. Ch.B.

## 6.2 Iranian Languages

### 6.2.A General Works

- [STEBLIN-KAMENSKII] STEBLIN-KAMENSKII, Ivan M., "Central Asia XIII: Iranian Languages," *Elr* 5/2, 1990: 223-224; 5/3, 1991: 225-226.

A brief enumeration of the various Iranian languages of Central Asia, introduced by chronological steps, this article is useful (above all to non-specialists) thanks to its bibliography (p. 225a-226b) with numerous references in Russian. V.H.

### 6.2.B Persian/Tajik

- ABIBOV, A., *Ganji Zarafshon* [The Zerafshan Treasure], Dushanbe: Adib, 1991, 544 p.

A systematic exploitation of literary albums and *tadchkiras* of Persian poets of Transoxiana, from the eighteenth to the twentieth centuries, has been undertaken for almost thirty years by the Rudaki Institute of Persian Tajik Language and Literature of Dushanbe, Tajikistan. It gives here, with this volume on "The Zerafshan Treasure," its most voluminous result. After works devoted to the poetical schools of Badakhshan (*Ganji Badakhshon*, Dushanbe: Adib, 1972), of Hissar (*Merosi adabii shoironi Hisor*, Dushanbe: Adib, 1984), and of the hilly regions of Qarategin, Darwaz and Kulab (*Ganji pareshon*, Dushanbe: Irfon, 1984), the present volume offers more than five hundreds notices of poets from Samarqand and Bukhara, on the basis of the information provided by the main late nineteenth and early twentieth-centuries biographers and anthologists ('Abdī, Wāzh, Afzal, Muhtaram, 'Aynī — whose works have been for the most part published in the 1980s). Each notice introduces *ghazals*, *rubā'is* or *mukhammas* which often come out of unpublished albums. The work edited by A. Abibov has the inconveniences of being published in Cyrillic script (which makes it more accessible to the bulk of Central Asian readers), and not quoting the source from which is extracted each given information, but it remains a very useful helper for those interested in the literary life in the cities of the Zerafshan Valley from the late eighteenth century to the beginning of the Soviet period. S.A.D.

- ALIEV, Odildzhon, "O iazyke tadjhikskogo eposa *Gurugli* [On the Language of the Tajik Epics *Gurugli*]," *IANT OON* 120/2 (1985): 76-81.

After an insight on the history of Soviet studies of this popular epics and brief considerations on its nature and recitation, the author gives some indications on its language's

phonetic as well as morphologic specificities. If most of the latter are typical of southern Tajik dialects, others remember the classical literary language. For more data on these short linguistic notations, see the *Gurughli*'s publication in the series "Epos narodov SSSR [Epics of the Peoples of the USSR]," announced since 1983 (!) and including twenty *dāstāns*... [See *infra* the review of this publication by I.S. Braginskii.]

V.H.

- ASOZODA, Khudoynazar, *Adabiyoti tojik dar sadai xx* [Tajik Literature in the Twentieth Century], Dushanbe: Maorif, 1999, 448 p.

A compilation of brief notices written by the author for various encyclopaedic publications, this volume appears as a series of synthetic biographies, each of which is followed by one or two bibliographical references, on numerous figures of contemporary Persian literature in Central Asia. These biographies have been arranged in four rather composite categories: 1) learned men and early intellectuals of the first two decades of the twentieth century, related or not with the Jadīd movement (reform-minded '*ulamā*' like Wāzih, Sarīr and Ziyā neighbour with the court chronicler Sāmī and with the much younger polygraphs Fitrat and 'Aynī); 2) writers of varied status belonging to the first two decades of the Soviet period (a poet in traditional *sabk-i hindī*, Jawharī; a Bolshevik satirist, 'Azīzī; a novelist with a strong nostalgia for classical *adab*, Jalāl Ikramī, etc.); 3) classical Soviet writers with very different profiles (from the distressing Tursūnzāda, an official poet specializing in the peoples' friendship, to Muhammadiev, an anti-establishment short-story writer of the pre-Perestroika period); 4) last comes a holdall with more or less conformist prose writers of the 1960s-70s (Sārbān, Kūhzād, Samad, Akābir, etc.). The more boisterous generation of Perestroika writers (Bahmanyār, Sayf Rahīmzād, M.-Z. Sāleh, etc.) has been carefully eliminated from this volume, despite indisputable successful works and a lasting popularity. That is to say that the present attempt at setting into order a still recent literary past remains problematic. No doubt the social and political upheavals of the last years, and the decay of school and university education system in Tajikistan will contribute to the emergence of new interpretations of this composite and starchy historical perspective. These changes should also lead to new selections in these series of notices and portraits in which numerous scribblers stand next to rare authors, in order to beef up, as in the Soviet past, the deceptive statistics of the almost defunct Union of Writers.

S.A.D.

- ASRORĪ, V., *Zhanrhoi khurdi fol'klori tojik* [The Short Genres in the Tajik Oral Tradition], Dushanbe: Maorif, 1990, 256 p.

Gathering very different genres of the Persian Tajik genres, the author puts together without clear distinction productions of extremely various periods of time and geographical origin. This work continues a first textbook by the same author (*Ejodiioti dahanakii khalqi tojik* [Oral Creations of the Tajik People], Dushanbe: Maorif, 1980), which did not contribute either to sharpening the critical sense of its explicit addressees:

the philology students of Tajikistan's faculties of letters.

S.A.D.

- AZAMOVA, M., "Semantika epiteta 'siioh' (chernyi v epose *Gurugli*) [The Semantic of the Epithet 'Black' in the *Gurughli* Epics]," *IANT VIF* 9/1 (1988): 59-64.

The epithet "black" (*siyāh*) appears rather frequently in the Tajik epics *Gurughli*. The author analyzes its use in two different versions of the text and she concludes that the use of this word, from the most concrete to the most metaphoric meaning, has no positive or negative connotation. However, in the comparative table given at the end of the paper, "black" has positive connotations only with the words "eye" and "eyebrow," which suggests that a more detailed study remains desirable.

V.H.

- BEČKA, Jiří, "Problème de l'écriture au Tadjikistan," in Ch. Balay, Cl. Kappler & Z. Vesel, eds., *Pand-o Sokhan. Mélanges offerts à Charles-Henri de Fouchécour*, Tehran: Institut Français de Recherche en Iran, 1995 (Bibliothèque iranienne: 44): 43-51.

From the second half of the nineteenth century onwards, the expansion of typography provoked attempts at reforming and simplifying the script of texts in Turkic and Persian languages, written until then in Arabic script. The author sketches a history of these reforms, focusing on Sadr al-Dīn 'Aynī's undertaking for the Tajik world from 1927 onwards. These undertakings ended in "Fitrat's project," implemented from 1930 onwards. Its goal was the transition to the Latin alphabet which had to be taught, with adaptations, from school. As soon as 1938 however, the Cyrillic script replaced the Latin one, with a goal of Russification and adhesion to a well-known ideology. Things went on until the moment when Tajikistan decided officially in 1989 to go back to the Arabic alphabet, through the vote of the law of the state language — a change on which the author tries to nuance the general enthusiasm.

R.

- BRAGINSKII, I. S., ed., *Gurugli: tadzhikskii narodnyi epos* [Gurugli: The Tajik National Epics], Moscow: Nauka, 1987 (Akademiia nauk SSSR, Institut Mirovoi Literatury – Akademiia nauk Tadzhikskoi SSR, Institut Iazyka i Literatury; Epos narodov SSSR: 12), 702 p., English summ.

Commented edition of the text of the *Gurughli*, a popular epic which tells the feats of the good king Gurughli, of the fabulous country of Chambul. Among innumerable episodes of the Gurughli theme and their variations, twenty *dāstāns* have been selected for the present volume; this choice, necessarily arbitrary since two identical versions of the same episode cannot be found, has been made on the basis of notes and tapings (some dating back to the 1930s-40s) of a hundred of versions told by popular tellers (*gurūghlī-khwān*). A whole paragraph of the comment is devoted to the traditional art of Tajik *gurūghlī-khwāns*, one of the most famous of whom, Hikmat Rizā (b. 1894) was still active when the book was published. It is a great pity that the biographical notices on the most well-known nineteenth and twentieth-centuries tellers are so short and superficial.

In his introduction, I.S. Braginskii gives a history of the critical research of the

different versions of the *Gurughli*; he assesses the latter's place among the other epic cycles of the same genre (interesting remarks on its obvious relationship with cycles of the "Robin Hood" type); analyses the epics' characters and historical and legendary events. The poetic value of the work is also discussed (the author stresses the uniform poetic nature of all its versions), as well as its literary roots (references to the *Shāh-nāma*, place of epics in the Tajik tradition) and its composition.

The Tajik text is printed in Cyrillic characters. The variants are briefly described at the end of the work (their text is not given). The original text is followed by a versified Russian translation by Braginskii himself. This work was the first edition of the whole *Gurughli* cycle and is part of a large programme of publications launched by the Academy of Sciences of the Soviet Union, entitled "The Epics of the Peoples of the USSR."

M.S.

- CHALISHEV, Soat, comp., *Fol'klori diiori Vose* [The Oral Tradition of the Vose County], Dushanbe: Adib, 1990, 160 p.

A disciple of the Tajik folklorist Rajab Amonov, the author spent a decade to collect the oral tradition of the district of Vose (Wāsī'), south-west of the city of Kulab, a region with a tormented modern history (it was the scene of peasants revolts throughout the colonial period — among which that led by 'Abd al-Wāsī', whose name was given to the district in the Soviet period —; it was also the field of bloody confrontations between the "Basmachis" and the Red Army in the 1920s). The compiler has arranged these works of various forms by genre (*rubā'i*, songs, *badiha*, tales, edifying anecdotes, *riwāyāt*, aphorisms).

S.A.D.

- CHALISHEV, Soat, *Iode az Valizoda* [Remembering Walizāde], Dushanbe: Irfon, 2000, 128 p.

This collection of souvenirs and homage in prose and verse by colleagues and friends of the *hāfiz* and popular singer from Khawaling (southern Tajikistan) Sayyid 'Alī Walizāde (1900-1971) gives a series of short evocations of his work. Despite — or because of — the conformist nature of this work (written to the glory of collectivization and fed by pathetic memories of the Emirs of Bukhara's time), these evocations usefully document the milieu of letters and arts in Tajikistan, and its specific sociability, during the second third of the twentieth century.

S.A.D.

- DARVESH, Bahriddin, *"Charoghi Hidoiati" Orzu va zaboni tojikii forsi* [Ārzū's *Charāgh-i Hidāyat* and the Tajik Persian Language], Dushanbe: Donish, 1992 (Akademiiai ilmhoi Jumhuriati Tojikiston, Pazvuhishgoi Khovarshinosi), 108 p.

The "Tajik language" takes up with its roots again, and rediscovers its own historical and geographical continuities. After re-editions in Dushanbe of classical works of Oriental Persian lexicography, the author proposes a comparative study of phrases from the *Charāgh-i Hidāyat* by Sirāj al-Dīn 'Alī Khān Ārzū (written in India in 1734) and of their equivalents in modern Persian of Dushanbe — and he observes that "more than half" of the terms and expressions of the Northern Indian Persian lexicographer are

alive in present-day Tajikistan.

S.A.D

■ DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., "‘Ajzī," in Marc Gaborieau, Nicole Grandin, Pierre Labrousse & Alexandre Popovic, eds., *Dictionnaire biographique des savants et grandes figures du monde musulman périphérique, du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle à nos jours*, Paris: EHESS, fasc. 2, 1998: 37-38, bibliography.

This short biographical notice on one of the most prominent and best documented figures of early twentieth century Samarqand's intellectual milieu is part of a general undertaking of rediscovering the protagonists of Central Asia's intellectual history in the modern and contemporary periods. See also in the same volume the notices on "Awlānī, ‘Abdallāh," 38-39; "Behbūdī," 39-40; "Fitrat," 40-42; "Hakīm," 42-43; "Tawallā," 46-47; "Tchulpān," 47-49.

R.

■ GULNAZAR, ed., *Adiboni Tojikiston. Ma'lumotnoma* [Men and Women of Letters in Tajikistan. A Directory], Dushanbe: Adib, 2002, 735 p.

Although this rich directory does not lie on any scientific postulate or method, it constitutes an invaluable bio-bibliographical basis for tackling Tajik literature of the second half of the twentieth century, through the member files of the Union of Writers of Tajikistan.

S.A.D.

■ [HABIBZODA] HABIBOV, Amirbek, *Az ta'rikhi ravobiti adabii Badakhshon bo Hinduston (Asrhai XVI, XVII va XVIII)* [Elements of the History of Literary Exchanges between Badakhshan and India (16th to 18th Century)], Dushanbe: Donish, 1991 (Akademiiai ilmhoi RSS Tojikiston, Instituti Sharqshunosī), 172 p.

In a careful prolepsis the author deplores that he could not have access to the huge documentation preserved in India for his inquiry on three centuries of literary exchanges between the Pamir and the subcontinent, from the conquest of Badakhshan by the Shaybanid ruler ‘Abd-Allāh Khān to the Agha Khan's establishment in Bombay (Mumbai). Habibov's work is made of a series of biographical notices of shaykhs, learned men and literati, the protagonists of these exchanges. It brings an invaluable contribution to our knowledge of the role played by the Ismaili community, by the main Sunni mystical orders (for the most part by the Naqshbandiyya) and by Pamirian madrasas in the continuous development of these exchanges between the Central Asian centres of learned culture, Badakhshan, the great *khānaqāhs* of Kashmir, and the Indian courts, during the three centuries which preceded the Russian colonization.

S.A.D.

■ HABIBZODA, A., *Mulloiori Vanji: Ahvol va Ash'or* [Mullā-Yār Wanjī: His Life and Poetry], Dushanbe: [Akademiiai ilmhoi Tojikiston, Instituti Khovarshinosī], 1993, 56-44 p.

The author offers us an interesting work on the way the echoes of the main centres of learned literary culture of Transoxiana (of Bukhara and Samarqand, in particular) and of Northern India, in full renewal in the nineteenth century, were coming to the high-



er valleys of the Pamir and were there reinterpreted in didactical poetry of varied traditional forms. S.A.D.

- HOLĪ, Altof Husain, *Armughon* [A Present], Dushanbe: Nashriioti Donish, 1987, 37-38 p. Although Husayn Hālī (1837-1913) is principally an Urdu-writing poet, he has composed verses in Persian, never published before in Tajikistan. Yet by introducing the notion of "national verse" (*qawmī nazm*) in the colonial context, Hālī's influence on both Hindustani and Tajik literatures is notable and characterizes a sort of continuity of the Indian literature's influence on Central Asia. A.P.

- ĪRĀNĪ, Nāser, "Bār-e dīgar dar Tājikestān. Ta'aththorhā-ye dhehnī va vaz'-e konūnī-ye zabān-e fārsī-ye tājīk [In Tajikistan Again. Intellectual Impressions and the Present Situation of the Tajik Persian Language]," *MAMvQ* 2/11 (1374/1995): 147-156.

An Iranian writer and literary critic studies Tajik culture in the aftermath of the civil war of the 1990s — he deplores the permanence of the Russian influence, denounces the recurring threat of Turkization, and rejoices himself of the vitality of a national sentiment among the Tajiks, and of their commitment to the preservation of Persian language. In a mood characteristic of the mid-1990s, the paper is closed by an appeal to a better cooperation between Iran and Tajikistan for the promotion of Persian language and of the Arabic alphabet in Central Asia. S.A.D.

- KALBĀSĪ, Īrān, *Fārsī-ye Īrān va Tājikestān (Yek barresi-ye moqābele'ī)* [The Persian of Iran and Tajikistan (A Comparative Study)], Tehran: Daftar-e motāle'āt-e siyāsī va beyn-ol-melālī, 1374/[1995], 405 p., maps.

An Iranian linguist known for her studies on Kurdish language embarks on a comparative description of the Persian language spoken respectively in Tehran and in Dushanbe. Written with a great pedagogical clarity, the book is opened with an introductory chapter devoted to the introduction of Tajikistan and of the Tajiks to an Iranian audience. The linguistic part properly said deals successively with the phonetic specificities of the Tajik in comparison with Iranian Persian, then with the morphology, the syntaxes and the terminology of Tajik language. A book easy to use and well organized, this work offers Persian-speaking people and specialists of Persian language a very complete introduction to the Persian spoken today in the capital of Tajikistan.

S.A.D.

- KERIMOVA, A. A., MOLCHANOVA, E. K., "K referentsii enkliticheskogo mestoimeniia –*ash* v tadjikskoi razgovornoj rechi [Referential Use of the Pronoun –*ash* in Spoken Tajik]," in M.N. Bogoliubov, ed., *Iranskoe iazykoznanie. Ezhegodnik 1982*, Moscow: Nauka, 1987: 78-85.

Using the theory of difference, one can show the underlying unity of the referential uses of the enclitic pronoun of the third person singular –*ash* in Tajik — whether in the absence of the pronoun's linguistic "antecedent" (or "postcedent") (the enclitic referring

in this case to a fact of the extra-linguistic world: *e.g.*, the cover of a book, *narkhash 20 tin*: "(its) price: 20 kopecks"), or in the case when the pronoun is part of the context of the discourse (which can be an element of a sentence or a whole clause). This paper completes another one, written by Molchanova alone, published in *Voprosy iazykoznaniia* 1987/1. V.H.

- KIEFFER, C., "L'avancée du persan vers l'est: le cas des isolats persanophones les plus orientaux de l'Afghanistan," *SI* 18/2 (1989): 221-236, 2 maps.

From Baluchistan (Sarawan) to Chitral (Madaglasht) through a whole series of places of Eastern Afghanistan, a set of Persian-speaking isolates today mark the advance of Persian language towards the Indian world. The author rapidly characterizes those of these oriental dialects located inside the Afghan boundaries, and he questions the conditions of their presence. If in most cases these conditions remain largely hypothetical, the lack of genetic (and dialectological) relationship between these different isolates is convincingly demonstrated. The most complete case, evoked in passing by the author, is no doubt that of the Dehwār of Sarawan who, beside a strong "Tājek" nucleus, poorly identified but clearly tribalized, incorporate elements of varied origins: Iranians from Fars (to be brought together with the Formolis of Urgun?), Pashtuns, Baluchs, Brahuis, Arabs. Contrary to its northern neighbours, the Persian-speaking isolate of Baluchistan seems to have constituted, until a relatively recent date, a centre of attraction and acculturation. Perhaps may we see there an effect of the privileged political status of its members inside the khanate of Kalat (direct protection by the khan, exemption from the military service). Let's underline also the recent exodus of Afghan refugees of all origins towards Pakistan will very likely, according to a recurring historical scheme, drive to the durable settlement of Persian-speaking colonies eastward of what the author calls the "Easternmost front of Persianophony." The future will tell in which measure these colonies will show able, or not, to generate new linguistic isolates, at the East of those which have been described here. D.B.

- LAZARD, Gilbert, "*Pārsi et dari*: nouvelles remarques," *BAI* 4 (1990): 239-242.

Coming back to two problems let unresolved in a paper published in 1971, the author takes benefit of discoveries made in the meantime for elucidating the nature of the "Dari" and "Parsi" languages evoked by Ibn al-Muqaffā'. This terminological dichotomy would in fact refer to a dialectical opposition between, on the first hand, Southern (Parsi) dialects — the direct heirs of the improperly called Pehlevi language, the most ancient attestations of which are texts in Judeo-Persian and the Qur'ān-i quds —; and on the other hand North-Eastern (Dari) dialects, more remote from Middle-Persian because of Parthian roots; also in use at the court, the latter will be at the origin of the future classical Persian language. So Parsi and Dari were then opposed from the South to the North, not from the West to the East as they are nowadays. V.H.

- LAZARD, Gilbert, "Darī," *Elr* 7/1, 1994: 34-35.

This historical statement on the term *darī* identifies it with the language spoken in Ctesiphon at the end of the Sassanian period, then propagated towards Khurasan and Transoxiana where it rapidly differentiated itself from its original form, to the point of being identified nowadays with the Persian language spoken in Khurasan and in Afghanistan. S.A.D.

- [MAHMADAMINOV, Abdulhai] MAKHMADAMINOV, Abdulkhai, *Poiski istiny: 'Obraztsy tadzhikskoi literatury' v bor'be za prava tadzhikskogo naroda* [The Search for Truth: The 'Examples of Tajik Literature' in the Fight for the Rights of the Tajik People], Dushanbe: Izdatel'stvo Sino, 1994.

This book provides an interesting study on the way the *Namūna-yi adabiyāt-i tājīk* ("Anthology of Tajik Literature") published by Sadr al-Dīn 'Aynī in Moscow in 1926 (*i.e.*, during harsh public debates, throughout the whole USSR, on the definition of national languages and literatures) must be resituated in polemics then engaged with some Uzbek intellectual circles on the status of Persian language in Soviet Central Asia. The author recalls how the reference to remote mythicized forerunners (Rūdakī in particular), as well as to nineteenth-century reformist ulama and early twentieth-century Jadid intellectuals should have permitted a justification of the political autonomy given in 1924 to the Tajiks inside the Uzbek SSR, before the proclamation of a federated republic in 1929. S.A.D.

- MOHĪT-E TABĀTABĀĪ, Mohammad, "Dar bāre-ye lafz-e tājīk o tāt [About the Words *Tājīk* and *Tāt*]," *Āyande* 12/7-8 (1365[/1986]): 343-349.

This paper is the result of a research through ancient Persian and Turkic dictionaries on the origin of the words *tājīk* and *tāt*. *Tāt* is the form of the word *tājīk* as it is employed by the Turks; *tājīk* was formerly designating, as we know, the new Persian-speaking converts to Islam. It is perhaps through Chinese language (see the origin of the word *Tokhāristān*) that the Turks have retained the form *tāt* of the word *tājīk*.

C.F.

- PERRY, John, "Script and Scripture: The Three Modern Alphabets of Tajik Persian, 1927-1997," *JCAS* 2/1 (1997): 1-18, 4 tabs.

After an enumeration of the respective technical "pros" and "cons" of the three successive alphabets of Tajik Persian language in the twentieth century (the Arabic alphabet until 1928, the Latin one from 1928 to 1939, the Cyrillic one until recent laws voted in Tajikistan in 1989-90 for the return to the Arabic alphabet), the author resituates in their respective historical contexts each of these changes, for casting light on the essentially political and cultural criteria which have each time determined the transition from one alphabet to the other. The paper is closed with the expression by the author of his doubts on the capacity of the return to the Arabic alphabet, demanded by the vernacular intelligentsia of Dushanbe since the late 1980s, to be enough for easing the reintegration of Tajikistan inside the Persian-speaking world. S.A.D.

- **POUJOL**, Catherine, "Delkaš," *EIr* 7/3: 250-251.

This short biography of the Bukharan literati and musician Qārī Mullā Karāmat-Allāh Tanbūrī (d. 1320/1902) is followed by an evocation of his literary work. The application of the adjective "progressive" to some mid-nineteenth century Bukharan intellectual circles is part of a retro-projection towards the past of ideological categories typical of the twentieth century. S.A.D.

- **RABIEV**, Jalil, *Afsonahoi Ūroteppa* [Tales of Ura-Teppa], Dushanbe: Donish, 1992 (Akademii ilmi Jumhurii Tojikiston, Instituti zabon va adabiot ba nomi Rūdākī), 350 p.

This book offers a rich collection of tales from Ura-Teppa (north of Tajikistan) transcribed phonetically in common Cyrillic script and gathered by themes and by "genres": tales on animals, didactic tales, tales "inspired by everyday life," satirical tales, edifying tales. By the same author, see also: *Folklori Uroteppa* [Oral Traditions of Ura-Teppa], Dushanbe: Donish, 1991, 240 p. S.A.D.

- **RAHMAN**, Munibur, "Shawkat Bukhārāyī," *EI*<sup>2</sup> 9, 1995: 378-379, bibliography.

As we have suggested above, the *Encyclopaedia Iranica* has distinguished itself, since its beginning, by its lack of interest in modern Persian literature in Transoxiana. What should be said about the *Encyclopaedia of Islam* — where, to say the truth, modern Central Asia as a whole occupies until now a very poor place? Papers on such and such figure of writer or scholar from the seventeenth to the nineteenth century appear only in the very last volumes of the collection, in a sporadic way, in the form of short notices, totally insufficient for permitting the reader to get a clear representation of the history of Persian literature north to the Amu-Darya after the seventeenth century. The present notice, devoted to a poet of Bukharan origin active in Herat and dead in Isfahan in 1107/1695-6, is no exception: a short biography, followed by an evocation of his *diwān*, allows us to get a general idea of the itinerary of a defender of the *sabk-i hindī*. S.A.D.

- **RAJABOV**, M., "Obrazi Vose dar nasri tojiki muosir [The Representation of Wāsī' in Modern Tajik Literature]," in A. Mukhtorov, ed., *Iz istorii narodnykh dvizhenii v Srednei Azii* (*Sbornik statei, posviashchennykh 100-letiiu vosstaniia Vose*), Dushanbe: Donish, 1990: 107-124.

The author analyses the historical novel *Vose* (Dushanbe, 1967) by the Soviet Tajik writer Sotim Ulughzoda. "The first fiction work which treats the social origins of the Baljuan uprising in 1885-86," the novel by Ulughzoda is centered on the conventional figure of a "professional revolutionary," who has learnt his job among the bandits by honour ('*ayyārān*) permanently revolted against the Emir of Bukhara. However M.R. stresses the lack of reference, in the novel, to any influence of Russian thought on the action of the hero (as it would have inevitably been the case in orthodox literary works of the 1930s to the 1950s). On the contrary, M.R. presents the figure of Wāsī', as it is treated by Ulughzoda, as an expression of continuity in the political culture which is

specific to Central Asia. The key problem, in the novel, is that of the moral of power, as it is inherited from the Persian tradition. At the same time, the attention which is paid (in the novel) by the hero to problems such as education allows to present him as an heir to the reformist ulama of the 19th century, and a precursor to the early 20th-century Jadid publicists. This genealogical link, from the mid-19th century reformist ulama to contemporary Tajik intelligentsia, through Wāsi' and the Jadids, has been proposed explicitly by Ulughzoda in another of his works (*Edinenie. Izbrannye stat'i i ocherki* [Union. Selected Papers and Studies], Dushanbe: Tadzhiqgosizdat, 1963, 168 p.). Social and ideological continuities are stressed by similarities between the reflection of the mid-19th century Bukharan *mudarrises* and the late 19th-century "*dehqān's* ideology," which are both described as being based on the research of a just ruler. It is noticed that the local *mīrs* of Baljuan themselves defended the autochthonous population against the exactions of the Bukharan Emirs, who appear in this historical narrative as "foreign" rulers. In the novel, the provincial administrators of Baljuan appear as Tajiks. The enemy is rejected outside the Tajik society, which appears in Ulughzoda's work as an undivided world, a community with no inner conflict; the enemy in the Manghit dynasty (the term Uzbek is not yet pronounced), whose tyranny hurts "the spirit of independence of the mountainous Tajiks" (M. Rajabov). This quest for unity includes the field of religion. However, Wāsi's religion is reduced to some principals of traditional ethics. In short, M.R. presents us a particularly interesting analysis of the historical themes and their functions, as they appear in Tajik literature between destalinization and perestroika. S.A.D.

- ROZENFEL'D, A. Z., "Tadzhikskaja i persidskaja skazka *Bluzhdaiushchii solovei* i ego paralleli [The Tajik and Persian Tale *The Wandering Nightingale* and Its Parallels]," *IANT OON* 1985/3: 90-93, Tajik summary.

In this polemic paper on the Western roots attributed to a Persian/Tajik tale known under the generic name of the "Singing Nightingale" (*bulbul-i sargashta*), the author discusses the position of R. Amonov who quotes this tale as "one of the Oriental (Iranian) elements which have directly passed into Western literature (Goethe's *Faust*)." Against this opinion, A.R. provides arguments which aim at localizing in the pre-Romantic tradition variations of the theme of the "Singing Nightingale"; these variations, under varying titles, are known in the European oral tradition and present in the Grimm brothers' fairy tales. Although the relationship between variations of the European and Iranian oral traditions is otherwise unquestionable, the exchange of ideas took place well before the "Orientalist" period of the European Romanticism. M.S.

- RUSTAMOV, A., "Semanticheskie protsessy v tadzhikskoi leksike posleoktiabr'skogo perioda [Semantical Evolutions in the Tajik Vocabulary after the October Revolution]," in M.N. Bogoliubov, ed., *Iranskoe iazykoznanie. Ezhegodnik 1982*, Moscow: Nauka, 1987: 124-131.

In this summary study of various processes of the evolution of the Tajik lexicon since the establishment of the Soviet power, the author provides not always clear distinctions

between: 1) the widening of meaning (e.g., *a'zo*, sg., "member of a party, of an organization"); 2) the shift in meaning (e.g., *maosh* "salary"); 3) the restriction of the meaning (e.g., *harif* "adversary, in sports"); 4) realization of meaning (e.g., *anjuman* "congress"); 5) the widening of the field (e.g., *Khonai Ittifoqi navisandagon* "House of the Union of Writers").

V.H.

- SHUKUROV, Muhammadjon, "Zindaginomai Ajzī [A Biography of 'Ajzī]," *SSh* 1992/2: 123-136.

Based for the most part on the "Muslim" press of the 1910s in Russian Turkestan (the journal *Āyīna* and the newspaper *Hurriyat*, both of Samarqand), the author proposes an intellectual biography of a protagonist of the cultural renewal in Samarqand between the revolution of 1905 and those of 1917.

S.A.D.

- [SHUKUROV, Muhammadjon] SHUKURI, Muhammadjân, "La situation de la langue persane tadjike et les perspectives de son renouveau," *CEMOTI* 18 (1994): 171-178.

An academician philologist and an ideologist of the Tajik national movement of the 1980s, the author deals with the pernicious effects of the regional segmentation of the Tajikistani society (deprived from its main centres of learned Persian culture, Samarqand and Bukhara). He calls for a linguistic renewal in Tajikistan, notably through large borrowings from Iranian Persian language, capable of giving Tajikistan a still unobtainable national cement.

S.A.D.

- SOPER, John D., *Loan Syntax in Turkic and Iranian: The Verb Systems of Tajik, Uzbek, and Qashqay*, PhD dissertation, Los Angeles: University of California, 1987, 488 p.

Tajik is an Iranian language influenced by a Turkic language, namely Uzbek. Qashqay, on the other hand, is a Turkic language surrounded, and heavily influenced, by Persian, an Iranian language. A study of the changes wrought in the texture of these languages as a result of such proximities may reveal important findings on various manners of assimilation of linguistic influences by different languages. This study focuses on the changes that have taken place in the verb system of the affected languages, *i.e.* Tajik and Qashqay. It concludes that both of these languages have assimilated the verb-making behaviour of the dominant linguistic paradigm. The major implications of the study seem to indicate that even the most complex linguistic structures may be acquired, and that, in the process, many original native mechanisms can be lost completely, and replaced by mechanisms borrowed from other languages. Furthermore, the study concludes, as a result of the give and take, the donor and borrower languages converge on one another, and their structural differences tend to decrease.

A.K.-H.

- [STEBLIN-KAMENSKII] STEBLIN-KAMENSKY, I., "Tādjīkī. I: Language," *EI*<sup>2</sup> 10/163-164, 1998: 66-67, bibliography.

This short notice offers us a historical skimming through and an overall description of the specificities of the Tajik Persian language — introduced here as a "language" in the

full meaning of this term, in the line of the Soviet theory of the national languages of the USSR, not as a dialectal variation of Persian language as a whole. S.A.D.

- TABAROV, Sohīb, *Taqdiri fojaviī yak shoīri tojik* [The Tragic Destiny of a Tajik Poet], Dushanbe: Sharqi ozod, 2001, 100 p.

One of the best Tajikistani specialists of the history of the Jadid movement in the Emirate of Bukhara, the author devotes a monograph to the work of the "peasant-poet" from Warzab, Sa'd-Allāh Rabī'ī (1883-1938) and to the attacks to which it was submitted in the 1930s, until its author's arrest and his deportation in 1937. Written on the basis of testimonies by contemporaries and of documents diffused in the press of the time, this biography of a secondary, and rather conformist figure of early Soviet literature, rehabilitated already during Khrushchev's Thaw in the 1950s, provides interesting elements on the functioning of the Soviet machine of repression and on the literary milieus of the Tajik SSR during the years preceding the launching of the main waves of the red terror in 1937. S.A.D.

- *Vīzhenāme-ye farhang va adab dar jomhūrīhā-ye Tājīkestān va Ozbekestān* [Special Issue of Culture and Literature in the Republics of Tajikistan and Uzbekistan], Tehran: s.n., 1369/1990, 196 p. (*Sīmorgh* 1/7-9).

This special issue of this monthly journal of Iranian and Islamic studies has been entirely devoted to the history and culture of Tajikistan and, to a lesser extent, Uzbekistan. Some room has been given to representatives of contemporary Tajik culture and literature, among others to Jalol Ikromi, Gulrukhsor, Akbar Tursunzod, Muhiddin Olimpur and Gulnazar. Among the papers written by Tajikistani scholars and writers, let's mention: [Kamol Ainī] Kamāl 'Aynī, "al-Khwārazmī va sahm-e ū dar roshd-e tamaddon-e jahānī [al-Khwarezmi and His Role in the Development of World Civilization]"; Seyyed Ja'far Hamadī, "Samarqand o Bokhārā-rā"; Rahman Rowshan, "Shā'erān-e mahallī va zarurat-e zab' va barresī-ye āthār-e ānhā [Local Poets and the Necessity to Index and to Study Their Work]." G.J.J.

- WERYHO, Jan W., "The Earliest Persian Translation of a European Poem: Topchibashev's Rendering of Mickiewicz's Sonnet," *FO* 30 (1994): 195-206, bibliography.

The author questions himself on the reasons which have brought the Azerbaijani orientalist Mīrzā Ja'far Topchībāshev (or Topchubāshī), assistant professor of Persian language in the University of Saint Petersburg, to embark in 1826 in what should be considered the first Persian translation of a text written in a European language other than ancient Greek. In fact, as the translator explains himself in his foreword, it is the Polish revolutionary poet Mickiewicz himself who demanded Topchībāshev a Persian translation of his "Views of the Mountain from the Kozlov Steppe" (a translation made out of a Russian version established by a pupil of Topchībāshev's, Alexandr Chodźko). Mickiewicz's romantic fascination for the Islamic East, which should be confirmed during the following decades, seems to be the source of this atypical experiment — which

seems to have remained without consequences in the history of Polish and Persian literatures. Although the side aspects of this affair are still poorly documented, the meeting between the Polish author and his Azerbaijani translator offers us some interesting elements for the study of the relations between the Muslim and Christian intelligentsias in the Russian Empire during the nineteenth century. S.A.D.

- [ZHANG Hong Nian] JĀN Hūn Nīn, "Adabiyāt-e fārsī dar Chīn [Persian Literature in China]," *Āyande* 13/4-5 (1366[1987]): 247-251.

Some steps of the knowledge of Persian language and literature in China are briefly stated by an Iranologist from Beijing. Persian language is taught in more than ten higher educational institutions throughout China, and attachment for Firdawsī attested in Xinjiang. Y.R.

### 6.2.C North-Iranian Languages

- BUDDRUS, G., "Wakhi-Sprichwörter aus Hunza," in R. Schmitt & P.O. Skjaervø, eds., *Studia grammatica iranica. Festschrift für Helmut Humbach*, München: Kitzinger, 1986: 27-44.

Detailed analysis of some twenty Wakhi proverbs, chosen in a wider corpus gathered by the author in the north of Pakistan in 1982 and still unpublished. P.Lq.

- CHRISTOL, Alain, "Introduction à l'ossète. Éléments de grammaire comparée," *Lalies* 8 (1990): 7-50.

This is an excellent initiation to the historical grammar of Ossetic language, which renews Miller's statement in the *Grundriss* (1903) and which will come in useful to those who cannot have access to Russian publications (see the contribution by M.I. Isaev on Ossetic language in the volume of the *Osnovy* devoted to the modern Eastern Iranian language). After a short introduction on the Ossetians and on their language (one may regret that the author did not take use of this opportunity for publishing here his paper "From the Scythians to the Ossetians"), the history of phonetics is described in an original way, on the basis of fifteen words; the part on morphology explains the nominal and verbal flections; in the appendix the reader will find a table of the Ossetic alphabets and a phonetic index. P.Lq.

- EDEL'MAN, Dzhoi Iosifovna, *Sravnite'lnaia grammatika vostochnoiranskikh iazykov: fonologiia* [Comparative Grammar of the East-Iranian Languages: Phonology], Moscow: Nauka, 1986 (Akademiiia nauk SSSR, Institut iazykoznaniia), 232 p.

D.I. Edel'man has published a number of works on the languages and dialects which make of the Eastern branch of the Irano-Aryan family. This time she undertakes a reconstruction of the phonetic prehistory of this large and varied ensemble. She has used for that not only all the relevant publications, but also unpublished dissertations (by Sokolova, Livshits, Steblin-Kamenskii, etc.), chapters written by Grundberg about



Munji and Pashto languages for a then forthcoming volume on the "Fundamentals of Iranian Linguistics" (*Osnovy iranskogo iazykoznanii*) and fragments of an "Etymological Dictionary of the Wakhi Language" by Steblin-Kamenskii (then in print). The plan of the work is chronologically descending. The first of the two chapters deals with the phonologic system of common Indo-Iranian language, the second with the evolution of this system and of these elements in various idioms of the Eastern branch until modern times. There is not separate treatment for the Middle-Iranian level, since the author considers, not without reason, that the distinction between Middle- and Neo-Iranian is less linguistic than philological. The book does not provide a general classification of all dialects and languages, which would probably be premature. Let's note, among the conclusions, that the author classifies Ormuri and Parachi in the Western Indo-Iranian; that the dialects of the Pamirian region have between each other no particular genetic relationship, but they share some innovations which group them in a "union of languages" (*iazykovoi soiuz*) particular to a certain area; and that Avestic can be clearly attached neither to the Western, not to the Eastern branch. G.L.

- FRITZ, Sonja, "Ein frühes ossetisches Sprachdenkmal," *Die Sprache* 32 (1986): 247-256. The author studies an Ossetic prayer collected in the beginning of the nineteenth century by the German traveller J.C. Kohl, composed in an ancient form of the Dzhav or Dual dialect, and one of the most ancient religious specimens of the Ossetians.

V.H.

- KARAMSHOEV, D., *Shughnansko-russkii slovar'*, 1: A-Z [Shughnani-English Dictionary, 1: A-Z], 1, Moscow: Nauka, 1988, 576 p.

The Shughni dialect is one of the most important Irano-Aryan dialects of the Pamir. It is spoken, according to the authors of the present book, by around 75,000 persons in the Panj Valley and in the valleys of the latter's Eastern tributaries in the USSR and Western tributaries in Afghanistan. The most extended glossary we had until now is that, 5,500 word rich, which accompanied Zarubin's texts published by his pupils in 1960 (*Shughnanskii teksty i slovar'*). The present work is the first volume of a 30,000 word rich dictionary which aims at being as complete as possible. The author, who is himself a native bearer of the dialect, limits oneself to the Shughnani proper (and so neglects the other dialects of what is called the "Shughni group"), but he embraces all the local varieties of this dialect, including his own native one, Bajui, to which he has already devoted a monograph (*Badzhuvskii dialekt shughnanskogo iazyka*, Dushanbe, 1963). The data have been collected in situ between 1960 and 1969, and since then completed and checked with the works of the author's forerunners.

The papers are abundantly provided with samples which offer the linguists an important documentation. The morphemes are included into the dictionary, so that the latter is not only a work of lexicography, but gives also a lot of grammatical information. The vocabulary is not limited to the indigenous lexicon, but includes borrowings from Tajik and Russian languages, at least those settled in the local language. The nota-

tion is Cyrillic script with diacritical signs. This work is a new testimony of the active contribution by Tajikistani linguists to the Irano-Aryan dialectology. The author lets us hope for further developments, since he evokes a future comparative dictionary of Pamirian dialects. G.L.

- LEDDET, Sophie, "La langue des Tadjiks de Chine," *LAC* 1 (1994): 3.

This paper gives a short, still very incomplete statement, through the works by the Chinese linguist Gao Erqiang, on the language of the Iranian-speaking populations ("Tajiks") of the region of Tashqurghan, in the south-west of Xinjiang. Cf. GAO Erqiang, ed., *Tajikuyu jianshi* [Concise Grammar of (Sariquli and Wakhi) Tajik], Beijing: Minzu Chubanshe, 1985 (*Zhongguo shaoshu minzu yuyan jianshi congshu*), 151 p. (reviewed by R.F. Hahn, *CAJ* 33/3-4 (1989): 305-306). S.A.D.

- STEBLIN-KAMENSKII, I. M., "Terminy orosheniia v pamirskikh iazykakh [The Vocabulary of Irrigation in the Pamirian Languages]," in M.N. Bogoliubov, ed., *Iranskoe iazykoznanie. Ezhegodnik 1982*, Moscow: Nauka, 1987: 132-157.

Study on the designation of irrigated lands and of the river facilities (dams and diversion canals) in six Pamirian languages (Tājīkī, Yazghulāmī, Shughnī-Rōshānī, Ishkashmī, Munjī, Wākhī). See also, by the same author: "Nazvaniia pakhotnogo orudiia v pamirskikh iazykakh [The Names of Ploughing Instruments in the Pamirian Languages]," in M.N. Bogoliubov, ed., *Iranskoe iazykoznanie. Ezhegodnik 1982*, Moscow: Nauka, 1987: 154-170, on the lexicography of the plough and of the yoke in the six same Pamirian languages. D.B.

- THORDARSON, Fridrik, "An Ossetic Miscellany Lexical Marginalia," in Eivind Kahrs, ed., *Kalyāṇamitrārāgaṇam. Essays in Honour of Nils Simonsson*, Oslo: Norwegian University Press, 1986: 277-286.

The author wants to react against the idea of a high openness of Ossetic language to the neighbor foreign languages because of its geographical situation in the Northern Caucasus. On the contrary he tries to demonstrate that, being very conservative, the Ossetic language shows an "almost prodigious" permanence, through the preservation of its character as an Iranian language: examples are borrowed from lexicography, notably through designations of the human being's elementary activities, and through the terms of genetic relationship, where one can observe the lack of a word for grandfather, uncle, aunt, cousin, nephew, what the author explains by the structure of a traditional tribal society. Ph.G.

## 6.3 Turkic Languages

### 6.3.A General Works

■ EREMEEV, D. E., "Tiurk – etnonim iranskogo proiskhozhdeniia? [*Turk* – an Ethnonym of Iranian Origin?]," *SE* 1990/3: 129-135.

Inspired by the great amount of borrowings by Turkic languages from Iranian languages, the author formulates the hypothesis of a relation between the *Turs* of the Avesta, the eponymous hero Tur of the Avestic texts and of the *Shāh-nāma*, and the ethnic denomination Turk — which would have derived from the initial denomination of Indo-European populations of Central and Inner Asia, applied from the third century CE onwards to autochthonous tribal confederations. S.A.D.

### 6.3.B Qipchaq Group

#### 6.3.B.a Tatar Language and Literature

■ ISMÄGYIL, Näjip Näkkash, ed., *Majmugyl hikaiat. Boryngy tatar prozasy* [The *Majmū' al-hikāyāt*: Tatar Prose of the Past], vol. I, Kazan: Tatar kitap nāshriiati, 1994 (Tatarstan fānlār akademiiae, G. Ibrahimov isemendäge tel, adabiiat hām tarikh instituti, Qul'iazmalar hām tekstologiiā bülege), 448 p.

The book provides an edition in Tatar language, in Cyrillic script, of the *Majmū' al-hikāyāt*, a collection of works in prose translated from Persian language in 1775 by Muhammad Rahīm b. Rafiq Qāzānī, a *mudarris* from Kazan who had taken refuge in the numerous Muslim community of Tobolsk (Western Siberia) after the Christianization campaigns of the second third of the eighteenth century. The *Majmū' al-hikāyāt* has been edited here on the basis of a manuscript preserved in the Institute of Language, Literature and History of the Academy of Sciences of Tatarstan, in Kazan. It constitutes an essential step in the history of the mutual exchanges between Tatar literature, on the first hand, and on the other hand Central Asian Chaghatay and Persian literatures — exchanges for which the Muslim communities of Western Siberia were an important melting pot at the turn of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

S.A.D.

#### 6.3.B.b Bashkir Language and Literature

■ URAQSIN, Z. G., dir., *Bashqortsa-Russa Hüdhlek / Bashkirsko-Russkii Slovar'* [Bashkir-Russian Dictionary], Moscow: Digora – Russkii Iazyk, 1996, 866 p.

This single-volume dictionary is the latest fruit of a major lexicographic project begun in the 1960s in the Bashkir branch of the USSR Academy of Sciences, and continued following the collapse of the Soviet Union by the renamed Bashkortostan Academy of

Sciences. This bilingual dictionary follows in slightly reduced form the publication in 1993 of the two-volume Bashkir monolingual dictionary. Lexicography is an expensive and labour intensive proposition under the best of circumstances, so the publication of any complete dictionary in the former Soviet Union should be welcomed; yet we have cause to be especially grateful that these compilers were able to publish a dictionary that in many respects exceeded the existing standards of lexicography in the former Soviet Union, standards that in fact were at times very elevated. This dictionary roughly doubles the headword volume of the last Bashkir-Russian dictionary, which was published in 1958. In addition to containing substantially more headwords, the new Bashkir-Russian dictionary provides a broader range of senses, and a larger variety of idioms, which appear at the ends of the individual articles. One of the most useful revisions to this dictionary is the extensive inclusion of collocations, some of which successfully broaden the semantic range of a given entry.

The dictionary's main shortcoming is its treatment of Russian loan-words. In most cases the Russian equivalent is an exact repetition of the headword. Such a practice provides no benefit to the user; nevertheless, some recent dictionaries, such as the Erzia (Mordvin)–Russian dictionary (1993) avoid this pitfall by providing Russian definitions after the Russian equivalent, thereby narrowing the meaning for the user. Still, the treatment of Russian loan-words, and the multiple inclusion of common collocations results in the bilingual dictionary complementing the Bashkir monolingual dictionary in a very fruitful way, since the monolingual dictionary provides full definitions of the Russian loan-words, but also lacks common collocations. This bilingual dictionary also lacks example sentences, however, these can be found in the monolingual work.

This Bashkir–Russian dictionary represents a major contribution to the lexicographic corpus for the Turkic languages of the former Soviet Union, and convincingly demonstrates that Bashkir scholarly institutions are capable of producing works of first-class quality.

A.J.F.

### 6.3.B.c *Kazakh and Karakalpak Languages and Literatures*

■ QAIRATDINOV, Qiios, *Alpamysh (dostondan parchalar)* [Alpamysh (Fragments of the *Doston*)], preface by Tura Hoji Mirza, introduction by Faizulla M. Karomatli, Tashkent: San'at zhurnali tahririati, 1999, 256 p.

These fragments of the epics of Alpamysh have been extracted from the Karakalpak tradition, in which large passages of the text are still sung by one or two bards (*zhirau*) accompanying themselves on monoxylic hurdy-gurdy (*qobuz*). The version which has been transcribed here is that taped in 1965 by the famous bard Qiios Qairatdinov (1903–1974), on the initiative of M. Afzalov and K. Alimboeva. This bard was holding eight variations of this repertory. This one is the best, from the viewpoint of the text as well as from that of the method. The musical notation has been made by Suren Gabrielen and the Karakalpak text transcribed by Tura Hoji Mirza.

The introduction by F. Karomatli (pp. 21–24) gives some keys of the musical sys-

tem and of the musical performance, which includes two sections: the (melodic) cantillation and the (recitative) declamation. The fragments use 29 melodies, called *nama* (probably from the Persian *nāma*), each of which bears a distinct name: Zhoshli *namasī*, Nama basy, Qayīrīm *namasī*, Zhortoli *namasī*, etc. They are clearly different from the *namas* used by lyrical bards (*bakhi*) and some are mere melodic outlines intended for declamation. The transcription has been realized on computer and reproduces on two staves the line of the song and that of the instrument, as well as the text which can also be found at the end of the book. Such a transcription can be used only for a metric and musical analysis, not for performing, this tradition being essentially oral. J.D.

### 6.3.B.d Kyrgyz Language and Literature

■ JACQUESSON, Svetlana, "Un barde kirgiz mal connu, Chamīrkan uulu Kīlīch (1886-1917)," *CAC* 5-6 (1998): 221-258.

Perhaps is it a little bit excessive to call unknown Moldo Qīlīch, one of the most prominent representatives of the Kyrgyz oral tradition at the turn of the twentieth century, famous throughout Central Asia, and on whom there is an important bibliography, quoted in part in the present study. Of this paper, one will retain first a historical reminder of a great pedagogical clarity, in which one can however regret that Moldo Qīlīch's work has not been resituated in the context of contemporary Turkic oral traditions and literatures of the Russian Empire, of the Volga-Urals region and of Turkestan in particular, the influence of which is easily detectable in the intellectual production of the Kyrgyz bard. This asks the problem of the relationship between oral creation and literature in the steppe world during the colonial period — a question more eluded than really dealt with in the present paper. The most original contribution of this article is a very precise analysis of the ornithological vocabulary employed by Moldo Qīlīch in several of his poems. S.A.D.

### 6.3.C Chaghatay Group

#### 6.3.C.a Chaghatay Language and Literature

■ BOLTABOEV, Hamidulla, "Mir Alisher Navoi Fitrat talqinida [Mir 'Alī Shīr Nawā'ī in Fitrat's Comment]," *UTA* 1992/1: 13-21.

Written by one of the best Uzbekistani specialists of the intellectual history of Russian Turkestan in the first third of the twentieth century, this paper evokes the philological works on the fifteenth century court poet Nawā'ī by 'Abd al-Ra'uf Fitrat (1886-1938), a central figure of the Turkestani nationalist and modernist milieus, who used to see in the poet from Herat an embodiment of the Central Asian Turkic and Persian cultures. Alas, as in the two other studies devoted by the same journal to Fitrat's works on Nawā'ī (cf. Sodir ERKINOV, "Fitrat – navoiishunos," *UTA* 1990/3: 3-8; *ibid.*, "Fitratning 'Farhod va Shirin' dostoniga oid tadqiqoti haqida," *UTA* 1993/1: 52-57), the paper by

H. Boltaboev carefully avoids resituating Fitrat's philological comment in the very specific context of the political debates of the 1930s between the defenders of a supra-ethnic vision of the cultural history of Central Asia (led notably by Fitrat himself) and those who, with the support of ideologists from Moscow, advocated a vision of the past limited to the "national" boundaries created by the ethno-territorial division of Soviet Central Asia from 1924 onwards.

S.A.D.

- ZOHIDOV, N., "Muhiddin Muhammad Rizo Okhund Ughli Muhii," *UTA* 1994/3: 46-48.

This paper gives elements of biography on the Persian- and Chaghatay-language scholar and poet Muhī al-Dīn Muhammad Rizā Ākhūnd Ūghlī, *takhallus* Muhī (Qandahar, 1835 – Andijan, 1911-12), a central character of the literary and spiritual sociability of the Ferghana Valley during the colonial period, whose rich correspondence with numerous leading figures of the cultural countryside of Transoxiana only begins to be rediscovered.

S.A.D.

### 6.3.C.b *Uzbek Language and Literature*

- ABDURAHMONOV, Ghani, "Behbudii va uning hozirgi uzbek adabii tilining shaklanishdagi khizmati [Behbūdī and His Contribution to the Formation of Modern Literary Uzbek Language]," *UTA* 1995/3: 7-12.

The author evaluates the contribution by the man of letters from Samarqand Mahmūd Khwāja Behbūdī (1875-1919) to the linguistic renewal in Turkestan during the first two decades of the twentieth century – a period marked notably by the appearance of organizations of the civil society backed by a press published in a common Turkic language close to the Ottomanized Tatar language advocated by Gasprinskii, and then marked by a will of simplification of the literary language and of bringing together the regional dialects. The present study offers one of the first systematic analyses of the relation between the growing implication of the Muslim reformist circles in the elected political institutions of the Russian Empire (the State Duma in particular) and the shaping of literary languages capable of competing with the discourse held by conservative mulahs from their minbars.

S.A.D.

- BADRĪ, Abdullāh, "L'Idiot. Pièce en un acte," transl. from Central Asian Turkī and presented by Stéphane A. Dudoignon, *Anka* 22-23 (1994): 221-232.

This is the French translation of a comedy by the Turkestani publicist 'Abd-Allāh Badrī, printed in Samarqand in 1915. According to a classical scheme of the "Jadid" literature of the Turkic-speaking peoples of the Russian Empire, the text confronts the figure of an *īshān* (the local leader of a mystical order) with that of a modernist intellectual here represented by the chief redactor of a Muslim newspaper of Tashkent.

R.

- BARAKAEV, Rahmatulla, *XX asr boshlaridagi uzbek bolalar adabiioti va Abdulla Avlonii*

*izhodi* [Early Twentieth Century Uzbek Literature for Children and 'Abd-Allāh Awlānī's Work], abstract of doctorate candidate thesis, Tashkent: Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiasi, Alisher Navoiy nomli Adabiyot Instituti, 1994, 24 p.

This is an interesting study on the literary work written by the Jadid publicist of Tashkent 'Abd-Allāh Awlānī (1878-1934) for the reformed native schools of Russian Turkestan. See also, by the same author: "Uzbek bolalar adabiyoti qachon maidonga kelgan [When Did Appear the Uzbek Literature for Children?]," *UTA* 1995/3: 63-69.

S.A.D.

■ BEHBUDII, Mahmudkhuzha, *Tanlangan asarlar* [Selected Works], ed. and intro. Begali Qosimov, Tashkent: Ma'naviyat, 1997 (coll. Istiqlol qahramonlari [The Heroes of Independence]), 231 p., glossary.

A discoverer of the early twentieth century Turkic Jadid literature of Russian Turkestan, the Uzbekistani philologist Begali Qosimov offers us here a collection of Cyrillic transcriptions of literary works (the drama *Padarkush*, the short story *Āq yālpāghichlī*), of travel accounts and of leading articles in Uzbek language by the Persian- and Turkic-language polygraph of Samarqand Behbūdī (1875-1919). The collection is followed by the edition of funerary elegies published a first time after Behbūdī's execution in Qarshi, in a jail of the Emir of Bukhara, and by memories on him by three leading intellectual figures of the 1920s-1930s: one from Bukhara (Fitrat), one from Samarqand ('Aynī), and one from the Ferghana Valley (Chulpān). The whole set is preceded by an introduction in which the editor gives a detailed biography of Behbūdī, and insists notably on his activity as a publicist in Samarqand between the revolution of 1905 and his death.

S.A.D.

■ DOLIMOV, Ulughbeg, "Abdulla Avlonii, atoqli metodist olim ['Abd-Allāh Awlānī, a Famous Methodical Teacher]," in Shuhrat Rizaev, ed., *Millii uighonish va uzbek filologiyasi masalalari. Uzbek filologiyasi fakul'teti ilmiy kengashi (11.10.90) da tasdiqlandi*, Tashkent: Universitet, 1993: 40-50.

The author studies the way the literary work of Awlānī (1878-1934), a representative of the "new method" of Islamic teaching in Tashkent, the author of numerous textbooks for the teaching of the Arabic alphabet and of the Islamic ethics, as well as of literary chrestomathies in Turkic language, has been discussed in the Uzbek literary circles of the early Soviet period, and practised in the schools of the young Uzbek SSR until the end of the 1930s.

S.A.D.

■ DOLIMOV, Ulughbeg, *Ishoqkhon Ibrat* [Ishāq Khān 'Ibrat], Tashkent: Sharq, 1994 (Istiqlol fidoilari ["The Heroes of Independence"]), 140 p., glossary.

The author provides a biography of the reformist 'ālim, traveller and polygraph from the Ferghana Valley Ishāq Khān Tūra Khwāja Junayd-Allāh Īshān Ūghlī, *takhallus* 'Ibrat (1862-1937), which includes a description of the latter's main work, and is followed by a Cyrillic transcription of some of 'Ibrat's ghazals of the years 1907 to 1912.

S.A.D.

■ DUSQORAEV, Boibuta, "Fitratning dinii mavzudagi asarlari [Fitrat's Works on Religious Subjects]," in Shuhrat Rizaev, ed., *Millii uighonish va uzbek filologiyasi masalalari. Uzbek filologiyasi fakul'teti ilmiy kengashi (11.10.90) da tasdiqlandi*, Tashkent: Universitet, 1993: 51-64.

In this innovative analysis of a formerly much neglected aspect of the works of 'Abd al-Ra'uf Fitrat (1886-1938), a Bukharan publicist of the Jadid movement and a leading ideologist of the SPR of Bukhara from 1920 to 1923, one can observe how this author's religious themes have been evolving during the first years of the Soviet period — from the anti-colonialist discourse and the both socialist and pro-Wahhabi pan-Islamism of the revolutionary years 1919-1920, until the violent anti-clericalism of the late 1920s. This last tendency has for long been interpreted as Fitrat's adherence to a conformist form of atheism; it is resituated by the author of the present study in the context of the struggles of Central Asian reformists and modernists against the religious ritualism and social traditionalism of the *īshāns* (the local leaders of Muslim mystical orders).

S.A.D.

● FITRAT, Abdurauf, *Tanlangan asarlar* [Selected Works], 1-3, ed. and intro. Hamidulla Boltaboev, Tashkent: Ma'naviyat, 1-2: 2000, 3: 2004 (coll. Istiqloq qahramonlari [The Heroes of Independence]), 256 p., glossary; 208 p., glossary; 256 p., glossary.

Since the perestroika period, in Uzbek journals and newspapers appeared a number of works of Fitrat (1886-1938), one of the most famous Jadid intellectuals in Bukhara and Turkestan. The editor has been engaged in the discovery and publication of Fitrat's works for many years. These three volumes, being the result of his devotion, will contribute to studies in intellectual and literary history of modern Central Asia. The first volume contains poems, prose works such as the *Munāzara* and the *Bayānāt-i sayyāh-i hindī*, and plays. The second volume consists of scientific works regarding classical Turkic and Persian literature. The third volume is dedicated to plays such as *Hind Ihtilolchilari* and *Arslon*, socio-political reviews and open letters.

K.H.

■ IMOMOV, Berdiali, ZHURAEV, Qudrat, HAKIMOVA, Khatiba, *Uzbek dramaturgiyasi ta'rikhi* [The Uzbek Dramatic Art], Tashkent: Uqituvchi, 1995, 238 p.

This study focusing on the colonial and Soviet periods describes the particularities of modern theatre as it developed in Russian Turkestan from 1914 onwards (first performance of Behbūdī's "Parricide"), then in the Uzbek SSR. The author evokes the different theatrical genres, and sketches lines of continuity between the colonial and Soviet periods. (For a relatively recent study which includes an important chapter on pre-modern theatre and on the forerunners of Jadid drama in Turkestan, see the curiously entitled but well-documented work by Mamadzhan RAKHMANOV [Mamadjon RAHMONOV], *Uzbekskii teatr s drevneishikh vremen do 1917 goda* [Uzbek Theater, from Its Origins to 1917], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo literatury i iskusstva imeni Gafura Guliyama, 1981,



312 p.)

S.A.D.

■ ISMAILOV, Hamid, "National Consciousness and Uzbek Poetry (1920-1980)," in Ingeborg Baldauf & Michael Friederich, eds., *Bamberger Zentralasienstudien: Konferenzakten ESCAS IV: Bamberg 8.-12. Oktober 1991*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 185), 1994: 185-204, appendix 199-204.

The author follows the evolution of the Uzbek "national sentiment" through a period divided up into decades, and through poetical works dealing with this theme. His study focuses on the evolution of literary forms and of their investment by new meanings.

R.

● [JALIL] ZHALIL, Abdulla, ed., *Namangan Navolari. Baioz* [An anthology of Namangan's Literary Works], Namangan: Namangan Viloiat Noshirlik Bulimi, 1997, 232 p.

This anthology contains 75 entries, which compose a sort of official "who's who" of the 20th century Namangani intellectuals. Each entry consists of a short biography and few extracts of poets, novelists, dramatists and scholars born or living in the province of Namangan.

A.P.

■ [JALOLOV] ZHALOLOV, A., *XIX asr oxiri XX asr boshlaridagi uzbek adabiioti* [Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Century Uzbek Literature], Tashkent: Fan, 1991 (Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiasi, Alisher Navoiy nomidagi Adabiiot Instituti), 155 p.

This introduction to the history of modern Uzbek literature, the result of the destalinization of the history of ideas in Soviet Central Asia, denounces the Soviet vision of a deliberate Russification of the Central Asian modernist intelligentsias during the colonial period. In its field, this work can be considered the first one of a new historiography. It has the unquestionable merit of reconstructing the links between, on the first hand, the intellectual milieus of Bukhara, Samarqand, Kokand and Tashkent with, on the other hand, many Tatar, Azerbaijani and Ottoman reformist and modernist thinkers.

The author also proposes a summary description of Jadidism in Russian Turkestan.

S.A.D.

■ [JURAQULOV] ZHURAQULOV, Uzoq, *Fitratning tadqiqotchilik mahorati (Uzbek adabiiot tarikhiga oid tadqiqotlari misolida)* [Fitrat's Contribution to Research (About the Problem of Research on Uzbek Literature)], abstract of a thesis in philosophy, Tashkent: Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiasi, Alisher Navoiy nomidagi Til va adabiiot instituti, 1998, 26 p., Russian and English summaries.

The author of this dissertation has been interested in the evolution of the literary conceptions of the Bukharan modernist thinker 'Abd al-Ra'uf Fitrat (1886-1938), as well as in the role played by the latter in the debates of the 1920-30s in Samarqand, then the capital of the Uzbek SSR, on shape and content to be given to the new Uzbek and Tajik national literatures.

S.A.D.

- KARIMOV, Naim, "Hamza Hakimzoda Niiozii (1889-1929)," *UTA* 1992/1: 62-73.

In this short descriptive statement on some pre-Soviet literary poems and dramas by the Uzbek-language writer from the Ferghana Valley Hamza Hakimzāda Niyāzī (1889-1929), the author insists notably on the significance of its anti-colonial themes. This contribution must be resituated in the context of the harsh current debates, in Tashkent, on the apocryphal character of a certain amount of the works attributed until now to Hamza. S.A.D.

- KARIMOV, Naim, ed., *Chulponning badiii olami* [Chulpān's Imaginary World], Tashkent: Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiasining Fan nashrii, 1994, 131 p.

The rediscovery of the Uzbek-language Ferghanese writer ‘Abd al-Hamid Sulaymān (*takhallus* Chulpān, c. 1897-1938) is at its height in Tashkent. The publication of numerous critical studies goes with the re-edition of his works in verse and in prose (*cf. Iana oldim sozimni* [I Have Taken Back My Lute], eds. Naim Karimov & Sherali Turdiev, intro. Ozod Sharafiddinov, Tashkent: Ghafur Ghulom nomidagi Adabiiot va san‘at nashrii, 1991, 574 p.; *Asarlar* [Works], critical edition under the direction of Ozod Sharafiddinov, Tashkent: Ghafur Ghulom nomidagi Adabiiot va san‘at nashrii, two volumes published over the three announced, 1994, 448+472 p.). The present collection of studies is opened by a personal study by the philologist Naim Karimov on Chulpān's imaginary world ("Chulponning badiii olami," 3-57): on the basis of memories of contemporaries, the author reconstructs the very specific intellectual climate of the 1930s in the Uzbek SSR, through Chulpān's role in the intellectual sociability of Tashkent. Although deprived of a critical apparatus, this study makes of to this date one of the Chulpān's most complete biographies; it literally teems with information on the relations between the writer from Andijan and his milieu. This introductory paper is followed by articles by Salohiddin MAMAZHONOV on Chulpān's work in prose and dramas ("Chulponning nasrii va dramaturgik izhodi," 58-81, which is essentially a description of these works' content); by Shinel’ VLADIMIROVA on Chulpān as a short story writer ("Chulpon — hikoianavis," 97-114, a series of value judgments on the stylistic qualities of the studied texts); by Tat’iana LOBANOVA on the friendship between Chulpān and the Russian critic V. Ian ("Chulponning va V. Ian izhodii dustligi tarikhidan," 114-120); and by Sherali TURDIEV on the intellectual influence on Chulpān's work by figures as mutually different as the Turk Tevfik Fikret, the Indian Tagore, the Bashkir Ahmad Dhakī Walīdī [Zeki Velidi Togan] and various representatives of the Tatar intelligentsia in Tashkent ("Chulpon va adabii aloqalar," 120-130). S.A.D.

- KARIMOV, Naim, *Usmon Nosir. Haiotii lavhalar, huzhzhatlar, rivoiatlar* [‘Uthmān Nāsir: Sources, Documents and Memories on His Life], Tashkent: Sharq, 1993 (Istiqlol fidoilari), 206 p.

This work provides a detailed biography of the Uzbek poet ‘Uthmān Nāsir (1912-1944), from his education years to his arrest for nationalism in 1937 during the red terror. The work reconstructs the young poet's multiple personal links in the rich literary

milieu of Tashkent, in particular in the neo-Jadid circles which used to gather around the writers Chulpān and ‘Abd-Allāh Qādirī. The book offers so a significant contribution to our knowledge of a certain Uzbek counter-society during the two first decades of the Soviet period. In the aftermath of this work, the same author has published a volume on ‘Uthmān Nāsir's trial and on his captivity: *Usmon Nosirning sungi kunlari* [Uthmān Nāsir's Last Days], Tashkent: Sharq, 1994 (Istiqlol Fidoilari), 254 p.

S.A.D.

- KARIMOV, Naim, "Behbudii va zhadid adabiioti [Behbūdī and the Jadid Literature]," *UTA* 1995/3: 3-7.

Written by one of the main current discoverers in Tashkent of the literary works by early twentieth century Turkestani writers of the Jadid movement, this study evokes the significance of Behbūdī (1875-1919)'s journalistic and literary writings for the understanding of the appearance of a Persian and Uzbek didactical literature which would serve as a vehicle for the slogans launched by the Muslim reformist and modernist theoreticians. The author remembers the intellectual influences received by Behbūdī during his education and during his travels — notably to Egypt and Palestine in the very first years of the twentieth century (without a word, however, on Muhammad ‘Abduh and his teaching). One can deplore that nothing is said of the considerable influence of the Muslim press and literature of other regions of the Russian Empire, in particular of the Middle Volga region and of the Southern Caucasus, on the emergence of Behbūdī's work and of that of other contemporary authors from Samarqand and its region.

S.A.D.

- MAHMUD, Vadud, "Turk shoiri Azhzii [‘Ajzī, a Turkic Poet]," in Shuhrat Rizaev, ed., *Millii uighonish va uzbek filologiyasi masalalari. Uzbek filologiyasi fakul'teti ilmiy kengashi (11.10.90) da tasdiqlandi*, Tashkent: Universitet, 1993: 76-85.

This paper is the new edition in Cyrillic script of a paper already published in 1924 in the journal *Inqilāb* ["Revolution"] of Tashkent. In this paper, a Jadid publicist from Samarqand, ‘Ajzī (1865-1927), was introduced as a revived Chaghatay poetic tradition, a modernizer of Central Asian "Turki" language, and a poet of civic inspiration, whose work had contributed to the reinforcing of an "Islamic" community consciousness, opposed to the collective identity developed by the Russian-speaking colonists of Central Asia. This interesting text is representative of the rooting of cultural and political Jadidism in the learned milieus of Turkestan at the eve of the ethno-territorial division of Central Asia through the creation of the first national republics in 1924.

The general intellectual climate however quickly changed, from the mid-1920s onwards, which is shown for instance a text by the famous critic Rahīm Hāshim published a first time in 1928 and edited again in the present collection by U. Dolimov and Sh. Rizaev ("Siddiqii tughrisida mulohazalar," 86-93), in which ‘Ajzī is posthumously called "the poet of the Muslim trading bourgeoisie," whence Jadidism itself is condemned as a bourgeois nationalist and anti-Russian movement.

S.A.D.

- MAHMUDOV, Muhammadzhon, "Hozhi Muinning izhodii iuli [Hājji Mu'in's Creative Path]," *UTA* 1992/1: 49-54.

This paper is a rare and significant introduction of the published and manuscript works by Hājji Mu'in b. Shukr-Allāh Kattaqurghānī, *takhallus* Mihrī (1883-1938), a companion of Behbūdī's, the latter's translator into Uzbek language, and one of the main theoreticians of the reformed Islamic education in Samarqand, who had been totally forgotten by the Uzbekistani critique until his very recent and still very incomplete rediscovery.

S.A.D.

- [MAMAJONOV] MAMAZHONOV, Salohiddin, "Chulponning nasrii izhodi [Chulpān's Prose Work]," *UTA* 1992/6: 6-13.

This very substantial study of the prose work by the nationalist and modernist Ferghanese writer 'Abd al-Hamīd Sulaymān, *takhallus* Chulpān (c. 1897-1938) begins with a detailed reminder of his literary work of the colonial period — short stories deeply inspired by Behbūdī and by several early twentieth century Tatar-language authors. The author then deals with Chulpān's historical novel in two parts *Kecha va kunduz* ["Day and Night"], on the uprising of the summer 1916 in Russian Turkestan (the first part published in Tashkent in 1936, the second still unpublished and considered by many as lost). The author astutely insists on the multiple continuities of the two periods, colonial and Soviet, in Chulpān's work; he casts light in particular on the latter's Turkism and on his intellectual links with the Tatar world. S.M. also insists on the central place, in this work, of the colonial themes and of the defense of the rights of the "autochthonous" populations against the excesses of colonization, until the period of the red terror. This paper has been one of the first in post-Soviet Central Asia to underline the permanence, in Soviet Turkestan until the late 1930s, of a political Jadidism characterized by a local form of Turkism and by a strong and explicit anti-colonial mood.

S.A.D.

- [MAMAJONOV] MAMAZHONOV, Salohiddin, "Hamza va zhaidichilik asarlarning millii zhozibasi [Hamza and the National Temptation in His Jadid Works]," *UTA* 1995/3: 12-19.

The debates of the late 1980s on the personality and work of the Ferghanese polygraph Hamza Hakīmzāda Niyāzī had been concluded with a global questioning of his role (considered central by the Soviet Uzbek historiography) in the appearance of a modern political culture in Russian Turkestan. Some critics went so far as denying him the paternity of several major items of his personal bibliography (among which the famous drama "Master and Servant," which in 1988-9 was eliminated from the edition of Hamza's "Selected Works" in five volumes). A specialist of the early twentieth century intellectual milieus of the Ferghana Valley, the author proposes a first post-Soviet tentative rehabilitation of Hamza, also criticized then for his resounding conversion to Communism; S.M. notably shows the mainly anti-colonial character of Hamza's pre-revolutionary literary works, and resituates his adherence to the Bolshevik party in the context of an overall strategy of allegiance which was that of a significant part of the

young Muslim intelligentsia of this region after the Bolshevik repression of the Autonomy of Turkestan in February-March 1918. S.A.D.

- MAQSUDI, Iunus, *Ulughlar davrasida* [In the Time of Great Men], Tashkent: Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiasi Fan Nashrioti, 1994.

A work of a considerable interest on the intellectual sociability in the Uzbek SSR (in Tashkent in particular) in the early 1930s, these memories by a disciple of the neo-Jadid publicist and writer 'Abd-Allāh Qādirī allow us to better assess the significance of the legacy of Islamic reformism in the Central Asian counter-society until the launching of the main waves of the red terror in 1937. See also by the same author and on the same subject: *Khazon bulgan taqdirlar* (A. Qodirī va dustlari haqida xotiralar) [Interrupted Destinies: Memoirs on 'Abd-Allāh Qādirī and His Fellows], Tashkent: Abdulla Qodirī nomidagi xalq merosi nashrioti, 1995. S.A.D.

- MIRVALIEV, S., *Uzbek adiblari: ikhcham adabii portretlar* [Uzbek Literati: Miniature Literary Portraits], Tashkent: Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiasi Fan nashrioti, 1993, 247 p.

This book contains a collection of about one hundred short biographies of twentieth century Uzbekistani men and women of letters, from the last representatives of Jadidism until authors born in the mid-1950s. The work is a practical tool, in spite of the lack of an even summary bibliography, for a geographical and historical approach of the Uzbekistani literary milieus during the whole Soviet period. S.A.D.

- NORMATOV, Umarali, "Abdulla Qodirī (1894-1938)," *UTA* 1992/2: 40-57.

This paper gives an innovative study on the neo-Jadid Uzbek writer 'Abd-Allāh Qādirī, less well-known under his pen name Julqunbāy, introduced for long in the Soviet Uzbek encyclopedias as the founding father of contemporary Uzbek literature. Qādirī's links with Islamic reform in general and, in particular, with the religious reformist circles of Tashkent until his arrest in 1937 are more and more often underlined by the critique. See also another study by the same author on the political grounds of the novel *Ūtgān kūnlar*, published in the early Soviet period but which expresses its author's nostalgia for an independence struggle symbolized by the "seasonal workers' uprising" on the summer 1916: "Istiqlol qaighusi (Utgan kunlarning ma'no va badiiat zhilollari)," *Shlu* 1993/2: 175-184. S.A.D.

- ÖZBAY, Hüseyin, QAHHAR, Tahir, eds., *Günümüz Özbek şairleri antolojisi* [Anthology of Uzbek Poets of Our Time], Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı Yayınları, 1995, 310 p.

In his introductory chapter on the history of Uzbek poetry in the 1930s, Tohir Qahhor tries to rehabilitate the authors of this period, who according to him have been erroneously considered obedient servants of the Communist regime. As a proof of his assertion, the author remembers the insistence of figures like Hamid Olimjon and Oybek on the permanence of an "Uzbek patriotism," for instance in their respective historical nov-

els *Navoyi* and *Tabari*, conceived in the 1940-60s. Qahhor affirms moreover that the only party which acted during the Soviet period in favor of the independence of Uzbekistan is "the party of poetry." He draws a surprising line of continuity between the struggle held by Chulpān and Fitrat in the 1930s and the production, twenty years later, of authors like Erkin Vohidov, Abdullah Aripov or Rauf Parfi. Each author of the anthology is introduced in a short biographical notice, followed by a selection of three to seven poems. Paradoxically if we take into account this work's initial postulates, most of the selected texts are mere occasional poetry. In a book published outside Uzbekistan, one would have awaited more room for less conformist authors, some of whom are well known in their country even if they have been obliged to leave for exile. Besides, we must deplore the inaccuracy of the Latin transcription of the selected texts (the editors have curiously mixed the Turkish orthography with the Latin alphabet now practiced in Uzbekistan). B.B.

- QODIRII, Sherkon, ed., *Qodirii qumsab. Iodnoma* [Missing Qādirī. Memorial Book], Tashkent: Abdulla Qodirii nomidagi xalq merosi nashrioti, 1994, 78 p.

In this collection of articles of memories on the Uzbek writer 'Abd-Allāh Qādirī (1894-1938), by his parents or by heirs of members of his personal circle, we can notice in particular memories by the former Mufti of Central Asia and Kazakhstan Ziiouddinkhon BOBOKHON ("Zubdatul kuttob," 60-65) on his conversations with Qādirī at the time of his madrasa studies, and on the religious *majlises* organized by the writer in his house in Tashkent during the Stalinist period. These evocations partly match up with those by another regular visitor of Qādirī's house, who had emigrated from Uzbekistan in the early 1930s: cf. Iunus MAQSUDII, "Ulughlar davrasida [In the Time of Great Men]," *Sharq iulduzi* 1990/4: 188-196; *ibid.*, "Qodirii, Chulpon va boshqalar [Qādirī, Chulpān, and the Others]," *ibid.* 1992/12: 166-173 (and our review of these papers in the present volume). S.A.D.

- QODIROVA, M., *Shoira Muazzamkhon* [The Poetess Mu'azzam Khān], Tashkent: Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiyasi Fan nashrioti, 1992, 72 p.

This short monograph on Mu'azzam Khān, a learned woman from Khujand at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, includes some thirty pages of extracts of her works in Central Asian Turki, in a Cyrillic transcription. They constitute an important document on early modern learned women and poetesses of Transoxiana, who were until recently known only through a little amount of better known and documented figures, such as Dilshād and 'Anbar Ātūn. S.A.D.

- QODIROVA, Mahbuba, *Uzbek shoiralari baiiozi. Uvaisii – Nodira* [An anthology of Uzbek Woman Poets. Uwaysī – Nādira], Tashkent: Fan nashrioti, 1993, 250 p.

In the poorly known tradition of feminine poetry in Central Asia (this issue is the first of a series on the "Anthology of Uzbek Woman Poets"), Jahān Ātūn Uwaysī (1780-1845) and Mahlarā'im Nādira (1792-1842) are the most famous names beside Dilshād

or 'Anbar Ātūn. The author gives a bio-bibliographical introduction to the two Ferghanese poets and a transcription in Cyrillic of their *ghazals*, *mukhammases*, *musaddases*, etc. written in Chaghatay Turkic mostly and in Tajik-Persian. From a formal point of view, and against an idealistic vision which would seek to find a 'feminine touch,' one could consider this poetry as a classicist genre. The author has published in 1992 an edition of Muazzamkhon: see above M. Qodirova. A.P.

■ [QOSIMOV] KASYMOV, Begali, *Revoliutsiia i literatura: zarozhdenie i razvitie uzbekskoi revoliutsionnoi poezii, 1905-1917 gg.* [Revolution and Literature: Birth and Development of the Uzbek Revolutionary Poetry, 1905-1917], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo Fan Akademii nauk Respubliki Uzbekistan, 1991.

This important monograph is devoted to the literary expressions of a national sentiment in Turkestan during the so-called "uprising of the seasonal workers" in the summer of 1916. This study, written by one of the best Uzbekistani specialists of the literary expressions of the Jadid movement, is all the more significant since from WWI onwards and the restoration of a harsh censorship in the Russian Empire, classical poetry and its specific codes became the unique field in which Turkestani literati could express a non-Russian community identity. A condensed version of this book can be found in a paper later published by the same author: "Sources littéraires et principaux traits distinctifs du djadidisme turkestanais (début du 20e siècle)," *CMR* 37/1-2 (1996): 107-132.

S.A.D.

■ QOSIMOV, Begali, *Maslakdoshlar: Behbudii, Azhzi, Fitrat* [Companions of Idea: Behbūdī, 'Ajzī, Fitrat], Tashkent: Sharq, 1994 (Istiqlol fidoilari), 155 p.

The book gathers three distinct studies: on the Samarqandi polygraphs 'Ajzī (1865-1927) and Behbūdī (1875-1919), and on a leader of the Young Bukharan movement, Fitrat (1886-1938). The author's excellent knowledge of these figures' respective literary works has been enriched by his field inquiries, which reveal a part of the collective memory of Jadidism as it has been preserved until a recent date in certain Uzbekistani literary milieus. The book is a meaningful document on the rediscovery of Jadidism in Central Asia from the late 1980s onwards.

S.A.D.

■ QUHQORTOEV, Iristoi, "Siddiqi-Azhzi asarlarining tili haqida [About the Language of Siddiqi-'Ajzī's Works]," in Shuhrat Rizaev, ed., *Millii uighonish va uzbek filologiyasi masalalari. Uzbek filologiyasi fakul'teti ilmiy kengashi (11.10.90) da tasdiqlandi*, Tashkent: Universitet, 1993: 8-12.

The modernization of Central Asian Turki language, forerunner of contemporary Uzbek, through its return to its Chaghatay roots (a position inspired by the theories launched by a prominent Turkish historian of culture, Fuat Köprülüzade) was a major stake of the inner debates of the Jadid movement in Turkestan during the first third of the twentieth century. This point is illustrated here through lexical borrowings from classical poetry in Chaghatay by a polygraph from Samarqand — 'Ajzī (1865-1927), a

mainly Persian-language author — in his poetical works in Turki.

S.A.D.

■ RIZAEV, Sh., ed., *Millii uighonish va uzbek filologiyasi masalalari. Uzbek filologiyasi fakul'teti ilmi kengashi (11.10.90) da tasdiqlandi* [National Awakening and Questions of Uzbek Philology. Proceedings of the Congress of the Faculty of Uzbek Philology, October 11, 1990], Tashkent: Universitet, 1993, 128 p.

In Central Asia the role of philologists has been and remains determining in the recent, lengthy and gradual rediscovery of the literary heritage of Islamic reform. The present collection of papers is devoted mainly to the analysis of the work of three prominent representatives of the Jadid movement in Russian Turkestan in the first three decades of the twentieth century: Sayyid Ahmad Khwāja Siddīqī, *takhallus* 'Ajzī (1865-1927) in Samarqand (cf. V. MAHMUD, I. QUHQORTOEV, Sh. RIZAEV, and the separate reviews of these papers); 'Abd-Allāh Awlānī (1878-1934) in Tashkent (cf. A. Avlonii [Awlānī], U. DOLIMOV, see the separate review of this paper); and 'Abd al-Ra'uf Fitrat (1886-1938) in Bukhara (cf. B. DUSQORAEV, see the separate review of this paper). The book is closed by the publication in Cyrillic script of a paper by the Turkestan polygraph Hājji Mu'in b. Shukr-Allāh on the circumstances of the arrest and of the execution of the Samarqandi mufti and publicist Behbūdī in Qarshi in 1919 ("Mufti Mahmud-khuzha hazratlarining qandai shahid bulgonligi va oning tomonidan iozilgan vasiyatnoma," ed. J. KHUDOIBERDIEV, 124-127).

S.A.D.

■ RIZAEV, Shuhrat, "Millat va maorif fidoiisi: Ajzii haioti [A Fighter of the Nation and Education: The Life of 'Ajzī]," in Shuhrat Rizaev, ed., *Millii uighonish va uzbek filologiyasi masalalari. Uzbek filologiyasi fakul'teti ilmi kengashi (11.10.90) da tasdiqlandi*, Tashkent: Universitet, 1993: 65-69.

This short paper deals with the intellectual relations and exchanges of the Samarqandi publicist Hājji Sayyid Ahmad Khwāja, *takhallus* 'Ajzī (1865-1927) with the Southern Caucasian poet Sābir and publicist Jelil Memmedgulūzāde. The latter published numerous papers by 'Ajzī in his famous newspaper *Mullā Nasr al-Dīn* and in 1912 and 1913 he edited his two *dāstāns*: *Anjuman-i arwāh* and *Mir'āt-i 'ibrat* (edited here in Cyrillic script by J. Khudoiberdiev, pp. 96-103).

S.A.D.

■ RIZAEV, Shuhrat, *Zhadid dramasi: shaklanish davri, manbalari, xususiiatlari. Risola va matnlar* [Jadid Theater: Its Formation, Sources, and Specificities. Studies and Texts], Tashkent: "Sharq" nashriiot-matbaa kontsernining bosh tahrirriati, 1997, 320 p.

In Uzbekistan, the recent historiography of Jadidism and of early twentieth century vernacular Turkic or Persian modernist literature has been characterized by a large amount of text editions and other documentary discoveries. Since the mid-1990s, however, this historiography has been confined in the ideological framework of an ideology of national independence, which has been tending to reduce the national past to an alternation of state constructions (from Tamerlane to Islom Karimov) and periods of recovery of lost sovereignty (as during the colonial period). For this reason one should rejoice of



the more and more sporadic publication of works which bring a genuine contribution to our knowledge of the abundant literature published during the 1910s in the southern regions of Russian Turkestan. Such is the case of the present work, which contains an original study of the role of modern theater in the propagation of new imported ideas between Samarqand and the Ferghana Valley. Very well documented, notably by the author's reading of the early twentieth century Muslim press of Turkestan, this study is enriched by an edition in Cyrillic transcription of eight short dramas by Behbūdī, Nusrat-Allāh Qudrat-Allāh, 'Abd-Allāh Qādirī, 'Abd-Allāh Badrī and Hājji Mu'īn b. Shukr-Allāh. Moreover the Sharq Publishing House of Tashkent has made a particular effort for offering the Uzbekistani readership a respectable print run of 10,000 copies, firmly bound and of a pleasant look, which cuts off with the usual poor quality of non-subsidized publications in Central Asia.

From the viewpoint of the content, one can deplore the omission of a figure as important as that of the polygraph and playwright Hamza Hakīmzāda Niyāzī (d. 1929), whose work has proved for long partly apocryphal. However Hamza's now concerted relegation in oblivion, because of his conversion to Bolshevism in 1917, suggests that the habits of the Uzbekistani intelligentsia have not changed very much since the end of the Soviet period: people have satisfied themselves with a modification of ideological priorities and taboos, without touching practices. Beside this lack of any nuance in the selections which are operated nowadays in a definitely problematic literary "patri-mony" (*mīrāth*), we must also deplore that the history of Central Asian modern literatures is now being written on a strictly national basis, in the framework of the political boundaries created from 1924 onwards and still in force today, with no big interest in the exchanges with the literatures very close by their language and their spirit, which were produced at the same time or slightly earlier in other regions of Turkestan, in the Caucasus or in the Volga-Urals region of Russia. So much anachronistic insistence on the "Uzbekness" of the Jadid literature written in Samarqand or in Tashkent in the early twentieth century will durably prevent the Uzbekistani readership from understanding the intensity of the exchanges between the cities of Turkestan and the centres of learned Islamic culture in the Volga-Urals region of Russia, of the Southern Caucasus, and also of the Ottoman Empire or Egypt. Focusing on exclusively literary sources of Islamic reform, by fear of any comparison between Central Asian Jadidism and contemporary "fundamentalism," and limiting the rediscoveries of these sources to the national boundaries and languages inherited from the Soviet period are two of the main obstacles which hamper now a complete rediscovery of the still very poorly known vernacular reform and modernization movements which took place in Central Asia between the late eighteenth and the early twentieth century. S.A.D.

■ SHARAFIDDINOV, Ozod, *Mustafo Chuqai, Chulpon, Otazhon Hoshim*, Tashkent: Sharq, 1993 (Istiqlol fidoilari), 138 p.

The book contains three distinct monographic studies, by a renowned philologist from Tashkent, on mutually different figures of the Turkestani national movement of the

1910s. The first paper is devoted to the publicist and political activist Mustafā Chuqāy (1890-1941), whose biography is summarily sketched on the basis of his own memoirs. The author has been trying to show Chuqāy's refusal of any collaboration with the Nazis during his stay in Berlin in the very last years of his life. O.Sh. is more at ease with the Ferghanese author 'Abd al-Hamīd Sulaymān, *takhallus* Chulpān (c. 1897-1938), to whom he has elsewhere devoted several studies, and whose accessible texts he has for the most part personally published in Cyrillic transcriptions. The present paper is on the promotion by Chulpān of a specifically Turkestani literature and language at the turn of the colonial and of the Soviet periods. The third and last article of the volume gives a statement on the life and work of a now very much controversial figure of modern Uzbek literary history, the Uzbek critique Ātajān Hāshim (1905-1938), a protagonist of the purges inside Uzbek intelligentsia in the mid-1930s, until his own arrest and execution in a later wave of the same purges. S.A.D.

- SHARAFIDDINOV, Ozod, *Chulponni anglash* [Understanding Chulpān], Tashkent: Iozuvchi nashrioti, 1994, 47 p.

This iconoclastic booklet by a well-known Uzbekistani philologist gives a statement on the behavior of various segments of the intelligentsia of Samarqand and Tashkent towards the Ferghanese nationalist and modernist writer Chulpān, between the launching of the first press campaigns against him in the mid-1920s to the main wave of the red terror in 1937. The author provides a captivating analysis of the intellectual sociability in Tashkent during the terror years, with a special interest in the role of the literary circles which used to gather around Chulpān himself, and the writer 'Abd-Allāh Qādirī. S.A.D.

- TURDIEV, Sherali, "Sud'ba Utrennei Zvezdy: Chulpan v uzbekskoi kritike [The Destiny of the Morning Star: Chulpān in the Uzbek Critic]," *ZV* 1991/10: 80-85.

The paper casts light on the inner division of the critics, in the Uzbek SSR from the mid-1920s to 1937, between on the first hand the defenders of the Proletkul't and Socialist Realism, and on the other hand the literary heirs of Jadidism and of Turkestani or Bukharan nationalism — who were led among others by the Ferghanese writer Chulpān. S.A.D.

- TURDIEV, Sherali, "Abdulla Qodirī va tatar adabiioti ['Abd-Allāh Qādirī and Tatar Literature]," *UTA* 1994/4-5-6: 32-38.

Through the key figure of the novelist 'Abd-Allāh Qādirī (1894-1938), the author reconstructs the particularly intense exchanges between the intellectual circles of Tashkent and those of the Volga-Urals region of Russia at the end of the Czarist period — relations which were continued in the early Soviet period thanks to the close links between the neo-Jadid Uzbek intelligentsia and the significant Tatar community of Tashkent.

See also, by the same author: "Chulpon va tatar adabiioti [Chulpān and Tatar

Literature],” *UTA* 1997/4: 10-13. In this study the author deals with the influence of the early twentieth century Turkic modernist literature published in the main urban centres of the Volga-Urals region on the genesis and evolution of the literary work of the Ferghanese writer ‘Abd al-Hamīd Sulaymān, *takhallus* Chulpān (c. 1897-1938). This important contribution on the influence of the “Muslim” literature of Russia on the learned circles of Turkestan unfortunately ignores the role of Tatar literature as a mediator of Russian literature in general, and as a mediator of the Populist movement (*narodnichestvo*) in particular — which had both a determining influence on Chulpān’s intellectual evolution. S.A.D.

- TURSUNOV, Islomzhon, ISHOQOV, Haidarali, “Tilshunos olim fozhiasi [The Tragedy of a Linguist],” *Shlu* 1992/1: 203-206.

This paper offers elements of biography on Ghāzī ‘Ālim Yūnusov (1893-1937), a scholar and writer with an itinerary in some way typical of the national intelligentsia of the Uzbek SSR. Coming from a learned family of Tashkent, Ghāzī ‘Ālim studied in madrasas before going to Cairo, from where he came back in 1924 entering as an adviser into the Ministry of Instruction of the newly created Uzbek SSR. He then became a leading figure of the reformist and nationalist circles of Samarqand, which were to be rapidly decimated by the successive purge campaigns launched by the Soviet regime. One can deplore that the author evokes only in passing Ghāzī ‘Ālim’s study years, in Egypt in particular, and that he does not show very forthcoming about his ideological positions during the harsh debates of the 1920s on national languages and on the adoption of the Latin alphabet for writing Uzbek language.

On this figure see also: UMURZOQOV, Ghafur, “Ghozii Yunus va uning ‘Zahhoki Moron’ asari [Ghāzī Yūnus and His Work *Zahhāk and the Snakes*],” *UTA* 1994/3: 42-46, in which the author gives a summary introduction to Ghāzī Yūnus’s satirical drama *Zahhāk va Temīrchī Kāva* (“Zahhāk and Kāva the Blacksmith”), and to the polemics raised by the newspaper *Ishtirākiyūn* after the play’s first performance in September 1919. S.A.D.

- VYDRIN, Andrei, “Fitrat, Polivanov, Stalin i drugie: iazykovaia politika v Uzbekistane [Fitrat, Polivanov, Stalin and Others: The Language Policy in Uzbekistan],” *ZV* 1994/5-6: 150-172.

This is a general introduction to the role played by the Russian linguist Evgenii D. Polivanov in the polemics of the 1920s on the reform of the Arabic alphabet (led by Fitrat), then on the adoption of the Latin alphabet and last of that of the Cyrillic alphabet, successively advocated by Polivanov and imposed on the vernacular learned circles of the Uzbek SSR. S.A.D.

### 6.3.C.c Modern Uighur Language and Literature

- ABDUREHIM, Kerimjan, *Bügünki Zaman Uyghur Ädäbiyati Lughiti* [Dictionary of Contem-

porary Uyghur Literature], Kashgar: Qāshqār Uyghur nāshriyati, 1998, 551 p.

The first and main part of the book consists of a long alphabetic list of Uighur authors born during the 20th century. This inventory presents various portraits: pure writers like Nimshehit (1906-1972), one of the figures of revolutionary epic poetry, Zunnun Qadiri (1912-1989), the chief dramatist of the 1930s, Muhämmät Baghrash (1952-), a novelist of the post-revolutionary generation; few academics including Abdukerim Rahman (1941-) who has published major studies about classical, popular and traditional literature; and polygraph intellectuals such as Abdurehim Ötkür (1923-1995), poet, novelist and scholar, as well Abdukerim Khoja (1928-1988), poet, translator and journalist. The numerous names selected by the author show an intellectual milieu – at least a part of – and aspects of cultural life in Xinjiang all a century long. The third part of the book describing institutions and edition (publishing house, scientific journals, press since 1910) indicates briefly but interestingly the media structure of that cultural activity. For a comparison with Uighur literary history in Kazakhstan, see below Sadvaqasov.

A.P.

■ BELLER-HANN, Ildiko, *The Written and the Spoken. Literacy and Oral Transmission among the Uyghur*, Berlin: Das Arabische Buch, 2000 (ANOR: 8), 102 p., bibliography.

The present booklet proposes new paths for the comparative study of the modes of oral and written transmission of knowledge, in this case among the Uighur society of Xinjiang during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. On the basis of extremely diverse sources, the author casts light, through an anthropological approach, on the specific interactions between these two forms of transmission at the turn of the twentieth century. Her analysis allows her to assert that in spite of the then very high rate of illiteracy, the bulk of the population had access to the learned culture thanks to the latter's intense oral diffusion. An important chapter has been devoted to traditional Islamic education in Eastern Turkestan and to the first tentative reforms of the educational system which appeared there at the turn of the twentieth century. Based on a substantial field work, the last part of the work deals with the present period. The author has observed that in spite of the progress of alphabetization, oral transmission still keeps a very significant role, in urban as well as in rural milieus. One may no doubt regret that the historical chapters (in particular that on the *mäktäbs* and *mädräsäs*) have been written for the most part on the basis of modern studies, despite the existence of numerous contemporary sources of various kinds in Uighur and other Turkic languages of Xinjiang. However, the author's personal observations give her work a great value, notably on the contradictory effects of the Han colonization of Xinjiang — which encourage the withdrawal into oneself of the Uighurs, but also a reactivation of the traditional modes of transmission of learning.

S.A.D.

● JAMALDINOV, Oktiabr', ed., *Uyghur Khäliq Qoshaqliri* [The Uighur Singing Poems], Almaty: Zhazushy nāshriati, 1988, 190 p.

A pleasant selection of Kazakhstan's Uighur singing poetry extracted from materials

collected by Uighur (unmentioned) and Russian (N.F. Katanov, S.E. Malov, N.N. Pantusov) scholars. In addition to the lyrical ones, the author provides a few interesting pieces of singing poetry of the Soviet period and some about nineteenth-century historic figures of Kashgharia. A.P.

- NIZARI, Abdurehim, *Nizari Lirikliri* [The Lyric Poems of Nizari], ed. Mähämmättursun Bahawidin, Urumchi: Shinjang Khäliq nāshriyati, 1995, 126 p.

Among this recent collection of Xinjiang Uighur literature classics (it should publish 30 items) usually existing only in manuscript or lithographic forms, here is a choice of *mukhammas*es quoted from the *Zād al-Nijāt* of the prolific poet ‘Abd al-Rahīm Nizārī (1776-1850) inspired by ‘Alī Shīr Nawā’ī in conformity with an ordinary practice in Turko-Persian literatures. M. Bahawidin has edited the text from two manuscripts, one from the Museum of the Uighur Autonomous Region and the other from the Oriental Institute of St. Petersburg. A.P.

- SADVAQASOV, Gh., ed., *Uyghur Soviet Ädäbiyatining Tarikhi* [History of Soviet Uighur Literature], Almaty: Nauka nāshriyati, 1986, 326 p.

The book alternates biographies of writers and short historical monographs in a chronological order, supposedly progressive and according to a firm official version. Diffused at the beginning by journals (*Kambaghallar Avazi* and *Qutulush* mainly), the first realistic stories, composed by Ömer Muhämmädii (1906-1931), are published in 1927. The author suggests that orientations then given by the Central Committee of the Communist Party of Kazakhstan convened in 1932 and 1933 ushers in a new epoch. The more convincing argument about the influence of Maiakovskii on greater Uighur poets (also on Tajik poets, see in particular Payraw Sulaymani, *Ash‘ori muntakhab*, 1959, Nashriiot-i davlatii Tojikiston, Stalinabad [Dushanbe]) such as Nur Israilov (1910-1953) or Ismaili Sattarov (1916-1944) is rightly stated, but not analysed in stylistic terms, unfortunately. At last the 60-70s period is the most expanded one due to the increase of fiction initiated by groups of writers like "Dostluq," "Iatta iilliqning izi bilän," "Jutmas izlar," also by several literary tenets created by chief authors (Ziia Sämädii and Jamal Bosaqov for example). A.P.

- ZAYIDI, Mahmut, AKBAR, Mahmut, TÖMÜRI, Ismayil, *Abdukhalıq Uyghur sheirliri* [The Poems of Abdukhalıq Uighur], Urumchi: Shinjang Khäliq nāshriyati, 1995 (first ed. 1986), 100 p.

The three authors present a critical edition and a new analysis of famous poems by Abdukhalıq Uighur (1901-executed in 1933). Concerned by and active in social events (the 1932 and 1933 peasant riots in Turfan and Qumul), attentive to the new ideas spread from Soviet Russia after his travels there in 1916 and 1923, Abdukhalıq is described as a realistic writer radically opposed to the classical Uighur literary patterns. His style, according to the argument of the authors, owes its originality to foreign influences. However, the continuity of prosodic features belonging to the classical poetry is

obvious in Abdukhalīq's verses, and the young poet is still strongly influenced by a Chaghatay Turkic tradition and far less by nineteenth-century Chinese or Russian literatures. The literary challenge of Abdukhalīq seems more situated *within* his own tradition and as opposed to it inherently. A.P.

### 6.3.D Oghuz Group

#### 6.3.D.a Azeri Language and Literature

■ AKHUNDZADEH, Fath'ali, *Mirza Fath'ali Akhundzadeh, Literary Critic: A Collection of Essays*, transl. with an introduction by Iraj Parsinejad, Piedmont, CA: Jahan Book Company, 1988, 73 p.

Akhundzadeh was the first major literary critic and theoretician of modern times writing in the Persian language. His many essays, epistles, prefaces and other writings remain monuments of an untiring effort to introduce European concepts and methods of literary analysis and evaluation to the Iranian society of the second half of the nineteenth century. In this little book, the translator has presented a representative sampling of Akhundzadeh's writings on literature and literary criticism in English. Problems of terminology, literary categories and esoteric allusions not readily understandable to the English reader interfere, as do other problems of un-annotated translation. Nevertheless, the book takes a much-needed first step in attracting attention to the views and ideas of a man without whom the history of modern Persian literature would doubtless have been very different. A.K.-H.

■ BERENGIAN, Sakina, *Azeri and Persian Literary Works in Twentieth Century Iranian Azerbaijan*, Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag, 1988 (Islamkundliche Untersuchungen: 124), x-328 p.

Iran offers a pluri-cultural literary field of a great interest for historians of literature. Politically, socially, culturally, Iranian Azerbaijan has played a major role in the evolution of this country in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. At that time Azerbaijan was constantly in the forefront of all movements. It is not a pure coincidence if the two first great names of modern Persian prose — 'Abd al-Rahīm Tāliboff and Zayn al-'Ābidīn Marāghe'ī — have their origins there. The author provides a very original study, based on a general vision of the two literatures — Persian and Azerbaijani Turkish — in a common cultural area, through authors who have often written in the two languages. After a short introduction to the classical period, the author deals with the constitutional period with the two above-mentioned writers. Then she devotes two chapters to the constitutional period (1906 to 1925), which is dealt with under its most varied aspects: the influences, the press, the literary renewal, poetry, prose, satire... She then studies the period of Reza Shah (1925-1941) with Parvīn E'tesāmī, Q.A. Radī, K. Rajavī, A.A. Harīrī and M.-H. Shahriyār. Then she focuses on the crucial period of the Autonomous Republic (1941-1946) with a study of the influ-

ence of Soviet ideology through poetry and prose. She ends her work with a series of notes on the period after 1946, and devotes several pages to Azerbaijani folklore. The reader can find at the end of the book an exhaustive bibliography on the subject (in Persian, Azerbaijani Turkish and European languages). Ch.B.

- DZHAVADOV, G. D., "Obychai vzaimopomoshchi u azerbaidzhantsev v XIX-nachale XX v. [The Custom of Mutual Assistance among the Azerbaijanis in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries]," *SE* 1986/5: 99-104.

The author provides a linguistic study of the specific expressions of the tradition of mutual assistance in the Azerbaijani rural world in the nineteenth century and until the 1930s. The interest of this paper lies in the enumeration of the dialectal variants for the designation of different kinds of association (animal and/or human strength, working tools, etc.), the methods of their implementation, their duration and realization according to the varied studied regions and to the participants' social level. C.P.

- GEMALMAZ, Efrasiyap, *Azeri Türkçesi Lügatı* [Dictionary of Azeri Turkish], Erzurum: Atatürk Üniversitesi Fen-Edebiyat Fakültesi, 1986, 267 p.

This dictionary does not give the Arabic nor Cyrillic orthography of Azerbaijani words, and uses the Latin characters in use in the Turkish Republic. It remains however a very useful working tool. T.Z.

- GEMALMAZ, Efrasiyap, *Çağdaş Azeri Türkçesi Metinleri Antolojisi* [Anthology of Contemporary Azeri Turkish Texts], Erzurum: Atatürk Üniversitesi Fen-Edebiyat Fakültesi, 1986, XLV-171 p.

The author is known through his doctorate dissertation on the dialects of the region of Erzurum (*Erzurum İli Ağızları*, Erzurum, 1978, 3 vols.). He provides us in the present work a significant number of Southern as well as Northern Azerbaijani texts. Intended for students and researchers, this anthology provides a wide choice of poetic, narrative and scientific texts published in their respective original alphabets: Arabic, Latin (in use from 1926 and 1939), Cyrillic. Before the texts the author has provided a grammatical introduction (IX to XLV). Among the authors whose texts have been published in the book, let's mention Sabir, Hüseyin Shahriyar, B.Q. Sahand, Hüseyin Javid, Sämäd Vurgun, Rasul Reza, Alaja Vahid, Bakhtiyar Vahadzada, Näbi Hüzri, Mirza Fäthäli Akhundov, H.M. Zärdabi, Jälil Mähämmädguluzadä, Abdulla Shaij, Jäfar Jabbarli, Kämäl Talibzadä, Ä. Säfärlä, Dr. Jävad Häy'ät, etc. T.Z.

- PAYFÜN, Mohammad, *Farhang-e ādharbāyyānī-fārsī* [Azerbaijani-Persian Dictionary], Tehran: Dāneshpāye, 1361/1983, 535 p.

This dictionary is divided into three parts: an Azerbaijani-Persian dictionary properly said (pp. 9-372); a table of place names in Arabic characters with, in front, their orthography in Cyrillic script (pp. 375-381); a table which gives the Cyrillic orthography of the dictionary's words (pp. 384-535). T.Z.

### 6.3.D.b Turkmen Language and Literature

■ FRANK, Allen J., TOUCH-WERNER (TACHMOURADOVA) Jeren, *Turkmen-English Dictionary*, Kensington, MD: Dunwoody Press, 1999, xii-710 p.

Very carefully and beautifully published, this very clear and accessible dictionary introduces for each Turkmen word noted in Cyrillic alphabet its main possible English translations, each of which is followed by an example borrowed from a Turkmen text, also translated into English. Given the fluctuation of the policies successively adopted in present-day Turkmenistan during the twentieth century for the writing of the national language, the reader may deplore the absence of a table of concordance between the Arabic orthography, the Latin orthography of the 1930s, the Cyrillic orthography, and the Latin orthography adopted in the 1990s. However, the main criticism that can be formulated about the present work is that it deals with the lexical patrimony of the former Turkmen SSR, with no opening toward Turkmen language as it is practiced in Iran or in Afghanistan — even if the latter is essentially linked with oral culture. We must nevertheless rejoice ourselves of the living character of the studied lexical corpus, which has been collected by the authors in the most varied publications published in Turkmenistan since its independence in 1991. From this viewpoint, the present work offers a captivating original document on the present state of the Turkmen language as it is practiced nowadays in the official culture north of the Atrek River. S.A.D.

■ [MASHAEVA] MAŠAEVA, O. N., "Classicismo turcomano. A proposito di alcuni recenti ricerche sovietiche sulla cultura turkmena nei sec. XVII e XVIII," *RSO* 64/3-4 (1991): 387-394.

This paper offers in fact a critical review of three works published in Ashgabat by the Ylym Publishing House of the Academy of Sciences of Turkmenistan, and selected by the authors as samples of the cultural and political fermentation in that former Soviet republic in the late 1980s: A. BEKMURADOV, *Andalyb hem oguznamachylyk däbi* [Andalib and the Tradition of Oghuz-nāma], 1987, 128 p.; *ibid.*, *Magtymgulynyn poeziiasynda shakhyrana dāp hem täzechillik gözlegleri* [Tradition and Innovation in Makhtūm-Qulī's Poetical Work], 1989, 189 p.; A. ASHIROV, *Turkmenskie poetry XVIII veka* [Turkmen Poems of the Eighteenth Century], 1990, 110 p. S.A.D.

■ SÄRLĪ, Ārāz Mohammad, "Ta'thīr-e fāje'e-ye Gök-Tappe dar adabiyāt-e torkaman [The Trace of the Gök-Teppe Disaster in Turkmen Literature]," *MAMvQ* 4/11 (1995): 19-32.

A renowned Iranian historian of Turkmenistan during the pre-colonial and the colonial periods, the author analyses the reinterpretation by Turkmen literature of the defeat of Gök-Teppe against the Russian army (January 1881). This event signified the end of the Turkmen resistance against the Russian conquest and dominance; it has been promoted since the end of the Soviet period as the founding drama of the modern Turkmen nation. The author sketches interesting comparisons between the official literature produced in independent Turkmenistan and various works published by Turkmen authors



in Iran during the period of the cold war.

S.A.D.

## 6.4 Hebraic, Yiddish, Judeo-Persian Languages and Literatures

■ BEČKA, Jiří, "A Continuator of Judeo-Persian Literature," in *A Green Leaf. Papers in Honour of Professor Jes P. Asmussen*, Leiden: Brill, 1988 (Acta Iranica: 28; Hommages et opera minora: 12): 199-204.

The author reconstructs the life and work of Mordechay Hiyo Bachaev (penname: Muhibb) who left Central Asia in 1973 for settling in Israel, where he then continued to publish works in Tajik language (in the Bukharan dialect). P.Lq.

■ PAPER, Herbert, ed., *The Mūsā-nāma of R. Shim'on Hakham*, Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College Press, 1986 (Judeo-Iranian Text Series), XXXIV-518 p.

This is the first volume of a collection of Judeo-Iranian texts launched by H.H. Paper with the moral support of those who, in several countries, are interested in the literature created by the Jews in the Iranian world, in Hebraic characters and in Persian or any other Iranian-Aryan language. Shim'on Hakham is a Bukharan Jew who in 1890, then aged 47, migrated to Jerusalem where he devoted himself to the writing of a number of works for the moral edification of his fellow countrymen and coreligionists. He published the *Mūsā-nāma* as a commentary of a work by Shāhīn of Shiraz, the most prominent Judeo-Persian poet (fourteenth century), that he further published. The work of a learned rabbi, the *Mūsā-nāma* is fed with midrashic, aggadic and rabbinic traditions on Moses' life. This is "one of the many modern works of the midrashic genre known from a variety of Jewish communities and in a number of languages" (p. XII). This is a narrative text written in a simple language, which has the great interest to have been written in the author's native language, the Persian of the Bukharan Jews or Judeo-Tajik language. The text reproduced by H.H. Paper in entirely vocalized Hebraic script is a good specimen of literary Judeo-Tajik language. The introduction by the editor provides some information on Shim'on Hakham's life and work. A second part reproduces a former paper on the language and its attestations, published in *Folia slavica* 5 (1981): 336-343. One can only wish good luck to the collection opened with this volume, and hope that besides now well-known Judeo-Tajik texts it will also welcome ancient Judeo-Persian texts, which make of data of primary importance for the overall history of Persian language. G.L.

■ SHAKED, Sh., "An Unusual Verbal Form in Early Judeo-Persian," in R. Schmitt & P.O. Skjærvø, *Studia grammatica iranica. Festschrift für Helmut Humbach*, München: Kitzinger, 1986: 393-405.

In the Judeo-Persian commentary of the Book of Ezechiel preserved in St. Petersburg, we find curious verbal forms in -gy (*bwdgy*, *krdgy*, etc.) which mostly have the value of a preterit. This reminds us of Tajik language, where one can also find participles in

–*gi*, which can express the past. This coincidence between the two forms of Persian could perhaps permit to locate the Judeo-Persian text and to clarify its date. P.Lq.

- ZAND, Michael, "The Literature of the Mountain Jews of the Caucasus," *Soviet Jewish Affairs* 15/2 (1985): 2-22; 16/1 (1986): 35-51.

This is the first study devoted to the history of Judeo-Tat literature of the Mountain Jews, the half of whom live nowadays in Derbent, the remaining part being established in Baku and in various rural zones. On the basis of an exceptionally rich documentation, the author reconstructs by periods the forms taken by this literature. On an overall background made of folkloric traditions and of local Judeo-Persian translations of the Old Testament, the Judeo-Tat language became a written literature in the early twentieth century, because of the needs of theater. The production then followed the events of the wars and the vicissitudes of the revolutions. Numerous authors and their respective works are resituated, in prose, poetry, dramatic art, and literary critique.

C.F.

## 6.5 Other Languages and Literatures

- AKHVLEDIANI, Vladimir Georg'evich, *Bukharskii arabskii dialekt: fonologiya i morfologiya* [The Arabic Dialect of Bukhara: Phonology and Morphology], Tbilisi: Metsniereba, 1985, 106 p.

Two Arabic dialects still exist today in Uzbekistan: that of the Kashka Darya and that of Bukhara. The latter, which is spoken in two *qishlāqs*, Jogary and Arabkhona, has been studied here by the author. Although his description, as often in Soviet publications, neglects syntax, it will interest the specialist of Iranian languages because of interference phenomena which appear between this dialect and Tajik (as well as with Uzbek) language. For example: the existence of /p/ and /ch/, the evolution *a*, *ā* > *o*, *ō*, the partial borrowing of *chl* "40," *sot* "100," etc., the use of the "past durative" (*kon* < *kāna* + unaccomplished) in conditional sentences, varied borrowings (*agar*, *agal* < *agar*, *jō* < *yā*, *polwōn* < *pahlavān*, *ohua* < *āhū*, *kucha* < *kucha*, etc.). There is no index, but a long summary in English pp. 98-106, and a bibliography pp. 96-97.

V.H.

- AKHVLEDIANI, V. G., "O vliianii tadzhikskogo iazyka na bukharskii arabskii dialekt [About the Influence of the Tajik Language upon the Arabic Dialect of Bukhara]," in G.Sh. Sharbatov, ed., *Irano-afganskije iazykovye kontakty*, Moscow: Nauka, 1987: 8-13.

In his study of the influence of Tajik language on the Arabic dialect of Bukhara, the author casts light on — beside specificities already analyzed in our review of his grammar of this dialect (see *supra*) — a number of phenomena like the borrowing of morphemes (*be*- "without," Taj. *be*-; *-nōk*, Taj. *nok*, Pers. *nāk*), the disappearance of the definite article, the use of verbal locutions (*harr sōr* "to heat," cf. Taj. *garm shudan*), the final location of the verb, a large use of *ki*, borrowings from Tajik language giving way

to verbal derivation (*pokiza* "clean" → *pakkaz* "he/she cleaned") or the origin of which is itself Arabic (*hōzīr* "now" < Ar. *hādir*), etc. V.H.

■ KIEFFER, Charles M., KIEFFER-VON MOOS, Rita, "Notes de lexicologie arabe, 1. A propos du parler des femmes de Ḥasanâbâd et de Solṭân Areḡ en Bactriane (Afghanistan)," in Ch. Robin, ed., *Mélanges linguistiques offerts à Maxime Rodinson*, Paris: Geuthner, 1985 (Comptes rendus du groupe linguistique d'études chamito-sémitiques: supp. 12): 205-219.

All those who until now had noted down the Arabic dialect of Bactriane (Bāyazīd Acak in 1966, and self in 1968 and 1975 for the A.L.A., A. Sattār Sīrat in 1973 and the Egyptian writer Tawfīq al-Hakīm (d. 1987) in 1967) had without exception remarked the existence of a difference between the language spoken by men and that of women, the latter being considered more conservative. However none had brought, for obvious reasons of lack of contacts, any testimony on this phenomenon. A decisive step has been made by the authors of the present work for filling this gap: on the basis of around one hundred words directly collected by Rita Kieffer-von Moos among Arab women, and checked by Ch. Kieffer among the men, we obtain a relevant sampling of what was still lacking to us on this subject. This set of words linked with domestic life is analyzed, compared, and resituated in its cultural context and in its multilingual environment. The author has paved the way for further studies to be undertaken in this field.

S.S.

## 7. Anthropology and Sociology

### 7.1 General Works

■ ANDREWS, Peter Alford, "The Evolution of the Trellis Tent: A Middle Eastern Development?," in Rémy Dor, ed., *L'Asie Centrale et ses voisins: influences réciproques*, Paris: INaLCO, 1990 (Colloques Langues'O): 141-164, ill., photos.

The author discusses the commonly admitted opinion according to which "trellis tents" (yurts and analogous forms diffused from Mongolia to Anatolia via Afghanistan and Iran) are a Central Asian creation propagated by the Turks and the Mongols. He tries to demonstrate that this kind of dwelling "does not represent a single line of development, but rather a convergence of traditions" (p. 147). In other words the *yurts*, *khergāhs*, *kara öys*, *topak evs*, *alachiqs* and trellis tents would not be variants of a unique type, but would have derived from several autonomous creations of Central Asia, on the first hand, and of the Middle East on the other. The argument is interesting but, given the lack of maps and explanatory drawings, the reader gets lost in the peregrinations of all these felt domes... J.-P.D.

■ ANDREWS, Peter Alford, ed., *Nomad Tent Types in the Middle East, I: Framed Tents*, Wiesbaden: Dr. Ludwig Reichert Verlag, 1997 (Tübinger Atlas des Vorderen Orients), 1 volume of text, 560 p., 1 volume of illustrations.

These two volumes constitute the first part, on tents with framework, of a large scale study of the types of tents used by the nomads of the Middle East. The volume of text consists mostly of an analytical catalogue of the types of tents with framework. P.A. Andrews establishes distinctions between trellis tents (trellis: "yurts"), rib tents, dome tents, arched tents with consolidated walls, vaulted tents, arched tents, tents with walls made of posts, penthouse tents, provisional refuges with removable roofing. The volume 1 is completed by three contributions: by P. A. ANDREWS himself on "*Öy, Alaçiq and Topaq ev*. Historical Interconnections in the Türkmen Tradition of Tentage" (pp. 507-520); by Micheline CENTLIVRES-DEMONT on "Trellis Tents, Rib Tents and Armature Tents in Northern Afghanistan" (pp. 521-533), and by Richard TAPPER on "Felt Huts, Haired Tents, Scene Changes and Thought Structures" (pp. 534-544). The volume 2 contains photographs and drawings related to volume 1. The two volumes offer a rich harvest of information, which is unfortunately tarnished by the weakness of the lexicographical and taxonomical reflection (the term "tent" should have been reserved to taut structures, the classification criteria are badly chosen and their hierarchy unsure), as well as by unforgivable bibliographical lacunae (the author ignores the works by A. Leroi-Gourhan, by Amos Rapoport, by Christian Bromberger and by many others). J.-P.D.

■ DYMSHITS, Valery, EMELYANENKO, Tatjana, *Facing West. Oriental Jews of Central Asia and the Caucasus*, Zwolle (NL): Waanders Publishers, [1996], 128 p., maps, ill.

This work accompanied a travelling exhibition (in Amsterdam and New York) of some 200 objects of the very rich Jewish collections of the Russian Ethnographical Museum of St. Petersburg. Served by objects of a very high quality — in particular textiles of a great freshness preserved through generations hidden from light —, this exhibition and its catalogue are enriched by a number of old photographs. They cast a particularly interesting light on the Jewish communities of Transoxiana and of the Southern Caucasus, in particular on the dialectics isolation/acculturation in communities as mutually different as those of Samargand and Tbilisi.

S.A.D.

- MARZOLPH, U., "Folklore and Anthropology," *IS* 31/3-4 (1998): 325-332.

The paper gives a globally positive appraisal of the notices devoted to folklore in the *Encyclopaedia Iranica* (letters A to D). The author rightly remarks that a respectable room has been given to this field of study in the *Elr*, whence it is poorly represented in similar reference works, for instance in the *Encyclopaedia of Islam*. He regrets however the absence of some synthetic notices (*e.g.*, on "Demonology") and of a sufficient attention for folklore in articles on fauna, water, varied tribes, etc. He also deplores the lack of consideration for "visual folklore" (*i.e.*, popular imagery). If the author is talkative about the merits and inadequacies of the *Elr* in matter of folklore, he curiously keeps silent on anthropology. Does it mean that both disciplines are confused in his view? May we see in this assimilation or neglect a trace of the heritage of German *Volkskunde*, or of terminological and conceptual hesitations by the editors of the *Elr* in their distribution between varied disciplines?

C.Br.

- TAPPER, R., "One Hump or Two? Hybrid Camels and Pastoral Cultures," *Production pastorale et sociétés* 16 (1985): 55-70.

The author sketches a general picture of the practices of crossbreeding between the (one hump) dromedary and the (two humps) camel of Bactriana. He describes more precisely the role played by varied hybrids — according to their respective crossbreeding — in the culture of the peoples who use them in Anatolia and Syria, in Azerbaijan, in Khurasan and in the Afghan Turkestan. The chapters on Azerbaijan (Shāhsevān) and Afghan Turkestan (Durrani Pashtuns), studied by the author on the field, are the most developed and they include a number of information on the events of social life (*e.g.*, marriage, circumcision, etc.) in which camels have a role. In these two groups, he observes that the camel as a ridden animal is associated with the image of woman, and the horse with that of man. The variants of hybridization, the qualities and defects associated with them, local practices and customs, different denominations according to the type of crossbreeding at different moments of the animal's life in local vocabulary enrich this study and will certainly be useful to zoologists as well as to linguists.

M.R.

- TISHKOV, V. A., ed., *Migratsii i novye diaspori v postsovetsskikh gosudarstvakh* [Migrations and New Diasporas in the Post-Soviet States], Moscow: Institut etnologii i

antropologii Rossiiskoi Akademii Nauk, 1996, 238 p., tab., appendixes.

Chapters on Central Asia in this collective work (S. S. SOKOLOVSKII, "Sredniaia Aziia: vynuždennye migratsii [Middle Asia: Forced Migrations]," 171-196, 3 tabs.), on Kazakhstan (I. A. SUBBOTINA, "Kazakhstan: retrospektiva i perspektiva migratsii [Kazakhstan: Migratory Retrospective and Perspective]," 197-214, 10 tabs.) and on the Southern Caucasus (N. A. VORONINA, "Zakavkaz'e: problemy migratsii [Transcaucasia: Migratory Problems]," 147-170, 6 tabs.) offer a rather classical approach of the migratory problematic in these different regions of the former USSR. These studies are mostly devoted to the emigration of the European, mainly Slavic, populations from Central Asia or from the Southern Caucasus toward Russia. The whole work is otherwise centered on the "Russian problem" (several authors are specialists of the Russian-speaking diasporas of the CIS) and suffers from an excessively Russian-centric vision. This vision brings some authors to hazardous interpretations of such and such political fact (in particular of the facts linked with the expansion of national oppositions during the last years of the Perestroika period). In spite of these shortcomings, the volume offers a complete panorama of migratory problems, and of the appearance of new Central Eurasian diasporas. Thanks to a special attention for the regional and local variations, the analyses proposed in this work distinguish for each country the role of various political and social factors which have played a role in the launching of the migration waves which have crossed the Caucasus and Central Asia since the late 1980s. S.A.D.

■ VITKOVSKAIA, G[alina], ed., *Migratsiia russoiazycznego naseleniia iz Tsentral'noi Azii: prichiny, posledstviia, perspektivy* [The Migration of the Russian-Speaking Population from Central Asia: Causes, Consequences, and Perspectives], Moscow: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 1996, 151 p.

This very coherent collective monograph resituates in different durations and under different lights the phenomenon of the migration of the Russian-speaking populations of Central Asia from the 1970s until now. The first study deals with the causes of the slowing down of the emigration of Russian-speaking populations from Central Asia in the mid-1990s; the author explains this phenomenon by the drying of demographic layers concerned since the end of the Soviet period by the re-emigration toward Russia (PANARIN, Sergei, "Tsentral'naia Aziia: integratsionnyi potentsial i perspektivy migratsii [Central Asia: Its Integration Potential and the Migratory Perspectives]," 11-39). The following paper provides interesting corrections to the most frequent representations on the ethnic distribution of the labour market in Central Asia since the end of the Soviet period; the author casts light on the risks of social conflict induced in this region by the demographic evolution (ZAIONCHKOVSKAIA, Zhanna, "Istoricheskie korni migratsionnoi situatsii v Srednei Azii [The Historical Roots of the Migratory Situation in Middle Asia]," 41-64, tab., bibliography). Then comes a brief look at the demographic exchanges between Central Asia and Russia during the years 1975-95; the author raises the question of a new threat of emigration of local populations from Central Asia to the Russian Federation, under the combined pressures of the demographic expansion

and of the stagnation of the labour market (RYBAKOVSKII, Leonid, "Tsentral'naia Aziia i Rossiia: mezhgosudarstvennyi migratsionnyi obmen [Central Asia – Russia: The Inter-State Migratory Exchange]," 65-82, tab.). The editor of the present volume gives an analysis of the motivations for departure of the Russian-speaking populations of Central Asia; she insists on the weight of the economic marginalization and of the cultural isolation induced for the Russian-speakers of southern Central Asia by the proclamation of independences in 1991 (VITKOVSKAIA, Galina, "Migratsionnoe povedenie netitul'nogo naseleniia v stranakh Tsentral'noi Azii [The Migratory Behaviour of Non-Native Populations in the Central Asian Countries]," 83-130, tab.). The following study insists most particularly on the political changes of the post-Soviet period and on their role in the departure of Russian-speakers from Kyrgyzstan (PIADUKHOV, Grigorii, "Kirgiziia: politicheskii faktor vyzhdennoi migratsii [Kyrgyzstan: The Political Factor of Forced Migration]," 131-143). S.A.D.

## 7.2 European Russia and Siberia

• BELIAULOV, U. B., KORSHUNOVA, O. N., TSITRINA, L. N., "Nauchno-tekhnicheskii progress v promyshlennosti i povyshenie professional'nogo urovnia rabochego klassa avtonomnykh respublik Povolzh'ia v 60–80-e gody [The Scientific and Technical Progress, and Improvement of the Professional Level of the Working Class in the Autonomous Republics of the Volga Region in the 1960-1980s]," *ISSSR* 1985/5: 3-21.

Consisting of an enthusiastic review of the Volga Region's economic modernization (from the 1960s to the 1980s), this long article was composed in preparation of the 27th Congress of the CPSU. Therefore the text, written in a typical Soviet cant, is full of quotations from Gorbachev. Aside from these limitations, there are more serious ones linked to the final validity of given information: using doubtful data from the official press, the authors examine the impact of scientific and technical innovations on regional development. After short presentations of the economic situation in Tatarstan, Mari-El, Udmurtia and Chuvashia, the authors insist on the importance of mechanical engineering industries. The article describes the implantation of big factories during this crucial period (especially the KamAZ plant of truck industry in Chally and the tractor factory in Cheboksary). Then they broaden the discussion to the social aspects of this specific industrialization, finding arguments to demonstrate that thousands of individuals were freed because of mechanization and automation: "Between 1981 and 1983, in Chuvashia, more than 4,600 workmen were released from their manual work." With a higher rhythm of economical growth, the Volga region can be depicted favourably in comparison with other parts of the USSR. This ideal position is also realized in terms of ethnic relationships: "Representatives of more than 80 nationalities have taken part in the construction of the KamAZ complex." It is only in the end of their eulogistic article that, finding some inadequacy between the plans and their realisation, the authors express more critical points of view, asking the new country leader "to make reforms

not only by words but also in action."

X.L.T.

■ BIRCHANSKAIA, Liudmila, "Assiriitsy: istoriia s prodolzheniem [The Assyrians: a Story with a Following]," *VE* 1-2 [6-7] (1999): 219-227.

A researcher in the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of the Russian Federation, in Moscow, the author retraces conversations she had with two representatives of the Assyrian community of that city (which claims nowadays more than 5,000 members, upon the 9,622 officially registered in Russia during the 1989 census): Maron Arsaris, a teacher of Assyrian language and the leader of the Moscow community, and Sergei Osipov, professor at the Faculty of Medicine and a representative of the "Khaiadta" association. This study constitutes a rare document on the problematic integration in the Soviet (and post-Soviet) capital of families of Assyrian confession who came from Iran (from Urumiya or Tehran) between the aftermath of the revolutions of 1917 and the launching of the red terror in the mid-1930s. For a historical study of the Assyrian community of Moscow, see also the following papers: AGRANAT, A. B., MIKHAILOV, S. S., MISHCHENKO, E. V., TIMOV, V. N., "Assiriitsy v Moskve (po materialam etnosotsiologicheskogo issledovaniia) [The Assyrians in Moscow (through the Materials of an Ethno-Sociological Study)]," *Vostok* 1994/2: 70-78; MIKHAILOV, S. S., "Formirovanie assiriiskoi obshchiny v Moskve v 1918 – nachale 1920-kh godov [The Shaping of the Assyrian Community in Moscow between 1918 and the Early 1920s]," *EO* 1995/4; *ibid.*, "Assiriiskii khutor Urmiia na Kubani [The Assyrian Farm 'Urmiya' in the Kuban]," *Vostok* 1997/1: 97-104; *ibid.*, "Obshchina assiriitsev v Moskve v 1920-kh godakh [The Assyrian Community in Moscow in the 1920s]," *Vostok* 1997/5: 38-44; U. Iu. ZAIA, "Assiriitsy v Rossii (vtoraia polovina XIX – nachalo XX v.) [The Assyrians in Russia (Second Half of the 19th – First Half of the 20th Century)]," *Vostok* 1997/4: 23-36.

As a matter of comparison in history of Iranian or Turkic-speaking communities of Moscow, one can recommend the reading of an also recent study by S. S. MIKHAILOV: "Is istorii karaimskoi diaspori v Moskve v XIX – XX vv. [Elements of History of the Karaim Diaspora in Moscow in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries]," *Vostok* 1999/4: 77-83. On the basis of a limited corpus of primary sources and a number of testimonies of elders, the authors deal with one century and a half of history of the numerically small Moscow diaspora of the Karaims, an ancient Turkic-speaking group of Crimea which practices a form of Judaism mixed with Christian and Muslim influences. The author provides a social profile of the various Karaim communities of Moscow (which originate from the Crimea or from Lithuania), and tries to establish links between their respective economic specializations and cultural profiles. See also: FEL'DMAN, D. Z., "S.A. Beim – glava karaimskoi obshchiny Kryma (po arkhivnym materialam) [S.A. Böhm, the Chief of the Karaim Community of the Crimea (through Archival Sources)]," *Vostok* 2000/3: 53-63.

S.A.D.

● BUSYGIN, E. P., STOLIAROV, G. P., "Kul'turno-bytovye protsessy v natsional'no-smeshan-



nykh sem'iakh (po materialam issledovaniï v sel'skikh raionakh Tatarskoi ASSR) [Everyday Culture Processes in Ethnically Mixed Families (about Materials from a Study in Rural Districts of the Tatar ASSR)]," *SE* 1988/3: 27-36.

Using ethnically mixed marriages (contracted between peoples of different nationalities) as an object for their study, the authors stay in a pure ethnographic tradition. At the same time, this article tries much more to prove scientifically the high efficiency of Soviet internationalism. The paper offers an analysis of the complex question of cultural influences inside such families. This article is based on a large survey (574 mixed families have been questioned) realized during an expedition conducted in rural districts of Tatarstan in 1985 under the supervision of the State University of Kazan. For this study on the formation of a "new Soviet culture," the authors have also made use of archive documents from the ZAGS (civil administration where marriages are registered). Noting the continuous increase in mixed marriages (from 3.2% in 1940 to 11.8% in 1982), the emphasis is put on concrete repercussions of this global trend. In terms of identity (especially the choice of nationality for the children) and social practices, the evolution displayed by the data is according to the authors largely positive. The integration process is undoubtedly successful as far as mixed families are closer to "modernity": no more submitted to traditions (equality is more widespread in homework and educational level between husband and wife), these families use to utilise Russian language for inner communication. In fact, such "democratization of family relations" is not considered as an assimilation of non-Russian cultures by the dominant one. The "russianization" of the Tatar population is still judged as an important symptom of the effective modernisation of a traditional society. In parallel, this article does not forget to remind the preservation of national specificities in multinational families. According to the statistics, there are very few families in which children do not speak even just one of their parents native tongue. Nevertheless, with a conclusion on "the full internationalization of family life," the article looks finally like a quantitative demonstration of the close fusion of all nationalities in a unique Soviet body.

X.L.T.

- DYATLOV, V. I., "Anti-Immigrant Attitudes in the Socio-Political Life of a Siberian City: The Example of Irkutsk," *IA* 2/1 (2000): 13-24.

Although many of them are themselves immigrants from Slavic regions, the residents of Irkutsk have increasingly expressed negative sentiments directed against Caucasian or Chinese immigrants. Several explanations are explored, including hostility to "trading minorities," local stereotypes of "the stranger," and the exploitation of nationalist sentiments by local politicians. The author also looks at the self-protective strategies that prevent these groups, especially the Chinese, from integrating into the mainstream society.

L.A.

- GAZEN-TORN, N. I., "Obriadovye polotentsa u narodnostei Povolzh'ia [Ritual Towels of the Peoples of the Volga River Area]," *EO* 2000/6: 103-117.

Kept at the Scientific Archive of Peter the Great Museum of Anthropology and Ethnography of the Academy of Sciences of Russia, this article was published on the occasion of the 100th birth anniversary of its author. A famous Soviet ethnographer, Gazen-Torn spent a lot of time in contact with the populations of the Volga Region. In the present article (probably written in the mid-1930s), towels are examined in connection with the origins of the talisman. In the former times towels were quite widespread in the ritual life of many peoples, including those of the Volga area: they were presented on the occasions of weddings and funerals, they were hung and left in the woods during public prayers... In this well-documented article, the question is considered with the wide use of comparative data of ethnography, linguistics and other disciplines. Claiming to be exhaustive on his subject (three photos show a traditional ceremony of sacrifice in Mari-El), this deep analysis is representative of the high standards of the first generation of Soviet ethnographic studies. X.L.T.

- KOMAROVA, G. A., "Etnicheskie ustanovki pri vybore brachnogo partnera (po materialam Sluzhby brachnykh ob'iaivlenii v Ufe i Cheboksarakh) [Ethnic Questions around the Choice of a Partner for Marriage (Based on Documents from Marriage Bureaus in Ufa and Cheboksary)]," *SE* 1987/3: 80-90.

The author of this brief article meant to study the expected correlations between the choice of a marriage partner and ethnic identities. Dealing with the context of demographical imbalance between males and females in the Soviet society, the study is based on the documentation available in the new marriage bureaus of the cities of Ufa (Bashkiria) and Cheboksary (Mari-El). After an interesting report on organisation and working process of these agencies, the author exposes the main characteristics of people using this kind of unusual services. But the most significant one is the small ads they have to write down for their search. The description of this material gives a lot of useful information, especially on the identity conceptions of these agency subscribers. For instance, it reveals the differential apprehension of family identity between Tatars and Bashkirs: when describing women they are looking for, 2/3 of Tatar men ask (in the Ufa agency) for a woman of the same nationality. Among Bashkirs, the proportion decreased to 1/3. In Cheboksary, almost 100% of Tatar men wish to find a Tatar woman. Obviously, a positive element of the text is the including comparison between the two capitals of Mari-El and Bashkiria. It appears that the focalisation on ethnic criteria is less common in Mari-El than in the second one. Finally, the sociological data carried by this 15 years-old article is still precious for a better understanding of identity significances in non-Russian-peopled areas of the Russian Federation. X.L.T.

- KOROVUSHKIN, D. G., "Tendentsiia etnokul'turnogo razvitiia chuvashei Zapadnoi Sibiri na sovremennom etape [The Current Tendency of Ethno-Cultural Development among the Chuvashs of Western Siberia]," *SE* 1991/4: 79-84.

Through an ethnographical approach, this article deals with the unfamiliar case of Western Siberian Chuvashs. According to the 1989 census, they were more than 45

thousand, mostly dispersed in Novosibirsk, Omsk and Tiumen *oblast's*. After some generalities (about the arrival of these groups in the middle of the 20th century), the author examines the central question of their ethnic identity. Based on sociological data (in the 1980s expeditions were conducted in these areas under the supervision of professor Tomilov from Omsk University to take a poll of 1,200 people), the purpose of this article is to prove the high level of national consciousness among Siberian Chuvashs. Considering migrations and well-spread endogamy practices, the author establishes a division between two sub-ethnic categories (the Chuvashs of Omsk and those of Tiumen). In each of these groups, he notes the preservation of traditional house-building techniques. Nevertheless, the main trend is a strong process of acculturation. Chuvash costumes disappeared from villages where linguistic assimilation is reinforced: 80% of the people polled described Chuvash language as their mother tongue, but only 33% declared to speak Chuvash fluently. A great deal of the interest of this article remains in the manner the author defends the ethnic group: in a way characteristic of the time when it was written, the paper ends on an alarm on the ultimate danger for the Siberian Chuvash to lose their spiritual values...

X.L.T.

■ PANARIN, Sergei, "Tadzhiki-bezhentsy v gorodakh Sibiri [Tajik Refugees in the Cities of Siberia]," *VE* 1996/1 [2]: 154-163.

The present paper offers the author's reflections after an interview with a Tajik refugee temporarily established with his family in the station of Ulan-Ude (Rep. of Buriatia, Federation of Russia), and some conversations with Buriat or Russian interlocutors in Ulan-Ude and in Irkutsk. These reflections are introduced by notations on the sociological profile of the Tajik refugees in Central Siberia. These general considerations are nuanced by the author's reflections on the causes of the weak social and professional adaptation of the considered populations to the specific conditions of Siberia. Moral appreciations, sometimes out of place, spoil the author's words on the strategies set up by the migrants gradually repelled by local and regional authorities throughout the CIS, from Uzbekistan to the northern confines of the Altai. The paper is concluded by overall reflections inspired to the author by the perception of the Tajik migrant population among the bi-national, Russian and Buriat, population of Ulan-Ude and in the mostly Russian population of Irkutsk.

S.A.D.

● PANARIN, Sergei, "The Buryat Village of Tory in the 1990s: Social and Cultural Re-Adaptation in a Small Village Community," *IA* 1/1 (1999): 107-110.

Tory became a unified community in the 1930s, but as Soviet institutions grew stronger, the community ties consisted of small familial groups and economic ties to the collective farm. When support for the collective farm was withdrawn in the 1990s, the question arose of whether the community would survive since people are accustomed to dependence on the state. The younger generation is not oriented to the village, so the question of the future of this community is open-ended.

L.A.

- SHAKIROVA, N. F., "Dikorastushchie rasteniia v traditsionnom pitanii bashkir [Wild Plants in the Traditional Nutrition of Bashkirs]," *SE* 1988/3: 99-109.

The author provides the basic ethnographic knowledge on traditional Bashkir cooking (especially the use of wild plants). Based on evolutionist convictions, the present analysis regards cookery as a social practice (vital function and at the same time cultural item) shared by all ethnic group members. Considering this, cooking procedure is precious to reveal specificities of a peculiar group at one stage of its evolution. This is why the article is a long sequence of concrete and precise explanations of the Bashkirs' ways of cooking in relation with their long-term settling process. Leaving nomad life, their needs for food changed and the mutation already touched the usefulness of wild plants. Resulting of an ethnographic expedition (conducted in eight districts of the Bashkir ASSR in 1980-1986), the work is well-documented and could be useful for comparative studies (the linguistic precision of the article is also helpful). A broad variety of plants are described as well as the manner they are picked, prepared and eaten by Bashkir villagers. For instance the author notes that tea was not popular among Bashkirs until the establishment of commercial relationship between Russia and China. In conclusion of her rich article (written in a comprehensive language and full of references to major ethnographic works on the topic), the author tries to convince its contemporaries of the benefits of such a knowledge for modern life. X.L.T.

- SULEIMANOV, R. N., "Zhenshchiny v demograficheskoi strukture Bashkortostana (1959 g. – nachalo 90-kh gg.) [Women in the Demographic Structure of Bashkortostan (from 1959 to the Early 1990s)]," *OI* 1996/4: 181-186.

In this short sociological study, the author examines the demographical situation of women in Bashkortostan during a period of violent modernization with deep impacts on local populations. To be convincing, this attempt at understanding long term inner evolutions leans on series of statistical figures. Despite a tendency of ageing of the population (fertility rate decreased from 17.8/00 in 1989 to 13.3/00 children/women in 1992), the imbalance between men and women in the Bashkir society tends to decrease. The lack of men was particularly significant in villages, which may be one of the possible explanations for the high rate of ethnically mixed marriages during this period. X.L.T.

- TOMILOV, N. A., KADYROVA, L. M., "Narodnye sposoby lecheniia u sibirskikh tatar [Traditional Treatment Methods of the Siberian Tatar]," *EO* 1997/5: 122-131.

According to the authors, the main object of their work is to expose possibilities of traditional treatment knowledge as a source for history and ethnography. Using material from an expedition directed in the mid-1970s by Omsk State University, the article gives the description and contemporary analysis of traditional knowledge on pharmacology of Baraba and Tobol-Irtish Tatars. This investigation gives many examples of herbs used as remedies. X.L.T.

□ VALEEV, F. T., TOMILOV, N. A., *Tatary Zapadnoi Sibiri. Istoriia i kul'tura* [The Tatars of Western Siberia. History and Culture], Novosibirsk: Nauka (Sibirskaia izdatel'skaia firma RAN), 1996 (Kul'tura narodov Rossii: 2), 220 p., 45 ills., [7] col. pl., Eng. sum.

Should one locate the northern boundaries of the Iranian world, for the modern, medieval and contemporary periods, on the middle course of the Irtysh River, and on the southern limb of tundra? Such a hypothesis was already suggested several decades ago by the works of the Uzbekistani historian Hamid Ziioev on the "Bukharan" communities installed in the merchant cities of Western Siberia since the end of the seventeenth century (cf. H. ZIIAEV [ZIIIOEV], *Uzbeki v Sibiri* [Uzbeks in Siberia], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo "Fan" Uzbekskoi SSR, 1968; *ibid.*, *Ekonomicheskie sviazi Srednei Azii s Sibir'iu v XVI-XIX vv.* [The Economic Relations between Middle Asia and Siberia, from the Sixteenth to the Nineteenth Century], Tashkent: Izdatel'stvo "Fan" Uzbekskoi SSR, 1983). The current researches by Sergei Panarin in Moscow and by Vladimir Boiko in Barnaul on the Tajik refugees settled in European Russia and Siberia since the last years of the Tajikistani civil war should also incite us not to neglect completely these northernmost latitudes, not very familiar to contemporary Iranian studies, even if the human groups concerned by these studies are numerically small — in the case of the "Bukharans" of old as in that of present-day Tajiks.

The synthesis work which is proposed to us here constitutes an important step since it gives a statement on research implemented for several decades in several regional academic centres of Russia (mainly in Omsk and in Kazan) on the history, ethnography and linguistics of the Muslim-background populations of Russia. In this volume one can find a short chapter on the "Bukharans of Siberia" (pp. 39-50), with interesting considerations on the variations of the "Bukharan" identity since the eighteenth century. The authors insist in particular on the role played by the fiscal privileges given, during a certain period of time, to partly Persian-speaking merchants from Transoxiana established in the trading posts of Western Siberia after the Russian conquest of this region, and the influence of this fiscal status on the structuring of a strong "Bukharan" identity among the other, mainly Turkic-speaking Muslim populations of the area. The authors analyze the disaffection with this identity, which was brought about in the course of the nineteenth century by the gradual suppression of these fiscal privileges, to the extent that the "Bukharan" ethnic denomination finally disappeared from the Soviet censuses from the mid-1920s onward. On this aspect, however, one would have waited for more critical distance of the authors vis-à-vis their official sources on the nationality policy of the early Stalinist period (F.T. Valeev himself mentions the preservation until the present of a vivid community consciousness among the former Persian-speaking populations of Siberia, now classified as "Siberian Tatars," in Tobolsk and in Tara).

S.A.D.

■ VITKOVSKAIA, Galina, MALASHENKO, Aleksei, eds., *Neterpimost' v Rossii, starye i novye fobii* [Intolerance in Russia, Old and New Phobias], Moscow: Moskovskii tsentr Karnegi, 1999, 196 p.

In the aftermath of first studies on the progression of "Islamophobia" in the Federation of Russia (see A.V. Kudriavtsev, "Islamofobiia v postsovetsoi Rossii [Islamophobia in Post-Soviet Russia]," in A.V. Malashenko, ed., *Islam v SNG* [Islam in the CIS], Moscow: Institut vostokovedeniia RAN, 1998: 160-172; see the reviews in the present volume), this collective monograph deals with the manner Caucasian peoples, as well as Jews, have been perceived and represented in the Federation of Russia since the end of the First War of Chechnia (1994-96). Among the most interesting studies, let us mention the paper devoted to the recent evolution of the perception of the Caucasian migrants in the predominantly Russian population of Irkutsk, in Western Siberia (Viktor DIATLOV, "Kavkaztsy v Irkutsk: konfliktogennaia diaspora [Caucasians in Irkutsk: A Conflict-Making Diaspora]," 113-135). In a spirit which is that of the whole volume, the author of this paper astutely underlines the large gap which exists between the real implication of these migrant (mainly Azerbaijani) populations in the parallel economy of the city, and the way they are perceived by the local population as a factor of destabilization and insecurity, in connection with their supposed role in the shadow economy. A more general study deals with the political use of religion in Russia, and with the propagation of a discourse of intolerance among varied political forces, in particular in the local and regional political institutions — against Islam and Judaism indeed, but also against American protestant missionary activity (Sergei FILATOV, Roman LUNKIN, "Konets 90-kh: vozrozhdenie religioznoi neterpimosti [The Late 1990s: The Rebirth of Religious Intolerance]," 136-150). The last paper is devoted to the rapid evolution in Russia of relations between local populations and Russian migrants coming from the Caucasus and Central Asia; the author notes with satisfaction the appearance of sentiments of solidarity on a local scale between the two, which is notably expressed by a growing mutual interweaving of autochthonous and migrant populations in organizations of assistance to the destitute (Galina VITKOVSKAIA, "Vynuzhdennaia migratsiia i migrantofobiia v Rossii [Forced Migration and Migrantophobia in Russia]," 151-191, 34 tabs.).

S.A.D.

### 7.3 The Caucasus

- BOBROVNIKOV, Vladimir, "Muslim Nationalism in the Post-Soviet Caucasus: Daghestan," *CAaC* 1/6 (2000): 93-104.

The author examines Daghestan's continuities with elements of Soviet social and economic structures and asks how these continuities are compatible with an upsurge in Muslim nationalism. He examines the historical development of ethnic hierarchies in Daghestan in the pre-revolutionary and Soviet periods and analyzes how de-sovietization actually only destroyed symbols and official ideology, while preserving key Soviet values and institutions. These Soviet ideas come together rather than competing with the newer Muslim nationalist ideologies. The results are seen in the way that Dagestanis deal with contemporary social problems such as conflicts over land and migration.

L.A.

- HENZE, Paul B., "The Demography of the Caucasus according to 1989 Soviet Census Data," *CAS* 10/1-2 (1991): 147-170.

Gives a demographic portrait focusing on issues of nationality and language use.

L.A.

- SABI, Manijeh, "The Impact of Economic and Political Transformations on Women: the Case of Azerbaijan," *CAS* 18/1 (1999): 111-120, 3 tabs.

This paper deals with the structural causes which can explain the permanence of varied forms of segregation against women on the labour market of Azerbaijan — among which is a strong patriarchal tradition, as well as the shortcomings of the social infrastructures of the Soviet period. The author also questions herself on the essentially economic factors of what she perceives as a degradation of the situation of women in the Azerbaijani society since the independence of the country in 1991.

S.A.D.

- SIVERTSEVA, Tamara, "Daghestan: the Quest for National Identity," *CAS* 18/3 (1999): 359-372.

Based on extensive interviews with local and regional leaders and surveys of mountain villages in Dagestan, the author examines the regional and international influences on national identity. The author touches briefly on a broad range of social problems and then focuses on issues of linguistic, religious and national identity, though her conclusions about the causes or consequences of these issues are not clear.

L.A.

- TAPPER, Richard, *Frontier Nomads of Iran. A Political and Social History of the Shahsevan*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997 (Cambridge Middle East Studies), 429 p., bibliography, index.

This book on the social and political history of one of the most important nomadic populations of Iran, whose territory neighbours with the very sensitive boundary of Azerbaijan, tries to retrace the origin of the Shāhsavan tribes in the seventeenth century, their unification inside a confederation in the eighteenth century, and their presumed decline under the Pahlavi régime, which endeavoured to ruin their economy and to destroy their political influence. Although the confederation does not exist any more nowadays, several thousands of Shāhsavan families continue to have a nomadic life near the boundary, whence thousands of other Iranians continue to recognize themselves as Shāhsavan. The book brings a notable contribution to three principal debates: first, on the question of the origin of the Shāhsavan and, more generally, on the question of the shaping processes of tribal entities in Iran; second, on the role which was played in these processes by the relations between the tribes and the state; third on the relations between history and ethnic identity, more specifically on the question of knowing to which extent and in which way varied modes of identity construction of a people reflect or determine this people's vision of the past. The rich documentation, writ-

ten and oral, on which the work is based, is worthy of the theoretical ambitions of the work, in the field of history as well as in that of anthropology. No doubt, the present work is one of the most significant studies of the nomadic tribes of Iran and even of the Middle East. J.-P.D.

## 7.4 Western Central Asia

■ ABASHIN, Sergei, "Vopreki 'zdravomu smyslu' ? (K voprosu o 'ratsional'nosti / irratsional'nosti' ritual'nykh raskhodov v Srednei Azii) [Against 'Common Sense' ? (Contribution on the Question of the 'Rationality' or 'Irrationality' of Ritual Expenses in Middle Asia)]," *VE* 1-2 [6-7] (1999): 92-112.

On the basis of several political measures taken by President Karimov in the autumn 1998 against the practice of important extravagant spending occasioned by the celebration of the main transition rituals (circumcision, marriage, funerals and bereavement anniversaries), the author questions himself on the causes of the present vivacity of this practice. He questions in particular the notion of the 'irrationality' of this spending practice, which has been commonly reproached to it by Soviet ethnographers and by present-day Uzbekistani politicians. This very nuanced study is based on the author's personal fieldworks, notably in the Ferghana Valley; it is also nourished by numerous theoretical references — in particular to the innovative works by the ethnographer F. D. LIUSHKEVICH: see by him "Traditsii mezhsemeinykh svyazei uzbeksko-tadzhikskogo naseleniia Srednei Azii (k probleme bytovaniia "kalyma" i drugikh patriarkhal'nykh obychaev) [The Traditions of Inter-Family Relations in the Uzbek and Tajik Population of Middle Asia (On the Question of the Payment of *Kalym* and Other Patriarchal Customs)]," *SE* 1989/4. The author of the present study deals in particular with the mutual interweaving of local communities of various level, notably the *oshkhur-obkhur* (or *tuilash*, or *oshlash*), an entity larger than that of the better known *mahalla*; he also studies the respective positioning of these varied communities in the organization of a circumcision banquet (*sunnat-tui*), which is taken as an example of family celebration giving way to particularly significant spending. Cutting off with the Soviet ethnographical school, the author insists on the function of this spending as a vector of community integration of nuclear families, of their collaterals and more largely of the local community (*mahalla*) in the close environment of allied *mahallas* (forming an *oshlash*). The author also resituates the spending occasioned by these celebrations in the framework of a sophisticated system of ritual exchanges, which occasionally becomes a powerful factor of social and even economic integration in the case of destitute families of local communities. S.A.D.

● ABASHIN, Sergei, "Ok-suiak, Muslim Elite of Central Asia," *CAaC* 1/6 (2000): 68-76.

A discussion of the role of a traditional system of social distinction (elite or "white bone" vs. common people) in contemporary Central Asia. The author traces the histor-



ical origins of various "white bone" groups through the Soviet period and comments on specific aspects of the role of "white bones" in society today. The focus is on Uzbekistan but other republics are examined as well. Caveat: the author does not provide adequate references or methodological information to assess the validity of the research.

L.A.

- ABDUKHOLIKOV, Yokubjon, "The Social Conditions of Rural Women in Tajikistan," *CAM* 2000/2: 13-17.

This article presents a superficial overview of the economic, educational, occupational, family, health and cultural environment for rural Tajik women. Though the author gives no sources for his data, the article serves as a cursory introduction to many important topics.

L.A.

- ABRAMSON, David M., "Remembering the Present: The Meaning Today of the 1989 Violence in Kokand," *CAM* 1997/3: 18-21.

Through oral narratives collected in 1994-95 on the pogrom of the Meskh population from June 6 to 8, 1989 in Kokand and its region, the author shows how the inhabitants of this city of the Ferghana Valley have reinterpreted this collective experience so that it makes sense at the moment when they tell it, in a totally modified social and political context. The author notes in particular the absence of a consensus of the causes of the tragedy, as well as on the role attributed by some to obscure rivalries for political power at a supra-local scale. (This argument permits the tellers to avoid the designation of culprits inside the local community.) The article is concluded by considerations on the determining effect of the memory of this founding drama on the manner everyone in the Ferghana Valley defines today his/her relation to his/her community (with the recent emergence of a well marked boundary between Uzbeks and non-Uzbeks).

S.A.D.

- ABRAMSON, David M., "A Critical Look at NGOs and Civil Society as Means to an End in Uzbekistan," *Human Organization* 58/3 (1999): 240-250.

The author takes a critical look at the culture-blind assumptions of the international donor community and argues that "conceptual ambiguities in development work can lead to the corruption of entire aid projects" (p. 240). The concept that is of particular interest is that of "civil society." Drawing on fieldwork and interviews in Uzbekistan and Washington, D.C., the author makes three main points: that elite communities who receive aid from international organizations are largely created through the development process; that the definition of what a "non-governmental" organization is and what its activities should be are highly contestable; and that promotion of activities that work outside of or in opposition to state structures may have disastrous consequences. For example, the rhetoric of civil society as practiced in the Uzbek NGO community encourages "a particular hegemony in which "civility" is symbolically opposed to accommodating an Islamic political culture" (p. 247). The article contains a sophisti-

cated critique that could have been fleshed out more and is slightly obscured by unclear writing. L.A.

- ANDERSON, John, "Religion, State, and Society in the New Kyrgyzstan," *Journal of Church and State* 41/1 (1999): 99.

In this article, based on newspaper accounts supplemented by interviews, the author gives an overview of religion in Kyrgyzstan during the Soviet period and of the interaction between religion and the state in the period of independence. He describes the activities of various non-Muslim religious groups, questions the motivations behind the media's discourse of "Islamic threat," and doubts the efficacy of new religious legislation and its role in building a democratic society. A solid, though not analytical, report by a respected scholar. L.A.

- ANDERSON, John, "Creating a Framework for Civil Society in Kyrgyzstan," *EAS* 52/1 (2000): 77-93.

Applying concepts from the theoretical literature on civil society to the case of Kyrgyzstan, the author calls for the analytical separation of civil society from democratization, arguing that indigenous forms of civil society are worthy of support apart from their democratizing effects. Focusing on the framework within which civil society operates in Kyrgyzstan, Anderson investigates the ways that civil society and the state work together to provide a channel of communication between the individual and the state. The body of the text draws mainly on secondary and newspaper sources to detail various political, economic and cultural developments in Kyrgyzstan as they relate to civil society. The author concludes that the "supporting contexts" that comprise the framework for civil society in Kyrgyzstan are ambiguous, with some trends supporting liberalization and others thwarting it. Informative with solid analysis. L.A.

- ANONYMOUS, "Rezultaty sotsiologicheskogo oprosa naseleniia Respubliki Tadjikistana [The Results of a Sociological Poll of the Population of the Republic of Tajikistan]," *TsA* 3 [9] (1997): 107-113.

This paper gives the results and a short comment on a political poll made in January 1997 by the Institute of Social Studies of Russia (*Rossiiskii institut sotsial'nykh issledovaniï*) on varied samples of the population of the Tajikistani cities of Hissar, Dushanbe, Nurek, Khujand and Qurghan-Teppa. Both responses and comments question the legitimacy of the régime of President Rahmonov, and speak in favor of the latter's former rival and former Prime Minister Abdumalik Abdullojonov. More generally the anonymous inquirers attribute the weak popularity of the régime and of the main warlords of the country to the dramatic events of the year 1997 (notably to the massacre of opponents to President Rahmonov in the prison of Khujand) and to the anxiety of the population of Tajikistan in front of the slowness and shortcomings of the process of national reconciliation supported by the United Nations. S.A.D.

- ARIFKHANOVA, Zoia, "Traditional Communities in Modern Uzbekistan," *CAaC* 1/4 (2000): 56-63.

The author examines the institution of the *mahalla/makhallia* in contemporary Uzbekistan, including its functions relating to social security, community rituals, building community, and women. However, the article only deals with the official state rhetoric about what *mahallas* are supposed to be, and gives no information about implementation or actual functioning of *mahalla* institutions.

L.A.

- ARIPOVA, Marianna, "Narcobusiness in Tajikistan: in the Hands of Women," *CAM* 1998/4: 30.

A tragic consequence of the losses of the Tajikistani civil war in the country's male population, the involvement of women in drug traffics (248 persons accused in 1997, plus 81 Tajik female citizens arrested outside the country) has become a characteristic feature of criminality in Tajikistan. The author, a member of the private press agency Asia-Plus, tries to bring the attention of politicians on the ignorance of the legislation by these women, which incite them to underestimate the penal consequences of their activity.

S.A.D.

- BABAIEV, K. R., "Kommunikativnoe povedenie evreev Bukhary [The Communicative Behaviour of the Bukharan Jews]," *SE* 1991/5: 86-94.

This study shows the influence of the culture and of the linguistic milieu of the Persian-speaking Jews of Bukhara on their specific registers of standard expression, through an analysis of numerous salutation, benevolence and malediction formulas, collected by the author since the 1950s.

S.A.D.

- BALDAUF, I., *Die Knabenliebe in Mittelasien: Bažabozlik* [Pedophilia in Central Asia], Berlin: Das arabische Buch, 1988 (Ethnizität und Gesellschaft, Occasional Paper: 17), 116 p.

On the basis of inquiries made among the Uzbeks of Mazar-i Sharif, a now famous German Turkologist deals openly with a subject considered for long a taboo in Afghanistan. Paedophilia (Pers. *bachabāzī*) is here a massive practice with a proper cultural expression: the author evokes the *majlises*, gatherings of young male dancers, and she provides a sampling of the oral expression that she could collect among them. In the appendix, she gives some comparative materials on Soviet Uzbekistan, where paedophilia is reputed to have considerably regressed, but nothing on the expressions of the same phenomenon among Persian-speaking populations of Afghanistan (see on this aspect the works by M. Slobin, which are not quoted by the author, and those more recent by J. Bailly: these two ethno-musicologists have also dealt with the subject, but have tended to minimize its sexual dimension.)

D.B.

- BAZIN, Marcel, "Identité ethnique et identité régionale en Iran et en Asie Centrale," in Olivier Roy, ed., *Des ethnies aux nations en Asie centrale*, Aix-en-Provence: Edisud, 1991 (*ReMMM*, 59-60/1-2, 1991): 101-116, 2 maps, bibliography.

Relying on Western (notably French) works on the ethnic fact (*le fait ethnique*), the

author introduces in a synthetic way the different scales of regional identity in Iran and in Central Asia. He shows the significance of local differentiations inside larger ethnic regions which are no longer homogeneous and do not act anymore as potential rivals of the state.

B.H.

- BLUM, Alain, "L'Asie Centrale ex-soviétique, espace culturel et espace démographique," *CEMOTI* 16 (1993): 335-349.

Refining an overall picture he had sketched in a more general study (*Naître, vivre et mourir en URSS, 1917-1991*, Paris: Plon, 1994: 152-158), the author proposes a contrasted demographic picture of former Soviet Central Asia. He observes in particular that this region, although isolated during the Soviet period from the cultural areas to which it belonged historically, has nevertheless continued to follow patterns (of fertility rate, for example) which are parallel to those of these areas (see for instance the case of Iran). At the same time, the recent history of migrations between the Russian metropolis and its former Central Asian colonies suggests that colonial history is still far from being forgotten, in spite of the recent reversal of the migratory influxes.

S.A.D.

- BRUSINA, O. I., "Mnogonatsional'nye sela Uzbekistana i Kazakhstana osen'iu 1989 g. [The Multi-Ethnic Villages of Uzbekistan and Kazakhstan in the Autumn 1989]," *SE* 1990/3: 18-30, 6 tabs.

On the basis of an inquiry realized between 1987 and 1989, the author analyzes the general degradation of inter-community relations in Soviet Central Asia, through the sample of nine multi-ethnic villages of Uzbekistan (in the regions of Tashkent and of Syrdarya) and of Kazakhstan (region of Shymkent). The studied villages have been formed from the late nineteenth century onward in the Hunger Steppe by successive waves of migrant cultivators coming from Russia and from other parts of Central Asia. In spite of a "natural" tendency to chain migration and community grouping, the authoritarian distribution of migrants resulted in the neighboring of communities with very diverse respective collective functioning, and with sometimes contradictory modes of improving of their life level. In the 1970-80s, the "non-native" populations (Russians, Ukrainians, Germans, Koreans, Tatars) have begun to flee from these villages toward cities; they used to justify their departure by the impossibility to satisfy their even elementary educative and cultural claims, to find qualified jobs in these non-industrialized areas, and above all by their own incapacity to maintain by themselves the small live-stock and family plots of land, the possession of which is necessary in rural areas for living above the poverty line. From 1987 onward the emigration of these non-natives saw a quick rise, which is explained by the opening of the international boundaries of the USSR (for the Jews, the Germans, and the Greeks in particular) and by the right given to deported peoples to return to their respective initial homelands (Tatars of Crimea, North Caucasian peoples). This movement toward emigration has also been justified by the nationalist discourse of the first Kazakh and Uzbek alternative political

organizations and parties, and by the general degradation of inter-community relations symbolized in particular by the pogrom of the Meskhetian Turks in the Ferghana Valley in June 1989. S.A.D.

- BUCKLEY, Cynthia, "Exodus? Out-migration from the Central Asian Successor States to the Russian Federation," *CAM* 1996/3: 16-22.

Using secondary data and statistics collected by the agencies in Moscow, the author examines the data on out migration from Central Asia. The author points out that while there has been out migration, the number of migrants is a relatively small proportion of the ethnic Russian population as of 1989. The motivations for migration were various, with "family considerations" and "ethnic relations" topping the list. The author also examines the problems this migration causes both for the host and for the donor countries. L.A.

- BUCKLEY, Cynthia, "Suicide in post-Soviet Kazakhstan: Role Stress, Age and Gender," *CAS* 16/1 (1997): 45-52.

The author examines the dramatic increase in Kazakhstan's suicide rates since 1990. She uses sociological theories about the causes of suicide to infer causality from her data, drawn from government statistics. The data show that suicide rates have increased and that men and the elderly are more likely to commit suicide, but her explanations for these phenomena in Kazakhstan are purely speculative. Buckley's approach is critiqued in a subsequent article (*CAS* 18/1 pp. 121-124) by David Lester, who uses cross-national data from the former Soviet States to correlate suicide rates with various social factors, but who also can't do more than speculate about causality. L.A.

- BURIEVA, Mamlakat Rahmonovna, *Uzbekistonda oila demografiyasi* [Family Demography in Uzbekistan], Tashkent: Universitet, 1997 (Uzbekiston Respublikasi Olii va Urta Makhsus Ta'lim Vazirligi, Mirzo Ulughbeg nomli Toshkent Davlat Universiteti Aholishunoslik ilmiy-tadqiqot laboratoriyasi), 182 p., 44+22+8 tabs.

In spite of its official character and of its chapter of political recommendations, the present monograph provides interesting data on the evolution of family demography in Uzbekistan through the twentieth century: a captivating work for the historians of contemporary Uzbekistani society. S.A.D.

- BUSHKOV, V. I., "Formirovanie sovremennoi etnicheskoi situatsii v severnom Tadjikistane [The Formation of the Current Ethnic Situation in Northern Tajikistan]," *SE* 1990/2: 30-41, 3 tabs.

On the basis of an unpublished dissertation presented in 1988 on the population of the Leninabad region (northern Tajikistan), the author provides a historical survey of migrations towards this region, since the Mongol period, of the Iranian- and Turkic-speaking populations that inhabit it nowadays. The paper goes on with a short analysis of the processes of cultural assimilation that have gone with the settlement of nomadic con-

federations (from the eighteenth to the early twentieth century), then with the migratory movements linked with industrialization. Some worries are expressed in the conclusion about the permanent rise of the demographic pressure in a country with a notoriously limited useful territory. The author also expresses his concern about the dangerous superposition of the social and ethnic cleavages, after half a century of development policy consisting of the importation of Russian manpower for the high-tech industries installed in this region, and resulting in the increase of underemployment among the autochthonous population.

See also by the same author: "The Population of Northern Tajikistan between 1870 and 1990," in Vitaly [Vitalii] Naumkin, ed., *State, Religion and Society in Central Asia: A Post-Soviet Critique*, Reading: Ithaca Press, 1993: 219-244, 2 maps, 6 tabs. This study evaluates the disastrous consequences that the recent demographic history of Central Asian societies had for the latter's structural modernization — a phenomenon through which the author tends to explain all the current evolutions, and the origins of the Tajikistani civil war. On this last aspect, see also by the same author: "Tadjikistan, quelques prémisses de la crise," *CEMOTI* 18 (1994): 15-26, tab. In this paper the author analyzes some of the demographic factors (among others the migration of mountain populations toward the cotton lowlands of the Tajikistani south from the 1950 onward) which have caused the inter-community conflicts which lie at the origin of the civil war of the years 1992-97.

S.A.D.

■ CENTLIVRES, Pierre, CENTLIVRES-DEMONT, Micheline, "Tadjikistan et Afghanistan: les groupes ethniques de part et d'autre de la frontière," in Mohammad-Reza Djalili & Frédéric Grare, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Genève: Institut Universitaire des Hautes études Internationales, 1995: 17-27.

Although this paper is based, as far as the former Soviet side of the Tajik-Afghan boundary is concerned, on geographical atlases of the USSR, it provides an interesting material for reflection on the mobilization of ethnic identity in the framework of the struggles for political influence on the Afghan bank of the Amu-Darya River. The authors deal in particular with the promotion of the word *tājik* as an ethnic denomination — a process which occurred on the basis of an attributed label, with a composite referent, used historically for the designation of varied populations alien to the dominating group.

S.A.D.

■ CHUKHOVICH, B., "Kul'turnyi mir molodykh khudozhnikov Uzbekistana, ikh sotsial'noe povedenie i tvorcheskii vybor, konets 80-kh – nach. 90-kh godov [The Cultural Universe of the Young Artists of Uzbekistan, Their Social Behaviour, and Their Creative Choice, in the Late 1980's-Early 1990's]," *TsA* 1998/3 [15]: 113-128.

An art critic of Tashkent questions himself on the reasons of the permanence of residual forms of socialist realism in Uzbekistan well after the collapse of the Soviet régime. For explaining what he considers an exception, expressed by the attachment of present-day young Uzbekistani artists for the "internationalist" legacy of the Soviet period, the

author deals with the particular sociology of the urban Soviet Uzbek intelligentsia and with the latter's economic basis, which was for the most part linked with the public commissions of a supra-ethnic state. The brutal disappearance of the USSR, followed by the installation in Tashkent of an authoritarian régime with a narrowly nationalist ideology has strongly contributed to the marginalization of the creators who had been educated in the last decade of the Soviet period, and have known their hour of glory during the years of Perestroika. S.A.D.

- CHVYR, Ludmila, "Central Asia's Tajiks: Self-Identification and Ethnic Identity," in Vitaly Naumkin, ed., *State, Religion and Society in Central Asia: A Post-Soviet Critique*, Reading: Ithaca Press, 1993: 245-261.

This study isolates three components of the system of collective identification of the former Soviet Central Asian Tajiks: their belonging to Sunni Islam, the practice of Persian language, and the allegiance to varied local and regional solidarity groups — that the author perceives as a "natural" fruit of tradition. The paper is concluded with the hypothesis of a bigger vividness of the identification with Islam, because of the fragility of the national link and the permanence of inter-regional conflicts. S.A.D.

- COOPER, Alanna E., "The Jews of Uzbekistan: A Brief Overview of Their History and Contemporary Situation," *CAM* 1998/6: 10-13.

The author, who conducted fieldwork with the Bukharan Jewish community throughout the mid-1990s, discusses the causes and consequences of massive emigration and gives a glimpse into the world of the few who have remained. As more people leave to join their friends and relatives in the U.S. and Israel, the depletion of the ancient community is seen by the author within the social context of inter-ethnic tensions and influential international organizations. L.A.

- DEYOUNG, Alan J., VALYAYEVA, Galina, "Post-Soviet Secondary School Reform in Kazakhstan: The Views of 149 Classroom Teachers," *CAM* 1997/3: 22-34.

The authors give an overview of the education system in Kazakhstan during the Soviet and post-Soviet periods and then report the results of a survey which they admit has problems with sampling and other errors. However, they did obtain answers to open-ended questions on positive and negative changes since independence, teacher status and working conditions, and language issues from over 100 educators. Since their data produced fuzzy results, they have a hard time concluding much except that the system is in chaos. L.A.

- DOBSON, Richard B., "Islam in Central Asia: Findings from National Surveys," *CAM* 1994/2: 17-22.

Using data from a survey conducted by the United States Information Agency in Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan in 1992-93, the author briefly examines religious practices, beliefs about religion and religion's role in politics and society. Of the

three countries, the Kyrgyz sample had the highest level of religious belief and the strongest conviction that Islam should play a larger role in society. L.A.

- DORRONSORO, Gilles, "Les réfugiés tadjiks en Afghanistan," *LAC* 1 (1994): 4.

The author provides a rare and interesting study on groups of Tajik refugees in Afghan territory in the beginning of the civil war, during the winter 1992-93, on the strategy then developed by these Tajikistani *mujāhidīns*, and on the general state of mind of the refugee populations. S.A.D.

- DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., HERBERT, Stéphane, "Le taekwondo, sport national... ouzbek," *France-Ouzbékistan*, 2 (1994): 10.

Here is a little paper, illustrated by Stéphane Herbert, which deserved to be signalled. Through the spectacular success of this martial art of Korean origin which, forbidden under Brezhnev, was promoted in four years (1990-93) to the rank of a genuine national sport. S. Dudoignon explains in one single page the lines that are followed by local and national identity dynamics in Uzbekistan, and reminds us that sport practice is a constitutive element of modern societies as well as politics or religion. Ph.R.

- DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., "Permanence des sociétés traditionnelles: le *gap*," *France-Ouzbékistan*, 2 (1994): 14-16.

On the basis of some inquiries realized in Tashkent in 1995, the author provides a short introduction to the *gap*, a semi-formal institution which lies at the core of traditional and alternative sociability in sedentary Central Asia. R.

- EDMUNDS, Timothy, "Searching for a Nationalism: Foci for Kazakh Identity in the 1990s," *CAM* 2000/2: 6-12.

This article provides a glimpse of the various bases of identities for Kazakhs, including nomadism, Islam, and the *zhuz* (which he notes doesn't actually mean that much to most people). Though the author doesn't provide any explicit methodological information, the data appear to be based on interviews conducted by him in 1996. He concludes that since all of these approaches focus on a pre-Soviet Kazakh identity, non-Kazakh citizens are being excluded from the emerging national identity. L.A.

- EITZEN, Hilda C., "Nawriz in Kazakhstan: Scenarios for Managing Diversity," in Ingvar Svanberg, ed., *Contemporary Kazaks: Cultural and Social Perspectives*, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1999: 73-102.

Based on secondary sources and fieldwork in Kazakhstan, the author explores the historical transformation and contemporary meanings of the spring Nawriz holiday. The author argues that public holidays in Almaty provide a forum for promoting interethnic consensus through inclusive forms of celebration and opportunities for social commentary. Nawriz in a rural area is more of a "national" celebration, showcasing contemporary interpretations of traditional culture. The article gives interesting descrip-



tions of particular events but draws some dubious connections between historical and contemporary symbolism. L.A.

- ENGIN DEMIR, Cennet, BALCI, Ayse, AKKOK, Fusun, "The Role of Turkish Schools in the Educational System and Social Transformation of Central Asian Countries: the Case of Turkmenistan and Kirghizstan," *CAS* 19/1 (2000): 141-155.

On the basis of inquiries realized in Turkmenistan and in Kyrgyzstan, the authors underline the fundamental role played by Turkish schools in social change and in modernization of the educational system of these two countries. The good image of Turkish schools in Central Asia is explained by their good results in university concourses, and by the fact that teaching is made there in English language. Conversely, probably because of a too short stay in the two countries, the authors did not perceive all the complexity of the phenomenon of the "Turkish schools" in ex-Soviet Central Asia, since they gather into one and the same category the *Nurcu* schools and the institutions which depend directly on the Turkish embassies and are administered by a representative of the Turkish Ministry of Education. The latter remain less numerous and less attractive than their *Nurcu* counterparts, which take advantage of their teaching staff with a missionary spirit, of their modern pedagogical facilities, of their schooling system based on boarding, etc. One can deplore that the authors have not even discern the most visible differences between these two types of schools: the dominance of teaching in English language in the *Nurcu* schools, whence the institutions of the Turkish Republic teach exclusively in Turkish. On a more general level, the success which is enjoyed by both systems is not explained, and one can regret the lack of light on the networks of economic and political support to the Turkish schools in charge of the education of the new elites of Turkmenistan and Kyrgyzstan. Last, the reader would have liked the study to be enlarged of the study to the other Central Asian countries, since it is in Uzbekistan and in Kazakhstan that the Turkish schools are the most numerous and the most active. B.B.

- FALKINGHAM, Jane, KLUGMAN, Jeni et al., eds., *Household Welfare in Central Asia*, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1997.

The contributions to this volume draw on official government data, data from international organizations such as UNDP, and data from studies conducted by organizations such as the World Bank. It is an excellent contribution to the sociological literature on Central Asia, though already out of date. The first part of the book examines the methodological problems of assessing household welfare in Central Asia. The second part of the book is a careful examination of various tools and indicators for quantifying living standards in Central Asia and reports on the concrete results of using these different methodologies in studies on poverty, living standards, the labour market, and nutritional status. The third part of the book looks at the interaction between various social supports ranging and household welfare. The chapters in this section report on public transfers in Kyrgyzstan, kindergarten divestiture, exchanges between households,

and the role of the voluntary sector.

L.A.

- FIERMAN, William, "Western Popular Culture and Soviet Youth: A Case Study of the 'Muslim' Regions," *CAS* 7/1 (1988): 7-36.

Using a variety of print sources, including images, the author looks at the official and unofficial dissemination of Western popular culture and speculates about the reception of these images by urban young people in Soviet Central Asia by reading between the lines of the official media that critiques foreign pop culture. He puts his analysis in the context of attempts to address social problems among Soviet youth and examines official attempts to borrow from Western pop culture for their own ends.

L.A.

- FIERMAN, William, "Central Asian Youth and Migration," in William Fierman, *Soviet Central Asia: The Failed Transformation*, Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1991: 255-289.

In this chapter, the author uses published statistics, secondary sources and newspaper articles to address the interesting issue of the Central Asian resistance to migration, despite high rural rates of unemployment. Though the Soviet government provided many incentives for youth to migrate to the cities and to other parts of the USSR that had a high demand for labour, the Central Asians were less likely than other groups to migrate for school and career, and far more likely to move back to their native region within a few years. The author points to certain attitudes (such as attachment to family) and the lack of skills (stemming from the poor quality of local schools) as the main factors keeping Central Asians at home. Unfortunately, the author's causal analysis is marked by his overly simplified view of Central Asian cultures. For example, he claims that Uzbeks are "confused" about the difference between their nationality and their religion (p. 272). Such an observation only indicates the author's own superficial understanding of what these concepts mean to the people he was studying.

L.A.

- FOURNIAU, Vincent, "Les Arabes d'Asie centrale soviétique: maintenance et mutation de l'identité ethnique," *ReMMM* 59-60/1-2 (1991): 83-100.

Based on census and ethnographic studies of the Soviet period (the classical works by Andreev and by Karmysheva among others), this paper assesses the permanence of an "Arab" identity in present-day Uzbekistan. The author asks the question of a political future of a "minority" in the framework of an Uzbekistani society now confronted with inter-community violence. Informed with the Stalinist ideology of nationalities, the paper suffers from its ethnic essentialism, and from the author's lack of interest for the often "functionalist" content of ethnic denominations in Soviet Central Asia (see on this aspects the works by J.S. Schoeberlein-Engel).

S.A.D.

- GLEASON, Gregory, "Educating for Underdevelopment: The Soviet Vocational Education System and Its Central Asian Critics," *CAS* 4/1 (1985): 59-81.

Using secondary sources, the author explores the thesis that vocational training was an important political issue that reflected Central Asia's colonial status. He evaluates the

responsiveness of central policy makers to local concerns and the urbanizing effects of new technocratic policies. L.A.

- HANEY, Michael, "Media Use and Ethnicity in Almaty," *CAM* 1995/2: 15-22.

Using survey data collected with a random sample of residents of Almaty in 1994, the author discusses issues of language use and consumption of media. Specific data from the study are presented in tables on state media consumption and language use, and the non-consumers of Kazakhstan state media are also discussed. No theoretical or analytical framework is presented for interpreting these data. L.A.

- HARRIS, Colette, "Coping with Daily Life in Post-Soviet Tajikistan: the Gharmpi Villages of Khatlon Province," *CAS* 17/4 (1998): 655-671.

Beyond giving a well-founded idea of the problems of daily life that women of the defeated Gharmpi population of southern Tajikistan had to face as a result of the disruptive effects of armed struggle in 1992/93, this article also provides a remarkably deep and sensitive insight into sentiments of Tajikistan's population struck by civil war and its aftermath. R.E.

- HOWELL, Jude, "Poverty and Transition in Kyrgyzstan: How Some Households Cope," *CAS* 15/1 (1996): 59-73.

Based on original research carried out during 1994, the author sketches a broad picture of the economic situation in Kyrgyzstan and then discusses how poor households are responding to the transition, highlighting the differences between urban and rural areas as well as differences between households. The author also draws out the implications of her findings for shaping economic policies. L.A.

- IKRAMOVA, Ula, McCONNELL, Kathryn, "Women's NGOs in Central Asia's Evolving Societies," in M. Holt Ruffin & Daniel C. Waugh, eds., *Civil Society in Central Asia*, s.l.: Center for Civil Society International, 1999: 198-213.

While this article takes neither an analytical nor a systematic approach to the role of Women's NGOs in Central Asia, nonetheless it is broadly informative. Drawing mainly on the data of U.S.-based non-governmental and governmental organizations, the authors provide anecdotal evidence about the problems faced both by Central Asian societies that women's NGOs help address, and the problems faced by women's NGOs in Central Asia. The authors also provide concrete, if selective, quantitative data about finances, membership, publications, etc. L.A.

- ILKHAMOV, Alisher, "Shirkats, Dekhqon Farmers and Others: Farm Restructuring in Uzbekistan," *CAS* 17/4 (1998): 539-560.

The author examines the so-called restructuring of state farms in Uzbekistan, which has been little more than a change in name from *kolkhoz* to *shirkat*. The numbers of these farms actually increased during the 1990s, and the state managers of these farms con-

tinue to function as a local aristocracy in charge of the distribution of scarce goods. The local ruling elites have little incentive to reform the system and the farmers continue to bear the brunt of the economic hardship caused by problems in the national economy.

L.A.

- ISHOQOV, Boris, *Zafarmandon (Majmuai ocherkho va p'esahoi ta'rikhī-qahramonī)* [The Victors (Collected Historical and Heroic Studies and Dramas)], Dushanbe: Irfon, 1993, 496 p.

This collection of journalistic and literary writings (notably several historical dramas) by a prominent figure of the Bukharan Jewish community, added with testimonies by contemporaries, constitutes an important document on the political destinies and the social and cultural practices of the Persian-speaking Jews of Central Asia during the decades following WWII — the role of which as a founding drama of a new supra-ethnic Soviet community is particularly enhanced in these writings.

S.A.D.

- ISMAILOV, Kh. I., "O narodnykh trudovykh traditsiiakh uzbekov [About Popular Labour Traditions among the Uzbeks]," *SE* 1990/6: 115-122.

The counter-productivity of the centralized economic system and the wandering of Soviet science in matter of ecology have aroused the appearance in the USSR, in the late 1980s, of a renewed interest in the "popular experience of labour" in matter of exploitation of natural resources. Through a number of ethnographic works (by M.S. Andreev, N.A. Kisliakov, G.P. Snesev, etc.), the author provides a global description of several female variants of the *hashar*, a traditional mode of mutual assistance and socialization in the rural communities of Mawarannahr.

S.A.D.

- ISMOILOV, Haiot, *Uzbek tiulari* [The Uzbek Feasts], Tashkent: Uzbekiston, 1992, 186 p.

Unfortunately deprived of the lesser critical apparatus, this work offered to a general readership the description of several cyclic or initiation rituals (circumcision, marriage, etc.) as they are again practiced openly, or even officially, in Uzbekistan since the end of the Soviet period.

S.A.D.

- [JABBOROV] ZHABBOROV, Iso, *Uzbek khalq etnografiyasi* [Ethnography of the Uzbek People], Tashkent: Uqituvchi, 1994, 312 p.

The author summarily sketches, with no mention of the sources of his information, the supposedly specific features of the Uzbek "tribal" (*qabilavii*) culture as it endures nowadays in fields as varied as feeding, sociability, or religious life.

S.A.D.

- [JURAQULOV] ZHABBOROV, Obod, *Qashqadario Manghitlari* [The Qashqa-Darya Manghits], Tashkent: Uzbekiston Respublikasi Fanlar akademiiyasining Fan nashriyoti, 1993, 256 p.

The author analyzes the most varied features of the economic and social life of the *qishloq* (wintering village) of Manghit, in the Uzbekistani region of Surkhan-Darya. In spite of — or thanks to — its complete absence of any critical apparatus, of its hotch-

potch of information, and its overall aspect of a long press report, this work constitutes an invaluable document on the impact of the history of the twentieth century upon the local communities of cultivators of one of the most important agricultural regions of Uzbekistan. S.A.D.

- KADYROV, Shokhrat, "Some Questions of the Study of the Turkmen Family," *CAS* 12/3 (1993): 393-400.

Basing his analysis on published survey and census data, the author examines several socio-demographic processes including urbanization, family living patterns, birth rates, women's concerns, family planning, and marriage practices. L.A.

- KANDIYOTI, Deniz, "Rural Livelihoods and Social Networks in Uzbekistan: Perspectives from Andijan," *CAS* 17/4 (1998): 561-578.

Using data from her own fieldwork, the author examines household economies and the circulation of cash through social networks to understand how families are coping with the decline of the centralized economy. The article contains interesting and concrete information on particular families' domestic financial arrangements in addition to discussing more general conditions. She argues that whereas social networks facilitated access to goods under the previous economy, now these networks are facilitating access to cash. In a time of inflation, keeping cash on hand circulating through a social network makes sense because cash only retains its value if it is used right away. She concludes that informal methods of coping are one of the lasting legacies of the command economy but they are innovative in coping with the demands of the new economy, as well. L.A.

- KHAFIZOVA, Lyudmila, "Business Culture and Ethics in Post-Soviet Uzbekistan, Azerbaijan and Georgia," *CAaC* 1/3 (2000): 153-165.

Based on 50 in-depth interviews conducted in 1999, the author explicates the attitudes of Western and local business people in the capitals of Uzbekistan, Azerbaijan and Georgia. The questions covered Westernization, problems of doing business, how Westerners and locals adapt to each other, and the differing understanding of the ethical aspects of the business practices in different cultures. This latter topic goes into practices that are viewed as Soviet legacies, national traditions, and Western. The author concludes that Soviet practices most strongly affect local business ethics. Locals are seen as more accommodating to Western practices than Westerners are to local practices. L.A.

- KHAZANOV, Anatoly M., "The Ethnic Problems of Contemporary Kazakhstan," *CAS* 14/2 (1995): 243-264.

The author purports to explain the ethnic (not state) bases of nationalism by using secondary sources to provide a broad overview of the ethnic composition, language laws, social structure, urban migration, and political and cultural elites of Kazakhstan.

L.A.

- KOROTEYEVA, Victoria [KOROTEEVA, Viktoriia], MAKAROVA, Ekaterina, "Money and Social Connections in the Soviet and Post-Soviet Uzbek City," *CAS* 17/4 (1998): 579-596.

Rather than examine some sort of mythical transition, the authors look at concrete Soviet and Muslim institutions and practices in order to explain contemporary practices of reciprocity and consumption. Having conducted fieldwork in Samarqand between 1985 and 1995, the authors are in a unique position to analyse changing patterns of behaviour. Their article covers a broad range of fascinating topics with clarity, examining practices associated with the fuzzy area between the formal and informal economies, the way networks of reciprocity work, and discourses of tradition and modernity. They also present a refreshing point of view on the competition between Western and local goods for prestige among consumers.

L.A.

- KOROTEYEVA, Victoria [KOROTEEVA, Viktoriia], MAKAROVA, Ekaterina, "The Assertion of Uzbek National Identity: Nativization or State-Building Process?," in Touraj Atabaki and John O'Kane, eds., *Post-Soviet Central Asia*, London: Tauris Academic Publishers, 1998: 137-143.

In this chapter, which is based on their extensive fieldwork in Uzbekistan, the authors explore the role of the neighbourhood (*mahalla*) organization as the nexus between the state and communities in Soviet and post-Soviet eras. The authors argue that the process of "indigenization" (their term for what the state calls the restoration of national tradition, though it's not clear why they make the distinction) consists of state-sponsored nation building through the appropriation of indigenous local institutions, specifically, the mahalla. The government wants to make this unit of society a unit of the state, and is transplanting this urban institution into the villages, as well. The post-Soviet mahalla organization provides essential bureaucratic and social functions for its members and is increasingly an instrument, the authors argue, of "the penetration of state activity into daily life...by an appeal to popular tradition as a legitimizing strategy" (p. 140). Unfortunately, the authors don't deliver any strong conclusions nor do they tie in their work to any larger body of literature.

L.A.

- KOSMARSKAIA, Natal'ia, "Ia nikuda ne khochu uezhat'". Zhizn' v postsovetsoi Kirgizii glazami russkikh ["I don't Want to Go Anywhere." Life in Post-Soviet Kyrgyzstan through the Eyes of Russians], *VE* 1998/1-2 [4-5]: 76-100, [2] ill., 1 tab.

The result of an inquiry held in 1995-1997 thanks to a financial support of the European body INTAS, the present study is devoted to the current process of "diasporization" of the Russian community of Kyrgyzstan. The author gives a statement on the causes of the recent, but sudden slowing down of the emigration waves toward Russia in several Russian-speaking populations of former Soviet Central Asia. She underlines in particular the specificity of Kyrgyzstan, through a comparison of the contradictory attitudes, regarding departure, among the Russian populations of this country (which are

generally reluctant to leave) and of Tajikistan (where persists only a limited, residual Russian population). The author also shows how, inside Kyrgyzstan, the varying adaptation of different groups of the Russian population to a market economy marked by ethnic groupings has influenced the attitude toward departure among these different groups — she has noted for instance notable differences between men and women. The paper is concluded with an analysis of the uneven audience of communal associations in various categories of the Russian population of Kyrgyzstan. S.A.D.

- KUPOVETSKII, M. S., "Evrei iz Meshkheda i Gerata v Srednei Azii [The Jews from Mashhad and Herat in Middle Asia]," *EO* 1992/5: 54-64.

This short historical study deals with the emigration toward Central Asia, from the mid-nineteenth century onward, of Jewish populations from the cities of Mashhad and Herat — among which some had recently been converted to Islam. The author casts light on the impact of the measures taken in the 1880s by the Russian colonial administration against the nationals of foreign countries on the migration strategies of these Jewish populations of the Iranian and Afghan Khurasan. The latter tended notably to make use of the tolerance of the Russian authorities toward Shiite Iranians and pretended to be so, holding the social life of the *Jadīd al-islām* after they had settled in Central Asia. After 1910 and during the two first decades of the Soviet period, until the red terror of the mid-1930s one can observe a reverse migration toward Iran, those who remained in Central Asia being then confused in census with the bulk of the Jewish population of the USSR. The author provides the results of an inquiry held about the residual migrant communities in Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan and in Tajikistan (marriage strategies, religious practices, material culture, proper name and other linguistic specificities, communal identity). S.A.D.

- KURGANSKAIA, Valentina, "Kazakhstan: The Language Problem in the Context of Ethnic Relations," *CAaC* 1/1 (2000): 53-64.

Examines language policy issues as well as presenting opinion poll data on Russian and Kazakh attitudes towards migration and language issues (however, specifics of the poll's methodology are not given). Data on other aspects of language use such as education and the mass media are also presented (also without adequate information about the source of the data). In her conclusions the author concisely analyses causes and consequences for contemporary conflicts over language in Kazakhstan. L.A.

- LIUSHKEVICH, F. D., "Traditsii mezhsemeinykh svyazei uzbeksko-tadzhikskogo naseleniia Srednei Azii (K probleme bytovaniia *kalyma* i drugikh patriarkhal'nykh obychaev) [The Traditions of Inter-Familial Links among the Uzbek-Tajik Population of Middle Asia (About the Question of the Survival of the *Kalym* and of Other Patriarchal Customs)]," *SE* 1989/4: 58-68.

On the basis of a century long tradition of Russian and Soviet ethnography, and of personal observations made mainly in the region of Bukhara, the author tries to demythol-

ogise the *kalym* which is traditionally perceived as the purchase of the bride by the family of her future husband, and which is introduced in the present study as a ritual exchange of gifts. As such, to the author's eyes the survival of the *kalym* has made it one of the last remnants of the pre-Soviet multi-family community, and a significant brake on the "cultural homogenization" of Central Asian societies. On this point, the author transforms himself into an ideologist of Perestroika, and his discourse gets a normative tint, in particular when he denounces the influence of this customary practice of ritual exchanges in the preservation of traditional solidarity networks inside the Soviet Uzbekistani bureaucracy, and when he criticizes the immoderate (to his eyes) taste of the vernacular population for extravagant spending, considered by the author a characteristic of pre-modern societies. In addition to his observation of the vivacity and dynamism of the institution of *kalym*, the author exhorts the political institutions of Soviet Uzbekistan and of the USSR to act through the intermediary of neighborhood communities (*mahallas*) and solidarity groupings (*jamoats*), in order to struggle more efficiently against the resistance force of Central Asian indigenous societies against the slogans imported from the centre.

S.A.D.

- LYONS, Shawn T., "Where Is the Gold of Amir Said Alimkhan. An Uzbek Metaphor for the Past," *CAS* 14/1 (1995): 5-16.

Since 1991, the year of the proclamation of independence by Uzbekistan (and other former Soviet Central Asian republics), a number of papers on the vanished treasure of the last Emir of Bukhara have set up an ethno-centered historical discourse, focused on two main ideas: on the first hand that of a noble ascendancy of the Uzbek nation and of its bright past; on the other hand a vision of this nation as a victim of the spoliations of the Russian and Soviet power. The author notes that if this paradigm brings a useful contribution to the necessary national catharsis of post-Soviet Uzbekistan, it shows over-simplistic and compromises the possibility of a critical historical discourse. Moreover, this paradigm bases the historical culture of the new Uzbekistani state on the idea of a collective irresponsibility brought about by European colonialism — this notion can be found in other, non-Soviet regions of the Iranian and Turkic world —; it does not seem to be in a position to make Uzbekistanis more conscious of their role as full-right protagonists of their collective destiny.

S.A.D.

- MAGHSOUDI, Manizheh, "Le mariage chez les Turkmènes," *Luqmān* 12/2 (1375/1996): 59-73.

The author provides a study of the particular types of marriage among the Göklan Turkmens: levirate, sororate, marriage through exchange, marriage of a daughter with an adoptive father, marriage through a donation of religious character, marriage through abduction. These types of marriage imply of answer to strong social pressures, which let little room for the spouses' choice; conversely, they go with exemptions from matrimonial compensations.

J.-P.D.

- MASANOV, Nurbulat, "Kazakhskaiia politicheskaiia i intellektual'naia elita: klanovaia pri-



nadlezhnost' i vnutrietnicheskoe sopernichestvo [The Kazakh Political and Intellectual Elite: Clan Affiliation and Intra-Ethnic Competition]," *VE* 1 [2] (1996): 46-61.

In this study nourished for the most part by the author's personal observations, he provides an analysis of the weigh of hordes of "hundreds" (*zhuz*, traditional segmentations of Kazakh nomadic society) in the inner conflicts of the political class in Kazakhstan since the independence of the country in 1991. The overall picture, enriched by considerations on the long duration, is quite seductive. However the author tends to introduce the *zhuz* as a trans-historical category, on which the mutations of the twentieth century would have had no impact at all, whence the political life of Kazakhstan would have been reduced to a mechanical and multi-secular antagonism of perennial clan structures. The main elements given by the author for situating the *zhuz* in the specific context of the current period are allusions to their utilization by Yu. Andropov in the early 1980s in the perspective of a purge of the Kazakhstani Communist party, and a conclusion on the weigh of clan structures in the organization of migrant communities which nowadays would make of more than 90% of the overall population of Kazakhstan. This stimulating reflection remains to be deepened, in particular by further research on the evolution and transformation of the *zhuz* through the twentieth century.

S.A.D.

● MEGORAN, Nick, "Theorizing Gender, Ethnicity and the Nation-State in Central Asia," *CAS* 18/1 (1999): 99-110.

Megoran states that Central Asian studies have ignored the importance of feminist scholarship on national identity and he is going to remedy this by examining how national identity in Central Asia is gendered. The author reviews and thoughtfully critiques the theoretical literature on this topic, especially the work done in Islamic countries, and the literatures on gender and on national identity in Central Asia. He uses an engaging (though unsystematically chosen) case study on gender and change at Ferghana State University to illustrate the complex web of gender and identity at play in Uzbekistan.

L.A.

● MESHCHERYAKOV, Aleksandr, "'You See that Cow? That's a Television...' Village Survival and the Information Environment," *IA* 1/1 (1999): 87-94.

This paper connects the economic collapse in Tory, Buryatia with a turning inward, both in terms of relying on a household economy and in terms of the information environment. Literate media are not used much because the dialect differs from literary Buryat. Oral communication is strong, however, and TV and video are an essential part of the domestic economy. The reliance on TV means that villagers are more connected to events in Moscow and around the world than in their own region, with the exception of the intense interconnection of local networks through conversation. These networks in turn help support the structures of household economies.

L.A.

■ MIKUL'SKII, Dmitrii Valentinovich, "Opyt analiza nekrologov chlenov Islamskoi partii

vozhrozhdeniia Tadjikistana [A Tentative Analysis of the Obituaries of the Members of Tajikistan's Islamic Party of Renewal]," *Vostok* 1996/1: 56-64, tab., Eng. sum.

Based on an analysis of several obituaries of "martyrs" of the Tajikistani civil war, published in the newspaper of the Party of the Islamic Revival in 1991-92, this study concludes on the neighbouring of values inherited from a more or less ancient vernacular tradition (remnants of agrarian cults today conveyed by the Naqshbandiyya, the backbone of the Tajikistani PIR) with values created by the Soviet system (in particular an overall insistence of the authors of these obituaries on the belonging of each defunct to the "Tajik" nation — which, however, may have expressed less an ideal of community identity than unsatisfied aspirations to citizenship). S.A.D.

■ MIROLIMOV, Shavkat, ed., *Mahalla mehri* [The Grace of the *Mahalla*], Tashkent: Navruz, 1994, 136 p.

This short work is representative of the official journalistic production of post-Soviet Uzbekistan; it evokes the multiple attempts by the new power to take in hand the current renewal of urban traditional sociability and assistance networking at the level of neighbourhood communities (*mahallas*). S.A.D.

■ MONOGAROVA, L. F., "Pamirtsy: narodnosti ili subetnosy tadjikov? [The Pamirians: Nationalities or Sub-Ethnies of the Tajiks?]," *SE* 1989/5: 28-35.

The author relates some of the main steps of the acculturation of Iranian-speaking communities of the Autonomous Region of Higher Badakhshan by Persian-speaking Tajiks since the mid-eighteenth century. She studies the effects of this acculturation process on the complex ethnic identity which has been developed since the 1950s by the Iranian-speaking communities of the Pamir. The latter have been marked in Tajikistan by a spectacular intensification of population movements between varied regions of this (then) Soviet Central Asian republic. The symbolic identity of the Wakhis, of the Zgamiks, etc. changes today according to whom they address: 1) to other Pamirians (then the primary identity predominates: Wakhi, Zgamik...); 2) to Tajiks from the lowlands (Wakhis and Zgamiks will then call themselves *Pamiris*); 3) or when they are outside Tajikistan (in that case all introduce themselves as Tajiks). The author notices that the "tajikization" of the Iranian-speaking communities of Higher Badakhshan will be achieved only when the Tajiks themselves will apply to them their ethnic self-denomination (which is now the case only for a part of the population of Vanj). The author still remarks that these communities tend to develop a common "Pamirian" identity which could find an expression in the political field, as we have seen in 1991 through the creation of the regionalist party *La'li Badakhshon*. S.A.D.

■ MUKANOVA, Gul'nar, "Migratsii kazakhov v Tsentral'noi Azii: vzgliad v proshloe i popytka prognozirovaniia [The Migrations of the Kazakhs in Central Asia: A Look to the Past and a Tentative Prospective]," *VE* 2 [3] (1996): 64-73.

This study on the "repatriation" (Rus. *repatriatsiia*) to Kazakhstan of the Kazakhs of

Mongolia and of Xinjiang since the early 1990s is original by several of its aspects. First, it is devoted to a population movement toward ex-Soviet Central Asia, contrary to the enormous majority of works on migrations from this region toward, for instance, Russia. Moreover, current population movements are resituated in the medium duration: the author devotes several useful pages to the history of Kazakh emigration from Semirech'e and the left bank of the Irtysh River toward Dzhungaria in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, in particular during periods of weakening of the Qing dominance in Eastern Turkestan. Several pages are devoted to the social effects of the "return" of the 1990s to Kazakhstan, and to the cautious political line adopted for several years about the Kazakhs of China by the governments of Astana and of Beijing. One may perhaps deplore the rarity in this study of statistical elements, and a still very embryonic approach to the social effects of this reverse migration to Kazakhstan, and to the utilization of this movement by the political organizations of the Kazakh opposition.

S.A.D.

- MUNKĪ, Rajab, KHATLONĪ, Amirsho, *Nomus* [Honour], Dushanbe: Nashrioti Paik, 1994, 352 p.

This is a collection of some 350 biographies illustrated by photographic portraits of "martyrs" of the Tajikistani civil war who came from the main districts of the south of the country: an important document for the future construction of a typical figure of the fighters of the "red," pro-Communist militias grouped for some time under the authority of the warlord Sangak Safar.

S.A.D.

- OKTIABR'SKAIA, I. V., "Kazakhi Altaia. Istoriia i sovremennost' [The Kazakhs of the Altai: Past and Present]," *EO* 1997/6: 92-102.

The author describes the process of the ethnic formation of the Kazakhs in the Republic of the Altai (the former Higher Altai Autonomous Region), in which they numerically make of the third national group, which makes them a minority in this national republic of the Russian Federation. The border demarcation set up in the Kazakh Steppe by the Qing and Russian Empires in the 19th and early 20th century have played a decisive role in the appearance of the Kazakhs as a distinct entity in this region. Meanwhile, a succession of migration waves has been occurring from the Kazakh Steppe, from Mongolia and from Xinjiang. The author analyses this historical process in detail, and the current relations between the Kazakhs and the Altais (Telengits), the titular nation of the republic. The paper insists on differences between these two peoples' culture and customs, especially on the role of religion in the shaping of a distinct Kazakh identity. Through the right given the Kazakhs of the Altai, by the Russian government, to use their own language, in education in particular, the author estimates that their case can be a model of coexistence in a multi-ethnic society.

N.J.

- OLIMOV, M. A., OLIMOVA, S. K., "Obshchestvo i konflikt v Tadjikistane [The Society and the Conflict in Tajikistan]," *Vostok* 1998/5: 40-55.

After a long theoretical introduction the authors embark on a global analysis of the social structure of the Tajikistani civil war. They insist first on the weak mutual articulation of the different regions of Tajikistan, a country described as a conglomerate of "sub-ethnic groups" (*sub-etnosy*) deprived of the lesser homogeneity. (On this aspect, see also: NIIAZI, A. Sh., "Tadzhikistan: konflikt regionov [Tajikistan: An Inter-Regional Conflict]," *ibid.* 1997/2: 94-107). The authors then describe, in a more innovative chapter, the role played in the conflict by different groups of patri-linear relationship, gathered under the common denomination of *awlād* (Taj. *avlod*). The main innovation of this paper is its analysis of the reinforcing of patriarchal structures, as a consequence of manpower migrations in the course of the last decades, and of the ravages of the civil war in the adult male population of some regions (of Khatlan in particular). The authors have also been interested in the upheavals which have appeared during the last years in the distribution of social roles (between men and women, notably) inside the *awlāds*, as well as in the latter's functional changes in the regions deeply transformed by the economic changes of the past decade. The whole paper constitutes an original contribution to the understanding of the structure of the Tajikistani conflict, but it still remains very theoretical — some hypotheses should be backed up by a genuine fieldwork.

S.A.D.

■ OLIMOVA, Saodat, "Tadzhikistan — pervaya ostanovka na puti afganskoi migratsii [Tajikistan: First Stop on the Way of the Afghan Migration]," *TsAiK* 1 (1998): 105-113.

In spite of a certain amount of confusion in figures, the sources of which are rarely quoted (most come from the police), this short study of the Afghan immigration in Tajikistan casts a crude light on a still poorly documented but significant phenomenon of the 1990s (there were 4,541 officially registered Afghan refugees in Tajikistan in 1997, and some 20,000 illegal immigrants in this country at the end of the same year). Beside the recent infiltrations by the Taliban in mountainous regions of southern Tajikistan (which was "revealed" by the arrest of four Pakistanis in one of the mosques of Dushanbe in April 1998, on which the author does not develop), this migrant population is divided into four clearly distinct categories: 1) former students who did not return to their homeland at the end of their studies, and seem nowadays well integrated into the Tajikistani society; 2) political refugees: executives of the Najibullah administration or of the industrial or academic apparatus of the defunct Popular Republic of Afghanistan, who have formed in Tajikistan a well-organized diaspora; 3) those who more recently have fled from the Taliban: Tajiks, Uzbeks and Hazaras of the central regions of Afghanistan, who represent the most recent and massive wave of incomers, and make of an illegal and transitory migration; 4) last the economic migrants who come from camps of Afghan refugees in Iran and in Pakistan, and are also in transit toward Russia, Western Europe or Northern America.

The author describes with precision the access routes of these illegal migrants; she insists notably on the vagueness of the respective consular rules of the different Central Asian countries, and denounces the total lack of coordination between the chanceries.

In spite of the reinforcement of the Russian control on the Afghan boundary, the author also evokes the role of smugglers (*qochogbar*) active in drug traffics in the underground transportation of migrants. She makes allusions to the infiltration of the Tajikistani Ministry of the Interior, and of the international airports of Central Asia by the international structures of the Central Asian underworld, which favors the latter's role as an inevitable intermediary for the illegal emigration toward the West. Documented exclusively by Tajikistani police sources, this study expresses concerns which are those of the public forces of this country, the discourse or estimations of which (*e.g.*, on the tariffs of emigration through illegal ways) do not seem to have been always checked by the author. One must however rejoice oneself with the presence of a short paragraph on the economic and social consequences of the Afghan immigration in Tajikistan, one of the most significant of which is no doubt its deregulating effect on the delicate process of reintegration of former Tajik refugees of the civil war period who come back from their exile in Afghanistan.

S.A.D.

- POUJOL, Catherine, "Qelihot ha-yhudim dovrei tajikit be-Asya ha-tkhtonatmu-nat mazab [The Tajik-Speaking Jewish Communities in Central Asia: Their Contemporary Situation]," *Pe'amim* 25 (1988): 178-197, 1 map, 5 photos.

The author surveys the Bukharan Jewish communities in Central Asia today, giving details on ten of them. Her presentation, based on numerous visits and interviews, gives a picture of religious and community life of the Jews and estimates of their people.

H.L.

- RAKHIMOV, R. R., *Muzhskie doma v traditsionnoi kul'ture Tadzhikov* ['Men's Houses' in the Traditional Culture of the Tajiks], Leningrad: Nauka, 1990 (AN SSSR, Institut etnografii im. N.N. Miklukho-Maklaia), 156 p.

The term "Men's house" means by metonymy the cultural institution made up by various forms of traditional male associations in sedentary Central Asia. Local authors use various denominations, such as '*alāw-khāna*' ("house of fire"), which is borrowed from the Tajiks of the mountain, '*mehmān-khāna*', '*gap-khāna*' or '*jūra*' ("parlour"), in use among the Tajiks of the plains, as well as among the Yaghnobis and other inhabitants of some localities in the Zarafshan Valley. This phenomenon is known through written sources since the end of the nineteenth century (see A. Grebenkin, "Tadzhiki," *Russkii Turkestan*, 2, 1872). Since the 1950s it has been studied by ethnographers from Uzbekistan (G.M. Gavrilov, O.A. Sukhareva), Kyrgyzstan (S.M. Abramzon) and Tajikistan (in particular M.S. Andreev, V.V. Ginzburg and N.A. Kisliakov). After S.P. Tolstov and G.P. Snesarev ("Traditsiia muzhskikh soiuзов v ee pozdneishe variante u narodov Srednei Azii [The Tradition of Male Unions in Its Latest Version among the Peoples of Middle Asia]," in *Materialy Khorezmskoi ekspeditsii*, Moscow, 7, 1963), the author tries to define the function of the "male houses" in the social life and ritual practices of the Tajiks, the place of these "houses" in the processes of socialization. The author has focused his description on the northernmost regions of Tajikistan (Khujand

area), where the traditions of intensive agriculture, large scale trade, and developed craftsmanship may have permitted a better transmission of the traditional male associations, at least until the beginning of collectivisation in the late 1920s, than in the southern regions of that republic. The materials that form the base of this work have been gathered by the author during annual expeditions undertaken since 1972. These expeditions have permitted the author to fix cultural traditions confronted with the importation of new norms of social behaviour. These data give to this work the quality of a primary source for the study of the permanency of the traditional forms of collective organization among the Tajiks.

S.A.D.

- RAKHIMOV, R. R., "K voprosu o sovremennykh tadjiksko-uzbekskikh mezhdunarodnykh otnosheniiakh [On the Question of the Present Inter-Ethnic Relations between the Tajiks and the Uzbeks]," *SE* 1991/1: 13-24.

This study has been realized in the framework of a research programme launched on the urban cultures of contemporary Central Asia by the St. Petersburg section of the Institute of Ethnographic Studies of the Academy of Sciences of the USSR. On the basis of inquiries held in the sensitive years 1987 to 1989 the author analyzes the social relations and linguistic exchanges between the Uzbek and Tajik communities of two urban neighbourhoods mixing ancient housing and constructions of the Soviet period in Samarqand (*mahalla* of Siyob) and in Bukhara (Fayzallah-Khwajaev district). In a short historical introduction the author (who is a Tajik) remarks the tendency of Soviet census, since 1926, to exaggerate the rate of Uzbeks and to minimize in the same measure that of the Tajiks in the population of these two cities. This phenomenon has been accompanied by an escheat of teaching in Tajik Persian language. Tajik language having been relegated in Uzbekistan to the status of residual dialects, the children intended to make studies have been obliged to attend the schools where teaching is given in Uzbek or in Russian. The author however underlines the pernicious effects of the resulting situation: in Samarqand and in Bukhara, Uzbek schools are attended for 80% by Tajik pupils, whose amount obliges their Uzbek counterparts to bathe constantly in a Persian-speaking climate (that of school playgrounds; moreover, the teachers are often obliged to summarize or to explain the difficult parts of their lessons in Tajik). From the end of the Soviet period the de-russianization and uzbekization of teaching have contributed to reducing the chances of young Tajiks to access to qualified jobs. (According to official figures the proportion of young Tajiks with higher education diplomas, in relation to the global Tajik population of Uzbekistan, is twice lower than in Tajikistan.) This situation is at the origin of inter-ethnic tensions which have appeared in the two studied cities since the first years of the Perestroika period.

S.A.D.

- RO'I, Yaacov, "Central Asian Riots and Disturbances, 1989-1990: Causes and Context," *CAS* 10/3 (1991): 21-54.

The author, using mass media sources, examines events in Dushanbe, the Fergana

Valley, Novyi Uzen', Ashkhabad, Osh and other locales as related to common religious, national and socio-economic problems. He gives credence to the allegation that these disturbances were instigated, or at least aggravated, by Moscow and that various powers in the republican leaderships benefited from the fear caused by violence. L.A.

■ ROY, Olivier, "En Asie centrale: kolkhoziens et entrepreneurs," in Jean-François Bayart, ed., *Les trajectoires du politique. I: La réinvention du capitalisme*, Paris: Karthala, 1994 (Hommes et sociétés): 73-86.

One of the sociological specificities of contemporary Central Asia, if compared with the European regions of the former USSR, is a relative preservation of rural areas, less affected than the Russian rural world by collectivisation. Moreover, in a region globally less industrialized than others, the power of vernacular apparatchiks has continued to rely on solidarity networks of rural origin. On the basis of this general observation — made out of fieldworks in Tajikistan and in the Uzbekistani part of the Ferghana Valley — the author is interested in the kolkhozes as a nucleus unity for networks of personal economic, social, and even political clientelism, which finds its clearest expression in the identification of local communities with a district or, more largely, with a province. An autonomous community which extends its ramifications toward the cities and the state, the Uzbekistani or Tajikistani kolkhoz functions as a territorial power basis, articulated with a state apparatus — the chairman of the kolkhoz appearing, thanks to his relations in the state apparatus or in the horizontal network of other chairmen, as a vector of integration of the local community into still very state-oriented markets. So the permanence of kolkhozes appears as a necessity for both apparatchiks and peasants. The latter need the community structure for getting access to the benefits of the market, and because it is their "form of access to politics, of articulation with the state apparatus, and of protection against it and against the ambitions of other groups." The author finishes his paper with reflections on the fact that the neo-Communist reaction observed in Uzbekistan as well as in Tajikistan from 1992 onward is not opposed to a growing autonomy of kolkhoz notables as actors of a market economy of its own.

S.A.D.

● ROY, Olivier, "Kolkhoz and Civil Society in the Independent States of Central Asia," in M. Holt Ruffin & Daniel C. Waugh, eds., *Civil Society in Central Asia*, s.l.: Center for Civil Society International 1999: 109-121.

Roy examines the resilience and ambiguity of the kolkhoz in post-Soviet Central Asia using data from his many years of fieldwork in the region. Addressing those who see the kolkhoz as a recalcitrant relic, Roy argues that privatisation should "start from the kolkhoz and not fight against it, because the kolkhoz is part of "real" society, civil or not" (p. 109). He addresses the question of the overlap between kolkhoz and other social institutions such as kinship and pre-Soviet hierarchies and argues that whatever their basis, Central Asian kolkhozes produced new identities that legitimate themselves by reference to "traditional" institutions, reshaping the Soviet political apparatus from

the inside. "Here we have the revenge of a traditional culture and society on an imported system" (p. 111). Today, the ability of a well-connected kolkhoz to secure benefits for its members continues to reshape collective identities and to reinforce traditional practices and hierarchies. The article ends with some practical recommendations to international organizations working in rural Central Asia. L.A.

- SABI, Manijeh, "The Impact of Economic and Political Transformation on Women: The Case of Azerbaijan," *CAS* 18/1 (1999): 111-120.

Using secondary sources, the author compares Soviet claims about women's gender roles and their political and labour force participation to the reality of post-Soviet Azerbaijan. The author concludes that despite progress during the Soviet era, women's political and economic status is still not equal to men's and has declined during the transition. Women in Azerbaijan are better off than their sisters in other parts of the world but there are indicators that set-backs are coming. L.A.

- SARSEMBAYEV, Azamat, "Imagined Communities: Kazak Nationalism and Kazakification in the 1990s," *CAS* 18/3 (1999): 319-346.

The author applies Anderson's description of how nations are imagined to the case of Kazakhstan, discussing issues of print capitalism, the intelligentsia, education, language and territory, and "census, map and museum." He also analyses the current process of "Kazakification" and briefly touches on the conflicts in contemporary Kazakhstan between nationalism and capitalism. L.A.

- SAVIN, I. S., "Etnicheskii aspekt sovremennoi sotsial'no-ekonomicheskoi situatsii v Kazakhstane (1993-1995 gg.) [Ethnic Aspects of the Present Socio-Economic Situation in Kazakhstan]," *EO* 1996/5: 39-57.

Based on a detailed sociological study (in the framework of a Russo-American project, "Language and Nationality in Former Soviet Union," carried out at the end of 1994), this paper analyses the links between ethnicity and politics in the socio-economic context of Post-Soviet Kazakhstan. It begins with a historical exploration of the question. Describing the laborious crystallization of Kazakhstan as a national state (through collectivisation of nomadic populations, and fast industrialization in the Union Republic after WWII), the author draws the vivid portrait of an independent country. Since 1992, all aspects of economy and social life are touched by a large autonomisation. The economic liberalization led to a deep social crisis (inflation and unemployment are presented as the most destabilizing phenomena of the period), and fluidity became the main feature of new individuals. In the same time ancient ethnic categories were used as points of reference. Parallel to everyday worries heard from Russians who failed to leave Kazakhstan, the titular nationality serves as insurance for social success: for instance in 1993 more than 70% of the peoples who opened a private business were Kazakhs. Numerically predominant in governmental structures, they also monopolise embezzlement of local productions. The description of clans networks is particularly



convincing (especially the division of labour between generations). However, if useful for understanding current events, ethnic analysis remains inadequate for reaching the true nature of politics in Post-Soviet states. X.L.T.

- SCHATZ, Edward, "The Politics of Multiple Identities: Lineage and Ethnicity in Kazakhstan," *EAS* 52/3 (2000): 498-506.

Using information from secondary sources and interviews, the author describes the legislative and institutional construction of identities in post-Soviet Kazakhstan. The author argues that the state wasn't able to implement a strategy to promote ethnic Kazakhs and instead left ethnic entrepreneurs up to their own devices which resulted in the proliferation of lineage-based claims. The author concludes with some thoughts about how the Kazakh case contributes to theories about linkages between levels and forms of identity and the political implications of viewing identity as inherently multiple. L.A.

- SCHOEBERLEIN-ENGEL, John, "Conflict in Tadjikistân and Central Asia: The Myth of Ethnic Anomosity," *HMEIR* 1-2 (1994): 1-55.

One of the first global studies on the Tajikistani civil war, the present paper provides a deciphering of the genesis of the conflict. The author analyzes in particular the gradual radicalization of growing segments of Tajikistani society in front of the refusal by the Communists in power to democratize their administration. Among the reserves which can be formulated on this approach — the explicit goal of which is to contradict the most common stereotypes on the incapacity of Central Asian societies to develop a democratic political life —, we will perhaps notice a simplistic dialectics and a demonisation of the Tajikistani Communists. The latter are introduced as a nomenclature devoid of project other than the preservation of its own privileges, and with no strategy else than opposition to any form of change. Moreover one also regrets the excessively univocal portrait which is given here of the organizations of the opposition (the nationalist and even irredentist discourse of which on the Tajik minorities of Uzbekistan is denied in spite of evidences). However this paper constitutes a very significant contribution to the analysis of the Tajikistani civil war. One must put at the author's credit his identification of the clear cleavage which appeared in the last years of the Soviet period (and not only after 1991 as indicated by the author) between those who possessed the instruments of economic and political transition, and wanted to keep a monopoly on them, and those more numerous but also more powerless who, because of their social and sometimes geographic origin had no access to the resources showed by privatization, of which they hope they would receive some part. S.A.D.

- SCHOEBERLEIN-ENGEL, John, "The Prospects for Uzbek National Identity," *CAM* 1996/2: 12-20.

A contribution to the fashionable debate on the highly problematic ethno-geneses of the Central Asian peoples, this paper provides a rapid statement on the evolution through the twentieth century on the content of the ethnic denomination "*uzbek*." This study also

reveals the permanence of *qipchoq* or *khuja* community identities (which from census in Uzbekistan have disappeared since the mid-1920s) and of the practice of Persian language by Tajiks of Samarqand (which is generally obliterated by official statistics). The author astutely suggests that a category such as that of *khuja*, far from being annihilated, has in fact prospered thanks to solidarity networks established by the Soviet bureaucracy. He concludes on the rather flexible interpretation which is made of the ethnic denomination *uzbek* by the populations, notably Persian-speaking, to which this denomination has been imposed since 1924, without reducing their sentiment of belonging to specific cultures or life styles. (Russian translation: "Perspektivy stanovleniia natsional'nogo samosoznaniia u uzbekov," *Vostok* 1997/3: 52-63; see A. I. SHEVIAKOV, "O stat'e d-ra Shoberlaina-Engela 'Perspektivy stanovleniia natsional'nogo samosoznaniia uzbekov'," *ibid.* 1998/6: 209-215.) S.A.D.

- SINDAROVA, Azizakhon, "Deiatel'nost' Gosudarstvennoi migratsionnoi sluzhby Tadzhikistana [The Activity of the State Agency for Migration in Tajikistan]," *TsAiK* 2 [3] (1999): 156-159.

A Vice-Director of the State Service of Migrations of Tajikistan (created in 1992) explains this body's contribution to the normalization which since the amnesty of 1993 went with the main waves of return of refugees, mostly from Afghanistan. In her conclusion the author insists on the significance of the role of this service for the control on underground immigration, of which Tajikistan has become the main hub in Central Asia. S.A.D.

- SOKOLOVA, L., "Demograficheskoe razvitie Respubliki Tadzhikistan v perekhodnyi period [The Demographic Evolution of the Republic of Tajikistan during the Transition Period]," *TsA* 1998/2 [14]: 34-44.

The author describes the consequences of the emigration movement of the past decade on the current ethnic composition of the population of Tajikistan — he notably underlines the increased rate of the Tajiks (68.4% in 1996 against 62.9% in the date of the last Soviet census in 1989), whence that of Uzbeks seems more stable at 24.8%. The author also underlines, although it is not so innovative, the loss of qualified manpower as a consequence of very numerous departures (126,400 holders of diplomas of middle and higher technical education have been censused among the emigrants between 1989 and 1995). S.A.D.

- TAZHIN, Marat Mukhambetkazievich, TAZHIMBETOV, Marat Abdugaliyevich, *Regional'naia Sotsiologiia* [Regional Sociology], Alma-Ata: Atamura – Qazaq Universiteti, 1993.

This book, which appears to be based mainly on published statistics, takes a sociological approach to understanding the cultural, political and economic differences within Kazakhstan. The authors discuss their theoretical and methodological principles; then they analyse three main topics: the social-territorial differences between cities and regions in Kazakhstan, the role of socio-economic inequality in perpetuating these dif-

ferences, and the political factors related to these differences. The book should be of interest to anyone interested in urban sociology and regional differences in Kazakhstan.

L.A.

- TOLMACHEVA, M. A., "The Muslim Woman in Soviet Central Asia," *CAS* 12/4 (1993): 531-548.

Critiquing Soviet studies of religious behaviour as missing the mark on several issues because of cultural or ideological blinders, the author discusses the religious outlook and patterns of behaviour related to religious beliefs of Soviet Muslim women. The author paints a more complex picture of women believers with other data (albeit secondary) on demographics, education, marriage, and specific aspects of beliefs and practices.

L.A.

- TURSUNALIEV, K., *Vse tsveta radugi (Tiubeteiki i golovnye uzory Uzbekov XIX – XX vv.)* [All the Colours of the Rainbow (*Döppi* and other Head Ornaments of the Uzbeks, Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries)], Tashkent: Fan, 1991 (Akademiia nauk Uzbekskoi SSR, Muzei istorii narodov Uzbekistana im. M.T. Aibeka), 113 p., ill., glossary.

The author provides a catalogue of 212 pieces from the ethnographic collections of the Museum of the History of the Peoples of Uzbekistan, collected in Tashkent and in the regions of mixed Uzbek – Tajik settlement of Bukhara, Samarqand and the Surkhan-Darya. In the introduction a tentative typology reconstructs the main regional variations; it distinguishes the ancient *tübeteks* (*kulah*), high and like a flattened cone, without ornament, with a large weaved headband at its basis (*jıyak*), more recent headgears of varied forms, flat, quadrangular or hemispheric. The caps (Uzb. *döppi*, Taj. *tuppī*) of Chust, district of Namangan, are characterized by their ornamentation in the shape of a tilted sweet pepper (*qalampir*) or of almond (*badamcha*), embroidered with white thread on a black background. The *döppi* from Marghilan distinguishes itself from this first model only by the more elongated and thinner shape of the pepper: these types have been propagated in all the regions of Uzbekistan as well as in the northern and central districts of Tajikistan. In Shahrizabz the most common headgears are tapestry made (*gilam döppi* / *tuppī-yi gilīm*); a decoration of flowering bushes on a united background give them their so peculiar multicolour aspect. The collections of the Oybek Museum still preserve numerous samples of female headgears made by female craftsmen of Tashkent and of the Ferghana Valley, and weaved according to the *iroqii* motive (in cross and half-cross), with a plant-like decoration peopled by little blue and green birds, symbols of good fortune, sometimes enriched with inscriptions. The *döppis* made of rich ornamental textiles and deprived of embroidered decoration are characteristic of productions of Khwarezm and of Bukhara (the author includes into this category non-embroidered velour caps from Tashkent). Let us mention last the quadrangular female *döppis*, the golden or silver brocade of which is divided up by thick black lines into four fields decorated by flowering bushes.

S.A.D.

- TYSON, David, "The Role of Unofficial Audio-Media in Contemporary Uzbekistan," *CAS* 13/2 (1994): 283-293.

The author analyzes the cause of the incapacity of the Uzbekistani opposition of the late 1980, and of its written media, to mobilize support in larger layers on the population, except that of a limited number of big cities, like Tashkent, and their suburbs. He also deals with the increasing success, since 1992, of another vehicle of alternative information: the "little media," for the most part auditory, more largely used by social actors better integrated into traditional sociability (like certain *hofizes* of the Ferghana Valley, listened in the public assemblies of the mosque, at the *choykhona* or in the private gatherings commonly called *gaps*). It is mainly by the intermediary of these types of sociability that we can observe in Uzbekistan, since independence, the structuring and the diffusion (even in rural milieus) of a Turkic and Islamic community ideal nourished by a rich historical counter-culture specific to Turkestan. Anonymous Russian translation: "Rol' 'dikoī' audioinformatsii v sovremennom Uzbekistane," *VE* 1996/1 [2]: 33-45; Persian translation by Qāsem Maleki: "Naqsh-e resānehā-ye sam'i-ye ghayr-e rasmī dar Ozbakestān," *MAMvQ* 4/11 (1995): 157-174. S.A.D.

- VISHNEVSKII, Anatolii, "Sredniaia Aziia: nezavershennaia modernizatsiia [Middle Asia: An Unachieved Modernization]," *VE* 1996/2 [3]: 136-159, 4 tabs.

The quantitative (notably demographic) parameters implemented by the author allow him only to keep turning over the apology, much common in Russian academic literature, of an imported modernization linked with colonization and the establishment of the Soviet system, against the hopeless "traditionalism" or "status quo" of Central Asian societies. S.A.D.

- VITKOVSKAIA, Galina, ed., *Sovremennye etnopoliticheskie protsessy i migratsionnaia situatsiia v Tsentral'noi Azii* [Current Ethno-Political Processes and the Migratory Situation in Central Asia], Moscow: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Moskovskii tsentr Karnegi, 1998, 229 p.

Although this collected monograph focuses on Kazakhstan, through the emigration of this country's important Russian-speaking population (the same problematic has been retained for Uzbekistan and Kyrgyzstan), let us remark several papers of more general significance, or focusing on other countries. On the basis of inquiries realized since 1992, Galina VITKOVSKAIA ("Ekonomiceskii faktor migratsii iz stran Tsentral'noi Azii: fon ili dominanta? [The Economic Factor in the Migration from the Central Asian Countries: Background or Leading Feature?]," 20-45, 9 tabs.) gives the overall tone of the work, through her insistence on the essentially political motivations of the emigration movements from the Central Asian states since the collapse of the USSR.

However the most complete study of the volume — the only one which does not ignore non-Slavic communities — has been devoted to Tajikistan. Through a number of polls made during the mid-1990s, Saodat OLIMOVA analyzes the level of identification with the Tajikistani state among this country's three large ethnic communities:

Tajiks, Uzbeks, and Russians ("Etnicheskaia i grazhdanskaia identichnost' i ikh vliianie na migratsionnoe povedenie naseleniia Tadjikistana [Civic and Ethnic Identities, and Their Respective Influence on the Migration Behaviour of the Population of Tajikistan]," 192-204). She underlines the great proximity of perceptions and representations (which is atypical in Central Asia) between the Tajiks and the second ethnic group of the country, the Uzbeks; she stresses on the contrary the deep differences in the perceptions of the Russians — on whom the author remembers that they traditionally depended on the state institutions, today disappeared, of the Soviet system. (This paper reproduces the argument of an earlier publication by the same author: "Etnopoliticheskaia situatsiia v Tadjikistane i ee vliianie na migratsionnoe povedenie," *TsA* 1996/ 6 [12]: 45-53.) Liudmila SOKOLOVA ("Tadjikistan: demograficheskaia situatsiia i migratsiia [Tajikistan: The Demographic Situation and the Migration]:" 205-215) retains some conclusions of a more general study by her: "Demograficheskoe razvitie Respubliki Tadjikistan v perekhodnyi period [The Demographic Evolution of the Republic of Tajikistan during the Transition Period]," *TsA* 1998/2 [14]: 34-44.

One can deplore the lack of attention of the present volume for migratory movements inside each of the newly independent states of former Soviet Central Asia — the political effects of which were and remain as determining, if not more, than migrations toward neighboring states, Russia of more remote foreign countries. S.A.D.

- WATTERS, Kathleen, "The Current Family Planning Debate in Soviet Central Asia," *CAS* 9/1 (1990): 75-86.

On the basis of papers published in 1988-1989 in two official newspapers of Soviet Central Asia (*Pravda Vostoka* in Tashkent and *Komsomolets Tadjikistana* in Dushanbe), the author analyzes the debates on family planning as a vector of political cleavage between the Communist power, favourable to a control of births, and the alternative movements of the radical intelligentsia, hostile to a family planning imposed from above, and more concerned in economic reforms. S.A.D.

- WERNER, Cynthia, "Household Networks and the Security of Mutual Indebtedness in Kazakhstan," *CAS* 17/4 (1998): 597-612.

In this article, the author discusses what has happened to the social networks that functioned, in the Soviet period, to facilitate access to scarce consumer goods. She argues that cash is increasingly what circulates through these networks, rather than just goods and services. This article is one of several in this same volume that makes the important point that household welfare cannot be examined purely in terms of income and food production, but rather in a complicated social context where networks of reciprocity make up a large share of household economic transactions. The author discusses what constitutes a household in the region where she did her fieldwork, how exchanges between households take place, how and when exchanges are used for social mobility as opposed to daily survival, and what the relationship is between exchanges and social networks based on kinship and friendship. L.A.

- WERNER, Cynthia, "Gifts, Bribes, and Development in Post-Soviet Kazakhstan," *Human Organization* 59/1 (2000): 11-22.

In this insightful article, the author reviews the literature coming from the development community on the problem of corruption and counters that while corruption is indeed a problem, most approaches in the literature on development fail to take into account local definitions of what kinds of behaviour are corruption and what kinds of behaviour are appropriate forms of social networking. Werner argues that in Kazakh society, the boundary between gift and bribe is especially problematic as the term "gift" covers many different categories of presents and ritual payments and she provides a useful table describing these categories. According to her research, based on extensive field-work and surveys, Kazakhs spend more than half their household income on gifts and ritual payments (p. 17). Factors her respondents took into account when assessing the morality of bribes included "the content of the bribe, the official's personality and generosity, his or her regular salary...and whether or not the bribes are voluntarily presented. Needless to say, these factors are not the same ones that international development experts mention when they talk about the problem of corruption" (p. 18). The author concludes that the anti-corruption policies of powerful international organizations are often self-serving in that they protect the interests of the international donor and business community without taking into account the legitimate social functions such forms of exchange may have. Therefore, anticorruption measures should be formulated in accordance with local norms for what constitutes immoral exchange behaviour.

S.A.

- YAVARI-D'HELLENCOURT, Nouchine, "Discours identitaire et patriotisme tadjik en Ouzbékistan," *LAC* 3 (1995): 11-13.

On the basis of interviews with Tajik "intellectuals" from Bukhara and Samarqand, the author proposes a first reflection on the possible consequences of the current social and political marginalization of the Tajik "minority" of Uzbekistan. She is interested in the possible evolution of a community identity based on a strong affective relation to the Persian language, and on a nostalgic vision of a long ago undivided Tajik nation, now divided between Uzbekistan and Tajikistan.

S.A.D.

- ZUBIN, M., "Yehudei Mahoz Samarqand bi-shnat 1979: sqira statistit [The Jews of Samarqand in 1979: A Statistical Survey]," *Pe'amim* 25 (1988): 170-177.

Presents contemporary demographic information on the Jews of Samarqand and its region, based on the Soviet census of 1979. (M. Zubin is the pseudonym of a Soviet scholar.)

H.L.

## 7.5 Eastern Central Asia (Xinjiang)

- BELLER-HANN, Ildiko, "Crafts, Entrepreneurship and Gendered Economic Relations in

Southern Xinjiang in the Era of 'Socialist Commodity Economy'," *CAS* 17/4 (1998): 701-718.

The author, who conducted fieldwork, examines craft production in Xinjiang, including the gendered aspects and explains in some detail how the craft economy works. The author also looks at formal credit associations sponsored by international organizations and informal credit associations supported by social networks. L.A.

● BENSON, Linda, SVANBERG, Ingvar, "The Russians in Xinjiang: From Immigrants to National Minority," *CAS* 8/2 (1989): 97-129.

In this historical study, the authors examine the migration and subsequent fates of Russians in Xinjiang. Three waves of immigrants are described and their status is examined by looking at employment, education, publication, marriage, religious, associational, and citizenship data. The period after 1949 is dealt with very briefly. L.A.

● GLADNEY, Dru C., "Transnational Islam and Uighur National Identity: Salman Rushdie, Sino-Muslim Missile Deals, and the Trans-Eurasian Railway," *CAS* 11/3 (1992): 1-21.

The author examines the 'invention' of Uighur national identity in relation to the Chinese state and contemporary processes of trans-nationalism, Islamicization, and exoticization. He argues that the Uighurs are used by the Chinese state to promote their policy objectives in the Middle East as well as in creating a clearer idea of Han identity in opposition to the Uighur 'other.' The author concludes by describing the possibilities these processes provide for the Uighur as well, by helping them formulate resistance to the regime and producing other unintended consequences. L.A.

● GLADNEY, Dru, "Nations Transgressing Nation-States: Constructing Dungan, Uyghur and Kazakh Identities Across China, Central Asia and Turkey," in Touraj Atabaki and John O'Kane, eds., *Post-Soviet Central Asia*, London: Tauris Academic Publishers, 1998: 301-323.

The author tackles the interesting contrast between the idea of the tribe and the nation as "imagined communities." Drawing on the recent literature on nation-states and transnationalism, Gladney argues that nationalism is a style of representation that defines a "grammar of action" that is defined by interactions within or resistance to nation-states (p. 303). Using his own fieldwork and interviews, he looks at the discourses of three groups in exile (Hui/Dungan, Uighur, and Kazakh) to understand how their identities became salient in dialogue with nation-states. Yet in this dialogue, their respective discourses (diaspora, indigeneity, and trans-humanity) manage to transgress the nation-state. The author concludes that identity formation must be understood as a contextual process of relational alterity — the definition of the self in relation to the other. The application of social theory to these communities is extremely insightful and the author develops a useful critique of Eurocentric theories of nationalism based on these challenging cases. L.A.

- NABY, Eden, "Uighur Elites in Xinjiang," *CAS* 5/3-4 (1986): 241-254.

A preliminary report based on observations and interviews in Xinjiang in 1985. The author examines the background, categorization, and interaction of Uighur elites, as well as their role in preserving cultural identity and in making contacts with their Soviet brethren. *Central Asian Survey* 6/4 (1987) carries a critique of this article by Linda Benson and the author's response to the critique. L.A.

- ROBERTS, Sean R., "Negotiating locality, Islam and National Culture in a Changing Borderlands: The Revival of the *Mashrap* Ritual among Young Uighur Men of the Ili Valley," *CAS* 17/4 (1998): 673-699.

The author examines the *mashrap*, a Uighur male newly "reinvented tradition" that has functions of a rite of passage, a means for regulating behaviour and teaching morals, and a way to create and maintain Uighur culture both on a local and trans-national level (the establishment of these *mashraps* is linked to the younger generation of cross-border traders). It also specifically grounds Uighur national culture in an Islamic tradition, though this aspect is not always accepted un-problematically by those attending the *mashrap*. Some *mashraps* function like mutual aid societies but others are more strict and formal. The author, who conducted several years of fieldwork in Xinjiang and Kazakhstan, concludes that these meetings serve as an important public forum for the working out of important social issues and that this, in part, is why the Chinese government is cracking down on these associations, claiming they are Wahabbi terrorist cells. L.A.

- RUDELSON, Justin Jon, *Oasis Identities. Uyghur Nationalism Along China's Silk Road*, New York: Columbia University Press, 1997, 209 p., maps, tab., ill., bibliography, index.

The present work has already been several times reviewed (notably by Linda Benson, *CAM* 1998/5: 21), so we will limit ourselves here to some general remarks. The first is the observation that, as in numerous studies by non-historians of collective memory and history writing in the USSR and in the CRP, the author seems to have an almost complete ignorance of the sources of ancient and modern history of present-day Xinjiang, and for this reason he has been relying permanently on the discourses he has been hearing in the learned and intellectual circles visited by him in the Turfan oasis. From there come numerous anachronisms — like that consisting of calculating the level of isolation of an oasis through its distance with its neighbors, with no attention for millennia of caravan trade, and of circulation of manuscripts, of oral traditions, etc. The chapter on the "history" of Islam in Xinjiang is a little bit light, with considerations on the mechanical relation between the strength of the Islamic "tradition" (?) and the more or less anti-Chinese sentiment of the Uighurs in varied oases...

However several interesting hypotheses can be retained, since they question the history of modern Uighurs and other sedentary populations of Central Asia. The most significant of these hypotheses is no doubt that concerning the determining role of regional or sub-regional geography in the formation of collective identities in Xinjiang.



More complete studies, relying on a more consistent historical documentation and more precise fieldworks, with a more developed comparative dimension (which is centered on Turfan and its intellectual émigré community in Urumqi) will be necessary for enriching the notion of a division of present-day Xinjiang into four large parts, with respective identities more vivid than a trans-regional Uighur identity. One can already ask oneself to which extent supposedly limited mutual exchanges between different oases have limited to our days the reinforcement of a national Uighur identity, except in the émigré intelligentsia of Urumqi's suburbs. Further research should also confirm the author's meaningful discoveries on the shifts of the modes of community self-denomination according to the social origins and the professional occupations of his varied Uighur interlocutors — with a tendency toward Turkism among the rootless intellectuals of Urumqi, against a stronger adhesion to Chinese citizenship among the merchants linked with China's great market... Such considerations are seductive indeed, but they remain to be confirmed by inquiries on larger and more representative samples. Such is also the case of the pages devoted by the author to the community of Uighur émigré intellectuals of Urumqi, whose nationalist discourse is taken literally and described as that of the Uighur learned and intellectual milieus as a whole.

Also reviewed by Wang, C., *TG* 81/4 (2000): 102-110.

S.A.D.

- SMITH, Joanne, "Four Generations of Uyghurs: The Shift towards Ethno-political Ideologies among Xinjiang's Youth," *IA* 2/2 (2000): 195-224.

Although most Uighurs in Xinjiang have a strong national identity, not all subscribe to separatist ideologies. These differences can be attributed in part to generational influences. This paper examines the younger generation and their increasingly strong views on independence from China. The author also speculates about the future attitudes of the youngest generation.

L.A.

- TOOPS, Stanley, "The Population Landscape of Xinjiang/East Turkestan," *IA* 2/2 (2000): 155-170.

Examines several factors affecting the enormous demographic change in East Turkestan since the 1980s. Migration, social and economic issues, policy implementation, and international forces are examined, as well as issues of urbanization and the lack of integration of Han into local cultures.

L.A.

## 8. Economy and Political Science

### 8.1 General Works

- AVŞAR, B. Zakir, ed., *Türkiye ve türk cümhuriyetleri* [Turkey and the Turkic Republics], Ankara: Vadi Yayınları, 1998, 286 p.

This collective volume is significantly dedicated to Ebülfez Elçibey, Rauf Denktaş and Mustafa Kırımoğlu, three political leaders known for their pan-Turkic tendencies. The first part is devoted to the exchanges between Turkey and the Turkic world; it does not show great interest, except several pages on the economic relations that the authors have illustrated by outdated statistics, compared with the date provided by the DEİK (Dış Ekonomik İlişkiler Kurumu, see: [www.deik.com.tr](http://www.deik.com.tr)). The second part is the most successful of the book: the authors give a synthetic profile of five former Soviet Turkic-speaking states (Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan), through history, geography, demography and the social and political structure. Conversely, in the last part on "General Evaluations, Results and Proposals," the authors reproduce an obsolete analysis: more than ten years after the burial of the "Turkish model" of development then promoted by Turkey and its Western allies for the use of Turkic-speaking countries of the former USSR, the authors of this work continue to believe that Turkey can still serve as an example for these new states, with attention to the national models of development which have been elaborated by each in the second half of the 1990s.

B.B.

- DROBIZHEVA, Leokadia, GOTTEMOELLER, Rose, MCARDLE KELLEHER, Catherine, WALKER, Lee, eds., *Ethnic Conflict in the Post-Soviet World: Case Studies and Analysis*, Armonk, NY – London: M.E. Sharpe, 1996, 365 p., bibliography, index.

The present volume is built on contributions to two conferences, held respectively in 1992 in Tallinn and in 1993 in Prague, under the auspices of the American organization *Women in International Security*, with the support of various private foundations of the USA. The explicit goal of this work consisted of offering, on a trans-regional comparative base, an analysis of the causes of the inter-community conflicts of the early post-Soviet period. To this high ambition the volume is far from giving a worthy answer, and shows once more the limitation to which a strict application of political correctness can drive. No men, or very few, among the authors of the volume; no European neither Canadians, which probably corresponds to the needs of a direct dialogue between certain Northern American organizations and their counterparts in the CIS. The delayed publication of papers given three or four years earlier deprives the whole work of a big part of its potential interest, in spite of the great care which has been taken of this English edition. Last, most papers on such and such region or country satisfy themselves with a chronological overview of the described events, on the basis of publications in Russian language which are known for long to the specialists.

Four articles of uneven interest deal with the cultural area covered by the present

bibliography. A well-known leader of the Tajikistani feminist movement of the second half of the 1980s retraces the chronology of the civil war, and insists on the responsibility of the Tajik Communist Party in the closure of the political debate and in the radicalization of the opposition from 1990 onward. The author's discourse reproduces in fact the main leitmotives of the Tajikistani intelligentsia coming from the Qarategin Valley, and of its specific organizations, notably about political "regionalism" as it developed inside the Tajikistani state-party at the end of the Soviet period (JURAEVA, Gavhar, "Ethnic Conflict in Tajikistan," introduced by Nancy Lubin, 255-270, 1 fig.). In the paper about Uzbekistan, an author apparently not very much accustomed to this specific field embarks on this theme of the effects of regionalism, which she applies to a country known for the opacity of its political system. Unfortunately no revelation is to be awaited here: the author provides a simplistic vision of this regionalism, through which she introduces all the political life in present-day Uzbekistan. No documentary or factual discovery allows her to deepen a superficial analysis. One must deplore, in particular, that the author has showed no sensitivity to the infra-regional or infra-ethnic segmentations of the Uzbekistani political class, or to the special cleavages produced by the history of the twentieth century: on these points, the readers will refer themselves to recent works by Donald S. Carlisle, John Samuel Schoeberlein-Engel, and Mark Thurman (FANE, Daria, "Ethnicity and Regionalism in Uzbekistan. Maintaining Stability through Authoritarian Control," 271-301, 1 fig., 1 tab.)

The paper devoted to the former autonomous region of Higher Qarabagh, in the Southern Caucasus, is more complete: after a well-informed historical overview, in which the author recalls the recent character of the last wave of Armenian migration toward Qarabagh and the successive logics of Russia's policy in the Southern Caucasus, she shortly deals with the present and potential role of the main foreign power implied in the conflict (ALTSTADT, Audrey L., "Ethnic Conflict in Nagorno-Karabagh," 227-253, 1 fig.). The most significant contribution of the volume, among those dealing with Muslim-background regions of the former USSR, is however that by a sociologist from Tatarstan. The elements of reflection which are proposed to the reader are indeed not totally unseen, and they have even benefited from numerous publications in Russian by several researchers from the Institute of History of Kazan. Nevertheless the author's analysis is nourished by numerous and recent statistical materials; it provides the Western reader with a useful synthesis on the community segmentations of the Republic of Tatarstan, inside the Federation of Russia. The author insists in particular on the superposition of a double cleavage Tatars / Russians and rural world / urban world, and on the effects of this cleavage in the social and political life of Tatarstan. Perhaps may be deplored an ethnic essentialism which seems inherited from the Soviet ethnography, refreshed by some more recent American references (see the works by Azade-Ayşe Rorlich, in particular). These remnants of essentialism bring the author to see certain features of the re-traditionalization observed nowadays in the Middle Volga region as a national "rebirth" particular to the Volga Tatars, without even thinking to compare this phenomenon with analogous tendencies in the most varied regions of the former

RSFSR (MUSINA, Roza N., "Contemporary Ethno-Social and Ethno-Political Processes in Tatarstan," 195-208, 1 fig.). S.A.D.

- GARNETT, Sherman, "Russia and the Former Soviet South," *CAM* 1998/6: 1-7.

Russia's perception of its former southern periphery as an undivided entity contrasts sharply with the division of Central Asia and the Caucasus into different units, sometimes closer to their respective neighbors than to the former centre of the USSR. The author rejoices himself of the multi-polar vision which was adopted by the ephemeral government led by Evgenii Primakov, and wishes it will mark a durable change of strategy. S.A.D.

- HERZIG, Edmund, *Iran and the Former Soviet South*, London: Royal Institute of International Affairs, 1995 (Former Soviet South Project), 63 p., 2 maps, bibliography.

Dealing with the five first years of independence of the former Soviet republics of Central Asia and the Caucasus, the present study provides some significant elements for a demythologization of Iran's foreign policy in this region of the world. First point: the Islamic Republic perceives instability in Central Asia and the Caucasus as a direct threat for its own security; for this reason it has oriented itself toward the offer of mediation in the open conflicts, and a support to authoritarian governments maintained or established with the help of Russia. In parallel Iran was intensifying its economic relations with countries formerly oriented exclusively toward Russia; the Islamic Republic has discovered itself a certain amount of complementarities with these countries — the ECO being seen as the possible basis of a future common market of the Middle-East. In the field of culture, the Islamic Republic provides where it is possible (*i.e.*, essentially in Tajikistan and to a lesser extent in Uzbekistan) an assistance to pre-Soviet sources erased by Stalinism. Curiously, it is in this domain that Tehran's successes seem to be the most mitigated. It is true that the best vectors of the Iranian cultural influence are missing in Tajikistan as well as in Uzbekistan, where national intelligentsias have lost a big part of the autonomy they enjoyed during Perestroika and in the very first years of independence. As a result, the Iranian influence has been canalized toward other intermediaries, such as the political organizations that claim to represent Islam — a tendency which seems to have been confirmed during the last years, in spite of Mohammad Khatami's arrival to power in 1997. S.A.D.

- LANDAU, Jacob, "Ethnonationalism and Pan-Nationalism in Turkey and the Ex-Soviet Republics," *Migration* 28 (1995): 67-84.

Relying on the principle that the Soviet period has been a mere parenthesis, which should have permitted the ideologies oppressed in the 1920s (such as the nationalist movements constructed on a culture of Turkism) to re-emerge nowadays, the author studies the competition between several ideologies in Turkey and in Central Asia in the early twentieth century and in the aftermath of the collapse of the USSR. His reflections bring him to assert that, in the seven countries studied by him, the leading ideol-

ogy of the independence period has been a kind of ethno-nationalism, which went with the end of pan-Turkism, as well as of pan-nationalism (a tendency consisting of reuniting the dispersed elements of an ethnic group, for instance the Kazakhs of Kazakhstan, China and Mongolia, or the Uzbeks of the whole Central Asia), and even of political Islam.

B.B.

- MALIK, Hafeez, ed., *Domestic Determinants of Soviet Foreign Policy towards South Asia and the Middle East*, Basingstoke, UK: Macmillan, 1990, XIII-332 p.

Based on the text of conferences given at Villanova University in 1988, this volume studies the foreign policy of the former USSR, not under the usual Euro-centrist viewpoint, but in the Soviet Union's dimension as a country with a strong Muslim minority. The 16 articles deal first with the ethnic and religious components of Soviet Central Asia and the other factors of the USSR's foreign policy, then the latter's relations with the neighbouring countries of Asia and the Middle-East. Three papers must be particularly mentioned: A. Arnold, "Soviet Relations with Afghanistan: The Current Dynamics"; R.K. Ramazani, "Soviet Foreign Policy and Revolutionary Iran: Continuity and Change"; V. Moskalenko *et al.*, "Soviet Relations with India and Pakistan and the Afghan Problem."

R.

- VERLEUW, Camille, *Trafics et crimes en Asie Centrale et au Caucase*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1999 (Criminalité internationale), 193 p.

Written by an excellent specialist of Central Asia and the Caucasus, this work is very well documented, precise and clear. In the context of the collapse of the USSR, of the Afghanistan war and of the political instability of states from the Indus River to the Black Sea, the author reveals the extent of the increase of criminality (drug traffics, kidnapping, smuggling...), provides elements of explanation (lack of administrations and of local elites, existence of alternative networks, economic and moral crisis) and he shows the limited perspectives for solutions to these problems.

B.H.

## 8.2 The Russian Federation and Ukraine

- ARININ, A. N., BOLTUSHKIN, V. V., "Sovremennye natsional'nye protsessy v Bashkirii: osobennosti, problemy, puti sovershenstvovaniia [Contemporary National Processes in Bashkiria: Its Specificities, Problems, and the Ways of Their Resolution]," *ISSSR* 1990/5: 31-41.

Treating the emerging problem of inter-ethnic relations in Bashkiria, the present article is written more from a publicist point of view than from a strictly scientific one. The political analysis by the two young authors deals only with questions acceptable in the Soviet context of 1990. Using the central press and local statistical publications, they study the current situation of ethno-federalism. Coming back to history, their clarification of nationalistic claims carried by local elites is realized through demographic

demonstration. The authors also describe the bad effects of the indigenisation policy led in favour of the eponymous population. Inspired by Leninist principles, they require equal rights for all ethnic groups inside the Bashkir Republic. After this introduction, they enter the crucial point of regional development: according to them, rich natural and human resources, as well as fast industrialisation, have given to the republic a strong level of economic potential. Therefore, relatively to its population the republic's GNP is higher than Ukraine's or Armenia's. However the local population does not benefit from this wealth, and the social situation is deteriorating due to the disproportion between industrial and consumer goods productions. Because 97% of the companies present on the Bashkir territory come under the authority of federal ministries, the authors denounce unfairness, estimating that the republican level is deprived of its initial signification. This article must be read as a precursor of all nationalistic ones which will reemploy the same argumentation in order to justify the request for autonomy. The leader of the local Russian national movement, A.N. Arinin has been hitherto the strongest opponent of the Bashkir President.

X.L.T.

■ BUKHARAEV, Ravil, *The Model of Tatarstan under President Mintimer Shaimiev*, Richmond: Curzon, 1999, xvi-251 p., photos.

In his study of the political and economic history of Tatarstan following the collapse of the Soviet Union, Ravil Bukharaev pays particular attention to the role of Tatarstan's president, Mintimer Shaimiev, in moving Tatarstan toward political and economic liberalization. In so doing, Shaimiev has sought to enjoy the political benefits of semi-independence within the Russian Federation, without taking the economic and security risks of full-scale independence. As Bukharaev ably demonstrates, Shaimiev has been able to accomplish these goals as a result of his political sense and his flexibility, while walking the tightrope of Tatarstan's ethnic politics and of Russia's unstable political and economic circumstances.

A major shortcoming is that Bukharaev's treatment of Shaimiev often seems hagiographical and uncritical, and he devotes little space to Shaimiev's formative years in the Communist Party of the Soviet Union. While the work does not purport to be a political biography, a more critical approach to Shaimiev may have given the reader greater insights into his goals as essentially a Russian provincial politician. Indeed, the story of Tatarstan's "sovereignty" and Shaimiev's political future is facing its most serious challenge with Vladimir Putin's accession to power. Putin has vowed to reign in the country's provincial leaders, including Shaimiev, who is perhaps Russia's most high-profile ethnic political figure outside of Chechnya. The new arrangement will certainly test Shaimiev's vaunted pragmatism and flexibility to the fullest, and one cannot but wonder whether Bukharaev will attempt a sequel.

A.J.F.

● FORMANCHIK, A. A., "Krymskaia avtonomiia v kontse XX veka: sluchainost' ili zakonovernost'?" [The Crimean Autonomy at the End of the 20th Century: A Chance or a Necessity?], *OI* 1999/2: 125-134.

The present article is a general presentation of the post-Soviet history of Crimea. Closely linked with state-by-state relationships between Ukraine and the Russian Federation, this narrative also clearly depends on ethnic components. Considering the emergence of a strong Tatar nationalism, the author (a political analyst from Simferopol University) draws its chronology since 1980s before insisting on the geopolitical aspects of the 24 August 1991 Declaration of Crimean Sovereignty. Despite the lack of original ideas on these subjects, the article contains an enthralling attempt to write on the sociology of elites. As far as the majority of Crimea's population is ethnically Russian, local Tatars should have played a leading part in maintaining institutional *status quo*. The author shows how Crimea has finally stayed inside Ukraine thanks to the *Kurultai* (Tatar representative organ) calls to definitive separation from Russia. However, it appears that subjectivity is not missing in this judgment on Tatars' role. It is very critically that the author is coming back on the priority given to Crimean Tatars in terms of political resources and their monopolization of leading capacities. In his mind, this group is responsible for the bad economic situation: "In 1996, the middle income for Crimea was just 82% of Ukraine's." Beyond that weakness, the absence of footnotes in the text is a more serious limit which removes a good share of its relevance.

X.L.T.

- KUZEEV, R. G., "Natsional'nye dvizheniia i federalizm v Rossii [National Movements and Federalism in Russia]," *EO* 1993/6: 46-59.

In the early 1990s, the so-called "parade of the sovereignties" (in the national republics of the RSFSR) contributed for much to the final dissolution of the Soviet Union. Rejecting centralistic authoritarianism, regional elites exploited Yeltsin's liberal policy in order to impose the right of their republic to self-determination. However in 1993 the public debates which were surrounding the adoption of a new federal Constitution focused on the need of restoring a balance between these national republics and Russian *oblast's*. Discussing the possible redefinition of the federal structure, the present article is clearly attached to this 1993 context. To counter Moscow's "new centralistic trends," the author openly defends the historical legitimacy of a Bashkir national territory. A famous ethnographer, specialist of the peoples of the Volga-Urals, and a prominent figure of the regional intelligentsia, the author uses his high intellectual authority in order to influence the political process of the time. Parting from academic cant (for comparison see Kuzeev, R.G., Babenko, V.Ia., Moiseeva, N.N., "Osobennosti etnonatsional'nogo razvitiia narodov Volgo-Ural'skoi istoriko-etnograficheskoi oblasti za gody Sovetskoi vlasti [Ethno-national Process among the Peoples of the Volga-Urals during the Soviet Period]," *SE* 1988/1: 3-15), his unambiguous and opened language is typically that of an intellectual engaging himself publicly to recommend general orientations for the future. Talking the voice of moderation, remembering centuries of peaceful cohabitation between Turkic and Slavic peoples of the region, the author condemns radicalism of both Tatar and Bashkir nationalists and pleads in favor of a democratic federalism.

X.L.T.

- SAFIN, F. G., "Iazykovoï aspekt suverenizatsii v Bashkortostane [The Linguistic Aspect of Sovereignization in Bashkortostan]," *OI* 1994/4-5: 159-180.

Written by a young political analyst, this article examines the problematic question of languages in the multiethnic republic of Bashkortostan. Using the results of a sociological study (the 1994 Russo-American project entitled "Language and Nationality in former Soviet Union" and the study by I.S. Savin, "Etnicheskii aspekt sovremennoi sotsial'no-ekonomicheskoi situatsii v Kazakhstane (1993-1995 gg.) [The Ethnic Aspects in the Present Socio-Economic Situation in Kazakhstan]," *EO* 1996/5: 39-57.), the author insists on the discrimination policy performed by local authorities against the relative Tatar majority of Bashkiria. His declared objective is to prevent "destabilization of the political situation in the republic" which would occur with the limitative recognition of Russian and Bashkir as its unique official languages. Considering the fact that Bashkirs are fewer than Tatars (21.9% to 28.4 % according to the 1989 census), Tatar language should be chosen as the third official language. X.L.T.

- SUDYN, Andrei, "Zhurnal 'Idel' kak tribuna tatarskogo natsional'nogo dvizheniia (obzor za 1993-1997 gody) [The Journal *Idel* as the Tribune of the Tatar National Movement (A Survey of the Years 1993 to 1997)]," *VE* 1999/1-2 [6-7]: 228-242.

Very few studies have been devoted to the flowering of the press of national intelligentsias in Russia and in the CIS since the proclamations of sovereignties in 1990 and independences in 1991. The present paper is unfortunately limited to a critical summary, from a Russophile point of view, of the articles published in the monthly journal *Idel* — a citadel of the Tatar nationalist intelligentsia of Kazan — by several spokespersons of the Volga Tatar national movement expressing their will of a de-Russification of the Republic of Tatarstan. S.A.D.

### 8.3 The Caucasus

- DZEBISASHVILI, Kakhaber, "Islamskii fundamentalizm na Kavkaze – vzgliad iz Gruzii [Islamic Fundamentalism in the Caucasus: A View from Georgia]," *TsAiK*, 1999/2 [3]: 160-167.

Although the present study, written by an adviser of the Georgian government for the CIS Affairs, is not devoid of approximations neither of cut-and-dried value judgments on the more or less developed "religiosity" of such and such Muslim nation of the Caucasus, it has the merit of evoking Georgia's "Islamic" policy since the Abkhaz uprising. The author also questions himself on the role played in the expansion of Islamic radicalism in the Northern Caucasus by inner factors (the ethnic segmentations in Dagestan) and external factors (the role of Russia, or of Saudi Arabia in the current destabilization of the region). In spite of the excellent information to which the author seems to have had access, the reader regrets the certain assertions or suggestions on political forces claiming to represent Islam, notably in Chechnia, are not better sub-



stantiated.

In a paper written from an analogous viewpoint, but dealing mainly with Iran (PAPUASHVILI, Tamaz, "Geopoliticheskie aspekty islamizatsii [Geopolitical Aspects of the Rise of Islam]," *ibid.* 1999/3 [4]: 181-190), another adviser of the Georgian government resituates the recent developments of Iranian diplomacy in the context of the influence struggles between the USA and Russia, in the Middle-East and in the Caucasus. The author notably underlines the concern of Moscow's political milieu in front of the danger of a definitive loss by Russia of its political and economic influence in these regions, in the case of an improvement of the relations between the USA and Iran, and of achievement of the project of pipeline which associates Azerbaijan and Georgia. S.A.D.

- GADZHI-ZADE, Khikmet, "Novaia identichnost' dlia novogo Azerbaidzhana [A New Identity for a New Azerbaijan]," *TsA* 1998/2 [14]: 60-67.

A series of polemical reflections, by a participant in the Azerbaijani nationalist movement, on the changes in that country's civil society since Heydar Aliev's return to power in the summer 1993. S.A.D.

- GOLTZ, Thomas, *Azerbaijan Diary. A Rogue Reporter's Adventures in an Oil-Rich, War-Torn, Post-Soviet Republic*, Armonk, NY – London: M.E. Sharpe, 1996, 496 p., ill., index.

Although not of an academic nature, this voluminous book of personal memoirs is the second edition, partly revised and updated, of a narrative first published in almost total anonymity in Istanbul in 1994, under the pessimistic title *Requiem for a Would-be Republic*. This first version, devoted to the "story" of the Republic of Azerbaijan since the proclamation of its independence in 1991, until Baku's decision to join the CIS in the autumn 1993, was focusing on the failure of a tentative state building. The second version is more prospective and optimistic, which is explained in part by the number of extravagant contracts signed between November 1994 and November 1997 between Azerbaijan and multiple multinational oil companies, thanks to the return to a relative "stability."

Among the reader's inevitable regrets, which are proportional to the work's weight and ambitions, one may no doubt deplore an overall vision which remains excessively centered on Azerbaijan, which deprives the author of useful landmarks when he tries to resituate the history of the Azerbaijani national movement in a more general context. Such is the case, for instance, when the author asserts (p. 45) that the Azerbaijani national movement has preceded those of the other Turkic-speaking republics of the USSR: isn't it in Almaty, in Kazakhstan, that the first national movements appeared in the southern periphery of the former USSR as soon as December 1986? From another viewpoint many questions raised or sketched by the author during a travel in provinces, or in conversations with protagonists of the Azerbaijani political scene remain without answer. But this is probably a rule of a diary written in the first person singular, and one must insist on the number of avenues of research traced by the author during his

permanent trips throughout Azerbaijan: there is no other case of such a complete geographical and chronological covering, by a foreign witness, of a former Soviet republic confronted with the open conflicts of the late Soviet and early post-Soviet periods. One may deplore, last, the lack of a critical apparatus of any kind, but this has been a deliberate choice by the author, which the latter explains by the mediocrity and the extreme political polarization of the academic production devoted for a decade to the main conflict of the Southern Caucasus. More generally the author very rightly denounces the encryption of the information coming from this region by the main Western media networks. His testimony is all the more important since it proceeds from a will to go to the source of information and of a general undertaking of demythologization of the political events which have been surrounding the Qarabagh conflict.

From this point of view, one can affirm that Th. Goltz's work shows a rigor superior to that of many academic works, whence it offers us a primary source of an exceptional completeness. The innumerable portraits of protagonists, famous or not, rapidly sketched, reconstruct an astonishingly contrasted picture of the Azerbaijani political society since 1991, and of its evolution during a decade of hardships. The author's documentary preoccupation permits him to rightly perceive the nature of a political transition without a social revolution that, in Azerbaijan as elsewhere in the former Soviet south, has gone with the proclamation of independence. ("No one had been sacked. No one had resigned.") The author must also be praised, although he does not always document his discourse, for the great attention he shows to the economic grounds of the Armenian-Azerbaijani conflict, in particular for the vital strategic interests that Russia's military industrial complex possessed in Azerbaijan until the proclamation of independence: so much lucidity is unusual among the foreign observers of the post-Soviet conflicts. In conclusion, if Th. Goltz's book does not correspond to all the usually recognized criteria of a reference work, the quality of his testimony makes it an extremely significant primary source for a global understanding of the conflicts of the 1990s, not only in the Southern Caucasus, but also in the whole periphery of the former USSR.

S.A.D.

## 8.4 Western Central Asia

### 8.4.A General Works

■ AKINER, Shirin, ed., *Political and Economic Trends in Central Asia*, London: British Academic Press – Tauris, 1994, 224 p.

The present volume is made of the papers given to a colloquium held in 1987 in the SOAS, and twice updated by their respective authors for a publication which was postponed until the end of the Soviet period in 1991. The main subjects raised during the colloquium turn around the nature of the process of Sovietization, of the current re-traditionalization of Central Asian societies, and of the capacity of ethnic nationalisms and

of Islam to transcend "clan" affiliations largely perceived as traditional, if not as permanent and trans-historical features of these societies. The volume is opened by a statement by Malcolm YAPP on the notion of Central Asia, and an analysis by this author of the relationship between "modern" and "traditional" societies in this region of the world ("Tradition and Change in Central Asia," 1-10 — a title which suggests that tradition and change are mutually exclusive...). This introductory paper is followed by a comparative study, by Guy IMART, of the French colonization of Algeria and Russian colonization of Turkestan ("Past Western Imperial Crisis: a Lesson for Forthcoming Eastern Ones?," 11-37). Then comes a series of four papers devoted to political education and social integration in Central Asia in the 1980s: Yaacov ROI has been interested in the educative aspects of this problem ("Political Education in Soviet Central Asia," 43-62); Bess BROWN ("Political Developments in Soviet Central Asia: Some Aspects of the Restructuring Process in Turkmenistan, Kirghizia, and Kazakhstan in the late 1980s," 62-74), and Michael RYWKIN ("Ethnic Cadres Policy in Uzbekistan," 38-42 — a paper which summarizes significant previous publications by the same author on the same subject) deal with various aspects of the party's "policy of executives." Martha Brill OLCOTT has studied the problems of Central Asian youth, through the press of the Komsomol ("Central Asian Youth Problems: The View from the Youth Press," 75-89). Three authors then sketch a rather dark picture of Central Asian economies (in particular in agriculture), not without making some suggestions for the international projects of financial and technical assistance which began to be launched as soon as in the spring 1992: Martin MCCAULEY, "Agriculture in Central Asia and Kazakhstan in the 1980s," 90-101; Stuart THOMPSTONE, "Uzbekistan's Economic Prospects," 102-113; and Alastair MCAULEY, "Living Standards in Uzbekistan, 1960-84," 114-142. A paper by Viktor KOZLOV gives, on the contrary, a very optimistic picture of the demographic evolution of Central Asia during the next decades ("Ethno-Demographic Problems of Central Asia and Measures for Their Solutions," 143-152). The volume is closed by two contributions on Central Asian Islam: Edward LAZZERINI ("Through the Contact Lens Darkly: Soviet Muslims and Their Foreign Co-Religionists, 1926-1986," see our review in this volume) observes the mode of reintegration of Central Asian Muslims into the *umma* after seventy years of isolation; James THROWER ("Notes on Muslim Theological Education in the USSR in the 1980s," see our review in this volume) offers a summary description of the Islamic theological education which is given in the region, from de-Stalinization to the end of the Soviet period.

S.A.D.

■ ANDERSON, John, *The International Politics of Central Asia*, Manchester – New York: Manchester University Press, 1997 (Regional International Politics Series), x-[1]-225 p.

In eight chapters of uneven length the author proposes an overview of the contemporary history and a socio-political analysis of the five newly independent Central Asian states. The three first chapters provide historical landmarks: the Russian conquest, the establishment and evolution of the Soviet power, Perestroika, and resituates in several

kinds of duration currently observed phenomena. The three following chapters offer an analysis of the challenges with which the leaders of Central Asian countries are confronted since independence: the shaping of a new political order in replacement of the defunct Soviet Union, the construction of new national economies without which independence would be meaningless, the construction of a new state ideology — which, in each state, must reinforce the sentiment of belonging to one nation, without neglecting Islam. The two last chapters are devoted to the Tajikistani conflict and to the respective foreign policies of the varied administrations which have appeared since 1991.

One of the great qualities of this work lies in the combination of a global vision of Central Asia as an entity and of the specific case of each country. On the other hand the author has been trying to underline the articulations between religious phenomena, clan affiliations, regionalism, ethnic solidarities — all integrated to varied extent into the new official ideologies, and combining each other in the emergence of regional and local conflicts. Last, the author invites his readers to perceive the structural diversity hidden under the apparent uniformity of the region's authoritarian regimes: he compares President Niyazov's tyranny in Turkmenistan with the more enlightened administration of President Karimov in Uzbekistan (a remark which was relevant until the launching of large purges in 1999). He also underlines differences between the Central Asian "democrats" Nazarbaev and Akaev. To be noticed also: the pedagogical quality of the critical apparatus (good bibliography, numerous and precise footnotes: between 60 and 90 notes per chapter, very useful index).

Also reviewed by Stephen Blank, *CAS* 18/1 (1999): 131-132.

B.B.

■ AZOVSKII, I. P., "V poiskakh putei rasshireniia transportnykh svyazei [In Quest of Means for Enlarging the Transportation Links]," *Vostok* 1997/2: 108-120.

Focusing on Kazakhstan, the present study provides a rather complete overview of varied projects of opening up of Central Asia during the five years following the proclamation of independences.

S.A.D.

■ BABAK, V., "Tsentral'naia Aziia – Izrail': potentsial i predely sotrudnichestva [Central Asia – Israel: Potentialities and Limits of Cooperation]," *TsA* 1997/5 [11]: 30-42.

The author embarks on a short analysis of the reasons why commercial exchanges between Israel and the Central Asian states remain extremely limited since the latter's independence, to the sole exception of Kazakhstan, with which exchanges have however been maintained at a remarkably low level. Beside geopolitical factors, the author shows the weak interest of Central Asian exports for Israel — except the hydrocarbons, the carriage of which poses insuperable problems —; he also insists on the non-existence of real markets in Central Asia for Israeli manufactured goods, and on the strong limitations to Israel's potential role as a backer in Central Asia.

S.A.D.

■ COPEAUX, Étienne, "Le rêve du Loup Gris. Les aspirations turques en Asie centrale," *Hérodote* 64 (1992): 183-193.

The author first recalls the role played by the Atatürkist conception of the history of the "Turkic peoples" after 1931, and his conception's impact on the emergence of a specific community consciousness in Central Asia. He then explains the various present perceptions of Central Asia in Turkey, with a special interest in the currents of the "Islamic – Turkic synthesis" (mainly through the German edition of the newspaper *Türkiye*). S.A.D.

- COVILLE, Thierry, "Les relations économiques entre l'Iran et les nouvelles républiques d'Asie centrale," *LAC* 3 (1995): 5-6.

Short statement on the (notably political) constraints which prevent the development of commercial relations between Iran and the newly independent states of former Soviet Central Asia, and on the potentialities for an intensification of trade currents between these countries. S.A.D.

- CURTIS, Glenn E., ed., *Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan. Country Studies*, Washington, D.C.: Federal Research Division, Library of Congress, 1997, LXI-570 p., ill., 23 tabs., bibliography, glossary, index.

This large work provides a general introduction to each of the five newly independent states of Central Asia, by one or several internationally recognized specialists (Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan by Martha Brill OLCOTT, pp. 1-98 and 99-193; Tajikistan by Muriel ATKIN, pp. 195-290; Turkmenistan by Larry CLARK, Michael THURMAN and David TYSON, pp. 291-374; Uzbekistan by Nancy LUBIN, pp. 375-468). Each notice is subdivided into the same number of sections: history, physical geography, demography, society, religion, education, health, economy, transports, political institutions, foreign policy, national security. The appendixes offer 23 tables of compared statistics between the different countries. The whole volume constitutes a rather complete and very accessible introduction to the politics and economies of the Central Asian countries. S.A.D.

- GLEASON, Gregory, *Common Sovereignty: The Politics of Change in the Central Asian Republics*, Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1996 (Westview series on the Post-Soviet Republics), 250 p., phot., appendixes, bibliography, index.

Fast-moving times desire quick answers. The preface to this wide-ranging introduction proposes: "This book should be read as a detailed answer of that question: Are the present states of Central Asia one or many?" — The answer appears to be twofold (intentionally?). On the one hand, Gleason visibly prefers to understand Central Asia (Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan, and Kazakhstan) as a distinct unity by emphasizing the artificial character of these newly independent states, and by repeatedly stressing that they are no nations: "Central Asia is one community of many very different parts" (p. 8). Differences, on the other hand, are by far prevailing in his description of these states before and after independence, their legacies, their transformation and the prospects of this "process of de-colonization." Common phenomena

appear only on a rather general and moreover disputable level: Islam, Turkic language, importance of family and clan, the value of honor. Unscrutinized remains the basic idea that Central Asia's path of salvation is supposed to be: privatization, market economy, multi-party system, clear division of power (executive, legislative, judiciary), strong parliament, establishing the rule of law and protecting human rights. Insofar as Gleason tends towards presenting his convictions, impressions and reflections as impartial and actual knowledge, his proposition to provide a "detailed answer" literally provokes criticism. His study touches a variety of subjects he obviously is not enough familiar with (*e.g.* philological and historical questions, Islam). This generates avoidable mistakes and shortcomings. Just to give an idea of their nature; (p. 149) speaking about a planned highway connecting Pakistan with the city of Badakhshan in Turkmenistan; (p. 137) calling the southern border of the Czarist Empire "Curzon line"; (p. 61) giving Tajikistan a common border with Turkmenistan; (p. 44) in Tajikistan the Darwaz dialect of the Persian language is spoken; (p. 42) *shari'a* translated as "Islamic courts"; (p. 42) Central Asians, even though considering themselves Muslims, "have only a vague idea about what that implies"; (p. 42) "many Muslims in Tojikiston belong to the Shia confession." Last but not least, a peculiar conclusion (p. 43); "Perhaps the vitality of cultural Islam during this [Soviet] period may be attributed to a popular backlash against Soviet atheism; perhaps it may be attributed to the proselytizing of Islamic movements in Iran and elsewhere; or perhaps it may have resulted from an anti-colonialist conjunction of Islam and ethnicity, the idea of the emergence of an 'Islamistan.'" — Discovering contemporary Central Asia still remains a scholarly challenge. R.E.

- GRARE, Frédéric, "Les ambitions économiques du Pakistan en Asie centrale: chronique d'une désillusion annoncée," *LAC* 3 (1995): 6-8.

This very short paper provides a synthetic overview of the various obstacles (de-structured post-Soviet economies, weakness of the Pakistani means, suspicion of the Central Asian leaders, prolongation of the Afghan conflict) which have limited Pakistan's economic ambitions in Central Asia, between the end of the Soviet period and the coming to power of the Taliban régime in Afghanistan. S.A.D.

- HAGHAYEGHI, Mehrdad, *Islam and Politics in Central Asia*, Basingstoke, UK: Macmillan, 1995, XXIV-264 p., 3 maps, 8 ill., 6 tabs., bibliography, index.

Published twice in parallel under the same title (see also the New York edition: St. Martin's Press, 1995, XIV-264 p.), the present monograph had authority to serve as a landmark in the general renewal of the studies on Islam in Central Asia since the end of the Soviet period. Unfortunately, the author conforms to the most usual faults of the studies published on Central Asian Islam since WWII: the facts are reduced to a narrow chronological framework, and analyzed from afar, through second hand works, non-deciphered official statistics, and the unavoidable press surveys of *Radio Liberty*. As a result the author's initial goal — to demonstrate that the current "Islamic renewal" in Central Asia has taken a moderated tone — goes down the plughole, whence he

reproduces the most common stereotypes on Islam in Central Asia (the Kazakh and Kyrgyz "nomad" are supposed to be more superficially Islamized and more inclined to "democracy" than their Uzbek or Tajik neighbours). S.A.D.

- HYMAN, Anthony, *Political Change in Post-Soviet Central Asia*, London: RIIA, 1994 (Russian and CIS Programme), [6]-51 p., map.

The paper begins with a historical survey on the experience of Central Asia under both Russian and Soviet rule. The following section examines how nationalism arose and developed in the various republics created since 1924; this section is very well informed by a close study of the political role of national intelligentsias in each of the five former Soviet Republics of Central Asia. However the author unfortunately ignores — as usually in political studies — earlier developments, especially the strong genealogical link between nineteenth and twentieth-century Islamic reformist trends and the early appearances of nationalist movements in Central Asia, up till the great terror of the late 1930s. The core of the paper comprises an analysis of the contemporary political setting of the region (development of embryonic civil societies on the first hand, building up of dictatorial systems on the other), of its economic problems (obstacles to the privatization, transition to national currencies, prospects of cooperation with the West and with various Muslim countries), as well as the ecological and demographic challenges that face it. A separate chapter (pp. 38-43) is devoted to the problem of Russians and other minorities in Central Asia and a final section examines security issues which arise from the NIS's military weakness and dependence on Russia. Although hampered by an overall anti-Soviet mood and over-simplification, probably shaped during long years of specialization of the author on Afghanistan under Soviet dominance, the present work, based on scrupulous field observations, offers a short but probably one of the brightest available synthesis on the political changes in the Central Asian NIS during the first five years of their independence. S.A.D.

- MILOSLAVSKII, G. V., "Integratsionnyi potentsial regiona [The Potential of the Region for Integration]," *Vostok* 1996/5: 5-18.

First paper of a special file devoted to "Central Asia in the Perspective of Eurasia," the present study offers an overview of the different parameters of former Soviet Central Asia's supra-regional integration. To the author's eyes, the region is well included in the CIS, not only from the geopolitical and geo-economical viewpoints, but also by a number of components of its hybrid civilization, which distinguished it from the Middle-Eastern countries. In a less general paper on Central Asia's place in the CIS, A.V. AKIMOV ("Tsentral'naia Aziia i SNG: raz'edinenie ili integratsiia? [Central Asia and the CIS: Separation or Integration?]," 19-28, 9 tabs.) insists on the economic discrepancies which have made their appearance in Central Asia since 1991, and on the distinct respective strategies of the region's varied governments on questions of regional and supra-regional integration. Aleksei MALASHENKO ("Islam v Tsentral'noaziatskom obshchestve: dinamika vozdeistviia [Islam in the Central Asian society: Dynamics of

an Interaction],” 29-36) casts light on the weight of external factors on the politicization of Islam in Uzbekistan, in Tajikistan and in Turkmenistan (Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan are *a priori* credited with a more secular culture, which would protect them from such processes). V. Ia. BELOKRENITSKII (“Tsentral’noaziatskoe edinstvo — mif ili real’nost’?” [The Central Asian Unity: Myth or Reality?],” 36-47) provides us a number of elements permitting a better assessment of the level of mutual economic integration of, on the first hand, Central Asian countries, and on the second the Federation of Russia, with interesting remarks on the new role played by the European Union in favor of a regional economic integration. M. Iu. MOROZOVA (“Prirodnye resursy vo vneshnei politike Tsentral’noi Azii — integriruiushchee zveno ili destabiliziruiushchii faktor ? [Natural Resources in Central Asia's Foreign Policy: An element of Integration or a Factor of Destabilization?],” 48-54) insists on the factor of integration which is made of the necessity of an international cooperation in the highly sensitive fields of the exploitation of natural resources and of the struggle against natural disasters.

The file is closed with a series of papers on several Central Asian countries' relations with their respective western or southern neighbours. R. M. MUKIMDZHANOVA (“Gosudarstva Tsentral’noi Azii i ikh iuzhnye sosedi [The Central Asian states and Their Southern Neighbours],” 54-61) states the question through a recall of the main steps of the official debate, in Tashkent and in Almaty in particular, on ideas such as that of a Turkestanian unity or that of a rapprochement between the Turkic states, in the years which followed the proclamation of independences in 1991. Then come several case studies: N. G. KIREEV (“Turtsiia — put’ v Evropu ili vozvrashchenie v Tsentral’nuu Aziuu? [Turkey: The Path to Europe or the Return to Central Asia?],” 62-68) focuses his study on the change in Turkey's perception of Central Asia in the mid-1990s, and the giving up by the Turkish and Central Asian governments of the dreams of unity which had been entertained by nationalist intelligentsias after the proclamations of independences. L. E. SKLIAROV (“Iran: ot politiki eksporta ‘islamskoi revoliutsii’ k regional’nomu sotrudnichestvu (Znachenie peremen dlia Tsentral’noi Azii) [Iran: From a Policy of Exportation of the ‘Islamic Revolution’ to Regional Cooperation (The Meaning of these Changes for Central Asia)],” 69-78) also casts light on now dominating pragmatism in the relations between Iran and its new northern neighbours (to be nuanced by A. Malashenko's insinuations in the same volume about the autonomous action of the Iranian religious circles close to the Guide of the Republic, Ali Khamenei); L.E. Skliarov also insists on the positive influence on the independence of Central Asian states of the diplomatic and economic rivalry between the Islamic Republic and other protagonists of the international political arena. Cutting off with the dominating tone in Moscow, V. N. MOSKALENKO (“Pakistan — kurs na Tsentral’nuu Aziuu [Pakistan: Its Orientation toward Central Asia],” 79-86) rejoices himself of Pakistan's regulating action in the Afghan crisis; he tries to minimize Russia's fear of the danger of a Pakistani penetration into Central Asia, arguing with the limited means of Islamabad. T. L. SHAUMIAN (“Indiia i gosudarstva Tsentral’noi Azii [India and the Central Asian states],” 86-92) devotes a several page long study informed by the Indian



press in English to the — quite classical — geo-strategic convergences of India, Russia, and Central Asian states neighbouring with Afghanistan on their common hostility to the Pakistani policy of support to the Taliban régime.

Last, V. Ia. BELOKRENTSKII ("Tsentral'naia Aziia v Evraziiskoi perspektive (vmesto zakliucheniia) [Central Asia in the Perspective of Eurasia (Instead of a Conclusion)]," 93-99) closes the file through a discussion of the leading theories of Eurasian unity, as they have been discussed since the end of the Soviet period in the leading circles in Moscow (Russo-centered perspective of the "neo-Eurasians" S. Panarin and B. Erasov), but also in Brussels (Euro-Eurasian perspective proposed by Jacques Delors in 1992), in the countries of the Near and Middle-East (with a particular attention to Iran, Saudi Arabia, and Pakistan), and in the Far-East. Relying notably on a projection toward the future of the curves of the demographic evolutions, the author previews that the reintegration of Central Asia into world history will pass through the Near and the Middle-East. Beside the abstract character of a number of considerations, based on Lev Gumilev's often woolly historiosophy more than on solid political analyses, the reader will generally deplore that only the action of the states has been taken into account in this file, except paragraphs by A. Malashenko on the influence of varied Islamist organizations (Iranian, in particular) in Central Asia. This limitation leads the authors to errors of perspective in the studies on the role of Turkey or Pakistan, whence the case of Iran remains very understudied. (On this subject, see notably a review of a conference held on January 14-16, 1996 in Tehran: V. Ia. BELOKRENTSKII & L. E. SKLIAROV, "Sovremennaia situatsiia v Tsentral'noi Azii i na Kavkaze: vzgliad iz Irana [The Current Situation in Central Asia and in the Caucasus: A View from Iran]," *Vostok* 1996/4: 142-146.). S.A.D.

■ NAUMKIN, Vitaly, ed., *State, Religion and Society in Central Asia. A Post-Soviet Critique*, Reading: Ithaca Press, 1993, xv-289 p.

Written in 1990 by a group of (then) Soviet researchers, the present volume constitutes an attempt at an understanding of Central Asia's social and political problems through systematic comparison with other "Oriental" societies. From this viewpoint, the present undertaking is characteristic of the territorial withdrawal inside the boundaries of the CIS of Russian researchers who formerly used to be dispatched throughout the Near and Middle East. We see that specialists of Africa, of India, and of the Middle-East deal with a region they are not very accustomed to, and naturally tempted to systematically reduce Central Asian realities to their respective experiences. In this heterogeneous volume five papers have been selected, the reviews of which can be found in the present bibliography: on the respective specificities of Islamic reform in the Arabic peninsula and in Russian Turkestan; in social and political change among the Muslims of the Soviet Union since Perestroika; on the population of northern Tajikistan since Russian colonization; on the symbolic identity of Central Asian Tajiks; and on the history of the Tajikistani civil war. S.A.D.

■ OLCOTT, Martha Brill, "Soviet Central Asia: Does Moscow Fear Iranian Influence?," in John Esposito, ed., *The Iranian Revolution. Its Global Impact*, Miami: Florida International University Press, 1990: 203-230.

Written before June 1989 (things have been changing since then), this well-documented paper based on the author's fieldwork describes the Islamic revival in Central Asia since the 1970s. According to the author, this revival is mainly due to inner factors. The concern of the Soviet authorities in front of the Iranian revolution comes from the acuteness of the Islamist challenge inside the USSR, made more difficult to control by the Iranian propaganda. A more tolerant policy has been launched toward religion by Gorbachev from 1987 onwards, notably under the pressure of Russian Orthodox Christians.

Y.R.

■ PANARIN, Sergei, "Bezopasnost' russkoiazыchnogo men'shinstva v Tsentral'noi Azii i politika Rossii [The Security of the Russian-Speaking Minority in Central Asia and Russia's Policy]," in Sergei Panarin, ed., *Natsionalizm i bezopasnost' v post-sovetskom prostranstve* [Nationalism and Security in the Post-Soviet Space], Moscow: Progress-Kompleks, 1994: 26-37.

This synthetic article deals with the potential influence of the social behavior of Russian-speaking minorities of Central Asia and of their reverse migration toward Russia on this country's foreign and inner policy. The analysis is augmented with advice of cautiousness to the Russian government in matter of citizenship policy, in order to maintain in Central Asia Russian-speaking populations that could be tempted by emigration toward Russia.

S.A.D.

■ PEIMANI, Hooman, *Regional Security and the Future of Central Asia: The Competition of Iran, Turkey and Russia*, West Port, CN: Praeger Publications, 1998, xiv-153 p., 1 map, bibliography, index.

This study is based on the hypothesis that the world after the end of Cold War is on the way to a multi-polar international system within which the Central Asian countries (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan), tied together by "many societal, economic, political, military/security, and geographical factors," form a distinct security complex. For the time being, the weaknesses of these states make them vulnerable to foreign powers that seek to dominate Central Asia, namely three rivals: Russia, Iran, and Turkey. This hypothesis basically turns out to be also the result of the author's investigations and discussions. It is achieved by filling various data and 'information' plus his own reasoning into the categories of Barry Buzan's concept of "security complex" (id., *People, States, and Fear*, 2nd ed., New York, 1991). Peimani, by the way, in his study obviously prefers matters of Iran to those of Turkey, Russia posing as a kind of necessary evil.

Also reviewed by Stephen Blank, *CAS* 18/2 (1999): 256-257.

R.E.

■ [RACINE, Jean-Luc, ed.], *Le cercle de Samarcande*, Paris: La Découverte, 1997 (*Hérodote*

84), 249 p.

The geopolitical framework of the present volume is stated by the editor of the journal *Hérodote* (Yves LACOSTE, "À propos du cercle de Samarcande," 3-5), and developed by this special issue's editor Jean-Luc RACINE ("Le cercle de Samarcande: géopolitique de l'Asie centrale," 6-43, 6 maps). Their common conclusion is that a new economic start is the key to the resolution of the social tensions in the region. Olivier ROY ("Les évolutions de l'Asie centrale," 44-56) provides a rapid overview of some leading ideas, among which: the lack of a religious policy in Central Asia; the will of independence of the Central Asian states and their refusal of any rigid cooperation structure at the regional or supra-regional scale; a reinforcement of national identities (Uzbekistani, Tajikistani...) at the expense of ethnic affiliations (Greater Uzbekistan, Greater Tajikistan); last a *modus vivendi* between the USA and Russia, at least as long as the former shows mainly concerned by the containment of the Iranian revolution. In a very different register, Thierry ZARCON ("L'islam d'Asie centrale et le monde musulman. Restructurations et interférences," 57-76) nuances several assertions of the previous study and underlines, through the case of Uzbekistan, the close links established during the last ten years between a "modernist" Islam — opposed to both "traditional" and "official" Islam — and the countries of the Near- and Middle-East; the author also deals with the role of the Turkish *Nurcu*, of various forms of the Naqshbandiyya, and of Salafi radicalism in the transmission of foreign political influences on Central Asian Islam. In one of the rarest geographical contributions to this volume, Daniel BALLAND ("Diviser l'indivisible: les frontières introuvables des États centrasiatiques," 77-123, 7 tabs., 8 maps) provides a very complete state of the question of boundaries in Central Asia; his study relevantly underlines the significance of purely geo-economic considerations in the drawing, from 1924 onward, of national borders which only rarely take into consideration the ethnic distribution of the populations; the author also evokes the numerous boundary conflicts raised in Central Asia, during the short twentieth century, in particular since the end of the Soviet period, by the Soviet power's will of division. Another border is dealt with in the following paper, by Catherine POUJOL ("Cosaques contre Kazakhs: nationalismes, identités et territoires au Kazakhstan," 124-144, 1 map, bibliography): the more and more opaque psychological boundary which in Kazakhstan separates the Russians from the Kazakhs; the author studies the current hesitations of the Cossack communities of Kazakhstan, between their integration into the Kazakhstani state inherited from the Soviet period, and the attachment to Russia of the territories these communities have been occupying since the eighteenth century Russian colonial expansion toward the east and the south. The next paper by Viatcheslav AVIOUTSKII ("La crise du Tadjikistan," 145-176, [5] maps) provides an overview of the Tajikistani civil war based for the most part on the Russian press of the early 1990s. The second geographical study of the volume is that by Claude COLLIN-DELAUVAUD about Eastern Turkestan ("Le Xinjiang," 177-200, 4 maps, 1 tab.): the author skims over the main economic and political aspects of the situation in the mid-1990s, and resituates Xinjiang in its most particular Chinese and international con-

texts. Besides, China is well represented in the volume since Elisabeth ALLÈS ("Stratégies chinoises en Asie centrale et nationalisme minoritaire au Xinjiang," 201-216) completes the previous analysis with a synthetic statement of the current limitations to a possible expansion of Muslim irredentism in Eastern Turkestan. The volume is meaningfully closed with a paper devoted to Afghanistan, in which Gilles DORRONSORO ("Territoire, communauté et mobilisation politique en Afghanistan," 217-237, 4 maps) updates personal studies with an analysis of the manner in which the Afghan political parties have in the 1990s gradually passed from a structure based on network coalitions to politically homogeneous political territories, even if their respective overall strategies have remained focused on the control of the whole country through the institutions of a central state. S.A.D.

- ROY, Olivier, "Frontières et ethnies en Asie centrale," *Hérodote* 64 (1992): 169-182.

After a rapid historical overview on the creation of the national republics in Central Asia, from 1924 onward, the author studies the role that has been played by these new boundaries in the gestation of the current inter-community conflicts. Among its neighbours Uzbekistan appears the best one for confronting with a period of uncertainty, thanks to its strong national ideology and to the lack of an ethnic minority sufficiently numerous or organized for counter-balancing the power's will of Uzbekization.

S.A.D.

- ROY, Olivier, *The Foreign Policy of the Central Asian Islamic Renaissance Party*, New York: Council on Foreign Relations, 1999, 29 p.

In a very concentrated form, the author provides a parallel history of the Tajikistani and Uzbekistani branches of the Islamic Revival Party created in Astrakhan in June, 1990, from the viewpoint of their respective foreign relations. The author first underlines their common points, among which are several specificities of Central Asian Islamist parties: an ideology analogous to that of other Islamist movements of the Sunni world; the existence of clearly identified regional footholds (in Tajikistan, the Garm Valley and its migrant communities of the Qurghan-Teppa area, and in Uzbekistan the Ferghana Valley); a social basis made of young educated people with a scientific or technical profile (the famous "Islamist engineers" whom we meet elsewhere in the worlds of Islam), who have often received a clandestine religious education from Ferghanese *'ulamā* strongly inspired by the Deobandi school (on this aspect, see: Bakhtiyar Babajanov and Muzaffar Kamilov, "Muhammadjan Hindustani and the Beginning of the 'Great Schism' among the Muslims of Uzbekistan," in Stéphane A. Dudoignon & Komatsu Hisao, eds., *Islam in Politics in Russia and Central Asia, Early Eighteenth to Late Twentieth Centuries*, London: Kegan Paul, 2001: 195-219). In Tajikistan, the IRP's strength is explained by the concomitance of three factors: this party's rapid alliance with the leader of the republic's registered Muslim clergy; its foothold in a politically active regional faction (the people from Garm); and the construction of a coalition with nationalist and democratic forces.

The biggest part of the present study is devoted to the respective influence of the local context and of the international situation on the evolution of the Tajikistani IRP's strategy, from the victory of the Communist militias in 1992 to the signature of the General Peace Agreement that put an official end to the civil war in June 1997. The author notices that the Islamists from Dushanbe, for the needs of their lasting alliance with the nationalists and the democrats, subscribe to a common political culture based on Tajik nationalism seen as the defense of a Persian culture threatened by Turkic hegemony. The IRP's foreign policy has been linked first by the party's participation in a coalition government with the Communists in 1992. At that date, Tajikistani Islamists and nationalist underwent a rapprochement with Iran, which remained for long marked by a series of misunderstandings. The Islamic Republic fears the establishment in Central Asia of an Uzbekistani hegemony backed by the USA, and intends to let Russia play in the region the role of a strategic counter-weight. Several years passed before Russia, hostile to both the Uzbeks and the Taliban, began to arm Masud in Afghanistan and to favor in Tajikistan the idea of a coalition between their former protégés from Kulab and the Islamist opposition from the Gharm Valley. On its side the IRP, after several years of armed opposition from Afghanistan's territory, has adopted a strategy which combines military pressure and negotiation. The key event of the overall period was the fall of Kabul to the hands of the Taliban in September 1996, which brought the Kulabis and the Gharmis to composition. After a radical strategic change, the IRP lost its Islamic coloration and transformed itself in a Tajikistani party with a strong regional foothold, but no support abroad. Curiously enough, the author remarks a reverse evolution in Uzbekistan, where during the same period the national IRP got closer and closer to radical supra-national Islamist organizations.

In its synthetic form, this study appears nowadays as one of the most complete among those devoted to the evolution of the Tajikistani political arena since the turn of the autumn 1992. One will in particular notice the author's care for stressing relations between the events of Tajikistan and the parallel evolution of the international context. Further studies should measure the respective part of geopolitical evolutions and inner factors specific to the Tajikistani society (see on this point the substantial elements brought by the respective works of V. Bushkov, A. Niyazi, D. Mikul'skii and K. Nourzhanov). Perhaps we should, besides, question ourselves on the real weight of identity questions in the protagonists' political choices, the significance of which can perhaps be explained by our viewpoint as remote observers — which is that of most specialists, whether Western or Russian, writing on the Tajikistani civil war —, and try to deal more with the economic considerations which have influenced political forces since the late 1980s: although problems of privatization lie at the core of the IRP's and of the Tajikistani nationalist and democratic parties' struggle since their very appearance, they are still very rarely assessed by political studies on Tajikistan. S.A.D.

■ SHIMIZU, Manabu, ed., *Chūō Ajia: shijōka no gendankai to kadai* [Central Asian Experiments in the Transition to a Market Economy: Present Stages and the Work to Be

Done], Tokyo: Institute of Developing Economies, 1998, xx-299 p.

This book is one of the results of a research project on the transition to a market economy in Central Asia, conducted by the Institute of Developing Economies with extensive field research. Not all of the authors are specialists on Central Asia, and the levels of included articles are varied, but still the book contains a lot of useful information and presents views different from those of European, American and Central Asian scholars. Among others, Iwasaki analyzes what has changed and what has not changed in relations between the government and industrial enterprises in Uzbekistan. On the basis of micro data, he shows that the Soviet system of industrial management by the government has been reorganized but not entirely abolished, and the administrative office of the economic union of each industrial sector even more strongly controls enterprises than did its predecessor in the Soviet times.

Principal articles: MATSUSHIMA, Yoshihiro, "Uzbekisutanno shijōkeizaikato sono kadai [Transition to Market Economy: the Case of Uzbekistan]," 3-32; IWASAKI, Ichirō, "Uzbekisutanni okeru taisei tenkankino seihu-kigyōkan kankei : kōgyōwo chūshinni [Mutual Relations between Government and Industrial Enterprises under Systemic Changes in Uzbekistan]," 33-66; KAWAI, Shinji, "Chūō Ajiano nōgyō: Uzbekisutano chūshinni [Agriculture in Uzbekistan and Other Central Asian Countries]," 67-103; NISHIKIMI, Kōji, "Kazahusutanni okeru nōgyō min'eikano genjōto kadai: dokuritsu jieinōno seisan kōritsuno keisoku [Farm Privatization in Kazakhstan: Production Efficiency of Family Farms]," 105-130; OKA, Natsuko, "CISni okeru keizai tōgō: Kazahusutanno senryaku [Economic Integration in the CIS: Kazakhstan's Strategy]," 131-165; SHIMIZU, Manabu, "Shijōkano yōkento shigen kaihatsu, chiikiteki saihensei [Exploitation of Energy Resources and Regional Re-organization: Pre-requisites for Transition]," 167-198; KIMURA, Hidesuke, "Chūō Ajiano Roshiajin [Russians in Central Asia]," 199-227. U.T.

■ VOHRA, N. N., ed., *Culture, Society and Politics in Central Asia and India*, New Delhi: Shipra Publications, 1999, 303 p.

This volume is a collection of papers that were presented during an international seminar entitled *Culture, Society and Politics in Central Asia*, organized by the India International Centre on 20–23 November 1998 in collaboration with the Indian Council of Cultural Relations. The contributors in this volume have focused mainly on civilizational contact between South, Central and West Asia. The thrust of the papers is on the Silk Route, which not only served as a conduit of trade, but also of men and ideas. Scholars from India (Mansura Haidar, Radha Raina, Fida M. Hassnain, R.C. Agrawal), Pakistan (Ahmad Hasan Dani), Central Asia (Alokhan Afsakhzod, M. Khairullaev, Anageldy Gubaev) have written on religion, arts and crafts in the pre-colonial period and analyzed the nature of culture exchange throughout Eurasia. The underlying emphasis of these papers was that there were unifying elements in the culture of the region that brought together missionaries, traders, pilgrims who travelled through the 'first transcontinental highway' known as the Silk Road. The syncretism of the past years,

the unifying bonds of Buddhist, Christian, Hindu and Islamic faiths waned with the imposition of colonial rule in the 19th century. In a few cases like that of the *jadids*, argues Shams-ud-Din, there were attempts to integrate Western aspects of education. These were what he called 'native responses.' Devendra Kaushik's paper points to the inevitability of collision between the colonial powers and their subjects in Central Asia. The dominance of state-mechanism was reflected in the Soviet epoch too. Farhad Atai of Iran points to the political culture in Central Asia under Soviet rule. He indicates how art, culture and literature was state-managed by the Soviet administrators in Moscow. Ajay Patnaik's paper touches on more complex problems of ethnicity in Central Asia during the 1990s. His paper points to the social problems afflicting Central Asia during the last 10 years. The papers in the volume stress that symbiosis and conflict of cultures go hand in hand. While some point to the Great Game rivalries of the imperial masters during the 19th century, others point to regional tensions in the late 20th century due to ethnic and clan differences. There is also the recurrent interest among scholars to analyze the 'new great game' of the late 20th century, *i.e.* the competition for new trade routes (oil and gas links via the Perso-Afghan sector). Others like P. Stobdan and E.M. Eben of Kazakhstan are hopeful about regional cooperation. There are indications about India's security interests in the region. There are some interesting reflections about expressions of national identity in Central Asia, particularly Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan. In Uzbekistan, the use of revised textbooks as the medium of *edep* or *adab* is referred to. On the whole, in this book, there are opinions that highlight on revival of civilizational contacts and the need to minimize tensions of geopolitics, ethnicity, strategy and defense of borders in Central Asia and its neighbourhood. Contents of the book as follows: DANI, Ahmad Hasan, "Cultural Links between Central Asia and South Asia," 6-16; PATNAIK, Nityanand, "Ethnic and Cultural Interaction between Central Asia and India," 17-23; HAIDAR Mansura, "Exchanges and Interactions in the Field of Fine Arts, Handicrafts and Technology," 80-97; SHAMSUD-DIN, "The Jadidist Movement in Central Asia: The Natives' Response to Russian Cultural Penetration," 98-108; KHAN, Aimat Hayat, "Political Contacts between Central Asia and the Indian Subcontinent," 128-152; PATNAIK, Ajay, "Socio-Cultural Changes in Post-Soviet Central Asia," 198-210; STOB DAN, P., "India and Central Asia: Perspectives for Regional Cooperation," 239-254; ROSS, Masood Hussain, "Cultural Evolution of Islam in Central Asia: Impact on Society and Politics," 264-277; WARIKOO, K., "Revival of Ethno-Cultural Heritage in Contemporary Central Asia: Relevance for India," 278-283; DIXIT, J. N., "Culture, Society and Politics in Central Asia," 284-290.

S.C.

■ WINROW, Gareth, *Turkey in Post-Soviet Central Asia*, London: Royal Institute of International Affairs, 1995 (Former Soviet South Project), 53 p., 2 tabs.

The author reconstructs the rapid evolution of the relations between Turkey and the newly independent states of Central Asia between a First Turkic Summit in Ankara in October 1992 and a Second Turkic Summit planned for January 1994 in Baku, but

never convened. The great merit of the present study, documented by the Turkish press, consists of offering a large overview of the political forces, with notably a great interest in the role of Turkish non-governmental organizations and their instrumentation by the successive Turkish governments, and in Central Asian oppositional political organizations and parties during the first years of independence (although on this point one may regret the weakness of the documentation, of exclusively Turkish origin). The study is concluded by an overview of the often differing economic interests of Turkey's various partners in Central Asia, and of their influence on the slowing down which has been observed in the mid-1990s in the evolution of the inter-Turkic dialogue.

S.A.D.

- ZELICHENKO, Aleksandr, "'Opiumovaia voina' v Tsentral'noi Azii [The "Opium War" in Central Asia]," *TsA* 1997/5 [11]: 106-110.

This short statement devoted mainly to Badakhshan does not bring decisive elements to our knowledge of the opium economy in Central Asia — if only on the recent establishment in the Murghab district of laboratories coming from Pakistan for the fabrication of heroin. Uzbekistan remains as previously Central Asia's largest white patch in matter of information on drug production and traffic.

S.A.D.

- ZLOTOWSKI, Yves, "Ouzbékistan et Turkménistan: l'impossible transition," *LAC* 2 (1994): 9-10.

The author provides a short study of the specific processes of "privatization," of obstacles to economic change, of the policy of monetary independence and of the possibilities for international insertion of two newly independent states of Central Asia. The cases of Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan offer to the author's eyes an illustration par excellence of the difficulties to which the former Soviet republic of that region have been confronted, since they had inherited an inter-regional specialization which hampered reforms and the reorientation of trade toward countries with a liberal economy. The author also proposes a new approach in the field of technical assistance to former Soviet Central Asia, not in terms of the development of an inner market, but of a development which would be compatible with the real social and political constraints of each country of the region.

S.A.D.

- ZLOTOWSKI, Yves, "Tempêtes monétaires sur l'Asie centrale: quelles politiques pour les monnaies nationales?," *LAC* 3 (1995): 2-5.

This short introduction of the main consequences of the collapse of the ruble zone in 1993, in each of the five newly independent states of Central Asia, shows in particular how the unorganized character of this transition has prevented the definition of new commercial relations inside the former Soviet area of integrated economy, and obliged each protagonist to choose a path of its own.

S.A.D.

- ZVIAGEL'SKAIA [ZVIAGEL'SKAIA], Irina, *The Russian Policy Debate on Central Asia*,



London: Royal Institute of International Affairs, 1995 (Former Soviet South Project), 41 p.

Based on the debates of the Russian press since the end of the Soviet period, this reflection classifies the current approach to Central Asia among the official circles of the Federation of Russia into two categories: on the first hand ideological interpretations common to all the media (Central Asia being rejected as a burden alien to Russia, or on the contrary claimed as an integral part of a strategic glacis); on the other hand a more pragmatic approach for each distinct country. Prospective is dominated by the hypothesis of a status quo in asymmetrical relations, based on security considerations, between Russia and the former Soviet Central Asian republics — notably under the pressure of the widening of the NATO, and under the Chinese (for Kazakhstan) and Afghan (for Tajikistan) threats. S.A.D.

#### 8.4.B Kazakhstan

■ MESAMED, Vladimir, "Kazakhstan – Iran: realii i perspektivy sotrudnichestva [Kazakhstan – Iran: Realities and Prospects for Cooperation]," *TsA* 4 [10] (1997): 16-27.

The author gives a statement of several obstacles that prevent the development of diplomatic and economic relations between Kazakhstan and Iran. Among the latter, let us mention: the essential role recognized to Russia as Tehran's as well as Astana's main strategic partner in the region; the reservation of Astana against any kind of politicization of Islam north of the Syr-Darya River; last Iran's relative economic isolation in the second half of the 1990s. S.A.D.

#### 8.4.C Tajikistan

■ AKINER, Shirin, "Tadjikistan: catalyseur ou anti-corps pour les États voisins d'Asie centrale?," in Mohammad-Reza Djalili & Frédéric Grare, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Genève: Institut Universitaire des Hautes Études Internationales, 1995: 135-151, 2 maps.

After a series of considerations on the "clanic" character of the Tajikistani civil war, the author estimates that the conflict should not be extended to neighbouring countries, in which political cleavages are expressed through an opposition between laicism and Islamic fundamentalism. S.A.D.

■ ANONYMOUS, "The Failed Revolt in Tajikistan," *CAM* 1998/6: 13-14.

A chronology of the failed coup by Colonel Mahmud Khudoiberdiev in Khujand, with a recall of the main positions of the Tajikistani and Uzbekistani governments during and after the crisis. S.A.D.

■ [ATKIN, Muriel] ETKIN, M., "Rossiia i Tadzhiikistan [Russia and Tajikistan]," *TsA* 1997/3 [9]: 72-84.

The author analyzes how the Kremlin's choice of strong-arm methods in Tajikistan has

driven Russian strategists to support locally the political forces which were preserving the old authoritarian mentality inherited from the Soviet period. The author denounces Russia's support to President Rahmonov as a factor of freezing of reforms inside Russia itself, and as a vector of deregulation of Russia's relations with other Central Asian countries.

In a contradictory study V. SEROV, former Russian Minister of Relations with the States of the CIS (in 1995-96) calls the observers' attention to the emergency of reconstructing Tajikistan, notably through a reintegration of this country's military-industrial complex into its Russian counterpart: a good illustration of the permanence of a certain vision of Central Asia in Russia's political circles, which was criticized from the USA by the previous paper ("Stabilizatsiia obstanovki v Tadjikistane otvechaet interesam Rossii [The Stabilization of the Situation in Tajikistan Corresponds to Russia's Interests]," *ibid.* 1997/4 [10]: 55-57). S.A.D.

■ BORNET, Jean-Marc, "Le comité international de la Croix-Rouge et le conflit du Tadjikistan," in Mohammad-Reza Djalili & Frédéric Grare, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Genève: Institut Universitaire des Hautes Études Internationales, 1995: 171-180.

A statement on the action principles of the ICRC in Tajikistan, from the assistance to and protection of non-belligerents, in the beginning of the conflict, to the promotion of international humanitarian right in the mid-1990s. S.A.D.

■ CHERNOV, Vladimir, "Politicheskaiia situatsiia v Leninabadskoi oblasti [The Political Situation in the Leninabad Region]," *TsA* 3 [9] (1997): 94-99.

The author interestingly puts into perspective the political events of the years 1996-97 in the city and region of Leninabad (Khujand) in northern Tajikistan: demonstration of May 1996 in Khujand against the "Kulabization" of the regional administration; in July of the same year, formation of the party of the "National Rebirth" (in fact: of the Rebirth of Khujand [*Eh'ioi Khujand*]), for representing the interests of the north of the country, by people from the entourage of the former Prime Minister Abdumalik Abdullojonov; in April 1997, savagely repressed mutiny in one of the prisons of Khujand, where the leaders of the demonstration of May 1996 were detained without judgment (100 dead, 200 wounded according to Moscow's *Nezavisimaia gazeta*); murder attempt against President Rahmonov at the end of the same month. The author particularly insists, without mentioning the sources of his information, on the implication of figures of the parallel economy in each of these events (negotiations between Abdullojonov and Colonel Mahmud Khudoiberdiev, the main warlord of the people of Hisar, who had then acquired the control on the lucrative aluminium-manufacturing plant of Regar; participation of Suhrob, a former warlord of the "red" militias of the civil war period, in the attack against the prison of Khujand, etc.). The paper is concluded with a general recommendation for an association of the most influential groups of the rich northern region to the current negotiations for the division of political power

between the "Kulabi" government and the "United Tajik Opposition," which is introduced by the author as the main defender of the interests of the mountainous region of Gharm and of its migrant agricultural communities in the southern cotton valleys. For a perfectly symmetric narrative of the same events, based for the most part on dispatch stories, see: [MARTIN, Keith], MARTIN, Kit, "Dobro pozhalovat' v Leninabadskuiu respubliku [Welcome to the Republic of Leninabad]," *ibid.* 1997/4 [10]: 60-72.

S.A.D.

■ DJALILI, Mohammad-Reza, GRARE, Frédéric, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Geneva: Institut Universitaire des Hautes Études Internationales, 1995, 203 p., maps, bibliography.

The papers gathered in the present volume have been given to a colloquium held in the Institut Universitaire des Hautes Etudes Internationales of Geneva in December 1993. After a short introduction by the editors, who recall notably the Iranian character of Tajikistan in a Turkic-speaking Central Asian environment, P. CENTLIVRES & M. CENTLIVRES (see the separate account in this volume) question themselves on the ethnic components of the Tajik identity, then G. JAHANGIRI (see the separate account in this volume) evaluates the "constructed" nature of this identity, on the basis of works by historians of Tajikistan in the 1920s-30s. On more recent social and political developments, and the role played in the 1980s by the Tajikistani intelligentsia, M. HAMMER (see the separate account in this volume) studies the perception of Perestroika by historians from Dushanbe, whence S. A. DUDOIGNON deals with the emergence of a new elite through the political upheavals of the decade (see the separate account in this volume). Then comes a second part devoted to the civil war and to its consequences. After a short chronology of the conflict, from February 1990 to December 1992, by Bess BROWN ("La guerre civile au Tadjikistan," 97-107), separate papers study the respective positions of Russia (C. POUJOL, see the separate account in this volume), then those of Afghanistan, Pakistan and Iran (M.-R. DJALILI & F. GRARE, see the separate account in this volume). This part is closed with two papers on the impact of the Tajikistani war on neighbouring countries, the consequences of the conflict being interpreted from the viewpoint of its role as a possible catalyst (Sh. AKINER, see the separate account in this volume), or as a possible model — or anti-model — for future conflicts in Central Asia (O. ROY, see the separate account in this volume). The last part reflects the humanitarian concerns of multinational organizations like the Red Cross Committee (J. M. BORNET, see the separate account in this volume) or Amnesty International. As a whole this volume, the second ever published on the Tajikistani civil war, offers a rather complete overview from the point of view of political science, even if one can regret a culturalist interpretation and the surprising absence of a study of the economic and social grounds of the Tajikistani war. Other surprising shortcoming: only Western researchers have been invited to contribute, among whom a number had never put a foot in Tajikistan, whence one can find in the research centres of Dushanbe or of Moscow recognized Tajikistani political scientists whose works have cast a more penetrating light

on the war which was ravaging their country.

An English version has been published: DJALILI, Mohammad-Reza, GRARE, Frédéric & AKINER, Shirin, eds., *Tajikistan: The Trials of Independence*, Richmond: Curzon Press, 1998, 248 p., bibliography, maps. R.

■ DJALILI, Mohammad-Reza, GRARE, Frédéric, "Le conflit du Tadjikistan: convoitise et enjeux régionaux. Le rôle de l'Afghanistan, du Pakistan et de l'Iran," in Mohammad-Reza Djalili & Frédéric Grare, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Genève: Institut Universitaire des Hautes Études Internationales, 1995: 121-133.

This short but substantial paper — which includes interesting historical recalls in the *moyenne durée* — on the role (or on the lack of role...) of the three "Muslim" regional powers in the Tajikistani civil war, casts light on these countries' position as observers more than protagonists of that conflict. S.A.D.

■ DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A. [pseud. BERTRAND, André], "Naissance d'une opinion publique au Tadjikistan: tour d'horizon des journaux et partis politiques d'opposition," in Catherine Poujol, ed., *Asie Centrale: aux confins des empires, réveils et tumultes*, Paris: Autrement, 1992 (Monde: 64): 205-215.

In this synthetic paper the author analyzes the role played by the Tajikistani academic intelligentsia ("academocrata") in the emergence of alternative political sociability during Perestroika. He notably deals with the reinvention by Dushanbe's intelligentsia of a collective past on the basis of the Soviet historiography of Central Asia, in order to hasten the construction of a national memory capable of becoming a vector of mobilization of masses. The paper is closed with a chapter on the Islamic discourse of the official or alternative organizations of the Tajikistani intelligentsia, which is characterized by an overall attempts at recreating a social ethic and practice capable of replacing Soviet norms. R.

■ DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., "Changements politiques et historiographie en Asie Centrale (Tadjikistan et Ouzbékistan, 1987-1993)," *CEMOTI* 16 (1993): 85-134.

This long study is devoted to the influence of geopolitical evolutions in Central Asia in national history writing under the control of newly independent states, heirs to the ethnic division of the years 1924-35. The author takes as an example the mutually contradictory current reinterpretations, in Uzbekistan and in Tajikistan, of the common patrimony which for these two countries is made of the history of reformist and revolutionary movements in the Emirate of Bukhara. On the Uzbekistani side, one commonly insists today on the contribution by Jadid intellectuals and activists to the formation of a "Turkic" communal ideal, and to the constitution of the Autonomy of Turkestan in the winter 1917-18, considered the direct historical precedent of Uzbekistan's independence. On the Tajikistani side, historians reproach to the same figures of the Jadid movement, their political inspiration from the Young Turks, and the sacrifice of the interests of the Persian-speaking populations of Central Asia, deprived of their main

centres of learned urban culture, Samarqand and Bukhara, to the benefit of a Greater Uzbekistan. R.

- DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., "Forces et partis politiques au Tadjikistan (1989-1993)," in Mohammad-Reza Djalili & Frédéric Grare, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Genève: Institut Universitaire des Hautes Études Internationales, 1995: 63-94.

This study describes the ideology and the social basis of the main alternative political organizations of Tajikistan from the appearance of the first oppositional organizations in 1989 to the military victory of the "red" militias in the civil war in December 1992. The author deals in particular with the manner the Kremlin has guided from Moscow, and determined the ideological evolution of the Tajikistani academic intelligentsia since the mid-1970s. He then analyzes how the emergence of an Islamist party in 1990, has obliged this intelligentsia, then allied with the official clergy of Tajikistan, to formulate a new "Persian-Islamic synthesis." The paper is closed with a rapid analysis of how the anti-establishment intellectuals and Islamists have been eliminated from the Tajikistani political arena in 1993. R.

- DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., *Communal Solidarity and Social Conflicts in Late 20th Century Central Asia: The Case of the Tajik Civil War*, Tokyo: Islamic Area Studies Project, 1998 (Islamic Area Studies Working Paper Series: 7), 24 p.

This synthetic study of the genealogy of the Tajikistani civil war is an English updated and summarized adaptation by the author of a paper previously published in French: "Une segmentation peut en cacher une autre: régionalismes et clivages politico-économiques au Tadjikistan," *CEMOTI* 18, 1994: 73-129. S.A.D. formulates two illuminating remarks: the conflict has not always opposed the same camps from its beginning to its end, and it has gone through a period of global strategic changes of each of the main protagonists. The author first recalls the forerunners of the conflict, through a description of the cleavages of the Tajikistani society on the political, but also economic and ethnic levels. In his study of the years 1989-90, "from discontent to opposition," the author describes the tensions which drove to the emergence of the Rastokhez movement in 1989, the repression of the demonstrations of 1990 in Dushanbe and the creation of the Democratic Party of Tajikistan and of the Tajikistani branch of the Islamic Revival Party. The author then deals with the political organization of counter-elites from October 1990 to October 1991; he notes in particular the political alliances which can be then observed in Tajikistan as elsewhere in Central Asia: local Islamists and reformist opponents against ex-Communists or Communists in power. The author last analyzes the radicalization and regionalization of the conflict (from October 1991 to December 1992), before underlying in his conclusion that the conflict has been then displaced from cities to rural areas, and was not more the result of the inner divisions of Soviet elites, or of a structuring of new counter-elites, but a community conflict. The solution of it would reside, according to the author's view, in the social processes linked

with the rapid decomposition of a modern post-colonial state. In short: a study rich in analyses and ideas, which proposes us to understand the Tajikistani war beyond the simplistic scheme of a conflict based on ethnic and clanic conflicts. T.Z.

■ DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., JAHANGIRI, Guissou, eds., *Le Tadjikistan existe-t-il? Destins politiques d'une "nation imparfaite,"* Paris: AFEMOTI, 1994 (CEMOTI 18), 200 p., photos., maps, chronology.

The first collective work ever devoted to the Tajikistani civil war, this special issue of the CEMOTI is dominated by one question, which explains its originality: which forces have been at work behind the regional cleavage lines along which the armed conflict has been structured, given the country's complex historical stratification? The sociologist and demographer V. BUSHKOV analyzes the inter-community cleavages brought about by the migration movements of the mid-twentieth century, and aggravated by the highly regionalized development policy of the Soviet authorities, which tended to privilege the northern region of Leninabad at the expense of the centre and of the south (see the separate review of this paper in this volume). We find, under the pen of the Tajikistani political scientist P. MULLADJANOV [MULLADZHANOV] a comparable sort of cleavage between the "first" and "second" Soviet intelligentsias of Tajikistan — the latter coming from the 1970s onward from the migrant communities of the southern cotton valleys (see the separate review of this paper in this volume). We then deal, with G. JAHANGIRI, with the role of local and community solidarities in the genesis of the first developments of the conflict (see the separate review of this paper in this volume). S. A. DUDOIGNON insists on the highly political nature of the cleavages revealed by the civil war in its open phase, and based on the recent history of the country; for that, the author has reconstructed the alliance reversals which have given to the Tajikistani civil war its particularly dynamic appearance (see *supra* the previous review). After interrogations on the political project of the "Kulabi" coalition of interests, and on the stake of the control of a modern, centralized state, we study with Gilles DORRONSORO the strategy of the Tajiks of Afghanistan, deprived as the Kulabis initially were of a lucrative territorial foothold, toward the control of a centralizing state (see the separate review of this paper in this volume). The file is followed by two testimonies: a short text by an Afghan political activist, Zâhir TANÎN, not devoid of nostalgia for a trans-boundary Tajik identity, and a paper by the Tajikistani academician Muhammadjân SHUKURÎ [SHUKUROV, SHAKURI] on the Tajik language considered (in a logic inspired by the theoretic literature of the Stalinist period) as the unique cement of an unreachable Tajik nation (see the separate review of this paper in this volume). The file is concluded with two appendixes prepared by G. JAHANGIRI: a chronology of the conflict, and a table of the Tajikistani parties in the years 1991-93 (see the separate review of these items in this volume). R.

■ EMADI, Hafizullah, "State, Ideology and Islamic Resurgence in Tajikistan," CAS 13/4 (1994): 565-573.

This weakly documented paper reinterprets the Tajikistani civil war through the rather simplistic prism of an antagonism between northern technocracy and the apparatchiks of southernmost regions, Kulab, Qurghan-Teppa and Badakhshan. S.A.D.

- EMADI, Hafizullah, "Politics of Transformation and Ismailis in Gorno-Badakhshan, Tajikistan," *Internationales Asienforum*, 29/1-2 (1998): 5-22.

Following a somehow thrown together historical overview, based e. g. on Soviet popular literature like Pavel Luknitskii's *Soviet Tajikistan* (1954), and a partly rather distorted description of the momentous civil war in Tajikistan (1992 onwards), this article finally (p. 16 ff.) appears to be a kind of publicity brochure for the Pamir Relief and Development Program of the Agha Khan Foundation. As laudable as this engagement of the Agha Khan Foundation might be, the engagement of the author to contribute to academic knowledge thereby does not get the attention it deserves. R.E.

- [ISKANDAROV, Qosimsho] ISKANDAROV, Kosimsho, "Vliianie afganskogo krizisa na situatsiiu v Tadjikistane [The Influence of the Afghan Crisis on the Situation in Tajikistan]," *TsA* 2 [14] (1998): 51-59.

This paper, very informed by the reading of Western publications (A. Hyman, O. Roy, etc.) in Persian and Russian translations, deals with the close interaction between the political evolutions of Central Asia (between Uzbekistan and Tajikistan, notably) and the evolution of the Afghan political scene in the mid-1990s. S.A.D.

- JAHANGIRI, Guissou, "Anatomie d'une crise: le poids des tensions entre régions au Tadjikistan," *CEMOTI* 18 (1994): 37-72, 1 map, 1 phot.

This long paper on the weight of political regionalism in the genesis and in the evolution of the Tajikistani civil war gives a large room to the analysis of the local basis of the "bands" (*dastas*) of the parallel economy, which are organized according to the same kind of regional and local affiliations as the main political parties. R.

- JAHANGIRI, Guissou, "Partis politiques au Tadjikistan, de l'indépendance à la guerre civile," *CEMOTI* 18 (1994): 193-198.

The author provides a series of notices on the main Tajikistani political parties and organizations, with for each a short overview of its history, the list of its periodical publications, some sketches on its programme (notably in economy, religious policy and international relations). The author tends to interpret literally the information given to her by activists of these organizations, rather than to study critically the numerous sources in her possession (for instance on the divorce between the Tajikistani branch of the Islamic Revival Party and its pan-Soviet nucleus in October 1991, which is explained here by the latter's "pan-Turkic" [?] tendencies). S.A.D.

- KARIMOVA, Mavzuna, "Khod ekonomicheskikh reform v Tadjikistane [The Path of Economic Reforms in Tajikistan]," *TsA* 1998/2 [14]: 116-127.

The author provides a digest of the legislation voted since 1994 by the Rahmonov administration on "privatization" — as if this process, the first scandals of which have blown up in Dushanbe as soon as 1987, would have waited for the late ukases of the current Tajikistani president. In the same file (entitled: "Politicheskie i ekonomicheskie reformy v stranakh Tsentral'noi Azii: osnovnye tendentsii i napravleniia [The Political and Economic Reforms in the Central Asian Countries: Fundamental Tendencies and Evolutions]), one can also read: KOICHEV, T., "Kyrgyzskaia Respublika na puti perevov [The Republic of Kyrgyzstan on the Path to Upheavals]," 106-115. S.A.D.

- MAMADAZIMOV, Abdugani, dir., *Partii i dvizheniia Tadzhikistana* [Parties and Movements of Tajikistan], monthly journal, Dushanbe: Natsional'naia Assotsiatsiia politologov Tadzhikistana, since May 1998.

The booklet published by the Association of the Political Scientists of Tajikistan appears as a kind of forum offered to parties and movements born from the fragmentation of the country's political scene after the formal end of the civil war in 1997. The journal introduces the statutes and programmes of these parties, as well as summary accounts of round tables and colloquia organized in Dushanbe on the most varied subjects. It must be noticed, however, that this periodical remains totally closed to radical organizations of the opposition. This journal remains however an interesting document on the parties and movements which came out of the reformist aisle of the Tajikistani Communist party, of the food-processing sector, of the industrial apparatus, or of the nationalist organizations of the urban intelligentsias in the aftermath of the civil war.

S.A.D.

- MEDVEDEV, Vladimir, "Saga o Bobo Sangake, voine [The Saga of Bobo Sangak, Warrior]," *Druzhba narodov* 1993/6: 188-205.

This biography of the leader of the "red" militias of the Tajikistani civil war has been written by a Russian journalist of Dushanbe, on the basis of a long interview with Bobo Sangak several months before the latter's assassination in 1993. Detailed review by Stéphane A. Dudoignon in *CEMOTI* 16 (1996): 396-400. R.

- MULLADZHANOV, P. [MULLAJANOV, Parviz], MILOSLAVSKII, G. B., eds., *Maverannakhr. Informatsionno-analiticheskii biulleten'* [Mawarannahr. Informational and Analytical Bulletin]: Moscow: Tsentr Evraziia – Sogdiana, non-periodical journal, 2 issues published, since August 1992.

Initially edited by the "Eurasia" Cultural Centre of Moscow, and by the independent journal of the Tajik intelligentsia *Sogdiana* (which disappeared in the autumn 1992), *Maverannakhr* is led by a team of young political scientists of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Academy of Sciences of Russia, in Moscow. Its goal is to provide regular overviews and analyses on the events of the past years on ex-Soviet Central Asia. The first issue (August 1992) has been devoted to the Tajikistani civil war, with notably a paper by Parviz MULLADZHANOV on "Islam and Politics in Tajikistan" (see its review



*infra*), as well as a chronology, political portraits, and a list of the parties created in Tajikistan since the autumn 1989, with extracts of the programme of the nationalist movement *Rastokhez* (Address: 111250 Moskva, Krasnokazarmennaia ul. 10).

S.A.D.

- MULLODZHANOV [MULLADZHANOV, MULLAJANOV], P., "Islam i politika v Tadjikistane [Islam and Politics in Tajikistan]," *Maverannakhr* 1 (1992): 15-21, map.

Was Tajikistan threatened by the proclamation of an Islamic republic, after the access to power of a governmental coalition including the Islamic Revival Party in May 1992? The author tries to answer this question with an analysis of the social basis of the IRP, which has been composed for the most part of cultivators and stockbreeders coming from the migrant highlanders communities of central Tajikistan (Gharm, Mastcha). For these migrant (*muhojir*) communities established from the 1950s onward in the southern cotton plains (Qurghan-Teppa and Kulab), the income from the individual plots of land, their main resource, brutally fell down in the 1980s as a result of the liberalization of prices of industrial products, of transports, etc. In their attempts at defending their interests, notably inside the Islamic Revival Party, these *muhojir* have had to face three different kinds of obstacles: first their "localism," which limited (and still limits) the IRP's audience to regions, districts and kolkhozes peopled by Gharmis; then the relative weakness of their urban footholds, in spite of the beginning of a rural exodus which explains the presence of numerous Gharmi students in the anti-establishment intelligentsia of the Perestroika years; last the young Islamist intellectuals of the IRP have shown unable to contest the authority of the leaders of official Islam (which is revealed for instance by the role played in 1992 by the Imam of Kulab, Mullo Haydar).

S.A.D.

- [MULLODZHANOV] MULLADJANOV, Parviz, "Réflexions sur quelques effets du passage de génération dans l'intelligentsia contemporaine du Tadjikistan," *CEMOTI* 18 (1994): 27-36.

This short study by a well-informed Tajikistani political scientist casts light on an inner cleavage of the academic intelligentsia of Dushanbe, between a first generation of scholars and researchers educated in the 1930s to 1950s, who often came from the greatest cities of Transoxiana (Samarqand and Bukhara, Khujand and other cities of the Ferghana Valley) and were globally attached to the Soviet culture, and a second generation (the "second Tajik intelligentsia") who from the 1960s onward came out of the migrant rural population from the country's mountainous regions; curiously enough, this later intelligentsia was less touched than its predecessor by Russia's cultural influence, and it played a leading role in the nationalist and Islamist movements and organizations of the late 1980s and early 1990s.

S.A.D.

- [NIIAZI] NIYAZI, Aziz, "The Year of Tumult: Tajikistan after February 1990," in Vitaly Naumkin, ed., *State, Religion and Society in Central Asia. A Post-Soviet Critique*, Reading: Ithaca Press, 1993: 262-289.

The author considers the violently repressed demonstrations of February 1990 in Dushanbe as the event that in Tajikistan permitted a polarization of the political forces and the more or less postponed launching of the civil war. He questions himself on the incapacity of the Tajikistani Communist Party to take back the initiative from this date on, and deplores the "localist" and careerist nature of the "secret faction" of the CP — *i.e.*, the group of interests gathered behind an squad of young reformers opposed to the entourage of the successive Prime Secretaries Nabiev and Mahkamov. This tough line is compared by the author with the ideological fluidity of the opposition's organizations, including the Islamic Revival Party — although the author shows critical on the latter's structural limitations, linked with their regional footholds in the higher valley of Gharm and the valley's migrant communities of the southern cotton plains. S.A.D.

■ NIIAZI [NIYAZI], A[ziz] Sh., "Tadzhikistan: konflikt regionov [Tajikistan: a Conflict between Regions]," *Vostok* 1997/2: 94-107, Eng. sum.

The author of numerous studies of the Tajikistani civil war, that he most often analyzes from the viewpoint of economic history, A.N. insists in the present paper on the crystallization of political regionalism since the violently repressed demonstrations of February 1990 in Dushanbe, and on the presence of this regionalism as a durable element in the geography of social conflicts in Tajikistan. He first evokes the main regional sub-groups of the Persian-speaking population of Tajikistan and the general influence of a natural environment as contrasted as the country's economic history on the respective ethno-cultural profile of these populations. These considerations are followed by a chapter on the very uneven upheavals brought about in the various regions of the country (Leninabad, Kulab, Gharm, Qurghan-Teppa, Badakhshan) by the economic development of the second half of the twentieth century. The paper is concluded by a chapter on the evolution of political conflicts in Tajikistan, from the jousts between apparatchiks on the system of distribution of public charges according to regional affiliations, to the armed confrontation between large regional coalitions. For a more developed argumentation on the same subject, see by the same author: "Tadzhikistan: konflikt regionov na fone sotsial'no-ekologicheskogo krizisa [Tajikistan: An Inter-Regional Conflict on the Background of An Ecological and Social Crisis]," in Martha Brill-Olcott & Aleksei Malashenko, eds., *Ekologiia, obshchestvo i traditsiia: sotsial'nye i politicheskie krizisy v SNG v kontekste razrusheniia prirodnoi sredy (Tadzhikistan i Rossiiskii Sever)* [Ecology, Society and Tradition: The Social and Political Crises of the CIS in a Context of Destruction of the Natural Environment (Tajikistan and Russia's Great North)], Moscow: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 1997: 8-41. S.A.D.

■ NIIAZI [NIYAZI], Aziz, "Tadzhikistan: ot sistemnogo krizisa k ustoichivomu razvitiui [Tajikistan: from Systemic Crisis to Sustained Development]," *TsA* 1997/3 [9]: 60-66.

The paper consists of a series of most relevant observations on the consequences of the Tajikistani civil war in the continuation of political traditions ("localism") and economic ones (rhetorical planning) of the Soviet period. The article is opened by suggestions

linking economic, ecological, and social reforms (through giving up the taste of the Soviet planners for gigantic projects and freezing large scale industrial projects; modernizing existing enterprises for a more rational mobilization of natural resources; reducing cotton monoculture and re-orienting a significant part of the agricultural sector toward the food-processing industry; developing rural economy in both plains and higher valleys so as to reduce the catastrophic political consequences of the rural exodus of the past decades).  
S.A.D.

■ NOURZHANOV, Kirill, "Seeking Peace in Tajikistan: Who is the Odd Man Out?," *CAM* 1998/6: 15-23.

Endorsing the overall interpretation of Tajikistani civil war as a conflict between sub-ethnic groups identified with mutually antagonistic regions, the author reconstructs the main phases of the negotiations between the "Kulabi" government and the "Gharmi" armed opposition since the military paralysis of the winter 1993. He astutely insists on the numerous political compatibilities between the two camps, beyond a merely cosmetic "Communist" or "Islamist" rhetoric. The author however remembers that the rapprochement between the two has been made at the expense a "third" force, made of those whom he calls the "Khujandis," former allies of the Kulabis. Khujandi apparatchiks had dominated the Tajikistani state and party from the red terror to the aftermath of independence; they lost a significant part of their weight in the government after the agreement between the Kulabis and the Gharmis in 1997. If the Khujandis are now divided by inner quarrels which are used against them by the central power, such is not the case of other allies of the Kulabis: the people of Hisar (see the coup by Ibodullo Boimatov in Regar in 1994) and the Loqay Uzbeks (coup by "Colonel" Mahmud Khudoiberdiev in Qurghon-Teppa in the following year). To this fragmentation of authority in the camp of the victors of the civil war corresponds an analogous division among the "United Tajik Opposition," the two most prominent leaders of which, Sayyid Abdullo Nuri and Akbar Turajonzoda, are nowadays measuring their respective forces. On the field, the fourteen "commandants" of Qarategin and Badakhshan behave more as warlords than as intermediaries of the central power. The solution proposed by the author for getting out of this liquefaction of political authority in Tajikistan would consist of opening the alleys of power to representatives of interest groups other than those usually called Kulabids and Gharmis — who do not seem very wishful to open their ranks...  
S.A.D.

■ OLIMOV, Muzaffar Abduvakkasovich, "Problemy metodologii analiza i prognoza v izuchenii mezhtadzhikskogo konflikta [Problems of Methodology of Analysis and Prospect in the Study of the Tajik Conflict]," *TsA* 1997/5 [11]: 54-59.

A rapid and superficial reading of a limited number of studies on the Tajikistani civil war (which excludes all the publications outside the CIS) drives the author to a series of misunderstandings on the orientations of research on this topic. On these fragile postulates, the author learnedly shows us the path to be followed, thrusting forward a sum-

marily commented — and most probably unread — bibliography made of a limited number of great names of Western sociology.... S.A.D.

- OLIMOV, M[uzaffar], ed., *Mezhtadzhikskii konflikt: put' k miru* [The Inter-Tajik Conflict: the Path to Peace], Moscow: Rossiiskaia Akademiia nauk (Institut etnologii i antropologii) – Informatsionno-analiticheskii tsentr "Shark," 1998, 144 p., tab.

This volume gathers the materials of a round table entitled "Compared Conflictology of the Post-Soviet Transformation of Central Asia," organized by the "Sharq" Centre in Dushanbe on October 3, 1997. It provides a stenograph of the debates between Tajikistani, Russian and US researchers, diplomats and political protagonists, on several aspects of the Tajikistani civil war. The participants deal first with the specificity of this conflict in Central Asia, then the economic origins and consequences of the war in Tajikistan itself and in the neighbouring countries. The second part, devoted exclusively to Tajikistan, provides first a tentative study on relations between the past and the present, an analysis of the social structure of Tajikistan (in particular that of the country's post-Soviet "elite"), then the relations with the Afghan crisis, last the perspectives and risks of normalization in Tajikistan. In spite of the lack of bibliographical references, which would have offered the readers useful critical developments, one can only rejoice oneself of the existence of this round table, a rare occasion for a peaceful debate between researchers and Tajikistani political figures, and of this meeting's publication, which allows us to overview the main analyses which have been elaborated on the conflict inside Tajikistan during the 1990s. Beside an intellectual openness that remains very unusual in Central Asia (such a debate would be hardly imaginable in Tashkent or in Ashgabat, or even in Bishkek or Almaty), the present volume reveals the dynamism of a young sociological and political science school which deals without taboo with the grounds of an exceptionally murderous conflict. The readers' main regret is the lack of a real Western participation in this debate, in spite of the support given to its organization by the US Embassy in Dushanbe. S.A.D.

- OLIMOV, Muzaffar, OLIMOVA, Saodat, "Khudzhand: mezhdur Ferganoi i Tadjikistanom [Khujand: between Ferghana and Tajikistan]," *VE* 1998/1-2 [4-5]: 203-219, 1 map.

As it is quite often the case in the authors' writings, the historical prelude to the present paper distinguishes itself by a number of unwarranted assertions (for instance on the weakening of "ethnic" identities in the Ferghana Valley in modern times, in favor of an overall "regional" identity), or by a non-cautious use of problematic categories (such as the ethnic denomination "Sart" applied to populations not clearly identified, or the term "clan" used without rhetoric precaution). The pages devoted to the current situation are based on the postulate of Tajikistan's incapacity to assume its independence since its proclamation in 1991, which is explained by the sequels of the national division of Central Asia in 1924 (problematic drawing of the boundaries, heterogeneity of the Tajikistani society, lack of a "national" project among the urban intelligentsia). Considerations on the economic functioning of "clans" of the city and region of

Khujand since the independence do not rely on any fieldwork, and no reference comes to substantiate them. Moreover, these considerations add nothing to a subtler study recently published by Kirill Nourzhanov (see the review *supra*). Last, the recall of political violence in Khujand in 1996-7 provides the official, governmental interpretation of this succession of events. More generally speaking, the energy expended by the authors to discredit the economic elites of the rich northern city and region appears politically oriented, and their study, a hurried and highly polemic work, should be taken with caution.

S.A.D.

- OLIMOVA, S. K., "Kommunisticheskaia partiia Tadjikistana v 1992–1994 gg. [The Communist Party of Tajikistan in 1992–1994]," *Vostok* 1996/2: 52–62.

This important study is devoted to the deep transformation of the Tajikistani Communist Party between the military victory of the red militias in December 1992 and the elections to the upper chamber of the parliament in February 1995. One may regret that the author's historical overview shows numerous shortcomings, in particular through unwarranted or non-documented assertions on President Nabiev (1992–3)'s strategy of state restoration, or on the popular support given in 1992 to the idea of a reconstruction of the USSR. Let us also deplore the purely quantitative analysis of the membership of the CP among the deputies elected to the parliament in 1995: it would have been more interesting to study with more detail the complex modes of instrumentation of the PC's membership among Tajikistani MPs (most of whom had been elected under the label of "independents"...). Besides, the author does not always avoid pure waffle, notably when she quotes without critical distance the resolutions voted by the party's various congresses. Nevertheless, this paper offers an invaluable — since rarest — analysis of the current social composition of the Tajikistani CP, and of the latter's problematic articulation with the political power which has come out of the civil war in fall, 1992. The author puts in perspective the party's social basis and its strong inner cleavages and conflicts, ideological and strategic. With its strongest footholds in Kulab, Hisar and Khujand, the Tajikistani CP appears totally absent from Qarategin and Pamir; inside its ranks, we see the opposition between "Northerner" renovators, the defenders of Uzbekistani-style reforms, and pragmatic "Southerners," concerned by the preservation of the privileges they have acquired by force. On the grass roots level, Russian-speaking workers and pensioners of old have given room to new supporters, less numerous than in the past, among whom one finds civil servants, white collars, and pensioners (these social categories, which have suffered more than others from the consequences of independence, are behind the Movement for the Restoration of the USSR). At the top level, the author has observed during the mid-1990s increasing contradictions between the "conservatives," who are close to the party's new supporters and willing to maintain an unchanged ideological line, and the "partocrats" (Rus. *partiitsy*) — this term designates young senior officials who at the right moment have taken control on the resources put at their disposal by the forbidding of the party for creating their own private companies; these profiteers of the political transition of 1991–92 try now

to get closer to the elite which has come out of the "red" militias' victory, in order to have access to riches privatized since the collapse of the USSR. The cleavage between conservatives and partocrats has been fully revealed during the public debate on the new constitution, when the former opposed the proclamation of an autocratic regime on the Uzbekistani or Turkmen model. Although they enjoy a certain audience, conservatives are limited by the fragility of their social footholds, and by their isolation in Central Asia (they have regular relations only with analogous organizations of the Federation of Russia). Moreover, in the mid-1990s they suffer on account of the general Tajikistani context (characterized by the overall loss of prestige of the political class, the marginalization of the intelligentsia, social violence inherited from the civil war, etc.). S.A.D.

- OLIMOVA, S. K., OLIMOV, M. A., "Nezavisimyi Tadjikistan: trudnyi put' peremen [Independent Tajikistan: The Uneasy Path of Change]," *Vostok* 1995/1: 132-146, Eng. sum.

Although deprived of a critical apparatus, this synthetic study deserves to be mentioned thanks to its subtle analysis of the contrasted effects of contemporary political and economic history on the level of community consciousness of the Tajiks, in various regions and socio-professional categories, and on their respective level of preparation to market economy in different regions of Tajikistan (with a particular interest of the authors in the glaring social and behavioral differences between the former allies of the civil war periods, Leninabad people in the north of the country and Kulab people in the south). Beside the lack of notes, the significance of this paper is unfortunately further limited by the authors' strong neo-conservative bias (hostile to alternative political organizations and favorable to the creation of a strong centralized state in Tajikistan), by their ethnocentric considerations inherited from the Soviet ideology (what is a region "culturally backward"?), and last by numerous approximations (the text is full of highly discussable assertions, never backed by any critical or documentary element, in particular in the first paragraphs on the history of the twentieth century). S.A.D.

- OLIMOVA, Saodat, OLIMOV, Muzaffar, "Integratsionnye protsessy v Tsentral'noi Azii: vzgliad iz Tadjikistana [The Integration Processes in Central Asia: A View from Tajikistan]," *TsA* 4 [16] (1998): 54-65.

The authors of this study give us a sort of official point of view of the authorities of Dushanbe on the current progress of Tajikistan's integration into the "group of four" formed since March 1998 with Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan. In the same file published by the journal of Luleå under the title "Problemy mezhgosudarstvennoi integratsii v Tsentral'noi Azii [Problems on Inter-State Integration in Central Asia]," one can also read: KUSHKUMBAEV, S., "Tsentral'noaziatskaia integratsiia v kontekste istorii i geopolitiki [Central Asian Integration in the Context of History and Geopolitics]," 20-34; MARKOV, V., "Tsentral'noaziatskaia integratsiia: etap ili al'ternativa integratsii stran SNG? [Central Asian Integration: a Stage or an Alternative to the Integration of the Countries of the CIS?]," 35-46; SUIUNBAEV, M., "Integratsiia

Tsentrāl'noi Evrazii: geopoliticheskie i geoeconomicheskie faktory [Central Eurasia's Integration: Geopolitical and Geo-Economic Factors], 47-53. R.

■ PANFILOV, Oleg, "Tadzhikistan: ot grazhdanskoi voyny k grazhdanskomu soglasiuu. Tretii raund mezhtadzhikskikh peregovorov [Tajikistan: from Civil War to Civic Concorde. The Third Round of the Inter-Tajik Negotiations]," *TsA* 2 [8] (1997): 25-31.

A former non-official spokesman of the Tajikistani opposition provides a polemical statement on some details of the "Inter-Tajik Dialogue" in the three years following the cease-fire signed in Tehran on September 17, 1994. One can also read, for another point of view: SAUNDERS, Harold H., "The Inter-Tajik Dialogue within the Framework of the Dartmouth Conference," *CAM* 1997/4: 31-36 (a former US Under-State Secretary for the Near-East and Southern Asia deals with the effects that have been exerted since 1994 the "Inter-Tajik Dialogue" sponsored by the Kettering Foundation and by the Russian Centre for Strategic Research). S.A.D.

■ POUJOL, Catherine, "Quelques réflexions sur l'implication russe dans le conflit tadjik: 1992-1993)," in Mohammad-Reza Djalili & Frédéric Grare, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Genève: Institut Universitaire des Hautes Études Internationales, 1995: 109-119.

After remembering the determining influence of the inner cleavages of the Tajikistani society in the genesis of the civil war, the author deals with the behavior of Russia's armed forces stationed in Dushanbe and on the Afghan boundary, and with Moscow's attitude, and that of its partners of the intervention force set up in Tajikistan after the victory of the pro-Communist militias in December, 1992. The paper casts light on Russia's reluctance to be dragged into a conflict which reminded its rulers of that of Afghanistan, whence it did not accept either the loss of the backbone of its security system, neither the threat of a chaotic reverse emigration of the Russian-speaking population of Tajikistan and Central Asia. S.A.D.

■ ROY, Olivier, "Le conflit du Tadjikistan est-il un modèle des conflits d'Asie centrale?," in Mohammad-Reza Djalili & Frédéric Grare, eds., *Le Tadjikistan à l'épreuve de l'indépendance*, Genève: Institut Universitaire des Hautes Études Internationales, 1995: 153-168.

The author stresses some specificities of the Tajikistani civil war (Islamic fundamentalism, politicized regionalism, the mobilization of sub-ethnic identities, the non-existence of a strong national identity) and questions himself on the possibility of the propagation of a Tajik "model" to former Soviet Central Asian neighbouring states — in particular to Uzbekistan, where the Ferghana Valley appears as a stronghold of autonomist and Islamist movements. However his conclusion is that the cohesion of Uzbekistani society, the strong local tradition of political centralism, and the repressive attitude of the Karimov administration toward all kinds of Islamist organizations seem to protect this country from the tragic disorders to which its southern neighbour has

been confronted.

S.A.D.

- RUDENKO, A., SOROKIN, A., eds., *Tadzhikistan v ogne* [Tajikistan in Flame], Dushanbe: Irfon, 1993, 288 p.

Collection of papers published in the Tajikistani Russian-speaking press in the period of expansion of Tajik nationalism (1989-1992), mainly by Russian authors favorable to the Tajik anti-establishment intelligentsia, but hostile to the Islamic Revival Party.

S.A.D.

- TURSUNZOD, Akbar, "Kul'turnaia antropologiiia odnogo konflikta (Vzgliad iznutri na tragediiu Tadjhikistana) [Cultural Anthropology of a Conflict (A View from Within on Tajikistan's Tragedy)]," *TsA* 1997/3 [9]: 48-59.

Nothing very innovative has been expressed in this very theoretic paper, deprived of critical apparatus, by a disillusioned Marxist on the essentially cultural causes of the Tajikistani civil war: to the author's eyes the urban culture of the Tajiks has been deprived of its main centres by the national delimitation of 1924 — a theory which espouses that formulated by the nationalist intelligentsia of Dushanbe since the late 1980s.

S.A.D.

- USMON, Ibrohim, *Soli Nabiev* [Nabiev's Year], Dushanbe: s.n., 1995, 114 p.

This book provides a tentative posthumous rehabilitation of Rahmon Nabiev (1930-93), Prime Secretary of the Tajikistani Communist Party (1983-1985), then an ephemeral President of the Republic of Tajikistan in 1991-92, through an analysis of his role in the first stages of the civil war.

S.A.D.

- ZVIAGEL'SKAIA [ZVIAGELSKAIA], Irina, "Tadzhikistan: vyzovy postkonfliktного perioda (zametki konfliktologa) [Tajikistan: The Teachings of the Post-Conflict Period (Notes of a Conflictologist)]," *TsA* 1997/3 [9]: 67-71.

This paper consists of a series of considerations full of shrewdness on the possible causes of a failure of normalization in Tajikistan, at a date when political negotiations have made the conflict enter into a latent period. According to the author, a foreign contribution to normalization could come only from countries of the "first circle," the intervention means of which are however limited, and the respective strategies divergent: Uzbekistan promotes the interests of the Tajik-Uzbek political class of Khujand; Iran is suspected to support the participation of the Islamic Revival Party in the government; Turkey is credited by the author of a laicizing influence through its school networks in the region; and Russia's military support against the Taliban threat is more than ever requested. These remarks of good sense should perhaps have been more documented (for instance those of the Iranian logistic support to the Islamic Revival Movement of Tajikistan). This reading can be completed by that of a short statement by the same author: "Sostoitsia li tadjhikskoe uregulirovanie? [Will Tajik Regularisation Take Place?]," *ibid.*, 1997/4 [10]: 58-59.

S.A.D.



#### 8.4.D Turkmenistan

■ OCHS, Michael, "Turkmenistan: The Quest For Stability And Control," in Karen Dawisha & Bruce Parrott, eds., *Conflict, Cleavage and Change in Central Asia and the Caucasus*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 312-359, tab., 141 bibliographical notes.

This long paper deals with the reasons of the "failure" of post-Soviet Turkmenistan's transition from a particularly opaque Communist system to a more open régime. The author casts light on the convergence of numerous phenomena like the very limited economic and social development inherited from the Soviet period, the perpetuity of the tribal structures of Turkmen society north of the Atrek River, the incapacity of Perestroika to change the *Stand der Dinge* in Ashgabat, the Turkmen society's political lethargy, and Turkmenbashi's fundamentally megalomaniac and dictatorial character.

B.B.

■ PETROSIAN, David, "Armiano-turkmenskie otnosheniia: vzgliad iz Erevana [The Armeno-Turkmen Relations: A View from Yerevan]," *TsA* 1997/2 [8]: 37-41.

This paper provides a very official Armenian point of view, which does not avoid cant (see the grotesque description of Turkmenbashi's visit to Yerevan in March, 1996), on the evolution of the Armenian-Turkmen relations since the early 1990s. The exchanges between the two countries, although initially advantaged after the independences by the development of road transports through Iran, have been hampered since 1995 by the establishment of a Russian monopoly on Turkmen gas exportations. The paper is closed by some statistic data and general considerations on the Armenian community of Turkmenistan (33,600 persons, of whom 20,600 in Ashgabat, according to the 1995 census).

S.A.D.

#### 8.4.E Uzbekistan

■ ABDUKARIMOV, Sur'at, ed., *Matbuotimiz fidoilari* [The Fighters of Our Press], Tashkent: Uzbekiston, 1993, 296 p., ill.

This collection of some fifty biographies of Uzbekistani journalists and publicists of the Soviet period is a regression, from the points of view of its volume and content, if compared with a first more substantial edition (*Matbuotimiz fidoilari*, ed. Ziiod Esenboev, Tashkent: Uzbekiston, 1991, 414 p.). It is true that the first edition provided a number of biographic notices on prominent figures of the Uzbekistani political opposition of the late 1980s and early 1990s...

S.A.D.

■ CARLISLE, Donald S., "Geopolitics and Ethnic Problems of Uzbekistan and Its Neighbours," in Yaacov Ro'i, ed., *Muslim Eurasia: Conflicting Legacies*, London: Frank Cass, 1995: 71-103, 8 maps.

This paper provides a masterly analysis of the strategy of successive Uzbekistani régimes, since the 1920s, in national and territorial policy. The author deals with the

tactics developed by Fayzullah Khojaev, the Prime Minister of the PSR of Bukhara, then of the Uzbek SSR (from 1920 to 1937) for recovering most of the territory of the former khanates of Kokand and Khiva and of the Emirate of Bukhara— with success, at least until the secession of the Tajik SSR in 1929, the episodes of which have let a painful memoir on both sides of the present-day boundary between Uzbekistan and Tajikistan.

See also, Donald S. Carlisle, "Soviet Uzbekistan: State and Nation in Historical Perspective," in Beatrice F. Manz, ed., *Central Asia in Historical Perspective*, Boulder CO: Westview Press, 1994: 103-126. S.A.D.

- DUDOIGNON, Stéphane A., "Les médias autonomes d'Asie Centrale pendant la dislocation du système soviétique. I. Le *Mustaqil Haftalik*," *Bulletin des Anciens Elèves et Amis des Langues Orientales* (November 1993): 95-121.

Short study of the monthly journal *Mustaqil Haftalik* published by the Uzbekistani opposition party Birlik, in Tashkent from January to November 1992, and in Moscow in the following years. The paper is based notably on the author's conversations with Hamidulla Rasulev, the Journal's chief-redactor who is in exile in Moscow since December 1992. R.

- GOL'DBERG, Gabriel', "O problemakh 'Turok-meskhettintsev' (istoricheskii aspekt) [About the "Meshkhetian Turks" (The Historical Aspect)]," *TsA* 2 [14] (1998): pp. 68-74.

Without unfortunately backing up his assertions by any documentation, the author resituates the inter-community violence inflicted to the Caucasian Turkish population of the Ferghana Valley in August 1989, in the general context of manipulations operated by Soviet security agencies in order to destabilize the Caucasus and to weaken the Georgian national movement. (The Turks from Meskhethia had been deported to Central Asia during the summer 1944; in the aftermath of the Ferghana massacres, they claimed the creation of an autonomous region of their own in the Southern Caucasian republic from which they had departed half a century earlier.) The paper is followed by the reproduction of documents coming from Beria's services on the deportation of the Turks of Meskhethia.

This recent interest of Israeli researchers in the Turks of Meskhethia has also been expressed in a study more recently published in the same journal by R. Enoch, from the University of Jerusalem, on the attempts made by the leaders of this community for obtaining in 1990 the right to resettle in Georgia. The author deals in particular with the reactions of the Georgian society and of the Georgian national movement to the threat of this population influx at a time when Georgia was confronted with Ossetian irredentism, and when Armenia and Azerbaijan were tearing each other apart about the Qarabagh question. (Reuven ENOKH, "'Turki-Meskhettintsy' — 'Pokhod na rodinu,' 1990 g. ['The Turks of Meskhethia' — 'The Fatherland's Marsh']," *TsA* 1997/4 [10]: 99-105.)

S.A.D.

- LUBIN, Nancy, "Uzbekistan: The Challenges Ahead," *MEJ* 43/4 (1989): 619-634.

A short overview of the economic, ecological and social problems that Uzbekistan has inherited from the Soviet period is followed by an analysis of several pernicious local effects of Perestroika, until the appearance of the first oppositional parties. S.A.D.

- MCCRAY, Tom, "Complicating Agricultural Reforms in Uzbekistan: Observations on the Lower Zaravshan," *CAM* 1997/1: 7-14; 1997/2: 19-25, bibliography.

On the basis of a survey made in the region of Bukhara, one of Uzbekistan's main cotton lands, the author sketches a very descriptive and richly documented picture of the various impacts on environment of the continuation or aggravation of the extensive agricultural practices of the Soviet period. Among the main obstacles to change, the author mentions the lack of a real political will to reform the system of water management, as the grassroots as well as at the top level, even if a desire for more autonomy seems to appear among the cultivators who have benefited from the first land privatizations. S.A.D.

- NISHANOVA, Dilorom, "The Impact of Educational Exchange," *CAM* 1997/5: 27-33.

Although written in a mere apologetic tone, in praise of Central Asia's "cultural renaissance" and of cultural exchanges between Uzbekistan and the USA, this short paper has the merit of providing some elements on the influence which has been exerted since the mid-1990s by various American foundations and institutions on the academic countryside of Uzbekistan. S.A.D.

- PETROVA, S. N., "Kul'turno-istoricheskoe nasledie kak resurs vneshnepolitiki Respubliki Uzbekistan [The Cultural and Historical Heritage as a Resource of Uzbekistan's Foreign Policy]," *Vostok* 1998/3: 79-88.

The author proposes an analysis of several points of divergence in the political use of the past in Uzbekistan, on the one hand, and on the other hand in the other former Soviet republics of Central Asia. She first describes the projection toward the remote past of the national states which have come out the national division of 1924 (Tamerlane's empire for Uzbekistan, the Parthian empire for Turkmenistan, the Samanid kingdom for Tajikistan, etc.). She then gives considerations on the manner the official historical discourse in Tashkent and in the other Central Asian capitals is deeply conditioned by Uzbekistan's relations with its neighbours — with a particular interest of the author in Tajikistan, unfortunately seen through the mainly polemic booklets by Rahim Masov. The paper is concluded with an analysis of the utilization of the history of the Stalinist period by the Karimov administration, for regular denunciations of Russia's will of hegemony in Central Asia. S.A.D.

- POLAT, Abdumannob, "Trying to Understand Uzbekistan's Dilemma," *CAM* 1998/1: 13-20.

A former leader of the Birlik movement deals with the shifts of the organization of

political power in Uzbekistan since the country's independence. His considerations on the limited attempts at democratization of the years 1996-97 have unfortunately lost much of their relevance, after a new period of political hardening marked by the bomb attacks of February 1999 in Tashkent, and the wave of repressions which followed them.

S.A.D.