

Contribution of Japanese Scholars to the Study of Art and Archaeology of Afghanistan (II)

An Annotated Bibliography

By Haruko T. MOTAMEDI

VIII. Middle of the Hindukush Mountains

Bamiyan :

Bamiyan, situated in the middle of the Hindukush mountains, once stood at the crossroads of civilizations which connected India, Central Asia, Mesopotamia, Iran and China. Chinese literary sources from the fifth century A.D. indicate that Bamiyan was already known to China at that time. The most complete record of Bamiyan was written by Hsüan-chuang who visited this Buddhist centre in 632. He noted the existence of two colossal Buddha images, and numerous sanctuaries and the presence of thousands of monks who belonged to the Lokattara-vadin school of Hinayana Buddhism. When Hui-ch'ao visited Bamiyan in the early eighth century, he observed the practice of both Mahayana and Hinayana Buddhism. Buddhist activity at Bamiyan seems to have ended with the advance of the Moslems shortly after the beginning of the eighth century.

The date of the introduction of Buddhism to Bamiyan is still a great question; the early theories maintained an early date of the second or third century A.D., while there is a tendency now to consider the date to be later, between the third and fourth centuries A.D.

The first organized survey of Bamiyan was conducted by members of DAFA led by A. Foucher. They made surveys and excavations as follows: 1) A. Foucher in November 1922; 2) A. and Y. Godard, from August to October 1923; 3) J. Hackin in June and November 1924; 4) J. Hackin and J. Carl, from May to September 1930; and 5) R. and J. Hackin in 1933.

The results of the above explorations are found in the following official publications;

1) A. Godard and J. Hackin: *Les antiquités bouddhiques de Bamiyan*, MDFA Tome II, Paris, 1928, 1 Vol. in-folio

2) J. Hackin and J. Carl: *Les nouvelles recherches archéologiques à Bamiyan*, MDFA Tome III, Paris, 1933, 1 Vol. in folio

3) J. Hackin: *Recherches archéologiques à Bamiyan en 1933, MDAFA Tome VIII*, Paris, 1959, pp. 1-6

In addition to the above publications, further information is available in:

1) J. Hackin: *L'oeuvre de la Delegation archéologique française en Afghanistan (1922-1932)*, Tokio, 1928

2) J. Hackin: *Le site archéologique de Bamiyan*, Paris, 1934

3) Hackin, Joseph and Ria: "*Dernier travaux de la Delegations archéologique française en Afghanistan*", *Revue des art asiatiques* VIII, 2

The French archaeologists first surveyed the 35 meter Buddha and the neighbouring caves: observations of 1) the colossal image; 2) the paintings in the niche containing the image; 3) architectural characteristics of the rock-cut caves; and 4) major paintings found in these caves, were made. The major caves explored by DAFA are numbered: A, B, C, D, E, F, G, J, K, I, V, XI, XII. According to the results of these surveys, Hackin concluded that the art that flourished in Bamiyan could be described as Irano-Buddhist. Hackin noticed the strong influence of Sassanian art and some influence from Gupta India, two forces which transformed the originally Graeco-Buddhist art into something unique.

The dating by French scholars of the Bamiyan remains is placed between the second and sixth centuries A.D. Foucher dated both images of Buddhas to the third century and considered that the 35 meter Buddha was the first to be completed. This early date is the result of Foucher's desire to relate the founding of the site to the reign of King Kanishka. In the official reports, Cave G where no Sassanian elements were found is considered the oldest, while Cave D, which shows strong Sassanian influence, was dated the fourth century, Cave F was dated mid-fifth century, and Caves I, II, XI to the sixth and seventh centuries. Among the paintings in the two niches of the Great Buddha images, the asparas in the 53 meter Buddha niche which reflected the style of the paintings of Ajanta was considered the oldest, while that of the 35 meter Buddha niche judging from the strong Sassanian influence is much later, from the fifth to the sixth century. Hackin identified the main composition as an image of the Moon God, but the present consensus identifies it as the Sun God, Surya.

The neighbouring sites of Kakrak and Deh-i-Ahangaran, which are presently called Foladi, were also surveyed. In one sense these sites could be included in greater Bamiyan proper. Kakrak is considered to postdate the 53 meter Buddha and the painting of a hunting king judging from the representation of three crescents on the crown is dated to the early fifth century. Foladi was considered as fifth or sixth century, although Rowland and Ghirshman date it from sixth to seventh century.

Bamiyan provides important information on the state of cultural contact and transmission which existed at the time when great changes were taking place in Buddhist thought and Mahayana Buddhism was developed. The

process of the gradual modification of the original Graeco-Buddhist style at Bamiyan through the influence of Iranian and Indian elements, can be observed in many different stages.

Among the papers by Japanese scholars written about the art and archaeology of Afghanistan, more than half are devoted to Bamiyan. The first Japanese scholar to visit the site was Sennosuke Odaka, who made a trip to Bamiyan in 1932. However, due to his sudden death, only his diary and photographs, but no article, were made available. Chigyô Yamada visited the site in September 1938 and Itsuji Yoshikawa in the autumn of 1939. Yoshikawa accompanied Hackin and made an independent survey while Hackin and other members of DAFA were conducting their brief observations. The publications of the finds of Yamada and Yoshikawa, based on their own first hand observations and analysis as well as on those of DAFA, were the first of their kind to reach learned Japanese circles. Since then, numerous articles have been written in which are discussed various characteristics of the site (see present bibliography), based on information gathered by Japanese survey teams: Nagoya University in 1964 and 1969; and Kyoto University (photogrammetric survey) at Bamiyan since 1970.

35. Ono, Genmyô: *Daijô Bukkyô Bijutsu no Kigen oyobi sono Hattatsu Taikei, Tokuni Bâmiyan no Daibutsu o chûshin to suru Zôzô Keishiki no Hattatsu ni tsuite* 大乘佛教美術の起源及びその發達大系, 特に梵衍那の大佛を中心とする造像形式の發達について (*The source of art of Mahayana Buddhism and its development, specially on the development of style of image in regard to the Great Buddha of Bamiyan*), in *Daijô Bukkyô Geijutsu no Kenkyû* 大乘佛教藝術の研究 (*A study of the art of Mahayana Buddhism*), Tokyo, 1972, pp. 1-41.

Contents:

- | | |
|---|--|
| 1. Introduction | 4. Images of Central Asia and India |
| 2. Great Buddha images and their styles | (The art of the Kushans) |
| 3. Dates and builder of the images | 5. Outlines of the development of the art of Mahayana Buddhism |

Comments: This paper covers a vast number of subjects including some of the most important questions in the history of Buddhist art such as the date of the first Buddha image; the development of Mahayana Buddhist art; and the dating of the Great Buddhas at Bamiyan. The paper was written in 1927 before the publication of the report on the first comprehensive survey made by Hackin and Godard in 1928; the paper was based only on the account of A. Foucher's brief stay at Bamiyan. Therefore, the discussions on the above subjects were limited to the two Great Buddhas in the middle of Afghanistan. On this limited information, the author made many theoretical assumptions concerning the development of Buddhist art,

but his conclusion were un-supported by facts. For example, the dating of both images at Bamiyan was given as the second century A.D. because, as the author reasoned, only an immensely powerful political figure like King Kanishka, who patronized Buddhism, would have been able to construct on the scale of Bamiyan.

The creation of the first Buddha image was considered to postdate Mahayana Buddhism which appeared after the turn of the Christian era. The writer believes that construction at Bamiyan took place not long after the introduction of the first Buddha image. The writer assumed that the 35 meter Buddha represents Sakyamuni, as Hsüan-chuang described, and considered the 53 meter Buddha to be an image of Maitreya. Since the author credited the Kushans with the creation of the first Buddha image, the later development of Buddhist art in India was also considered the result of Kushan influence. He maintained the Kushan domain was the centre from which images of the Buddha had spread to India as well as to Central Asia—theories which have been outdated by subsequent finds.

Summary: From the report of A. Foucher basic data concerning the question of the source of Mahayana Buddhist art and the creation of the first Buddha was made available to the writer. The finds at Bamiyan provide many clues to the solution of the above problems. Considering the grand scale of the two Buddha images, which must have required the sponsorship of a powerful authority, and an active artistic tradition, as well as wealth, it may be assumed that the images were commissioned by the Kushans. During the reign of the Kushans, from the first to the third centuries, King Kanishka stands out as the leader who succeeded in solidifying the vast Kushan Empire. Since Kanishka is believed to have reigned during the second century, naturally the building of this large site at Bamiyan must date to his reign.

There is no doubt that the 35 meter Buddha image is a representation of Sakyamuni, as Hsüan-chuang stated. Concerning the 53 meter Buddha, the writer assumes it represents Maitreya, because the idea of Maitreya was an old one which appears in both Hinayana and Mahayana texts. As Fahsien recorded that a large image of Maitreya was in existence in the northern part of India three hundred years after the death of the Buddha, there must have been a tradition of erecting large images in this area.

The position of Bamiyan at the centre of cultural flow, must surely have been connected with the vast Kushan empire. Kapisa was the location of the Kushan capital and, as Bamiyan is situated in the vicinity of Kapisa, it may easily be imagined that the construction of the site was initiated by the Kushans. These large images are the most representative creations of the newly established art of Mahayana Buddhism which appeared after the turn of the Christian era. Also, it was during this time that the first image of the Buddha was created, since in many Mahayana texts, the construction

of Buddha images is clearly described.

Therefore, the new art of Mahayana Buddhism, with the first anthropomorphic representation of the Buddha, was created in the land of Kushans (Yüeh-chih). This school became the source of all Buddhist art which was disseminated throughout the Far East. The general belief that Buddhist art originated in India, and was transmitted through Central Asia to China, should be corrected. Mahayana Buddhist art was transmitted to the Far East from the land of Yüeh-chih through two routes: one from the land of the Yüeh-chih through Central Asia to China and the other, from the land of the Yüeh-chih, through India to China.

36. Yoshikawa, Itsuji: *Bāmian no hekiga* パーミアンの壁畫 (*Paintings of Bamiyan*). The first part, *Kokka* 國華, No. 607, June, 1941, pp. 177-184. The second part, *Kokka*, No. 609, Aug., 1941, pp. 239-245.

Contents: in four parts with no titles (may be summarized as follows).

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Introduction | 3. Paintings in the niche of 53 meter Buddha |
| 2. Paintings in the niche of 35 meter Buddha | 4. Conclusion |

Comments: This paper discusses the paintings which adorn the two niches of the colossal Buddhas as well as those found in the caves surrounding the niches. The discussion is almost the same as that given in his paper "*Art of Bamiyan*" (ref. pp. 260-265) which gives further elaboration. The present paper threw light and understanding on the interpretation of the paintings of Bamiyan which are difficult to categorize under a single artistic tradition. The process of the development of a hybrid art form influenced by many civilizations which met at these cross points, is well elucidated.

The civilizations which met and influenced the paintings of Bamiyan include the Mediterranean world, Mesopotamia, Iran, Central Asia and India. This paper is often quoted by later scholars, who indicate its major role in introducing these important paintings into the study of the history of Buddhist art.

Summary: (See summary of Yoshikawa Itsuji, "*Art of Bamiyan*", pp. 260-265 in which a more detailed discussion of the Bamiyan paintings was included.)

Through a stylistic examination of the paintings in the niches of the two colossal Buddhas, it was found that the paintings over the head of 35 meter Buddha revealed Sassanian influence while those over the 53 meter Buddha demonstrated a strong Indian style. The paintings on the side wall of the same (53 meter Buddha) niche, together with the Kakrak painting, exhibit the final stage of the assimilation of foreign elements into the unique art which was born at Bamiyan.

Buddhist activity at Bamiyan flourished for the longest period of time in north-western India. Even one hundred years after the visit of Hsüan-chuang, which took place in the early part of the seventh century, Hui-ch'ao recorded in 729 A.D. that Buddhism was still practised at Bamiyan. However, it is assumed that the Moslems reached Bamiyan shortly after Hui-ch'ao's visit. The end of the Buddhist period at Bamiyan must have come in the first half of the eighth century. The most vigorous time of activity took place, not at the end of the Buddhist period, but rather at the beginning when the two colossal images of the Buddha were hewn into the cliff, and the niches containing the images were lavishly ornamented. In other words, the paintings in both niches are contemporary with their respective colossal Buddha images.

The 35 meter Buddha was carved first, judging from the artistic style and the simple technique employed, and next the caves surrounding the Buddha were excavated. Cave D is a rare example from the early period, having been left untouched in the renovations of later days.

Secondly, a well-formed Buddha of 53 meter was constructed and the niche was painted, starting from the top. The paintings in the niche of the 53 meter Buddha are assumed to date from the fifth or sixth century, judging from the costumes of the figures which appear in the paintings.

With respect to the history of the development of Buddhist art in Afghanistan, the art of Bamiyan represents the second half, the first half coinciding with its development under the influence of the Graeco-Buddhist art. The art of Bamiyan was first effected by the Gupta and Sassanian traditions in which the original Greek tradition had been assimilated into a unique art which immediately became the model for the Buddhist art which flourished in Central Asia.

37. Yoshikawa, Itsuji: *Bāmian no Geijutsu* バーミアンの藝術 (*Art of Bamiyan*) in *Chūgoku oyobi Saiiki no Bijutsu* 中國及び西域の美術 (*Art of China and Central Asia*), Osaka, 1948, pp. 71-109 with illustration 1-13.

Contents: in six parts without titles (summarized as follows).

- | | |
|---|------------------------|
| 1. Historical background, general description of the site | 4. Decorative elements |
| 2. Two colossal Buddha images | 5. Paintings |
| 3. Caves | 6. Conclusion |

Comments: This paper is the first comprehensive article to introduce Bamiyan to the Japanese public. The discussion covers the historical background and presents a detailed examination of each important point, namely the colossal Buddha images, the caves and their decorative elements such as sculpture and painting. Since the author himself visited the site in 1939 together with Hackin and Carl who had previously made excavations and surveys at Bamiyan, the discussion deals in detail with these points from

first hand experience and in site observation. Considering that the date of publication was only three years after the end of the Second World War, when news on academic activities abroad were completely closed to Japanese scholars, the impact of the paper cannot be overemphasized. The number of articles dealing with Bamiyan in recent years is testimony to the excellent results of this paper.

Reflecting the nature of the location of Bamiyan, which once stood at the crossroads of civilization, the art which flourished there is a hybrid composed features borrowed from several different traditions—Gandhara, Sassanian Persia, Central Asia, Mesopotamia and the Mediterranean world. Elucidating these points succinctly, the author unfolds the panoramic background of the art of Bamiyan and states the importance of future research which he urges to be made from a broad point of view in order to grasp the currents of various artistic tradition. The unique mixture of different traditions at Bamiyan had a great impact on other Buddhist sites particularly those in Central Asia and China.

In addition to the discussion of Bamiyan, other sites are briefly introduced: the art found at Kakrak, a site located near Bamiyan; Fondukistan, which is 128 kilometers east of Bamiyan; and Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan, 130 kilometers north of Bamiyan.

The paper, a pioneer Japanese study of Bamiyan, has since been frequently quoted by many Japanese scholars engaged in research on Bamiyan.

Summary: Bamiyan, located in the middle of the Hindukush ranges, used to be situated at the crossroads of civilization. The roads from India through Bactria to China and the route from Mesopotamia and Persia all met at Bamiyan. Contact between East and West in ancient times reached its peak during the Kushan Period. Active artistic construction, encouraged by King Kanishka, seems to have been the indirect force behind the establishment of a Buddhist centre at Bamiyan. Although the Kushans were divided into small kingdoms after the invasion of the Sassanians, Buddhist activity seems to have continued up to the advance of the Moslems in the middle of the ninth century A.D. The Islamic period at Bamiyan lasted only until the invasion of Jinghis Khan in 1222 A.D. when the fortress of Shahr-i-Ghorghola was completely destroyed. The important historical role played by the Bamiyan Valley, ended when the trade route no longer passed that way.

The architectural and artistic remains are the only data which provide information on the history of the site. There is a lack of inscriptions or literary sources except the accounts left by such Chinese pilgrims as Hsüan-chuang and Hui-ch'ao.

The 53 meter Buddha is plastically executed. But, in comparison to Gandharan figures, it is more stylized and reminiscent of the modelling of form in Indian art. By contrast, the 35 meter Buddha is heavy and less

refined in execution and therefore should be regarded as earlier. The difference of the shape of the niches which contain the colossal figures also indicates a difference of date. However, it seems impossible to consider the 35 meter Buddha as early as the time of King Kanishka. In this respect, Foucher's dating of Bamiyan to "between Takht-i-Bahi's large Buddha image and the images of Lung-men in China" is worthy of further consideration.

In addition to these two colossal Buddhas, there are four seated Buddhas now in poor condition. These images are made of clay, like the images at Kakrak not far from Bamiyan, which has long fallen, while the colossal images are carved into the conglomerate rock face. These two techniques suggest different dates for these two groups of images.

There are many caves cut into the cliffs beside the niches of the two colossal images. Some of the caves contained pedestals on which Buddha images were placed, while the traces of stupas were found only in two caves, which seem to be a later date. Probably at the initial stage, stupas did not exist at Bamiyan.

The stupa was originally the focus of worship at Taxila or Hadda, and it functioned as a cosmic diagram which symbolized the mortal nature of Sakyamuni. At these sites, the main stupa was built in the centre of a stupa court. Many square niches were built along the four sides of the court facing the central stupa. These niches were often adorned with images, or sometimes, with smaller stupas. It seems that at Bamiyan a colossal Buddha image replaced the stupa as the focus of worship, and in place of the niches which surrounded the central stupa at Taxila and Hadda, caves were excavated at the foot of the colossal images.

It may be assumed that the concept of monumental sculpture came from the West, most probably from the Iranian traditions of Achaemenid and Sassanian periods. The introduction of monumentality in size in the conception of the Buddha image expresses the cosmic nature of Buddhahood. After the transitional period when both stupas and large images of the Buddha were used simultaneously as symbols of the cosmos, the latter gradually replaced the former, and eventually completely took over the focus of worship previously occupied by the stupa.

The caves at Bamiyan can be divided into several groups; it seems that each group represents an independent monastery with sanctuary, lecture hall, dining room and store rooms. The sanctuaries can be classified into several categories according to plan, such as round, octagonal or square, which were designed to support a dome or equivalent ceilings. These three architectural styles are derived from different traditions: dome from the Mediterranean world; octagonal plan from Syria; square plan with a dome from Iran; and square plan with lantern ceiling from Central Asia. At Bamiyan the octagonal was preferred to the round plan and there are masterworks of octagonal planning in Caves I and XI. At the same time there seems to

have been a close relationship between the lantern ceiling and the round plan with a domed ceiling—since if the first beam of the lantern ceiling is replaced by squinch arches, a round dome could easily be placed over it giving rise to the Iranian style of a square floor plan covered by a dome. There is no evidence of the Indian tradition among the caves.

The caves show many elements, architectural and decorative, combined according to the degree of acceptance of each element. In general, the caves around the 35 meter Buddha are simple and spacious, while those around the 53 meter Buddha are more complicated with arches, pillars and bands.

Examples of stupas are found in Caves G and J, where nirvana scenes are painted. The writer believes that these caves are much later than what Hackin regarded as the oldest among the caves, considering the style of the clay figures which are very different from the sculptures of Hadda and Taxila. Caves G and J are all decorated with painting and sculpture and other architectural ornaments, which were applied to the niches and caves in order to realize the ideal Buddhist pantheon on a three dimensional scale. The caves around the 35 meter Buddha are mostly decorated with paintings in the Sassanian style. Only in the octagonal cave of Group D did sculpture begin to appear in the cave. This tendency became more conspicuous in the shrine of Cave C group where Buddha images were placed in three large niches and twelve smaller niches. This tendency gradually accelerated in the caves carved around the 53 meter Buddha. Cave I, for example has an octagonal plan with two tambours just below the dome both divided into sixteen sections by arches, and each arch contained a Buddha image. Each of the seven side walls provided a niche for a seated Buddha image. Cave XI has an intricate dome articulated into octagonal and sexagonal shapes, in which Buddha images were placed as if to represent the complicated geometrical design popularly employed in the West Asia.

This architectural dome design developed an iconographical meaning on the ceiling of the octagonal cave at Kakrak, which may be called a mandala painting.

In the niche of the 35 meter Buddha there is a large composition with the Sun God in the middle and the representations of the Buddha and devotees on both sides. The costume of the god as well as those of the devotees looks Sassanian. The theme of the Sun God, led by a chariot drawn by four horses, is Greek in inspiration, but the style of painting is Iranian. This type of Sassanian painting is otherwise unknown, except at Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan, where a seated monarch is flanked by attendants. Although no Buddhist elements are found in the painting at Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan, many motifs seem to be similar to those found in the painting at Bamiyan.

The Iranian style painting was done in fresco in pigments of lime for

white, carbon for black, yellow ochre for yellow, red ochre for red and lapis lazuli for blue. The monumentality of the painting is enhanced by the even distribution of colours and outlines, which emphasize its flatness. The individualistic representation of Gandharan art is not seen: each type was conceptualized, arranged in a symmetrical order, and in a stereotyped pattern. This large composition, which adorns the niche over the 35 meter Buddha, is not the outgrowth of an artistic activity confined to the province of Bamiyan, but is derived from the great tradition of Sassanian art which can be compared to that of China, India or Gandhara. As for the dating of the painting, many questions still remain. From the results of a stylistic and architectural analysis of the 35 meter Buddha, it is generally understood that the 35 meter Buddha was erected first at Bamiyan. Although one assumes that some traces of Graeco-Buddhist influence would be present in the initial period at Bamiyan, the painting on the niche of the 35 meter Buddha completely lacks any such traces but shows instead purely Sassanian elements. This problem remains to be solved in future.

In the niche of the 53 meter Buddha, the painting is executed in Indian style. From the remaining fragments, which represent one fifth of the original area, one can observe slender and plastic figures, represented with shading and outlines. The two female musicians are particularly reminiscent of the Indian ivory carvings found at Begram, but they are much later in date and more stylized. A large canopy adorns the upper part of the niche, a tradition which already existed in the Achaemenid Period. Under the canopy, the seated Buddhas all clad in red robes with halos and mandala are arranged in the three bands and are very stylized. Most of the Buddha heads display the typical Hadda type.

One very uniquely bejewelled Buddha with many accessories and a Kushano-Sassanian-type crown may be identified. This type of Buddha seems to have been popular in Bamiyan and can also be seen in a sculpture from Fondukistan. Among the painted representations, the flying asparas are the best at Bamiyan, executed in unhesitating outlines and expressive movement with a brilliant contrast of pigments. The drawing of the figures is reminiscent of Gandharan sculpture but, in addition, there is a very Indian sensuality, and in the costumes some Sassanian elements appear.

These paintings were also executed in Fresco. First the underdrawing was made in reddish-brown pigment and then each colour was drawn with shading, and the final outlines were given in yellow ochre. The figures were painted in contrasting colours against a grey background so that the figures stand out clearly. These excellent paintings derive from the combination of two traditions: Gandharan sculpture and Indian painting as represented by Ajanta. The question is where the two traditions met and how they fused into a unique style. The characteristics of the art of Bamiyan include: the tendency toward abstraction; a geometric division of space;

and the absence of representations of scenes from the life of the Buddha. The refined paintings in the niche of the 53 meter Buddha influenced for a long time the art of Bamiyan, which became more stylized and mannerism, as in Caves H, E and i. In later years, the expression became very heavy and the paintings thick as those in cave groups A, B, C.

In the lecture hall of the Cave C group, sculptures representing torsos of Bodhisattvas were found which are very similar to clay figures found at Fondukistan, a Buddhist site located between Kabul and Bamiyan. The Fondukistan finds, which were discovered in 1937, show Indian and Sassanian influence, but almost no traces of the Gandharan style. As Fondukistan is dated to the latter half of the seventh century, the decoration of the interior of the lecture hall in Cave C group, and all the caves in Cave groups C and A, G and J may be considered contemporary to the Fondukistan objects and reflect the last phase of Bamiyan art.

The two colossal Buddhas and the decoration over the niches may be dated to the first half of the Bamiyan period and represent the classical Bamiyan style. Those caves in between the two colossal Buddhas are from a later period. Kakrak's date is to the beginning of latter half of the Bamiyan period, that is, to the fifth and sixth centuries. The paintings in the 53 meter Buddha niche also date to around the fifth century A.D. But the beginning of artistic activity at Bamiyan is still an open question.

There was no unified style at Bamiyan as there was at Hadda and Taxila where the Graeco-Buddhist tradition was a constant source of artistic inspiration. At Bamiyan, not only the Gandharan tradition but also Indian influence, and, greatest of all, western influence from the Mediterranean world and Iran, particularly Sassanian art, are present. It can be said that the art which flourished at Bamiyan is unique in that it reflects the artistic activities of the early-Mediaeval art of western Asia, as well as the particular ethnological characteristic of people who resided there.

38. Yamada, Chigyô: *Bâmian no Busseki* バーミアンの佛跡 (*Buddhist remains at Bamiyan*), *Mikkyô Bunka* 密教文化, No. 26, 1953, pp. 1-19, Figures 1-13.

Contents:

Introduction, The 35 meter Buddha: Wall paintings, Caves; G, A, B, B1, C, D, D1, E, K, J, H, I, The 53 meter Buddha: Caves; 11, 12, 15, Kakrak, Paitava, Sia Gerd, Fondukistan.

Comments: The writer expounds on the major features of Bamiyan: the two colossal Buddha images, and most of the important caves. He based his discussions on the reports published by DAFA, because he could not reach Bamiyan himself when he visited Afghanistan in 1938. In this relatively short paper the author offers many interesting analyses which led him to date the images and the paintings much later than Hackin. The

theory of connecting the founding of the site with the King Kanishka as suggested by Foucher and Ono (p. 258) was not acceptable to the writer.

Summary: Bamiyan may be regarded both as the westernmost point of Indian art and, at the same time, as the first place where Central Asian art can be found. From the records of Chinese pilgrims, it may be assumed that Buddhism in Bamiyan survived the invasion of the White Huns, which took place in the early fifth century A.D. About thirty years later, Hsüan-chuang visited Bamiyan in 632 A.D. While Moslems had appeared on the scene, Hui-ch'ao who passed through Bamiyan in 727 A.D. saw Buddhism still surviving.

Judging from the treatment of drapery, the 35 meter Buddha should be dated as intermediary between arcaic-Gandharan and Gupta styles, to around the fourth or fifth centuries A.D.

The painting in the niche of the 35 meter Buddha represents the Sun God, Surya, although Hackin tried to identify it as the Moon God. The concept of Surya, which originated among the Aryans, existed in both the Iranian and Indian traditions. The representation of Surya in an Indian style must have been employed by the Kushans at Mathura from where it was later disseminated to the Central Asian oases. Therefore, the identification of the Surya image at Bamiyan as Iranian in origin, is misleading. The figures of royal dignitaries represented at the side of the same niche were identified by Hackin as paintings in the Iranian tradition. However, the writer is inclined to consider that the paintings were executed by Iranian artists under Gupta influence, and to date them to around the sixth century A.D.

In the rock cut caves at Bamiyan, three different traditions, Indian, Iranian and Central Asian, can be observed. Cave G, which is the oldest cave at Bamiyan, reflects the Gandharan tradition in both sculpture and painting, the latter no longer extant in Gandhara itself. The plans of most of the cave groups are carved horizontally along the cliff. This type of plan, which may be defined as Central Asian in style, must have developed out of technical necessity unrelated to the pure Indian architectural tradition. Thus, the plans at Bamiyan are unique.

There are many paintings which reflect different traditions: in Cave E, the seated Buddha images on the lower ceiling show a provincial Gupta style of the sixth and the seventh centuries; in Cave K the numerous Buddha images encircling the central Maitreya image, as in a mandala, have no prototypes in Indian art; the central Maitreya image, with its crown ornaments of three crescents and moons and streaming ribbons, could be interpreted as the Iranian Mithra transformed into a Buddhist deity.

The 53 meter Buddha indicates the late-Gandharan style and may be dated to the fifth or sixth centuries, although Hackin dated it to the third century A.D. The paintings represented in the niche of the 53 meter Buddha are

from a much later period, that is, around the seventh century A.D. This date is based on the iconography of the Bodhisattva images flanked by ladies in waiting, which did not appear during the Gupta period. The representation of asparas, skillfully executed in flying poses, does not reveal either Gandharan or Gupta characteristics, but clearly indicates the Indian tradition by their dhoti and other accessories. Hackin's theory that these asparas are Gandharan, therefore, is not acceptable.

The paintings found at the Kakrak site, located south-east of the main Bamiyan site, represent a unique style which combines Gupta and Iranian representations and may be dated to around the seventh century. The representations of stupas are similar to those found at Kizil.

The art which developed at Bamiyan, therefore, may be identified as the combined style of the Indian and Iranian traditions. The Indian tradition can be further divided into the Gandharan and Gupta schools. The Iranian tradition comes from the Sassanian period. The Gandharan, Sassanian and Gupta traditions influenced each other and established a new school of Central Asian art. The Indian element, which was relatively neglected by Hackin, should be re-considered. The writer finds the Indian tradition even more influential than the Iranian in many examples found at Bamiyan.

The Buddhist sites of Paitava, Fondukistan and Sia Gerd show a style which combines late Gandharan and Gupta styles, and may date from the sixth or seventh centuries. These sites cannot be overlooked in considering the development of art at Bamiyan.

39. Yamazaki, Kazuo: *Saiiki hekiga no ganryô ni tsuite* 西域壁畫の顔料について (*A study of paints used in the painting of Central Asia*), *Bijutsu Kenkyû* 美術研究, No. 212, 1960, pp. 31-33 with a list

Comments: This short paper refers to the pigments used in the paintings at Bamiyan, and is based on the author's study and on a summary of works by other scholars.

It is emphasized that among eight sites chosen from eastern Mongolia to Ajanta, only Bamiyan and Kizil seem to employ similar pigments, such as lapis lazuli for blue, and silicic-acid copper for green. The only other site where lapis lazuli was used is Ajanta. This paper further contains interesting data concerning the distribution of pigments at various sites throughout Central Asia.

Only four of the eight sites were chosen here to indicate the varieties of pigments used at the different sites; and the similarity of the pigments used at Bamiyan and Kizil.

	Base	Red	Yellow	Blue	Green	White	Black
Bamiyan	plaster (gypsum)	red lead red ochre red ochre- carbon	yellow- ochre	lapis lazuli	silicic acid copper	plaster	carbon
Kizil	„	red lead red ochre	—	„	„	„	—
Bezeklik	plaster (gypsum) lime	red lead red ochre vermillion	yellow ochre		verdigris	„	—
Ajanta	plaster & lime	red ochre	yellow ochre	lapis lazuli	green earth	—	carbon

40. Yoshikawa, Itsuji: *Bāmian* バーミアン (*Bamiyan*), in *Afuganisutan Kodai Bijutsu* アフガニスタン古代美術 (*The ancient art of Afghanistan*), *Nihon Keizai Shimbun*, Tokyo, 1964, pp. 163–170, English translation: pp. 227–234, Figures: 39–43

Contents: no division made.

Comments: This paper was written for the book, *Ancient art of Afghanistan*, published on the occasion of the exhibition of the same title which was held in Japan during 1963. The writer visited Afghanistan in 1939 and made a survey together with Joseph Hackin, then head of the French Archaeological Delegation to Afghanistan (DAFA). This paper was based on research done by the writer himself, and on publications concerning the survey and excavation made by Hackin and two other French scholars, A. Godard, J. Carl: *Memoire de la Delegation Archéologique Française en Afghanistan*, Vol. II, “*Les antiquités bouddhique de Bamiyan*”, and Vol. III, “*Les nouvelles recherches archéologiques à Bamiyan*”.

This is the final of several articles which the author published on Bamiyan. The general history of Bamiyan in the light of cultural contacts, and the history of Buddhism, were discussed first; then a detailed discussion of the paintings in the two niches of the colossal images was presented from a primarily stylistic point of view. Interesting features of the surrounding rock-cut caves were pointed out, and the traditions of the various architectural forms of several cave plans were investigated. Finally, the relationship of the colossal images to the stupa was considered as evidence of a transition, related to the development of Buddhist thought. Originally, the centre of worship was a stupa, and then gradually the stupa came to be replaced with Buddha images, a transition which took place at such sites as Taxila and Hadda. This transition culminated in the worship of the colossal Buddha images at Bamiyan. Behind this change of worship there was a gradual development of the concept of the Buddha as a transcendental being. Along with these discussions of Bamiyan, other related sites, such as Kakrak and Fondukistan, were introduced. The writer feels there are

unique features characteristic of the art that flourished in Bamiyan proper, features which played a great role in evolving the basic form of Buddhist art which later spread throughout Central Asia and China. The art at Bamiyan was originally based on the Graeco-Roman tradition, but developed under the strong influence of the Sassanian art. Later, Indian Gupta art began to show its influence. Thus the colourful and versatile art that flourished at Bamiyan was gradually transformed into a more orientalized form—the same course of the development which may also be seen in Central Asia.

Summary: The artistic remains found at Bamiyan, Kakrak and Fondukistan belong to the second phase of Buddhist art which developed out of Graeco-Roman Buddhist art in Afghanistan. The centre of this artistic activity was Bamiyan, where Iranian and Indian influences were assimilated into a unique style.

Bamiyan is famous for two colossal Buddha images, numerous rock-cut caves hewn into the conglomerate cliffs, sculptures, and wall paintings. The site is located at an important junction of the ancient highway linking the northern and southern Kushan Empire, and it is possible to associate the spread of Buddhism in this area with King Kanishka. After the fall of the Kushans which was caused by the invasion of Shapur I in mid-third century, Bamiyan became one of the vassal states under Sassanian rule.

Buddhist art in Bamiyan was once threatened by the invading Hephthalites, but it seems that the invasion was repulsed with Sassanian support. The accounts of Hsüan-chuang on Bamiyan, written after his visit in 632 A.D., and of Hui-ch'ao, who went to Zābul from Kapisa in 727 and visited Bamiyan, vividly described the flourishing of Buddhism and its art in this region.

Two colossal Buddha images were hewn into a cliff and details such as drapery were modelled in stucco. Basically, these two images followed the Graeco-Roman style, but they also include some forms and techniques of the Gupta period. The 35 meter Buddha image shows an archaic form, awkwardly proportioned, which may be dated earlier than the 53 meter Buddha. By contrast the 53 meter Buddha is an imposing statue with a powerful effect.

The walls of the niches of the great Buddhas were once completely covered with paintings. The ceiling of the niche of the 35 meter Buddha was painted with a grand representation of the Sun God, reflecting predominantly Sassanian influence in the flat execution and the use of bright colours. Sassanian styled painting can also be found at Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan, situated north of Bamiyan, as well as in some of the earlier Bamiyan caves such as Groups A, B, and C, which surround the 35 meter Buddha.

The Sun God is represented in Iranian costume, riding in a quadriga against a great saw-toothed disk symbolizing the sun. This motif is Greek

in origin but often appears in the art of the Parthians. The Bamiyan example is much more stylized than its Parthian parallel, yet still retains some Graeco-Roman features.

The walls of the niche of the 53 meter Buddha, constructed in a trefoil shape, was originally completely covered with paintings of which only some fragments remain. As several Bodhisattvas can be identified, an attempted reconstruction of the painting was made by Hackin with a great figure of the Buddha seated in the centre, surrounded by Bodhisattvas and celestial musicians. The style of the painting of this niche is drastically different from that of the 35 meter Buddha. One finds the employment of subdued colours, shading to emphasize plasticity, and skillfully drawn outlines in the tradition of Graeco-Roman painting somewhat transformed, stylized and abstracted. The painting also has the sensuous character inherent in Indian art. Canopies with a band of checkered design were already in use during the Achaemenid period and also could be associated with those canopies represented in the Tun-huang caves in China and Golden Hall of the Horyu-ji Temple in Japan.

A characteristic of Bamiyan art is its emphasis on diagrammatic composition, realized in geometric designs and abstractions. Narrative elements, popularly used in the art of Gandhara, are diminished and replaced by an idealistic and transcendental expression. For example, the main figure, the Buddha, was given more independence and separation from the other flanking figures.

The distinctive character of the architecture of the Bamiyan caves is that all three types of sanctuaries, rotunda, octagon and square hall, are crowned with either a cupola or some kind of central roofing. The square cave temples have two types: one is the lantern type—a kind of roofing of wood construction from Central Asia in which beams are laid repeatedly across the corners of a square ceiling; the second type has arched squinches, derived from Iranian dome structures, which support the cupola.

At Bamiyan, the culmination of the worship of a transcendental Buddha was recognized and the Buddha image replaced the stupa as the focus of worship. The Buddha image in colossal size derived from the tradition of the Graeco-Roman world and Iran.

However, the trace of a stupa was detected in Cave G and Cave IV of Group J, both of which have paintings of Mahaparinirvana on the walls surrounding the stupa. Hackin considered Cave G to be the oldest example of rock cut sanctuaries at Bamiyan, and dated it to the third century. The writer prefers to ascribe this group to the seventh century, since the sculptures found in Cave G show more similarity to the local clay figures from Central Asia of later centuries.

The Sassanian influence, which was initially prevalent at Bamiyan, was later overshadowed by the influence of Indian Gupta art. The emergence

of the Mahaparinirvana scene, together with the stupa, must have taken place after the influence of Gupta art reached Bamiyan.

Indian influence is more strongly felt at Fondukistan where the Gandharan style is hardly discernible. The art of Fondukistan has a heavy, baroque character, not found even among the most advanced ornamental clay figures of Bamiyan. The art of Fondukistan, therefore may be defined as the latest phase of Buddhist art which flourished at Bamiyan.

41. Kashiwase, Seiichirô: *Bâmian 35 mētoru Daibutsu no Butsugan dai-kôzu no zuzô ni tsuite* バーミアン 35 m 大佛の佛龕大構圖の圖像について (*A study of iconography of the great composition decorating the Niche of the 35 meter Buddha at Bamiyan*) (Author's English title), *Nagoya Daigaku Bungakubu Kenkyûron-shû* 名古屋大學文學部研究論集 (*Nagoya University, Department of Literature Monograph XLII*), 1966, March, pp. 59-75 with 2 colour plates

Contents:

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Introduction | 5. Irano-Buddhist culture at Bamiyan |
| 2. Question of the identification of the deity | 6. Passages from <i>Avesta</i> on Mithra |
| 3. Hackin's theory: Moon God | 7. The deity is Mithra |
| 4. Yoshikawa-Rowland's theory: Sun God | |

Comments: This paper tackles the question of the identification of the deity represented in the centre of the painting in the niche of the 35 meter Buddha at Bamiyan. The material for this paper was collected during the survey conducted by the Nagoya University Team at Bamiyan from May to September, 1964.

The discussion begins with the theory proposed by J. Hackin, that the deity is Moon God. However, considering the iconographic development of Moon God in Iranian culture at that time, it seems that a clear image was always accompanied by a half moon in the composition.

Secondly, the question of the Sun God was considered. This theory was first proposed by I. Yoshikawa then enlarged by B. Rowland. The popularity of the anthropomorphic representations of Surya in many different cultural contexts, makes it possible to assume that the deity is the Sun God. However, the author's investigations revealed that there is definitely a half-moon shape behind the deity, which covers the lower half of the circle, which Yoshikawa has identified as the mantle of Surya. Moreover, he was able to identify a circle below each of the wind gods represented in the upper corners of the composition which he assumed to represent the sun and moon. The presence of the moon in the representation of Surya is previously unknown in Gandharan and Mathuran art.

According to the records of Chinese pilgrims who visited Bamiyan, such as Hsüan-chuang and Hui-ch'ao, the ruling class at Bamiyan seemed to

be of Iranian extract, and Iranian culture formed the basis of the tradition maintained by those who resided at Bamiyan. Although they embraced Buddhism, they must have been brought up in the tradition of Zoroastrianism. In the *Avesta*, the idea of a Sun God was not embodied in Surya but rather in Mithra, while in *Veda* Mitra, on the contrary, was not as popular as Surya.

The author selected various passages from the *Avesta* which describe Mithra as riding in a golden chariot drawn by four white horses and holding a sharp spear and a long arrow. Mithra is also described as a deity which runs before the rising sun; he is also associated with the moon. The author concludes that the deity represented in the niche of the 35 meter Buddha is, therefore, Mithra. Further, considering relationship of this Iranian deity to Buddhism at Bamiyan, he assumes that Mithra was represented here as an idealized image of the king. In spite of this new theory proposed by the author, who headed the Nagoya University Team, the reports of the Second survey team conducted by the same group, does not mention the theory and names the deity the Sun God, without explanation. (ref: *Bamiyan, the report of the survey in 1969*, Nagoya University, 1971, pp. 31-32; Maeda, Kôzaku:—*Some remarks on the wall painting of the 35 meter Buddha—Journal of Toyota Technical College*, Vol. 3, 1970, p. 98)

Summary: The discussion (in part (3).) of Hackin's theory that the deity is the Moon God, deals with evolution of the concept of the Moon God, in Iran from 4,000 B.C. to the Sassanian period. There seems to have been numerous variations. In the *Avesta*, the moon was not immediately anthropomorphized like Ahura Mazdah or Mithra. Rather, the moon was regarded mostly as the sphere representing the concept of natural phenomena, and later when various beliefs were introduced into Zoroastrianism each deity began to symbolize composite concepts. Hence it is difficult to conclude that the deity represented is indeed the Moon God even with the presence of a half moon behind the deity.

Concerning Yoshikawa and Rowland's proposal that the deity is the Sun God, the author does not oppose it. There is, however, a mistake in Yoshikawa's drawing of the central deity: he considered that the half of the circle behind the deity was a part of the mantle worn by the deity. The author could not positively identify the mantle: only a clear semi-circular line could be discerned. (Later, the author came to agree with Yoshikawa, HM.)

By comparing the composition of Surya, as seen in the Gandharan and Mathuran examples, to the present painting some common points, such as the emphasis on frontality, or the chariot drawn by four leaping horses, are to be found. In the examples from Gandhara and Mathura, there are no representations of the sun and moon, such as those which the author

identified below the Wind Gods in the upper corners of the composition. Moreover, two *kinnaras*, which appear in the middle of the painting, are without precedent.

It is well known that the ruling class of Bamiyan was of Iranian extract and therefore under the cultural influence of the Sassanian Empire; a fairly nationalistic policy was implemented in contrast to the cosmopolitan tendency which prevailed under the Parthians. In spite of the fact that those people at Bamiyan believed in Buddhism, their tradition was based on Iranian culture and religion. Under these conditions, it is possible that a deity from the *Avesta* pantheon could be thematically involved in the paintings at Bamiyan. Therefore Surya, the Sun God popular in the Vedic pantheon, was overshadowed by Mithra.

In order to portray Mithra, descriptive passages from the "*Hymn to Mithra*" from the *Avesta* were followed. According to these quotations, Mithra possessed supernatural power, could run fast in front of the sun and after the sunset guarded the whole world. He has a golden chariot drawn by four white horses, commands the winds of victory and creation of Ahura, and will send them to those who worship him. Here Mithra is associated with both the sun and the moon, and has a chariot and horses. All these elements can be seen in the painting, where the winds of victory are represented by two Wind Gods painted in the upper corners of the composition.

The "*Hymn to Mithra*" ends as follows:

"...we worship Mithra and Ahura—the two exalted owners of Truth that are removed from danger—, as well as the stars, the moon, and the sun. We worship Mithra, who in all countries is the head of the country". (Gershevitch, I: *The Avestan Hymn to Mithra*, Cambridge University Press)

As Mithra is closely associated with the sun and moon, it seems certain that Mithra must be the deity painted on the niche of the 35 meter Buddha.

This Iranian deity was further represented as an idealized image of the king. This image was prevalent among the rulers and powerful clans who resided at Bamiyan, and was closely connected to the Sassanian Empire. The Sassanian kings were always aware of the necessity of impressing the people with authoritative images of themselves. The image of Mithra reflects both Buddhism and the native religion of the Iranian people who created it.

42. Kashiwase, Seiichirô: *Bâmian N-dô Hakken Hôkoku* パーミアン N 堂發見報告 (*The report on a new discovery of Cave N at Bamiyan*), Nagoya Daigaku Bungakubu Kenkyûronshû 名古屋大學文學部研究論集 No. XLV, March 1967, pp. 93–113, English translation: pp. 115–120, Plates 1–7, Figures 1–24.

Contents:

1. Approach to Cave N
2. Cave N East Wall; the first group of wall painting
3. Cave N East Wall; the second group of painting
4. Cave N North Wall; Wall painting
5. Architectural characteristics of Cave N
6. Conclusion

Comments: The article is a report on the paintings found in Cave N of the newly discovered cave group "N", at Bamiyan. The discovery was made by the Nagoya University Scientific Mission, headed by the writer in July, 1964. The article discusses the three groups of paintings that remain on the east and north walls of Cave N. These paintings have been found to be unique among the Bamiyan paintings in that they are executed in line, make no use of shading techniques, are painted in a bright crimson colour otherwise unknown at Bamiyan, and use parallel lines to represent folds of the draperies. These peculiarities have their prototypes in the paintings found at such Central Asian sites as Bezeklik, Khotan, Sim-sim, etc., which supports the dating of the paintings to the sixth century A.D.

The article is accompanied by four fine colour plates of the paintings together with abundant figures, of which some explain the position of the paintings in terms of the size of the walls. Also many reference materials from various sites, from Calcutta in India to Bezeklik, Kumtura in Central Asia to Lung-men in China and the Kongobuji Temple in Japan, are provided.

Summary: During the survey conducted by the Nagoya University Scientific Mission from May to September, 1964, the Mission made a discovery on July 28 of a new cave group at Bamiyan which was named Cave group N. The Cave group N, named for Nagoya University, consists of caves numbered from N1 to N5 and Cave N. Many of the caves seem to have been left unfinished, and except for Cave N, no wall paintings were found in the other caves. The paintings were found on the north and east walls of Cave N. The paintings on the east wall were divided into Group I and Group II.

The paintings of Group I painted in a band above the representation of a group of figures, still show three seated Buddhas, which may be assumed to have been part of a thousand-Buddha composition. The Buddha images are painted in crimson red, an extremely unusual colour previously not found at. The treatment of the draperies of these three images indicates a similarity to the Gandharan style. However, while among Gandharan images there are only examples of the folds of the flowing from the left shoulder, in these Group I paintings there are examples of folds flowing from the right shoulder. In comparison to similar examples from Foladi and Bezeklik, the seated images of the Group I painting retain more of the

Classical Gandharan tradition. In the examples in Group II, the absence of a shading technique, popularly employed in the paintings in the niche of the 53 meter Buddha, was noticed. The linear expression strongly enhances the two-dimensional effect.

The Group I painting extant on the east wall represents a portion of a group of holy men which were painted above the seated main image of the Buddha. Four figures are still discernible. Judging from the position of the heads with respect to the halo, it may be assumed that these four figures were standing behind the main image. The writer is inclined to consider the painting as a primitive form of the representation of the Pure Land presided over by Amida Buddha. The hair of these holy men is, minutely drawn hair by hair, a technique unknown at Bamiyan. The closest example seems to be found among the finds from Khotan. Further, the border of the hair-line of the holy men takes the shape of a concentric circle, which is also rare among the Bamiyan paintings, while examples from Central Asia such as Kumtura, Kara Khoja and Bezeklik, indicate a certain similarity.

The painting on the north wall still reveals a seated Buddha image which takes up one third of the space of the north wall. This seated Buddha image could have been one of three similar images, which once occupied the whole space of the wall. The chignon of the Buddha is rather tall for its narrow width; a prototype may be found in the representation of "The Seven Mortal Buddhas" in Cave 17 at Ajanta. The treatment of the drapery of this Buddha image on the north wall is characterized by the free use of parallel lines. The tradition of these parallel lines probably originated in Gandharan painting which is no longer extant. Despite a certain degree of formalization these parallel lines still retain something of the naturalism of Gandharan art. Similar examples of parallel lines may be found in: 1) Central Asia at Sim-sim at Khotan; 2) China—a standing stone Buddha of the Northern Wei Period now in the collection of Okura Museum in Japan; and 3) Japan, a Buddha image in Kongobuji Temple at Mt. Koyasan.

The ceiling of Cave N has a lantern roof, represented without a three-dimensional effect. Four beams are laid diagonally across the corners of a square and the process, which is supposed to be repeated in successive tiers, in the present case is different: the second beams are not placed over the first tiers; the corners of the beams just touch the first tier. This peculiar beam construction might indicate the last phase of this popular form of ceiling, or it could be interpreted as an aesthetic preference.

The stylistic characteristics observed in the paintings of Cave N may be representative of the western-most examples of the styles of painting transmitted from India through China to Japan.

The date of Cave N may be placed in the sixth century, or, in other

words, contemporary with the beginning of the latter half of the phase of artistic activities which developed at Bamiyan from the sixth to the eighth centuries. The paintings of Cave N seem to be slightly later than those of the 53 meter Buddha niche, judging from the classic nature of the styles detected therein.

43. Kashiwase, Seiichirô: *Bâmian ni okeru sentaibutsu-teki sekai no tenkai* バーミアンにおける千體佛的世界の展開 (*The development of the World of the Thousand-Buddhas at Bamiyan*).

Part 1

Nagoya Daigaku Bungakubu Kenkyûron-shû 名古屋大學文學部研究論集 XLVIII, March, 1968, pp. 101-131, English Translation: pp. 133-143, plates 1-3, Figures 1-10.

Part 2

Nagoya Daigaku Bungakubu Nijû-shûnen Kinenron-shû, 名古屋大學文學部 20 周年記念論集, December, 1969, pp. 173-191, English Translation: pp. 193-198, Figures 1-8

Contents:

Part 1

Preface

- | | |
|--|-------------------------------|
| 1. Composition of the painting of
the 35 meter Buddha | 3. Multiplication of one self |
| 2. Fire and Water | 4. Time and existence |
| | 5. Apollo |

Part 2

- | | |
|---|---|
| 1. Koinè | 3. From "récit-memorandum" to
"récit vivant" |
| 2. The foot of the Hindukush
mountains | 4. The end of "récit" |

Comments: This is an article which discusses the questions of iconography and composition concerning the paintings in the niche of the 53 meter Buddha, with emphasis on philosophic and aesthetic points of view. The article pursues the origin of the underlying concepts which promoted the painting of rows of Buddha images, which has come to be interpreted as the "Thousand Buddhas". Philosophical considerations of the presence of the 35 meter Buddha image, as well as the thousand Buddha images, develops into questions of an ontological nature. In searching for the impetus behind the initiatives which resulted in the erection of the 53 meter Buddha, the writer first examines Iranian and Indian traditions, and then turns to consider the Greek tradition. Pointing out that architectural forms, as well as the treatment of human body, reveal a strong Greek influence, an analysis is made of the Graeco-Iranian and Parthian traditions, purported by Schlumberger to have been the source of tradition in the area. The writer concludes that influence, derived from the combination of Graeco-Iranian

traditions, made it possible to realize the representation of the Thousand Buddha images for the first time.

The emphasis was placed on the importance of the Greek influence at Bamiyan which the writer assumed to have been introduced by the Kidara Kushans, who inherited the Greek tradition from the Great Kushans of Bactria.

The discussion, subjective and philosophical in theme, and rather difficult to comprehend, offers an utterly different point of view regarding the iconographic interpretation of the paintings.

Summary: The 53 meter Buddha is identified by the writer as the Buddha in the scene of the "Miracle of Sravasti", since he observed the traces of flames over the shoulder of the Buddha. The two main themes of the scene, water and fire were considered in the light of the *Rigveda*, the *Upanisad* and then the *Divyāvadāna*. Representations of the scene from Benares, Ajanta and from Gandhara, were discussed as to whether or not they faithfully represented the scene as mentioned in the *Divyāvadāna* which stresses the multiplication of the Buddha. The Indian examples seem to be closer to the description given in the *Divyāvadāna*, while among the Gandharan examples, more emphasis was given to the architectural forms associated with the "Miracle". The trepezoid gable, found in the painting of the niche of the 53 meter Buddha, was considered to relate closely to these Gandharan representations of architecture. This trepezoid gable, the writer maintains, is of Greek origin and is found on Greek sarcophagi. Also, these gables are used to separate one image from another. The narrative nature of the scene of the "Miracle" is lost in this separation of images. In other words, the sense of time is eliminated and just the presence of image was stressed. In search of the Greek tradition, the paper written by Schlumberger, entitled, "*Descendants non méditerranées de l'art grec*," (particularly chapters I and II) was examined. Various theories, on Gandharan art such as the Graeco-Buddhist theory of Foucher, the Roman Buddhist theory of Sir Mortimer Wheeler, and Schlumberger's Irano-Buddhist theory are studied. Several characteristics of Parthian art, such as spirituality, hieratic order, linearism, and frontality are discussed. Although frontality in art is the most powerful enemy of the narrative and the depiction of a sense of time, the Greek element in Graeco-Iranian art is still strong enough to survive and assist in the development of a new trend of Buddhist art which resulted in the representation of the Thousand Buddha images.

44. Sadakata, Akira: *Bāmian no Bukkyō Iseki ni tsuite* パーミアンの佛教遺跡について (*On the Buddhist remains at Bamiyan*), *Tōkai Daigaku Kiyō Bungakubu* 東海大學紀要文學部, 1968, No. 11, pp. 51-70, Summary in French p. 50, Figure 1.

Contents:

Preface	Seated Buddhas
Records of Chinese pilgrims	53 meter Buddha
Legends on Bamiyan	Caves I, V, XI, XII
Surveys of Bamiyan	Nirvana Buddha
Bamiyan sites	Kakrak
Seven caves (near the 35 meter Buddha)	Deh-i-Ahangaran Caves I-VIII
Dating	Caves G, A, D, F, I, II, XI

Comments: In order to discuss the development of Buddhism at Bamiyan, the writer, in this paper, arranges all the records and information on Bamiyan from Chinese accounts, and Islamic sources to the first organized survey conducted by the French archaeologists. The major part of the discussion was devoted to the summary of the two records published by Hackin, Godard and Carl. In a relatively short space, the paper gives substantial information on Bamiyan, together with nine pages of detailed footnotes.

Summary: Hsüan-chuang recorded the presence of the Lokattara-vadin school and also his meeting with two monks of the Mahasangika school at Bamiyan. Both the Lokattara-vadin and Mahasangika schools belong to Hinayana Buddhism. The concept behind the founding of this gigantic site might be considered in relation to the *Aparimitāyus-sūtra*.

It is assumed that Bamiyan was already known in China during the fifth century A.D. In 615, an emissary was sent from Bamiyan to the Sui Court in China. In 632, Hsüan-chuang visited Bamiyan and described the grand scale of the site. There are interchanges of emissaries between Bamiyan and the Chinese T'ang Court during the early seventh century. When Hui-ch'ao visited the site in 727, he saw both Mahayana and Hinayana Buddhism being practised, and an Iranian king was reigning in Bamiyan.

The Islamic records show that they did not recognize the two colossal images as Buddhist sculptures. In the *Farhang-i-Jahangiri*, it is written that these two statues existed from the time of Noah. The Moslems considered the images as male and female statues.

The destruction of the face must have been taken place at an early stage in the Islamic invasions: in one theory the leg part was considered to have been damaged by Aurangzeb (1618-1707) on his way to Balkh in 1646; another theory is that Nadir Shah (1688-1747) caused the damage.

During the nineteenth century, many European travellers visited the site and some identified the site as a Buddhist centre. In 1922, the first organized survey was conducted by the French archaeologists of DAFA and their reports are still considered to be the authoritative records of the site.*

45. Sadakata, Akira: *Bāmian no Bukkyō* パーミアンの佛教 (*Buddhism*

* (See the summary of the activities of DAFA at Bamiyan (pp. 255-257)).

at Bamiyan), *Tôkai Daigaku Kiyô Bungakubu* 東海大學紀要文學部, 1969, No. 12, pp. 25-42, Summary in French pp. 43-44, Figures 1-8.

Contents:

Preface

Buddhism as observed by Hsüan-chuang (630 A.D.).

Buddhism as observed by Fa-hsien (400 A.D.)

Buddhism around 700 A.D.

Buddhism at the time of Sang-yun (520 A.D.)

Some problems

Tentative conclusion

Comments:*

This paper discusses the history of Buddhism as it developed in Bamiyan, on the basis of the discussion given in the writer's previous paper entitled "*On the Buddhist remains at Bamiyan*". Dividing the Buddhist period at Bamiyan in four divisions which coincide with the visits of four Chinese pilgrims, the writer endeavours to formulate an assumption on the nature of Buddhism during these periods according to the records left by the pilgrims.

According to Hsüan-chuang's records written on the basis of a five-day stay at Bamiyan in 632 A.D. the Buddhism practised in the area seems to have been the Lokattara-vadin school. Although he also mentioned that he met two monks of the Mahasangika school, the writer is inclined to think that only the Lokattara-vadin school existed at Bamiyan. This is because Lokattara-vadin developed from the Mahasangika school. The Buddhist manuscripts discovered in Cave G, which is considered to be the oldest cave, can be regarded as part of the *Abhidharma sutra*, which reflects the tenor of Buddhism at the time of Hsüan-chuang's visit to India. It was Hsüan-chuang himself, who translated the *Abhidharma sutra* into Chinese after his return to China from India in 645 A.D.

Fa-hsien never visited Bamiyan. He came to Nagarahara about the time the Kidara Kushans (412-437 A.D.) were just coming into power. It may be assumed that Buddhism at Bamiyan was modelled after that of Nagarahara. When Fa-hsien visited Nagarahara, Bamiyan was not important enough to attract pilgrims from China.

The name of Bamiyan was first known to China around the fifth century A.D. The carving of the Yun-kang and Lung-men caves was started during the Northern Wei Period (439-543 A.D.) possibly coincidental with the time when the presence of Bamiyan was reported to China.

Hui-ch'ao visited both Ghazni and Bamiyan in the early eighth century, and recorded that both Hinayana and Mahayana Buddhism were practised. This, however, could not be an active practice since the Moslems had already

* Although the main theme of the article is Buddhist thought, it gives an insight into the understanding of the nature of the unique art which developed at Bamiyan. Therefore the summary and the comments are combined.

In the art of Bamiyan, Sassanian, Byzantine and Gupta influences can be detected which later must have travelled to Kizil, Tun-huang, Yun-kang and Lung-men. It is rather difficult to find a literary reflection of the Buddhist sutras in the art of Bamiyan. However, the description of the Paradise found in Bamiyan reminds one of the Paradise scene in *Sukhāvativyūha sūtra*. The relationship between Buddhist thought and the founding of Bamiyan should be carefully examined in the future.

Contents :

- I. Structure of the caves: 1. Individual caves, 2. Conclusion
- II. Paintings:
 1. Wall paintings decorating the top of the niche of the 53 meter Buddha:
 2. Wall paintings decorating the top of the niche of the 35 meter Buddha:
 3. Cave A:
 4. Cave C:
 5. Front Chamber of Cave D:
 6. Cave E:
 7. Cave H:
 8. Cave I:
 9. Cave F:
 10. Cave N:
 11. Cave M:
 12. Cave East III:
 13. Cave S:
 14. Cave J:
 15. Conclusion

The aim of the survey was to conduct a close examination of the architecture and paintings at the site in order to collect basic data for consideration in reference to the significance and chronology of this important ancient Buddhist centre.

*** There are seven colour plates, 108 monochrome plates and 45 illustrations; among the plates are 14 line-drawings of paintings.

The survey covered not only the portion of the ruins which were surveyed by the French Mission in the 1930s but also previously uninvestigated caves. The report is divided into two parts: an architectural survey, and an examination of the paintings. After describing each of the buildings, caves and niches around the two colossal Buddha images, the caves were classified according to plan and ceiling types.

The paintings were also described in detail, particularly the new finds in Cave N, M, East III and S. An analysis of the motifs and style of the painting was made possible by the quantity of information collected by the survey. Among the interesting motifs discussed, are the Nirvana scene (Caves G, Fc, Jd, Jg and K3), the Bejewelled Buddha (35 m Buddha niche, Cave i), Paradise Scenes (Caves Fc, N, Jd) and the Sun and Moon Gods (Caves Jd, K3, and M). The K Caves were not surveyed although they contained paintings of Bodhisattvas on the dome part which could be Maitreya.

Some detailed discussions were not included in the present report but were published in a separate article, "*Painting and Architecture in Bamiyan*" (*Gakujutsu Geppô* 23, No. 11, Vol. 294, 1971, pp. 43-48). The report provides much detailed information collected through the use of such special equipment as ladder and rock climbing devices and powerful telephoto-lenses.

Part I: Structure of caves

All the caves previously surveyed by the French archaeologists were re-surveyed; these were Caves A-J, I-XV. In addition many unexplored caves (except for Cave K) were surveyed and numbered: L-Z, XVI; East I-VI; seven caves under the foot of the 35 m Buddha were numbered 35 I-VII.

The types of caves fall into two groups: one, caves clustered around a niche containing Buddha images, such as the 35 m Buddha, the 53 m Buddha and those in Caves H and i; caves of the other group have a chapel at their centre with one or more caves around it. Generally the latter type has one front chamber while the shape of the chapel and the number of cells show considerable variety. All the chapels and the other caves can be arranged systematically into four groups according to the types of plans and ceilings. The ground plans are: square, octagonal, round and rectangular, and can be sub-divided into eleven groups according to six types of ceilings: dome, lantern, flat, cross-vaulted, vaulted and special. For example, the square chapel type has three kinds of ceilings: dome, lantern and flat; while the octagonal type has domed, lantern and cross vaulted ceilings; and the round type: domed and flat ceilings. Within these subdivision, further classifications were made according to the treatment of the corners of the caves or other architectural differences such as squinches, arcades or beams. The ground plans are supplied for easy identification and the list cannot but impress one with the versatility of caves. In the report, it is mentioned that these multiple cave types at Bamiyan are the result of the free transformation of architectural prototypes which were originally employed

as models. There seems to have been an effort to create symbolic space within the caves.

Part II: Paintings

The purpose of the survey of the paintings was to collect information for further comparative studies of the arts of the different traditions of Syria, Rome, Persia, Gandhara, Indian Gupta, the Tarim Basin, and early Christianity.

Emphasis was placed on the correct identification of details which serve as the basic elements for stylistic analysis, in considerations of chronology, and in order to determine the uniqueness of the art which flourished at Bamiyan.

Each of the surveyed paintings is described in detail with the help of plates, illustrations and drawings. Among the new finds from Caves N, M, East III and S, were several important paintings which provide clues to the development of style and the dating of the site.

Many important themes and motives were identified such as nirvana scenes, the be-jewelled Buddha, crescent-shaped headdress, Sun and Moon Gods, Paradise scenes, all of which are very closely related to the development of Buddhist theology. For example, the most well preserved painting of the nirvana was found in the upper part of Cave Fc over the entrance. This painting, (29×96 cm) represents the Buddha lying on a couch surrounded by eight figures, and one seated Buddha image. One figure clad in a long dress, who is seated on a chair near the head of Buddha, has a halo and seems to be a woman, possibly Maya. Among the other figures, Upavana, Mahakasyapa, Mallas and Subhadra were identified. Since scenes from the life of the Buddha are not popular at Bamiyan, the presence of these themes in Caves G, Jd, Jg, K3 and Cave Fc, is particularly noteworthy. In his account Hsuan Chuang states that a large figure of the "Nirvana of the Buddha" existed at Bamiyan. The result of the excavations at Adzhina Tepe, in Soviet Tajikistan, brought to light a large image of the Buddha in a Nirvana scene. There must have been a definite reason for the popularity of this particular scene.

As a result of the survey, it became very clear that the reports of Foucher, (*Correspondence*, JA, 1923), many points in Hackin and Godard (*Les antiquités bouddhiques de Bamiyan*, 1928), and Hackin and Carl (*Nouvelles recherches archéologiques à Bamiyan*, 1933), must be corrected. Also it has become clear that many of these previous might not have been actually based on information collected at the sites.

47. Maeda, Kôsaku: *Some remarks on the wall painting of the 35 meter Buddha (On the Irano-Buddhist art of Bamiyan I)* (in English), *Journal of Toyota Technical College*, Vol. 3, 1970, pp. 97-106.

Contents:

1. The Great Composition

2. Iconographical problem

Comments: The author, a member of the Nagoya University Team which conducted the survey of the Bamiyan site in 1969, attempts to describe the wall paintings which decorate the niche of the 35 meter Buddha, and to bring up several iconographical questions. The descriptions of each theme and motif in the composition are very minute.

First, a figure which has been considered by some to represent the Sun God, was dealt with. The figure was carefully described from pose to costume and accessories. Two attendants with nimbuses and wings are associated with the figure found in Cave M. Four winged-horses, four birds or *hamsas*, two wind gods, and two half-human and half-bird creatures or *kinnaras* were described, including the quotations of Hackin, Foucher and A.C. Soper. It was noted that the style and the colouring of the painting are unique, and the author believes they represent a pure Sassanian style. The painting is compared to the painting on the ruined wall at Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan, which the author surveyed in 1964 as a member of the Nagoya University Team, and it is felt that these two paintings are very closely related.

In the second part, many iconographical questions were discussed. Several interpretations of the solar character of the central figure were introduced including those of Rowland, Snart, Soper, and Rosenfield. According to these scholars the God Surya of the Vedic world became very popular during the middle of the third century A.D. when it was influenced by the religious trend in both the Romano-Syrian and Romano-Parthian worlds; then under Iranian influence, an Irano-Buddhist image was evolved. By systematically listing various examples of Surya figures, the iconographical evolution was examined. The author felt that the great composition of the niche of the 35 meter Buddha was painted under the strong Sassanian influence.

The image in the wall painting in the niche of the 53 meter Buddha seems to have been a symbol of the cosmos, or universal sovereignty. But, the author feels that some similar motifs are found in both paintings which might hold a clue to their dating.

The paper, short but very informative, raises many questions regarding the dating and iconography of the paintings.

*Summary:*1. *The Great Composition*

The composition is described in great detail. The identification of the central image, while not positive, was assumed to represent the God Surya since it is possible that Mithra may be regarded as the symbol of the Buddha's solar character. The pose of the figure, which stands in a slightly twisted attitude, is associated with an unfinished relief discovered at Surkh Kotal. Some new details were identified: two round

white headdresses on the head of the figure, similar to those found on the head of the "bejewelled Buddha" painted on the east side under the vault of the niche of the 35 meter Buddha. The figure wears one of two types of Indo-Scythian costumes: a long tunic which has a round neckline. The other type of long tunic with a lappet, found mainly in the examples from Dura Europos, Hatra, Gandhara and Mathura, were also found at Bamiyan. A comparison was made between the two attendants with nimbuses and the wind gods, with those found in the representation of Surya at Mathura, Bodh Gaya and Khair Khana. The Bamiyan example seems to be remarkably foreign and finds its prototype in Cave M. On both sides of the lower part of the round disc, a half-human and half-bird creature was found. These figures were first identified by Foucher as *kinnara*. Then, Soper said the *Kinnaras*, which originated in Indian myths, and the two wind gods, represent the four corners of the universe and the zodiac ceiling at Palmyra.

The painting is executed in pure Sassanian style, similar to the wall painting at Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan and to the very small painting fragment brought by Sir Aurel Stein from Sistan. It is also mentioned that a similar example was found on the ceiling of the anteroom of Group D.

2. *Iconographical problem*

The major figure of the painting has been interpreted as a symbol of the solar character of the Buddha represented in the guise of Surya. Several theories by Rowland and Bussagli and other scholars regarding the nature of solar character, were introduced along with the author's comments. The iconographic significance of the image and its transformation were traced from Bodh Gaya to Kandhagiri in Orissa, Abarchinar in Swat up to Tun-huang in China. This wide dissemination is explained by the presence of active trade which connected north-west India and the Roman East.

All the examples of Surya found so far at various sites from India to China, were listed in two parts, sculpture and painting, with respective provinces. This list offers information concerning the iconographic evolution of Surya. It is clear that plastic representation precedes the pictorial one, and the Khair Khana example is the latest among the sculptural examples. As for the paintings, better representations can be found among the Central Asian examples. The question of why such an important painting at Bamiyan retains such strong Sassanian influence, could be answered by the presence of a Bamiyan school. The central figure and the attendants are emblems of the cosmos and reflect social functions. The political-religious significance of the hieratic representation should not be ignored, as the painting could be the representation

of a divine king or of the principle of universal sovereignty.

There must have been a tendency to transform religious doctrine into a more idealistic and transcendental form. The iconographic problems remain to be discussed and the present paper only deals with a part of them. The possibility of dating the painting was afforded by a comparative study of two groups of donor representations in the niche of the 35 meter Buddha, and the painting in Cave M, together with the painting presently under discussion.

48. Koderä, Takehisa: *Bāmian no Sekkutsu-jiin ni kansuru shomondai* バーミアンの石窟寺院に関する諸問題 (*Some remarks on the question on the cave temples at Bamiyan*), *Kenchiku Zasshi* 建築雑誌, No. 12, Shōwa 46, January, (1971), pp. 16-19 with illustration.

Contents:

Introduction; Structural forms of the caves; Octagonal plan; Buddha images and stupa.

Comments: This paper written by a member of the 1969 Nagoya University Survey Team discusses four points of architectural interest at Bamiyan given short, but succinct and informative, descriptions concerning:

- 1) The architectural function of various elements in the caves
- 2) The transition of functional elements into decorative parts, as seen in the treatment of the lantern ceiling.
- 3) The necessity of considering the Central Asia and Sassanian traditions in discussing the ceiling of the caves.
- 4) The question of the presence of the stupa in an otherwise image-dominated site where the colossal Buddhas were worshiped.

Summary:

- 1) The architectural interpretation of the Bamiyan caves is a difficult task since there are numerous examples of functionless elements. This is due to the fact that in copying architectural models in the construction of the caves, the support architectural function was lost and a new style developed independent of the original function.
- 2) After losing their architectural function, these architectural elements became purely decorative. In Cave V near the 35 meter Buddha, for example the original plan is octagonal but it becomes 16 sided near the ceiling and then completely round, as if to support a dome, but instead it has a lantern ceiling.
- 3) The cross-vaulted ceiling in the Cave II (35 meter Buddha) seems to indicate the presence of a nomadic tradition behind the construction of the caves at Bamiyan. The lantern ceiling is considered to have originated in the Central Asia. The gradual transition from lantern to domed ceiling at Bamiyan led to the development of a unique cave style. In order to support a round dome over a square chamber, many

- devices were used to reduce the corners. Among them are the
- i) squinch arches which were introduced from the Sassanian tradition.
 - ii) the combination of a round chamber and a domed ceiling, a feature from the Mediterranean world introduced through Central Asia.
 - iii) an octagonal plan in which the sides increase to 16 near the ceiling, finally becoming completely round to accommodate a dome. The double row of arcades decorated with arches is perhaps associated with stupa decoration, a tradition which might have come from India or Gandhara.
- 4) There are two examples of stupas found in Caves G and J. Moreover it is possible that stupas were originally placed in Caves A and B. In spite of the predominance of image worship in Bamiyan, small stupas were present at one time. The ruins of a large stupa located east of the 35 meter Buddha needs to be excavated in the future in order to solve many questions. Further studies are necessary for the understanding of the nature of the artistic sense prevailing at this site which once stood at the crossroads of civilization.

49. Itô, Michio and Ôno, Takatsugu: *Bāmian no Sekkutsu-jiin* パーミアンの石窟寺院 (*Cave temples at Bamiyan*), *Kenchiku Zasshi* 建築雑誌, Shōwa 46, January, (1971), pp. 12-15 with illustration.

Contents:

Introduction	Caves M and N
Niches of 35 m and 53 m Buddhas	Caves P, Q, R
Caves XI to XVI	Caves T to Y
Caves A to D	East Caves 1 to 6
Caves H, I, J	

Comments: It is a short but very informative paper concerning the general architectural features of the main cave groups at Bamiyan and the two niches which contain the colossal Buddha images.

After discussing the historical position of Bamiyan as one of the sites on the crossroads of civilizations, the geographical location of Bamiyan was established in relation to the nearby sites of Fōladi and Kakrak.

The features of each group of caves were given according to types of ceiling, shapes of the chamber, and whether or not there are front chambers or attached facades. From a comparison of the cave groups below to two colossal Buddhas, it can be seen that in the caves around the 35 m Buddha importance is placed on the lantern ceiling, while the domed ceiling is found in heavily decorated caves. These differences are explained by the fact that these two groups were constructed at different times.

Five groups of caves near the 35 meter Buddha, (A-D, E-G, M & N, P-Q, T-Y), one near the 53 meter Buddha (XI-XVI), one group between the two colossal Buddhas (H-I-J), and one at the eastern-most end of the

site East Caves 1-6, were discussed separately in order to show the varieties of types and styles. These require future examination to learn their exact form and respective functions.

Summary: There are tunnel-like passages around the head of the 53 meter and 35 meter Buddha images. From these passages there must have been platforms which held seats for the noblemen and musicians during religious ceremonies. There were platforms on both sides of the 35 meter Buddha; from the passages around the head of the 53 meter Buddha, numerous holes were carved in the walls of the niche for the beams which supported the platforms. At the feet of the two Buddhas are groups of caves cut in different shapes. Their ceilings, in particular, show many varieties of the lantern ceiling (35 meter Buddha) and squinched arches (35 meter Buddha) or domes on two bands of arcades decorated with arches. The last example is found in Cave XI which has an octagonal plan and each of the side walls have niches to contain Buddha images. Cave XIII has a flat ceiling but some traces of the dome which was originally planned for the cave remain. Cave XVI was discovered during the recent survey (Nagoya University Team 1969). The cave is larger than Cave XV but in better condition. Caves A to D are carved into walls near the 35 meter Buddha. The Cave A group has two sets of chambers in different elevations; at the lower level, the central cave has squinches and a dome while at the upper level, the chamber has an octagonal plan and a lantern ceiling. Cave B is cross vaulted, but the centre is a small lantern ceiling and the four corners are small domes. Cave C is a unique cave with a round plan and a domed ceiling. Cave D has an octagonal plan with a cross vaulted ceiling. In Cave E, there is a seated Buddha image eight meter high and a passage around the image for circumambulation. To the west of this cave is a rectangular hall with a pedestal on the east side wall. The central cave of Group F has an octagonal plan and a domed ceiling with decorative bands between the side walls and the dome. This type can only be seen in Cave I, II and XI near the 53 meter Buddha, and is not found near the 35 meter Buddha. Cave G has squinches carved into the dome. This is very rare at Bamiyan, as all the other domes are carved above the squinches.

Many variations of the lantern ceiling were recorded. Completely flat representations were found in Caves H and N, and a representation of beams as if they were woven is found in Cave O.

A new access was found to reach Caves P, Q and R. The central cave of the Cave R group has an octagonal plan and a lantern ceiling, like Caves A and I.

Caves T to V are located on east side of the 35 meter Buddha. Because there is the ruins of a stupa nearby, it is assumed that caves were carved in the most important religious area. East of the above group are six cave groups which reveal an interesting combination of architectural

elements and the remains of paintings.

50. Kôdera, Takehisa: Maeda, Kôroku: and Miyaji, Akira: *Bâmian no kaiga to kenchiku—Iran Bukkyô bijutsu gakujutsu-chôsa* バーミアンの繪畫と建築—イラン佛教美術學術調査 (*Paintings and Architecture of Bamiyan—Scientific survey of Iranian Buddhist art*), *Gakujutsu Geppô* 學術月報, Vol. 23, No. 11 (or Vol. 295, Feb., 1971), pp. 710–715, Figures 1–5.

Contents:

Introduction

1. Paintings

- | | |
|--------------------------|------------------|
| 1) 35 meter Buddha niche | 5) Cave N |
| 2) 53 meter Buddha niche | 6) Cave M |
| 3) Cave F | 7) Cave East III |
| 4) Cave i corridor | |

2. Architecture

- 1) Niches of 35 meter Buddha and 53 meter Buddha
- 2) Group of rock-cut caves

Comments: This article is the preliminary report of the survey conducted by the Nagoya University Scientific Mission to Bamiyan in the year 1969. The article summarizes very succinctly but in full detail all the important points of interest noted during the survey. It gives ample information of the scope and the result of the survey. The newly discovered materials and their analyses will enable future studies on Bamiyan to reach a dimension hitherto unreached in depth and scope.

Since the information of the more detailed official report is available (pp. 280–282), the summary of the present article will be kept simply as an outline.

Summary: The aim of the survey was to collect new basic data on the paintings and architectures at Bamiyan. The Mission made a survey of most of the caves on the southern cliff of the site. However, the overall photographing of the paintings and the measurement of the paintings in the niche of the 53 meter Buddha were left unfinished. Most of the rock-cut caves whose structural forms were important were surveyed.

Paintings

1. *The 35 meter Buddha niche*

- 1) Iranian style ribbons are flying symmetrically from the shoulders of the Sun God.
- 2) The spear held in the right hand of the Sun God has a striped design.
- 3) The right attendant holds an arrow and a bow.
- 4) The left attendant has the same shield that is found in Gandharan sculpture.

2. *The 53 meter Buddha niche*

- 1) Some of the figures painted on the east side of the niche are not

asparas as were previously thought, but are found to be the representation of pilgrims wearing a kind of leggings and holding a leather bag, both bearing leopard-skin design.

- 2) A figure wearing a Sassanian-style crown was found near the right shoulder of the colossal Buddha.

3. *Cave F*

- 1) This cave is ornamented mostly by paintings, in contrast to Cave I and XI where the major ornamentation was sculptural. A very small unique sculpture executed in a realistic manner was found.
- 2) On the south wall there was a nirvana scene, the best preserved among the nirvana scenes found in Bamiyan. On the east wall, the first example of a halo framed with flame motif in Bamiyan was found. On the ceiling, near the entrance there was a representation of Buddhas or Bodhisattvas arranged radially from the central Buddha image. This cave is an important cave having many syncretic elements.

4. *Cave i corridor*

- 1) The 16 Buddha images painted on the side wall of the corridor are notable for their flat treatment of draperies and complicated folds represented by black lines.

5. *Cave N*

- 1) The paintings found in this cave are the highest quality among the Bamiyan painting. On the west wall four figures of holy men were represented by excellent brush strokes.

6. *Cave M*

- 1) The fragments of painting left on the walls of the cave represent interesting details of costume and accessories.
- 2) An attendant figure wears a Greek helmet and long boots.
- 3) In the two medallions, representations probably of the Sun and Moon Gods, respectively, were found.
- 4) On the south and north walls, representations of Buddhas, Bodhisattvas and devotees with costumes interesting from the iconographic level, were found.
- 5) The ceiling used to be covered with a painting of the thousands of Buddha images, painted by a free hand, rather than by the use of patterns.

7. *East Cave III*

- 1) Fragments of some figures on the west wall wear interesting accessories.

In conclusion, the above new finds enable us to make a comparative analysis of the paintings at Bamiyan. Many more questions are to be examined in the future such as the Parānirvāṇa scene, "bejewelled Buddha" images, crescent-style hair ornaments, Maitreya images, Sun and Moon Gods, and the question of the scene of the "Pure Land". An analytical study of these features will lead us one day to the understanding of the true nature

of the art that flourished in Bamiyan.

Architecture

1. *Niches of 35 meter and 53 meter Buddhas.*

- 1) Alcoves must have been built like terraces around the heads of the Buddhas.
- 2) The caves cut around the feet of Buddhas have various forms of plans which are related to the rock-cut caves of A and D groups.
- 3) The origin of the cross vaulted ceiling has a certain similarity to Byzantine architecture, but a more immediate prototype which must have been the source of the present form seen at Bamiyan should be sought.
- 4) The process of turning free-standing architectures into the rock-cut architectures must have been a complicated one. In rock cut caves, the sculptural nature had more potential for development, independent of the consideration of pure architectural elements.

In general, Central Asian and Sassanian elements could be detected among the caves carved near the 35 meter Buddha while more Gandharan and Central Asian elements were found in the caves near the 53 meter Buddha.

2. *Rock-cut caves*

Generally, the rock-cut caves at Bamiyan lack a strict geometrical sense, a feature which might be attributed to indifference rather than to technical incapability. The octagonal plan, numerous found at Bamiyan may be considered alongside prototypes in the Mediterranean region as well as in Central Asia. A very good example of the lantern ceiling was found near the entrance to the corridor around the 53 meter Buddha. In Caves J and G, it was possible to detect the trace of a stupa.

51. Koderu, Takehisa: *Bāmian no Sekkutsu-jiin to sekkutsu no kūkan keitai ni kansuru kōsatsu* バーミアンの石窟寺院と石窟の空間形態に関する考察 (*The cave temples of Bamiyan and some remarks on the treatment of space in the caves*), *Kenchikushi Kenkyū* 建築史研究, No. 38, 1971, December, pp. 1-26, Figure 1-56.

Contents:

Introduction

1. Cave temples at Bamiyan

- a) Distribution of caves b) Style: 1) Square plan, 2) Octagonal plan, 3) Round plan, 4) Rectangular plan c) Facade d) Decoration e) Chronology

2. Question on cave temples in general

- a) Characteristics of caves b) Dissemination of cave temples c) Significance of the cave temples at Bamiyan

Conclusion

Comments: This paper further elaborates the discussion the writer made in "*Some remarks on the question on the cave temples at Bamiyan*" (pp. 285-286). In the present paper, the writer developed the previous paper into a comparative study of cave temples in general.

In the previous discussin, cave structure was studied from the point of the form of the ceilings (dome, lantern or cross vaulted) and plans. It was noted that among the various plans of the caves, (square, round, octagonal and rectangular), the octagonal plan was frequently used for the main cave of a group. On the other hand, the octagonal plan is scarcely found at Taxila or at other sites in India, Central Asia, and China. It was assumed that the octagonal plan, a development of a round plan came from the Mediterranean world. Concerning the stupa at Bamiyan, the writer maintained that in spite of the importance placed on Buddha images as the focus of worship, the juxtaposed position of the stupa at Bamiyan was not an inconsistency.

In the first half of the present paper, the arrangement of the caves, structural forms, facades, decoration and lastly the question of chronological development of the caves, were discussed in detail. These discussions were made in order to arrange all the information collected in 1969 by the survey of the Nagoya University Team which was led by the writer. The origin of different structural forms was discussed in order to trace the source of respective elements and to follow their architectural development.

The discussion in the second part was used as basic data for the consideration of the significance of the Bamiyan caves in light of the architectural history of the cave temple. In the construction of cave temples, architectural techniques were not required, and, therefore, the significance of architectural vocabulary is lost. Hence unlimited by function, the free development of many architectural elements was possible. Space became important and was used to represent the metaphysical ideal of the universe.

The architectural characteristics of each cave temple site in Afghanistan, such as of Fil-Khana, Hazar Sum, Haibak, and Kucha, Bezeklik and Tunhuang on the Central Asian route, were reviewed. As a result, it was decided that the caves usually reveal architectural features already predominant in each respective area, rather than those introduced from other cultural spheres. Within these given forms, cave temples gradually developed in order to realize the concept of the universe within the space created by the cave.

The main feature of Bamiyan is that various influences met there and went through numerous stages before the ideal form of "the universe" was created within a given space. The writer tries to analyze not only the development of architectural form but also the religious ideal which resulted in the creation of a universe in the caves.

The second part of the paper, as mentioned in the writer's conclusion

still remains hypothetical, but at least it enables the reader to consider the historical role of Bamiyan as the centre of the architectural development of the cave temple from India to China through Central Asia.

Summary: The art and architecture of Bamiyan is very unique. While the caves hewn into the cliffs of Bamiyan indicate numerous variations, they can be roughly divided into two types; one is represented by the cave groups carved around the two enormous niches which contain the colossal Buddhas; the other is represented by independent cave groups which either centre around sanctuaries or have no particular central halls. Hackin tried to categorize the caves into three parts; sanctuary, assembly hall, and cell. Hackin's criterion for defining a sanctuary was the presence of a niche which contain a Buddha image. The writer, however, was inclined to consider that the niche was created according to the transition of the form of worship from stupa to image and therefore Hackin's criterion remains vague.

The differences in the forms of the caves were listed according to the structure of plan and ceiling, and the distribution of each characteristic was examined in four sections A to D as follows: A includes caves around the 53 meter Buddha most of which have a rectangular plan; B includes caves carved in the middle section between the two colossal Buddhas, and are mostly small rectangular caves; C includes cave groups around the 35 meter Buddha which are characterized by various forms of plan and ceiling. D includes all the caves east of Cave F where different forms are mixed.

The various combination of square, octagonal, round and rectangular plans with different types of ceilings such as dome, lantern, flat and cross vaulted ceiling, were examined. The squinch arches which supported domes in sections C and D were regarded as of Sassanian origin. The octagonal plan was found in all categories except B, in combination with different types of ceilings; octagonal plan with dome in category A, with lantern ceiling in category C, and with cross-vaulted ceilings in category C and D. It was noted that in Kakrak, Foladi and Haibak, no octagonal plan was found. The octagonal plan is considered to be of Mediterranean origin, as Yoshikawa suggested. The round plan was only found in category C and could be associated with Byzantine structures of round plan with a dome ceiling.

In general, the cave groups can be divided into two main types by ceiling: the central cave is either domed or lanterned. Among each category there are two types: one has these characteristic ceilings as a part of their architectural expression; and the other, which, may show unique developments of these elements, observed only in cave structures and not in free-standing architecture.

Hackin dated both Buddha images to the third century A.D. and the caves from between the third and seventh centuries. Rowland dated the 35 meter Buddha to from the second to the third centuries and the 53 meter

Buddha two hundred years later. The development proposed by Yoshikawa was from caves specifically designed to support a ceiling to a rectangular form. The writer considers this to be true to certain extent but not absolutely.

The writer unfolds his examination on the transition of architectural forms with a hypothesis that the 35 meter Buddha is earlier than the 53 meter Buddha as follows: 1) the square plan with squinch arches was introduced prior to the carving of the 35 meter Buddha but was not employed in the caves around the 53 meter Buddha. The traces of stupas in this type of caves together with the absence of niches in the side walls might indicate the nature of worship; 2) the square plan with a lantern ceiling was carved in the early period and continued throughout the whole Bamiyan period; some of these show heavy decorations; 3) octagonal plans with lantern ceilings were seen in the centre caves among the cave groups near the 35 meter Buddha, but almost completely disappeared in the later years; 4) the octagonal plan with a domed ceiling must have been developed after the 35 meter Buddha was carved, and reached a peak of development when the 53 meter Buddha was carved. This type has much to do with the decorative trend prevailing at Bamiyan.

These four transitional stages can also be viewed from the fact that the focus of worship changed from the stupa to images of the Buddha. The stupa, which used to occupy the centre of the cave, gave way to images which were placed in the niches of the side walls of the caves, leaving the centre part for the use of worshippers. In other words, men started to create an ideal space in order to realize the ideal form of the universe. Architectural space was then transformed into metaphysical space.

The dates of the introduction of different architectural elements were discussed. The squinch arch was traced to Sassanian stone architecture, which was already imitated in brick at Bamiyan during the time of the carving of the 35 meter Buddha. The date of the introduction of the octagonal plan with a domed ceiling is not exactly known; its origin may perhaps be traced to the Mediterranean world and/or to northern Iran, but it is assumed to postdate the introduction of the octagonal plan with lantern ceilings or squinch arches. The lantern ceiling, which is a primitive type of dome ceiling is thought to have originated in Iran or the Pamir plateau. The lantern ceiling was used in the main caves around the 35 meter Buddha while the domed ceiling was used in the major caves around the 53 meter Buddha.

The development of forms independent of architectural function which is only possible in the rock-cave structures, resulted in the increase of decorative elements in the caves. This can be seen in Caves I and XI at the foot of the 53 meter Buddha. In Cave XI, the side walls and dome were covered with decorative motifs and images of Buddhas. The dome was

covered with a mandala-like geometrical form, which created a fantastic space, completely devoid of any architectural function.

Looking back on the history of cave temples in India, the origin of the chaitya hall can be traced to similar wooden structures. However, it is important to consider that there is also an influence of cave structure on wooden structures, particularly in the decorative aspect of the caves. The independent development of structural forms of the cave temples is based on the fact that architectural function is not considered. The function of side walls and the ceiling, freed from load bearing, enabled the creation of a fantastic metaphysical world within the caves, and provided endless possibilities for decorating the space within the caves which became very popular in Bamiyan and Central Asia in general.

The cave temple which originated in India changed in nature according to different types of Buddhist worship as well as according to region. P. Brown pointed out that the reason for the popularity of the cave temple in India was the durability of the long tradition of ascetic life in undisturbed places far from human habitation. Considering the severe climatic environment in Central Asia and also the nature of oases towns, hermit life itself was difficult. Also the type of Buddhism practised at the time when Hsüan-chuang visited Bamiyan is described as consisting of huge assemblies which indicates that a great number of the cave temples were made by monks rather than by architects, for architectural knowledge was not really required. Nevertheless, the idea of the universe of the pantheon of the Buddhist world was closely associated with the space created within the caves. The idea of cave temples travelled from India, to Afghanistan and throughout Central Asia. It has been noted that the Indian vihara type cave was found only in Jalalabad at Fil Khana; but no other Indian cave type was found in Bamiyan or north of the Hindukush ranges. At Haibak Cave I, ornamented with a lotus flower motif, is a good example of the creation of symbolic space independent of architectural function.

At Kizil in the Kucha region, there are examples of caves with a square plan and a lantern ceiling, and also with a rectangular plan and a tunnel-like vault which has a niche containing a Buddha image. At both sides of the niche, a tunnel is carved which enables one to circumambulate, like the stupa at Cave 6 of Haibak. The Kizil example, which has a pedestal in the centre of the inner cave, is considered to have been influenced by Chinese wooden architecture as observed at Tun-huang and not by the stupa which was only seen in the early period at Bamiyan.

At Bezeklik near Turfan, some examples of painted lantern ceilings are dated to the sixth or seventh century A.D. by their similarity to a type of cave at Tun-huang (No. 254). Architecturally the Bezeklik cave shows western influence in spite of the Chinese-style painting found there.

At Tun-huang, the early caves have the so-called pillared niche which

occupied the centre of the cave, but later the niches were placed only at the back wall leaving most of the cave space for the worshippers. It is generally accepted that the architectural structures found at Tun-huang are modelled after wooden architectural forms which originated in China. However, to create a space for worshipper is not a Chinese idea but may be associated with the same type of space created at India and Bamiyan, where worshipper and the main image share a common space.

The role which Bamiyan played in the architectural history of the cave temple may be likened to an experimental laboratory where different elements derived from various traditions are accepted and assimilated.

The characteristic Indian vihara and chaitya types have not been found at Bamiyan. The unit-type caves, which consisted of various caves each with different function centered around the main cave, was developed into numerous styles at Bamiyan. The rich interior decorations enabled men to visualize the universe. Thus the caves were created not only for the image, but also for men to experience the universe; in this way it may be assumed to be of western origin. Here lies the significance of Bamiyan caves. In order to forget the severity of nature which surrounds man in Central Asia, at Bamiyan, men searched for a space wherein they could experience the universe and be in the centre of space. Another significance is the creation of the colossal Buddha images, a tradition which spread to the Far East.

52. Miyaji, Akira: *Bâmian F-dô no nehanzu* バーミアン F 洞の涅槃圖 (*The nirvana scene at Cave F of Bamiyan*), *Nagoya Daigaku Bungakubu Kenkyûron-shû* 名古屋大學文學部研究論集, Nagoya University, Department of Literature, Monograph LX, 1973, March, pp. 51-73, 8 plates with an excerpt in French.

Contents:

1. General description of Cave F 2. Nirvana scene of Cave Fc 3. Relation to other nirvana scenes from different sites 4. Conclusion

Comments: The paper introduces a painting representing a Nirvana scene discovered in the Cave F group during the survey conducted by the Nagoya University Team at Bamiyan from July to October 1969.

The author was one of the members of the team and participated in the close examination of the painting. Thus, the observations and analyses of the painting were done first hand and provide information hitherto unknown except for a brief description by Hackin (NARB pp. 25-26). In the first chapter, the significance of the Cave F group was discussed. It was noted that the Cave F group has three chambers each with a different ceiling: flat, domed and lantern. The combination of a dome and lantern ceilings was considered as evidence for the dating since many of the caves around the 35 meter Buddha have lantern ceilings, while those around the 53 meter Buddha, tend to have domed ceilings. Secondly, the thousand

Buddha type painting on the ceiling of Fc caves was discussed. Two types of mandala arrangements were noted: one, arranged all the Buddha heads in one direction, while the other arranged the Buddha images radiating in all directions around a central image.

A detailed description of the painting of the nirvana scene, not only of Fc Caves but also of all the other examples from Bamiyan such as G, Jd, Jg, and K3, was given. After examining the style of all the paintings, the author considered the possibility of placing them in a chronological order of F-G-J-K.

A thorough analysis of the nirvana scene was made with reference to Buddhist *sutras*, thirty-eight other examples from the Gandharan school in which the original pattern was created, and numerous examples from different schools, such as Mathura, Shotorak, the Central Asian type from East Turkistan's Kizil, Kumtura, and China from Tun-huang to Hsian-t'ang-shan. The similarity and the difference of each school were painstakingly discussed. Particular emphasis was placed on the presence of a female figure with a halo seated at the head of the Buddha in the nirvana scene at Fc Cave, which the author believes is the first Maya figure to appear in a nirvana scene from Gandharan proper, where the *Mahāparinibbana-sutta* was widely read. The presence of Maya indicates that the nirvana painting under discussion shows evidence of a great transition away from the Gandharan prototype. However, when it is compared with the nirvana scene in Cave 295 of Tun-huang, which show a further development of the composition, the present example still retains many classical elements originally developed in the Gandharan region. Therefore, he provisionally dated the nirvana scene from Fc Cave to the mid-sixth century A.D. Other interesting points were considered. The robes of the Buddha in the nirvana scene seemed to have been covered with gold leaf, which may have been an attempt to represent literally the passages in *sutras* where the body of the Buddha before attaining nirvana is described as shining with gold rays. It was believed that gold symbolized eternity. Another symbol of eternity is the north-south axis which, in contrast to east-west axis, symbolizes the concepts of creation and extinction derived from the movement of the sun over the globe. At Bamiyan, the nirvana scenes included the concept of eternity, all the examples are painted on either the north or the south walls of the caves. This rule is also followed in the nirvana scene in the pagoda of Horyuji Temple (Nara) in Japan, where it is represented on the north side of the pagoda with a Maitreya paradise scene on the south side. The images in the centre of the domes clearly seen in Caves Jd, K and most probably in the Caves Fc, G and Jg, are Maitreya Buddha. This reflects the messianic ideas prevalent at the end of the initial period of classical Buddhism. The consideration of the nirvana scene was not confined to art historical analyses, but extended to include the development of Buddhist thought which gives

dimension and depth to the paper.

Summary:

Chapter I

The Cave F group is located to the east of the 35 meter Buddha, and consists of three chambers, Fa, Fb and Fc. Cave Fa is an octagonal hall which has a domed ceiling and an arched niche which held a Buddha image on each side of the walls with the exception of the entrance. Fb cave is a rectangular hall with a flat ceiling which shows no trace of decoration. Fc cave has a square plan and its ceiling is a combination of the lantern ceiling and a dome. Both the side walls and the ceiling retain traces of painted decorations. The combination of lantern ceiling and dome in one cave provides a clue to the classification and dating of the caves at Bamiyan. This is the tendency: near the 35 meter Buddha many caves have lantern ceiling, while near the 35 meter Buddha domed ceilings predominate.

The ceiling of Cave Fc is completely covered with paintings of Buddha images in various sizes, even on the beams, skillfully painted. The Buddha image painted in the middle of the dome could be a Maitreya, but it is difficult to discuss in detail because of the poor condition of the painting. The arrangement of Buddha images on the ceiling radiates in all directions around the central image. This differs from the Kakrak example, where all the Buddha heads are arranged in the same direction as the central image. Both arrangements may be types of mandalas, one of the important motifs found in the painting of Bamiyan. The first Bamiyan example of a nimbus which has a flame design at its edge is found on the east wall. On the south wall, there is an interesting decoration which combines crescents and round, and a pomegranate-like ball at the centre with flowing ribbons.

Chapter II

On the same south wall, a nirvana scene is painted above the entrance. This painting was mentioned briefly by Hackin.

The Nagoya University Team carefully cleaned the painting before the survey which enabled a more thorough examination of the painting. In spite of the poor condition of the painting, most of the details became clear. The composition of the painting, (29 cm×96 cm), shows a Buddha reclining on a couch surrounded by eight figures. The cover of the couch shows a design of rounds with a border filled with pearls, a device commonly found in Sassanian textile designs. Two Sal trees can be vaguely seen at both ends of the couch. The eight figures around the couch may be identified as Upavana, four Mallas, Mahakasyapa, Subhadra and Maya, in light of the sutras. The representation of the seated Subhadra who emits flames from his shoulders, is particularly noteworthy. Similar examples from Gandharan and Indian art do not show any flames around the body of Subhadra, but in the Chinese translation of the *Mahāparinirvāṇa sūtra* by Fa-hsien, and Hsüan-chuang's *Ta-t'ang-hsi-yu-chi*, there are description of Subhadra

entering into a state of being engulfed by flames and dying because he could not bear to witness the death of Buddha.

The most interesting point in this *nirvana* painting is the presence of Maya, seated on a chair at the head of the Buddha, clad in long red robes and surrounded by a halo. None of the examples of *nirvana* scenes in Gandharan art have a representation of Maya. On the other hand, considering the important role which Maya played in *nirvana* scenes in Far Eastern art, the significance of this *nirvana* scene cannot be overlooked. It could be said that the Cave Fc painting is the first *nirvana* scene to represent Maya. *Mahāparinibbāna* and related sutra, which were translated into Chinese, do not contain descriptions of Maya as present at the *nirvana*, but in the *Mahāmāyā* and in the *Ta-t'ang-hsi-yu-chi*, it is recorded that Maya wailed at the death of Buddha. The *Mahāmāyā sūtra* was translated into Chinese by Tan Ching in Southern China (479–502 A.D.). The emergence of the Maya figure in the *nirvana* scene indicates the beginning of new era in the representation of the scene which broke with the tradition maintained in Gandharan art.

Chapter III

Comparative studies of various examples of the *nirvana* scene, chosen from different schools of art, were made from an iconographical point of view. The author discussed 38 examples from the Gandharan school, wherein the scene is represented through story-telling techniques, which emphasize the drama of the scene. The Gandharan prototype was followed in many schools such as the Mathuran, Shotorak, Central Asian and the Chinese. The Mathura examples inherit the prototype but replace the dramatic sense with a more formalized mannerism. The Shotorak example retains the Gandharan tradition as it is, except for four points:

- 1) Mahakasyapa is kneeling in adoration, while in the Gandharan examples he is usually represent as standing.
- 2) Upavana's movement interrupts the full representation of the halo of the Buddha.
- 3) The dramatic wailing scene of the Gandharan model has become static and formalized.
- 4) The three-dimensional sense of the Gandharan model is lost and a flat two-dimensional effect predominates.

In these four points the Shotorak example is similar to the example in the Fc Cave. In other words, this *nirvana* scene represent a stage of considerable transition of the Gandharan examples.

On the other hand, the examples from Kizil or Kumtura show the flames of cremation emanating from either the body of the Buddha or from the coffin. These Central Asian examples are not very similar to the Bamiyan examples. It is the same with Chinese examples from the Six Dynasties to the Sui periods. It is only in Cave 295 at Tun-huang that

an example similar to the nirvana scene of Cave Fc is found. Here Subhadra is already engulfed in flames and Maya in grief is seated in a round chair near the head of the Buddha. The difference of the Tun-huang example can be seen in the flames which emanate from the body of Buddha and in the tree spirits flying over the two Sal trees.

The appearance of Maya in Chinese nirvana scenes become popular after the translation of the *Mahāmāyā sūtras*. If one considers the nirvana painting of Cave 295 at Tun-huang as a typical example of the Sui Period, it can be assumed that the representation of nirvana scene which include Maya, inspired by the *Mahāmāyā sūtras*, began to become popular during the same period. Therefore in light of the above the dating of paintings in Cave Fc, and also the dating of Shotorak and Tung-huang examples, is approximately mid-sixth century. Among the Bamiyan examples, it seems that Cave Fc is the first example (among the four caves) of a nirvana scene. The chronological order may be tentatively considered as Caves F-G-J-K.

Nirvana scene seem to have been popular at Bamiyan. This tendency is unique considering the lack of Jataka stories or any other representation taken from the life of Buddha at Bamiyan. It might be necessary to consider the theme of nirvana in a context different from more representations of scenes from the life of the Buddha, which were popular in Gandharan art.

It has been noted that in the nirvana scene of Cave Fc the robes of the Buddha were originally covered with gold foil. This could be the literal representation of the Buddha as described in related sutras: the Buddha's body turned a golden colour before he attained nirvana. The golden colour symbolized eternity, and divinity. Eternity is also symbolized in Cave Fc on the southern wall, one of the two directions, north and south, which symbolize eternity. The meaning to the nirvana scene in this example therefore is related to the idea of eternity and is not simply a story from the life of Buddha.

This new trend observed at Bamiyan probably indicates the prevalence of a messianic spirit when the artistic activities at Bamiyan entered into the latter of its phase, which coincided with the end of the classical period of early Buddhism. This fact naturally leads to the study of Maitreya, a deity which has been given great importance. The ceilings of Caves Jd and K have Maitreya as the central image and indicate the relation of Maitreya to the nirvana scene. In this connection, it should be mentioned that the nirvana scene represented on the north side of the pagoda of the Horyuji Temple in Nara, Japan has a Maitreya Paradise scene on the south side.

The nirvana scene represented in Cave Fc demonstrates the significance of the Bamiyan site as the place where many ideas and thoughts took deep root.

53. Miyaji, Akira: *La scène du Parinirvana dans la grotte F à Bamiyân*, *Journal de la Faculté des Lettres de l'Université de Nagoya*, LX, mars 1973, pp. 1-4. Résumé in French of "Bâmian F-dô no nehanzu" (*The nirvana scene at Cave F of Bamiyan*) (No. 52).

Foladi :

54. Mizuno, Seiichi: *Bâmian Sekkutsu Oboegaki* バーミアン石窟覺書 (*Some notes on Bamiyan caves*), *Tsukamoto Hakushi Shôju Kinen Bukkyô-shigaku Ronshû* 塚本博士頌壽記念佛教史學論集, 1961, pp. 760-763.

Contents (Summary):

- | | |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------------|
| 1. Dating of the caves | 3. Dating of Foladi caves |
| 2. Foladi caves (Deh-i-Ahangaran) | |

Comments: This is a short but important introductory note on the caves at Foladi, a site near Bamiyan. The author, who led the Kyoto University Scientific Mission to the Iranian Plateau and the Hindukush, has had long experience in the survey of the cave temples in China. This experience enabled him to make a comparative study of the caves which he observed in the Foladi Valley with those of Tun-huang and Yun-kang.

In the first part, the writer proposes that only through research of all the caves existing at Bamiyan will the history of this cave temple site be known. At that moment, however, it was impossible for his team to conduct such a survey. The arbitrary datings hitherto made by many scholars cannot be precisely re-dated otherwise. He himself is in the opinion that both colossal images belong to the period between the height of Gandharan period and the beginning of Yun-kang period between 300 and 400 A.D.

In the second part, he briefly introduces for the first time the caves of Deh-i-Ahangaran in the Foladi Valley. The notable features were lantern ceilings with the details of beams at the eaves observed for the first time at the sites in Bamiyan proper; traces of paintings of the thousand Buddha; the similarity of the wooden structure of the lantern ceiling used as a decorative motif expressed in a pictorial manner. These characteristics, not present at the main site of Bamiyan, suggest that the Foladi caves are closely associated with the Tun-huang caves from the Northern Wei period around 500 A.D.

This note first proposes a new approach to the much-debated site of Bamiyan and then introduces some unknown caves located near Bamiyan which possess some unique characteristics.

Summary: Thanks to Foucher's survey, most of the necessary information on Bamiyan is now available, but due to the absence of any records or inscription, the dating of the site is unclear; the dating is generally assumed between the third and fourth or fifth and sixth centuries. Rowland dates the 35 meter Buddha to the second or third century A.D. and the

53 meter Buddha to the third century A.D. The two colossal images at Bamiyan are similar to each other particularly in the square faces and the well-developed shoulders. A different treatment may be observed in the draperies. The date seems not earlier than the height of Gandharan period and not later than the beginning of the Yun-kang Period. Therefore, naturally, the dating lies between the fourth and fifth centuries A.D. The only possible way to prove this dating is to make a complete survey of all the caves at Bamiyan, which requires an enormous amount of time and labour, and is impossible for our (Kyoto University) team to complete at the present time. While paying unceasing respect to Foucher's great achievements in the archaeological survey of Afghanistan, it must nevertheless be pointed out that there is still much room for study at Bamiyan.

At Deh-i-Ahangaran in Foladi valley near Bamiyan, several interesting caves, which seem to be associated with the main site at Bamiyan, were found. Some notes on these caves are given as follows: one of the caves consists of a main room and an ante-room; the main room has a square plan and a lantern ceiling; at the centre and four corners are domes; the ante-room, of a rectangular plan, also has two lantern designs on the ceiling; these lantern ceiling are not true architectural features, but are only painted representations. A feature of this cave is that near the eaves the end of the beam is represented by carvings in the rock, something never seen in the other caves at Bamiyan. All the walls including the ceiling seem to have been covered with paintings. Some pigments remain: chalk white, ochre yellow, vermillion, green and blue. No niche was found. The paintings found in another cave were identified as a part of a "thousand Buddha" painting.

The architectural elements found in the caves are very similar to those at Tun-huang in that both are derived from wooden architecture. Moreover, these architectural elements are expressed in painting as they are at Tun-huang. Nothing has been found at the main site of Bamiyan which could be deemed similar to that of Tun-huang. Therefore, it is possible to date the caves at Deh-i-Ahangaran as contemporary with the late period of the Bamiyan caves. It is difficult to decide whether the colossal images and the caves at Bamiyan are contemporary. However, there is no doubt that the caves and the paintings at Deh-i-Ahangaran are from the same period. The fragmentary remains of the paintings make it difficult to comment on their style, but it seems that the paintings show a style earlier than that of Fondukistan, and may be dated to around 500 A.D. or as roughly contemporary to the Northern Wei caves at Tun-huang.

55. Nishikawa, Kôji: *Bâmian; Foradi-koku no sekkutsugun* パーミアン, フォラディ谷の石窟群 (*Bamiyan; a group of caves at Foladi Valley*), *Bukkyô Geijutsu* 佛教藝術, No. 55, 1964, August, pp. 86-111 with 35 figures includ-

ing plans and map.

Contents: Divided in twelve parts without numberings (may be arranged as follows).

- | | |
|-----------------------|------------------------------------|
| Introduction | 10. Architectural structure |
| 1-8. The Cave | 11. Stupa represented in paintings |
| 9. Plans and function | 12. Paintings |

Comments: This paper presents the first comprehensive discussion of the group of caves located in the Foladi Valley, about two and a half kilometers south-west of Bamiyan. Some of the caves discussed here were briefly mentioned by Mizuno (pp. 300-301) and were also discussed by Scerato ("*A short note on some recently discovered Buddhist grottoes near Bamiyan, Afghanistan*" in *East & West*, Vol. II, nos. 2-3, 1960, 9). Eight caves which kept their architectural elements and contained paintings worth mentioning were chosen for observation from among the numerous dilapidated caves.

Each cave was described in detail with illustrations and photographs. The caves are either square or rectangular in plan, in contrast to Bamiyan where cave plans are octagonal or round in addition to square and rectangular. The style of ceiling at Foladi seems to have been confined to either the lantern roof or the vaulted ceiling. The paintings are the only decorative means employed at Foladi and mainly represent seated or standing Buddha images with a few representations of stupas in which some Indian or Sassanian elements are visible. The stupa form was analyzed in light of many examples chosen from a wide area from the middle to the north-western part of the Indian sub-continent, and was assumed to be representative of the stupa form of the fifth and sixth centuries A.D., which provides a date for the Foladi site. The uniqueness of Foladi and its geographical proximity to Bamiyan presents much valuable information for the study of the art which flourished in Bamiyan proper, and in this respect, this first comprehensive study on the Foladi site is very important.

Summary: These caves were carved into the western cliff near Deh-i-Ahangaran, two and a half kilometer to the south-west of Bamiyan in the Foladi valley. The eight caves which are introduced in the present paper are located in the lower part of the western cliff at the end of a narrow valley.

Each of the eight caves is numbered from south to north and described in detail with reference to plan, measurement, shape of ceiling, and the condition of the existing paintings. Only some characteristics are summarized here:

Cave 1 consists of an ante-room and a back room without any painted decoration except for a small niche at the deep end wall. This cave was probably used as an assembly hall or monastic cell.

Cave 2 has a square plan with a lantern ceiling which has a dome at the centre as well as in each triangular area at the four corners. The painted

images of seated Buddhas in the *Dhyani-mudra* can be seen on the beams of the lantern ceiling against a blue background. This motif is also repeated in the domes at the four corners of the cave, where only a halo, painted with green, dark brown and red colours surrounded by two strings of pearls, is visible.

Cave 3 the front of the cave has fallen in leaving only the flat vaulted ceiling in good condition. Like *Cave 1*, this cave could have been as assembly hall or a monastic cell.

Cave 4 is now connected to *Cave 3* but there used to be a wall dividing the two caves, which has fallen. The cave has a lantern ceiling realized in shallow relief. The lantern roof is also used as a motif in the verandah. The paintings, mostly of seated Buddhas, are well preserved in the ceiling as well as on side walls. In the domes in the four corners, seven standing images of the Buddha radiate from the central seated Buddha. These were identified by Scerrato as the Seven Buddhas of the Past. Also there is a dome with a seated Buddha at the centre surrounded by four seated Buddhas and four small stupas alternately arranged. The stupa motif has a double pedestal with a staircase at the centre and colourful drums in red, white and green over which is a white *aṇḍa* and *chatra* in conical shape. Two sets of lantern ceiling motifs remain in the ceiling of the verandah, the floor of which has fallen down. There is a detail of beams represented at the end of the ceiling (which was also mentioned by Mizuno as a unique representation which did not exist at Bamiyan).

Cave 5 consists of two square chambers: A and B. Chamber A has a lantern ceiling. Traces of seated Buddhas indicate mandala style similar to paintings seen at Bamiyan and Kakrak.

Cave 6 has a square plan with a simplified lantern ceiling. Many seated Buddha images with halos and mandolas are represented on the ceiling, while all the paintings on the side walls are lost.

Cave 7 is a square room with a lantern ceiling which has a dome at its centre. No paintings are visible due to soot and defacement.

Cave 8 consists of two rooms, A and B. *Cave A* has a flat vaulted ceiling with a vaulted niche at the end wall. *Cave B* is badly preserved and the original plan is lost. Both are considered to have been monastic cells.

After the introduction of these eight caves, the general characteristics and nature of this cave group were discussed.

Neither the octagonal nor the round plan as seen at Bamiyan, nor the *chaitya* or *vihara* type of India plans were found at Foladi. The square plan was exclusively employed. The rectangular chamber, divided by walls into ante-chamber and back-room, observed at Foladi, has its prototype in Sanctuary B of the 35 meter Buddha and at Hazar Sum near Haibak, and is regarded as either an assembly hall or monastic cell. Those square caves

with lantern ceilings and decorated with paintings could also have been used as sanctuaries.

As for architectural structure, the ceiling is designed with a lantern roof and ornamented with rich decorations. The lantern roof was originally a wooden structure, which still has a wide distribution throughout Central Asia. Cave 4 of Foladi shows a rare faithful copy of the original form.

There are some examples of structures which show a similarity to examples from Bamiyan, Haibak and Hazar Sum, such as the rectangular plan with flat vaulting and a niche at the back wall.

The representation of a stupa was found in the paintings of Cave 2 and 4 at Foladi. This is reminiscent of the original focus of worship which gave place to the Buddha image, a trend which culminated at Bamiyan.

A careful comparative study of the stupa forms represented in the Foladi caves, which are characterized by a double pedestal, drums and anḍa, with the stupas at Jalalabad, Swat, Kashmir and Taxila, reveals that the style of stupa at Foladi may be dated to between the fifth and the sixth century.

At Foladi no Buddha images or other sculptural decorations were found, only paintings. In spite of the poor condition of the extant paintings, some brilliant pigments were still visible, such as white, pale-blue, purple, green, brown, red and yellow.

The abundant use of blue was associated with the presence of lapis-lazuli mines in the north-eastern part of Afghanistan. The style of the Buddha is similar to those in the Cave C group at Bamiyan and the sanctuary of Kakrak, and indicates the influence of the Indian Gupta style. The mandala-like arrangement colourfully painted halo, pearl-like motif framing the halo, and the flying ribbon behind the Bodhisattva head (Cave 4) could all be explained as Sassanian influence.

A comparative study was made between the style of paintings at Foladi and that of Fondukistan, which is assumed to be a mid-seventh century site, with the result that the date of Foladi is definitely not later than Fondukistan. Further, in considering the stupa form as discussed above, the Foladi caves could have been made between the fifth and the sixth centuries A.D., or coincident with the later period of Bamiyan art.

Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan :

56. Maeda, Kōsaku: *Notes on the fragments on the wall painting at Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan* (in English), *Journal of Toyota Technical College*, Vol. 3, 1970, pp. 95-106 with 2 maps and illustrations.

Contents:

Introduction, 1) Geography, 2) The vast composition.

Comments: In this short paper, the author, who took part in the Nagoya University Team surveys at Bamiyan in both 1964 and 1969, in-

vestigated the paintings of Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan, and described their compositions and geographic location situated in the midst of the Hindukush mountains near Bamiyan (130 km north of Bamiyan according to Hackin). The paintings of Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan have been frequently referred to by many scholars. The illustrations which was first published by Hackin has been repeatedly transcribed without further modification.

The present report is based on the *in situ* survey made by the Nagoya University Team on the 25th of July 1964.

A description of all visible details was made with reference to Hackin. Although an interpretation of the subject, an analysis of the motifs, and a dating of the paintings, are not included in this paper, it is nevertheless very valuable because the description is based on fresh data brought back from the site. The report makes clear that Hackin's description and all the papers based on Hackin's report must be modified.

Summary: A. Foucher was the first scholar to confirm the geographical position of Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan which he did on his way from Kabul to Balkh on the 1st of December 1923. Although Foucher could not conduct a formal survey, he recorded the position as roughly one hundred and thirty km north of Bamiyan, at a place between Roui and Mohi along the Khulm river.

In June, 1924, J. Hackin made the first survey of the site from November 9–20, 1924. He published his report concerning the relationship between Sassanian and Buddhist art. This discussion of the influence of Sassanian art at Bamiyan is still valid in many respects.

The site of Dokhtar-i-Noshirwan is represented by a large niche cut into the cliff on the north side of the Khulm valley. The upper part of the niche measures 6 meters in height, 14 meters in width, and 2–3 meters in depth. Here badly-mutilated mural paintings still remain. These paintings were divided into four parts (A—D) and are described in detail. According to provisional identification, the great composition of the painting seems to represent an enthroned monarch seated under canopies, flanked by many figures. The monarch wears a headdress and is framed by a nimbus. The headdress identified by Hackin, was further discussed by Herzfeld and Rowland. However, the representation of two pieces of horn painted in lapis-lazuli blue were overlooked by them. The horned ram contained within a circle is closely related to the worship of the God of Triumph, Vərəthraghna, in the Zend Avesta. In other words, the central enthroned figure seems to be the incarnation of Triumph.

To the left side of the main figure are two standing figures: the small one holds a flower and is clad in a long costume, and wears a short sword. To the right of the central figure are two other figures. One is represented by part of a profile head which wears a nimbus and a Sassanian crenellated

crown with flying ribbons, the other is a lotus flower in blossom and a heraldically-drawn lotus bud.

Between the canopies are two Roman arches, each of which frames a figure; the figure on the left, probably a female, holding an offering dish and flowers, is represented behind a balustrade; the other, also apparently a female figure likewise holding a dish and a flower.

The painting, even in its fragmentary state, still shows what was a largescaled composition in the Sassanian style, carried out in lapis-lazuli blue, reddish brown, dark-ochre and white.

57. *Sekai Bijutsu Shôjiten* 世界美術小辭典 (*Little dictionary of world's art*), *Indo Tōnan Ajia* インド東南アジア編, (*India, South East Asia*), Edited by Takata, Osamu, *Geijutsu Shinchō* 藝術新潮, (I) No. 65 (May, 1975): (II) No. 66 (June, 1975): (III) No. 67 (July, 1975): (IV) No. 68 (Aug., 1975): (V) No. 69 (Sept., 1975).

In this series entitled "*Little Dictionary of World's Art*" published in the monthly magazine "*Geijutsu Shinchō*", most of the major archaeological sites in Afghanistan are included and described by Takayasu Higuchi and Shōshin Kuwayama. The description of the site, its historical significance, the information of its excavation and present location of the finds are given in Japanese alphabetic order. Published in piecemeal in five parts in the section of India, South East Asia from No. 65 to 69 of the above series, this information on the sites of Afghanistan will be available in the future in a book to be published under the same title, "*Dictionary of World's Art*".

IX. List of Publications

List of the publications of the French Archaeological Delegation to Afghanistan, *Memoires de la Delegation Archéologique en Afghanistan* (MDAFA), referred to in the present bibliography;

Foucher, A.

MDAFA Tome I *Le vieille route de l'Inde de Bactries à Taxila*, (in 2 volumes), Vol. I, Paris, 1942; Vol. II, Paris, 1947.

Godard, A., Godard, V., et Hackin, J.

MDAFA Tome II *Les antiquités bouddhiques de Bamiyan*, Paris. 1928. Hackin, J., et Carl, J.

MDAFA Tome III *Nouvelles recherches archéologiques à Bamiyan*, Paris, 1933.

Barthoux, J.

MDAFA Tome IV *Les fouilles de Hadda*, Paris, 1933.

Barthoux, J. C.

MDAFA Tome VI Les fouilles de Hadda, Paris, 1930.

Hackin, J., Carl, J.-C., et Meunie, J.

MDAFA Tome VIII Diverses recherches archéologiques en Afghanistan (1933-40), Paris, 1959.

Hackin, J.

MDAFA Tome IX Recherches archéologiques à Bégram, Chantier No. 2, 1937, (in 2 volumes), Paris, 1939.

Meunie, J.

MDAFA Tome X Shotorak, Paris, 1942.

Hackin, J.

MDAFA Tome XI Nouvelles recherches archéologiques à Bégram, 1939-40, (in 2 volumes), Paris, 1954.

Ghirshman, R.

MDAFA Tome XII Bégram, recherches archéologique et historique sur les Kouchans, Le Caire, 1946.

List of the publications of the Kyoto University Scientific Mission to the Iranian Plateau and the Hindukush, referred to in the present bibliography;*

Mizuno, Seiichi, ed.;

*Haibak⁽¹⁷⁾** and Kashmir-Smast cave temples in Afghanistan and Pakistan surveyed in 1960, Kyoto University, 1962.*

Mizuno, Seiichi, ed.;

Durman Tepe⁽¹⁹⁾ and Lalma⁽²⁷⁾, Buddhist sites in Afghanistan surveyed in 1963 and 1965, Kyoto University, 1968.

Mizuno, Seiichi, ed.;

Hazar Sum⁽¹⁸⁾ and Fil Khana⁽²⁸⁾, cave-sites in Afghanistan surveyed in 1962, Kyoto University, 1967.

Mizuno, Seiichi, ed.;

Chaqalaq Tepe⁽²⁰⁾, fortified village in north Afghanistan excavated in 1964-1967, Kyoto University, 1970.

Mizuno, Seiichi, ed.;

Basawal⁽²⁵⁾ and Jelalabad-Kabul⁽²⁸⁾, Buddhist cave-temples and topes in south-east Afghanistan surveyed mainly in 1965, Kyoto University, 1971.

In addition to the above official reports, the following publications were published by the Mission as *Annual reports* of their activities;

1. *Dai Sanji Iran, Pakistan, Afghanistan Gakujutsu chōsa yohō* 第三次イ

* The publications of the Kyoto University Archaeological Mission to Central Asia, see *MTB*, No. 33 (1975), pp. 230-242.

** Figures in parenthesis indicate the number of the articles assigned to in the present bibliography.

- ラン, パキスタン, アフガニスタン學術調査豫報 (*The forecast of the third scientific mission to Iran, Pakistan and Afghanistan*), *Tôhō Gakuhō* 東方學報, 34, 1964, March pp. 337-354.
2. *Dai Yonji, Goji Iran, Pakistan, Afghanistan gakujuetsu chôsa yohô* 第四次, 第五次イラン, パキスタン, アフガニスタン學術調査豫報, (*The forecast of the fourth and the fifth scientific mission to Iran, Pakistan and Afghanistan*), *Tôhō Gakuhō* 東方學報, 37, 1966, March, pp. 359-466.
3. *Dai Shichiji Iran, Pakistan, Afghanistan gakujuetsu chôsa yohô* 第七次イラン, パキスタン, アフガニスタン學術調査豫報 (*The forecast of the seventh scientific mission to Iran, Pakistan and Afghanistan*), *Tôhō Gakuhō* 東方學報, 40, 1969, March pp. 389-420.

X. Authors Index

Names of authors

Fujita, Kunio 藤田國雄
 Hamada, Seiryô 濱田青陵
 Hayashi, Minao 林巳奈夫
 Higuchi, Takayasu 樋口隆康
 Itô, Michio 伊藤三千雄
 Kashiwase, Seiichirô 柏瀬清一郎
 Katsuno, Yutaka 葛野豊
 Koderia, Takehisa 小寺武久
 Kuwayama, Shôshin 桑山正進
 Maeda, Kôzaku 前田耕作
 Miyaji, Akira 宮治昭
 Mizuno, Seiichi 水野清一
 Nishikawa, Kôji 西川幸治
 Odani, Nakao 小谷仲男
 Okamoto, Kan'ei 岡本貫瑩
 Ono, Genmyô 小野玄妙
 Ôno Takatsugu 大野耕嗣
 Sadakata, Akira 定方晨
 Sahara, Makoto 佐原眞
 Takata, Osamu 高田修
 Tanabe, Katsumi 田邊勝美
 Watanabe, Hiroshi 渡邊弘
 Yamada, Chigyô 山田智敬
 Yamazaki, Kazuo 山崎一雄
 Yoshikawa, Itsuji 吉川逸治

Serial numbers given to their publications

10, 27, 31, 32.
 29,
 15.
 4, 6, 7, 8, 20.
 49.
 41, 42, 43.
 16.
 46, 48, 50, 51.
 9, 11, 20, 22, 24, 34.
 47, 50, 56.
 50, 52, 53.
 3, 5, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28, 54.
 17, 25, 26, 28, 55.
 25, 28.
 30.
 35.
 49.
 33, 44, 45.
 15.
 57.
 13, 14, 21.
 12.
 38.
 39.
 1, 2, 23, 36, 37, 40.